A MULTIPLE VIEW: A STUDY OF BILINGUAL EDUCATION ON XINJIANG UYGHUR AUTONOMOUS REGION

A Thesis in
Educational Theory and Policy

by
Xiqian Liu

© 2013 Xiqian Liu

Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of

Master of Arts

August 2013
The thesis of Xiqian Liu was reviewed and approved* by the following:

David Post
Professor of Education, Educational Theory and Policy, and Comparative & International Education
Thesis Advisor

Suet-Ling Pong
Professor of Education, Sociology, and Demography

Mindy Kornhaber
Associate Professor of Education
Coordinator of Educational Theory and Policy Program

*Signatures are on file in the Graduate School
ABSTRACT

The Xinjiang Uyghur Autonomous Region is located in the northwestern China. With various national minority groups using different languages, Mandarin Chinese (Hanyu Putonghua), is the instruction language being promoted in ethnic minority schools, with an aim to promote economic, cultural exchange between ethnic groups, boost reform, accelerate modernization, strengthen the consciousness of Chinese national identity, and safeguard national unity. As a result, the bilingual teaching has been an issue addressed by not only the government but the research institutions.

This thesis reviews Chinese language policy historically, and the development of minority bilingual teaching. It also analyzes the vigorous promotion of bilingual teaching in Xinjiang Uygur Autonomous Region. The thesis describes the current situation for the minority bilingual teaching by reviewing government documents, statistical reports and research literature. Moreover, it points out the problems and elaborates on the discussions of resolve methods. Minority teachers’ attitude and mental health are discussed, and so are the Hanyu proficiency test score in college entrance examination, test score of minority students, and the over-time ethnic gap in university admission scores.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Tables ........................................................................................................... vi

Acknowledgements ................................................................................................... vii

Chapter 1 The Development of Language Policies in China ...................................... 1

Chapter 2 Xinjiang Uygur Autonomous Region and a Historical Review of the Language Policy ........................................................................................................... 7

Types of Schools in the Primary and Secondary Level ............................................. 8
  Minority schools ...................................................................................................... 8
  Han schools .......................................................................................................... 10
  Min-Han joint schools ........................................................................................... 11

The Political Context of China and Xinjiang Uygur Autonomous Region ............... 13

History of Xinjiang Educational System .................................................................... 14

Chapter 3 Analysis of 2004 Decision to Vigorously Promote Bilingual Teaching in XUAR ............................................................................................................... 19

2004 Decision to vigorously promote bilingual teaching ......................................... 19

Big project with limited time .................................................................................... 22

Current situation teacher training program and program ......................................... 24

Problems concerning Hanyu Putonghua Language proficiency test ....................... 28

Problem concerning assessment process ................................................................... 30

Chapter 4 Discovering Reflections and Psychological Condition of the National Minority Teachers on Bilingual Education ................................................................. 32

Positive attitude toward Hanyu Putonghua teaching ................................................. 33

Worries about the future of national minority languages and culture .................... 34

Bilingual teaching modes are also doubted by the minority teachers ...................... 34

The teachers’ psychological health condition ............................................................ 35

Chapter 5 Assessment of the Minority Students’ Hanyu Putonghua Level by College Entrance Examination ....................................................................................... 39

Chapter 6 Conclusion and Suggestions ..................................................................... 44

Reference .................................................................................................................... 47
LIST OF TABLES

Table 2-1. Teacher’s HSK Level Requirement in 2004 Decision ........................................21

Table 4-1. 1999-2005 Xinjiang College Entrance Exam Hanyu Putonghua Test Average Score ........................................................................................................................................42
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

It is a pleasure to thank those helped me in a number of ways through the thesis writing process. I offer my sincerest gratitude to Dr. David Post, who offered his support selflessly to make connections, and gave directions for me with his patience and knowledge. Without his help, I am not confident enough to start a topic not familiar by many people. Without him, this thesis even could not be written and completed. One simply could not wish for a better or caring advisor. I gratefully acknowledge Dr. Suet-ling Pong for her advice, supervision, and crucial contribution, her involvement and curiosity has triggered and nourished my intellectual maturity. I grateful thank to Dr. Gerald LeTendre for his constructive comments on this thesis. I am grateful that he could accept my request regardless his tight schedule.

I also want to thank my parents for their care and support from. My father and mother tried to find useful materials and the get a lot credits. I also need to thank my uncle, Jianjiang, who kept contact with Xinjiang Education Bureau to provide the latest information for me. My husband, Haotian, is appreciated for his support and love. My friend, Weodao, inspired me to write this topic, I want to thank her for encouraging me to start an interesting journey.

Finally, I want to thank those professors who I ask for help through email, Dr. Ma Rong, professors connected by Dr. David Post. They gave me many useful suggestions and provided names of other important people who I could turn to.
Chapter 1

The Development of Language Policies in China

Marxist influences have been reflected on the language ideologies of dominant and minority populations within modern nation states (Bourdieu, 1977a; Hill, 1985; Woolard, 1985; Gal, 1988). The birth of Chinese Communist Party was considered as “an outcome of the combination of the Chinese labor movement and the wide spread of Marxism-Leninism in China.” Therefore, from a Marxist view, language ideology and, to be specific, monolingualism or multilingualism, can reflect the national identity of a country (Marx & Engels, [1846] 1947). The political economic positions (“base”) of individuals and groups, particularly, the ethnic or linguistic minorities, are determinants for language ideologies (“superstructure”) (Marx & Engels, [1846] 1947). Moreover, ideology influences people on both personal and societal level in perceiving, understanding and managing the monolingualism and multilingualism (Zhou, 2011). The language policy in China has experienced development and change, which was also tied closely to the national identities in China. The policy influences how people from various ethnic groups perceive themselves and the others. It also links to the nation-building policies of China (Dwyer, 2005).

According to Zhou (2001), there are five goals of languages policies in China: to make Putonghua the standard spoken language and promote it in PRC; to develop a writing system similar to spoken language in order to replace the “literary language writing”; to design phonetic symbols that express the standard spoken language; to simplify the Chinese characters; to help the ethnic groups develop their own writing systems for their languages.
When the People’s Republic of China was founded in 1949, its language policy followed the Soviet model and the language policy experienced adjustment according to the circumstances then (Dreyer, 1976; Zhou, 2010a). Soviet policy included three assumptions in managing the relationship of majority language and ethnic minority languages:

1. Each minority nationality, with its political, economic, and cultural center, and each minority language, with its own political, economic, and cultural center, and each minority language, with its own standard dialect and written language based on that center, are initially satellites of the majority nationality and the majority language; (2) standardization of a minority language first consolidates various dialects within the language and then facilitates that language’s eventual convergence with the majority language; and (3) linguistic convergence of dialects and languages leads to consolidation and convergence of different ethnic identities into a single (ethno) national identity (Zhou, 2011).

The philosophy and characteristics of Soviet model were also acknowledged and applied to the Chinese standard language model. The fundamental logic of soviet model is that it brings out an idea of “standard language,” which means that one language can be standardized in a sense of pronunciation, vocabulary, grammar and orthography and serves the needs for every aspect of society communication. The national identity also can be unified when language is standardized (Zhou, 2011). In order to achieve a strong and unified China, Han linguistic nationalism was promoted in order to justify acquiring a standard Han and reform the Han script (Chen, 1999). Putonghua use is believed to serve to unify Chinese people by providing the common media for communication and unifying the various regional dialects. Standardization and promotion implies the goals and the future of Putonghua will be used as an official, standard, formal Han language. However, according to Zhou (2011), two exceptions were permitted in building the Chinese standard language model. One was the “alliance of writing systems” and the other is the creation of more than one standard dialect and writing system for a single nationality.

The language policy in PRC is composed of legislation and executive directives and regulations. The legislation components, starting from PRC Constitution, range from various
national, provincial, prefectural, county, to local legislation branches. The executive component
ranges from directives and regulations issued by the State Council (the cabinet) and by various
minorities as well as those of the organs of the Chinese Communist Party (CCP) Central
Committee, at the national level, to those issued by local governments and CCP branches (Zhou,
2004). In Chapter one, I will focus on the legislation part mainly from a national perspective.

The attitude toward minority language planning is reflected in legal documents. In terms of
minority language planning, Article 53 of the Common Program of 1949 (the interim
Constitution), states that the ethnic minorities should have “freedom to develop their dialects and
languages” and protect the cultural heritage, traditions, customs, and religious beliefs (National
People’s Congress, 1983). On February 5, 1951, the Government Administration Council
(replaced by the State Council in 1954), in its resolutions on nationality affairs, pointed out: “A
guiding committee on research into of the nationalities is established within the Culture and
Education Committee of the Government Administration Council, to guide and organize the
research work on the languages of the minority nationalities, and to assist the minority
nationalities which are still without a written language in the formulation of a written language;
and, to assist those nationalities whose written language has not been perfected in its gradual
improvement.” Speaking of the attitude of original policy, quoting from Zhou, is tends to be
“pluralistic” and encourage the linguistic development of different ethnic groups. It recognizes
the equality of all nationalities, endows regional autonomy with the 55 ethnic groups, and
encourages them develop their own languages and writing systems (Macherras, 1994). Chinese
mandarin (Putonghua) and ethnic minority languages were valued equally.

During the Great Leap Forward in 1958, Chairman Mao Zedong made the announcement
that massive, rapid, high-quality, economic development should be made in order to achieve
communism. The relation of ethnic minority languages and the Putonghua was also affected. The
satellite model of ethnic minority languages and Putonghua were challenged and destroyed. Han
languages were promoted to replace other ethnic minority languages in order to achieve shortcut for rapid linguist convergence (Zhou, 2011). This process was accelerated during the Culture Revolution (1966-1976) and the goal was explicitly toward monolingualism (Zhou, 2011). When the constitution was under revision in 1975, the articles concerning multiple languages used in minority communities and the minority languages used in courts were eliminated (Yang, 2009). The right to use minority language in court was not restored until 1982. More importantly, it was first mentioned in the constitution that Putonghua should be promoted nationally in 1982. Minority rights were used to be implemented by executive regulations or directives before the 1980s (“The Guidelines for Regional Autonomy for Minority Nationalities in the PRC” and “The Decision on the Organization and Structure of local Minority United Governments” passed by State Council in 1952), however, since early 1980s, specific laws/statues on education and minority autonomy were implemented to serve the same purpose (Sun and Gao, 1996). In 1984, the two regulations were revised and incorporated as PRC Regional Autonomy Law for Minority Nationalities echoed with the 1982 constitution issued by National People’s Congress (Zhou, 2004). It endows the minority groups with autonomy of utilizing and developing minority languages in education, court, and under other political contexts.

Zhou then classifies the triggers that cause the change of language planning models in the 1990s into two categories. One is the economic reform that replaced the old economic model with a Chinese-style market economy which creates population movement for better economic opportunities to the developed economy regions. Also, in 2000 the PRC started the “Open up the West Project” aiming to reducing the gap between the eastern part of China and the western economic disadvantaged regions mainly on building infrastructure, developing education, promoting reform and opening up to the world. Coming with the population flow are the “capital and labor migration,” it created the condition that using Putonghua as a communication tool. The second cause was the collapse of Soviet Union at the end of 1991, which led to the “abandonment
of the failed Soviet model.” So as a communication base, the importance of Putonghua has been realized and it has been promoted nationally. Originating from Fei Xiaotong (1999), three concepts of Chinese model were revealed: The inclusive Chinese nation (zhong hua min zu); (2) the process of the formation of this Chinese nation; and (3) diversity in unity of this Chinese nation.

The Chinese model emphasizes that Putonghua as a primary language should be mastered by every Chinese, while minority languages serve for the linguistic diversity (Zhou, 2004). The concept of “unity of Chinese nation” requires all Chinese citizens to comprehend Putonghua, in other words, it is treated as a “superlanguage”. It means it would be used in various contexts “while politically and functionally marginalizing minority languages” (Zhou, 2004).

The Law of the National Commonly Used Language and Script of the PRC passed by the National people’s congress, article 5 (translated by author) explains that national commonly used language can safeguard national sovereignty and ethnic dignity, and explains that a common language can be helpful for national unity. Moreover, it is beneficial to the construction of socialist material civilization and spiritual civilization construction. It delivers the information that Putonghua is not only a communication tool, but it is also a weapon that protects the national unity. The degree of importance and the implementation enforcement can be reflected by the law.

In 2001, China revised the PRC Minority Regional Autonomous Law, Article 37 (translated by author), if the majority students are ethnic minorities in schools and other educational institutions, minority languages should be used in the textbooks and as the instructional language when condition permits; according to different situations, Chinese should be taught from lower grade or higher grade in primary schools which aims to promote nationally accepted Putonghua and standard Chinese characters. Under the law's s Article 49, autonomous region governments should educate and encourage the officials from all ethnic minority groups to learn languages and

2 More information can be found from website http://www.ycxy.com/cn/zt/2007/12116.html
scripts from each other. The Han officials, should learn the languages and scripts of the local ethnic minorities; the minority officials should learn Putonghua and standard Chinese characters meanwhile improving their own languages and scripts.

In my thesis, I will focus on the development of bilingual education in Xinjiang Uyghur Autonomous Region, mainly in terms of the regional language and educational policy concerning promoting Hanyu Putonghua. I will analyze the 2004 *Decision to Vigorously Promote Bilingual Teaching*. Moreover, teachers’ reflection of the policies and the consequences for the students will also be included in the thesis. The reason I chose a specific region is because it is an example to reflect the change of language policies and the change of national identity which provides us more detailed, explicit way to understand the changes.
Chapter 2

Xinjiang Uygur Autonomous Region and a Historical Review of the Language Policy

The Xinjiang Uyghur Autonomous Region (XUAR) is the largest province of China, with a total area of 1.6649 million square kilometers, and it constitutes one sixth of China’s total land area. XUAR is located on China’s northwestern border, sharing the international borders with Mongolia, Russia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Afghanistan, Pakistan, and India (Ma, 2009). Within China, it shares a border with Tibet, Qinghai and Gansu province. The Tianshan Mountains divide Xinjiang into two parts, the Northern, and the Southern Xinjiang. Northern Xinjiang has developed faster than Southern Xinjiang in terms of its economy and education.

Xinjiang has multiple ethnic groups. According to the sixth Census data released in 2011, the population in Xinjiang is 21,813,334. The population of Han Chinese is 8,746,148 (40.1%) of the whole population. Minorities account for 13,067,186 (59.9%) of the whole population. The largest ethnic group in Xinjiang is the Uyghurs who constitute 46.42% of the minority population. Other minority groups include Kazakhs (7%), Tajiks (44,000), Kirghiz (171,000), Uzbeks (15,000), Hui (4.4%), Xibe (41,000), Manchu (25,000), Russians (11,000), Daur (6484), and Tartar (4717) (Xinjiang Uyghur Autonomous Region Bureau of Statistics, 2006, pp 82-83).

Han usually lives in urban and suburban areas, while the minorities inhabit in rural areas. Southern Xinjiang is mostly taken up by national minorities, mainly Uygur (78.6%) with a few Han Chinese living in cities and towns. Some Hui and Han who live in southern XUAR have similar habits and customs with the Uygur and they are also fluent in Uygur language. Uygur

---

3 More information concerning XUAR can be found through the website https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Xinjiang
language is one of the legal languages that are used for the governments to perform official duties in XUAR and it is primarily used in XUAR especially for cross-national communications. Some national minorities’ mother languages, such as, Kirghiz, Uzbeks, Tajiks, and Tartar, are usually used within the nationals, but Uygur language is used for communicate between these nationals (Xinjiang National Minority Languages Commission, 2002). However, the chance of knowing or using Putonghua is very small among non-Han children, and this isolation increases the difficulty for the students to have a Hanyu Putonghua environment.

**Types of Schools in the Primary and Secondary Level**

Distinguished by the nationalities of students and the languages of instruction, there are three types of schools in XUAR: Han schools, minority schools and minority-Han Joint schools.

**Minority schools**

The minority schools use ethnic minority languages as the instructional language, and the system can be further divided into Uyghur, Kazak, and Mongolian schools. The bilingual education modes targeted on minority schools in Xinjiang aiming to promote Hanyu Putonghua for the national minority students. Until June, 2001, the total population of pre-school, primary and secondary students in XUAR who received education under bilingual teaching modes was 994,300. This covered 40% of the total minority students population. Liu Jun⁴, who is a member of XUAR bilingual education Think Tank, made a summary for the modes of bilingual teaching in minority schools.

(1) Science related subjects are taught in Hanyu Putonghua while others are in minority

---

⁴ Jun, Liu, Han, Classroom Teaching Director in XUAR Education Science Institute
languages.

The direct cause for this mode originated from the goal to improve the below the average science score of college entrance examination in the 1990s (Liu, 2008). The different admission score for “Min Kao Min” and “Han Kao Han” students on science subjects for college entrance examination are the measurement indicators of the current situation- “Min Kao Min” students lag behind than “Han Kao Han” students on science subjects or even on educational development (Ge, 2008). A generally accepted argument is that the admission score disparity between Han and minority students (Han students are higher than the national minority students) is the symbol of different education quality between Han and minority schools (the education quality of Han schools is higher than the minority schools). So when the admission score disparity is reducing, it means the education quality of minority schools has been improved. However, the score disparity on science subjects have not been changed much.

According to Gulinaer (2002), the reasons for low scores in science subjects are twofold. One is that science subjects are treated as unimportant since the entrance examination only takes the total score into consideration leaving space for the score for a single subject. The other is the shortage of science subject workbooks or exercises written in minority language. These two reason can to some extent answer the question but ignore an important factor- the quality of the teachers who teach science subjects in the minority schools. It means the low score may also cause by the teachers’ low quality in delivering professional subjects. This mode is also taken as the initial bilingual teaching form for the experimental classes.

(2) This mode requires the courses such as ethnic minority language, music, physical education and Arts of which the contents related to the traditional ethnic minority culture are taught in ethnic minority languages and the rest are taught in Hanyu Putonghua. This mode is encouraged in the minority schools or Min-Han joint schools in mixed ethnic neighborhood.
(3) All the courses are offered in Hanyu Putonghua. Ethnic minority languages are additional courses in the curriculum which started from the first grade or third grade of primary school.

This mode is the ultimate goal for bilingual education. The curriculum will be the same with the Han schools. It also covers the situation that ethnic minority languages courses are taught in Han schools. As this mode requires high Hanyu Putonghua levels for both teachers and students, it is not realistic to apply largely under current situation.

(4) Traditional mode: all the courses are taught in ethnic minority languages with Hanyu Putonghua as an additional course for 4-5 hours per week.

Ma (2009) indicates that 2830 schools, 74.9% of the total number of minority schools, adopted this mode in 2005. Today 1,189,456 students, making up 97% of the total number of minority students, and 135,584 professional teachers, making up 98.6% of the total number of professional in primary and minority middle schools follow this mode for Putonghua education in Xinjiang. However, this mode is not encouraged because the performance disparity between the Han and ethnic minority students.

**Han schools**

Han schools apply Hanyu Putonghua as the instruction language and add foreign language class (usually English) as an additional language course. In terms of bilingual teaching, ethnic minority languages are not included as a subject taught in Han school until 2010.

In accordance with the essence of 2010 Central Xinjiang Working Conference and Ministry of Education and others’ Opinions on Promoting Xinjiang Bilingual Education Implementation, XUAR Education Bureau issued Notice of Han schools in compulsory education period opening Ethnic Minority Languages Courses Pilot projects in 2010(thereafter Han School
Project), aims to explore the ways that the letting ethnic minority students studying in Han schools achieve “Min Han Jian Tong” which means being proficient both in ethnic minority languages and Hanyu Putonghua.

The students attending Han schools are Han students and ethnic minority students. The ethnic minority students who study in Han schools and take exams in Hanyu Putonghua are called “Min Kao Han”. The incentives for the ethnic minority students studying in Han schools usually are: first, better Hanyu Putonghua language environment which is beneficial for learning another language; in addition, enjoying national preferential policies in college entrance examination: admitted with score below the admission line and score bonus (Li, 2005).

Han School Project required the Ili Kazak Autonomous Prefecture, Kashgar Prefecture, Altay Prefecture to open ethnic minority languages courses in two or three Han schools having more “Min Kao Han” students, ethnic minority students who study in Han schools and take exams in Hanyu Putonghua. Moreover, those courses are required for the first year primary school “Min Kao Han” students, but designed as selective courses for Han students and “Min Kao Han” in other grades.

Compared to the bilingual programs in ethnic minority schools, bilingual teaching is not the right word to describe the ethnic minority language teaching in Han schools. Hanyu Putonghua was given the priority bilingual teaching.

Min-Han joint schools

The differences between Min-Han joint school and Min or Han schools lies with Han classes (use Hanyu Putonghua as the instruction language) and Min classes (use ethnic minority languages as the instructional language) coexist in one school according to the ethnicity composition of that area which are the areas with mixed ethnic minority groups and Han people
(Wen, 2010). The ethnic minority students can either choose Min class or Han class to study. The two requirements for Min-Han Joint schools are, first, the Han teachers and minority teachers belong to two paralleled systems (Jiao, 2006) but they all under the leadership of the same management level (Zhang, 2005); in addition, the Min classes are using ethnic minority language or applying the bilingual teaching modes but not totally using Hanyu Putonghua as the instructional language (Jiao, 2006).

The Min-Han Joint schools were initiated in 1950s for two purposes: establishing the ethnic minority schools using ethnic minority languages as the instructional languages which was for accelerating the development of ethnic minority education; solving the problem that the small number of ethnic minority students’ access to education in the minority and Han cohabitant areas. In 1960s, in accordance with the directive issued by XUAR Party Committee “Min-Han joint school is one issue in education reform”, by then, the number of Min-Han joint school started to increase. However, in the 1980s, many Min-Han joint schools were separated by ethnicities and many mono instructional language schools were established. When it came to the 1990s, Min-Han joint schools were rapidly developed. In order to make rational use educational resources, the education bureau promoted the principles of centralized school sponsoring and students enrolling in neighborhood schools, so that XUAR again started to promote Min-Han joint schools (Li, 2001).

In 2002, the State Council formulated “the Decision on Deepening Reform and Accelerating Ethnic Minority Education Development”. Min-Han joint schools were one of those strategies to answer the call of State Council and improve the ethnic minority education quality. In 2004, the XUAR Party Committee passed the “Decision to Vigorously Promote Bilingual Teaching” (discussed later). In the Decision, all the bilingual teaching modes currently were asked to transit to a mode in which all the subjects are taught in Hanyu Putonghua adding ethnic minority mother

\[\text{More information can be found from http://www.jksedu.com/showcontent.asp?id=9103&Nclassid=895}\]
language as the independent subject. Moreover, Min-Han joint schools were also asked to be vigorously promoted (Kulaxi, 2008).

The Political Context of China and Xinjiang Uygur Autonomous Region

China's political party system is officially considered as a multi-party cooperation and political consultation with the leadership of the communist party of China. However, the Chinese Communist Party is considered as the only ruling party.

In China, there is no strict boundary between the party and government organizations. According to “the Chinese Communist Party Constitution”\(^6\), any of the following organizations has three or more party members are required to establish party primary units: enterprises, countryside, government organizations, schools, research institutions, street-based community, social organizations, people’s liberation army company and other primary units. In business enterprises, educational institutions, government organizations, research institutions and social organizations, the executive leadership responsibility system is applied generally which means the secretary (leader) of party committee will take charge of party affairs but are not responsible for managing professional affairs. However, for all level of government organizations, from nation, province, city, county, township, town to village, the leader of the party committee has the most power and takes complete responsibility for the organization. For instance, the general secretary of the CPC Central Committee is more powerful than the prime minister of the state council. Moreover, his/her political status is also higher than the president of China. On the provincial level, secretary of the party committee ranks higher than the government head of the

\(^6\)More information can be found from https://zh.wikipedia.org/wiki/%E4%B8%AD%E7%AB%A0%E7%A8%8B
same level. The secretary of the party committee has the final say for the major policy decision, on the contrary, the government head serves as a senator and executor.\footnote{More information can be found from https://zh.wikipedia.org/wiki/%E5%85%9A%E5%A7%94}

After the Chinese Communist Party acquired the regime, the government relations are between party and administration, and between party and legislatures. The communist party organizations are the most important decision makers in the government policy making process. As a result, the Party is also considered as the decision main body for educational policies. The supplemental educational policy decision making body is consist of national educational development research institutions, regional government policy research centers, think tanks and consulting organizations. The supplemental organizations will also compensate for the communist party’s lacking of educational knowledge.

**History of Xinjiang Educational System**

At the beginning of the establishment of PRC, from 1950 to the mid-1960s, China followed the Soviet Model for minority languages, and minority languages were thought as satellites of the Han Chinese language. In accordance with the essence of the Constitution which encourages minority languages development, languages policies minority languages were given priority in dealing with cultural, social, political issues. The goal was that Han people and ethnic minorities would learn languages from each other (\textit{The Law on Regional National Autonomy of the People's Republic of China}, Article 37). Minority schools used minority languages as the instructional languages from primary education level to higher education level. In 1950, Xinjiang Uyghur Autonomous Region government launched the \textit{Directives for Xinjiang Current Education Reform}. It required the ethnic minority students taking Han Chinese and Russian as selective courses and the Han students taking Russian or Uygur language as selective courses (Tang,
2009). For example, in the Second Secondary Education Conference of 1956 there was a "Notice for Improving Hanyu Puotonghua Teaching in Ethnic Minority Schools" that had been passed by XUAR Education Bureau. This established that Chinese was one of the important subjects from every education level.

The national and government education policies can greatly influence the ethnic minority education\(^8\). From 1958 to 1976, the development of ethnic minority language was under severe disruption as a result of the leftist ideology leading to the assimilation policies taken on the national and XUAR government level. The ethnic minority primary and secondary schools are perceived as national parochialism and were cut or merged with other schools. Eight of the ten institutes of nationalities nationwide were closed. The administration organizations for ethnic minority education were also closed. The ethnic literature compilation publishing organization was also abolished and using ethnic minority languages to teach is also forbidden. The ethnic minority education and even the education system in China were experiences hard hit in that period.

After 1976, the ethnic minority education in XUAR gradually came back to normal. In March, 1982, former Vice Chairman of XUAR, Ba Dai, first used “Min Han Jian Tong” as the basic principle of Putonghua teaching in XUAR. “Min Han Jian Tong” means “on the basis of learning ethnic minority language well, then try to learn Putonghua (Ba Dai, 1983)”. In 1984, XUAR Party Committee put forward a decision that “all levels of Party Committee should treat strengthening Hanyu Putonghua teaching as an important part accelerating the cultivation of ethnic minority talents.” The XUAR Education Bureau required administrative levels of educational institutions to consider Hanyu Putonghua class as one of the most important instrumental courses. “Min Han Jian Tong” was officially used as the basic principle to direct the

\(^8\) More information can be found from http://big5.xjass.com/mzwh/content/2012-12/10/content_256412.htm
Hanyu Putonghua education which emphasize the importance of both Hanyu Putonghua and ethnic minority languages.

In 1984, XUAR Party Committee asked all levels of Party Committee to treat Hanyu Putonghua teaching as one important way to accelerate the speed of cultivating ethnic minority talents. Accordingly, XUAR Education Bureau issued “Opinions on Implementing XUAR Party Committee’s No.3 Document” which provided suggestions for Hanyu Putonghua teaching in primary and secondary schools and used “Min Han Jian Tong” as the basic principle for Hanyu Putonghua teaching on ethnic minority groups. In 1985 and 1986, XUAR Party Committee passed directives to address the importance of Hanyu Putonghua teaching and included ethnic minority groups teaching as one of the contents in “Socialist Cultural and Ethical Progress”. In July, 1987, the former chairman of XUAR Tomur Dawamat made a speech in the XUAR Ethnic Minority Education Working Conference that firstly considered bilingual teaching as one of the strategy to make XUAR prosperous. In September, XUAR Education Bureau passed out “Measures to Further Enhance Hanyu Putonghua Teaching in Ethnic Minority Primary and Secondary Schools”.

The measures can be summarized as followed: the ethnic minority schools were asked to give the ethnic minority students Hanyu Putonghua class from the third grade in primary school; strengthening Hanyu Putonghua educational institutions; increasing the enrollment rate of the Hanyu Putonghua major in the normal educational institutions; making plans for the primary and secondary education Hanyu Putonghua teacher training; increasing the Hanyu Putonghua class hours in ethnic minority primary and secondary schools; Hanyu Putonghua was first regulated as the subject being tested in college entrance exam of the ethnic minority students; the recruit test for the vocational schools will also include Hanyu Putonghua; (8) modernization of Hanyu.

---

9 The goal for “Socialist Cultural and Ethical Progress” is cultivating high quality Chinese citizen.
10 Tomur Dawamat, Uygur, is the Member of the 14th CPC Central Committees, Vice-Chairman of the 9th National People’s Conference Standing Committee.
Putonghua teaching by utilizing audio-visual educational programs (Tang, 2011). 1992, in the XUAR Second National Ethnicity Language Script Working Conference, Vice Chairman of XUAR Keyoumu Bawudong gave a speech in the conference and raised a point that bilingual is the only way to improve ethnic culture.

The Education Bureau of the Region issued and distributed the Circular of Accrediting 10 Experimental Schools of “Min Han Jian Tong” in the Autonomous Region on July 15, 1992\(^\text{11}\). It launched a bilingual teaching experiment wherein part of the courses, such as mathematics, physics, chemistry, and later English, would be taught in Putonghua while the rest of the courses would be taught in ethnic minority languages in some previously Uyghur-, Mongolian-, and Kazak-language schools. The executive regulations passed in the 1990s provided the goals of the experiment and detailed instruction for the class management, textbooks, curriculum plan, and etc.

From 2000 to 2003, the concept of “bilingual education” started to be perceived as the goal of XUAR Hanyu Putonghua education. Various in-depth research was asked to be conducted on bilingual education as well as experiments of bilingual education. All of them could be reflected in the Opinions about vigorously Pushing Forward the Reform and Development of our Bilingual Education passed after the XUAR Hanyu Education in Primary and Secondary level Working Conference in 2000. The XUAR government passed The Opinions About the Execution on Decision of deepening the Reform and Speeding up the Development of National Education by State Council in 2003.

In April, 2004, the CCP committee of the Xinjiang Autonomous Region issued its Decision to Vigorously Promote Bilingual Teaching. And, in 2005, it further issued Opinions of Strengthening the Pre-school Bilingual Education for Minorities, advancing the opening year of

\(^{11}\) More information can be found from [http://www.jksedu.com/showcontent.asp?id=10067&Nclassid=1333](http://www.jksedu.com/showcontent.asp?id=10067&Nclassid=1333)
Putonghua learning from primary school to pre-school and kindergarten, and emphasizing that
“learning Putonghua should begin at an early age.”
Chapter 3

Analysis of 2004 Decision to Vigorously Promote Bilingual Teaching in XUAR

Lequan Wang, a Han Chinese, who was a member of the Political Bureau of the CPC Central Committee and the secretary of the Party Committee of the Xinjiang Autonomous Region, made instructions for learning ethnic minority languages and Hanyu Putonghua between ethnic minority officials and Han officials. The Chairman of the autonomous region, Isma’il Tiliwaldi, and deputy secretary of Party Committee of XUAR, Nur Bekri, also made clear requirements for further promoting bilingual teaching and languages and scripts in XUAR Third Language and Script Working Conference.

2004 Decision to vigorously promote bilingual teaching

In April, 2004, the Party Committee of XUAR and the XUAR government issued the Decision to Vigorously Promote Bilingual Teaching (thereafter, Decision 2004). The Party Committee and regional government of XUAR asked Party Committee and government of all levels to understand the significance of promoting bilingual teaching from strategic development.
perspective. The Party Committee and government of XUAR put forward three arguments to
describe the importance of promoting bilingual education. First, they argued that Xinjiang is the
key area of western development\textsuperscript{15}. The common language is the premise of economic, political
and cultural communication. So promoting Hanyu Putonghua and standardized Chinese
characteristics was also seen as a way of accelerating Xinjiang development. Second, they argued
that a standard language can serve the role fight against the attempts to spilt the nation and
safeguard the nation unity and society stability. Finally, they believed that promoting bilingual
teaching is related to the long-term well-being, society development and safety for ethnic
minorities

There were three goals of bilingual teaching as framed in the decision. They included an
improvement of the quality of Hanyu Putonghua teaching while maintaining and improving the
quality of teaching in ethnic minority mother languages. Also, by following the principles which
are adjusting measures to local conditions, directing by categories, district planning, and
implementing step by step, the scope and scale of bilingual teaching can be continuously
enlarged. Finally, it a third goal was that the modes of bilingual teaching would transfer from
teaching math, science subjects in Hanyu Putonghua to all the subjects that would be taught in
Hanyu Putonghua with ethnic minority languages added as an additional course. So that ethnic
minority high school graduates reach to the goal of “Min Han Jian Tong” and sound foundation
can be laid for their further study and life.

The 2004 decision provides implementation methods for bilingual teaching in preschool,
primary, and secondary education. Hanyu Putonghua oral practice is used as an important method

\textsuperscript{15} China Western Development is a policy adopted by the western regions. The main components of the
strategy include the development of infrastructure (transport, hydropower plants, energy, and
telecommunications), enticement of foreign investment, increased efforts on ecological protection (such
as reforestation), promotion of education, and retention of talent flowing to richer provinces.
in preschool bilingual teaching. Integrated institutions and classes are encouraged in preschool education.

According to the Decision, primary education should vigorously promote Hanyu Putonghua class from the first grade of primary school and start to teach math by using Hanyu Putonghua from the third grade. Depending on local conditions, all the ethnic minority primary schools should reach the goal finally that teaching Hanyu Putonghua from the first grade of primary school.

Table 2-1. Teacher’s HSK Level Requirement in 2004 Decision

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Primary schools</th>
<th>Middle schools</th>
<th>Vocational and high schools</th>
<th>Higher education institutions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chinese</td>
<td>Level 6</td>
<td>Level 7</td>
<td>Level 8</td>
<td>Level 9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other subjects</td>
<td>Level 5</td>
<td>Level 6</td>
<td>Level 7</td>
<td>Level 8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The media in all subjects except for ethnic minority languages should be Hanyu Putonghua, which was encouraged to be adopted by qualified schools.

The decision was aimed at improving the quality of Hanyu Putonghua class, enlarging the scale that all math and science subjects should be taught in Hanyu Putonghua in secondary schools, and encouraging all subjects except for ethnic minority languages to be taught in Hanyu Putonghua.

The time span was also set up in the 2004 Decision. Ethnic minority primary and secondary schools in educational advanced cities such as Urumuchi, Karamay, Shihezi should achieve bilingual teaching mode in 2006. Ethnic minority primary and secondary schools of cities in northern, eastern Xuar and counties in Southern XUAR, will adopt bilingual teaching mode in 2010. The other places need to accomplish that in 2012.

(1) Teacher training plans
The 2004 *Decision* made the HSK\textsuperscript{16} test required at certain standards for ethnic minority teachers to conduct Hanyu Putonghua teaching tasks. The higher education levels the teachers were at, the higher level of certificate on the test they were required to attain.

According to the 2004 *Decision*, the higher institutions were asked to provide bilingual teacher training programs for the teachers at primary and secondary level. One or two-year off-job training is provided for the science teachers who are unqualified in bilingual teaching under 40-year old. By 2007 and 2011, urban and rural primary school teachers should meet the bilingual teaching requirements respectively. All the teachers, to continue working, needed to hold a teacher certificate by February 1, 2006. Since 2006, there have been quotas in recruiting in normal institutions for training Hanyu Putonghua and bilingual teachers for minority schools in south XUAR. A goal was for each minority central primary schools to have 2-3 Han or Min Kao Han teachers by 2010.

**Big project with limited time**

After this decision was adopted, Ma Rong (2009) in *Development of Minority Education and Practice of Bilingual Education in Xinjiang* described the situation of bilingual teaching by providing data on the regional level. 943 schools, covering 20% of XUAR’s ethnic minority schools, opened bilingual experimental classes in Xinjiang in 2004. 35,948 students (2.9%) and 1847 teachers (1.3%) participated in the new mode of bilingual experimental classes. In 2005, 8487 minority teachers (5.1% of the total number of professional minority teachers) participated

\textsuperscript{16} The Chinese Proficiency Test (HSK) is China’s national standardized test designed and developed by the HSK Center of Beijing Language and Culture University to assess the Chinese language proficiency of non-native speakers (including foreigners, overseas Chinese and students from Chinese national minorities). It was promoted nationally since 1990 and to the overseas from 1991. XUAR started to implement HSK from 1996, however, since 2011 MHK replaced HSK as the test evaluate Hanyu Putonghua proficiency. HSK was abandoned from January, 1, 2013.
in the bilingual teaching tasks.

In 2004, there are 35,948 minority students who participated in the bilingual program that use Hanyu Putonghua to teach math, science subjects and use ethnic minority languages for other subjects including minority languages, history, geography, etc. The number increased four times in 2005 with 145,138 students. Until 2008, the number of bilingual teaching program has reached to 5000. The ethnic minority students who participated in the programs were about 150,000 making up 6.6% of the whole ethnic minority students population. Data provided in Xinjiang Uygur Autonomous Region Minority Preschool and Primary and Secondary School Bilingual Education Development Planning (2010-2020) shows in 2009 the ethnic minority students educated in bilingual teaching mode are 460,000 making up 22.2% of the total population of ethnic minority students in primary and secondary schools. Minority students educated in Hanyu primary and secondary schools were 240,900 covering 11.6% of the total population of minority students in primary and secondary schools (Ma, 2001).

However, in the 2010 Central Working Conference on Xinjiang, Hu Jintao, general secretary of the Central Committee of the Communist Party of China (CPC), put forward that two years preschool bilingual teaching should give priority to Hanyu Putonghua, and it should be applied regionally by 2012; accelerate the speed that all the subjects in primary and secondary schools should be taught in Hanyu Putonghua and add ethnic minority languages as additional subjects; solve the problem of bilingual staff shortage in economic disadvantaged areas; bilingual education should be applied regionally in 2015. Premier of the State Council of the People's Republic of China, Wen Jiabao, also suggested that by 2020 the ethnic minority students should master to use national standard spoken and written language.

There were three reasons why the preschool bilingual teaching was promoted, according to the “Eight Questions for Bilingual Education.” First, the experiences of promoting bilingual teaching in various areas show that preschool bilingual teaching gives a solid foundation for nine-year compulsory education and Hanyu Putonghua leaning, Second, research in various areas, such as, psychology, education and sociology imply the importance of early education and its economic and societal benefits from 1960s. In addition, the national minority children made up 60% of the children between age 3 to 6. Preschool education would help the children learn Hanyu Putonghua and improve the education quality and quality of whole population.
Current situation teacher training program and program

Yimiti (2006) suggests the teachers in the ethnic minority primary and secondary schools, according to their instructional languages, are categorized into three groups. First is the group using ethnic minority languages as instructional languages. This phenomenon exists in districts applying bilingual mode which uses Uygur, Kazak, or Mongol as instructional language to teach ethnic minority language, politics, history, geography, etc. Most of them are “Min Kao Min” teachers who have rich teaching experience and high educational background. The problem for them is their limited knowledge of Hanyu Putonghua. The second group is the teachers who are using Hanyu Putonghua to teach Chinese, math, science related subjects. It is a challenge for the ethnic minority teachers as this not only requires Hanyu Putonghua proficiency but also asks for knowledge delivering skills and teaching experience. The third group is bilingual teachers who can both teach courses in Hanyu Putonghua and ethnic minority languages (Yimiti, 2006). This group is welcomed by the students for their high level Hanyu Putonghua in conducting teaching tasks and the communication ability with the ethnic minority students who are not proficient in Hanyu Putonghua. The third goal setting up by the 2004 Decision was that “all the bilingual teaching modes need to transfer to the ultimate mode- all the subjects are taught in Hanyu Putonghua with ethnic minority languages as the additional course gradually.” It is predictable that the second and third group of teachers will be in urgent need with the development of bilingual teaching program. It sets high requirement of Hanyu Putonghua level for the ethnic minority teachers especially those are “Min Kao Min” who covers a large portion in primary and secondary ethnic minority schools.

According to the report from XUAR Primary and Secondary School Teachers Continuing Education Center in 2005, Uygur and Kazak teachers made up 53.88% of the total population of teachers in XUAR. In primary, middle and high schools, the Uygur and Kazak
teachers cover 56.78%, 53.31% and 37.5% of the all the teachers in three levels respectively (You 2006). Ethnic minority teachers thus made up a big portion of the bilingual teaching programs. However, a large number of the ethnic minority teachers are under the requirements of Hanyu Putonghua proficiency and failed to conducting teaching tasks using Hanyu Putonghua, also, their professional level of subjects are also questioned.

There are two reasons why the ethnic minority teachers are lacking in Hanyu Putonghua proficiency. Most of the ethnic minority schools located in southern XUAR and the common communication language use Uygur. Even the Han people living in the rural areas of south Xinjiang use Uygur to communicate with ethnic minorities. Moreover, other ethnic minorities such as, Kazakhs and Hui also use Uygur as a common media in interethnic communications not only in casual occasions but also in formal government meetings. As a result of lacking the Hanyu Putonghua language environment, the Hanyu Putonghua ability of the ethnic minority teachers is difficult to improve without deliberate efforts.

Most of them are “Min Kao Min,” which means the education they obtained through their student life was conducted in ethnic minority languages. The ethnic minority teachers who were doing their basic education after 1990s have taken Hanyu Putonghua courses. However, those who received basic education before that even didn’t have the chance leaning Hnayu Putonghua on a regular base.

The level of professional knowledge of the subjects taught by the ethnic minority teachers is also lower than that of Han teachers. XUAR Primary and Secondary Teachers’ Professional Basic Knowledge Level Test Results Analysis Report in 2004 provides comparison data between all subjects tested in Hanyu Putonghua and in minority languages for the professional knowledge on XUAR 50,000 primary and secondary school teachers (the ethnic minority teachers took the tests in their mother languages). The degree of difficulty of Hanyu Putonghua tests was higher than the test in minority languages. However, the results showed both the pass rate and excellent rate in
test taken in Hanyu Putonghua were 10% and 16% higher than the test taken in ethnic minority languages. (Li, 2007). It points out the professional level disparity between Han teachers and ethnic minority teachers and also addresses the necessity of teacher training program for professional development of the ethnic minority teachers.

From September, 2003, XUAR started to organize and implement the National Support Xinjiang Hanyu Putonghua Teachers’ Work Plan (Li, 2007). This plan was formulated by Ministry of Education, State Ethnic Affairs Commission, Ministry of Finance, and Ministry of Personnel, and was issued by the State Council\(^\text{17}\). The plan regulated the forms to support and train XUAR hanyu Putonghua teachers\(^\text{18}\) programs.

Basically the ways include higher education institutions supporting programs; bilingual teachers training programs; training teachers by distance education methods; organizing volunteer teachers who are fresh normal university graduates and other college graduates coming to XUAR. “Building a team of teachers meeting the requirement of quantity, quality and sustainable development” is the goal before 2020 (National Support Xinjiang Hanyu Putonghua Teachers’ Work Plan, 2003).

In accordance with the National Support Xinjiang Hanyu Putonghua Teachers' Work Plan, in 2004, XUAR Party Committee and XUAR People’s Government initiated the XUAR Primary and Secondary Schools Ethnic Minority “Bilingual” Teachers Training Project and formulated XUAR Primary and Secondary Ethnic Minority “Bilingual” Teachers Training Project Implementation Plan. The goal of the plan is off-job training for 45,000 ethnic minority teachers under 40-year-old from 2004-2011 in aspects of ideological and political work, educational theories, Hanyu Putonghua proficiency, professional development, in-class practice, and educational technology. Their HSK level should be upgraded two levels from the level they were

\(^{17}\) More information can be found from http://www.law-lib.com/law/law_view.asp?id=111993

\(^{18}\) XUAR Hanyu teacher usually means teachers who teach Chinese and those teach other subjects in Hanyu Putonghua.
at before the training program (primary level 3; middle level 4; high level 5) or reach certain criteria set up by the plan. After the first phase of training, research has been done on the 945 participants, however, the results were not as good as expected. So the plan was adjusted to decrease the scale of plan, lower the maximum age to 35, and prolong the training time to be two years for teachers from both urban and rural areas (Wang, 2011).

Since September 2003, 337 million RMB (244 million from nation and 93 million from XUAR) have been invested in ethnic minority teacher training programs. By September, 2012, 19,720 bilingual teachers had been trained in those programs (2800 people have been trained on national level one-year program, 16920 people have been trained on regional level one to two-year programs). Based on the XUAR Ethnic Minority Pre-school, Primary and Secondary Bilingual Education Development Plan (2012-2020), 16500 ethnic minority bilingual teachers are to be trained between 2013 and 2018 (China News, 2012).

However, some researchers cast doubt on the effectiveness of the training plan. Yu (2006) argues that from 2004, even if every year 2000 teachers are trained according to the training plan, by 2012, only 16,000 teachers can be trained which covers 13.4% of the Uygur and Kasak teachers (not including other ethnic minorities). So he cast doubt on the goal that XUAR will transition to bilingual teaching in all the subjects are taught in Hanyu Putonghua with ethnic minority languages as the additional course by 2012. There is still a long way to go for realizing the goal that applying Hanyu Putonghua as the instructional languages in all ethnic minority schools. In addition, many researches concerning the quality of primary and secondary schools ethnic minority teacher training programs pointed out problems weaken the effects of training programs and hinder the professional development of teachers.

It is true that more teachers for bilingual programs are being trained which, including 14.17% of the total population of Uygur and Kasak teachers. However, referring to the goal set up in the 2004 Decision, “by 2007 and 2012, the teachers in urban and rural areas should reach
the criteria for bilingual teaching (the Decision, 2004)”. The training goal cannot be achieved by 2012, as the bilingual teachers are insufficient to conduct the bilingual tasks. The reality also contradicts the goal that bilingual education should be applied regionally in 2015 put forward by Hu Jintao in Xinjiang Central working conference in 2010.

Problems concerning Hanyu Putonghua Language proficiency test

One important measure in the criteria for teachers conducting bilingual teaching currently is HSK (abandoned in 1/1/2013) or MHK\textsuperscript{19} levels as mentioned before. Two thing need to be clarified: one is the measures evaluate whether the minority teachers meet the requirement of qualified teacher conducting bilingual teaching tasks; the other thing is looking at the teacher training programs to evaluate the effectiveness of them.

Through their research on HSK test, Yang and Yu made an argument that HSK level 8, which is the highest level in the intermediate rank, should be the lowest requirement for ethnic minority teachers in bilingual education. The HSK level 8 will test listening, grammar, reading and filling in the blanks but not speaking or writing skills are tested. In reality, bilingual teaching requires teachers to express his/her opinions clearly both orally and in written language. So HSK level 8 cannot assess the writing and speaking skills of the test takers. The test preparing practices also prevent the test to accurately reflect the Hanyu Putonghua ability of the teachers.

After the 2004 Decision, HSK level 8 was required by middle vocational and high school ethnic minority teachers. Below secondary education, the levels required are under level 8. However, only the highest level (level 9) is required for conducting bilingual teaching in higher education institutions, and this level includes writing and speaking as two additional tests. Below level 9, without a test on writing and speaking, the HSK levels cannot accurately indicate Hanyu

\textsuperscript{19} Ethnic minority Hanyu Putonghua level test
Putonghua level of the test takers as important skills such as writing and reading are not assessed in the test, let alone the bilingual teaching ability. More comprehensive, well-designed and theory based test are needed which can really serve the needs to assess the language ability of the ethnic minority teachers.

By observing and analyzing the participants in teachers’ training programs who obtained certain level HSK certificate, it appears that a large amount of minority teachers’ Hanyu Putonghua proficiency and instruction capability are still not meeting the criteria of bilingual teaching for even having high level HSK certificate. This finding casts doubt on the test content of HSK, which did not include speaking and writing (Wang et al., 2010). Moreover, as HSK was designed for people from overseas to equip them with Hnayu Putonghua abilities to study, communicate and live in China, this goal cannot meet the requirements for the ethnic minority groups to conduct professional study, social interaction, and professional works (Ju and Lu, 2009). As a result, the language proficiency test looks for adjustment and improvement on the test contents.

Based on the experiences from HSK, starting from 2001, research has been done to design a Hanyu Putonghua language proficiency test for ethnic minority groups. This test was named MHK, which is the abbreviation for “Min Zu Han Kao” (ethnic minorities Hanyu Putonghua test). Compared with the HSK test, MHK eliminated the section for grammar and added writing and speaking sections (Wang et al., 2010). From 2002, experimental MHK tests have been implemented in some ethnic minority living areas and some higher education institutions. XUAR also applied MHK test structure on the College Entrance Examination for “Min Kao Min” students from 2002 to 2006 (Ju and Lu, 2009). From May, 2011, MHK was regionally applied to all levels of Hanyu Putonghua language proficiency test. Research concerning the feasibility effects of the MHK test need to be addressed in the future.
Problem concerning assessment process

Liang (2007), through two questionnaire surveys, points out the problem in teacher training programs and evaluates the quality of these programs. The curriculum and class hours are not designed to meet the teachers’ needs. For example, oral practice as the issue most of the teachers concerned is not paid enough attention and time.

I offer two tentative explanations for this phenomenon. One is that oral Hanyu Putonghua has not received enough attention, and the second is it echoes with the test contents of HSK which didn’t taken speaking as a section which in another way reflects the characteristic of a test-oriented training program. Moreover, as it was mentioned before, Hanyu Putonghua proficiency is not enough to become a qualified teacher. Professional development training is also significant in improving teachers’ quality in bilingual teaching. However, the ratio of classes related to professional development is relatively small according to the questionnaire. Teaching ability, which is the ultimate goal of the programs, is also overlooked in the training program (Liang, 2007).

However, the attention to these problems above have been reflected on the Xinjiang Primary and Secondary Ethnic Minority “Bilingual” Teachers “Two-year” Training Guidance (thereafter Guidance 2010) formulated by XUAR Education Bureau. Training class hours has been extended from 2360 to 2710. In addition, “Primary and secondary education textbook study and classroom simulation training” requires all level participants to simulate the classroom teaching process is added as one part of the new curriculum; extending class hours for political theory, professional moral and educational theory classes (Notice for printing and distributing Xinjiang Primary and Secondary Ethnic Minority “Bilingual” Teachers “Two-year” Training Guidance, 2010).

Yang and Yu (2011) select evaluation items which related to bilingual teaching abilities: Hanyu Putonghua levels, educational theories, basic education new courses, basic knowledge for
computer, knowledge for the subjects, professional Hanyu Putonghua. Basic teaching skills and Hanyu Putonghua teaching abilities which are concerning the bilingual teaching ability are also important evaluation standards. Moreover, it is necessary to acquire a certain level of HSK or MHK certificate to become a qualified teacher conducting bilingual teaching tasks. The testing subjects, such as political theory and professional ethics, theory and practice of education, HSK or MHK certificate, Hanyu Putonghua basic knowledge, only HSK is taken nationally and arranged by HSK Center of Beijing Language and Culture University. If the teachers participating in the training program cannot reach certain level in HSK required by the XUAR Minority Bilingual Teachers Training Assessment Measures issued by XUAR Education Bureau, they will fail the training program. Thus, many organizations only focus on HSK passing rate but ignore the real purpose of teaching training program which is not just a piece of certificate paper. This also leads to test-oriented courses and large amount of time is spent on test preparing (Liang, 2007).
Yang and Wu (2009) conducted a survey aimed to know the attitudes among ethnic minority teachers on bilingual teaching. They chose ethnic minority teachers from primary and secondary schools in Urumqi (the capital of XUAR), and also on city, county and township level in Kohtan prefecture (south most prefecture). In addition, primary and secondary schools ethnic minority teachers who were training in Urumqi Adult Education College from different places in XUAR and ethnic minority teachers in universities also participated as the interview objects in the research. The total amount of participants in this research is 100.

In this research, the authors didn’t explain why they chose the ethnic minority teachers in Urumqi and Kohtan prefecture. The tentative answers could be: Urumqi is the capital of Xinjiang and the economic, political, and cultural center of XUAR. It also represents the places with sufficient educational resources and the pioneer of new bilingual education policy and decision implementation. The proportions of Han, Uygur, Hui and Kazak are 75.3%, 12.79%, 8.03% and 2.34%. Kohtan, on the contrary, is the most southern prefecture of XUAR with agriculture being the main body of economics. The population comprises Han (3.33%) and Uygur (96.43%). The large number of Uygur people in Kohtan face the severe shortage of bilingual teachers, insufficient educational resources, etc. However, through two extreme examples, the accuracy of the teachers’ reflection is doubtful. The interviewees participating in bilingual teacher training programs were chosen from those under 35-year-old and who already passed the pre-training test for selecting potential trainees. This means the research only includes the voices from the winners.
of training selection, however, for those ethnic minority teachers who are older than 35-year-old or cannot meet the requirement of further training, how their lives were changed by bilingual education and their reflections of it are not addressed in the research.

Moreover, the survey doesn’t provide information on how do the ethnic teachers feel about the promoted, enlarged Hanyu Putonghua language environment. The researchers consider the big environment is already accepted by the ethnic minority teachers and they are positively adjusting themselves to fit in the new environment by improving their Hanyu Putonghua abilities. The tentative reasons the researchers are doing so are, one, they ignore the attitude toward the broad environment, or the other, out of political reasons they cannot have opinions on the central government policy. However, when the survey comes to more specific opinion on bilingual teaching, the minority teachers express their doubt on bilingual teaching explicitly.

Taking the methodology and research design limitation of the research into consideration, this research still opens a door for us to know what are the participants’ feelings, ideas and suggestions for bilingual education. It will be beneficial for fixing the problems in policy and implementation and making further bilingual related policies.

**Positive attitude toward Hanyu Putonghua teaching**

The interviewees expressed their thoughts on the importance of learning Hanyu Putonghua from three perspectives: the ability of using Putonghua is important in the urban areas with Han people covering the majority population; employers tend to hire people who can use Hanyu Putonghua; ability of using Putonghua is important for further education as higher education institutions are applying Hanyu Putonghua as the instructional language. However, the authors use the subtitle “ethnic minority teachers fully realized the importance and necessity of bilingual education” to lead the contents in fact are about importance of using Hanyu Putonghua.
Worries about the future of national minority languages and culture

Some of the ethnic minority teachers are worried about the future of ethnic minority languages and culture will be replaced by Hanyu Putonghua and Han culture. Some ethnic minority teachers consider their role as transmitting ethnic minority culture and language and they are worried about the existence of Uygur writers and Uygur press in the future. The ethnic minority students’ speaking, reading and writing abilities in Uygur are also concerned by the interviewees for being weakened.

Bilingual teaching modes are also doubted by the minority teachers

(1) The Hanyu Putonghua ability of the minority teachers is not proficient to conduct teaching tasks.

They were worried about the expression accuracy for using Hanyu Putonghua to teach professional subjects. Whether the minority teachers can clarify themselves in the classroom is been doubted. Even they are proficient in Hanyu Putonghua communication, the ability of teaching classes in Putonghua is requiring higher standard. Moreover, the ethnic minority teachers who start to teach after 1990s can be trained to use Hanyu Putonghua as the instructional language but the ones joined the labor market earlier than 1990s cannot meet the criteria even after training. As a result of lacking Hanyu Putonghua language environment, southern XUAR is challenged to conduct teaching in Hanyu Putonghua.

(2) The second concern is whether students’ academic performance will be negatively influenced by bilingual teaching mode.

The interviewees point out the concern that the limited Hanyu Putonghua ability will affect the teaching quality and students’ academic achievement negatively. They also thought the
ethnic minority students’ Hanyu Putonghua condition now is not proficient enough to receive bilingual education.

The results show that the ethnic minority teachers realized that the ability of Hanyu Putonghua is an important, determinant premise in living in areas where Han people are the majority of population, as the Hanyu Putonghua also has been promoted as the public language in various social institutions. However, they are concerned about the consequence of bilingual education and whether their ethnic language and culture will be diminished. The qualification of the ethnic minority teachers is also a concern, moreover, whether the academic achievement of the ethnic minority students will be influenced or not by bilingual education also attracts the interviewees’ attention.

The teachers’ psychological health condition

The teachers’ psychological health condition also reflects changes in the educational system. In Xinjiang’s case, the ethnic minority teachers experienced the transformation from mother languages instructional system to Hanyu Putonghua instructional system. This change influences the ethnic teachers not only in terms of requirement on bilingual teaching abilities but also their psychological conditions.

Wang et al (2012) randomly sampled 205 Uygur bilingual teachers from six Urumqi Min-Han joint schools (two primary schools, two middle schools and two high schools) and Uygur primary and secondary schools’ bilingual teachers who are trained in Urumqi Vocational University Teachers Training College coming from all over XUAR. Since the bilingual teachers in this research are all from Urumqi, the most advance bilingual teaching development area with the least population of ethnic minority groups, the representativeness and the generalization of the research is limited. However, through the research, we can still get a sense of the influences of the
bilingual teaching on the teachers’ mental health. When it comes to the prefectures with more ethnic minority population, the challenges been discovered in this research will be magnified and needed to be addressed as well.

By analyzing the symptom checklist (SCL-90)\(^{20}\) and questionnaire about “the factors influence the ethnic minority teachers’ psychological health”, the researchers found Urumqi Uygur bilingual teachers’ mental health level is lower than the domestic average level of adult and bilingual teachers of different ethnic groups in Urumqi. 43.3% of the participants have obvious mental illness and 38.0% of them were judged as sub-health groups.

Through the factors comparison, they found that gender and age are two effective factors to influence mental health level. The mental health level of female Uygur bilingual teachers is lower than male Uygur bilingual teachers. The explanations the researchers gave considered three reasons: first, female teachers are the majority in primary and secondary schools teacher population; second, the female bilingual teachers are under the pressure to change the instructional language from Uygur to Hanyu Putonghua after one or two-year training held on national level, or by XUAR Education Bureau and Urumqi city; in addition, they also take responsibility for housework and child rearing.

The research also indicates the mental health level of the bilingual teachers older than 30 is worse than the teachers who are younger than 30 years old. The authors attributed the reasons for their teachers’ lower mental health level to the fact that it is not a good time for them to learn Hanyu Putonghua as a second language. In other words, this group of teachers’ educational background and teaching environment are lacking of Hanyu Putonghua language environment; second, they are challenged by high standards and high requirements on bilingual teaching tasks which create large amount of pressure (Wang et al, 2012). It relates to the age limit (35-year-old) for the bilingual teachers who are eligible for teacher training according to the XUAR

---

\(^{20}\) This checklist is commonly applied to self-evaluate psychological symptom in China which uses Likert-type scale.
Primary and Secondary Ethnic Minority “Bilingual” Teachers Training Project Implementation Plan. The bilingual teachers who are older than 35 are not eligible for the teacher training program. The Urumqi Education Bureau every year will organize “bilingual” teacher evaluation, and the successful candidates will be given the bilingual teaching certificate. By 2012, the bilingual teachers in school needed to have the certificate. Those who could not acquire the certificate faced the risk of being laid off. However, those teachers who were under 30-years-old, taking advantage of the bilingual teaching reform, could study in Hanyu Putonghua instructional language environment in higher education institutions. In addition, they passed the employment test organized by personnel department of the schools then become a bilingual teacher (Wang et al, 2012). On the one hand, they enjoyed more bilingual teaching resources while they were receiving their own education; on the other hand, once they were admitted in the school, if they meet the requirements for training programs they are also eligible for off-job training programs which provide further language, professional development training for them. Thus, to some extent this explains the mental health level disparity between the 30-40 year and older teachers and the teachers younger than 30-year-old.

From the survey of the factors affecting mental health of the Uygur bilingual teachers, social and school factors are the two major resources. Heavy bilingual teaching tasks, and the high standard of bilingual teaching set up by school create great pressure on the teachers (Wang et al, 2012). It somehow reflects the situation of teacher’s shortage for the increasing scale of bilingual teaching modes. Moreover, various Hanyu Putonghua levels of the students, especially the ones who have limited Hanyu Putonghua ability, tend to be weary of learning, which also put pressure on the bilingual teachers (Wang et al, 2012). From this point, further research can be conducted on the mental health of the students. This reflects the issues needed to be addressed in the bilingual teaching implementation process. Wang et al (2012) also points out the low salary and little humanistic concern of the school also reduces the motivation of the bilingual teachers.
From the social factors’ perspective, the high expectation on the bilingual teachers and the changes happening on education system also creates a burden on the bilingual teachers.
Chapter 5
Assessment of the Minority Students’ Hanyu Putonghua Level by College Entrance Examination

Starting from 1979 (the year college entrance examination was resumed\(^{21}\)), the national minority students who are taking college entrance exam in minority languages have to take Hanyu Putonghua proficiency test, which covers a considerable portion of the total college entrance exam score (Lan, 1998).

The Hanyu Putonghua language proficiency test was reformed and adjusted in the 1990s due to the ineffectiveness to assess the Hanyu Putonghua proficiency of the national minority high school graduates. Song (1997) argues that the transition from test-oriented teaching methods to quality-oriented Hanyu Putonghua language education resulted in higher score but lower listening and speaking ability of the national minority students in Xinjiang Institute of Finance and Economics. Zhao (1998) also proposed an explanation for that the score disparity in Central University of Nationalities (Minzu University of China). The comparison between high score of Hanyu Putonghua in college entrance exam of national minority students from XUAR and the low Hanyu Putonghua proficiency test (held by the university) score when they start their undergraduate study raised the concern of effectiveness of Hanyu Putonghua proficiency test in the college entrance exam (Zhao, 1998). Hanyu Putonghua score covers almost 40% of the college entrance exam. However, the high score doesn’t mean the high proficiency of Hanyu Putonghua language. This means that the test score doesn’t reflect the real Hanyu Putonghua

\(^{21}\)October, 12, 1977, the State Council issued and forwarded “Recruit Requirements in Higher Education Institutions for 1977” which resumed the uniform examination for higher institution recruit.
level of the national minority high school graduates (Ju, 2006). The weakness of the Hanyu
Putonghua test in the college entrance exam was revealed to be seen as unable and ineffective to
assess the Hanyu Putonghua level of the students. The contents of Hanyu Putonghua test in
college entrance exam were randomly chosen from the excises in Hanyu Putonghua textbook
used in high school (Song, 1997; Lan, 1998). By memorizing the answers to these exercises, it is
not hard to get a high score. This kind of test cannot test the level of students as a whole but only
measures the relative rank of the test takers (Lan, 1998).

The HSK test (Hanyu Shuiping Kaoshi) was applied in XUAR since 1996 as the national
standardized test for Hanyu Putonghua proficiency. It was given a high evaluation in terms of
contents, testing standard, and the effectiveness of testing the Hanyu Putonghua level (Song,
1997; Zhao, 1998; Lan, 1998; Ju and Lu, 2009). From 2000, the form and contents of the HSK
test were used for the college entrance exam, and the results reflected the stability and ability of
assessing the Hanyu proficiency of the national minority students (Ju and Lu, 2009). However,
during the years that the HSK was used, its drawbacks were gradually revealed. The original
purpose of the HSK was assessing the Hanyu Putonghua ability of people from the foreign
countries, but not for national minority students. According to “the Notification about the
Relevant Provinces Implementing Pilot test of Hanyu Proficiency Level for National Minorities”
issued by the Ministry of Education in 2002, HSK is not suitable for China’s national condition
and has drawbacks for national minority students to learn Hanyu Putonghua. The setting of the
test, combing primary and middle level, will influence the reliability of the test in a sense that
low level and high level students cannot be accurately assessed (li ruzhong zibaogao2).
Moreover, speaking and writing skills are not tested in the HSK primary and middle level. As a
result, two important skills are not tested, which will affect the reliability of Hanyu proficiency
level reflected by the test score. Drawing lessons from the past, in March, 2000, the department
of national minority education in the Ministry of Education held a seminar for experts in Guojia
Hanyu Shuiping Kaoshi Zhongxin (National Hanyu Putonghua Level Test Center). In this seminar, educational administrations at provincial level and academic staffs proposed the suggestion that develops Hanyu level test for national minorities. In 2001, “China’s National Minority Hanyu Level Test Working Conference” was held in Beijing, and there the MHK (Minzu Hanyu Kaoshi, which means the China’s National Minority Hanyu Level Test) was initiated to conduct research. The national minority high school graduates currently apply the mode of MHK\(^2\) test (Minzu Hanyu Kaoshi) for the test of Hanyu Putonghua proficiency for the from 2002. From 2005, Hanyu Putonghua proficiency test for college entrance exam is not testing the knowledge from the teaching material any more (Ju & Lu, 2009).

By looking at the data that describe the Hanyu proficiency test in college entrance examination from 1999 to 2005, we can roughly see the changes over years. However, the data concerning the college entrance exam are limited and confidential. Demographic information, such as, gender, ethnicity, age, and the number of test takers are not revealed in the chart. We can only draw a general picture to see the changes over years. Given the limited information regarding the Hanyu test score of national minority students on college entrance exam, the Hanyu test scores in college entrance exam later than 2005 are not available in the most recent published books. So the development of bilingual teaching will be studied through another lens – College entrance examination admission score\(^2\) from 2006 to 2011 (Zhang and Hao, 2012).

\(^2\) College entrance exam score line is the lowest score can be admitted by one higher education institution. The admission office ranks students according to their scores and choose the students from the top according to their planned admission number. The score of the last student admitted is the admission score line of the higher education institution.
From Table 4-1, we can see consequences of the changes on the types of test. The improvement of test average score for the year 2000 and 2001 showed in this table when HSK and Zi Min Ti were combined to test the Hanyu proficiency of the high school graduates. The total score is 150 (80 for HSK; 70 for Zi Min Ti). From 2002, MHK was applied and we also can see the improvement of average test score over the four years. The improvement of average score between 2003 and 2004 is 2.9 which is the largest one. The reasons contributing to this phenomenon are needed to study.

Zhang and Hao (2012) conducted research on college entrance exam admission score from 2006 to 2011 to display the variation trend of admission score for first-tire and second-tire\textsuperscript{24} schools among Han, Min Kao Han, Min Kao Min test takers. The researchers used categories of test takers as the independent variable and make admission score for first-tire and second-tire schools as the dependent variable to conduct variance analysis for Han, Min Kao Min, and Min Kao Han students. The results show that the highest admission score is made for Han test takers followed by Min Kao Han students. The lowest admission score belongs to Min Kao Min

\textsuperscript{24} First-tire universities are those universities and colleges which recruit students firstly after college entrance examination. Those higher education institutions rank higher among institutions, which aim to recruit selected, high score students. The second-tire institutions rank lower than the first-tires and recruit students after the first-tire institutions complete their recruit.
students. The results show that over years the admission score gap is closing for the national minority students take the test in Hanyu Putonghua and national minority languages. They also make arguments that the bilingual teaching does not influence the test score of the national minority students. However, there is progress in that the admission score variation trend of Min Kao Min students went up continuously and was always higher than Min Kan Min students. However, the admission score variation trend only can reflect the general trend of the test score over the years. Whether there is a solid basis for this argument still needs further research. Moreover, due to the limitations of individual data on college entrance examination, we do not know how much bilingual teaching can contribute to the improvement in admission scores.
Chapter 6
Conclusion and Suggestions

The language policy of any country reflects the national identity of that a country. The language ideology is determined by the political economic positions of individuals and groups and also reflected by how people and society understand and react on monolingualism or multilingualism. Taking the People’s Republic of China as an example, language policy is linked to the changes of national identity of China. From the establishment of PRC in 1949, following the Soviet model, an idea that the national identity of country can be unified when language is standardized was promoted in building the language policy. As a result of extreme leftist policy, starting from 1958, Hanyu Putonghua was promoted to replace other national minority languages and the use and development of other languages experience destruction. From the 1980s, given the argument that Hanyu Putonghua serves the role to standardize the dialects and provide a common media, so it should be designed to popularize domestically. So the rights of language for the national minorities were protected by laws and they have the right to use and develop their own languages. However, they are now being also required to learn and master Hanyu Putonghua and it was also regulated under “bilingual education” policies in major national minority living provinces to provide courses using Hanyu Putonghua as the instructional language for the national minority students.

Xinjiang Uygur Autonomous Region is an area that includes national minorities, especially the Uygur. By looking through the lens of a specific region, one can obtain a sense of how the language policy changes and how it influences the life of national minorities in that region. Focusing on “bilingual teaching” which means promoting Hanyu Putonghua in the national
minority schools on primary and secondary level, a historical summary of educational policies concerning bilingual teaching was provided. Moreover, as a massive, significant educational policy issued by the CCP committee of the Xinjiang Autonomous Region, the *Decision to Vigorously Promote Bilingual Teaching in 2004* was analyzed from three perspectives: whether the goals could be achieved; the effectiveness of the assessment test for Hanyu proficiency test; and the effectiveness of teacher training program. By learning from the statistical report and research regarding the assessment and teacher’s training project, the time span is limited to achieve the relatively large percentage goal setting up for bilingual teaching in XUAR; the assessment test by then was incompletely designed, but it received adjustment later on; teacher training programs were also doubted for the large goal, shortness of program and the ineffectiveness of the training courses.

To provide a comprehensive picture of XUAR bilingual teaching, the attitude and psychological condition of the national minority teachers is also important. Taking the limitation of methodology of the research on the teachers’ attitude into consideration, the conditions of the teachers still provides a new lens to see bilingual teaching. The national minority teachers hold a positive attitude toward Hanyu Putonghua learning, although they have worries about the future of national minority languages and culture. They also cast doubt on the bilingual teaching modes through the concern of low quality national teachers and the influence on the students’ academic performance. The psychological condition of the national minority teachers also needs to pay attention. The research results indicate that women and older bilingual teachers are under psychological pressure and have poorer mental health. Heavy bilingual teaching tasks, high standard and low salary and little humanistic concern are the main resources for the pressure.

The impact of bilingual teaching may be reflected in changes on the Hanyu Putonghua text score of the national minority students in the college entrance examination. However, due to the limitation and confidentiality of the college entrance exam score, the Hanyu Putonghua
proficiency score from 1999 to 2005 is provided. The increasing average score of Hanyu Putonghua proficiency test for national minority students to some extent indicates the development of bilingual teaching. However, due to the lack of information of the test takers (whether they receive bilingual education and what kind of mode of bilingual teaching), it is not very convincing make that argument. Drawing from other research on the outcomes of the students, comparing the lowest admission score of first-tire and second-tire schools for Han and minority students from 2006-2011, the development of bilingual teaching was made as an argument. However, the same concern limitation of the data which weakens the persuasiveness of the argument.

Bilingual teaching should not be only for national minority students. Only if Han people learn national minority languages can they better understand the minority people and contribute to the communication of multiple national minorities. The loss of national minority language and culture could be stopped if minority language and culture are respected. Developing and using national minority language and learning Hanyu Putonghua are also in accordance with the law.

Minority teachers are under pressure because there are few qualified minority bilingual teachers, there are heavy bilingual teaching tasks, and there are high requirements set by the policy for the minority students. More attention, mental and financial, should be paid to the minority teachers, especially female teachers and those older than 35 years old. It is essential to provide training program which can fit their needs and humanistic care for their mental health.

The lack of quantitative analysis makes it hard to evaluate the effectiveness of bilingual teaching progress. A better policy on bilingual teaching should be linked closely to the research on the evaluation of the bilingual teaching development. Asking officials to open access to the test scores would lay a good foundation for the development of bilingual teaching.
Reference


http://www.xjskw. org.cn/article/list.asp?SelectID=1530&ClassID=28


