The Pennsylvania State University
The Graduate School
College of Education

STAKEHOLDER PERCEPTIONS OF THE SARVA SHIKSHA ABHIYAN EFFECTIVENESS IN INCREASING SCHOOL ENROLLMENT IN INDIA

A Dissertation in
Educational Theory and Policy

by
Mary Chandy Vayaliparampil

© 2012 Mary Vayaliparampil

Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

December 2012
The dissertation of Mary Chandy Vayaliparampil was reviewed and approved* by the following:

Dr. David Baker  
Professor of Education and Sociology  
Co-Chair of Committee

Dr. Ladislaus Semali  
Professor of Education  
Dissertation Advisor  
Co-Chair of Committee

Dr. Madhu Prakash  
Professor of Education  
Committee Member

Dr. Jamie Myers  
Professor of Education  
Committee Member

Dr. Mindy Kornhaber  
Associate Professor of Education  
Program Chair, Educational Theory and Policy

*Signatures are on file in the Graduate School
ABSTRACT

This study examines how diverse stakeholders involved with school enrollments perceive the effectiveness of the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan in increasing school enrollment in India. Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan is the Indian Government’s flagship program for achieving universal school enrollment. Eight specific interventions within the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan that target disadvantaged population subgroups were considered. These interventions include the Midday Meal, Stipend for Girls, School Sanitation and Hygiene Education, Madrassa Modernization, Civil Works, Village Education Committee, Residential Hostel for Girls and School Supplies. The disadvantaged subgroups in the general population include Muslims, scheduled castes (SC), scheduled tribes (ST) and girls. Stakeholders under consideration are the state government, international non-governmental organizations, local non-governmental organizations, teachers and parents. A multiple case study design was adopted to conduct the research. The data methods used to collect data for the study includes photovoice and semi-structured interviews. A phenomenological approach was employed to analyze data.

The primary findings of the study are: 1) all the stakeholders attribute the increase in primary school net enrollment ratios from 73.99% in 2003-04 to 98.59% in 2008-2009 and in secondary school net enrollment ratios from 43.14% in 2005-06 to 56.22% in 2008-09 almost entirely to the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan. Some interventions such as the Midday Meal were perceived to be more effective than others in increasing school enrollment, 2) the stakeholders perceived that the difficulties in implementing the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan were the misappropriation of funds, misuse of school facilities and the
insufficiency of personnel, and 3) the stakeholders perceive the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan to be inadequate in addressing secondary school enrollment challenges of loss of income, poor quality of schooling and the safety of girls. The Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan did not compensate for the loss of income, did not provide good quality schooling comparable to that of private schools and did not enhance the safety or guarantee the purity of girl children when enrolled in school.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF FIGURES........................................................................................................viii  
LIST OF TABLES.........................................................................................................x  
ABBREVIATIONS.......................................................................................................xi  
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS............................................................................................xiv  

Chapter 1 Introduction of the Study............................................................................1  
  Global education goals and the context of India.......................................................4  
  Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan............................................................................................14  
  Statement of the problem.......................................................................................20  
  Purpose of the study.............................................................................................21  
  Research questions...............................................................................................23  
  Significance of the study.......................................................................................23  
  Expected advocacy/participatory changes............................................................25  
  Design of the study...............................................................................................26  
  Limitations and delimitations..............................................................................27  
  Summary...............................................................................................................28  

Chapter 2 Review of Literature..................................................................................29  
  Genesis of ‘education for all’................................................................................29  
  Universal primary school enrollment....................................................................34  
  Universal secondary school enrollment...............................................................39  
  Significance of perceptions to policy.....................................................................46  
  Perceptions.............................................................................................................49  
  Program effectiveness............................................................................................50  
  School enrollment.................................................................................................51  
  Theoretical framework..........................................................................................53  
  Summary...............................................................................................................67  

Chapter 3 Methodology..............................................................................................69  
  Research design....................................................................................................70  
  Research method..................................................................................................71  
  Sample...................................................................................................................74  
  Researcher positionality.......................................................................................82  
  Data collection strategies.....................................................................................84  
  Data analysis procedures.....................................................................................87  
  Research trustworthiness......................................................................................92
Appendix D  Informed Consent Hindi Photovoice..................................................196
Appendix E  Informed Consent English Interviews..............................................200
Appendix F  Informed Consent Hindi Interviews..................................................202
Appendix G  Letter of Permission from State Governments..............................206
Appendix H  Recruitment Script English Photovoice.........................................207
Appendix I  Recruitment Script Hindi Photovoice...............................................208
Appendix J  Recruitment Script English Interviews...........................................209
Appendix K  Recruitment Script Hindi Interviews................................................210
Appendix L  Letter of Hindi Translation Authentication......................................211
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1-1: Comparison of state literacy rates in India .................................................. 9
Figure 2-1: First generation activity theory model ............................................................... 55
Figure 2-2: Subsystems within the human activity system ................................................... 57
Figure 2-3: Second generation activity theory model ............................................................ 58
Figure 2-4: Conceptual framework. Adapted from Learning by expanding: An activity-theoretical approach to developmental research by Engestrom, 1987 .......................................................... 60
Figure 3-1: Net enrollment ratio from 2005-2007 ............................................................... 76
Figure 3-2: Political map of India ......................................................................................... 78
Figure 3-3: Sampling structure ............................................................................................ 81
Figure 3-4: Research context and methodology ................................................................. 86
Figure 3-5: Initial thematic map ........................................................................................... 91
Figure 4-1: School supplies photographed by parent #98 ................................................... 104
Figure 4-2: Midday meal photographed by parent #93 ....................................................... 106
Figure 4-3: Cycles for girls photographed by parent #32 .................................................... 109
Figure 4-4: Misappropriation of funds photographed by parent #64 ................................. 112
Figure 4-5: Impact of violence ............................................................................................ 116
Figure 4-6: Misuse of sanitation facilities by parent #72 .................................................... 119
Figure 4-7: Caught in the Maoist conflict by parent #17 ...................................................... 122
Figure 4-8: Maintenance of SSA records by parent #41 ..................................................... 123
Figure 4-9: Loss of income by parent #53 .......................................................................... 129
Figure 4-10: Poor school facilities by parent #102 ............................................................. 132
Figure 4-11: Lack of English instruction by parent #69 .............................135

Figure 4-12: Final thematic map...............................................................138
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1-1: Comparison of enrollment indicators for India and select countries........2
Table 1-2: Comparison of EFA goals, MDG for education and SSA goals..........6
Table 1-3: History of SSA in India.................................................................15
Table 1-4: Comparison of enrollment indicators for subgroups in the population....20
Table 2-1: Comparison of challenges to universal school enrollment in select regions........................................................................................................41
Table 2-2: Comparison of regional interventions for universal school enrollment....43
Table 3-1: Sampled states and stakeholders. ..................................................74
Table 3-2: Representation of parents by population subgroup..........................80
Table 3-3: Sample of data extracts and codes applied......................................89
Table 4-1: Comparison of findings from Jharkhand, Karnataka and Maharashtra..143
Table 5-1: Comparison of implementation difficulties in India and Nigeria.........159
ABBREVIATIONS

AIDS Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
BRAC Bangladesh Rural Advancement Committee
CINI Child in Need Institute
CRPF Central Reserve Police Force
DFID Department for International Development (UK)
DISE District Information System for Education
DPEP District Primary Education Program
EFA Education for All
EO Education Officer
GER Gross Enrolment Ratio
GDP Gross Domestic Product
GNP Gross National Product
HIV Human Immunodeficiency Virus
IDB Inter American Development Bank
IFPRI International Food Policy Research Institute
INGO International Non-governmental Organization
KGBV Kasturba Gandhi Balika Vidyalaya
L1 Location 1
L2 Location 2
LNGO Local Non-Governmental Organization
MDGs Millennium Development Goals
MDM Midday Meal
MHRD Ministry of Human Resource and Development
NAR Net Attendance Ratio
NER Net Enrollment Ratio
NFHS National Family Health Survey
NFPE Non Formal Education Program
NUEPA National University of Education and Planning
OBC Other Backward Class
SC Scheduled Caste
SEWA Self Employed Women’s Association
SFA Schooling for All
SSA Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan
SSHE School Sanitation and Hygiene Education
SWASTHH School Water and Sanitation Towards Health and Hygiene
ST Scheduled Tribe
UN United Nations
RBI Reserve Bank of India
RTE Right to Education Act
UBE Universal Basic Education
UNESCO United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNICEF United Nations’ Children’s Fund
UPSE Universal Primary School Enrollment
USSE Universal Secondary School Enrollment

VEC Village Education Committee

VMW VMW Analytic Services
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I do not know if God exists but if he does, I would not get here without Him. The completion of this dissertation would not have been possible without the active involvement of both institution and people. My gratitude to Penn State – particularly the College of Education and the Comparative and International Education program for the financial support provided in carrying out my doctoral studies. Appreciation also goes out to the Educational Theory and Policy program for the intellectual grounding needed to undertake this dissertation.

I would especially like to thank my dissertation advisor and Co-Chair of my dissertation committee, Dr. Ladislaus Semali for the unwavering support and patience in helping me get through my doctoral studies. Through his support, I was challenged to develop an intellectual understanding of the significance of ‘comparative’ in the field of comparative and international education. Dr. David Baker, I am indebted to you for being flexible enough to take on the responsibility of co-chairing my dissertation committee in spite of having your hands more than full with research projects, teaching responsibilities and the CIES conference. A special thanks to Dr. Ian Baptiste for teaching me to think critically about qualitative analysis of data rather than talking me through the mechanics of conducting qualitative research. Thanks also to the other members of my committee, Dr. Madhu Prakash for helping me to get started with my program at Penn State and Dr. Jamie Myers for being willing to help me work through my dissertation on short notice.
A word of appreciation goes to the Indian bureaucracy in the states I collected data for being efficient, quite contrary to my expectations, in giving me logistical support to collect data from remote rural areas. The enthusiasm and willingness of all the participants especially parents in taking time out to participate in my study is also appreciated.

Thanks to certain others who were ready to give in writing that I would return to India with the same speed that I left for the United States, for providing me a point to prove if I needed one.

Finally, my family has been of incredible support throughout this journey. I am indebted forever to my parents, Mrs. Elizabeth Chandy and Mr. Pynadathu Ittyerah Chandy for their genes. One of my siblings once said in humor that I have the worst of both my parents. I agree, that has helped me get here. I am also indebted to my parents for sponsoring my doctoral studies over this long period. Thanks to my brother, Jerry and my brother-in-law, Sonu for being available with funds when needed. Thanks also to my sisters Digi and Kucku for all the advice in international resident related matters and help taking care of my girls when I was busy with other things to do. I appreciate the role of my nieces, Nysa for being the webcam distraction I needed from worries and little Ziva for being the most complete stress-buster while writing the concluding parts of my dissertation.

Last but not the least I am greatly indebted to my husband and children for their constant presence in my life. My husband, Rajeev has been ever willing to drive me anywhere anytime and take charge of all the technology requirements throughout this process. Besides, he has often had to take care of the house and look out for our girls
when needed. My daughters, Rhea chechi and Renee kutty have been simply awesome. Twelve-year-old Rhea has been the resident family counselor and home caretaker while Renee has been her able assistant. Very special thanks to Rhea for mothering Renee and Renee for being good at taking instructions from her big sister. Their sometimes-nonsensical chatter was all that was needed to make me smile.
Chapter 1

Introduction to the Study

Among the major regions of focus in achieving the “Education for All” (EFA) goals is India. This is a country of growing economic, political and strategic importance to the world. India is home to about one-sixth of the total world population and thus the well-being of the world will very well be affected by its state of affairs. India is among the leading suppliers of technical expertise to the world today, and its economy is predicted to be the third largest in the world by 2035. However, it has a substantial proportion of its school-aged children out of the school system.

The Indian constitution states that all school-aged children below the age of 15 years were to be provided compulsory education at no cost by 1960. This target is far from being achieved even today. According to Analytical Report 2008-09 published by the National University of Educational Planning and Administration (NUEPA), the overall net enrollment ratio at the secondary level is a low 56.22%. The population of children not enrolled in school is largely constituted by disadvantaged minorities such as scheduled castes, scheduled tribes, Muslims and girls. According to Dreze and Sen (2002), India stands considerably behind even the average of the poorest countries in elementary education. This particular failure in primary education is believed to be the cause for the limited success in ending poverty, ignorance, disease; it is also believed to be reason for much of the inequality of opportunity in India. In recent years however, increases in the primary school enrollment of girls, Muslims, scheduled castes and
scheduled tribes have been made and India is expected to achieve the United Nations EFA goal of universal primary school enrollment by 2015.

A comparison between India and the rest of the world of education-related indicators according to the 2012 World Development Indicators measure by The World Bank (2012) is displayed below:

Table 1-1: Comparison of enrollment indicators for India and select countries.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Net Enrollment Ratio (% of relevant age group) Primary, 2010</th>
<th>Out of School Rate (%) Primary, 2009</th>
<th>Gross Enrollment Ratio (% of relevant age group) Secondary, 2010</th>
<th>Transition Rate to Secondary Education (%) Female 2009</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>Not available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malawi</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lesotho</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>27.7</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peru</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
According to NUEPA (2010), the net enrollment ratio at the primary level increased to 98.59% in 2008-09 from 84.53% in 2005-06. During this period, enrollment of girls grew from 47.79% to 48.38%, while the gender parity index grew from 0.90% to 0.94%, scheduled tribe (ST) enrollment has grown from 9.71% to 11.04% and scheduled caste (SC) enrollment increased from 18.64% to 19.72%. For Muslims, enrollment grew from 9.39% in 2006-07 to 11.03% in 2008-09.

The increase in school enrollment in India since the year 2000 coincides with numerous interventions implemented under the aegis of the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA) that was launched in 2001. The Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan, which is translated as the Education for All Campaign, is a partnership of the central government, state governments, international non-governmental organizations and local non-governmental organizations with the teachers as the end-of-the-line implementers and disadvantaged population subgroups as the target population. Eight specific interventions within the SSA target disadvantaged groups. These interventions include the Midday Meal, the Stipend for Girls, School Sanitation and Hygiene Education, Madrassa Modernization, Civil Works, the Village Education Committee, the Residential Hostel for Girls and School Supplies.

Few studies to date have examined how stakeholders in this region perceive these nationally-targeted interventions aimed at improving school enrollment. The main research question in this study is to understand stakeholder perceptions of the effectiveness of the SSA in increasing school enrollment in India. The study focuses on understanding a) the extent to which the stakeholders attribute the increase in school enrollment since 2004 to the SSA, b) the implementation difficulties and how they impact
the effectiveness of the SSA, and c) the inadequacies of the SSA in addressing the challenges to secondary school enrollment.

This dissertation, being conducted from within the field of Comparative and International Education, necessitates situating the study within a comparative and international context. To situate the SSA within this context, I begin by presenting global education goals such as the EFA goals and the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). I then consider the SSA in India as a policy initiative in response to them.

**Global Education Goals and the Context of India**

In 1990, as the world inched towards the end of the millennium and the dawn of another, representatives from various countries and organizations met in Jomtien, Thailand for the World Conference on Education for All. Participating country representatives set 2000 as the target year by which to substantially reduce illiteracy and achieve universal primary education. As the world failed to achieve these EFA goals by this target, the target was revised to 2015 at the Dakar summit. Six specific goals were adopted in the Dakar Framework for Action (UNESCO, 2000). They are:

1. Expanding and improving comprehensive early childhood care and education, especially for the most vulnerable and disadvantaged children.

2. Ensuring that by 2015, all children, and particularly girls, children in difficult circumstances and those belonging to ethnic minorities, have access to and complete free and compulsory primary education of good quality.
3. Ensuring that the learning needs of all young people and adults are met through equitable access to appropriate learning and life skills programmes.

4. Achieving a 50 percent improvement in levels of adult literacy by 2015, especially for women, and equitable access to basic and continuing education for all adults.

5. Eliminating gender disparities in primary and secondary education by 2005, and achieving gender equality in education by 2015, with a focus on ensuring girls' full and equal access to and achievement in basic education of good quality.

6. Improving all aspects of the quality of education and ensuring excellence of all so that recognized and measurable learning outcomes, especially in literacy, numeracy and essential life skills, are achieved by all.

Goal 2 of EFA was further adopted as one of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), which were formulated at the turn of the millennium with a view to substantially reduce poverty. The eight MDGs that were articulated in the UN Millennium Declaration (United Nations, 2000) are:

1) Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger

2) Achieve universal primary education

3) Promote gender equality and empower women through equal access to education

4) Reduce child mortality

5) Improve maternal health

6) Combat HIV/AIDS, malaria and other diseases

7) Ensure environmental sustainability
8) Develop a global partnership for development

Education is a basic human right that is vital for personal, national and global development. "Achieving the Education for All goals is critical for attaining all 8 MDGs—in part due to the direct impact of education on child and reproductive health, as well as the fact that EFA has created a body of experience in multi-partner collaboration toward the 2015 targets. Simultaneously, achieving the other MDGs, such as improved health, access to clean drinking water, decreased poverty, and environmental sustainability, are critical to achieving the education MDGs” (The World Bank, 2009). Recognizing their importance to the development of India, some of the EFA goals were adopted by the SSA in India. Table 1-2 below provides the EFA goals, the MDG for education and the goals set by the SSA in India.

Table 1-2: Comparison of EFA goals, MDG for education and SSA goals.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EFA Goals</th>
<th>MDG for Education</th>
<th>SSA Goals in India</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Expanding and improving comprehensive early childhood care and education</td>
<td>Achieve universal primary education by 2015</td>
<td>Enrollment of all children in school, Education Guarantee Centre, Alternate school, or’ Back- to- School’ camp by 2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Achieving a 50 percent improvement in levels of adult</td>
<td>Retention of all children till the upper primary stage by 2010</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>literacy by 2015</td>
<td>Ensuring that the learning needs of all young people and adults are met through equitable access to appropriate learning and life skills programmes</td>
<td>Bridging of gender and social category gaps in enrollment, retention and learning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ensuring that by 2015 all children have access to and complete free and compulsory primary education of good quality</td>
<td></td>
<td>Ensuring that there is significant enhancement in the learning achievement levels of children at the primary and upper primary stage.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eliminating gender disparities in primary and secondary education by 2005, and achieving gender equality in education by 2015</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improving all aspects of the quality of education and ensuring excellence of all so that recognized and measurable learning outcomes are achieved by all</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
At the time of the introduction of the MDGs in 2000, there were 104 million out-of-school children, about 94 percent of which were in South Asia and Sub-Saharan Africa (UNESCO Institute for Statistics, 2000). Within South Asia, India had the largest proportion of out-of-school children. How did this come to be?

Until the entry of the East India Trading Company, the Indian subcontinent was known for its economic prosperity and cultural depth. It was home to the Indus Valley civilization and a region comprising of wealthy kingdoms that were connected to the rest of the world through historic trade routes. Colonization reduced the subcontinent from the most fertile and wealthy region to the poorest. Education-related indicators were low, particularly for scheduled castes, scheduled tribes, girls and Muslims. The prevalence of educational inequity based on caste, tribe and gender has a very long social exclusion history, while, rural-urban and religion-based educational inequities appear to be social constructs of the twentieth century.

In the case of scheduled castes, social exclusion for this group is inherent in the Hindu social structure which classifies people by their occupation. The word "scheduled caste" is an administrative coinage that was used for dispensing benefits and privileges accorded by the constitution to the lowest group in the Hindu socio-religious structure in post-colonial India. Each caste has specific occupations and occupies a specific place in the hierarchy. The Brahmins who are the priestly class are at the head of the hierarchy. Then Kshatriya followed next, the warrior caste followed by the Vaishya caste comprising the traders and agriculturalists, and then came the craft workers and laborers who formed the Sudra caste. Figure 1-1 below presents a map of India illustrating the literacy rates in India as of 2006.
At the bottom of the hierarchy are the untouchables or scheduled castes who historically have been outside of the caste system. In the past, they were involved in occupations revolving around the killing of animals, disposing of dead animals or working with animal skin, as well as, any contact with waste from the human body such as.
as sweat, urine, or feces. Sweepers and laundry cleaners were also included in this caste. In some regions, scheduled castes had to rest during the day and work at night because even the sight of scheduled castes was imagined to have a polluting effect on upper castes. Though education itself was traditionally an exclusive occupational privilege of the Brahmins, the Kshatriyas and Vaishyas also could access education by virtue of their status. The scheduled castes had neither occupational privilege nor status privilege to access education. According to Sheth (as cited in Barr, Durston, Jenkins, Onoda, & Pradhan, 2007), the caste system “can be seen as the institution that has been structuring and maintaining for centuries relations of power among different communities, and seeks to legitimize these power relations through systematically dispensing mixes of economic and cultural assets/opportunities and deprivations to different communities” (p. 1).

Social exclusion of scheduled tribes is attributed to both the reluctance of scheduled tribes to join the mainstream and the isolation of scheduled tribes from the political and social space in India. The term “scheduled tribe”, like “scheduled caste”, is a coinage used for administrative purposes by the government of India. It refers to the oldest indigenous communities of India inhabiting large forest areas, which form the essence of their existence. Until Indian independence, they were self-governing communities who practiced collective ownership of land and were beyond the jurisdiction of the local rulers. The British introduced the "Zamindari" system that allowed assigned landlords to control scheduled tribe lands for revenue collection. “Introduction of capitalism, private property and the creation of a countrywide market broke the traditional economy based on use value and hereditary professions” (Minority Rights Group International, 1999). Furthermore, this dominance of the upper caste
landlords relegated the scheduled tribes to the lowest position in the social structure.

Post-independence, the government of India took steps for affirmative action by reserving seats in institutions of higher education and jobs, but it has so far failed to draw the scheduled tribes out of social isolation.

The causes of low educational levels among Muslims are several according to Sikand (2006). First, India’s Muslims are mainly descendants of scheduled castes who converted to Islam to escape oppression left behind after the partition of India took away the north Indian middle class who promoted modern education. Despite conversion to Islam, Muslims were still identified by their caste origins. As a result they were forced to continue their traditional occupations, working as artisans, small peasants and agricultural laborers, stalling any improvements in their social and economic conditions. This class of Muslims was ignored along with scheduled castes and scheduled tribes by the ruling elites. Like other scheduled caste groups, these Muslim communities remained educationally deprived. Second, after the bitter partition, the Muslim community was fearful of a losing its Islamic ways of doing and thinking by attending Hindi-medium government schools in a Hindu-dominated polity. As a result, the Muslim clerics promoted separate Islamic education through their own institutions. Third, government investments in education were only directed towards government schools, which left Muslim institutions lacking in resources. All of these factors have resulted in keeping the Muslims in India at very low levels of education even below that of scheduled castes.

With regard to girls, though ancient India had an excellent tradition of female education that gave equal access to girls in ‘gurukuls’ as boys, this tradition was
transformed during the post-Vedic period into family nurturer notions of female status in society. Speier (as cited in Sangari, 1990) argues that “A thousand years B.C. Hindu women appear to have been as free as Trojan dames or the daughters of Judaea…Even in the succeeding phase when Brahmans contemplated the soul beneath the Himavat women attended their discourses” (p. 43). Post-Vedic Hindu texts such as Manu’s code depict the declining status of women. Speier further says that according to the code, women are without rights and are taken in by other representations of ‘domestic’ bliss. With the role of women increasingly restricted to the four walls of the home, the relevance of education to women has diminished. This notion of women’s status was further cemented during the Mughal period. Only today is it beginning to see a reversal.

The common denominator among all the above sub-groups within the Indian population appears to be poverty. Scheduled castes, scheduled tribes and Muslims are more likely than others to be poor. Similarly, poor parents are more likely than rich parents to deny education to their girl children. Thus, the strategies employed by successive governments in India for increasing school enrollment among disadvantaged populations have largely involved monetary incentives through policy initiatives such as the SSA.

The multiplicity of population subgroups, the cultural differences from state to state and the broad variation in enrollment growth among the states makes this study well-suited to the use of comparison and comparative data. Chevalier de Jaucort (as cited in Schriewer, 2010) explains, “Two objects may be given to us simultaneously without our comparing them; consequently, it is a conscious mental act which performs this comparison; and it is this mental act which constitutes the essence of what may be called
the relation or connection, which is an act accomplished entirely by ourselves.” The purpose of comparison may vary and is achieved through the use of comparative data. According to Hallak (1991), comparative studies that assume different countries often have common problems they address in different ways are valuable for decision-making purposes. Comparative studies of this kind he says:

[May] help policy-makers to understand how common problems are addressed by different educational systems, to question the established national aims and options, and to broaden their perception of possible alternatives. Moreover, such comparisons may be used by decision-makers to identify certain long-term trends of their own national setting (institutional, socio-cultural and other factors) to be taken into account when they adopt strategies for reforming or improving their educational system. (p. 2)

This dissertation is comparative in essence. Comparativeness in this study is addressed through a discussion of the types of EFA-related interventions and their effectiveness around the world, and a comparison of stakeholder perceptions of the SSA in the states of Jharkhand, Karnataka and Maharashtra.

An important aspect of comparativeness is equivalence. Merriam-Webster’s dictionary defines equivalence as the state or property of being equivalent; a presentation of terms as equivalent etc. Equivalence for the comparison of stakeholder perceptions in the states of Jharkhand, Karnataka and Maharashtra in this study is established through the selection of cases that were comparable in terms of the feasibility in displaying substantial growth in school enrollment. To achieve comparability, states with a net enrollment ratio of 60% and above were excluded while selecting the cases.
Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan

The SSA of 2001 was the culmination of a series of efforts by the government of India to ensure education for all its citizens. Beginning with the formation of the Republic of India, ‘education for all’ was seen as a goal to strive for. ‘Education for all’ made its first appearance as a policy goal in 1950 under Article 45 of Directive Principles of State Policy in the Indian constitution. According to Article 45, all children under the age of fifteen years would have free and compulsory education by 1960. Article 45 provided fundamental guidelines for governance by the states but could not be enforced by a court of law.

The initial target of 1960 was revised in 1986 and a new National Policy on Education with a focus on improving access to education was announced. Under the National Policy on Education three changes were specified. First, focus was expanded from enrollment to enrollment as well as retention. Second, enrollment drives were modified to allow for the active involvement of teachers and villagers in developing the plan of action. Third, non-formal education programs were made an important aspect of the strategy to promote primary education for all children.

The National Policy of Education was modified in 1994 and reformulated as the District Primary Education Program (DPEP). The DPEP aimed to enhance the efforts of the state governments to improve access to schools, retention of students and learning achievement, and reduce gender and social inequities in order to lower the dropout rate. It was however implemented in some states and not all. The most recent revision of the
National Policy on Education took the form of the SSA in 2001. A summary of the revisions and their outcomes in terms of enrollment is displayed below in Table 1-3:

Table 1-3: History of SSA in India.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Policy</th>
<th>Outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1950</td>
<td>Directive Principles of State Policy under Article 45</td>
<td>The gross enrollment of 6-11 age group increased from 43.1 in 1950-51 to 85.0 in 1985-86. The gross enrollment of 11-14 age group increased from 12.9 in 1950-51 to 27.3 in 1985-86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1986</td>
<td>National Policy of Education - Program of Action</td>
<td>The gross enrollment of 6-11 age group increased from 87.4 in 1985-86 to 109.8 in 1995-96. The gross enrollment of 11-14 age group increased from 27.3 in 1985-86 to 41.0 in 1995-96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>District Primary Education Program (DPEP)</td>
<td>The gross enrollment of 6-11 age group increased from 109.8 in 1995-96 to 113.8 per cent in 2000-01. The gross enrollment of 11-14 age group increased from 41.0 in 1995-96 to 42.8 in 2000-01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>SSA</td>
<td>The gross enrollment of 6-11 age group increased from 113.8 in 2000-01 to 124.6 in 2005-06. The gross enrollment of 11-14 age group increased from 42.8 in 2000-01 to 43.7 in 2005-06</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: Government of India, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Selected Educational
The SSA is an umbrella program that comprises a network of current externally-funded as well as new interventions taken up by the government of India. The SSA aims to ensure the right to education of good quality for all children up to age 14 by 2015. The goals of the SSA (2001) are:

1) Enrollment of all children in school, Education Guarantee Centre, alternate school, or ‘Back- to- School’ camp by 2005

2) Retention of all children till the upper primary stage by 2010

3) Bridging of gender and social category gaps in enrollment, retention and learning

4) Ensuring that there is significant improvement in the learning achievement levels of children at the primary and upper primary stages

Financial assistance for the SSA is shared between the governments at the state and central level. This assistance for the SSA (Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan, 2001) was on an 85:15 sharing arrangement during the IXth Plan Five Year Plan India and 75:25 sharing arrangement during the Xth Five Year Plan for all States. During the XIth Five Year Plan, it was 65:35 for the first two years i.e. 2007-08 and 2008-09; 60:40 for the third year i.e. 2009-10; 55:45 for the fourth year i.e. 2010-11; and 50:50 thereafter i.e. from 2011-12 onwards between the Central Government and State Governments/ Union Territories other than North Eastern States. For the 8 North-Eastern States, the fund sharing pattern between Centre and States was 90:10 under the program during the XIth Plan period and till the end of the program with the Center’s share resourced from the 10% earmarked funds for the North Eastern Region from the Central Budget for the SSA. (p. 5)
In achieving the above goals, the SSA lays stress on the need for participation of civil society and non-governmental organizations in implementation of the SSA. The World Bank, the European Commission and United Kingdom’s Department for International Development collectively funds this initiative. The focus of the SSA has been improving access to schools, in particular for girls, remote and disadvantaged communities and those with special needs. Other areas of focus include the enhancement of the quality of teachers, monitoring outcomes and conducting evaluations, improve financial management systems, and mobilize communities in favor of education through dissemination campaigns. Around 7000 local non-governmental organizations also partner with the SSA in trying to achieve its goals. These non-governmental organizations provide alternative education to serve as a bridge to get children out of the system into schools. They also implement programs to improve the quality of education and capacity of village education committees, and often advise states, districts and blocs on educational matters.

The SSA in India is fairly uniform in ‘what’ interventions are implemented throughout all the states but shows variation in ‘how’ the interventions are implemented. Eight specific interventions within the SSA target the population subgroups under consideration for this study. The interventions assume various names from state to state. To ensure clarity and uniformity throughout this dissertation the interventions are referred to as the Midday Meal, the Stipend for Girls, School Sanitation and Hygiene Education, Madrassa Modernization, Civil Works, the Village Education Committee, the Residential Hostel for Girls and School Supplies. The Midday Meal intervention provides one cooked meal for every child up to grade eight. The meal is cooked
according to weekly menu specifications of the government. The preparation of the meal either is done on the school campus by local women appointed by the village education committee or is outsourced to non-governmental organizations. The Stipend for Girls involves the distribution of rupees one to girl students for every day of school attended. The money is handed over to the students at the end of the month. The School Health and Sanitation Education intervention involves the improvement of the hardware and software components needed for a healthy school environment. The hardware components refer to the drinking water, hand washing and sanitation facilities in and around the school compound. The software components are activities that promote a behavioral change in hygiene and sanitation practices. Each of these interventions is implemented through the school which is also responsible for maintaining records and reports related to the SSA. The Madrassa Modernization program targets the Muslim population subgroup. Madrassa originally referred to any type of educational institution. However, during the colonial period in India, the madrassas turned into institutions for Islamic religious and cultural studies. The Madrassa Modernization intervention provides grants for madrassas to focus on ‘modernizing’ teaching methods and curriculum by bringing in mainstream courses. Additionally, the madrassa schools that previously were not entitled to government support are now entitled to SSA grants and interventions that encourage enrollment. It is hoped that out-of-school Muslim children who may be reluctant to join mainstream schools can be drawn to the madrassa.

The Civil Works intervention involves the construction of schools, classrooms and resource centers, including the procurement of furniture. Up to 50% of the annual plan expenditure can be availed for Civil Works. The village education committees were
envisioned as part of the decentralized management structure for schools. Their primary role is to establish a link between the school and the community. The link between the school and the community is maintained through community participation in the management of school related programs. In addition, the village education committees are also expected to work towards improving accessibility and participation of children, particularly girls. Finally, the committees are given grants to undertake the Midday Meal intervention and the overall development of the school.

The Residential Schools intervention, also known as the Kasturba Gandhi Balika Vidhyalaya intervention, targets girls from scheduled caste, scheduled tribe, other backward class and minority communities in difficult situations. The scheme is applicable only in Educationally Backward Blocks. Educationally Backward Blocks are regions in a district that, as per census data of 2001, have female literacy lower that average for the country and the gender gap in literacy is higher than the average for the country. The program aims to provide the students an environment conducive to learning while easing parental stress. The School Supplies intervention involves the provision of free textbooks to all students. Money left over after providing free text books, is used for providing stationery, shoes, note books, uniform material etc.

Statistics provided by NUEPA (2010) show that since the SSA was implemented in 2003, enrollment has generally gone up for the population subgroups. Table 1-4 below provides a comparison of the growth in enrollment for girls, scheduled tribes, scheduled castes and Muslims, which are reflected in their share to total enrollment.
Statement of the Problem

Low school enrollment among disadvantaged populations in India has been a concern for the various governments in India since independence. Successive education policies in their many iterations, failed to achieve the goal of universal primary school enrollment. In response to the immediacy created by the framing of the MDGs in 2000, India’s Education for All Campaign, called the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan, was launched in 2001. As no pretest data in the form of school enrollment indicators were collected prior to the launch of the program, conclusive evidence of program effectiveness, which is traditionally measured through a quantitative analysis of data, is absent. To date little information is available to show how stakeholders in this region perceive these nationally targeted interventions aimed at increasing school enrollment. Though various statistics such as those provided by NUEPA indicate that school enrollment has increased in India,
it is not clear whether the stakeholders would attribute this increase to the SSA. The impact of contextual difficulties on the effectiveness of the SSA in increasing school enrollment is also unknown. Moreover, there is no information on the adequacy of the SSA in addressing the problem of low secondary school enrollment even after the implementation of the SSA. It is particularly important to understand the challenges to secondary school enrollment that the SSA fails to address if the program is to achieve its goal of universal secondary school enrollment.

**Purpose of the Study**

The purpose of this study is to understand stakeholders’ perceptions of the SSA’s effectiveness in increasing school enrollment in India. Engestrom’s (1987) Cultural Historical Activity Theory informs my perspective on this topic, and the study is participatory in nature. Cultural Historical Activity Theory sees certain historical developments and cultural influences as informing practice, which is particularly relevant when studying the historically disadvantaged populations being considered for this study. Engeström’s human activity system combines two earlier generations of human activity articulated by Vygotsky’s model (1978) of individual action and Leontiev’s (1978, 1981) notion of collective activity. According to Engeström, the human activity system comprises seven interacting components: a subject, an object, instruments, rules, community, divisions of labor, and outcomes. There is no information on the adequacy of the SSA in addressing the problem of low secondary school enrollment even after the implementation of the SSA. It is particularly important to understand the challenges to
secondary school enrollment that the SSA fails to address if the program is to achieve its goal of universal secondary school enrollment.

Perception, exemplified in the work of Merleau-Ponty (2002), is the collection of experience which directs every conscious action. Merleau-Ponty emphasizes that “[p]erception is precisely that kind of act in which there can be no question of setting the act itself apart from the end to which it is directed. Perception and the perceived necessarily have the same existential modality “(p. 435).

In the present study, program effectiveness refers to the degree to which a program achieves an intended outcome in practice. According to Greene (1994) “Program effectiveness, for example, has many hues, depending on one’s vantage point in both space and time”. Program effectiveness in this study refers to the effectiveness of the SSA as a program to increase school enrollment.\footnote{In considering ‘perceptions of effectiveness’ the intention is not to study effectiveness but to study perceptions. However, perceptions is not a stand-alone concept and so more precisely the study is about PERCEPTIONS of effectiveness. The focus is more on PERCEPTIONS and to a lesser extent on effectiveness. The study will give a sense of how stakeholders perceive the effectiveness of the program. The study will comment on the effectiveness of the program but is not intended to serve as conclusive evidence of program effectiveness.} In India, this program includes a set of interventions aimed at achieving universal school enrollment: the Midday Meal, the Stipend for Girls, School Sanitation and Hygiene Education, Madrassa Modernization, Civil Works, the Village Education Committee, the Residential Hostel for Girls and School Supplies.

More specifically, for this study, the interventions targeting Muslim, scheduled caste, scheduled tribe and girl populations were considered. The study used interview and photovoice methods to collect data. Photovoice is an action research method that allows people to identify, represent, and improve their communities using photography.
Stakeholders under consideration are the state government, international non-governmental organizations (e.g. UNICEF, World Bank), local non-governmental organizations (e.g. CINI, Sparsh), teachers and parents.

**Research Questions**

The primary research question for this dissertation is:

*What are the stakeholders’ perceptions of the effectiveness of the SSA in increasing school enrollment in India?*

This central question was explored through three specific secondary research questions:

1) To what extent did the various stakeholders attribute the increase in school enrollment since 2004 to the SSA (Education for All Campaign)?
2) What difficulties did stakeholders experience in implementing SSA and how did they impact the effectiveness of the SSA?
3) What are the inadequacies of the SSA in addressing the challenges to secondary school enrollment, according to the stakeholders?

**Significance of the Study**

This study carries significance for both the body of knowledge in the field and public policy. While much research has been done on various aspects of school enrollment, the literature suffers from two primary problems. First, current explanations
of the concept of school enrollment do not account for regional variations in the dynamics of school enrollment. Second, the literature provides no understanding of the perspectives of the various stakeholders involved in implementing school enrollment programs as program effectiveness is generally analyzed using quantitative techniques. Stakeholder perceptions are important because there is a growing emphasis on understanding operations of programs from insiders or stakeholders' perspectives.

The study addresses these gaps in the literature by a) developing a conceptual framework specifically for school enrollment and b) providing an understanding of stakeholders’ perceptions of the effectiveness of the SSA. Very importantly, this study includes parental perceptions that are of particular importance since it is parents who are the ultimate decision makers in enrolling a child in school.

In the realm of public policy, it has been approximately six years since the SSA was implemented in India, and it is time to understand the effectiveness of this policy initiative. The current secondary school net enrollment ratio is 56.22%. It is obvious that the SSA is inadequate in mitigating all the challenges to secondary school enrollment in India that is vital for the development of the country. According to Bruns, Mingat and Rakotomala (2003), secondary education is an instrument that has a powerful impact in the reduction of inequality and poverty and also in laying foundations for economic growth that can be sustained, institutions that are effective and sound governance. This calls for a review of the implementation of the program to identify concerns of the parents that the SSA does not address and understand the difficulties in program implementation. This study increases our understanding of those challenges to secondary school enrollment that have persisted even after the implementation of the SSA in India.
and in particular, among the population subgroups under consideration. This study provides policy makers insight into areas where the SSA needs to be improvised for success in achieving universal secondary school enrollment.

**Expected Advocacy/Participatory Changes**

This study employs photovoice – a participatory action research approach in collecting data from parents. According to Kemmis and Wilkinson (1998), “Participatory action is recursive or dialectical and is focused on bringing about change in practices. Thus, at the end of advocacy/participatory studies, researchers advance an action agenda for change”. The results identify the strengths and problem areas of the SSA as perceived by the stakeholders.

Further, the researcher will advance an action agenda for change by disseminating the findings of the study to policy makers, funders, media, and others who may be mobilized to bring about change. This will be done by presenting the findings and recommendations of the study at seminars organized in collaboration with the governments in each of the participating states. The study will identify the challenges to secondary school enrollment at which level a substantial number of children remain out of school. The researcher will advocate for the implementation of improvements in the interventions or the development of new strategies where needed. It is expected that the state governments and collaborating non-governmental organizations will consider the recommendations of the study and take steps to make the SSA more effective.
Further, in reference to the advocacy/participatory paradigm, Creswell (2007) illustrates “the basic tenet of this world view is that research should contain an action agenda for reform that may change the lives of the participants, the institutions in which they live and work, or even the researcher’s life”. This study will change the lives of the participants by creating conditions that enable all children of marginalized populations such as the scheduled caste, scheduled tribes, Muslims, girls and rural populations to avail of schooling opportunities beyond the primary level.

**Design of the Study**

This dissertation employs qualitative case study research in order to arrive at some possible understandings of the questions previously outlined. Three UNICEF education officers, nine state government officers, six representatives of local non-governmental organizations, 18 teachers and 135 parents will be involved as the stakeholder participants in this study. The data to be collected consists of documents, semi-structured interviews and photographs and focus group discussions related to the photographs. Data was analyzed simultaneously with data collection, and the result will be a narrative text describing the perceptions of the various stakeholders about the SSA effectiveness in increasing school enrollment, difficulties in implementation and the SSA’s adequacy in addressing the challenges to secondary school enrollment in India.
Limitations and Delimitations

Limitations are in reference to the internal validity of the design of the study; they “identify potential weaknesses of the study” (Creswell, 1994). This study faces three limitations. First, this study only considers the interventions within the SSA that directly target the scheduled castes, scheduled tribes, Muslims, girls and rural populations. There may be other aspects of the SSA which have had an impact on school enrollment but have not been examined.

Second, children who are also stakeholders in universal primary school enrollment have not been considered for the study. Though children are important stakeholders in the SSA, it was expected that they would not have views that are radically different from their parents about the effectiveness of SSA.

The third limitation is that sometimes the data sources may not be complete difficult to access, or false (Mason and McKenney, 1997). In this study, it was possible to calculate growth in the net enrollment ratio for only two years as the data prior to 2005-06 was incomplete. The results also depend upon responses of the participants who may have been biased in their opinions and may want to project what is good for the image of the organization or government. In addition, one of states was a Maoist stronghold and participants in this state may have been reluctant to honestly discuss the challenges to secondary school enrollment for fear of Maoist repercussions. To reduce anxiety in this regard, the participants were told that their names would be known only to the researcher and this helped mitigate the potential for their not being forthright. Additionally, participants may have also forgotten certain information or the information
could be inconsistent. Other possibilities include the use of a different set of participants, and the conduct of interviews at a different time may have resulted in different meanings (Seidman, 1998). However, appropriate measures such as data triangulation were taken to deal with these limitations.

Delimitations refer to the issues of external validity or generalizability. Creswell (1994) explains that “delimitations address how the study will be narrowed”. This study is limited to three districts, each within three states of India, and the use of this multiple-case methodology enhances the transferability of the study. Considering that there is immense variation in India in terms of the political ideology of the state government, culture, religion, geography and ethnicity is immense, the sample may not be sufficient to capture every contextual variation in India, and hence not be generalizable.

Summary

Chapter 1 provides an overview of the study. The first section describes the contextual background and the population subgroups considered in the study. The second section describes the origin and historical development of the SSA. Finally, the third section discusses the statement of the problem, purpose of the study, research questions, and significance of the study. It also provides a brief overview of the research design involved in this dissertation. Chapter 2 describes the conceptual framework for this dissertation, Chapter 3 discusses the research methodology, Chapter 4 details the analysis of the data collected and discussion of the findings and Chapter 5 provides the conclusions for the study.
Chapter 2
Review of Literature

Stakeholder perceptions of the effectiveness of the SSA in increasing school enrollment are examined in this study. This chapter utilizes education literature to explain the conceptual framework of the study. In this chapter, I trace the genesis of Education for All movement that has culminated in global Education for All programs such as the SSA in India. A synthesis of the primary and secondary school enrollment literature is provided and a brief discussion of the significance of stakeholder perceptions to policy is included in this chapter. The chapter concludes by presenting an adaption of the Cultural Historical Activity Theory to form the theoretical underpinning of the study.

Genesis of ‘Education for All’ (EFA)

‘Education for All’ is a movement initiated by the UNESCO around the world with the primary purpose of meeting the fundamental learning needs of all children, youth and adults by 2015. In reality, education has come to be equated with schooling, and Education for All can be translated as schooling for all. The focus of Education for All really is to get all school-aged children enrolled in school. According to Hoppers (1998) “It was school education for all just being labeled ‘Education for All’”. In her book; Whose Education for All? The Recolonization of the African Mind, Brock-Utne (2000) bemoans: “In publications written after the Jomtien conference, especially by
authors from the North, we find that Education for All is frequently equated with primary education or Schooling for All (SFA)” (p. 10). Moreover, this is evident in that four of the six EFA goals (UNESCO, 2000) are related to primary schooling. Goal 1 is to improve childhood care and education for children below the age of five. Goal 2 is to provide compulsory primary education for all children at no cost. Goal 5 calls for achieving gender parity in primary and secondary education by 2005. Goal 6 calls for improving the quality of education and ensuring excellence so that all, especially in literacy, numeracy and essential life skills, achieve learning outcomes. This goal again is really a reference to primary schooling considering that literacy and numeracy are outcomes expected at this level.

The origin of Education for All or ‘schooling for all’, as some would call it, can be traced to the spread of schooling witnessed over three phases. The first phase was driven by the spread of Christianity and Islam. The “spread of religions, especially Islam and Christianity, brought with them their own educational forms and systems of schools and universities. These interacted with and often disrupted and displaced indigenous forms of education, ceremonies, skills and crafts training” (Tikkly, 2001). In the context of the Indian sub-continent, these religions brought a shift in the Hindu mode of thinking in which education was the preserve of the upper castes. Christianity and Islam did not advocate a hierarchical social structure and instead brought with them the notion of equality among all. ‘All’, therefore, were expected to have equal rights to education. The advent of Christianity and Islam around the globe sowed the seeds of the conceptual origins of Education for All but did not substantially increase the number of people with access to education.
It was during the second phase, the period of European colonialism, that schooling was really cemented. The changing dynamics of the world economy served as the driving force behind the spread of schooling during this phase.

Furthermore, colonialism paved the way for missionary activity that promoted schooling among greater numbers of people. The impact of European colonialism on schooling was substantial. According to Tikkly (2001):

It provided a key mechanism and template for the spread of contemporary forms of education….colonial education spread a common structure of schooling. It also spread form of curriculum based on an episteme (ground base of knowledge) with its roots in the Graeco-Roman tradition. Colonial education either superseded or worked alongside earlier forms and has provided the basis on which post-colonial reform efforts have had to build. In this respect, colonial forms of schooling and the pedagogies and forms of knowledge that they engendered have proved remarkably resistant to change….further, colonial education was instrumental in the globalization of English and other European languages. (p. 7)

Today the Western form of schooling is dominant throughout the world (Altbach & Kelly 1986; Meyer 1992; Serpell 1999). It has replaced traditional forms of schooling in former colonies of European powers as well as in countries that have never been colonized. According to Carnoy (1974), “The spread of schooling was carried out in the context of imperialism and colonialism, in the spread of mercantilism and colonialism…..and it cannot be separated from that context”. This spread of a single almost monolithic form of schooling is well acknowledged in the World Bank (1990) report:

Through the influence of the UN and other international organizations, primary school curricula are remarkably similar world-wide. Regardless of the level of economic or educational development, countries now teach the same subjects and accord them the same relative importance. Approximately 35% of available instructional time is devoted to the acquisition of language skills and 18% of time to mathematics. Science,
social studies and the arts are given equal weight, about half that of mathematics and one-fourth that of language. (p. 16)

Though European colonialism spread a Western form of schooling around the globe, schooling was still elitist in nature. The third phase in the spread or globalization of schooling began in the 18th century with a dramatic increase in the pace of educational expansion around the world. Baker and LeTendre (2005) explain:

This all started to change some 150 to 200 years ago with the rise of mass schooling in many Western nations. There were still elite forms of education, but over time schooling was developed in principle for all children to learn academic skills through a more or less common curricula ....Full enrollment in elementary education was achieved before the middle of the twentieth century in wealthier nations and over the next forty years in poorer nations....At the core of the spread of mass schooling is a set of fundamental ideas that were unique just a short time ago but now have become widely accepted and even cherished. For instance, the ideas that all children should be educated; that the nation has an interest in this and should furnish funds; that education is for the collective good; that children should start early and receive continuous instruction for a relatively large number of years; that tradition of statuses such as race, gender, religion, or language should not be barriers to mass schooling; and that academic cognitive skills are useful to all children are institutional foundations that underpin and give modern schooling widespread meaning in society. (p. 7)

In the later half of the 20th century schooling began to be seen as a major catalyst for national and human development. The benefits to schooling were found to be varied. Education increased the human capital of a nation. It brought social returns such as lower population growth and mortality rates, and increased life expectancy, among others. Education also had substantial economic returns in terms of higher labor productivity. This made it imperative for national governments to promote schooling if the nation was to progress. Baker and Wiseman (2006) explain, “What has been particularly noticeable is the degree to which governments in all types of nations have come to see that
education plays a central role in the future development of the nation’s human capital, and in turn governments have become the main providers of schooling”. Further, education also increases the human capabilities of an individual. It maximizes inherent human potential allowing an individual to direct his capabilities in making life fulfilling. Chabbott (2002) illustrates,

A newer trend in the push for education at all levels is the shift from a national economy focus to an individual focus as the main objects of development. As economic growth proved disappointingly slow in these early decades-or population growth outstripped economic gains –emerging professionals in development organizations looked for new ways to define development in terms of individual welfare. In this evolving discourse, education—previously just one of several policies to achieve national economic growth—became central to individual or human development.

With the connection between education and human development established, education then became a basic human right. Education as a fundamental human right underpins the Education for All movement. Education which was advocated earlier on national, political or economic terms was now cast in terms of the human right of the individual at conferences around the globe celebrating the need for “education for all” (Chabbott, 1999).

Education for All assumed urgency with the setting of fixed targets at the World Conference on Education for All in 1990 and subsequently at the Education for All Dakar summit as well as the MDGs summit in the year 2000. To fast-track the achievement of the MDG of universal primary school enrollment, a global partnership between donor and developing countries called the Education for All – Fast Track Initiative was launched. While some countries have joined the global Education for All – Fast-Track initiative, others like India have implemented their own Education for All interventions such as the
SSA in collaboration with donors from international organizations and wealthy countries. Education is an investment for the enhancement of human capital that is impeded by poverty. Developed economies recognize this and provide free elementary education (Hoenack, 1996). Since poverty is a constraint to primary school enrollment (Filmer & Pritchett, 1999 & 2001; Banerjee, 2000; Orazem, Glewe & Patrinos, 2007), the interventions to achieve universal primary school enrollment are designed to alleviate its consequences. According to the World Bank (2004), poor people are generally the last to enroll in primary education, therefore government spending favors low income households to improve access. Castro-Leal, Dayton, Demery, and Mehra (1999) found that in many African countries education subsidies remain poorly targeted in spite of the benefits they bring. Against this backdrop, since the 1990s a number of programs such as the SSA in India have been implemented around the world to fast-track universal primary school enrollment by reducing schooling expenses and increasing public subsidies in education.

**Universal Primary School Enrollment**

Since the framing of universal primary school enrollment as a global goal in 1990, there has been a surge in related literature. This literature is largely composed of evaluative and descriptive reports, theoretical papers and research studies. Broadly speaking, the literature can be divided into five categories. The first category examines how close the world is to achieving universal primary school enrollment, whether it is achievable and what kind of reform for education policy, and domestic and international
financing increments is required to be taken to achieve it (Bruns, Mingat, and Rakotomalala, 2003; UN Millennium Project, 2005). The following is advocated by the UN Millennium Project (2005) for the international community to reach the goal of universal primary school enrollment:

Three strategies can help get out-of-school children into school: crafting specific interventions to reach out-of-school children, increasing educational opportunities (formal and nonformal) for girls and women, and increasing access to postprimary education…. Specific interventions have been shown, in some settings, to get hard-to-reach children into school. These include eliminating school fees, instituting conditional cash transfers, using school feeding programs as an incentive to attend school, and implementing school health programs to reduce absenteeism…. women’s literacy programs should be considered an important complement to interventions to increase access and retention at the primary school level. (p. 53)

Further, Bruns et al. (2003) explain:

Research suggests that many of the social and economic returns to primary education require that a minimum threshold of five or six years of schooling be attained—hence the importance of ensuring primary school completion, and not just primary school access…. where political will is strong, effective reforms are adopted, and international support is adequate, dramatic progress in increasing primary completion rates is possible….. Some 86 countries, however, are at risk of not reaching the goal unless progress is accelerated. (p. 29)

The second category looks at the cost of achieving universal primary school enrollment (Glewwe & Zhao, 2005; Vandemoortele & Roy, 2004, Binder, 2006; Bruns, Mingat, and Rakotomalala, 2003). As would be expected, the costs to achieve universal primary and secondary education are very high. Bruns et al. (2003) estimated the costs to be:

close to $1.9 billion per year—would be needed in Africa…. The four South Asian countries we studied would require about $397 million per year in external funding; the three low-income countries analyzed in Latin
America and the Caribbean would face a gap of $48 million per year; two countries in East Asia would require external support of about $36 million per year; the one Middle Eastern country in the sample would need $70 million per year; and the three countries analyzed in the Europe and Central Asia region would have a combined financing gap of about $34 million per year…. the total incremental costs of achieving the education MDG (through five or six years of schooling) in all low-income countries, including all needs, would total an estimated $9.7 billion per year over the period to 2015. (p. 10)

Similarly, according to Binder (2006), “achieving universal secondary education imposes a heavy burden on the poorest countries. Under the 25-year time horizon and with present cost structures, low-income countries would need to more than double their current spending on secondary education, at a cost of nearly 2 percent of GDP”.

A third category relates to factors hindering the achievement of universal primary school enrollment (Brock & Cammish, 1997). These factors include costs of schooling, distance and loss of labor/income. For example, in Ghana, when parents were asked the reasons for their children not being in school, about half answered, “School is too expensive” or the “child needed to work at home” (World Bank, 2004). Bommier and Lambert (2000) found: 1) children who do not live very near a school enroll later and 2) that the further away from school the children live, the shorter their schooling duration is. Alderman et al (2001) investigated the impact of the health of children on school enrollments in rural regions of Pakistan using longitudinal data. This study found that the health of children is three times as important for enrollment than suggested by popular estimates that assume child health rather than be determined by household choices that are influenced by factors such as health endowments and preferences is predetermined.

The fourth category relates to non-formal approaches to achieving education for all (Ranaweera, 1990; de Armengol, 1990; Nath et al., 1999; Thompson, 2001). In
general non-formal education approaches were found to have a positive impact on their
target populations: street children and children with disabilities. For example, Thompson
examined some non-formal education approaches in Africa and found that responses in
the form of alternative and non-formal approaches to basic education to meet the need
and demand of the educational needs of disadvantaged populations were appropriate.
The cases studied included work and culture oriented literacy (Burkina Faso, Mali and
Senegal); special needs education (Kenya and Uganda); rehabilitation and education of
street children (Undugu Basic Education Programme, Kenya); community school
approaches (Zambia); political literacy (Sierra Leone) and methodological innovation in
formal education (Zimbabwe). These cases demonstrated the diversity of the objectives
and focal clientele that non-formal education programs and alternative education
programs seek to target.

In another study, Nath et al. explored the impact of the Non-Formal Education
Programme (NFPE) of the Bangladesh Rural Advancement Committee (BRAC) on the
achievement of basic education skills for children in rural Bangladesh. It was found that
BRAC children performed significantly better in writing and life skills than children from
informal schools on the four components of basic education. In reading and numeracy
equal performance was observed. Although the children who had never attended school
showed poor performance, some children had developed knowledge of life skills and
more than half the children had acquired numeracy skills. The study concluded that the
impact of BRAC’s education program on basic education of children in rural Bangladesh
was positive.
The fifth category of literature concerns the evaluation of various interventions in order to understand policy effectiveness in increasing school enrollment (Guttman & Kosonen, 1994; Ravallion and Wodon, 2001; Sperling, 2006; Deininger, 2003). To illustrate, the study by Ravallion and Wodon examined the effects of the pure school-price change induced by the Food-for-Education program in rural regions of Bangladesh on school enrollments and participation of children in the labor force. The theoretical model predicted that the enrollment of students was increased by the subsidy, but the effect of the subsidy on child labor was not clear. The model indicated that the enrollment of children increased much more than child labor was reduced because of the subsidy. Current incomes from higher school attendance as a result of the subsidy were protected by substitution effects. The study found that to reduce the incidence of child labor, stipends of considerable less value than the mean child wage was sufficient to have nearly full attendance in school amongst participants. Further, the study conducted by Deininger evaluated the impact of the Universal Primary Education program in Uganda which removed the requirement of fees for primary school enrollment. It was found that a dramatic increase in primary school attendance was associated with the program, a substantial reduction in the inequalities in attendance related to income, region and gender was also associated with the program, and the fees paid to the school by parents did not decrease at the secondary level though it decreased at the primary level. A general decline in the quality of education was also observed at the same time. Deininger concluded that the policy needed to be further supported by improvements in the quality of the school and access to secondary education to be able to lead to improvements in attendance that can be sustained and to change these into higher levels of human capital.
Similar studies examining the effectiveness of programs show a general consensus over the types of programs that bring success. Sperling (2006) explains: “While greater steps must be taken to expand the things we know work—eliminating fees, making schools girl-friendly and close-by, and establishing well-designed school lunch programs, for instance—we must also expand our knowledge of other areas”. While the implementation of such programs has resulted in substantial progress at the primary education level, the progress at the secondary school level has been slow.

**Universal Secondary School Enrollment**

At the secondary school level, the experts point out that school enrollment programs similar to those at the primary level have been implemented. However, the progress in school enrollment at the secondary level does not match the progress at the primary level. According to Binder (2006),

Since the 1960s, access to primary education worldwide has increased dramatically. As of the year 2000, 96 of 112 reporting low-income countries had primary gross enrollment rates that exceeded 75 percent. Access to secondary schooling, unfortunately, has not followed suit. Of these same countries, only 39 reported similarly high gross enrollment rates for secondary education. (p. 455)

According to some experts, there has been stagnation in the expansion of secondary schooling (Bloom, 2006; Binder and Woodruff, 2002; IDB, 1998; Lewin and Caillods, 2001). Secondary school enrollment traditionally has lagged behind primary school enrollment. Several studies attempt to explain what factors affect secondary school enrollment. For instance, Di Gropello (2006) found that many countries with low
school enrollment at the secondary level fail to use resources as efficiently as they could to improve the quality and coverage and assign too less resources to secondary education.

Suryadarma et al. (2006) conducted a study to determine why despite near universal primary school attendance, secondary school enrollment in Indonesia was low. They found that the main cause was that during the transition between primary and junior secondary education levels there was attrition. They then used a longitudinal household survey dataset to examine the reasons for attrition. The found that 1) the probability of continuing was significantly affected by the consumption expenditure; 2) the child’s ability, which is measured by performance in the primary school national final examination, and the child’s gender, where girls have a lower probability of continuing influence the chances of continuing directly; 3) where children from Muslim families have a significantly lower probability of transition, religious background played a significant role; 4) children’s probability of continuing to secondary school was increased by constructing more schools; and 5) children’s continuation to junior secondary school was negatively impacted by higher employment opportunity in a community.

Further, the decision of a child to enroll in school may also be impacted by the desire to conform with other children as a result of pressure from peers or norms followed in the society he lives (Akerlof, 1997; Bernheim, 1994; Glaeser & Scheinkman, 2003; Akerlof & Kranton, 2002). Table 2-1 displayed below compares the challenges to universal school enrollment in select regions of the world with the findings of the United Nations organizations:
A number of experts have addressed how the world can improve secondary school enrollment. Di Gropello (2006) prepared a report for The World Bank addressing the following questions: How can countries address the different challenges they face in secondary education? How can countries grow their education systems in a responsible and efficient manner? How can countries with different technical and financial capacities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>United Nations</th>
<th>South Asia</th>
<th>Africa</th>
<th>East Asia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Distance</td>
<td>Child health (Pakistan)</td>
<td>Costs of schooling (Ghana)</td>
<td>Consumption expenditure (Indonesia)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loss of income</td>
<td>Language barriers (Pakistan)</td>
<td>Loss of labor (Ghana)</td>
<td>Child’s ability (Indonesia)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Too few allocation of resources by countries</td>
<td>Income poverty (Pakistan)</td>
<td>Forced migration, conflict situations (Somalia)</td>
<td>Religious background (Indonesia)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child labor</td>
<td>Peer pressure and social norms (Bangladesh, Pakistan)</td>
<td>Income poverty (Tanzania)</td>
<td>Higher employment opportunity in a community (Indonesia)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2-1: Comparison of challenges to universal school enrollment in select regions.
address those challenges? Experiences and data from East Asia and Latin America were used for the report which makes the following suggestions: 1) provide information on labor market opportunities and payoffs, and educational options, 2) provide targeted grants (e.g., scholarships, conditional cash transfers, vouchers) at the lower secondary level to address credit constraints, 3) expand public funds, encourage contributions from the private sector or ask the international community for greater assistance to finance secondary education, 4) decrease inequity through public intervention to ease borrowing constraints and improve the quality of schooling for the poor, 5) increase the scope for private financing, 6) opt for broad-based lower secondary education.

Further, another study by Schady, and Araujo (2006) for the The World Bank examined whether when transfers are given on the condition of displaying certain behaviors, such as families enrolling their children in school, program effects are larger. The study found that the program had an impact on school enrollment that was large and positive, about 10 percentage points, and an impact on child work that was large and negative, about 17 percentage points. The study also found that even though the school enrollment requirement was never monitored or enforced in Ecuador some households believed that school enrollment was a requirement attached to the transfers. This helped in explaining the magnitude of program effects.

A number of studies have found positive effects of cash transfer programs on enrollment in schools in other Latin American countries. This finding is reported by Cardoso, and Portela Souza (2004) in Brazil, Maluccio, and Flores (2005) in Nicaragua, Behrman, Sengupta, and Todd (2005) and Schultz (2004) in Mexico, Glewwe, and Olinto (2004) in Honduras and Attanasio, Fitzsimmons, and Gomez (2005) in Colombia. This
positive effect of conditional cash transfers on school enrollment has been attributed in a large part to the conditions attached to the cash transfers (Bourguignon, Ferreira, and Leite 2003 in Brazil; Todd and Wolpin 2003; Attanasio, Meghir, and Santiago 2005; and De Janvry and Sadoulet 2006 in Mexico).

Littlefield et al. (2003) conducted a study involving the review of evidence showing that a critical contextual factor that had a strong impact on the achievement of the MDGs was the financial services available to low-income households (“microfinance”). In the case of education, it was found that during the period 1997-99, boys' secondary-school enrollment rates was positively impacted by borrowing from SEWA Bank, which rose to 70 percent. However, the enrollment of girls and boys at the primary-school level or of girls at the secondary-school level or showed a weak relationship to SEWA participation.

Table 2-2 below compares the interventions implemented in various regions of the world to achieve universal school enrollment and the suggestions by the United Nations organizations to increase enrollment.

Table 2-2: Comparison of regional interventions for universal school enrollment.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>India</th>
<th>Africa</th>
<th>South America</th>
<th>United Nations Organizations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Midday Meal</td>
<td>Rehabilitation and education of street children (Kenya)</td>
<td>Cash transfer programs (Mexico, Colombia, Nicaragua,</td>
<td>School feeding programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stipend for Girls</td>
<td>Special needs education (Kenya and Uganda)</td>
<td>PACES program of providing vouchers (Colombia)</td>
<td>Conditional cash transfers, scholarships, vouchers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School Sanitation</td>
<td>Community school approaches (Zambia)</td>
<td>Rural education project involving specialized teacher training targeting disadvantaged students (Colombia)</td>
<td>School health programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civil Works</td>
<td>School meals (Kenya)</td>
<td>Primary school breakfast programme (Peru)</td>
<td>Increasing access to postprimary education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School Supplies</td>
<td>Elimination of primary fees (Uganda)</td>
<td>Program for the Eradication of Child Labor (Brazil)</td>
<td>Nonformal approaches for girls and women</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In the India though the SSA targets children below the age of fifteen, the growth in secondary school enrollment continues to be low. Since the implementation of the Education for All at the secondary school level, the increase in enrollment is similar at 11.54 percentage points for the primary level and 14.57 percentage points for the secondary level. Though the growth at the secondary level is higher than that at the primary level, the difference is not substantial. Considering that secondary school enrollment was only 59.17 in 2005, the growth in enrollment is low when compared to its potential.

Experts increasingly call for research looking into implementation issues in the context of developing countries, as policies often fail due to contextual challenges. In the latter half of the 20th century, comparativists underscored the need to investigate implementation issues, not just reform policies (Napier, 2005). Research questions that are framed in terms of practical benefit for policy makers and educationists could enable more successful implementation by informing policy makers as recommended by Reimers and McGinn (1997). More studies of macro-level policies versus micro-level realities; investigations of the complexities of educational innovation and the importance of planning; the end products of implementation processes; and the levels at which implementation obstructed, terminated, or successfully completed are also needed (Adams & Chen, 1981; Ketudat, 1984). Implementation issues and micro-level realities are best understood by those participating in the implementation at the micro-level. Gaining an understanding of these people’s perceptions would be useful in refining the particular policy initiatives.
Significance of Perceptions to Policy

Understanding the perceptions of the teachers, parents and other stakeholders involved in SSA in India is an important aspect of the policy process. Research of policy effectiveness has traditionally relied on methods that have roots in a scientific positivism. According to (Rao and Woolcock, 2003),

Many of the most important issues facing disadvantaged populations—their identities, perceptions, and beliefs, etc. cannot be meaningfully reduced to numbers or adequately understood without reference to the immediate context in which they live. Most surveys are designed far from the places where they will be administered….Certain marginalized communities, for example, are small in number (the disabled, widows) or difficult for outsiders to access (sex workers, victims of domestic abuse), rendering them unlikely subjects for study through a large representative survey. (p. 165)

Participatory approaches useful in enabling outsiders learn in cost-effective ways about project impacts and poverty that reflect grounded experience. The question of whether it is valuable to consider a possible state of the world as it is perceived by participants in the policy process is often given insufficient attention. “If there are good theoretical or methodological grounds….it is essential to consider whether different participants might perceive the status of affairs differently” (Greenberg, Miller, Mohr, and Vladeck, 2000). According to Allen, Eby, and Lentz (2006),

“Participant-perceived” program effectiveness is important to study as an outcome for several reasons. Perceptions of program effectiveness likely play a large role in determining whether or not individuals will continue in the program, if others will sign up for the program, and ultimately whether or not the program itself continues. Other desired outcomes of the program take time to evolve and favorable program reactions are likely key to continuing with the program long enough to realize those outcomes. (p. 126)
This approach thus allows the identification of more than one path to a policy outcome: the result may be explained by more than one combination of conditions in contrast with mainstream econometric and statistical tools (Rihoux and Grimm, 2006). This approach is therefore very helpful in policy practice because policy effectiveness often depends upon settings at the national/regional level and upon sector-specific features, and that different political, cultural and administrative traditions often need implementation schemes that are differentiated to suit the context (Audretsch, Grimm and Wessner, 2005).

Though the importance of “participant-perceived” program effectiveness is emphasized in the realm of public policy, perceptions are often quantified resulting in lack of in-depth meaning. For example, a study was conducted by Jishi, Khalek, and Hamdy (2009) to evaluate the clerkship phase student perceptions of the effectiveness of the Professional Skills Program. The researchers used a mailed questionnaire to obtain student perceptions. A 5-point Likert scale was used to assess closed-ended questions. Comments on areas of strengths or suggestions for improvement were also invited. A group of students in the clerkship years were used to pilot the questionnaire. The study found that in relation to three levels of Kirkpatrick outcome measures, students were positive about the clinical skills training in preparing them for clerkship. This was true especially for the domains of procedural skills and physical examination. The study also pointed out that some areas were in need of program development, particularly in the history-taking domain. The study provides valuable information about student perceptions. However, the study provides no details explaining, for example, why students were more positive about their procedural skills domain over others.
Qualitative approaches to understanding perceptions allow for more attention to describing context and reaching out to members of minority groups. Qualitative approaches are also better for engaging the poor as partners in data collection, analysis, and interpretation. Perceptions also give policy makers a firsthand account of problems confronting the target population and which are therefore important to policy framing and implementation. The perceptions of relevant actors are important determinative variables in many theories about public policy, but policy theories rarely specify whose perceptions are to be taken into account (Greenberg et al., 2000). As a result, it is largely the perceptions of the subjects in a particular policy context that is considered while the perceptions of the objects or target population are largely ignored. According to Kelly, and Maynard-Moody (1993), “Recently, a growing number of evaluation research analysts have used a post-positivist approach based on understanding agency operations from insiders' or stakeholders' perspectives. This calls for greater involvement by the analyst in facilitating discussions among insiders”.

In conclusion, though there has been a surge in literature about universal primary school enrollment and various aspects related to it, there exist a few gaps. First, a qualitative approach to studying program effectiveness is almost non-existent in the literature. The literature on the effectiveness of Education for All programs largely comprises quantitative research. This literature is useful in describing the magnitude of program effectiveness. However, it is does not provide a comprehensive understanding of the difficulties of implementing policy interventions that would be useful in improving the effectiveness of the programs. Second, there is very little literature explaining the inadequacies of the Education for All programs in addressing the challenges to school
enrollment at the secondary level. Third, the voice of particular groups of stakeholders in education—for example, parents, who are often the target population for policy interventions, and teachers; the policy implementers have been largely ignored.

This study on the stakeholder perceptions of the effectiveness of the SSA in increasing school enrollment in India seeks to address these gaps in the literature by providing an understanding of the extent to which the increase in school enrollment can be attributed to the SSA, the difficulties in implementing the SSA and the inadequacies of the SSA.

The following sections explain the concepts of perceptions, program effectiveness and school enrollment that are the underlying basis of this study.

**Perceptions**

To investigate perceptions is theoretically and practically a complex matter. In his book, *Phenomenology of Perception*, Merleau-Ponty (1962) explains “perception to be the background of experience which guides every conscious action. The world is a field for perception, and human consciousness assigns meaning to the world. We cannot separate ourselves from our perceptions of the world”. Merleau-Ponty further emphasizes that “[p]erception is precisely that kind of act in which there can be no question of setting the act itself apart from the end to which it is directed. Perception and the perceived necessarily have the same existential modality, since perception is inseparable from the consciousness which it has, or rather is, of reaching the thing itself “. In this study, stakeholder perceptions hone in on what is perceived because of
interaction between experiences, culture, and the interpretation of the participants. In the context of this research, the experience of participating in the SSA leads to the formation of perceptions. As Merleau-Ponty explains, perception cannot stand alone because perception is meaningful only when considered with “the end to which it is directed”. With regard to the SSA, perceptions of effectiveness are directed towards benefits, difficulties, challenges and other aspects of the SSA. The experience of participating in the SSA leads stakeholders to form opinions or perceptions about the effectiveness of the program in enabling school enrollment. Instead of using the more common practice of measuring perceptions utilizing Likert scales in questionnaires and surveys, this study seeks to understand perceptions using interviews and photovoice.

**Program Effectiveness**

Program effectiveness in the present study refers to the effectiveness of the SSA as a program to increase school enrollment. In India, this program includes a set of interventions aimed at achieving universal school enrollment: the Midday Meal, the Stipend for Girls, School Sanitation and Hygiene Education, Madrassa Modernization, Civil Works, the Village Education Committee, the Residential Hostel for Girls and School Supplies. Program effectiveness is the degree to which a program achieves a desired outcome in practice. According to Greene (1994), “Program effectiveness, for

---

2 In considering ‘perceptions of effectiveness’, the intention is not to study effectiveness but to study perceptions. However, a perception is not a stand-alone concept and so more precisely the study is about PERCEPTIONS of effectiveness. The focus is more on PERCEPTIONS and to a lesser extent on effectiveness. The study will give a sense of how stakeholders perceive the effectiveness of the program. The study will comment on the effectiveness of the program but is not intended to serve as conclusive evidence of program effectiveness.
example, has many hues, depending on one’s vantage point in both space and time. Administrators might well understand effectiveness as efficiency, beneficiaries as significant relief from life’s daily struggles, and funders as the long-term as the long-term realization of tax dollars saved”. In the context of the SSA, the program may be effective in a variety of ways such as increasing school enrollment, empowering marginalized populations, increasing the accountability of the government etc. However, for the purpose of this study, the researcher is only interested in the effectiveness of the SSA in achieving the goal of universal school enrollment.

**School Enrollment**

Though school enrollment is a commonly used concept both in daily life and academic literature, the lack of conceptual definitions of school enrollment is conspicuous. One of the few definitions that capture the essence of enrollment is the United States Census definition. By this definition, “school enrollment refers to students in regular school, either public or private, which includes nursery school, kindergarten, elementary school, and schooling that leads to a high school diploma or college”. This definition, however, is context specific. It is based on the premise that an individual who is registered is attending school for a significant proportion of the school days; otherwise the individual would not be on the school records. This definition uses enrollment as a broad term that implies minimum attendance. This understanding, however, is insufficient when discussing school enrollment in the Indian context.
In regions such as the Indian subcontinent enrollment is a necessary but not sufficient condition for attendance. Individuals may continue to be registered in school even though their attendance is below stipulated requirements. School enrollment figures in this context reflect more appropriately the number of students registered in a school but not necessarily attending a required minimum number of days in school. “Moreover, enrollment does not necessarily mean attendance, attendance does not necessarily mean receiving an education, and receiving an education does not necessarily mean receiving good education. High enrollment ratios may give the mistaken impression that a high proportion of school-age children are being well educated “(Cohen, Bloom, Malin & Curry; 2006).

Ambiguous operational definitions of school enrollment are, relatively speaking, more available in the literature. A proxy that is often used in reference to enrollment causing ambiguity is attendance. For example, primary net attendance rate is defined as NAR (revised definition) = Number of children of primary school age in primary school or higher / Total number of children of primary school age (UNESCO Institute for Statistics, 2005). Similarly, in reporting current school enrollment, the National Family Health Survey 3 (2006) mentions that “only 83 percent of school age children (6-10 years) attend school; 88% in urban areas and 81% in rural areas”. Rather than attendance figures, what the UNESCO is defining and the NFHS intends to report here is school enrollment figures, which are actually school registration figures in the Indian context. School enrollment is more appropriately defined as the number of children, while school attendance defined as the number of days.
Enrollment is thus a three-stage concept involving registration, attendance and certification in that order. Registration is the act of an individual gaining entry or being admitted into a program. Attendance is a measure of the physical presence of an individual throughout a program. Certification is the act of presenting an individual with a document validating the completion of the program’s activities and/or fulfillment of the program’s minimum requirements. When applying the definition of enrollment to the school setting, one is referring to the act of individuals being enrolled in or admitted to a school and attending a minimum number of days over the school calendar while working towards certification, which is generally a high school diploma or its equivalent.

**Theoretical Framework**

The theories that have been traditionally used in the field of educational policy studies to study universal primary school enrollment (systems theory, modernization theory, dependency theory etc.) raise concerns about both their adequacy and utility in different contexts. These theories were found to be inappropriate for this study as they capture the dynamics of policymaking from the perspective of those in control of the policy process and exclude the perspective of the target populations of policy. Other traditions such as critical-cultural studies fail to relate the patterns of practice to the lived experience of individuals. This study seeks to connect the practice of educational policy to the perceptions of stakeholders formed because of their experience of participating in the SSA. Moreover, this study seeks to elicit meanings, both from the perspective of the
subject and the object, derived from collective activity. Thus, there is need for a different conceptualization.

Engeström’s Cultural Historical Activity Theory helps bridge the subject-object and individual-collective dualism. Activity theorists such as Engestrom take a holistic approach that avoids reducing any pole of a dualism to its corresponding opposite by making activity the minimal unit of analysis (Roth and Lee, 2007). There is also closer focus on the nature of the activities and relations between various actors and the mediating artifacts used by them than in more traditionally used theories. Cultural Historical Activity Theory identifies practice as the outcome of historical developments and cultural influences, which is particularly useful when studying the historically disadvantaged populations being considered for this study. Therefore, the Cultural Historical Activity Theory model is ideal for this study of school enrollment in the Indian context.

Cultural Historical Activity Theory provides a structure for the analysis of collective human activity. Engeström’s human activity system builds on two earlier conceptualizations of human activity. Vygotsky’s model (1978, p. 40) for individual action and Leontiev’s (1978) notion of collective activity. The earliest conceptualization, illustrated in Figure 2-1, was initiated by Lev Vygotsky, who brought attention to the role of culturally determined mediating artifacts in the dynamics between the stimulus and response that then evolved into the dynamics between the subject and the object.
In this model, the subject is the human agent or agents interested in achieving a particular goal. The object is the raw material, tangible as in a physical material or non-tangible such as a problem, towards which the subject directs an action or activity. Mediating artifacts are culture-specific instruments: tools and signs used for a particular activity that have evolved over time within the local context. While tools are physical mediating artifacts used to gain control over the external environment, signs are psychological mediating artifacts in terms of the thinking and behavior that facilitates the organization of activity. The importance of this generation of activity theory lies in that it allowed for the understanding of the social through individual actions that have a cultural basis.

The second generation of activity theory illustrated in Figure 2-2 expanded Vygotsky’s model for individual action into a collective activity system. While Leontiev distinguished between individual action and collective activity, Engeström conceptualized the structure of the collective activity system. According to the
Leontiev’s conceptualization, operations constitute the bottom-most level in the human activeness hierarchy and are directed by the prevailing conditions and available tools. A group of operations together constitute individual action at the middle level of activeness and is directed by a more concrete goal. Actions of different individuals together directed by an object-related motive constitute collective activity at the upper-most level. What define collective activity are the motives of the actors involved. Activity is properly identified not by its outcomes but by its motive(s) (Youn and Baptiste, 2007). Engeström incorporated these ideas of Leontiev to provide a graphical representation of the collective human activity system.

According to Engeström, the human activity system comprises seven interacting components: a subject, an object, instruments, rules, community, divisions of labor, and outcome. The subject, object and instruments are the components already discussed within Vygotsky’s model. Rules refer to the guidelines for the appropriate conduct of activity and may be socially or individually determined. Community in this context refers to a group of people working towards a common goal. Lave and Wenger (1991) called this group a community of practice defined as “a group of people who share a common interest and a desire to learn from and contribute to the community with their variety of experiences”. This group has interacted over time on particular sets of objects. Division of labor refers to the manner in which the community of practice is organized in terms of the role played by each member within the community of practice (Engeström, 1987). Put simply, it refers to separate responsibilities undertaken by different members of the community in carrying out the activity. The outcome of the collective activity is
the end product that the object transforms into as a result of the collective activity directed towards it.

The seven components described above constitute four subsystems of production, distribution, exchange and consumption as displayed in Figure 2-2. The production subsystem forms the upper level of the main triangle and consists of the subject, objects and instruments which comprises tools and signs. The distribution subsystem consists of the object, community of practice and division of labor. The exchange subsystem is made up of the subject, community of practice and rules. The consumption subsystem comprises of the subject, object and the community of practice.

Figure 2-2: Subsystems within the human activity system.

The roles of the subsystems are described by Marx (1973):

Production creates the objects which correspond to the given needs; distribution divides them up according to social laws; exchange further parcels out the already divided shares in accord with individual needs; and finally, in consumption, the product steps outside this social movement and becomes a
direct object and servant of individual need, and satisfies it in being consumed. Thus production appears as the point of departure, consumption as the conclusion, distribution and exchange as the middle, which is however itself twofold, since distribution is determined by society and exchange by individuals. (p. 307)

The subject, object, instruments, rules, community, divisions of labor, and outcome interact among each other within the production, distribution, exchange and consumption subsystems to form the human activity system displayed in Figure 2-3 below.

Figure 2-3: Second generation activity theory model (Source: Engeström, 1987, p. 78).

Two principles underlying Engeström’s model of the human activity system are of particular relevance to this study. The first is the principle of historicity which emphasizes a consideration of the historical evolution within the local social setup of the activity under investigation. “Historicity in this perspective means identifying the past
cycles of the activity system. The reorchestration of the multiple voices is dramatically facilitated when the different voices are seen against their historical background” (Engeström, 1999). This allows for the examination of school enrollment within local social, cultural, historic and political contexts. A consideration of the history of India’s disadvantaged population subgroups, policies towards primary education and the politics of education will provide for a better understanding of the dynamics within the activity system for school enrollment. The second is the principle of multivoicedness. “An activity system is by definition a multivoiced formation. An expansive cycle is a reorchestration of those voices, of the different viewpoints and approaches of the various participants” (Engeström, 1999). The relevance of the principle of multivoicedness lies in that it calls for the examination of multiple viewpoints within the community of practice. It was expected that the government, non-governmental organizations, teachers and parents would all have different perspectives while commonly working towards universal primary and secondary education, which is what the study seeks out.

Applying Engeström’s structure of human activity system to the concept of school enrollment provides us a framework, as illustrated in Figure 2-4, by which to understand school enrollment as the intended outcome of systematic activity undertaken by the actors involved. The social phenomenon of interest in this study is the substantial increase in school enrollment figures since the year 2000 in India. The collective activity under consideration here is the development and implementation of strategies to enable school enrollment in India. This collective activity is defined by the motive of improving human capital and human capability, and ensuring the fundamental right to education.
Human capital proponents such as McMahon (2002), and Patrinos and Psacharopoulos (2002) suggest that investment in human capital by increasing education levels can facilitate economic growth. The investment in education is seen to bring two kinds of returns: social returns and economic returns. The social returns may include lower population growth and rural poverty, better human rights, democratization, and
political stability (McMahon, 2004), lower infant mortality as well as better life expectancy of the next generation (Cochrane, Leslie, and O’Hara, 1982), lower fertility (Cochrane, 1979), female labor force participation (McMahon, 2002), and natural resource management (Godoy and Contreras, 2001). Bruns, Mingat, and Rakotomala, (2003) explain that the health of infants and children, immunization rates, family nutrition, and the next generation’s schooling attainment are strongly impacted positively by more education for girls. Birdsall and Londoño (1998) found correlation between a distribution of education that was equitable and lower levels of poverty and inequality and quicker economic growth.

In particular, researchers have pointed out that the social benefits from investing in male education are much lesser than those from investing in female education. A study by Subbarao and Rainey (1995) found that in considering fertility, women's education had larger benefits than not only men's education but also public interventions such as improving family planning services. Simulations predicted that “infant deaths in 1985 reduced by 64% by doubling the female secondary school enrollment ratio from 19% to 38% in 1975 while the number of infant deaths reduced by a mere 2.5% by doubling the number of physicians. There would be no effect on the number of infant deaths by doubling per capita income (or GDP) from the average of $650 in the 72 sample countries to $1300”’. Robeyns (2006) argues that the economic returns of education carry relevance

[i]n so far as education creates skills and helps to acquire knowledge that serves as an investment in the productivity of the human being as an economic production factor, that is, as a worker. Thus, education is important because it allows workers to be more productive, thereby being
able to earn a higher wage. By regarding skills and knowledge as an investment in one’s labor productivity, economists estimate the economic returns to education for different educational levels, types of education, etc. (p. 69)

The benefits of human capital to labor productivity is reported by a number of researchers throughout different regions of the world such as rural Pakistan (Fafchamps and Quisumbing, 1999); rural Sri Lanka (Sahn and Alderman, 1988); Ghana (Glewwe and Desai, 1999); and rural India (Behrman and Deolalikar, 1993).

The human capability theory espouses that some capabilities shared by human beings are nearly universal; the opportunity to exercise these capabilities makes a human life fulfilling. Education plays a substantial role in increasing the freedom to exercise these capabilities. Education promotes “human capabilities”- the essential and individual power to reflect, make choices, seek a voice in society, and enjoy a better life” (Sen, 1999). Experts who see a possibly strong and symbiotic relationship between the human capability approach and education increasingly support the significance of the human capability approach. This “approach is clearly apt for exploration from an educational point of view” (Saito, 2003). International organizations working towards education for all acknowledge the importance of the underlying capability approach to education in that “the distinctive feature of the human capability approach is its assessment of policies not on the basis of their impact on incomes, but on whether or not they expand the real freedoms that people value. Education is central to this process” (UNESCO, 2003).

The rights discourses view education as an individual’s fundamental right as it contributes to the fullest development of individual potentials. Conceptualizations of
education as a fundamental right are prominently endorsed by organizations of the United Nations such as UNESCO and UNICEF and national governments such as India. Education as a fundamental right is further emphasized by several documents such as the 1948 Universal Declaration of Human Rights (Article 26) which explicitly says, “everyone has the right to education”. Today after six decades, this aim has not yet been achieved, therefore, bringing greater focus on it: “to give everyone the chance to learn and benefit from basic education – not as an accident of circumstance, nor as a privilege, but as a RIGHT” (UNESCO, n.d.). The Government of India’s perceptions and involvement in education since independence are also based on the education as a right perspective. The Constitution of India (Article 45) states that “[t]he State shall endeavour to provide, within a period of ten years from the commencement of this Constitution, for free and compulsory education for all children until they complete the age of fourteen years”. This target was not achieved in the stipulated time frame; however, subsequent policy formulations further cemented the notion of education as fundamental right. The National Policy on Education (1986) and its Revised Policy Formulations (1992) describes the role of education as follows: “In our national perception education is essentially for all. This is fundamental to our all-round development, material and spiritual”. This important principle in the constitution forms a fundamental aspect of the Indian National Policy on Education (1986). Education formally became a fundamental right for every child in India when the Right to Education Act (RTE) came into force on 1 April 2010.

These motives of improving human capital and human capability and ensuring the fundamental right to education are the defining factors for the collective activity of
developing and implementing strategies to bolster school enrollment in India. As specified by Engeström, seven components (subject, object, community of practice, rules, division of labor, tools and signs and the outcome) comprise the activity system being considered for this study. The subject is the group of actors driven by the motives already discussed. To satisfy the motives discussed, the actors work towards the goal of universal primary school enrollment, which is seen as the most effective promoter of development in a country. The actors are the government of India; the state governments; international non-governmental organizations such as the World Bank; UNICEF and DFID among others; and local non-governmental organizations. These subjects primarily frame policy interventions and provide monetary backing. In addition, they also implement the interventions and work for the development of better practices. Thus, these subjects are also a subset of the community of practice.

The object is the out-of-school children and their parents towards whom the policy initiative is directed. The objects belong to population subgroups identified as having low school enrollment figures. These are the scheduled castes, scheduled tribes, Muslim, rural and girl subgroups within the population. Scheduled castes, scheduled tribes and girls are historically disadvantaged population subgroups in India, while Muslims and rural populations are the relatively newer postcolonial underclasses in India.

The tools used to achieve the goal of universal primary and secondary school enrollment in India are primarily policy interventions that serve as incentives to get the out-of-school children enrolled in school. The signs are the various forms of communication using text and graphics; such forms include media such as the television;
newspaper; street plays; door-to-door campaigns; and bill boards, all of which aim at promoting positive attitudes towards schooling.

The community of practice comprises government personnel, local non-governmental organizations, teachers and the village education committees comprising parents. In the context of India, teachers, in addition to being the agents of learning, are also the implementers of the policy interventions. The interventions discussed above are implemented through the agency of the school, thus making teachers the final implementers at the end of the line. The teachers supervise the preparation of midday meals, distribute stipends for girls and school supplies, double up as the care providers in residential schools and also make house-to-house census visits at the start of the academic year. Parents as a constituent of the community of practice are a post 2001 phenomenon in India. It is an outcome of the SSA program wherein the formation of the village education committee comprised of parents is an intervention. The village education committee members are elected from among the parent body of the school. The committee has the responsibility and monetary power to undertake all-round development of the school through the utilization of government grants.

The rules guiding the activity of increasing school enrollment are separate for each member of the community of practice. For example, the ultimate authority and responsibility for framing policies and policy interventions rests with the national government and respective state governments. The international and local non-governmental organizations will only support the government in the implementation of policy interventions and will not be responsible for any policymaking decisions. Another common rule is that the government cannot deny any child access to public schools based
on personal background factors. Norms guiding the functioning of international non-governmental organizations include noninvolvement in disputed territories close to the Pakistan and China borders and the eventual handing over of policy interventions implemented by international non-governmental organizations to the state government.

Security of personnel in conflict areas is another issue of concern with its own norms. As implementers of policy, teachers are expected to follow the directions of the government. Specifications are provided by the education wing of the government about how, when and what to teach.

The division of labor is dependent on the community of practice. The government frames policies and has the main responsibility for ensuring universal primary school enrollment. International and local non-governmental organizations support the government by providing monetary assistance, personnel and expertise. The teachers implement government interventions. The outcome of the collective activity of developing and implementing strategies to enable school enrollment is that out-of-school children get enrolled in school presumably as a result of the interventions implemented through the SSA.

As is evident in the discussion above, the seven components comprising the activity system are not as mutually exclusive as Engeström formulated; rather, they are mutually interactive. There exists some overlap in what constitutes these components. For example, in this study, the subjects (government and non-governmental organizations) are also constituents of the community of practice. Similarly, the parents are both the objects as well as new entrants to the community of practice. In addition, the community of practice determines the rules and the division of labor. Each constituent of
the community of practice has a separate role to play and is often guided separate rules in carrying out the activity. Thus, it can be said that both rules and divisions of labor are products of the community of practice (Youn and Baptiste, 2007). In sum, Engeström’s model enables the analysis of a multitude of perspectives against a cultural and historical background within the triangular structure of activity. This kind of analysis is what this study seeks to do.

Cultural Historical Activity Theory thus allows for the examination of the SSA in India through stakeholder perceptions of its effectiveness against the historical development of the constitutional directive principle for free and compulsory elementary education. This study opens a window for policymakers at the national and international level to find solutions to improve secondary school enrollment in India and beyond.

**Summary**

This chapter provides a synthesis of the literature related to Stakeholder Perceptions of SSA Effectiveness in Increasing School Enrollment in India and describes the conceptual framework for the study. The first section traces the origin of Education for All movement and its historical development in the context of India. The notion of ‘education for all’ has been existed within Indian policy formulations since the creation of the Indian republic as constitutional provisions. However, at the inception of the constitution, ‘education for all’ was only a nonbinding directive principle of state policy. Various policy revisions later, education today is a fundamental right for every child in India. A discussion of the literature on primary and secondary school enrollment is
provided. The literature reveals that though there is a consensus on the types of programs that can bring success, owing to contextual difficulties, sometimes policy initiatives fail in program implementation. Moreover, there is not sufficient literature providing insider perspectives of the policy process, which is important for the successful implementation of policy. This section concludes by discussing the significance of stakeholder perceptions to policy.

The second section of this chapter provides a three-part conceptual framework for this study. The first part discusses the definition of stakeholder perceptions, program effectiveness and school enrollment. The second part provides a theoretical framework explaining the factors that impact school enrollment. Finally, the third part applies the framework of Engeström’s Cultural Historical Activity Theory to the context of the SSA in India. The use of Engeström’s activity system allows for the analysis of multiple perspectives against the cultural and historical background of disadvantaged population subgroups of scheduled castes, scheduled tribes, Muslims and girls in Indian society.
Chapter 3
Methodology

Education for all has been a policy goal in India since independence in 1947. However, the problem of low school enrollment persists in many regions of India. To address this problem a number of interventions have been implemented under the aegis of the SSA. However, there is no information on how various stakeholders perceive the effectiveness of the SSA. This study seeks to understand stakeholder perceptions about the extent to which the increase in school enrollment can be attributed to the SSA, the difficulties in implementing the SSA and the inadequacies of the SSA in addressing challenges to secondary school enrollment.

The investigation of perceptions of policy effectiveness is an interpretive task that is best accomplished using case study method. Further, attention is directed toward the maintaining the rigor and trustworthiness of the design for the study, implementation of the research design, and related procedures. This chapter details the methods and process of conducting the study by discussing the research design and method, sample, researcher positionality, data collection and data analysis procedures as well as research trustworthiness.
Research Design

This research employs a phenomenological multiple-case study design that uses semi-structured interviews and photovoice to collect data. Qualitative research methods are appropriate in situations where quantitative measures are not capable of adequately describing or interpreting the situation. Qualitative data helps to more fully describe a particular phenomenon, which is of interest for both the researcher and the target audience. The nature of this dissertation is therefore grounded in qualitative research that is characterized by Denzin and Lincoln, (1994) as:

[…] multi-method in focus, involving an interpretive, naturalistic approach to its subject matter. This means that qualitative researchers study things in their natural settings, attempting to make sense of or interpret phenomena in terms of the meanings people bring to them. Qualitative research involves the studied use and collection of a variety of empirical materials — case study, personal experience, introspective, life story interview, observational, historical, interactional, and visual texts — that describe routine and problematic moments and meaning in individuals' lives. (p. 2)

The difficulties in implementing the SSA and the inadequacies of the SSA in addressing the local challenges to secondary school enrollment that this research intends to examine are best understood when studied in a natural context. Moreover, the focus of this study on stakeholder perceptions calls for the attempt to understand and the SSA through the interpretation of meanings that stakeholders assign to them. Therefore, a naturalistic and interpretive method is necessary to answer the research questions.

Strauss and Corbin (1990) explain that qualitative research is best used in situations where little is known about the phenomena. Qualitative research is also useful for gaining new perspectives on things that are already known, or to gain detailed
information which would be difficult to convey through the use of quantitative methods. The primary research question “What are the stakeholders’ perceptions of the effectiveness of the SSA in increasing school enrollment?” can only be answered qualitatively. “If you want people to understand better than they otherwise might, provide them information in the form in which they usually experience it” (Guba and Lincoln, 1985).

This investigation aims to understand stakeholder perceptions of policy effectiveness in increasing school enrollment. The design of this study adhered to the following characteristics of quality qualitative research as outlined by Garman (1994): a) verity (intellectual authenticity), b) integrity (structural soundness), c) rigor (depth of intellect), d) utility (professional usefulness), e) vitality (meaningfulness), f) aesthetics (enrichment), g) ethics (consideration of dignity and privacy of participants), and h) verisimilitude (sufficient detail to warrant transferability).

The researcher kept these characteristics in mind while conducting the study in order to avoid possible pitfalls such as an unclear focus, the use of jargon, an insufficient sample, equipment failure, the mismanagement of data, researcher bias, the inadequate description of methods, transcription errors, and shallow analysis.

**Research Method**

This research employs case study as a distinctive method of conducting qualitative research as described by Yin (2003); it is also exploratory in nature. This study seeks to understand stakeholder perceptions of effectiveness by examining
implementation difficulties and inadequacies of the SSA in India. Yin (2003) further says that, case studies allow the researcher to explore individuals or organizations, interventions, relationships, communities, or programs and can link program implementation with program effects. A good fit, therefore, emerges in the case study method for research studying the perceptions of policy effectiveness to be conducted from within the constructivist and advocacy/participatory paradigms. According to Corbin and Strauss (2008), “Qualitative research allows researchers to get at the inner experience of participants, to determine how meanings are formed through and in culture, and to discover rather than test variables”.

Case studies are best suited for situations that call for detailed analysis of the context of a small number of events or conditions and the relationships between them. Yin (2003) explains that:

A case study is an empirical inquiry that investigates a contemporary phenomenon within its real-life context, especially when the boundaries between phenomenon and context are not clearly evident. The case study inquiry copes with the technically distinctive situation in which there will be many more variables of interest than data points: and as one result relies on multiple sources of evidence, with data needing to converge in a triangulating fashion; and as another result benefits from the prior development of theoretical propositions to guide data collection and analysis. (pp. 13-14)

In accordance with Yin’s prescription, this researcher collected data from the various stakeholders in a triangulating fashion to converge around stakeholder perceptions of the SSA effectiveness in increasing school enrollment.

Further, this research is a multiple-case (holistic) design (Yin; 2003, 2008) or a collective case study (Stake, 1995, Merriam, 1998; Creswell, 2007), as the data will be
collected from 3 states in India. Creswell (2007) explains multiple case study in the following manner: “The one issue or concern is again selected, but the inquirer selects multiple case studies to illustrate the issue. The researcher might select for study several programs from several research sites or multiple programs within a single site. Often the inquirer purposefully selects multiple cases to show different perspectives on the issue”. Yin (2003) suggests that the multiple case study design is a method which involves the replication of the data collection procedures for each case considered for the study. “The use of multiple cases makes the findings more robust, generalizable, and testable theory. The ability to adjust the data collection as a result of insights obtained during the early phases of the research process highlights one of the key advantages of the multiple-case studies design” (Eisenhardt and Graebner, 2007).

The social phenomenon of interest in this study is the substantial increase in school enrollment figures since the year 2000 in India. This case study is bounded by interrelated contexts; of geographic location, demography and the level of growth in school enrollment since 2004. The case for this study is defined as a state in India that is bounded by two conditions. First, the state shows low, medium or high growth in school enrollment between 2005 and 2008. Second, it has at least 5 percent scheduled caste, scheduled tribe and Muslim populations according to the 2001 Census.

Through the multiple case-study method, the relationships and its derived interactions between the context of this study and the effectiveness of the SSA will be determined. The experiences of the stakeholders while interacting within these contexts will facilitate the development of perceptions about the effectiveness of the SSA. These are the outermost boundaries for this study.
More specifically, this study is a phenomenological case study. A phenomenological approach was employed in the analysis of data. According to Lindgren and Kehoe (1981), “A phenomenological approach is used for the purpose of understanding the issue or topic from the everyday knowledge and perceptions of specific respondent subgroups”. As the study sought to understand stakeholder perceptions, a phenomenological approach was thought to be the most appropriate for the purpose of this study.

Sample

The sample for this study was selected using multiple sampling techniques keeping in the contextual realities of the social milieu and organizational culture. Table 3-1 below presents a numerical representation of the sample for this study.

Table 3-1: Sampled States and Stakeholders.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sample Category</th>
<th>Number of participants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>States</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Districts</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education Officers</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International NGO Officers</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local NGO Officers</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parents</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teachers</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Creswell (2002) has recommended that 3-5 participants or cases be used for case study research. “An appropriate sample size for a qualitative study is one that adequately answers the research question. For simple questions or very detailed studies, this might be in single figures; for complex questions, large samples and a variety of sampling techniques might be necessary” (Marshall, 1996). The cases for this study were selected on the basis of growth in enrollment, demography and regional location in India. The growth in school enrollment among states in India displayed a high amount of variation. According to Patton (2002):

For small samples, a great deal of heterogeneity can be a problem because individual cases are so different from each other. The maximum variation sampling strategy turns that apparent weakness into a strength by applying the following logic: Any common patterns that emerge from great variation are of particular interest and value in capturing the core experiences and central, shared dimensions of a setting or phenomenon. (p. 235)

Further, according to Guba and Lincoln (1985), maximum variation sampling is the most useful strategy for the naturalistic approach. Also, the Analytical Report 2007-08 published by NUEPA showed wide variance among the states of India in the growth of school enrollment. Therefore, the researcher decided to use the maximum variation sampling technique and categorize growth in school enrollment as high, medium and low. The indicator used is the Net Enrollment Ratio obtained from the annual analytical reports of the District Information System for Education (DISE), India. The lowest enrollment growth figure was used as the base line. Figure 3-1 below presents the net enrollment ratio for all the states in India from 2005 to 2007.
### Figure 3-1: Net enrollment ratio from 2005-2007.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State/UT</th>
<th>Net Enrollment Ratio: Primary Level *</th>
<th>Enrollment Ratio at Upper Primary Level *</th>
<th>Gross Enrollment Ratio *</th>
<th>Net Enrollment Ratio *</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A &amp; N Islands</td>
<td>73.75</td>
<td>79.32</td>
<td>65.46</td>
<td>44.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Andhra Pradesh</td>
<td>74.32</td>
<td>77.93</td>
<td>61.92</td>
<td>49.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arunachal Pradesh</td>
<td>72.54</td>
<td>81.01</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>57.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assam</td>
<td>73.73</td>
<td>75.12</td>
<td>59.70</td>
<td>49.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bihar</td>
<td>86.68</td>
<td>51.12</td>
<td>36.69</td>
<td>32.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chhattisgarh</td>
<td>88.30</td>
<td>56.33</td>
<td>72.66</td>
<td>48.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dadra &amp; Nagar Haveli</td>
<td>90.00</td>
<td>65.49</td>
<td>62.61</td>
<td>52.74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daman &amp; Diu</td>
<td>73.63</td>
<td>52.31</td>
<td>50.38</td>
<td>40.41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delhi</td>
<td>89.36</td>
<td>53.17</td>
<td>44.98</td>
<td>32.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goa</td>
<td>80.26</td>
<td>62.86</td>
<td>55.90</td>
<td>41.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gujarat</td>
<td>87.79</td>
<td>70.27</td>
<td>54.01</td>
<td>41.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haryana</td>
<td>89.61</td>
<td>70.01</td>
<td>56.41</td>
<td>41.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Himachal Pradesh</td>
<td>90.29</td>
<td>60.00</td>
<td>70.65</td>
<td>41.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jammu &amp; Kashmir</td>
<td>71.55</td>
<td>70.94</td>
<td>51.41</td>
<td>41.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jharkhand</td>
<td>80.97</td>
<td>65.43</td>
<td>55.90</td>
<td>41.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karnataka</td>
<td>85.77</td>
<td>60.65</td>
<td>55.90</td>
<td>41.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kerala</td>
<td>84.27</td>
<td>64.26</td>
<td>55.90</td>
<td>41.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madhya Pradesh</td>
<td>71.28</td>
<td>63.37</td>
<td>55.90</td>
<td>41.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mahasatra</td>
<td>71.28</td>
<td>63.37</td>
<td>55.90</td>
<td>41.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manipur</td>
<td>71.28</td>
<td>63.37</td>
<td>55.90</td>
<td>41.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meghalaya</td>
<td>71.28</td>
<td>63.37</td>
<td>55.90</td>
<td>41.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mizoram</td>
<td>71.28</td>
<td>63.37</td>
<td>55.90</td>
<td>41.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nagaland</td>
<td>71.28</td>
<td>63.37</td>
<td>55.90</td>
<td>41.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orissa</td>
<td>65.30</td>
<td>51.65</td>
<td>42.01</td>
<td>32.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Punjab</td>
<td>71.28</td>
<td>63.37</td>
<td>55.90</td>
<td>41.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rajasthan</td>
<td>65.30</td>
<td>51.65</td>
<td>42.01</td>
<td>32.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sikkim</td>
<td>71.28</td>
<td>63.37</td>
<td>55.90</td>
<td>41.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tamil Nadu</td>
<td>71.28</td>
<td>63.37</td>
<td>55.90</td>
<td>41.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tripura</td>
<td>71.28</td>
<td>63.37</td>
<td>55.90</td>
<td>41.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uttar Pradesh</td>
<td>65.30</td>
<td>51.65</td>
<td>42.01</td>
<td>32.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uttarakhand</td>
<td>65.30</td>
<td>51.65</td>
<td>42.01</td>
<td>32.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Bengal</td>
<td>65.30</td>
<td>51.65</td>
<td>42.01</td>
<td>32.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All States</td>
<td>65.30</td>
<td>51.65</td>
<td>42.01</td>
<td>32.01</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\* Calculated based upon the population projections provided by the Office of the Registrar General of India.

\* Based on the in-principle coverage of a number of states have not reported Grade VIII enrollment.
At the primary level, it is defined as the total enrollment in grades I-V expressed as a percentage of the population of age 6-11. First, the growth in school enrollment in each state was calculated by subtracting the 2005-06 net enrollment ratios from the 2007-08 net enrollment ratios at the upper primary level. To fix the range for each category of growth, the researcher subtracted the minimum growth figure from the maximum growth figure and then divided it by three.

Further, the researcher also took into consideration the regional location so that each state is from a different regional location; North, South, East, North-East and West. On the basis of growth in enrollment, the demography and the regional location, the sample includes three states in India: Jharkhand (high growth), Karnataka (medium growth) and Maharashtra (low growth).

Next, three districts from each state have been selected using the mixed purposeful sampling technique. For each state, the districts were selected on the basis of three conditions:

1) one of the districts is urban and two districts are rural;

2) one of the districts has a substantial scheduled caste population, one district has a substantial scheduled tribe population and one district has a substantial Muslim population. Substantial is defined as above the state proportion of the particular population sub-group. The demography data was obtained from the state government offices;

3) and the districts have Hindi or English as a spoken language;

The districts selected from Jharkhand are Ranchi, Pakur and Chhatra. The districts selected from Maharashtra are Greater Bombay, Nandurbar, and Bhandara and
the districts selected from Karnataka are Bangalore, Raichur and Bidar. Figure 3-2 below presents a political map of India displaying the location of the states sampled for this study.

Figure 3-2: Political Map of India. (Source: MapsofIndia.com).
With regard to stakeholders, the sample includes the UNICEF state education officer, as UNICEF does not have separate district education officers for India. The UNICEF was selected to represent international non-governmental organizations on the basis of intensive purposeful sampling as the UNICEF is the most active international NGO in the field of children’s education in India. To represent the state government, the longest serving district education officer since 2001 in each district has been selected for the interviews. The local non-governmental organizations have been selected using the snowball sampling technique. The two local NGO partners of the SSA in the state have been identified based on conversations with the state government representative, UNICEF and the local community. The most knowledgeable person within the organization regarding the SSA in the state has been selected for the interview.

Teachers and parents interviewed for the study have been selected from two randomly selected locations within the district. From each location, one teacher and seven or eight parents have been selected. In the case of teachers, first, a purposeful sample of public school teachers working in the same school since 1995 or before was considered. From this sample, one teacher was randomly selected. In districts selected for their substantial Muslim population, teachers from only Madrassas or Muslim management schools aided by the state government were considered. With regard to parents, the sample has satisfied the following conditions:

1) all the parents have at least one child in public school;
2) all the parents belong to the population sub-group on the basis of which the district was selected;
3) half the parent sample consists of mothers of girl children;
4) and half the parent sample consists of parents who have at least one secondary school age child not in school

Table 3-2 below provides a numerical representation for the population subgroups considered for this study.

Table 3-2: Representation of Parents by Population Subgroup.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Population Subgroup</th>
<th>Number of participants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Scheduled castes</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scheduled tribes</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muslims</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mothers of girl children</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parents of un-enrolled secondary school age children</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The sample for each state consists of 3 state education officers, 1 UNICEF education officer, 2 local NGO representatives, 6 teachers and 45 parents. Figure 3-3 below presents the sampling structure of the states and population subgroups considered for this study. In this figure, L1 and L2 refer to location 1 and location 2, T & P refers to parents and teachers, EO refers to state education officers, INGO and LNGO refers to international and local NGO officers respectively. The total sample for the study consists of 3 UNICEF education officers, 9 state education officers, 6 representatives of local NGOs, 18 teachers and 135 parents.
Figure 3-3: Sampling Structure.
Researcher Positionality

We recommend that, rather than trying to be inauthentic by adopting a contrived role, qualitative researchers be themselves, true to their social identities and their interests in the setting and/or topic….The researcher should reveal sensitivity to participants’ testing of her and their reluctance to participate, unquestionably respecting their right not participate in a study” (Marshall & Rossman, 2010, p. 74).

I bring to this dissertation experience most recently as a graduate student and a graduate assistant. I also bring to the study three years of previous experience as a high school math and science teacher in India, where I am from, and three years in Abu Dhabi, U.A.E. A few years into my teaching career I realized my work was affecting only the students I taught. There were millions of children in India and beyond without access to an education. Since then, I have wanted to pursue a career that involved creating equity in access to education for children throughout the world. “One's historical position, one's class (which may or may not include changes over the course of a lifetime), one's race, one's gender, one's religion, and so on - all of these interact and influence, limit and constrain production of knowledge. In other words, who I am determines, to a large extent, what I want to study” (Scheurich, 1994). My interest in educational access issues transformed into a possible research topic when reading the Millennium Development Goals Report 2007 and the Education for All Global Monitoring Report 2007. The reports said India was well on track to achieve universal primary school enrollment while lagging far behind in terms of achieving universal secondary school enrollment. The reports caught me by surprise; I thought if India was close to achieving universal primary school enrollment, it should have been in a similar position in terms of secondary education and I wanted to understand what accounted for the difference.
As Denzin (1986) explains, "Interpretive research begins and ends with the biography and self of the researcher". During the initial phases of my research, I experienced a personal conflict of interest between what I believed to be education and what I would appear to advocate through my research. I come with a strong bias for education and a bias against compulsory schooling. I believe schooling does not equal education, but that is what I might be promoting through my research. Every human being needs an education but not necessarily schooling. I also realize that the indigenous forms of education available to disadvantaged populations in India do not enable children to successfully compete in the modern ‘schooled’ world. In this scenario, modern schooling appears to be an appropriate option for all children.

Another area of bias comes from my view of multinational agencies pushing an agenda as a new form of mental colonization that equates education with schooling. While indigenous forms of education prepare one for life, schooling only prepares one for a white collar job. “What I believe about research cannot be separated from who I am” (Harding, 1987). It is not possible for me to separate my bias from my person. Therefore, I must remind myself to control this bias so that it does not affect the validity of the data I collect. My role is that of an interpreter as Stake’s (1995) explains:

The case researcher recognizes and substantiates new meanings. Whoever is a researcher has recognized a problem, puzzlement, and studies it, hoping to connect it better with known things. Finding new connections, the researcher finds ways to make them comprehensible to others. (p. 97)

I expect that my awareness of the bias in my worldview is in my best interest, as my awareness allows me to conduct my research in a more effective manner by focusing on perceptions of the effectiveness of the SSA in achieving universal primary school
enrollment in India, rather than on the mental colonization that I believe the SSA may promote.

Data Collection Strategies

Data collection for this study has been done in compliance with the guidelines set by the Institutional Review Board. Data was collected from multiple data sources using multiple tools in accordance with the traditions of qualitative research (Denzin & Lincoln, 2005; Merriam, 1998; Stake, 1995; Yin, 2003). The data collected has been organized into four sets based on the data collecting method.

The first set of data consists of 405 photovoice photographs and transcripts of focus group discussions. The photo-voice method is used to collect data from parents. Photovoice is an innovative action research method that is participatory in nature. It has its origins in a variety of areas such as feminist theory, education for critical consciousness, health promotion principles, and nontraditional approaches to documentary photography. According to Wang (1999):

Photovoice enables people to identify, represent, and enhance their community through a specific photographic technique….Photovoice has three main goals: to enable people 1) to record and reflect their personal and community strengths and concerns, 2) to promote critical dialogue and knowledge about personal and community issues through group discussions of photographs, and 3) to inform policy makers about issues of concern at the grassroots level. (p. 185)

Wang and Burris (1997), further explain that photovoice provides researchers “the possibility of perceiving the world from the viewpoint of the people who lead lives that are different from those traditionally in control of the means for imaging the world”.


Adapting the methodology described in Caroline Wang’s “Photovoice: Social Action Through Photography”, the following steps were implemented for this study:

- Training the participants on the topic of the study, the photovoice methodology, the goal of recording photographs and the ways to use the cameras;
- Devising the initial themes and taking pictures;
- Facilitating group discussion for critical reflection and dialogue based on the pictures taken;
- Dissemination of information to policy makers, funders, media, and others who may be mobilized to advance reform.

The training session took approximately an hour. The recording of photographs took approximately an hour as well and the focus group discussion took approximately two hours. Digital cameras were provided to the participants as a means of taking the photographs. The focus group discussions were recorded using a digital recorder. The language used was either Hindi or English. The validation of data is inbuilt into the photovoice methodology. The participants themselves select the photographs, issues and themes that best represent the community’s perceptions of the effectiveness of the SSA during the focus group discussions. The dissemination of information was done through the presentation of the findings at seminars organized in each state by the researcher in collaboration with the respective state governments.

The research methodology (including the research questions, data sources and research tools) for this study is summarized in Figure 3-4:
With reference to Figure 3-4, the central and state governments, international non-governmental organizations (INGO) and local non-governmental organizations (LNGO) implement the various policies targeting particular population subgroups. The policies are implemented via the teachers in schools. Since the implementation of the SSA, the net enrollment ratio (NER) at the primary level has increased to 98.59% from 84.53% and is close to reaching the goal of universal primary school enrollment (UPSE). Enrollment at the secondary level has grown to 56.22%, but there is still a long way to go in achieving universal secondary school enrollment (USSE).
Data Analysis Procedures

This study employed thematic analysis in interpreting the transcripts of the semi-structured interviews and focus group discussions compiled during photovoice. The data collected described the stakeholder perceptions of the SSA program in India. Understanding perceptions involves the interpretation of meaning that emerges out of the data collected. Thematic analysis was found to be the most appropriate for this study as it “involves the finding themes which capture something important about the data in relation to the research question and represents some level of patterned response or meaning within the data set” (Braun and Clarke, 2006). As Van Maanen (1979) puts it, the prime analytic task is to “uncover and explicate the ways in which people in particular (work) settings come to understand, account for, take action and otherwise manage their day-to-day situation.” This “uncovering” and “explicating” is generally based on multiple observations and interviews, which are reviewed analytically and guide further steps in the field (Miles and Huberman, 1994). The analysis for this study will follow the procedures described in the definition provided by Miles and Huberman (1994):

We define analysis as consisting of three concurrent flows of activity: data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing/verification…..

Data Reduction refers to the process of selecting, focusing, simplifying, abstracting, and transforming the data that appear in written-up field notes of transcriptions….a display is an organized, compressed assembly of information that permits conclusion drawing and action….From the start of data collection, the qualitative analyst is beginning to decide what things mean-is noting regularities, patterns…The researcher holds these conclusions lightly….but the conclusions are still there, inchoate and vague at first, then increasingly explicit. (p.11)
The data reduction process for this study began simultaneously with the data collection process as prescribed by Merriam (1998): “[T]he right way to analyze data in a qualitative study is to do it simultaneously with data collection”. Field notes and audio recordings were reviewed on a day-to-day basis to identify emerging themes and questions for further clarification. Summaries of my overall impression of the encounters were prepared and provided to the participants to get their feedback as a way of ‘member checking’. In the case of the photovoice material, the initial analysis was carried out by the participants themselves by identifying the photographs that best represent the community’s perceptions during the focus group discussions.

The analysis of data post-data collection was carried out in two phases. In phase 1, the thematic analysis described by Braun and Clarke (2006) was employed in analyzing the data. This constituted the within-case analysis for the case study. The thematic analysis of data included the following phases: familiarizing oneself with one’s data, generating initial codes, searching for themes, reviewing themes, defining and naming themes and producing the report.

Familiarizing oneself with one’s data involved the transcription of interviews and focus group discussions. The generation of initial codes for coding the interviews and the focus group discussions, involved the use of the Nvivo Qualitative Software Package. In this phase, all the segments of data including transcripts of interviews and focus group discussions of photovoice, were assigned a code. The coding was done for one secondary research question at a time across both sets of transcripts. Table 3-3 below presents the codes applied to a sample of data extracts from the interview and photovoice transcripts.
Searching for themes involved collating codes into possible themes. This phase was aided by the preparation of thematic maps that were modified multiple times as

### Table 3-3: Sample of data extracts and codes applied.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data Extracts (Method)</th>
<th>Code</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Midday Meals, anyhow they will come for it. Lack of fees is another attraction. Free education madam, free books, free shoes, uniform also. All the programs together madam useful but Midday Meal much more. Without Midday Meal nobody will come. (Interview)</td>
<td>* Individual intervention * Combined interventions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uniform, it is not enough. There is shortage, measurement is not enough. Stitch the cloth and give that is better. I have to pay more than amount of the cloth to tailor. (Photovoice)</td>
<td>* Insufficiency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In the rural area when they have to go for higher primary, many times the school will not be very close by. Because of this the safety problem is there. Cycles program is helpful for this matter. You can reach school faster and less danger is there because the girls use the busy roads but they give cycles only to big girls. (Interview)</td>
<td>* Safety * Distance * Safety</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When girls become big then parents stop sending girls to school. They do work at home because parents go early morning to work then who will take care of small children. (Interview)</td>
<td>* Loss of Labor * Income</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Also, once they are big you can’t say, they may get involved with boys and make bad name. Then who will marry my daughter? (Photovoice)</td>
<td>* Reputation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
needed. Reviewing themes involved going back and forth between the themes on one side and the coded extracts and the data set on the other side in order to check if they fit well together. The thematic map was further refined during this process.

Defining and naming themes involved expressing the ‘essence’ of the themes in a few sentences and relating the theme to the research question it answered. Where needed, individual themes were divided into sub-themes or two themes were collapsed into one theme. This phase concluded with developed stories that the themes tell. Producing the report was the final phase of thematic analysis and it included presenting the thematic analysis as a written report as is done in this chapter. Figure 3-5 below is the initial thematic map developed for this study, showing the initial themes that emerged out the data.

In Phase 2, the data analysis proceeded from noting patterns and themes to determining cross-case explanations. I employed cross-case analysis techniques to “bring together the findings from individual case studies and are the most critical parts of a multiple-case study “(Yin, 2003). This was done by identifying the similarities and differences between the themes that emerged out of the three cases. The final product is a comparative description of the stakeholder perceptions in the three states that explains the extent to which the increase in school enrollment in India since 2004 can be attributed to the SSA, how contextual difficulties impact the implementation of the SSA, and the inadequacies of the SSA in addressing the challenges to school enrollment.
Figure 3-5: Initial thematic map.
Research Trustworthiness

Research quality and trustworthiness in quantitative research involves the consideration of reliability, external and internal validity and generalizability. In qualitative research, research quality and trustworthiness is maintained by the consideration of credibility and transferability of the study. Credibility is the congruence of the findings with reality, while transferability is the extent to which the results would be applicable to situations external to the cases being studied (Merriam, 1998). For this study, research quality in terms of credibility is enhanced in a number of ways. First, the triangulation of data sources and methods was employed in the study. The data sources for this study included representatives of the state government, international NGOs and local NGOs, teachers and parents. The data collection methods employed included semi-structured interviews and photovoice. Second, field notes were prepared and used to cross-check the themes emerging out of the interviews and focus group discussions of photovoice. Third, summaries of my overall impressions of the encounter were developed and given to the participants to get their feedback as a way of ‘member checking’. Fourth, an audit trail was prepared by writing short memos of the issues, problems and ideas encountered during the research process. These memos were read and reread throughout the data collection and data analysis processes to check if the issues being raised had been addressed.

The transferability of the study was enhanced by the use of the multiple case study approach. A sample of states that constituted one tenth of the total population of states was selected for the study. Employing maximum variation sampling techniques for
selecting the cases ensured that the entire range of variation in the growth of school enrollment in India was captured.

**Summary**

Through its use of rigorous qualitative case study research, the study uncovers the perceptions of various stakeholders about the SSA effectiveness, implementation difficulties and SSA’s adequacy in addressing secondary school enrollment challenges. This chapter describes the design of the study, which comprises multiple case study research, and related methods of data collection and analysis. The chapter provides a description of the participants, the procedures for selecting the participants, and the participant characteristics considered for the study. For data collection, semi-structured interviews, documents and photovoice were used. The methods of data collection were anchored by the research questions. Additionally, specific measures to ensure the transferability, reliability and validity of the data were described. Finally, a description of the procedures for maintaining good quality of research and analysis are provided. Stake’s (1995) observation that, “[t]he function of research is not necessarily to map and conquer the world but to sophisticate the beholding of it” underlies this dissertation, on understanding the impact of the SSA as perceived by the various groups of stakeholders.
Chapter 4

Results

Chapter 4 presents the findings that emerged from 36 semi-structured interviews with UNICEF education officers, officers of the state education department, representatives of local non-governmental organizations and teachers, and focus group discussions with parents. To examine the stakeholder perceptions of the effectiveness of the SSA in increasing school enrollment in India, eight interventions were considered for this study. The interventions are: the Midday Meal, the Stipend for Girls, School Sanitation and Hygiene Education, Madrassa Modernization, Civil Works, the Village Education Committee, the Residential Hostel for Girls and School Supplies. The three states selected were Jharkhand, Karnataka and Maharashtra, which together represent high, medium and low growth in enrollment, respectively, since the implementation of the SSA.

This chapter first describes the demography and development contexts for each state. Second, the themes arising from within-case theme analysis that relate to the three secondary research questions are presented. The three secondary research questions relate to the extent to which stakeholders attribute the increase in school enrollment to the SSA, the contextual difficulties in implementing the SSA and the inadequacies of the SSA in addressing the challenges to secondary school enrollment. Thematic analysis as described by Braun and Clarke (2006) was used to arrive at the themes. The themes that emerged out of the data are individual intervention as a contributor, the combination of interventions as contributors, non-supply based strategy as a contributor, the
misappropriation of funds, the misuse of school facilities insufficiency of personnel, loss of income, the quality of schooling and safety and purity of girls. Finally, I present the cross-case theme analysis by identifying the similarities and differences between the three states in terms of the themes arising out of the within-case theme analysis.

**Demography and Development Context of Jharkhand**

Jharkhand is an Eastern India state that came into existence after being carved out of the state of Bihar on 15th November 2000. The state of Jharkhand was created to meet the long-standing demand of the various tribal populations for a separate tribal homeland that would ensure greater political autonomy. According to the 2011 census of India, the total population of Jharkhand is about 33 million, which is comprised of about 28% tribes, and 12% scheduled castes. The major religions prevalent in Jharkhand include Hinduism, which is followed by about 68%; Islam, which is followed by about 14%, the tribal Sarna religion, which is followed by about 13% and Christianity, which is followed by about 4.1% of the total population (Census of India, 2001).

The economy of Jharkhand is largely dependent on its mineral resources. Iron and coal mining, methane gas wells and fertilizer production are some of the major industries. Though rich in natural resources, in terms of development, Jharkhand is one of the least developed states in India. Tribal communities have lost control of their traditional habitat, the forests, to the government of India in the process of industrialization. While the benefits of industrialization were accrued by the upper classes participating in the
formal economy, the tribal communities that depended on the forest resources for livelihood remained deprived.

Development indicators for Jharkhand reflect a trend of lower levels of development in the state than the country as a whole. The human development index is 0.376 for Jharkhand and 0.467 for India (Planning Commission, 2011). The net domestic product growth rate for Jharkhand stands at 6.35% compared to 8% for India (Reserve Bank of India, 2011). According to Census of India 2011, the male literacy rate is 78.45% in Jharkhand, compared to the national average of 82.14% while for women the contrast is even larger, at 56.21% compared to the national average of 65.46%. The poverty and hunger indicators are also poorer than the national average. While the national poverty headcount ratio is 29.8% for India, for Jharkhand it is 39.1% (Planning Commission of India, 2011). The global hunger index for Jharkhand is 28.67 compared to 23.3 for India while the percentage prevalence of underweight children under the age of 5 is 57.1 compared to 42.5 for the country (IFPRI, 2009).

Of particular importance to this study are school enrollment-related indicators. The Analytical Report 2002-03 published by the National University of Educational Planning and Administration provides a comprehensive picture of school enrollment in Jharkhand prior to the implementation of the SSA in India. The overall enrollment figures for Jharkhand indicate that of the total enrollment at the primary level, 55.33% of students were boys and 44.67% of students were girls. Jharkhand was one of only two states to have its share of girls’ enrollment below 45%. At the upper primary level, 60.03% of the total enrollments were boys and 39.97% were girls. In terms of the population subgroups under consideration in this study, the share of scheduled tribe and
scheduled caste enrollment to total enrollment were approximately 31.7% and 14% respectively at the primary level.

Since the implementation of the SSA, the enrollment figures in Jharkhand have improved. According to the Analytical Report 2009-10 and Analytical Report 2003-04, the net enrollment ratio was 60.27% at the upper primary level compared to 16.62% in 2003-04. The share of upper primary enrollment of scheduled tribes is 26.15% compared to 26.3% of scheduled tribes in the total population of Jharkhand. The share of upper primary enrollment of scheduled castes is 13.20% compared to 11.80 % scheduled castes in the total population, and finally, the share of upper primary enrollment of Muslims is 11.78 compared to 13.85% Muslims in the total population. The share of girls’ enrollment in the total enrollment at the primary level is 48.75% with a gender parity index of 0.95.

Of particular relevance to this study is the fact the Jharkhand is a state with a strong presence of Maoist militants. Maoist militants are followers of Maoist political ideology and claim to fight for the land rights of tribal populations in various parts of India. The Maoists have been considered a terrorist organization by the government of India since 1967. The impact of Maoism on the effectiveness of the SSA in India is revealed later in this chapter.

**Demography and Development Context of Karnataka**

Karnataka is a state located in the southern region of India. Karnataka has a population of approximately 61 million (Census of India, 2011), which is comprised of
the major ethnic groups of Kannadigas, Tuluvas, Konkanis and Kodavas and various immigrant populations. It is home to 5.05% of India’s population and geographically it is the eighth largest state of India. The population of Karnataka is comprised of 83% Hindus, 11% Muslims, 4% Christians and smaller percentages of Jains and Buddhists. The city of Bengaluru, which is the information technology capital of the country, serves as the state capital, and Kannada is the official language. Besides the information technology industry, Karnataka is also known for its contribution to Indian literature and the Indian classical music form of Carnatic music.

The economy of Karnataka is largely dependent on the three main sectors of agriculture, public sector manufacturing and information technology. Karnataka’a gross state domestic product (GDP) for 2011 was $86.83 (VMW Analytic Services, n.d.). The GDP has been the fastest growing GDP and per capita GDP in India over the last decade. During the Eleventh Five Year Plan from 2007 to 2012, the economy of Karnataka grew by 8.0% in comparison to the Indian economy that grew by 7.9%. Some of the major economic sectors of the state are agriculture, which employs about 56% of the total workforce, and public sector manufacturing such as aeronautics and information technology, for which Karnataka is a national and international leader. Other significant industries include oil refineries, biotechnology, silk and petrochemicals.

In terms of development, the state generally fares better than the national average on the various development indicators, ranking 10th among 19 major states of India. According to Census of India 2011, the male literacy rate is 82.85% compared to the national average of 82.14%, while for women the rate stands at 68.13% compared to the national average of 65.46%. The poverty and hunger indicators show state-level figures
that are better than the national averages. While the national poverty headcount ratio is 29.8% for India, for Karnataka it is 18.52% (Economic Survey 2011-12, 2012). The deprivation headcount ratio for Karnataka is 26% compared to 32% for India and the percentage of severely malnourished children is 0.3% (Economic Survey 2011-12, 2012).

With regard to the school enrollment related indicators relevant to this study, the Analytical Report 2003 published by the National University of Educational Planning and Administration provides a comprehensive picture of school enrollment in Karnataka prior to the implementation of the SSA in India. The overall enrollment figures for Karnataka indicate that of the total enrollment at the primary level, 51.46% of students were boys and 48.54% of students were girls, with a gender parity index of about 0.94. At the upper primary level, 52.78% of the total enrollments were boys and 47.22% were girls with a gender parity index of about 0.89. In terms of the population subgroups under consideration in this study, the shares of scheduled tribe and scheduled caste enrollment within total enrollment were approximately 20.3% and 8.0% respectively at the primary level.

Since the implementation of the SSA, the enrollment figures in Karnataka have improved. According to the Analytical Report 2009-10, the net enrollment ratio was 99.23% at the primary level compared to 83.5% in 2003-04 (NUEPA, 2004). The share of primary enrollment of scheduled tribes is 8.04% compared to 6.60% scheduled tribes in the total population of Karnataka. The share of primary enrollment held by scheduled castes is 19.61% compared to 16.20 % scheduled castes in the total population, and the share of primary enrollment of Muslims is 35.52% against 12.23% Muslims in the total
population. The share of girls’ enrollment in the total enrollment at the primary level is 48.36% with a gender parity index of 0.94.

Demography and Development Context of Maharashtra

Maharashtra is a western Indian state located in the western region of India and has a population of approximately 112 million (Census of India, 2011). It is home to 9.29% of India’s population and geographically it is the third largest state of India. The population of Maharashtra is comprised of 83.2% Hindus, 10% Muslims, 6% Buddhists and smaller percentages of Christians, Jains, Sikhs, Jews and Zoroastrians. The city of Mumbai, which is the financial capital of the country, serves as the state capital, and Marathi is the official language. Historically, Maharashtra has been a politically significant region, reaching the zenith of its supremacy with the peak of Maratha rule over central and northern India in the late 17th and early 18th centuries.

The economy of Maharashtra is largely industrial. The state’s gross domestic product for 2011 was $224.12 (VMW Analytic Services, n.d). Maharashtra contributes about 13.3% of India’s gross domestic product. Some of the major industries of the state are chemical products, machinery, textiles and petroleum. Other significant industries include jewellery, pharmaceuticals, the Hindi filmmaking industry, which is known to be the largest movie industry in the world, and shipbuilding. Agriculture also forms an important sector of the economy, employing 64.14% of the people. Two main crops cultivated in Maharashtra are sugarcane and cotton.
In terms of development, the state generally fares better than the national average on the various development indicators. The human development index value is 0.572 for Maharashtra and 0.467 for India (Planning Commission, 2011). The net domestic product growth rate for Maharashtra stands at 8.67% compared to 8% for India (Reserve Bank of India, 2011). According to the Census of India 2011, the male literacy rate is 89.82% compared to the national average of 82.14%, while for women the rate stands at 75.48% compared to the national average of 65.46%. Poverty and hunger indicators show state-level figures that are better than the national averages. While the national poverty headcount ratio is 29.8% for India, for Maharashtra it is 24.5% (Economic Survey 2011-12, 2012). The global hunger index for Maharashtra is 22.8 compared to 23.3 for India, while the percentage prevalence of underweight children under the age of 5 is 36.7 compared to 42.5 for the country (IFPRI, 2009).

With regard to the school enrollment-related indicators under consideration in this study, the Analytical Report 2002-03 published by the National University of Educational Planning and Administration provides a comprehensive picture of school enrollment in Maharashtra prior to the implementation of the SSA in India. The overall enrollment figures for Maharashtra indicate that of the total enrollment at the primary level, 52.10% of students were boys and 47.90% of students were girls with a gender parity index of about 0.92. At the upper primary level, 52.48% of the total enrollments were boys and 47.52% were girls with a gender parity index of about 0.91. In terms of the population subgroups under consideration in this study, the shares of scheduled tribe and scheduled caste enrollment to total enrollment were approximately 15.7% and 12.7%, respectively, at the primary level.
Since the implementation of the SSA, the enrollment figures in Maharashtra have improved. According to the Analytical Report 2009-10, the net enrollment ratio was 88.01% at the primary level compared to 83.54% in 2003-04 (NUEPA, 2004). The share of primary enrollment of scheduled tribes is 12.74% compared to 8.90% scheduled tribes in the total population of Maharashtra. The share of primary enrollment of scheduled castes is 14.49% compared to 10.20 % scheduled castes in the total population, and finally, the share of primary enrollment of Muslims is 12.03% compared to 10.60% Muslims in the total population. The share of girls’ enrollment in the total enrollment at the primary level is 47.09% with a gender parity index of 0.89.

**Research Question 1: Extent to Which Stakeholders Attribute the Increase in School Enrollment to the SSA**

With regard to the secondary research question about the extent to which the stakeholders attribute the increase in school enrollment to the SSA three major themes emerged for Jharkhand. They are: the individual intervention as contributor, the combination of interventions as contributors and non-supply based interventions as contributors.

**Theme 1: Individual intervention as contributor**

I define the individual intervention as contributor as perceptions that certain interventions have the ability to draw children of marginalized populations to school on their own. The constituent elements of this theme include intervention positivity and
intervention indispensability. An individual intervention is identified as a contributor when stakeholder perceptions indicate both overall positivity about the intervention and a belief in the indispensability of the intervention in enabling school enrollment. *Positivity and indispensability act as identifiers* for the themes of individual intervention as the contributor and combination of interventions as contributors.

*Positivity*

Intervention positivity refers to overall satisfaction about the interventions. Intervention positivity is identified by the expression of overall satisfaction with the interventions by participants. It involves the perceptions of the participants that the interventions helped mitigate certain life or schooling concerns for parents, which enabled the school enrollment of children. The perceptions may involve dissatisfaction with some aspects of the interventions. However, there is overall satisfaction with the interventions, which is reflected by the desire to see the continuation of the interventions with or without improvisations. I refer to life concerns as the fundamental concerns associated with human living such as access to food, water, income, housing and health. Schooling concerns are concerns associated with having children enrolled in school.

Positivity regarding the specific interventions appeared frequently across the districts and stakeholders sampled. As one participant in Jharkhand expressed:

>[A]t present the Midday Meal seems most effective, parents send their children so that they get at least one nutritious meal which they cannot afford at home, other programs such as the SWASTHH Plus have not made that much of a difference to enrollment but yes they have also had some positive effect. When children get injured we put medicine and fix a Bandaid or a bandage or when they have a mild fever or stomach ache
we give medicine so children get excited because at home they don’t get anything but if they come to school even minor ailments are taken care of so they become happy. So, SWASTHH Plus has been effective and of course Midday Meal has been effective without question because sometimes that is the only meal the child gets the whole day. Even the supplying of books has been effective, each text book costs about 40 rupees and children cannot afford it so that has also been a big factor.

As evident in the views expressed above, the interventions mitigate some life and schooling concerns for parents. For parents, the Midday Meal alleviates the fundamental life concern of providing food to children. SWASTHH Plus alleviates some health concerns, and the School Supplies intervention decreases the cost of schooling, which is an important concern for parents. Intervention positivity appeared to serve as a necessary condition for intervention indispensability. However, perceptions of intervention positivity were often not accompanied by perceptions of intervention indispensability.

Figure 4-1: School supplies photographed by parent #98.
Though strong intervention positivity was the pervading perception throughout the state, there were many instances of intervention dissatisfaction wherein participant perceptions reflected dissatisfaction with some aspects of the interventions.

Many of the participants perceived that some operational procedures of interventions were undesirable. Though they did not desire to have the intervention discontinued, they wanted it improvised. An example of dissatisfaction with some aspects of the SSA is provided by a teacher in urban India:

[I]n general all the SSA programs have been very good for our locality, most of our children are beginning to be enrolled now and the school looks nice…..For cooking we have not been given a kitchen shed till now. We have made our own arrangements for now by making a temporary shed…… sometimes money gets over and there is problem in buying rice on time. Also, one teacher has to supervise the management of the Midday Meal accounts and the cooking of the meal. If the responsibility of the Midday Meal is given to an outside agency it would be better. Same with the construction of the school building it takes up too much of the teacher’s time. So if this is also given to an outside agency like the VEC it would be good. The stipend is also not sufficient; you cannot do anything with 180 rupees these days. Plus it should be extended to poor children of the general category instead of restricting it only to SC/ST. The children in secondary school are given the same amount of material as children in primary school. But children in secondary school cannot wear knee length clothes, they need ankle length clothes and the cloth is not enough.

**Indispensability**

Intervention indispensability is the second constituent element of individual interventions as contributors. I define intervention indispensability as stakeholder perceptions that a particular intervention was indispensable to substantially increasing school enrollment in India. It refers to perceptions among the various stakeholders in the state that if particular interventions were not implemented or discontinued a large number
of parents would have not sent or stopped sending their children to school even if all other interventions were in place.

This would have made achieving universal school enrollment in India, the primary goal of the SSA, impossible.

Perceptions of intervention indispensability were found to be accompanied by perceptions of intervention positivity except in one instance. In this instance, perceptions of indispensability were accompanied by perceptions of negativity with regard to one particular intervention for a parent group. Though participants perceived the intervention as impacting their children in a specific negative way, there was consensus that the intervention was a big factor in having drawn the children of Jharkhand to school.

Intervention indispensability was highlighted by a district education officer EO in a rural Jharkhand in the following manner:

**EO:** In the beginning they used to distribute raw food to parents who would cook it at home but then often the child would not get sufficient food. The parents would share it among all the members or give more to those who go to work. So, from 2004...
the children are given a cooked meal in school. This Midday Meal has been very effective. Now children are coming to school, parents are sending them just for the meal.

Interviewer: What if the Midday Meal had not been implemented?
EO: If the Midday Meal was not implemented, nothing would have worked. Everything else would have been useless. Parents would not have sent their children. Even now with the Midday Meal the attendance drops in the afternoon. Some children go home after they eat.

The perception of the Midday Meal as the biggest factor drawing children to school was more prevalent at the primary school level than at the secondary school level. Among the eight interventions, some interventions were perceived as being bigger incentives than others in drawing children to schools. Similar views as this were expressed consistently by the various stakeholders: the government, teachers, non-governmental organizations and parents in the state.

**Theme 2: Combination of interventions as contributors**

The second major theme in relation to the extent to which the increase in school enrollment can be attributed to the SSA is the combination of interventions as contributors. The combination of interventions as contributors revolves around the perceptions of stakeholders that some interventions, in combination with other interventions, contributed to the increase in school enrollment. It is identified by two characteristic perceptions. First, these interventions were appreciated and perceived to have been useful in increasing enrollment but lacked the ability to draw children to school on their own.
Second, participants perceived that if these individual interventions were not implemented or were discontinued, it would make no or very little difference to the enrollment of students. An example of the perception that some interventions, though useful, were not indispensable is illustrated by a local NGO representative:

NGO #2: In the SSA program, one of the most effective interventions is the appointment of para-teachers….When para-teachers started to come the schools benefited a lot. It not only provided extra staff but also the para-teachers are of the same community and it removed the language barrier. So the enrollment and retention of children has increased.

Interviewer: What do you think would happen if the appointment of para-teachers was not implemented?

NGO #2: Hmm…I don’t know. I am not sure. Maybe fewer number of children would have joined but I think they might still come for the midday meal.

Interviewer: What about the other interventions? How effective have they been in increasing enrollment?

NGO #2: The role of the VEC has also been very good. In some areas when the money given by the government falls short, the VEC goes around and collects donations for the school and fills all the potholes. In another place, they built many taps and put up many fans. All this was done due to the initiative of the VEC in collecting donations from the villagers. All these SSA programs are good. They have definitely helped in bringing the children to school but I am not sure of their individual effectiveness. If any one was not implemented and the others continued, I don’t think there would be a big effect. As long as the Midday Meal is there I am sure the children will come to school. Some few children may stop coming maybe.

It is evident here that the perceptions of the participants reflect intervention positivity but not intervention indispensability. Indispensability is perceived for the combinations of interventions and not for an individual intervention. In this excerpt the Village Education Committee is perceived to be an important contributor to the increase in school enrollment. However, this perception of the Village Education Committee did not carry through all states or stakeholders.
An intervention that was perceived throughout the three states to have been an important contributor is the distribution of bicycles to girls above grade 7. The distribution of cycles for girls was an intervention that was not initially considered for this study. The interviews and focus group discussions revealed that this intervention was perceived to have played an important role in increasing school enrollment among girls throughout the three states. However, this intervention was not perceived to be effective enough to increase school enrollment on its own. Here is an example of the importance of the distribution of cycles to girls:

A new provision in the SSA for class 8 girls below poverty line is to provide them cycles because when they reach high school they will stop schooling because high school is far and without transport they won’t go. So they provided cycles and the cycles have been very influential and useful. After getting cycles in our area lots of girls; all those who got admitted in our high school. They didn’t like going to school before had to because they walk 5, 6 km every day. So cycles have been very effective and girls have been getting admitted in upper primary, middle school classes because of the cycles. You have to reach class 8, to get the cycles. So now girls reach till class 8 now whereas they would drop out after primary before.
Theme 3: Non-supply based strategy as contributor

In examining perceptions of effectiveness in increasing school enrollment in India, I focused on interventions within the SSA program that were intended to increase enrollment among population subgroups with low enrollment. Most interventions within the SSA are supply-based interventions that involve the distribution of supplies such as school facilities, stipend, meals, uniforms, books etc. However, a thematic analysis of the data revealed that a non-supply-based strategy of the SSA program was perceived to have contributed substantially to increased school enrollment in the states. The theme “non-supply based strategy as contributor” refers to strategies, which do not involve the supply of any kind of resource to students and that have still played an important role in increasing school enrollment. It involves participant perceptions that a non-supply-based strategy of the SSA program contributed substantially to the increase in school enrollment in the three states.

It revolves around expanded teacher responsibilities as part of the SSA (Education for All Campaign). Other than academic responsibilities, schoolteachers are expected to take a census of school-aged children in the village to identify the children not enrolled in any school. The census was undertaken by teachers visiting every home in the village. If the teachers discovered the presence of school-aged children not enrolled in school, they were supposed to talk to parents and work out a solution that addressed the life or schooling concern that prevented the parent from enrolling the child. Here is an example that demonstrates the role of this non-interventional aspect of the SSA program:

We go to guardians and convince them, tell them to send the children – you say that because of poverty you cannot send the children, they go to
break rocks, because of poverty you cannot send the children, they go to do manual labor, if they don’t go they won’t get money, from where will we get rice and how will we eat – they tell us all these reasons so we tell them okay then in a week you send them for 3 days and then the other days they can do your household work or else you can send them for one half – let them come the first half and the second half they can do housework or take care of younger children, we even tell them to send the younger children to school with the older child and we will manage.

A few of the participants said that in addition to the SSA (Education for All Campaign); the increase in school enrollment could also be attributed to an increased awareness among the people about the benefits of education.

**Research Question 2: Implementation Difficulties and How They Impact the Effectiveness of the SSA**

With regard to the second secondary research question about implementation difficulties and how they impact the effectiveness of the SSA, three major themes emerged for Jharkhand. They are: the misappropriation of funds, the misuse of school facilities and the insufficiency of personnel.

**Theme 4: Misappropriation of funds**

Merriam-Webster’s dictionary defines “misappropriate” as to take something, such as money dishonestly for your own use: to appropriate something wrongly. In this study, I refer to misappropriation of funds as the diversion of the SSA ’s monetary allocation by illegal means from its intended purpose to purposes unrelated to the program. It involves the ‘taking away’ of money by those associated with the SSA or
those external to the program. The constituent elements of misappropriation of funds are illegal means and purposes unrelated to the program. Illegal means refers to the ‘taking away’ of SSA funds without approval of the body that has authority over the funds. Purposes unrelated to the program refer to purposes not stated within the official SSA program document for the state.

Misappropriation of funds was found to have occurred in two ways: misappropriation through systemic corruption and misappropriation through violence.

**Misappropriation through systemic corruption**

Corruption is defined as a) impairment of integrity, virtue, or moral principle, b) decay, decomposition, c) inducement to wrong by improper or unlawful means, or d) a departure from the original or from what is pure or correct. The popular reference of corruption is to money and power. In this study, I refer to corruption as dishonest conduct involving money by those in positions of

Figure 4-4: Misappropriation of funds photographed by parent # 64.
power. Systemic corruption refers to corruption that is endemic to the SSA. In this study, misappropriation through systemic corruption involves the taking away of money by people associated with the SSA program for personal use.

The constituent elements of misappropriation through systemic corruption, therefore, are dishonest means and the involvement of people associated with the SSA program. The participants perceived that systemic corruption occurred along different levels of authority within the SSA, ranging from senior administrative officers within the state government to members of the village education committee and contractors involved in the construction of the school building. The following is an example of some parents in a focus group discussion accusing another parent who is the cook for the Midday Meal at school of corruption:

Parent #1: We have got the gas cylinder but nobody knows where the money has gone. Children don’t get proper food.
Parent #4: You are the master of the money; you should know where the money has gone.
Cook #1: I kept complaining that the cylinder hasn’t come; I can’t cook on the mud burner. Then after 2 months I asked him where has the money gone, and he said he has put it in the account.
Parent #3: Have you seen the money in the account? If the money is in the account, why are the children getting bad food? They are supposed to get eggs and milk but there is only rice gruel everyday. They think these are poor children; nobody will question, and the 1lakh, 2lakhs disappears for their own service. There are only 50 glasses for 300 children. We tell them oil and dal is over, and they tell us to make do with what is there. The money comes in advance into the account, and then it disappears.

The misappropriation of funds at the state level affects the availability of funds for multiple schools throughout the state, while misappropriation by members of the village education committees affects specific schools.
The misappropriation of funds allocated to the SSA program implies that reduced funds are available to implement the various interventions within the program. This was perceived to substantially affect the effectiveness of the SSA in two ways. First, the reduced funds result in insufficiency of supplies. It involves the purchase of supplies in smaller quantities than required for the purposes of the SSA program. The insufficiency of supplies relates to school supplies such as books, shoes and uniforms; health and hygiene supplies such as disinfectants, soap, toothpaste and medication or materials needed for the construction of school facilities. For example, one participant explained how corruption caused difficulties in the implementation of SSA interventions:

Dress is a cause of problems for parents. Children are supposed to get uniforms from the SSA. Children in other schools get uniforms. But here nobody gets uniforms. Some members of the VEC say they should be paid for the work they do. I heard that they are filling their pocket with the SSA money. I would say that there is some 30% misappropriation at least through the VEC. So there is no money for uniforms or shoes and bags. Children go without uniforms and shoes and they are pulled out of assembly and scolded. Children feel bad because it not their fault and they refuse to go to school without uniforms.

Second, the reduced funds result in the use of cheaper and poorer quality materials such as the food provided through Midday Meal and construction material for the school building. Poor quality food provided to the children sometimes causes stomach upset or food poisoning among the students. With the use of poor quality material, wear and tear of facilities occurs at a much faster rate.
**Misappropriation through violence**

Misappropriation through violence is the forcible ‘taking away’ of any portion of the monetary allocation meant for the SSA program. It is characterized by violence and the involvement of people external to the SSA program. The SSA funds are diverted from the purposes of the SSA program by Maoist militants through armed assault and then used to fund Maoist operations against the state of Jharkhand.

Maoists are armed militant followers of Marxist thinking who claim to fight against the capitalist Indian government of India for the rights of landless people. Personnel associated with the SSA program, such as state government officials disbursing the funds or principals controlling the funds allocated to the village education committee for school improvement, are killed if they resist to Maoists demands for money.

Participants were reluctant to talk about the Maoist problem in public places because “walls have ears”. Here is what one district education officer revealed in her home:

Maoist people claim to fight for poor people, but they also cause problems for them. They threaten the village education committee and take the money coming for school work. Last year they shot dead a school principal. He was not ready to give the SSA money and they shot him; he was addressing some function in the school, and they shot him; through the window. One high school student also got injured in the leg. Children were screaming; it affected attendance for a week. We have this problem in this district, and then schools cannot do their work.

Participants in the state of Jharkhand perceived that the active presence of Maoists in the state caused substantial difficulties in implementing the SSA. First, the loss of
funds reduces the money available for the implementation of the interventions within the SSA program, resulting in insufficient and poor quality supplies and materials as discussed in the preceding section. Second, the use of violence is often carried out in the presence of villagers and sometimes in the presence of students in school. This causes a substantial loss of class instruction time as the community members recover from the traumatic experience. The poor quality of resources at school, coupled with the occasional traumatic experience, makes the parents question the effectiveness of schooling. This is perceived by participants as one of factors that discourage parents from having children enrolled in schools.

Figure 4-5: Impact of violence by parent #29.
Theme 5: Misuse of school facilities

Misuse is the use of something incorrectly and facility is something that is built, installed, or established to serve a particular purpose, according to Merriam-Webster’s. In this study, misuse of facilities revolves around the inappropriate use of school facilities that have been built as through the SSA program or otherwise. The constituent elements are incorrect or inappropriate use of school facilities. Inappropriate or incorrect use involves the use of school facilities for purposes other than those that enable a positive learning experience for the students. School facilities include the school building, furniture, land, water pumps and sanitation facilities that belong to the school and are meant to be used by the school staff and students unless otherwise permitted by the school management. Members of the larger community in which the school is located perpetrate the misuse of school facilities. Additionally, in the state of Jharkhand, school facilities are also misused as a result of the Maoist conflict as I discuss later in detail.

Misuse by community members

Misuse by community members refers to the inappropriate use of the facilities belonging to the school by the local community members. According to the participants, the community members often indulge in the unauthorized use of the school facilities for a number of personal reasons.

A common occurrence throughout the three states was the use of the school water and sanitation facilities. The school hand pumps or taps are used to collect water for use in the homes of the community members, while community members to relieve
themselves use the sanitation facilities. Participants attributed the use of the school facilities by community members to lack of water and sanitation resources for the local communities and the lack of a boundary wall that would have restricted the community from easily accessing the water pump. However, in some cases, even though school building was locked, the community members accessed the water and sanitation facilities through dishonest means.

Another instance of misuse of school facilities by community members involves the use of the school premises after school hours for illegal activities such as gambling and drinking. The school in this case did not have a boundary wall thus allowing the school premises to be accessed by anybody at any time. The school premises are left unclean, with litter and soiled restrooms often found after drinking and gambling sessions. It is left to the students to clean the premises as part of their regular duties with the School Sanitation and Hygiene Education intervention. The following excerpt shows the extent to which children were disturbed by the misuse of the school facilities:

You look around; you can see the mess here. You think this is made by the Children; it is not. Children don’t bring alcohol bottles to school. The bad elements from that basti come here in the night. They play cards, get drunk, vomit, make the toilet dirty and go. It stinks so bad my daughter tells me you have to hold your nose even if you are 10 meters away. Who will clean it? Teachers tell children they should keep the school clean but I won’t let my child clean other people’s mess. They come here to learn or to become servants?

Finally, the school facilities were also misused as a source of income. Metal objects such as window frames, restroom doors, roofs and furniture were often stolen by members of the community who earned an income from the sale of the stolen property.
The misuse of school facilities impacted the implementation of the SSA in different ways. For one, the water and sanitation facilities were often nonfunctional as the facilities got damaged much quicker than expected owing to large number of people using them. In one instance where the community used the school water supplies sponsored by the corporate social responsibility center of a leading company, the school managements found itself billed for copious amounts of water. Unable to continue making huge payments for the community use of water, the company disconnected the water supplies provided to the school. At the time of data collection, the school had no water supply for purposes of drinking or use in restrooms. Second, as drinking and gambling involve people who are not in full control of their mental faculties, the sessions often culminate in violent arguments and the damage of school property. In addition, during my visits to interview teachers, some of the school facilities were found to be in a state of disrepair. The budget
allocation for repairs is perceived to be insufficient for the frequent repairs necessitated.

The state of disrepair is illustrated well in an excerpt from the field notes I prepared:

I arrived at school by 7:30. The place looked unkempt. There was a bunch of loudly-talking men on the verandah in a circle. Bottles around them cards in the centre. As soon as they see us getting out of the car, they pack up. One person seemed drunk. Another in the group helps him walk. There are fresh paan stains on the floor. As I walked into the verandah, I was greeted by a million houseflies, 2 dogs and 1 cow. Broken bottles. Somebody sends for children. They carry buckets of water to clean. The water-pump is broken. I walk around the school, and the place stinks. The toilet is soiled and has no door. The door disappeared one night, I am told.

Participans, cutting across various stakeholder groups perceived this to be a negative influence for the students that did not inspire parents about the quality and effectiveness of schooling.

**Misuse in Maoist Conflict**

Misuse in Maoist conflict refers to the use of the school buildings in the state of Jharkhand as a barricade against armed attack. According to the participants in the state of Jharkhand, school facilities are frequently misused in the Maoist conflict by both the Maoist militants as well as the security forces of the country. In the battle against the Indian government, Maoist militants blast school buildings in remote, heavily forested areas of the state by stuffing rooms with improvised explosive devices or using landmines or dynamite. Participants perceive that the Maoists attack school buildings for two reasons.

First, in remote forests where facilities for housing Indian security forces such as police stations are not available, the school buildings are inhabited by Indian security
forces. Since the Indian security forces are the Maoists’ primary target, the Maoists blow up schools in a direct attack on their adversaries. One parent explained the impact of the Maoist conflict on schooling in the following manner:

The Maoists blew up the school. Now 3 rooms don’t have walls or roofs, 2 rooms have walls but no roofs and 2 rooms are somewhat okay. There are holes in the floors; the doors are in pieces. Some classes are conducted in the rooms without a roof but children have to run under the trees when it rains.

Second, the participants perceived that Maoists sometimes blow up schools even when they are not occupied by security forces in order to maintain a supply of potential Maoist recruits. Destroyed school facilities discourage the youth from pursuing education and finding meaningful jobs. The only option left to the illiterate children then is to join the militant Maoist organizations. Third, schools often lose working days because the Maoists call for shutdowns in protest against government policies. As one NGO representative commented, “3 days a month there is some bandh and teachers are not able to cover the syllabus. If you dare to keep the school open they will come and break your bones. What can you do?”

Besides the destruction that is brought on schools, the occupation of school buildings by the security forces creates additional problems. The security forces sometimes occupy a majority of the classrooms in the school for months as a base for anti-Maoist operations. This leaves very few classrooms to conduct school activities. The schools are forced to function in cramped spaces. One district education officer had this to say:

This is a border Maoist area but they have not destroyed our schools, but The next district in a Maoist stronghold. My sister is married there. It is deep inside the jungle. There is no development, only the school. Maoists
destroyed the school there. I was in my sister’s house at the time. It was deafening in the middle of the night. First, the CRPF people used to live in the school. They used 7, 8 rooms in the school, and the CRPF people would use 4 rooms. Children from 1st to 10th would sit in the remaining rooms. The children are distracted with all the weapons. Instead of studying, they watch the soldiers practice.

The security forces also bathe in the open in the presence of students and use the school sanitation facilities, leaving the children to use open spaces. This makes the learning experience uncomfortable.

In these ways the Maoist conflict disrupts the schooling of India’s most marginalized children. In this environment of frequent violence, participants perceive that it is difficult to convince parents to keep their children enrolled in school.
Theme 6: Insufficiency of personnel

The final theme that emerged out of the participants’ perceptions in relation to the difficulties in implementing the SSA program is the insufficiency of staff.

Merriam-Webster’s defines insufficiency as the lack of adequate supply. In this study, I refer to the insufficiency of personnel as the non-availability of manpower to implement the SSA interventions in an efficient manner. The interventions within the SSA program are implemented through the agency of the school. For example, midday meals are provided to students in school, school supplies such as books and uniforms are distributed in school and stipends for girls are distributed in school.

As the schools are not equipped with administrative staff and neither are they provided external personnel, the teachers are assigned additional responsibilities. The constituent elements of the insufficiency of personnel are teachers and inappropriate responsibilities. Teachers are staff of the school,
and their primary responsibility is to teach students. Inappropriate responsibilities refer to the responsibilities beyond teaching-related duties that teachers carry out as end-of-the line implementers of the SSA interventions.

The additional responsibilities that are carried out by teachers are varied. A major non-teaching responsibility for teachers in the three states is the management and supervision of the SSA interventions. For example, the teachers are responsible for maintaining daily records of details such as the materials used and the number of students for the Midday Meal intervention. Besides this, they are also responsible for supervising the helpers in preparing the Midday Meal. In a few places the management of the Midday Meal was outsourced but in majority of the districts, schools are responsible.

This creates an undue burden on the teachers, described here:

The burden on teachers is becoming more. Because the burden is more teachers cannot pay attention to quality, it is difficult. They have to write reports because the cooks are illiterate. Teachers spend 25% of their time in non-teaching activities in this and that. There are arguments with the cooks also sometimes over how much to cook and how to cook. I think these jobs should be given to the panchayat then the harassment of the teachers will be less.

The teachers were also expected to supervise the School Sanitation and Hygiene intervention, which involved managing the student groups responsible for cleaning the school premises and sanitation facilities and maintaining records of the stipends distributed to girl students. Though these activities are supposed to be undertaken during the teachers’ and students’ free time, participants perceived that it was not always feasible to get the work done within the time limit.

Non-teaching responsibilities for teachers also include taking a census of school-aged children in the community. This involves teacher visits to homes in the community
to identify the children not enrolled in school and to find solutions that enable their enrollment in school. Another responsibility that participants perceived as often thrust upon the teachers is election-related duties. Election-related duties involve receiving applications for the voter identification cards, providing guidance in filling out the application forms and manning election booths at the time of elections. The schools function as the stations for submitting the applications, and I had the opportunity to witness teacher involvement in election-related duties in one school I visited. The following excerpt from the field notes I prepared captures teacher involvement in election-related duties well:

We try to teach well and give children good education, but what happens is that the government puts a lot of work on our heads; sometimes election duty, sometimes pulse polio…for pulse polio 2 teachers have to leave the school for 3 days. So in this way there is a lot of disturbance in the teaching. The routine of teaching children is stopped. In government schools there are two teachers from classes 1 to 5. One teacher is generally busy with attending meetings or some other work in the government office. 1 teacher is left and so the required amount of teaching does not happen.

The multiple roles performed by the teachers results in the substantial loss of instruction time for the teachers and students, according to a majority of the participants across the three states. Students were thus perceived to lose out on crucial learning experiences in the classroom. These non-teaching responsibilities do not directly impact the implementation of the interventions within SSA program. However, they indirectly impact the enrollment goals of the SSA program. Parents are discouraged by the quality of schooling, and this makes it harder to convince them to enroll their children in school. One teacher described the impact of the additional teacher responsibilities as follows:

You understand madam; our teachers go for elections, pulse polio then
they also have to see that meals are cooking properly, worms are not falling inside from the tree. Then have to also see the records for giving the girls money. This is a very big factor that children are weak and then because the children don’t learn anything, they remove the children and send them to work. Parents say why we should send children to your school; you’re not teaching anything.

Another difficulty in the implementation of the SSA programs includes the social exclusion of marginalized groups being considered in the study. A few schools had problems implementing the Midday Meal intervention. The Midday Meal intervention provides one cooked meal to students in school. The Midday Meal is cooked by helpers appointed through the system of reservation or preference for scheduled castes and scheduled tribes and other backward classes (OBCs). Few participants reported that in schools with students from diverse castes and classes, the schools faced upper-caste boycott of meals cooked by women of SC, ST or OBCs. In some cases, upper-caste parents withdrew their children from school and in extreme cases, schools faced violent protests. Though difficulties in implementing the SSA interventions caused by social exclusion exist, they did not emerge as a major theme across all three states.

Research Question 3: Inadequacies of the SSA in Addressing the Challenges to Secondary School Enrollment

With regard to the third secondary research question about the inadequacies of the SSA in addressing the challenges to secondary school enrollment, three major themes emerged. They are: the loss of income, the quality of schooling and safety and purity.
Theme 7: Loss of income

Loss of income was a major theme that emerged from analyzing participants’ perceptions of the inadequacies of the SSA program in addressing the challenges to secondary school enrollment. Loss is the failure to keep or to continue to have something and income is money that is earned from work, investments, business, etc. as defined by Merriam-Webster’s. Loss of income was perceived by participants to be of two types: loss of direct income and loss of indirect income.

Loss of indirect income

I refer to loss of indirect income as the loss of income that results from the loss of labor. The performance of physical or mental labor by school-aged children without monetary compensation forms the essence of loss of labor. The constituent elements are form of labor and absence of income. I refer to loss of labor as the failure to continue to have ‘another hand’ in performing household tasks. It revolves around the work that school-aged children do for their own families. Loss of labor was perceived to be a core factor in the parents’ decisions to not enroll their children in school.

Participants across all three states perceived loss of labor to be an important challenge to the secondary school enrollment of children, especially girls. Participants perceived that by the time children begin secondary school, they are considered old enough to contribute substantially to the running of their households. According to one parent on the village education committee, the enrollment of girls is low in secondary schools for the following reasons: “Parents make them work at home no madam, do the work in the house, take care of small small children in the house, cook, clean and wash
clothes”. Other than earning an income for the family, boys also contribute labor to their households. Some of the labor that boys engage in includes agricultural activities, herding farm animals and ferrying agricultural produce to markets. The role of household labor as a factor preventing boys from enrolling in school is illustrated in the following case:

Some childrens [sic] are there but they need to get education but the family is not helping. In our school only Wasim is there. Night nearly one’o’clock two’o’clock water will come it seems. He has to collect water for the house…..then he helps his father in the harvest time. He won’t come to school harvest time. They need help to cut the crops; extra hand means extra money.

The participation of children in domestic labor enabled parents to work longer hours and increase the family income. A teacher in rural India expressed how besides income, there may be some additional benefits to the mother leaving the house to work: “What can they do madam; if the children go to school then the mother has to stay at home to for the housework and she cannot go outside and in other people’s house[s]. Sometimes she gets leftover food or raw rice or vegetables from the houses she works in and that is also helpful.”

Loss of direct income

Another type of loss of income that emerged from the interviews and focus group discussions with the participants is the loss of direct income. In this study, I refer to loss of direct income as the failure of a family to continue to have the additional income that is earned by a child family member. Loss of direct income involves the inability of a child to contribute directly to the family income by engaging in a form of labor as a direct consequence of being enrolled in school. Loss of direct income, therefore, is
characterized by a form of labor and monetary compensation from a source other than the parents. Participants across all the three states perceived loss of income to be the most important factor in preventing children, especially boys, from being enrolled in secondary school.

One NGO representative highlighted the role of loss of income in hindering secondary school enrollment:

Guardians who are very poor, they think that in the time that the child goes to study, he could earn. If earns and brings money we can eat. Children who are 10, 12 years old are old enough to go to work and earn money for their home. The government gives 180 rupees but that is not enough. Here there is a beedi factory; girls are sent to work there, the nimble fingers of girls are more useful in rolling beedis. Every house has girls working in the beedi factory and parents think if they send their daughters to school they will lose that income. The smaller girls do housework

Forms of income-generating labor that boys engaged in included agricultural work on local farms, rolling leaves to make indigenous Indian cigarettes, carrying cement at construction sites and waiting tables in restaurants. Across the three states, girls were perceived to be relatively less likely to engage in income-generating activity. When girls were sent to work, the forms of labor they performed were perceived to be housekeeping, agricultural work such as milking animals etc.
Unpaid domestic labor and paid labor outside the home prevent parents from enrolling children in schools. According to the perceptions of participants, the program in India addresses some life and schooling concerns for parents, such as providing healthy food and minimizing schooling expenses. However, it fails to address certain other life concerns, such as the loss of labor for the care of small children, household chores and farming support. The SSA program does not have a mechanism that provides parents with a substitute for the loss of labor; nor does it compensate parents for the loss of income. Participants perceive that the school enrollment of children will cause the family income to drop in direct or indirect ways. Loss of indirect income is perceived to be a bigger hindrance to the enrollment of girls than the enrollment of boys, while the loss of direct income is a relatively bigger hindrance for boys.

**Theme 8: Quality of schooling**

The second major theme in relation to the inadequacies of the SSA in addressing the challenges to secondary school enrollment is the quality of schooling. Merriam-Webster’s defines quality as how good or bad a thing is and schooling as instruction in school: that is, education. For this study, I consider quality of schooling as how good or bad the educational experience provided in school is. Quality of schooling revolves around the perceptions of stakeholders that the quality of the educational experience in school is inadequate, and as a result parents do not see much benefit in having their children enrolled in school. Quality of schooling is perceived to be inadequate primarily
with regard to two aspects: the personnel providing educational experiences and the physical facilities in which the educational experiences are provided.

The personnel providing educational experiences refers to the persons providing classroom instruction to the students. Though most of the personnel are regularly-appointed teachers, some of the teachers were working under temporary contractual appointments. The participants perceived the quality of teachers to be a major challenge to secondary school enrollment in India. A UNICEF officer emphasized the importance of quality education in keeping the children enrolled in school in the following way:

Supply-related interventions maybe initially attractive, but if you want to Sustain enrollment you need to provide quality education. Midday Meal Scheme, of course has an impact definitely, but along with that you need to provide soft components in terms of good quality education. That is the important thing. If the purpose for which a child is coming needs to be completed, you need quality, teacher training, good teacher training, teachers implementing new methodologies so that children understand and learn better. Some of the programs, which we have initiated as activity based learning, which are more joyful, help them to understand better, learn with peers, and individualize instruction to pace of the children. I strongly feel these are important for a child to remain in school….Differential training is important because needs of a village child are different from that of the city; the context is different. When government school children get good quality education then the parents will be encouraged to keep them in school as they will see how much they benefit from going to school.

The perceptions of the participants revealed a number of problems with the quality of teachers. Firstly, there was a shortage of teachers in schools, and students were being instructed in multi-grade classrooms with a single teacher attending to up to three grades at a time. Secondly, the teachers often did not have the necessary qualifications specified by the state education department. The teachers were perceived to lack a degree or teacher certification or both. This was perceived to be truer of rural areas than urban areas because “educated people want to be in cities”, as one participant explained.
Sometimes local people in the village with the most years of schooling were assigned teaching responsibilities in the school with no prior experience in teaching. Therefore, some schools had teachers with no content knowledge, pedagogical training or prior teaching experience. Thirdly, participants perceived that teachers were not conscientious enough. Teachers often arrived an hour late and left early to deal with personal problems, sometimes teachers clocked in their attendance and leave immediately. During the time the teachers were in school, they would sometimes not teach and ask students to read from their textbooks. One parent had this to say about the teachers: “No studies happen in school. They don’t do anything; they often gossip among themselves. They come, sign and go; one teacher often sits in his chair and dozes and the children make noise; he is newly married. Some teachers come from far, travelling two, three hours, and they are tired and they don’t teach.”

Physical facilities in which educational experiences are provided are another important aspect that contributes to the overall poor quality of schooling. The physical facilities in which educational experiences are provided include the school building, school premises and

Figure 4-10: Poor school facilities by parent #102.
classrooms. Participant perceptions centered around the perception that the physical facilities provided in the school were insufficient and in poor shape.

According to the participants, some of the schools had only two rooms in which to conduct classes from grade 1 to grade 5. Many classrooms had no tables or chairs, and children were seated on the floor. Blackboards were often absent and there were no teaching aids to help teachers provide a visual representation of concepts.

As discussed in an earlier section, water and sanitation facilities were often broken or dysfunctional. According to the participants, once school facilities are damaged, nothing or very little is done to redress the situation. Some of the participants perceived the sustenance mechanisms for the interventions to be inadequate. Broken water pumps, toilets, roofs and other such damages were generally left unattended. If reading glasses or wheelchairs given to disabled students through the SSA program were damaged, the students were not provided with a replacement.

The school premises often lacked boundary walls, thus enabling misuse of the facilities meant for students. These perceptions of the participants matched my observations during visits to schools to interview teachers. The following is an excerpt from a focus group discussion with parents:

Interviewer: Okay, so tell me why you chose to click the picture of the school building?
Parent: Because till now it is not final, and there are so many problems because of it. The school building is not final. It is stuck since 1998 or ‘99. But we thought our children’s lives or will be destroyed so we forcibly opened the locks. This is a middle school so there are big, big girls. Where is the bathroom? There is so much difficulty with the latrine; I keep telling it should have a boundary and gate and there should be a latrine, bathroom inside so that girls do not have to go outside and they remain safe. ....cows and goats also
wander in; you saw one when you came, didn’t you? Also, in the classrooms – 2 classes, 3 classes sit in one room; we keep asking for some more classrooms on the top but nobody listens.

Interviewer: What about the water pump?
Parent: We have a water-pump, but it is outside the school boundary; nor is the room for making rice gruel inside the boundary. The latrine is also outside and it is so dirty that nobody uses it, I have taken a picture and given you. The girls are hardnosed; they will go far away and hide behind the trees to relieve themselves but they will not use the toilet; it is very problematic. The water-pump is working at present; often times it is not and you have to go far for water. You have to be after them for so long to get it fixed.

The poor quality of teachers and physical facilities were perceived to be major contributing factors to the overall poor quality educational experiences that children received in school. Taught in an environment of poor quality resources, the academic achievement of government school students is poor in comparison to the achievement of students from better quality private schools. As one teacher described:

They don’t want to send their children to government schools and they don’t have money to send their children to a private school…No studies happen in government schools; there is no point in sending children to government schools. Results of government students are not good in the matric exam and they get disappointed. Also, the government has made a new rule that children should not be failed from class 1 to 8. So we are forced to promote the children, and when children come to high school their foundation is weak.

Participants also perceived that poorly qualified teachers did not speak good English. English teachers often taught English in the local language, making it difficult for students to learn good English. Since English skills are critical to finding a good job, a high quality of English instruction was considered an indicator of good quality schooling. A teacher had this to say about the importance of English:
“The English is important has became for the duties, service but here minority languages are there. All government schools they learn from the mother tongue. So it has got that difficulty for the children also and for the parents also. So little they have money means they will be sending to English schools.”

Another contributing factor to the poor quality of education as perceived by parents is the lack of vocational training provided in schools. Many parents perceived that at least if vocational training was provided in schools, the students would have some skills that would enable them to work along with pursuing studies.

The participants perceived that because of the poor quality of schooling, the government school students would not be able to successfully compete with private school students for higher education or jobs. Therefore, parents did not perceive substantial benefits from enrolling their children in school. In the ways described above, participants across all the sampled states perceived that the SSA program was grossly inadequate in addressing the schooling concerns of parents with regard to the quality of education received in school.
Theme 9: Safety and purity of girls

In analyzing the data for inadequacies of the SSA in addressing the challenges to secondary school enrollment, one theme emerged that was specific to the school enrollment of girls. Safety and purity emerged a theme specific to the secondary school enrollment of girls. Safety is the condition of being safe from undergoing or causing hurt, injury, or loss, and purity is the quality or state of being pure as defined by Merriam-Webster’s. Purity in this context is used in reference to the virginity of female children. The concern of parents to ensure the physical safety, reputation and purity of their girl children forms the essence of what I refer to as safety and purity.

Secondary schools in India are often more than a reasonable walking distance from the homes of children. This means that children have to travel long distances on their own making them vulnerable to physical harassment. For parents of female children, this is a major concern. Also, according to participant perceptions, the marriage prospects of girl depend largely on the girl’s reputation. A girl’s reputation involves community perceptions about her sexual and non-sexual romantic encounters with the opposite sex as explained by this parent: “There are boys also in the school; tomorrow if somebody says they saw my daughter talking to boys then her name will be spoiled who will marry her…… Girls are sometimes stupid; they get carried away if some boy gives them little attention. If there are only girls in the school it is okay.” Even if schools are close to the home, girls still come in contact with the opposite sex in school. Parents are therefore concerned about the possibility of their daughters being romantically involved with boys in school. Keeping female children out of school is perceived to be the only way parents
can ensure the girls’ purity and maintain their reputations prior to marriage. An NGO representative from rural India had this to say about issues of safety in secondary school and the inadequacy of the SSA program in addressing this problem:

They drop out because of the behaviors of the people here. Parents remove girls saying they have become mature. The school is too far. They ask whether you will give guarantee that they will be safe; will you walk with them to school? It is good if they make the higher classes in the same school. Then they don’t have to walk so far. The SSA gives money but what is 1 rupee these days; you can’t do anything……There are KGBVs in some villages, but parents don’t always like to keep the girls away from them. What guarantee is there about their safety?

The SSA provides parents with incentives to send their female children to school. The Stipend for Girls intervention provides female children with a rupee for every day of attendance in school. However, this incentive does not override the parents’ concerns about the safety and purity of their daughters. Participants perceived that the program was inadequate in addressing the safety and purity concerns of parents for their girl children. No intervention within the SSA program enhances the safety or guarantees the purity of their female children when enrolled in secondary school.

Figure 4–12 displayed below presents the final thematic map developed by refining the initial thematic map. A review of themes that emerged out of the states of Jharkhand, Karnataka and Maharashtra revealed commonalities in the stakeholders’ perceptions about the effectiveness of the SSA in increasing school enrollment in India. However, some minor differences in the difficulties in implementing the SSA also emerged. The following section presents the similarities and differences between Jharkhand, Karnataka and Maharashtra.
Similarities and Differences among Jharkhand, Karnataka and Maharashtra

The SSA, known as the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan provides a broadly converging framework for the implementation of various interventions for achieving universal school enrollment in India. As a federal government initiative, the SSA program does not allow for much difference in what was being implemented to reach the goals of universal primary and secondary school enrollment. However, the study revealed some contextual differences in the difficulties associated with the implementation of the interventions.
within the SSA program. This section of the chapter presents the similarities and differences in the findings among the states of Jharkhand, Maharashtra and Karnataka.

**Similarities**

The first secondary research question for this study revolved around the extent to which the various stakeholders attributed the increase in school enrollment in India to the SSA. The analysis of data revealed consensus among all the stakeholders throughout the three states that the increase in school enrollment in India could be attributed to the SSA program to a very large extent. Within the SSA program, some interventions were perceived to be more effective than others in drawing children to school. Again, there was consensus throughout the three states and among all the stakeholders that the Midday Meal was the biggest or the most effective contributor to the increase in school enrollment. It is also perceived that the Midday Meal was effective enough to draw children to school in and of itself. School enrollment at the primary and secondary levels would have increased very minimally without the Midday Meal. There was also consensus that the cycle distribution to girls and census visits by teachers played important roles in increasing school enrollment, especially at the secondary school level. However, these interventions were not perceived to be effective enough to increase school enrollment in significant numbers on their own.

The second secondary research question was about the difficulties in the implementation of the interventions within the SSA and how they impact the effectiveness of the program. With regard to this question, the misappropriation of SSA
funds through systemic corruption at all levels of the program was found to be a commonly perceived difficulty in all three states. Further, the misappropriation of funds was found to impact the effectiveness of the SSA program across the three states in similar ways. Most of the stakeholders in the three states perceived that as a result of corruption by people at various levels of implementation, the supplies provided to students were insufficient. The purchase of cheaper and poorer quality of materials leading to quicker wear and tear was another way that corruption impacted the effectiveness of the SSA program. A second difficulty that was found to be commonly perceived in all the sampled states was the misuse of school facilities by the local community members due to the lack of boundary walls. Lastly, the insufficiency of personnel was found to be a difficulty in all three states. The interventions within the SSA program were implemented throughout the school. As no personnel were appointed in schools for implementing interventions, teachers were expected to take on SSA program-related duties.

The third secondary research question involved examining how stakeholders perceived the inadequacies of the SSA in addressing the challenges to secondary school enrollment. The analysis of the data for this question revealed that the stakeholders perceived the SSA to be inadequate in addressing some common challenges to secondary school enrollment in the literature. First, the loss of direct and indirect income due to the loss of labor was found to be a challenge that was not adequately addressed by the SSA program. The stakeholders across the three states perceived that the SSA program did not provide a substitute for the loss of labor, nor did it provide a compensation for the loss of income. Second, the SSA program was found to be inadequate in addressing the
challenge of quality schooling in the three states. Parents perceived the quality of educational experience in school to be poor, and this prevented them from having their children enrolled in school. Third, the program was perceived to be inadequate in addressing the safety and purity concerns of parents for their female children. There are no interventions within the SSA program that ensure the safety of the female children when enrolled in secondary school.

Though the abovementioned similarities were found in stakeholder perceptions across the states of Jharkhand, Karnataka and Maharashtra, there were differences in the degree to which the perceptions pervaded each state. The following section discusses the differences in how various stakeholders perceived the SSA program in the three states.

Differences

This section presents the differences between the states of Jharkhand, Karnataka and Maharashtra in relation to how stakeholders perceived the effectiveness of the SSA in India. The analysis of data revealed some primary differences between the three states in the stakeholder perceptions of the contextual difficulties and how they impacted the implementation of the SSA program. Some secondary differences were revealed in the perceptions about the extent to which individual interventions within the SSA program were effective in increasing enrollment. Secondary differences between the three states were also revealed in the perceptions about the adequacy of the SSA program in addressing the challenges to secondary school enrollment.
The primary difference between the three states in the perceptions of the stakeholders relates to the impact of militant Maoism on the implementation of the interventions in the SSA program. The difficulties in relation to Maoism were not perceived in Karnataka and Jharkhand. As explained in the case context provided earlier in this chapter, Jharkhand is a stronghold of militant Maoists who are fighting the Indian State for tribal land rights. The dominance of Maoists in the state was perceived to cause two difficulties in program implementation.

The first difficulty is the misappropriation of funds. Though misappropriation of funds was not found to be unique to Jharkhand, the misappropriation of funds by violence was unique to Jharkhand. Misappropriation of funds by violence involves the ‘taking away’ of portions of the SSA funds by Maoists through the use of violence. This results in fewer funds being available for implementing interventions. It also results in traumatic experiences that the school community has to cope with and the loss of instruction time.

The second primary difficulty is the misuse of school facilities in the Maoist conflict. Again, though the misuse of school facilities is common to the three states the misuse of school facilities in the Maoist conflict is unique to Jharkhand. The misuse of school facilities occurs by the Indian security forces as well as the Maoist militants in ways that have been described in the earlier sections of this chapter. The misuse of school facilities in the state was perceived to have a significant impact on the implementation of the SSA in the state of Jharkhand.

The secondary differences among the three states refer to the variations in the similarities among perceptions of the stakeholders in relation to the research questions in this study. With regard to the research question about the extent to which interventions
within the SSA program were effective in increasing enrollment, the stakeholders perceived some interventions to be more effective than others in increasing school enrollment. In all the states, the Midday Meal was perceived to be the most effective intervention. Excluding the Midday Meal, in Jharkhand, stakeholders perceived the Residential Schools intervention and the Para-teachers intervention to be more effective than other interventions in increasing school enrollment. On the other hand, in Maharashtra and Karnataka, the Village Education Committee and the Cycle Supply interventions were perceived to be more effective than other interventions by the various stakeholders. A comparison of the findings from the states of Jharkhand, Karnataka and Maharashtra is tabulated in Table 4-1 below.

Table 4-1: Comparison of findings from Jharkhand, Karnataka and Maharashtra.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research Question</th>
<th>Jharkhand</th>
<th>Karnataka</th>
<th>Maharashtra</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Extent to which stakeholders attribute the increase in school enrollment to the SSA</strong></td>
<td>Individual intervention as contributor</td>
<td>Individual intervention as contributor</td>
<td>Individual intervention as contributor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Combination of interventions as contributors</td>
<td>Combination of interventions as contributors</td>
<td>Combination of interventions as contributors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Non-supply based strategy as contributor</td>
<td>Non-supply based strategy as contributor</td>
<td>Non-supply based strategy as contributor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Implementation</strong></td>
<td>Misappropriation of</td>
<td>Misappropriation of</td>
<td>Misappropriation of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficulties and</td>
<td>How they impact</td>
<td>Accessibility of</td>
<td>Addressing the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Systemic corruption</td>
<td>Misappropriation of funds through violence</td>
<td>Misuse of school facilities by community members</td>
<td>Insufficiency of personnel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Misuse of school facilities in the Maoist conflict</td>
<td></td>
<td>Loss of indirect income</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Insufficiency of personnel</td>
<td></td>
<td>Loss of direct income</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Quality of schooling</td>
<td></td>
<td>Quality of schooling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Safety and purity of girls</td>
<td></td>
<td>Safety and purity of girls</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
With regard to the research question about the adequacy of the SSA program in addressing the challenges to secondary school enrollment, the challenge of quality schooling was perceived to be inadequately addressed by substantially more participants in Maharashtra and Karnataka than Jharkhand. More participants in Karnataka and Maharashtra than Jharkhand perceived quality schooling to be an impediment to school enrollment. Stakeholders in Maharashtra and Karnataka, and especially urban parents perceived that it was better to have NGO workers teach their children for a couple of hours in some space provided by the community than to have their children attend poor quality government schools. This perception was not found in Jharkhand.

**Localized Bottom-up Solutions to Increasing School Enrolment**

Besides the themes that emerged in relation to the research questions for this study, the analysis of the data also revealed certain localized bottom-up solutions that were being implemented in order to increase school enrollment while functioning within limited resources. A number of supply-based interventions are being implemented to minimize the schooling expenses of parents and thereby encourage the enrollment of children in school. However, the implementation of the interventions is faced with contextual difficulties. In response to contextual difficulties, certain ingenious solutions have been devised at the school and local community level in implementing interventions within the SSA in India.
The SSA ensures a primary school within every kilometer. It also provides a cooked midday meal to all children in government and government aided schools. School supplies in the form of school bags, uniforms and text books are also supplied to children. Stipends and sanitation facilities are provided to girls to encourage their enrollment in school. However, these interventions are perceived to be inadequate in addressing all the schooling concerns of parents such as the loss of labor and the loss of income as the SSA does not compensate the loss of income nor substitute for the loss of labor. In order to deal with this situation the teachers, during the census visits to the local homes, discuss with parents some solutions to enable the enrollment of their children.

One of the labor contributions of a secondary school aged child is to take care of younger siblings at home. To address this loss of labor, teachers encourage parents to send younger siblings with the older children to school. This was observed by the researcher during visits to schools to interview teachers. Little children about 3 years of age and above were seen to be standing in the morning assembly lines holding the skirts or hands of older siblings. The children were also observed to be sitting in class and sharing lunch during the midday meal with older siblings.

To deal with loss of income, teachers encourage parents to send their children for at least either the morning session or the afternoon session at school. This allows for the family to retain the income a child brings while the child attends school. In other instances, teachers inform parents that they can take the child to help in the fields during labor intensive periods such as harvest in the agricultural cycle and send the child to school during periods that the child’s help is not needed much in the fields. Other
solutions to this problem include allowing children to stay absent on certain days of the week to help their parents transport and sell vegetable produce in the local markets.

To encourage the enrollment of Muslim girls, teachers in one instance expressed that they would conduct the census visits of local homes in the company of a respected Muslim community member. Rather than talk about the popularly discussed benefits of schooling girl children, the teachers discuss with parents how the Koran calls for the education of all human beings by quoting the relevant verses of the Koran. In this case the teacher perceived that this strategy was useful in increasing the enrollment of girls among the Muslim community.

Another difficulty perceived by a few of the participants in the implementation of the SSA interventions is social exclusion. SSA norms require that women from SC, ST or OBC category be given preference to be appointed as cooks for the Midday Meal intervention. A few participants expressed that upper caste students would refuse to eat the midday meal that was cooked by a scheduled caste or scheduled tribe woman. In one case parents stopped sending their children to school. To address this difficulty the village education committee decided to outsource the preparation of the midday meal to an external agency. This strategy was perceived to have helped retain upper caste students in school as well as enable teachers to devote more time to teaching related activities rather than nonteaching responsibilities.

Though the primary objective of this study was not to investigate bottom-up solutions in relation to the SSA in India it would be useful for practitioners in the field to consider them for their local contexts.
Summary of Findings

The most critical finding of this study is the emergence of the quality of schooling as a challenge to secondary school enrollment. The stakeholders perceived that the SSA program in India was inadequate in addressing the challenge of the quality of schooling at the secondary school level. The government schools were perceived to be of poor quality in comparison to private schools. This leaves the children of government schools unable to compete for seats in higher education institutions and in the job market. It was perceived that children who attend government schools did not gain much from schooling and generally ended up with jobs they were eligible for without schooling. Parents did not see any benefit that they would gain from having their children attend school, and as a result they were reluctant to enroll their children in school. In the absence of good quality schooling comparable to private schools, sending a child out to work or engaging children in household chores were perceived to be of greater benefit to the family. Therefore, the quality of schooling was perceived across the three states to be a challenge to universal secondary school enrollment.

Another critical finding that emerged from the study is the insufficiency of personnel as end-of-the-line implementers of the SSA interventions in all the three states sampled. An important aspect in the implementation of interventions is the consideration of who will implement the interventions. The availability and efficiency of personnel to undertake the new responsibilities that the interventions bring are critical to the effectiveness of the program. The SSA program in India has no provision for the appointment of an adequate number of personnel for the efficient functioning of the
interventions. Rather the interventions within the SSA program in India are implemented through the agency of the school. Due to the lack of appointed personnel, the teachers are required to maintain records of expenses, be the primary implementers (as in the case of census visits to the homes of the local community), supervise interventions such as the Midday Meal, procure various intervention materials and undertake other such responsibilities. This involvement of teachers in non-teaching activities causes the quality of schooling to deteriorate further.

Other important findings of the study include the misappropriation of funds through systemic corruption. The various stakeholders perceived that the funds allotted for the implementation of the SSA interventions were insufficient. The misappropriation of funds through systemic corruption further exacerbated this situation. This results in poor quality physical resources such as the school building and water and sanitation facilities. Also, a non-supply based strategy, the census visits of teachers to the local community of homes was found to play an important role in drawing children to school. The census visit involved the teachers providing reasonable solutions to the problems that prevented parents from sending their children to school.

This study also found that the stakeholders in the Maoist stronghold of Jharkhand perceived the misappropriation of funds by violence and the misuse of school facilities in the Maoist conflict to be significant difficulties in the implementation of the SSA program in the state. The misuse of school facilities by community members was found to be a problem to varying degrees in all three states. Loss of direct income and indirect income through the loss of labor, in addition to the safety and purity of female students were found to be challenges to secondary school enrollment that the SSA program in
India was inadequate in addressing. The stakeholders across Jharkhand, Maharashtra and Karnataka largely attributed the increase in school enrollment since 2004 to the SSA in India. However, some interventions were perceived to be more effective than others in drawing children to school.
Chapter 5

Summary, Discussion, Conclusions and Future Research

This chapter presents a summary of the study that includes the research questions, research methodology and the key findings of the study. The summary is followed by a discussion involving how the findings of the study compare and contrast with the published literature on the effectiveness of the SSA in increasing enrollment in India. Finally, the chapter concludes with the implications of the study for policy, practice and future research on school enrollment.

Summary of the Study with Key Findings

In response to the global Education for All movement, India launched the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan in 2000. The Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan, which is translated as the Education for All Campaign, is a program for the achievement of universal school enrollment in India. It is an umbrella program that loosely connects a number of interventions such as the Midday Meal, the Stipend for Girls, School Sanitation and Hygiene Education, Madrassa Modernization, Civil Works, the Village Education Committee, the Residential Hostel for Girls and School Supplies. The interventions are implemented with the aim of increasing school enrollment among scheduled castes, scheduled tribes, Muslims and girl children.

The purpose of this study is to understand stakeholder perceptions of the SSA effectiveness in increasing school enrollment in India. The primary research question that guided this research is:
What are the stakeholders’ perceptions of the effectiveness of the SSA in increasing school enrollment in India?

This primary research question was explored through three specific secondary research questions:

1) To what extent did the various stakeholders attribute the increase in school enrollment since 2004 to the SSA?

2) What difficulties did stakeholders experience in implementing the SSA and how did they impact the implementation of the SSA?

3) What are the inadequacies of the SSA in addressing the challenges to secondary school enrollment, according to the stakeholders?

This study fills a gap in the literature by a) providing a conceptual framework for expanding our understanding of school enrollment to fit developing world contexts and b) providing an insider’s perspective of the effectiveness of the SSA program in increasing school enrollment.

Engestrom’s collective human activity system based on Cultural Historical Activity Theory is adapted to form the theoretical framework that guides this study. As the study sought to understand the perspectives of both the subject and the object, Cultural Historical Activity Theory was useful in bridging subject-object and individual-collective dualism by making activity the minimal unit of analysis. The collective activity under consideration is the implementation of strategies to achieve universal school enrollment in India. As put forth by Engeström—seven components: subject, object, community of practice, rules, division of labor, tools and signs and the outcome—comprise the activity system being considered for this study.
The subject is the group of actors who are the drivers of the SSA in India. The actors include the government of India; the state governments; international non-governmental organizations such as the World Bank, UNICEF and DFID, among others; and local non-governmental organizations. The object is the out-of-school children and their parents towards whom the policy initiative is directed. The tools used to achieve the goal of universal primary and secondary school enrollment in India are primarily policy interventions that serve as incentives to get the out-of-school children enrolled in school. The community of practice comprises government personnel, local non-governmental organizations, teachers and the village education committees comprised of parents. The rules are those that guide the implementation of interventions to achieve universal school enrollment, such as that a child cannot be denied access to public schools on the basis of personal background factors. The division of labor involves the distribution of responsibilities in implementing SSA interventions and is dependent on the community of practice.

Qualitative research methods were employed to understand stakeholder perceptions of the effectiveness of the SSA. Specifically, multiple case study methods (Creswell, 2007; Yin, 2008) with a phenomenological approach were used to conduct the study. With regard to the sample, the three states were selected using the maximum variation sampling technique, the three districts within each state were selected using the mixed purposeful sampling technique, district education officers were selected using the criterion sampling technique and the international NGO was selected using intensive purposeful sampling. The teachers and parents were selected using a combination of criterion and random sampling techniques. The total sample consisted of 3 UNICEF
education officers, 9 officers from the state education department, 6 representatives of local non-governmental organizations, 18 teachers and 135 parents.

The data collection methods included interviews with district education officers, teachers, UNICEF officers and local NGO representatives. The photovoice methodology, which is a participatory action research approach that employs a photographic technique in valuing the voice of disadvantaged populations, was used with parents. For data analysis, thematic analysis (Braun & Clark, 2006) techniques were employed to arrive at within-case findings. This was followed by cross-case theme analysis that was used to identify the similarities and differences among the three states. The thematic analysis of the transcripts of the semi-structured interviews and focus group discussions with the stakeholders revealed the following key findings:

1) All the stakeholders attribute the increase in primary school enrollment from 73.99 in 2003-04 to 98.59 in 2008-2009 and in secondary school enrollment from 43.14 in 2005-06 to 56.22 in 2008-09 almost entirely to the SSA. Some interventions such as the Midday Meal were perceived to be more effective than others in increasing school enrollment

2) The insufficiency of personnel, misappropriation of funds and misuse of school facilities caused difficulties in the implementation of the SSA interventions and were perceived to negatively impact the schooling experience for children.

3) The stakeholders perceive the SSA to be inadequate in addressing secondary school enrollment challenges of loss of income quality of
schooling and the safety of girls. The SSA did not compensate for the loss of income, did not provide good quality schooling comparable to that of private schools and did not enhance the safety or guarantee the purity of girl children when enrolled in school.

4) Poor quality of schooling in government schools was perceived to be a restraining factor preventing parents from enrolling children in schools at the secondary level.

**Discussion**

The findings of this study confirm many aspects of published literature on strategies to achieve universal school enrollment. However, the findings also contradict one particular aspect of the literature on school enrollment. According to Birdsall, Levine, and Ibrahim (2005):

Three strategies can help get out-of-school children into school: crafting specific interventions to reach out-of-school children, increasing educational opportunities (formal and nonformal) for girls and women, and increasing access to postprimary education…. Specific interventions have been shown, in some settings, to get hard-to-reach children into school. These include eliminating school fees, instituting conditional cash transfers, using school feeding programs as an incentive to attend school, and implementing school health programs to reduce absenteeism…. (p. 340)

The interventions considered for the study include the Midday Meal, the Stipend for Girls, School Sanitation and Hygiene Education, Madrassa Modernization, Civil Works, the Village Education Committee, the Residential Hostel for Girls and School Supplies. These interventions associated with the SSA in India align closely with the
strategies put forward by the United Nations as described above. The findings of the study validate the strategies suggested above by the United Nations to get out-of-school children into school. In analyzing data about the extent to which stakeholders attribute the increase in school enrollment to the SSA, three primary themes emerged. First, the stakeholders perceived that the increase in school enrollment in India could be attributed to the interventions associated with the SSA. Stakeholders perceived that all the interventions were useful in enabling the enrollment of children in school by mitigating certain life and schooling concerns for parents. Some interventions such as the Midday Meal were perceived as more effective than others (such as the School Supplies) in drawing children to school. The stakeholders expressed overall satisfaction with the program, though they perceived that some aspects of most of the interventions needed to be improvised. Thus, these perceptions of the stakeholders confirm the findings in published literature that “eliminating school fees, instituting conditional cash transfers, [and] using school feeding programs as an incentive to attend school” are useful strategies for increasing school enrollment (Birdsall et al., 2005).

With regard to contextual difficulties and how they impact program implementation in the realm of education, the lack of research on this aspect has been bemoaned by researchers. More studies of macro-level policies versus micro-level realities as well as investigations of the complexities of educational innovation and the importance of planning, the end products of implementation processes, and the levels at which implementation obstructed, terminated, or successfully completed, are needed (Adams & Chen, 1981; Ketudat, 1984). Empirical observations of the difficulties in implementing Education for All interventions from an insider’s perspective are not found.
In the case of the SSA in India, though a number of studies on the SSA program have been conducted, none of them have examined implementation issues in terms of the realities at the micro-level.

The findings of this study indicate that the primary difficulties in implementing the SSA program in the three states in India include the misappropriation of funds through systemic corruption and Maoist violence. The finding in this study that the role of systemic corruption is an impediment in the implementation of SSA program in India is an example of the empirical observation by Treisman (2000) that poor countries are generally rated as having more corruption than rich countries. The finding also substantiates current literature on the culture of corruption prevalent in modern India. Transparency International ranks India 87th out of 178 countries listed in its 2010 Corruption Perceptions Index. Former diplomat Pavan Varma explains the culture of corruption in India in his book *Being Indian*, by saying “Corruption, of course, is not unique to India. What is unique is the level of its acceptance, and the ‘creative’ ways in which it is sustained. Indians do not subscribe to antiseptic definitions of rectitude…Their understanding of right and wrong is related far more to efficacy than absolute notions of morality.”

The misappropriation of funds at various levels through the administrative setup for the SSA leads to poor quality school supplies and physical facilities. The second difficulty affecting implementation of the SSA program in India is the misuse of school facilities by local community members and in the Maoist conflict which further aggravates the poor physical facilities in school. A third difficulty impacting the implementation of the SSA program is the insufficiency of personnel which dilutes the
quality of instruction in school. This finding aligns with the research of Unit E of the Delta State University (2009) which investigated the challenges that affect implementation of the Universal Basic Education (UBE) in Delta State of Nigeria. Delta State University found poor funding, poor motivation of teachers, improper supervision and monitoring of the UBE program, inadequate labor to handle effectively subjects in schools, and inadequate teaching and learning facilities to be challenges affecting the implementation of the program.

The findings of the study also aligned with another investigation by Vaux, Smith, and Subba (2006) which reviewed the EFA program in Nepal. Some of the problems in the implementation of the EFA program were found to small budgets for the School Management Committee, insufficient teachers and poor academic performance of government school students in comparison to private school students. The investigation also found that the scholarships distributed to dalit students were not sufficient to compensate for the loss of labor and there was lack of transparency in decision-making. The insufficiency of teachers, poor academic performance of students from government schools and the insufficient compensation for the loss of labor were problems also perceived to be associated with the SSA program in India. Table 5-1 below compares the findings of this study in terms of implementation difficulties of the SSA program in India with the implementation difficulties of the Universal Basic Education program in Nigeria and the Education for All—Nepal program.
The third research question in this study is about the inadequacies of the SSA in addressing the challenges to secondary school enrollment. In examining the challenges to secondary school enrollment, there is a general consensus in the literature about factors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>World Regions</th>
<th>Implementation Difficulty</th>
<th>Implementation Difficulty</th>
<th>Implementation Difficulty</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>Poor funding</td>
<td>Inadequate teaching and learning facilities</td>
<td>Inadequate manpower to handle effectively subjects in schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>Small budget for School Management Committees</td>
<td>Poor academic performance of government school students in comparison to private school students</td>
<td>Insufficient teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>Misappropriation of funds by systemic corruption and Maoist violence</td>
<td>Misuse of school facilities by community members and in the Maoist conflict</td>
<td>Insufficiency of personnel</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
that hinder secondary school enrollment. These factors include the costs of schooling, distance and the loss of labor/income. For example, in Ghana, almost half of parents, when asked the reasons for their children not being in school, answered that “school is too expensive” or the “child needed to work at home” (The World Bank, 2004). Though the challenges to secondary school enrollment have been identified and recognized since the late 20\textsuperscript{th} century, the strategies devised in response do not directly address these challenges. The analysis of data for this study revealed that stakeholders perceived that the loss of labor and loss of income were unaddressed challenges to secondary school enrollment. Stakeholders in this study perceived that none of the interventions within SSA program in India substituted for the loss of labor or provided compensation for the loss of income, as a result making enrolling a child in school less likely.

A third finding in relation to this research question is the emergence of the quality of schooling as a challenge to secondary school enrollment. The Quality of schooling is found in educational literature to follow three primary lines of research. One line of research involves the examination of the impact of the quality of schooling on student outcomes such as test scores, repetition rates, and drop-out rates (Heyneman & Loxley, 1983; Barro & Lee, 1997; Harbison & Hanushek, 1992; Glewwe & Jacoby, 1994). Another line of research relates the quality of schooling and returns to education (Johnson & Stafford, 1973; Case & Yogo, 1999, Campbell, 2001; Betts, 1999). The third line of research examines the quality of schooling as a trade-off with access to schooling as both vie for the same funding allocation (Hanushek, 1995). In contrast to this body of literature, a finding of this study is that the quality of schooling acts as a deterrent to
school enrollment. This role of quality of schooling as restraining school enrollment has not been sufficiently explored in the literature on EFA programs around the world.

In terms of school enrollment of girls, the challenges to the enrollment of girls in school include minimal or no monetary return to schooling and higher opportunity cost in China (Song, Appleton & Knight, 2006); poverty, cultural constraints, and an inadequate supply of government school for girls in rural Pakistan (Lloyd, Mete & Grant, 2007); low returns to expenditure, tradition, safety, distance, lack of single sex schools, women teachers and sanitation facilities (Lone in Adamson, 1996). The SSA addresses the challenge of sanitation facilities through the School Sanitation and Hygiene Education intervention which involves the building of separate toilets for girls. The SSA also provides monetary incentives in the form of a stipend to encourage the enrollment of girls in school. However, the safety and purity of girls is not adequately addressed by the SSA in India. There is no mechanism within the SSA that ensures the safety and sexual purity of girls during the process of schooling. The finding of this study that the safety and purity of girls were perceived as challenges to school enrolment of girls confirms published literature on this topic. The findings of this study also reveal that this is an inadequately resolved, persisting challenge that is not addressed, though identified in research literature.

Conclusions

Conclusions that can be drawn about the primary research question for this
study—*What are the stakeholders’ perceptions of the effectiveness of the SSA in increasing school enrollment in India?*—are presented in this section. In making conclusions, I draw upon the findings from the thematic analysis of data that addressed the secondary research questions—a) To what extent do the various stakeholders attribute the increase in school enrollment since 2004 to the SSA? b) What difficulties did stakeholders experience, and how did they impact the effectiveness of the SSA? and c) What are the inadequacies of the SSA in addressing the challenges to secondary school enrollment, according to the stakeholders?

The interventions associated with the SSA in India that were considered for this study were the Midday Meal, the Stipend for Girls, School Sanitation and Hygiene Education, Madrassa Modernization, Civil Works, the Village Education Committee, the Residential Hostel for Girls and School Supplies.

Three major conclusions can be drawn from this study. First, the stakeholders perceived that the interventions were either individually indispensable or collectively contributed to the increase in school enrollment. Hence, it can be concluded that the increase in school enrollment in India since 2004 appears to be due to the interventions associated with the SSA program in India.

Second, the stakeholders perceived all of the interventions to be useful in mitigating some life or schooling concerns for parents. The stakeholders also perceived overall satisfaction with the interventions and desired that the interventions be continued. However, stakeholders were also dissatisfied with some aspects of the interventions and perceived that they needed changes. I conclude here that the SSA interventions in India do not function in the most efficient manner. The efficiency of the SSA in India can be
increased by making improvisations to the interventions in accordance with the implementation difficulties revealed by the various stakeholders.

Third, the SSA program in India was perceived to minimize some schooling and life concerns through interventions such as School Supplies and the Midday Meal. However, some other challenges to secondary school enrollment remained unaddressed. It was perceived that the loss of labor and income, the poor quality of schooling and the safety of girls were challenges to secondary school enrollment that the SSA program in India did not address. I conclude that the insufficiency of the SSA program in addressing these persisting challenges appears to be a contributing factor to low secondary school enrollment in India in spite of the implementation of various interventions to increase school enrollment.

**Recommendations**

This study has important implications for those involved in developing and implementing strategies to achieve universal school enrollment in India. This section presents recommendations for policymakers and future research.

**Recommendations for Policymakers**

This study found that the increase in school enrollment in India since 2004 can be attributed to the SSA program. The findings also revealed a number of implementation difficulties and inadequacies of the SSA in addressing the challenges to secondary school
enrollment. With regard to the implementation of the SSA program, three primary difficulties emerged.

First, the misappropriation of funds was found to be a major difficulty that impacted the effectiveness of the SSA program in India. The stakeholders perceived that the fund allocation for the SSA program interventions was insufficient, and the misappropriation of funds further minimized the availability of financial resources. SSA funds were found to be misappropriated through systemic corruption as well as violent means by Maoist militants. The misappropriation of funds through violent means by Maoist militants is a difficulty that will need to be addressed by the Indian Ministry of Home Affairs. The problem of misappropriation of funds by systemic corruption can be addressed by policymakers. The SSA requires the maintenance of records related to school expenditures for the SSA interventions. However, the monitoring mechanisms for the utilization of SSA funds are not well established. The strengthening of internal audits and monitoring mechanisms for every fund disbursement level from the central government down to the village education committee would help minimize the misappropriation of funds through systemic corruption.

Further, I would recommend an increase in the allocation of funds for the various interventions. For example, the village education committee is allotted a school maintenance grant of approximately Rs. 7500 or $150. This was perceived by the various stakeholders to be insufficient. Fund allocation was perceived to be insufficient for some of the other SSA interventions as well. Additionally, the stakeholders also perceived that the fund allocation for schools did not match the size of the school. In many instances, allocations were reported to be the same for schools with only primary section and
schools with primary as well as secondary sections. A common difficulty in this regard was the insufficiency of school uniform material for secondary school students. As the fund allocation was the same, secondary school students were provided the same quantity of material as primary school students. The uniform material provided is thus insufficient to match the measurements of secondary school students. The SSA would do well to examine and appropriately increase fund allocation for various interventions to match the size and requirements of individual schools. An increase in fund allocation is also recommended to provide better educational facilities and experiences that help government school students compete with private school students for higher education opportunities and jobs.

The misuse of school facilities by community members and in the Maoist conflict is another difficulty impacting the implementation of the SSA program. Community interventions such as the Total Sanitation Campaign, which involves the distribution of subsidies for the construction of sanitation facilities, have not been very successful due to the lack of water and lack of complete coverage. To resolve the problem of misuse of school facilities by community members, two recommendations are put forward. First, the relevant district authorities need to fast-track the resolution of boundary wall disputes to secure the school premises. Second, government authorities should promote access to water and sanitation by expanding sanitation and water facilities to the local community. Programs such as the Total Sanitation Campaign to promote sanitation among poor families have begun to be implemented but are yet to reach all villages. Removal of bottlenecks in the implementation of the Total Sanitation Campaign will help fast-track the campaign. This will eliminate the need of local communities to use school facilities.
To address misuse of school facilities in the Maoist conflict, the recommendations are to construct separate shelters for the Indian security forces in thickly forested rural areas that serve as Maoist strongholds. This will prevent the use of school facilities by security forces. It will also hence prevent Maoist militants from blowing up schools to target Indian security forces.

The third difficulty that impacts SSA program implementation is the insufficiency of personnel to implement SSA interventions. Due to a lack of administrative staff in government schools, teachers are assigned non-teaching responsibilities that cut into the instruction time thereby creating an atmosphere of poor schooling experiences for students. This difficulty can be resolved by the appointment of separate administrative staff in all government schools. The administrative staff appointed should be responsible for managing all SSA interventions. The staff members may undertake responsibilities such as the maintenance of records, procuring school supplies and materials, distributing supplies and stipends, overseeing construction activities and conducting child census surveys. Other non-SSA responsibilities such as election duties and census survey can also be assigned to the administrative staff.

To address inadequacies of the SSA, the following paragraphs discuss some recommendations. The first theme that emerged in relation to the inadequacies of the SSA is the loss of direct and indirect income. The recommendation here is that policymakers extend the distribution of stipends, which is currently restricted to girls, to all secondary school students with family incomes below a fixed limit. The stipend should be of an amount that matches the average income that a child may obtain from working outside the home.
Another major inadequacy of the SSA was perceived to be the poor quality of schooling in relation to the personnel providing educational experiences and the physical facilities in which the educational experiences took place. To address the problem of poor quality personnel, I recommend expanding teacher training programs that include new learning methodologies to every district. The lack of English speaking skills possessed by government school teachers was perceived to be an indicator of poor quality schooling for parents by the various stakeholders. This can be addressed by having teacher-training programs for English teachers that include English speaking classes in addition to pedagogy classes so that the teachers are able to teach English in English rather than the local language. Another recommendation is to provide additional monetary incentives for teachers working in low priority regions in order to attract qualified and trained teachers where they are required the most. The development of vocational training programs in secondary and higher secondary schools is another recommendation. This will help students to earn a more immediate income by learning the skills that their parents desire.

To address the challenge of safety for girls, I recommend that transportation be provided to girls who must travel more than a kilometer. This will minimize safety concerns for girls. To address the concerns over the purity and reputation of girls, it is recommended that mediums such as television and street plays are used to spread the message that schooling can help increase girls’ confidence in their abilities and help focus their attention on career possibilities rather than boys.

Finally, I recommend the institution of stronger sustenance and maintenance mechanisms within the SSA in India. It was perceived that once a particular school facility or supply was damaged, no steps were taken to repair or replace the damaged
material. For example, without access to water, school facilities were often found to be unclean and unused. The provision of water in school sanitation facilities would help sustain the use of sanitation facilities in school.

**Recommendations for Future Research**

The SSA in India was implemented in India in 2002 to achieve universal school enrollment. India has almost achieved universal primary school enrollment. However, a lot of progress still needs to be made to achieve universal secondary school enrollment. This section provides suggestions for further research on school enrollment that will help take school enrollment in India and the developing world forward.

An important contribution of this study to the literature on school enrollment is the development of a conceptual framework to understand the concept of school enrollment. This conceptual framework was developed to fit the context of the global movement to fast-track the achievement of universal school enrollment in developing countries by 2015. Further research is required to examine the extent to which this conceptual framework fits school enrollment in other world contexts such as that of the developed world. In countries of the developed world such as the United States of America, school and university enrollment is not a collaborative activity pushed by governments and international aid organizations. As India begins to consider pushing for increased enrollment at the university level, additional research examining the suitability of the ‘developed world’ conceptual models for university enrollment will be useful.
This study examined stakeholder perceptions of the SSA effectiveness in increasing school enrollment in India through qualitative research methods. Though this study comments on the effectiveness of the SSA, it cannot be used as conclusive evidence of program effectiveness. Conclusive evidence of program effectiveness is traditionally obtained through the use of quantitative methods. At the time this study was being designed usable enrollment indicators such as net enrollment ratios were available for only two academic cycles. At present net enrollment ratios and other enrollment indicators are available for four academic cycles and can be used for further research. Additional research examining program effectiveness through quantitative analysis of data will complement the qualitative findings of this study to provide a more comprehensive picture of the effectiveness of the SSA in increasing school enrollment in India.

Two non-supply based strategies, census visits by teachers to the homes of the local community and the appointment of temporary contract teachers from within the local community, were found to have been substantially useful in increasing school enrollment contrary to the expectations of this researcher. Non-supply based strategies were not considered for this study. It would be useful to conduct further research to find out the relative effectiveness of non-supply based strategies over the supply-based interventions considered in this study.

Eight interventions—the Midday Meal, the Stipend for Girls, School Sanitation and Hygiene Education, Madrassa Modernization, Civil Works, the Village Education Committee, the Residential Hostel for Girls and School Supplies—were considered for this study. During data collection it was observed that the stakeholders did not talk much
about the Madrassa Modernization intervention even though 45 Muslim parents participated in the study. It was found that Muslims were generally sending their children to regular government schools. Additional research studying the effectiveness of the Madrassa Modernization intervention in increasing school enrollment would be useful. Further research is also required to study in-depth the effectiveness of the other individual interventions in increasing school enrollment. This would help identify best practices that could be promoted to expedite the achievement of universal secondary school enrollment in India. This would also help policy makers and the governments decide which interventions need to continue.

A delimitation of the study was that due to the insufficient financial resources to collect data from a larger sample of states, the northeast region of India is not represented in this study. The northeast region of India consists of seven states that are separated from the rest of India by Bangladesh. Mainland access to this region is therefore relatively difficult. The culture of the northeast is different from the rest of India. Given these differences, it is important to research the implementation of the SSA and its effectiveness in increasing school enrollment in the northeast.

The thematic analysis of the data collected to examine the inadequacies of the SSA in India revealed that quality of schooling was perceived to be a challenge to secondary school enrollment. This is in contrast to existing educational literature that presents the quality of schooling as a factor impacting student outcomes and returns to education, and as a trade-off for increasing access to schooling. The emergence of the quality of schooling as a deterrent to school enrollment needs to be investigated further through the undertaking of research in different regional contexts of the world. This
would have important policy implications for the expansion of education beyond secondary school that India and other developing countries seek. It would help researchers, governments and aid agencies resolve the debate of quantity over quality in advancing schooling around the world.
References


Mehra, B. (2001). Research or personal quest: Dilemmas in studying my own kind. In B. M. Merchant & A. I . Willis (Eds.), Multiple and intersecting identities in qualitative research (pp. 69-82). Mahwah, NH: Lawrence Erlbaum


Appendix A

Interview Protocol

The interview protocol was adapted to suit the context of the stakeholder and what follows below are only some primary questions. Further questions were asked on the basis of the response

1) Approximately what proportion of the children in this locality were enrolled in schools prior to the SSA?

2) What kinds of facilities were available in schools prior to the SSA?

3) What are the interventions implemented since the SSA to increase school enrollment? Describe separately for Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes, Muslims, girl children and rural populations.

4) In what way has the schooling experience changed if at all in the locality since the SSA?

5) What has been the impact of the SSA interventions on primary school enrollment?

6) Are there any factors other than the SSA interventions that might have contributed to the increase in primary school enrollment? If yes, what are they?

7) Have all the SSA interventions been equally helpful for parents in enabling enrollment of their children? If no, Why?

8) Which of the SSA interventions do you think have been the most helpful for parents in enabling enrollment of their children? Why?

9) Which of the interventions do you think have been the least helpful for parents in
enabling enrollment of their children? Why?

10) If any of these interventions were not implemented, would it have impacted school enrollment? How?

11) If any of the interventions are stopped, would school enrollment be affected? How?

12) What are the factors preventing enrollment of children above age 9 in school?
    Enumerate separately for Scheduled Caste, Scheduled Tribe, Muslim, girl children and populations.

13) Is the SSA adequate to address the challenges to secondary school enrollment? Why?

14) What would you recommend to increase secondary school enrollment?

15) Describe the difficulties in implementing the SSA interventions?

16) What causes the difficulties in implementation of the interventions?

17) To what extent do these difficulties impact the effectiveness of the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan in increasing school enrollment?

18) What would you recommend to improve the implementation of the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan?
Appendix B

Photovoice Themes

• Positive aspects if any about the SSA interventions as enablers of school enrollment
• Negative aspects if any of the SSA interventions as enablers of school enrollment
• Possible areas of improvement in the SSA interventions
Appendix C

Informed Consent English Photovoice

IRB# Doc. #

Informed Consent Form for Social Science Research
The Pennsylvania State University

Title of Project: Stakeholders' Perception of Policy Effectiveness in Increasing School Enrollment in India

Principal Investigator: Mary Chandy Vayaliparampil, Graduate Student
303 Rackley Building,
University Park, PA 16802
(814) 865 1488; mcv120@psu.edu

Advisor: Dr. Ladislaus Semali
314 Keller Building
University Park, PA 16802
814- 865-2246, lms11@psu.edu

Other Investigator(s): None

1. Purpose of the Study: The purpose of this research is to conduct exploratory qualitative research to examine the effectiveness of policies in increasing school enrollment at the primary level in India. In order to meet this purpose, the study will a) identify the policies implemented to achieve the millennium development goal for education, b) investigate the difficulties in their implementation, and c) explore the stakeholders’ perception of their effectiveness. In particular, the policies targeting rural, Muslim, scheduled caste, scheduled tribe and girl populations will be considered.

2. Procedures to be followed: You will be asked to undergo 1) training in operating a digital camera, 2) click photographs related to a particular theme and 3) participate in a focus group discussion to interpret the photographs. The focus group discussion will be recorded using a digital voice recorder.

3. Discomforts and Risks: There are no risks in participating in this research beyond those experienced in everyday life. Some of the questions are personal and might cause discomfort.
4. **Benefits:** The benefits to you include long-term benefits as the study will help policy makers in better framing policies to enable school enrollment for disadvantaged populations at the secondary level. This will result in better opportunities for your children to attend secondary school.

   The benefits to society include, firstly, the filling of gaps in the literature by a) developing a conceptual framework specifically for school enrollment, b) identifying implementation issues in the context of developing countries such as India and in particular, the population subgroups under consideration as often policies fail due to contextual challenges and c) providing a stakeholders perception of policy effectiveness which is absent in the largely quantitative studies. Parental perceptions in particular are of vital importance as at the end of the day, it is parents who decide whether their child is to be enrolled in school. These fundamental groups of stakeholders have been ignored so far. Secondly, the study also carries significance for policy makers. The study will be of practical benefit for policy makers enabling better framing and more successful implementation of policies towards universal secondary education in India.

5. **Duration/Time:**
   The training will take 2 hours. Clicking of photographs will take an hour and the focus group discussion will take 3 hours.

6. **Statement of Confidentiality:** Your participation in this research is confidential. The data will be stored and secured on my thumb drive. Code numbers will be used to mask the identity of the participant. The names associated with each code will be stored in a separate password protected file. Other than the principal investigator nobody will have access to the participants' identity and have access to the data. In the event of a publication or presentation resulting from the research, no personally identifiable information will be shared. Penn State’s Office for Research Protections, the Social Science Institutional Review Board and the Office for Human Research Protections in the Department of Health and Human Services may review records related to this research study.

7. **Right to Ask Questions:** Please contact Dr. Ladislaus Semali at (814)865-2246 with questions or concerns about this study. You can also call this number if you feel this study has harmed you. Questions about your rights as a research participant may be directed to Penn State University’s Office for Research Protections at (814) 865-1775. The investigator can be reached at 9890249805 on a 24 hour basis.

10. **Voluntary Participation:** Your decision to be in this research is voluntary. You can stop at any time. You do not have to answer any questions you do not want to answer. Refusal to take part in or withdrawing from this study will involve no penalty or loss of benefits you would receive otherwise.

    You must be 18 years of age or older to consent to take part in this research study. If you agree to take part in this research study and the information outlined above, please
sign your name and indicate the date below.

You will be given a copy of this consent form for your records.
Appendix D

Informed Consent Hindi Photovoice

Page 1 of 5 - ORP OFFICE USE ONLY – DO NOT REMOVE OR MODIFY: This informed consent form (Doc. # 4) was reviewed and approved by the Social Science Institutional Review Board (IRB#08013) at The Pennsylvania State University on 06-17-2009. It will expire on 05-05-2010. (D. Maney)

अर्ज आर पी कार्यालय अनुशंस के लिए
परिवर्तन या संशोधन न करें

पेन्सीलवेनिया स्टेट विश्वविद्यालयी
अफिस और रिचार्ज प्रोटेक्शन
अनुरोध की लिखि:

सामान्य की लिखि:
सोशल साइंस इन्स्टीट्यूट्स बोर्ड
सामाजिक विज्ञान संगठन हेतु हेतु जानकार सहभागी पॉर्टित
पेन्सीलवेनिया स्टेट विश्वविद्यालयी

प्रोजेक्ट का शीर्षक / नाम: भारत में स्कूलों में नागरिक बृद्धि में नीतियों के प्रभाव से संबंधित

स्टेट्सकोर्टजे की दृष्टि

पुरुष अनुसरक: मरी चेएडी वायवीपोर्नी, ब्लाक क्लास
303 रैकले भवन
यूनिवर्सिटी पार्क, शी ए 16802

(614) 865 1488 : एमरिनाइ;20@पीएमएच.एडू
सलाहकार/परामर्शदाता: डॉ.लेकसलॉर संगाली
314 कोलार ब्लाक
यूनिवर्सिटी पार्क, शी ए 16802
दूसरे अन्यथा: कोई नहीं

1. अध्ययन का उद्देश्य: इस अध्ययन का उद्देश्य भारत में प्राथमिक विद्यालयों में नामांकन पर पड़ने वाले नीतिगत प्रभावों का खोजपूर्व एवं मुक्तार्थक शोध करना है। इसके अंतर्गत क. विश्लेषण के सहायक विषय के लिए नीतिगत नीतियों का पहचान करने, ख. नीतियों के विकास में हो रही कठिनाइयों का पता लगाने, और उन नीतियों के प्रभाव को लेकर स्टेज कांस्यों/दावेदारों की दृष्टि को जानने की कोशिश की जाएगी।

2. शोध प्रक्रिया: इसके लिए आपको क. विभिन्न कौशल कैसे संचालन कर सकते हैं, ख. विषय विषय के संबंध में प्रश्नावली, और ग.उन छात्र विषय विषय के व्याख्या कर पाएं से संबंधित कंद्रित समूह चर्चा में हिस्सा लेना होगा। साथ ही, उक्त कंद्रित समूह चर्चा के विवरण का भ्रम/ऑडियो रिकॉर्डिंग भी किया जाएगा।

3. अनुशंकाएं और खतरे: दैनिक जीवन के अनुमोदन से परे इस शोध अध्ययन में हिस्सा लेने में किसी प्रकार का खतरा नहीं है। हीलाँकी पूर्ण जानकारी कृपया नीतियों के निजी प्रकृतिके कारण कोई अनुशंका नहीं सकती है।

4. लाभ: यह शोध अध्ययन दूरसंचालित लाभ देने वाला होगा। इससे नीति निर्देशाओं को एकदम आवश्यक वाले बच्चों का स्वस्थ रखने का संचुक लाभ प्राप्त करता है। नीति निर्देशाओं की एक अध्ययन के दृष्टि के बाहर उससे अधिक लाभ निष्पादित किया जाना होगा।
नहीं हो पाती हैं, के संदर्भ में किया गया है वाले संदर्भों को लेकर स्टेंडहोल्डर की दृष्टि से समझ हो सकती है, जो आत्मार्पण पर व्यापक परिवार औद्योगिक अधियोग में चुप रहे जाते हैं।

विवादास्य में बच्चों के नामकरण को लेकर विशेष रूप से उनके बालक पिता की समझ ही महत्वपूर्ण होती है। इस संदर्भ में अत्याचार इस शौच, स्टेंडहोल्डर की अनदेखी ही होती है।

द्वितीय यह कि इससे मिलने वाली लाभ नीति निर्माण कार्यों के लिए भी महत्वपूर्ण होगा। इसकी मदद से वे सर्वव्यापी संबंधित शिक्षा के दिशा निर्देशिका और उसके सफल विकास के लिए उन्नत नीति निर्माण कर सकते हैं।

5. अधिक/समय : डिजिटल कैमरा संबंधित प्रशिक्षण की अवधि दो घंटे, छायांकन एक घंटे और कोन्सिल सम्मूच चार घंटे की होगी।

6. गोपनीयता : इस शौच में आपकी मार्गदर्शिता गोपनीय रखी जायेगी। विशेष रूप से शॉयर का सीएम और सुविधा रखे जायेंगे। प्रशंसक को दिए गए व्यक्ति नीति के अनुसार स्त्रियां और संबंधित आंकड़ों को दहन नहीं होगा। अपना फोटो स्त्रियां और प्रशंसक या अनुशासन में प्रतिभागी व्यक्ति से संबंधित निर्देश संस्थाओं को सार्थक नहीं किया जायेगा। लेकिन इस शौच अध्ययन से संबंधित दस्तावेजों के समीक्षा अन्य रूप से अंतर्दृष्टि पॉर्ट्रेटिंग, संबंधि स्त्रियां इन्स्टीट्यूशनल रिफ़्लेक्टर, बोर्ड और अंतर्दृष्टि फॉर्म हूमिन रिफ़्लेक्टर प्रोटेक्टर इन दो डिपार्टमेंट ऑफ हेल्थ एंड ह्यूमन सर्विस्टिज द्वारा की जा सकती है।

7. प्रश्न पूछने का अधिकार : इस अध्ययन से संबंधित प्रश्नों और जिस्तात्त्वों के लिए क्या की जाए देखिए संयंत्र समालोचना के (814) 865 2246 नं पर संपर्क करें।

यदि आपको ऐसा लगता है कि इस अध्ययन में शामिल होने से आपको किसी प्रकार की हानि हुई है तो इसी व्यक्ति पर संपर्क कर सकते हैं। शौच प्रतिभागी के रूप में आप अपने अधिकारों से संबंधित प्रश्न पॉर्ट्रेट स्त्रियां फील्ड ऑफिस
पॉर रिश्ता प्रोटेक्शन का नंबर (8114) 865 - 1775 पर पूछा सकते हैं। अन्यथा आपके प्रश्नों का उत्तर देने के लिए फोन नंबर 980249805 पर उपलब्ध होगी।

8. ऐच्छिक भागीदारी: इस शीर्ष अध्ययन में आपकी भागीदारी पूरी तरह ऐच्छिक है। आपको किसी भी समय स्वेच्छा से रूपांतर कर सकते हैं। आप कुछ गर्म जिन प्रश्नों का उत्तर देना नहीं चाहते, आप उत्तर देने से मना कर सकते हैं। शीर्ष में शामिल होने से मना करने पर या उससे अलग होने पर आप न सामान्य डंड के भागी होंगे और न ही आपको कठिन रूप से मिलेगा किसी लाभ से बाधित किया जाएगा।

इस शीर्ष अध्ययन में भाग लेने के लिए प्रतियोगियों की उम्र 18 वर्ष होना अनिवार्य है। यदि आप इस अध्ययन में भाग लेने के लिए और उपरोक्त सूचनाओं की समर्थन में तो वर्ण अंदाज में तिथि निम्नांकित रूप स्थान पर लिखें।

रिजर्व के लिए आमंत्रित्त इस प्रति दिन की एक प्रति उपलब्ध करा दी जा रही है।

तिथि

सहमति प्राप्त करनेवाले व्यक्ति का हस्ताक्षर

तिथि
Appendix E

Informed Consent English Interviews

IRB# Doc. #

Informed Consent Form for Social Science Research
The Pennsylvania State University

Title of Project: Stakeholders' Perception of Policy Effectiveness in Increasing School Enrollment in India

Principal Investigator: Mary Chandy Vayaliparampil, Graduate Student
303 Rackley Building,
University Park, PA 16802
(814) 865 1488; mcv120@psu.edu

Advisor: Dr. Ladislaus Semali
314 Keller Building
University Park, PA 16802
814- 865-2246, lms11@psu.edu

Other Investigator(s): None

1. Purpose of the Study: The purpose of this research is to conduct exploratory qualitative research to examine the effectiveness of policies in increasing school enrollment at the primary level in India. In order to meet this purpose, the study will a) identify the policies implemented to achieve the millennium development goal for education, b) investigate the difficulties in their implementation, and c) explore the stakeholders’ perception of their effectiveness. In particular, the policies targeting rural, Muslim, scheduled caste, scheduled tribe and girl populations will be considered.

2. Procedures to be followed: You will be asked to answer questions in an interview.

3. Discomforts and Risks: There are no risks in participating in this research beyond those experienced in everyday life. Some of the questions are personal and might cause discomfort.

4. Benefits: The benefits to you include long-term benefits as the study will help policy makers in better framing policies to enable school enrollment for disadvantaged populations at the secondary level. This will result in better opportunities for your children to attend secondary school. The benefits to society include, firstly, the filling of gaps in the literature by a) developing a conceptual framework specifically for school
enrollment, b) identifying implementation issues in the context of developing countries such as India and in particular, the population subgroups under consideration as often policies fail due to contextual challenges and c) providing a stakeholders perception of policy effectiveness which is absent in the largely quantitative studies. Parental perceptions in particular are of vital importance as at the end of the day, it is parents who decide whether their child is to be enrolled in school. These fundamental groups of stakeholders have been ignored so far. Secondly, the study also carries significance for policy makers. The study will be of practical benefit for policy makers enabling better framing and more successful implementation of policies towards universal secondary education in India.

5. **Duration/Time:**
The interview will take 2 hours. If needed a follow-up interview will take an additional 2 hours.

6. **Statement of Confidentiality:** Your participation in this research is confidential. The data will be stored and secured on my thumb drive. Code numbers will be used to mask the identity of the participant. The names associated with each code will be stored in a separate password protected file. Other than the principal investigator nobody will have access to the participants' identity and have access to the data. In the event of a publication or presentation resulting from the research, no personally identifiable information will be shared. Penn State’s Office for Research Protections, the Social Science Institutional Review Board and the Office for Human Research Protections in the Department of Health and Human Services may review records related to this research study. In the event of a publication or presentation resulting from the research, no personally identifiable information will be shared.

7. **Right to Ask Questions:** Please contact Dr. Ladislaus Semali at (814)865-2246 with questions or concerns about this study. You can also call this number if you feel this study has harmed you. Questions about your rights as a research participant may be directed to Penn State University’s Office for Research Protections at (814) 865-1775. The investigator can be reached at 9890249805 on a 24 hour basis.

10. **Voluntary Participation:** Your decision to be in this research is voluntary. You can stop at any time. You do not have to answer any questions you do not want to answer. Refusal to take part in or withdrawing from this study will involve no penalty or loss of benefits you would receive otherwise.

    You must be 18 years of age or older to consent to take part in this research study. If you agree to take part in this research study and the information outlined above, please sign your name and indicate the date below.

    You will be given a copy of this consent form for your records.
Appendix F

Informed Consent Hindi Interviews

ओ आर श्री कार्यालय प्रयोग के लिए
परिस्थित या संशोधन न करें

पेन्सिलवेनिया स्टेट यूनिवर्सिटी
ऑफिस फॉर रिसर्च प्रोटेक्शन

अनुमोदन की तिथि :
समाप्त की तिथि :

सोशल साइंस इंस्टीट्यूशनल रियूज़ बोर्ड
सामाजिक विज्ञान शोध हेतु जानकार सहमति पॉर्म

पेन्सिलवेनिया स्टेट यूनिवर्सिटी

प्रोजेक्ट का शीर्षक / नाम : भारत में स्कूलों में नामांकन वृद्धि में नीतियों के प्रभाव से संबंधित

स्टेटकोलेक्टर्स की दृष्टि

मुख्य अन्वेषक : मेरी चेंड्री याइयरपेस्पील, स्नातक छात्र

303 रैकेल्स म्यूनियर
यूनिवर्सिटी पार्क, पी. ए 16802

(314) 865 1488 ; एमसीआर@पीआरएसपी, पी ए 16802,

सलाहकार / प्रशासनिक दौड़ी : डॉ. लेडेट्सस्टोस सेमाटी

314 केंसर ग्वाना
यूनिवर्सिटी पार्क, पी. ए 16802
दूसरे अनेकाः कोई नहीं

1. अध्ययन का उद्देश्य : इस अध्ययन का उद्देश्य भारत में प्राथमिक विद्यालयों में नामांकन पर पहले नीतिगत प्रभावों का खोजपूर्व एवं गुणात्मक शोध करना है। इसके अन्तर्गत क. शिक्षा के सहायक विकास लक्ष्यों को निर्देश नीतियों की पहचान करने,
ख. नीतियों के कायमत्यन्त्र में हो रही कठिनाइयों का पता लगाने, और उन नीतियों के प्रभावों की लेखन स्टेट्सखोजॉर्ड/द्वारिकाओं की दृष्टि को जानने की
कोशिश की जायेगी।
खासकर ग्रामीण, मुसलमान, अनुस्वारित जाति, जनजाति एवं बालिका जनसंख्या पर पड़नेवाले नीतिगत प्रभावों का आकलन किया जायेगा।

2. श्रेणि प्रक्रिया : इसके लिए आपको साक्षात्कार में सवाल के उत्तर देना होगा।

3. अनुशंसा एवं प्रतिश रेतार : दैनिक जीवन के अनुमोदन से परे इस श्रेणि अध्ययन में
हिस्सा लेने में किसी प्रकार का खराब नहीं है। हालांकि पूरे जाननेवाले कुछ
प्रश्नों के निर्देश नीतियों के कारण धोखाधड़ी अनुशंसा हो सकती है।

4. श्रम : यह श्रेणि अध्ययन दूरसंचार लाम देने वाला होगा। इसके नीति
निम्नावालों को पिछले आयामों में बड़ा बनाने का सूचनाभारी कर स्थान में नामांकन को बढ़ाने के लिए
बढ़ावा देने हेतु बेहतर नीति निर्माण में मदद किया जायेगा।

बच्चों को इस स्तर पर अध्ययन का बेहतर अवसर मिल सकेगा।

जहाँतक समाज को निति-जने वाले लाम का प्रस्ताव नहीं, हो सर्वानुसार इस्तेमाल क.
विशेषकर स्कूलों में नामांकन से संबंधित अध्यायाएं सत्ता का विकास कर
संबंधित सहायता की कमियों को दूर किया जा सकेगा, ख., भारत स्वस्थ
विकास सड़कों के संचार में, विशेषकर विश्वासी जनसंख्या उप-भागों,
जिनसे संबंधित नीतियों जो संदर्भ चुनावियों के कारण अधिकांशतः कार्यरत
नहीं हो पाती हैं, के संदर्भ में किया जानेवालों वाले युवाओं की पहचान नहीं
सकेगी, ख. नीतिगत भावनों को लेकर स्टेट्सखोजॉर्ड की दृष्टि/समाज की पहचान
हो सकेगी, जो आंतरिक पर व्यापक परिस्थिताएं अध्ययनों में लुप्त पाये जाते
हैं।

(814) 865 2246 ; एलएमएस११@पीएमएस६, पूर्व
विद्यालयों में बच्चों के नामांकन को लेकर विशेषक्रम से उनके माता-पिता की समस्या ही महत्वपूर्ण होती है। इस चांदगं में अभाव इस मूल सेटेकल्यर समूह की अपेक्षी ही होती है।

दूसरी तरीक़े यह कि इससे मिलेगा लाभ नीति निर्माण के लिए भी महत्वपूर्ण होगा। इसके गठन से वे तर्कशाही संख्यात्मक शिक्षा के दिशा निर्देशार्थ और उसके समक्ष एक्साम्यन के लिए उन्नत नीति निर्माण कर सकते हैं।

5. अन्य/समय: साक्षात्कार की अवधि दो घंटे और फासले—अप साक्षात्कार अगर जरूरत पड़े दो घंटे की होगी।

6. गोपनीयता: इस शीर्ष में आपकी भागीदारी गोपनीय रही जायेगी। आयंटी देंगे अधिकांशतः संचित और सुरक्षित रखे जायेंगे। प्रत्येक गोपनीयता है वार्ता ने पासपोर्ट संग्रहीत फाइल में रखा जायेगा। मुक्त अन्वेषक के अनुमतित किसी अन्य व्यक्ति को प्रतिवेदितियों के नाम और संबंधित ऑफिस तक पहुँच नहीं होगी। वार्ता अनुमति किसी भी प्रकार के प्रलोक पर प्रश्न पर प्रतिवेदिति ही व्यक्ति के संबंध ध्वनि गृहितों को सार्वजनिक नहीं किया जायेगा। लेकिन इस शीर्ष अप्रवाह से संबंधित तस्वीरों की संगीत पैन सेटेकल्यर निर्देश की रिश्ता प्रतिवेदिति, हूसल साइंस इस्तेरियालवेट रिसर्च बॉर्ड और अथिक पर हूसल रिसर्च प्रतिवेदिति इन दो बिगिनाटें ऑफ हेउस्ल रिमोट सेवा द्वारा की जा सकती है।

7. प्रृण तृप्ति का अधिकार: इस अप्रवाह से संबंधित प्रस्तरों और विज्ञापनों के लिए कृपया ऑफिसलाइस्ट से माइल को (814) 865 2246 बॉन पर संपर्क करें। यदि आपको ऐसा लगता हो कि इस अप्रवाह में शामिल होने से आपको किसी प्रकार की हानि हुई है तो इसी नंबर पर संपर्क कर सकते हैं। शीर्ष प्रतिवेदिति के रूप में आप अपने अधिकारों से संबंधित प्रस्तर पैन सेटेकल्यर रिसर्च प्रौद्योगिकीकरण के नंबर (814) 865 - 1775 पर पूछ सकते हैं। अन्वेषक आपके प्रश्नों का उत्तर देने के लिए फोन नंबर 980249805 पर उपलब्ध होगी।
8. ऐंधिक भागीदारी : इस शोध अध्ययन में आपकी भागीदारी पूरी तरह ऐंधिक है। आपके किसी भी समय स्वेच्छा से स्वयं को इस अध्ययन से अलग कर सकते हैं। अपने पूरे जिन प्रश्नों का उत्तर देना नहीं चाहते, अपने उत्तर देने से मना कर सकते हैं। शोध में शामिल होने से मना करने पर या उससे अलग होने पर आप न तो किसी दंड के भागी होंगे और न ही आपको काफी स्वत: से मिलने-लायक किसी लामे से बंधन किया जाऊँगा।

इस शोध अध्ययन में भाग लेने के लिए प्रतिभागियों की उम्र 18 वर्ष होना अनिवार्य है। यदि आप इस अध्ययन में भाग लेने के लिए और उपयोग सुविधाओं की रुपरेखा से सहमत हैं तो कृपया अपना नाम और तिथि के साथ रिकॉर्ड खाता स्थान पर लिख दें। रिकॉर्ड के लिए आपको इस सहमति के एक प्रति उपलब्ध कर दी जायेगी।

प्रतिभागी हस्ताक्षर

सहमति प्राप्त करनेवाले व्यक्ति का हस्ताक्षर

[Signature]

[Signature]
Appendix G

Letter of Permission from State Governments

Date:

Mary C. Vayaliparampil, Doctoral Candidate
Educational Theory and Policy – Comparative and International Education
300 Rackley
Penn State University
University Park, PA 16802

Dear Mary C. Vayaliparampil:

This letter is to confirm that your research ‘Stakeholders’ Perception of Policy Effectiveness in Increasing Primary School Enrollment in India’ may be conducted at the following site(s) within the state of _____________:

I am aware of your research procedures and plans for reporting results. I agree to provide access to our teachers, District Education Officers, and parents. If you have any questions or I may provide additional information, please feel free to let me know.

Sincerely,

( )
TITLE
ORGANIZATION
ADDRESS
CITY, STATE ZIP
TELEPHONE
EMAIL
FAX
Appendix H

Recruitment Script English Photovoice

Recruitment for the study was done in person. The script below served as the framework during the in-person meeting.

Hello!

I am a graduate student under Professor Ladislaus Semali in the College of Education at Pennsylvania State University. I am conducting a research study to examine the effectiveness of policies in increasing school enrollment at the primary level in India. In order to meet this purpose, the study will a) identify the policies implemented to achieve the millennium development goal for education, b) investigate the difficulties in their implementation, and c) explore the stakeholders' perception of their effectiveness. In particular, the policies targeting rural, Muslim, scheduled caste, scheduled tribe and girl populations will be considered.

I am recruiting individuals who will take a few pictures and participate in a focus group discussion. The training will take approximately 2 hours. The clicking of photographs will take approximately an hour and the focus group discussion will take approximately 3 hours.

Your participation in this study is voluntary. If you have any questions concerning the research study, please call me at (832)246-2482.
Appendix I

Recruitment Script Hindi Photovoice

भर्ती पत्र फोटोवॉयस

मैं पेंसीलवेनिया स्टेट यूनिवर्सिटी से संबद्ध कॉलेज ऑफ एडुकेशन में प्रोफेसर लॉडिसलों सेमाली की छात्रा हूँ। मैं भारत में प्राथमिक स्तर पर स्कूल में नामांकन में वृद्धि पर होने वाले नीतिगत प्रभावों का शोध पर काम कर रही हूँ। इसके लिए, इस अध्ययन के अंतर्गत क. शिक्षा से संबंधित सहायताओं विकासात्मक लक्ष्यों को निर्देश नीतियों की पहचान, अ. उन नीतियों के किरायावधि में होने वाली कठिनाइयों, और ग. उन नीतियों के प्रभावों को लेकर स्टेट्सों की तृप्ति की खोज की जाएगी।

विशेषकर, उन नीतियों जो ग्रामीण, मुसलमान, अनुप्रस्तुत जाति, जनजाति और बालिका जनसंख्या से संबंधित हैं पर विचार किया जाएगा।

इसके लिए मैं कुछ लोगों की भर्ती करूँगी जो इससे संबंधित कुछ तस्वीरें लेंगे और फोकस समूह चर्चा में सहभागी होंगे। तस्वीरें लेने में लगने आए धंडे का समय लगेगा और फोकस समूह पदक्षेप लगभग 3 घंटे की होगी।

इस अध्ययन में आपकी मान्यतार्थ सहभागिता एकैहक है। इस शोध अध्ययन से संबंधित यदि आपके मन में कोई प्रश्न हो, तो आप मुझे, मेरे चांद्र्को को कूपड़ा (832)246–2482 संपर्क करें।
Recruitment Script English Interviews

Recruitment for the study was done in person. The script below served as the framework during the in-person meeting.

Hello!
I am a graduate student under Professor Ladislaus Semali in the College of Education at Pennsylvania State University. I am conducting a research study to examine the effectiveness of policies in increasing school enrollment at the primary level in India. In order to meet this purpose, the study will a) identify the policies implemented to achieve the millennium development goal for education, b) investigate the difficulties in their implementation, and c) explore the stakeholders' perception of their effectiveness. In particular, the policies targeting rural, Muslim, scheduled caste, scheduled tribe and girl populations will be considered.

I am recruiting individuals to interview which will take approximately 2 hours. If needed I will come back for a follow-up interview.

Your participation in this study is voluntary. If you have any questions concerning the research study, please call me, Mary Chandy at (832)246-2482.
भर्ती पत्र साक्षात्कार

मैं पेन्सीलवेनिया स्टेट युनिवर्सिटी से सबद्ध कॉलेज ऑफ एडुकेशन में प्रोफेसर लीडिंगलॉव से समालोचकीय प्रभाव छात्रा हूं। मैं भारत में प्राथमिक स्तर पर स्कूलों में नामांकन चुनने की प्रौढ़ कार्यों का साधन परक अध्ययन कर रही हूं। इसके लिए, इस अध्ययन के अंतर्गत के शिक्षा से संबंधित सहायक विज्ञानकल्पना कार्यों को निविद्ध नीतियों की पहचान, ख. उन नीतियों के चित्रायन में होने वाली कविताओं, और ग. उन नीतियों के प्रभावों को लेकर प्रदेशी स्टेजीसेल्यों की पृथ्वी की खोज की जाएगी। विशेष रूप से, उन नीतियों जो ग्रामीण, मुसलमान, अनुपूर्वित जाति, जनजाति और बालिका जनसंख्या से संबंधित हैं पर विचार किया जाएगा।

इसके लिए मैं कुछ लोगों की भर्ती करनी जो साक्षात्कार में सवाल के उत्तर देगा। साक्षात्कार की अवधि में घंटे और फालो-अप साक्षात्कार अगर जरूरत पड़े दो घंटे की होगी।

इस अध्ययन में आपकी भागीदारी ऐतिहासिक है। इस शोध अध्ययन से संबंधित यदि आपके मन में कोई प्रश्न हो, तो आप मुझे, मेरी चापड़ी को कूप्या (832)246-2482 संपर्क करें।
Date:

Name, Designation
Office for Research Protections
Room 201 Kern Building
Penn State University
University Park, PA 16802
United States of America

Dear ________________,

This letter is to verify that the Hindi version of the informed consent forms (photovoice and interview), the recruitment script (photovoice and interview) and the interview questions and photovoice themes provided by Mary Vayaliparampil towards her research ‘Stakeholders’ Perception of Policy Effectiveness in Increasing Primary School Enrollment in India’ is an accurate translation of the original English version of all the above mentioned documents.

Sincerely,
Name:
Designation:
Address:
Phone:
Email:
VITA

Mary Chandy Vayaliparampil

EDUCATION:
Ph.D. Candidate, Pennsylvania State University, USA 2007-present
Educational Theory and Policy – Comparative and International Education

University of Oregon, Oregon 2005-2007
Completed coursework in Educational Leadership

M.Ed., Goa University, India 1994-1996

B.Sc. in Physics, Goa University, Goa, India 1990-1993

SELECTED PROFESSIONAL EXPERIENCE:
Research Assistant, Pennsylvania State University 2008-2011

Community and Public Schools Program Coordinator, University of Oregon 2006-2007

Research Assistant, University of Oregon 2005-2006


Math and Science Teacher, Jesus & Mary Sarvajanik High School, Goa-India 1996-1997

SELECTED AWARDS:
Pennsylvania State University Dissertation Research Initiation Grant 2010-2011

Comparative & International Education Society New Scholar Fellowship 2009-2010

Pennsylvania State University Comparative and International Education Summer Research Grant 2009-2010

University of Oregon General Development Scholarship 2006-2007

SELECTED CONFERENCE PAPERS/PUBLICATIONS IN PROGRESS:
Vayaliparampil, M. C., (June, 2007). Rethinking the Understanding of Development. Presented at the Hawaii International Conference on Social Sciences: Honolulu, Hawaii, USA.