

The Pennsylvania State University

The Graduate School

Department of Political Science

**THE INTERACTION OF FRAMES, CULTURE AND RESOURCES IN THE
UKRAINIAN WOMEN'S MOVEMENT: AN ANALYSIS OF KYIV, KHARKIV
AND L'VIV**

A Thesis in

Political Science

by

Nicole Edgar Morford

© 2007 Nicole Edgar Morford

Submitted in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements
for the Degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

December 2007

The thesis of Nicole Edgar Morford was reviewed and approved* by the following:

Lee Ann Banaszak
Associate Professor of Political Science and Women's Studies
Thesis Advisor
Chair of Committee

Michael Bernhard
Associate Professor of Political Science

Gretchen Casper
Associate Professor of Political Science

Catherine Wanner
Associate Professor of History and Religious Studies

Donna Bahry
Professor of Political Science
Head of the Department of Political Science

*Signatures are on file in the Graduate School

ABSTRACT

This dissertation examines the emerging Ukrainian women's movement in 2002 and 2003 in three regionally distinct Ukrainian cities; Kyiv, Kharkiv, and L'viv. Using social movement theory this study focuses on the dominant frames being used by Ukrainian women activists as they voice their concerns and solutions to local Ukrainian women, foreign donors and the broader public while seeking to acquire material resources from foreign and domestic sources. This research helps to answer the following questions. To what extent is the success of women's groups and groups generally constrained by culture? Can groups that represent women outside of the dominant cultural perspective succeed in bringing about their desired social changes? To what extent do the three different local cultural contexts act as resources and constraints for social movement actors in their framing activities and attempts to bring about change? What are the influences of large amounts of international funding and severely limited domestic resources on a women's movement in a post-Soviet context? The effects of local culture and context, resources, both domestic and international, and elite allies are examined for their influence on the construction of frames used by Ukrainian women activists. In addition, the influences of frames, local cultural contexts, domestic and foreign material resources, and elite allies on social movement outcomes are examined.

In-depth interviews with women's activists from representative samples of women's non-governmental organizations in Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv, observation of movement activities and movement produced literature are the data used in this research.

The findings depict a Ukrainian women's movement using frames which both resonate with local contexts and also critique them as activists struggle to reach local Ukrainian women while simultaneously negotiating changing foreign donor priorities. Local cultures and contexts along with foreign funding influenced the construction of frames and progress toward desired outcomes. Domestic material resources had no observable impact on frame construction and often the opposite than expected relationship to outcomes. The ability of women's activists to make progress toward their desired goals within their cities was varied as each local cultural context presented different opportunities and constraints.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES	ix
LIST OF FIGURES	xi
ABBREVIATIONS	xii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	xiii
Chapter 1 Theory	1
Introduction.....	1
The Framing Perspective	8
Resonance and Cultural Context	10
Resources	20
Political Opportunities	24
Outline for the study	26
Chapter 2 Data and Methodology	28
Introduction.....	28
Design: Why Ukraine and why Kyiv, Kharkiv and L’viv?	29
Methods and Data	32
The Sample	33
The Interviews	39
Observation and Printed Materials	46
Measurement.....	48
Frames.....	48
International Funding.....	49
Domestic Resources.....	50
Outcomes	52
Summary.....	55
Chapter 3 Cultural and local context	57
Introduction.....	57
Ukraine’s historical regional diversity.....	58
Kharkiv (eastern Ukraine)	65
Russian Orientation	65
Loss of status: educational, scientific, and industrial collapse	69
L’viv	73
Nationalism.....	74
Religion and conservative social climate	79
Western Orientation.....	84

Kyiv	85
Mixed Historical Roots.....	86
Support for Independence.....	87
Mixed Ukrainian and Russian orientation	88
Economic context and capital city.....	90
Relevance.....	92
 Chapter 4 Nationalism Framing.....	 94
Similarities in Nationalism: A Ukrainian Ukraine	98
Language.....	98
Revive spirituality, history, and cultural traditions	101
Spirituality	102
History and cultural traditions	104
Kyiv	104
Kharkiv	108
L'viv	109
Disillusionment.....	113
Summary.....	115
Differences.....	116
Sovereign State	117
Women and Nationalism	119
Critique of Nationalism	126
Outcomes and Nationalism.....	129
Conclusions.....	134
 Chapter 5 Gender Discrimination Framing.....	 137
Use of gender and discrimination.....	140
Types of Gender Discrimination	148
Institutional Gender Discrimination	149
Ukrainian Cultural Gender Discrimination	153
Universal Cultural Gender Discrimination	157
Summary of types of discrimination.....	159
Goals and Activities to Address Gender Discrimination.....	160
Assistance to particular groups of Ukrainian women.....	162
Improving the status of all Ukrainian women	164
Summary of goals and activities to address gender discrimination.....	167
Gender Studies Centers.....	169
Kyiv	170
Kharkiv	171
L'viv	172
Summary of gender studies centers	173
Outcomes and Gender Discrimination.....	174
Conclusions.....	179

Chapter 6 Economic Crisis Framing.....	183
Women as Mothers	186
Lack of social services available to mothers and children	187
Care for children	190
Women as workers	193
Kyiv women as workers	193
Kharkiv and L'viv women as workers.....	195
Assistance to women and children	198
Self-help.....	198
Charitable aid.....	201
Outcomes and the economic crisis frame	206
Conclusions.....	210
Chapter 7 International Funding and the Ukrainian Women's Movement.....	215
Introduction.....	215
Primary International Donors	216
Who are they?	216
Funding Priorities	217
Criticism by Western Scholars	219
Ukrainian Activists' Assessments of foreign funding	222
Positive Assessments	222
Negative Assessments	227
Splinters movement	227
Exist just for grant	230
International funding and framing	233
Does it influence the issues adopted by women's activists? Yes	234
How does foreign funding influence framing?	235
Incomplete framing.....	236
Frame transformation, abandonment, and extension.....	240
Transformation	240
Abandonment.....	241
Extension	242
Frame bridging.....	245
Outcomes and international funding.....	249
Conclusions.....	252
Chapter 8 Domestic Resources and Elite Allies	258
Introduction.....	258
Material resources.....	260
Office Space.....	260
Donations from local businesses or individuals	261
Local Government Assistance	263
National government assistance	264

Obstacles to acquiring more domestic resources.....	266
Variations in local opportunities.....	267
Kharkiv	268
L'viv	274
Kyiv	277
Local business assistance.....	281
National level opportunities.....	283
Kyiv	283
Kharkiv and L'viv.....	286
Political Parties	287
Outcomes and domestic resources.....	292
Conclusions.....	300
Determining the Causal Process between Frames, Resources and Outcomes.....	303
Chapter 9 Conclusions	307
Introduction.....	307
Implications	314
Suggestions for future research	321
Bibliography	324
Appendix A Interview Protocol.....	341
Activists interview protocol.....	341
Elite Allies Interview	344
Appendix B Women's NGOs and Founding Dates	347

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1-1: Summary of Theoretical Expectations.....	7
Table 3-1: Summary of Cultural and Local Context in each City.....	64
Table 3-2: Percent of Population with Complete Higher Education.....	69
Table 3-3: Wage Arrears by Region, 1997-2003.....	72
Table 3-4: Average Monthly Wages by Region (1996-2003).....	72
Table 4-1: Summary of Similarities and Differences across cities in the Construction of the Nationalism Frame.....	95
Table 4-2: Comparison of Past Rates of Organizational Maintenance for NGOs using the Nationalism Frame compared to those not using it by city and across all cities.....	130
Table 4-3: Comparison of Current Rates of Organizational Maintenance for NGOs using the Nationalism Frame compared to those not using it by city and across all cities.....	131
Table 5-1: Number of NGOs using Gender and Discrimination in their Frame.....	141
Table 5-2: Summary of Similarities and Differences across cities in the construction of the Gender Discrimination Frame.....	147
Table 5-3: Types of Gender Discrimination by City.....	149
Table 5-4: Assistance to Particular Groups or All Ukrainian Women.....	161
Table 5-5: Comparison of past rates of Organizational Maintenance for NGOs using the Gender Discrimination Frame compared to those not using it by city and across all cities.....	177
Table 5-6: Comparison of current rates of Organizational Maintenance for NGOs using the Gender Discrimination Frame compared to those not using it by city and across all cities.....	177
Table 6-1: Summary of Similarities and Differences across cities in the Construction of the Economic Crisis Frame.....	185
Table 6-2: Comparison of Past Rates of Organizational Maintenance for NGOs using the Economic Crisis Frame compared to those not using it by city and across all cities.....	206
Table 6-3: Comparison of current rates of Organizational Maintenance for NGOs using the Gender Discrimination Frame compared to those not using it by city and across all cities.....	207
Table 6-4: Outcomes by types of Activities.....	209
Table 7-1: Summary of the Similarities and Differences across cities in the influence of international funding on the construction of frames.....	221
Table 7-2: Number of NGOs by city working in international donor issue areas.....	234
Table 7-3: Proportion of NGOs by city that received or tried to receive international funding for their activities in donor priority areas.....	234
Table 7-4: Comparison of past rates of organizational maintenance for NGOs with international funding to those without by city and across all cities.....	249
Table 7-5: Comparison of current rates of organizational maintenance for NGOs with international funding to those without it by city and across all cities.....	249
Table 8-1: Summary of similarities and differences across cities in the influence of domestic resources on the construction of frames and opportunities for resources.....	259

Table 8-2: Comparison of past rates of organizational maintenance for NGOs with office space to those without it by city and across all cities.....293

Table 8-3: Comparison of current rates organizational maintenance for NGOs with office space to those without it by city and across all cities.....294

Table 8-4: Comparison of past rates of organizational maintenance for NGOs with local government assistance to those without it by city and across all cities.....295

Table 8-5: Comparison of current rates of organizational maintenance for NGOs with local government assistance to those without it by city and across all cities.....295

Table 8-6: Comparison of past rates of organizational maintenance for NGOs with national government assistance to those without it by city and across all cities.....296

Table 8-7: Comparison of current rates of organizational maintenance for NGOs with national government assistance to those without it by city and across all cities.....296

Table 8-8: Comparison of past rates of organizational maintenance for NGOs with local business donations to those without it by city and across all cities.....297

Table 8-9: Comparison of current rates of organizational maintenance for NGOs with local business donations to those without it by city and across all cities.....297

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 3-1: Breakdown of Ukraine's Presidential Vote, 2004.....	77
Figure 9-1: Breakdown of September 2007 electoral results by region.....	317

ABBREVIATIONS

CKSP	Cincinnati Kharkiv Sister City Project
EU	European Union
IRB	Institutional Review Board
IRES	International Research and Exchange Board
IRF	International Renaissance Foundation
NGO	Non-governmental Organizations
NIS	Newly Independent States
Rukh	Popular Movement for Ukrainian Restructuring
SIDA	Swedish Agency for International Development
TACIS	Technical Aid to the Commonwealth of Independent States
UNDP	United Nations Gender in Development Program
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
UWWFCU	Union of Women Workers for the Future of Children in Ukraine

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I gratefully acknowledge the sources that funded my dissertation research. The bulk of the research was conducted under a Fulbright dissertation grant in 2002-2003. Additional funding came from the Research and Graduate Studies Office at the Pennsylvania State University, the Waskob Family Fund, and a Foreign Language Area Studies grant for language study in L'viv, Ukraine.

First, I would like to thank the women's leaders in Ukraine who generously gave their time and shared their knowledge with me. Without their willingness to share their insights and experiences this research would not have been possible. I consider it a privilege to have worked under Lee Ann Banaszak who advised this dissertation. Her constant advice and encouragement throughout pushed me to produce a better dissertation. Thank you for continuing to read drafts and provide insight despite numerous interruptions.

I would never have been able to complete writing my dissertation without the love and support of my family. My parents gave generously of their time and drove many miles to joyfully help care for my children. Thanks, especially, to my mom for her weekly visits that included many hours of driving and to my dad who read drafts and listened to my ramblings. They encouraged me in more ways than they know. My boys, Brayden and Kellen, motivated me to finish and give me much joy. Finally, no one is happier to see me finish than my husband. He lovingly supported and helped me in more ways than I can count and more ways than he wants to remember. He endured this

project with me and made many sacrifices so I could have time to write. Thank you.

Think of all the things we can do now that this is done.

Chapter 1

Theory

Introduction

Ukrainian women and children have become a commodity to be bought and sold (United Nations Development Program 2003, 54). Four hundred thousand Ukrainian women were trafficked for the purposes of sexual exploitation from 1989 through 1998, according to an estimate from Ukraine's Ministry of the Interior. The International Migration Association estimated that 500,000 Ukrainian women were trafficked to the West from 1991 through 1998 (Hughes and Denisova 2001, 43-44).

Ukrainian women are frequently eager for chances to go abroad as a result of the widespread unemployment, poverty, gender discrimination, political disenfranchisement, and the generally dismal prospects available to them following the collapse of the Soviet Union. Many Ukrainian women have no legitimate job opportunities in Ukraine where the social and economic context often excludes women from the formal, regulated economy. Consequently, thousands of Ukrainian women search for low-skilled labor abroad, such as waiting tables, au pairing, or dancing, but instead unwillingly become part of the sex industry (Hughes and Denisova 2001, 45; United Nations Development Program 2003, 54). Traffickers choose countries where they can easily recruit women. They lure women with false promises of a better life, but instead subject women to

bonded labor and forced prostitution, while threatening to hurt their families or deprive them of earnings if they do not cooperate (United Nations Development Program 2003, 54-55). International attention has been drawn to the issue with little success in stopping or slowing it.

Where is the voice of Ukrainian women speaking out against their global exploitation and the conditions that make them easy prey for traffickers? A women's movement is developing in Ukraine, and women's activists are addressing the trafficking of women and children among other issues they consider relevant to Ukrainian women. However, it is still a nascent movement, and meeting with limited success.

During the Soviet era women were encouraged to work and join the Communist party, however, discriminatory maternalist attitudes kept them out of positions of authority in work places and in politics. Soviet women's political interests were articulated by males in maternalist rhetoric, and women were unable to develop their own communication networks that would have allowed them to advance their own interests (Gal and Kligman 2000).

Glasnost and *perestroika* created openings that allowed limited discussion of issues specific to women, for instance, the lack of contraceptives and conditions in abortion clinics. Limited women's studies also developed within academia, although this was met with strong resistance (Buckley 1992). Gorbachev also created the Soviet Women's Councils, which never generated significant support from women (Chomiak 1994, 20-21; Pavlychko 1992a, 90). A few independent women's groups organized in Ukraine in the late 1980s. For example, the Organization of Soldiers' Mothers of Ukraine, which was able to gain concessions from the state (Hrycak 2006, 75).

Beginning in 1990, we start to see more Ukrainian women organizing independently (Pavlychko 1992a, 91). Rallies were held for Ukrainian independence, and women began to participate in the ecological, educational, and cultural movements for the revival of Ukrainian language and culture, primarily in western Ukraine and later in Kyiv. In 1990, women active within Rukh (Popular Movement for Ukrainian Restructuring), formed Zhinocha Hromada (Women's Community) in Kyiv, focusing on ecology problems that resulted from the Chernobyl reactor disaster (Chomiak 2000; Hrycak 2000 and 2005, 71; Pavlychko 1992a, 93-94). Ukrainian women participated within movements for Ukrainian independence, but they also organized their own independent groups. These groups were generally opposed to the official Soviet Women's Councils, which were actually shut down in a few western Ukrainian regions. Soyuz Ukrainok (Ukrainian National Women's League) was the first independent women's organization formed in 1990 (Pavlychko 1992a, 84-90). Its members, who were most active in western Ukraine, supported Ukrainian independence along with the revival of Ukrainian culture and language. At this point, little was heard from women in the eastern regions of Ukraine which was less enamored with the idea of Ukrainian independence.

The promising women's movement that emerged in the early 1990s shortly after independence organized around an activist mother discourse of empowered motherhood and the myth of the Ukrainian Berehynia (hearth mother). They initially addressed nation building and childcare, issues which resonated with women by critiquing the state socialist gender project (Hrycak 2002; Pavlychko 1997, 221; Rubchak 1996; Zhurzhenko 2001, 1). Soon a broad range of women's non-governmental organizations

(NGOs) emerged throughout Ukraine. Professional women's organizations such as the Organization of Women Cinematographers and librarians associations developed to offer resources to their members. Some women's rights and "feminist" groups also began forming. For example, gender studies centers in Kyiv, Lviv, Odessa and Kharkiv are working to increase women's political participation, publicize the problems of violence against women, and raise awareness of sexual harassment. Business women's groups also exist to help women adapt to the market economy. Many of these groups are heavily supported by grants from Western agencies and foundations. (Chomiak 2000, 35; Grunberg 2000; Henderson 2003; Hrycak 2006 and 2007a; Ishkanian 2004; Sperling 1999; Zhurzhenko 1999).

Outsiders, many of them Western governments and foundations, were hopeful that this nascent women's movement would have a strong political impact, helping to build a vibrant civil society that would in turn strengthen Ukraine's weak democratic state (Hrycak 2005; Pavlychko 1997, 222). Despite assistance from foreign women's rights advocates and Western funding, the women's movement seemed to weaken and appeared divided by the mid to late 1990s (Hrycak 2005, 69; Hrycak 2007a; Pavlychko 1997). They did not become a strong political force as women consistently won fewer and fewer seats in Ukraine's national parliament with the abolition of Soviet era quotas. Women active in NGOs were far from presenting a unified voice for Ukrainian women (Hrycak 2001, 155-157; Pavlychko 1997).

This study uses social movement literature to explore the women's movement in Ukraine in 2002 and 2003.¹ The preceding discussion shows that Ukrainian women have no shortage of grievances, and have established their own groups to address a broad range of issues, and these issues vary regionally to some extent. The movement was supported by Western agencies which stepped in to provide material assistance to the emerging movement. However, the social, political, and economic space for Ukrainian women appears to be shrinking despite their mobilizing efforts. The 2002 parliamentary elections resulted in a drop in women's representation even though women's groups actively mobilized during the election campaigns. Women's presence continues to be dominant in the stalls at the outdoor markets and feminized areas of employment, such as medicine and education, are still among the most poorly funded sectors. Ukraine is still a

¹ I use Bull, Diamond and Marsh's (2000) definition of a women's movement because it most closely describes what is developing in Ukraine and differentiates the growing women's movement from the development of feminism or a feminist movement in Ukraine. According to these authors, a women's movement includes, "a number of women's groups and associations in one country or region which have arisen spontaneously, organized by women for women" (Bull, Diamond and Marsh 2000, 1-2). They distinguish it from feminism that is an active desire to change women's position in society, remove discrimination and breakdown male domination. As, Sperling, Ferree and Risman point out, this also includes groups that define themselves as feminist, but is not limited to only feminist organizations (2001, 1158). Many of the women's NGOs in Ukraine are feminist and many are not, but still form part of the women's movement. Bull, Diamond and Marsh's definition is very similar to Beckwith's also broad definition of a women's movement, except that they do not require a reference to gender identity. Beckwith defines the women's movement as a subset of movements that are "characterized by the primacy of women's leadership and decision making. The relationship of women to these movements is direct and immediate; movement definition, issue articulation, and issue resolution are specific to women, developed and organized by them with reference to their gender identity" (Beckwith 1996, 1038). Beckwith's definition, however, highlights the variety of types of women's organizations that may be found in a women's movement recognizing that the content of women's issues will vary across nations, local and national cultures, structures, experiences and contexts. This definition includes feminist and antifeminist women's groups (Beckwith 2000, 437).

leading country in the export of women and children for sex trade purposes. Why are women's groups meeting with such limited success?

This dissertation examines how specific factors influence movement outcomes. The findings will explain how the frames constructed by particular women's groups interact with the local cultural context in which they operate to influence the progress a group is able to make towards its stated goals. In addition, the impact of material resources, both domestic and international, and political opportunities are also studied. This research will help us understand the extent to which the success of women's groups and groups generally is constrained by local cultural context. Can groups that represent or frame women outside of the dominant cultural perspective bring about their desired social changes? This chapter places my research on the emerging Ukrainian women's movement within the context of social movement studies using the framing approach and lays out expectations for the interaction of frames, local cultural context, resources and political opportunities. The framing approach constitutes the primary focus of this research. The connection between framing, resources and outcomes is also of particular interest given the infusion of foreign assistance and scarcity of domestic resources. The potential influence of the political opportunity structure is also considered but constitutes a minor focus. The table below lays out the theoretical expectations discussed in the rest of the chapter.

Table: 1-1 Summary of theoretical expectations

	<u>Influences on frames</u>	<u>Influences on outcomes</u>
<i>Local Culture & Context</i>	<p>Local culture & context are a resource activists draw on when constructing frames</p> <p>Local culture & context act as a constraining factor limiting the meaning that can be fruitfully generated in each local context</p>	<p>Successful outcomes are associated with frames that correspond to aspects of local culture & context</p> <p>Local contexts will present varied opportunities for material resources & elite allies that will assist in progress successful outcomes</p>
<i>International Funding</i>	<p>International funding may influence the issues activists choose to adopt as they seek foreign grants</p> <p>International funding may cause activists to focus frames on foreign donors instead of Ukrainian women</p>	<p>International funding will provide necessary material resources to implement campaigns & make progress toward goals</p> <p>International funding may hinder successful outcomes as foreign donors become the target audience instead of Ukrainian women</p> <p>International funding may cause competition & divisions among activists as they compete for limited grant money, hindering progress toward goals</p>
<i>Domestic Material Resources</i>	<p>Domestic material resources are not expected to have a strong impact on the construction of frames</p>	<p>Office supplies, space & money should assist progress toward desired outcomes</p>
<i>Elite Allies</i>	<p>The presence of elite allies is not expected to have a strong impact on frames</p>	<p>Elite allies may provide material resources & information about legislation assisting progress toward desired outcomes</p>

The Framing Perspective

Social movement literature prior to the mid 1980s was focused on the influence of structural factors, such as the presence or absence of resources or changes in the structure of political opportunities in the emergence and success of movements (Jenkins 1983; Jenkins and Perrow 1977; McAdam 1982; McCarthy and Zald 1977; Skocpol 1979). A primary criticism of this literature was its overly deterministic nature (Benford 1997; Jasper 1997 and 2004; Zurcher and Snow 1981). In response, ideational and sociocultural factors have moved to the center of social movement studies as scholars who previously focused primarily on material, structural and organizational factors now recognize that meaning is central (Johnston and Noakes 2005; Meyer, Whittier and Robnett 2002). Human responses are predicated on the meaning attached to events, groups, and symbols. This is why movement actors debate, modify, articulate and rearticulate meaning as they seek to influence interpretations of reality among targeted audiences (Blumer 1969, 2; Benford 1997, 410). Movements produce specific frames to interpret events even as they require material resources and a favorable political context (Benford 1997; Cress and Snow 2000; Goffman 1974; Johnston and Noakes 2005; Snow et al. 1986; Williams 1995 and 2002). A frame is “an interpretive schemata that simplifies and condenses the ‘world out there’ by selectively punctuating and encoding objects, situations, events, experiences, and sequences of actions within one’s present or past environment” (Snow and Benford 1992, 137). The framing perspective recognizes that movements are more than carriers of existing meaning, but involved in its production (Cress and Snow 2000, 1071).

Activists use frames to articulate meaning from the movement's perspective as they try to influence how others will identify and label events. Frames connect an array of events and experiences so that they "hang together in a relatively unified and meaningful fashion," serving as signals for a targeted audience to use in interpreting events and experiences (Snow and Benford 1992, 138). Thus, framing literature attributes agency to movements as they construct meaning. Activists, as rational agents, try to encode events so that audiences will attach a meaning favorable to the movement's ends (Levin 2005). They may construct a frame so that a situation previously considered acceptable becomes viewed as an injustice demanding action (Gamson 1992; Mika 2006; Snow et al. 1986). For instance, domestic violence, a long accepted practice in Ukraine, was framed as an injustice by Ukrainian women's activists (Hrycak 2007a). Frames intentionally identify culpable parties or an enemy for the movement to work against, as well as construct a favorable identity for the movement (Gamson 1992; Snow et al. 1986). Three core framing tasks are identified by framing scholars. Movement activists must diagnose a problem as an injustice in need of change and propose a solution. They must also convince their target audience that the situation can be effectively addressed through collective action (Cress and Snow 2000, 1071; Snow and Benford 1988, 202). In particular, the diagnosis of the problem and proposed solution, called the diagnostic and prognostic aspects of a frame, have been linked to movement outcomes (Cress and Snow 2000, 1072, 1078-79). This research joins Cress and Snow (2000) by focusing on how Ukrainian women activists have addressed the diagnostic and prognostic framing tasks, connecting them to outcomes of women's NGOs in Ukraine.

Recognizing that movements have agency, activists should be aware of “framing hazards” as they are cognizant of the context in which they operate (Mika 2006; Morgan 2004, 493; Reese and Newcombe 2003; Snow et al. 1986; Sperling 1999). Scholars recognize that frames do not produce the same effect across all contexts, and that activists need to construct frames that resonate with the cultural context to use them as an effective strategy (Babb 1996; Gamson and Modigliani 1989; Noakes and Johnston 2005; Snow and Benford 1988; Snow et al. 1986; Williams 1995 and 2002; Williams and Kubal 1999; Zuo and Benford 1995).

This dissertation examines how women activists describe and assign responsibility for injustices, and their proposed solutions, as they negotiate potential framing hazards in the Ukrainian context. Through a representative sample of women’s NGOs in Kyiv, Kharkiv and L’viv, I examine the frames women activists construct, specifically their diagnoses and prognoses, as they address issues relevant to Ukrainian women. Women’s activists are expected to create frames that resonate with their particular cultural contexts in an effort to attain their desired outcomes.

Resonance and Cultural Context

The resonance of frames within their larger cultural context has become a prominent concept in social movement research as interest in meaning construction grows. Framing theory suggests frames that resonate with the cultural context are more effective (Gamson and Modigliani 1989; Meyer, Whittier and Robnett 2002; Reese and Newcombe 2003; Snow and Benford 1988; Snow et al. 1986; Whittier 2002; Williams

1995; Zuo and Benford 1995). Debates among scholars concerning whether the concept of frame resonance or cultural resonance is more appropriate, and the finer points of what constitutes resonance, have not produced consensus or a great deal of empirical support for the many conceptual distinctions (Noakes and Johnston 2005). What appears to be the product of the debate is a focus on the importance of cultural context in the construction of frames and the interpretation of frames among targeted audiences, as well as the continued use of the resonance concept, incorporating concepts from proponents of frames resonance and cultural resonance (Johnston and Noakes 2005; Myer, Whittier and Robnett 2002; Williams 1995 and 2002).

Resonance in framing discussions concerns the relationship between a movement's collective action frame, its target population and the broader cultural context. Themes and symbols that appear "natural and familiar" are more likely to resonate and be more compelling to their audience (Gamson 1992a, 135; Williams and Kubal 1999). Scholars have employed the terms frame resonance and cultural resonance to explore this relationship. Frames resonate, according to Snow and Benford (1988 and 1992) when they meet three conditions. First, the frame needs to have ideational centrality or narrative fidelity. That is, the frame draws on values, traditions, beliefs, folktales, etc. that exist in the culture and the centrality of those beliefs to the target audience. Second, the frame must be empirically credible by "fitting" with events in the world. Lastly, experiential commensurability ensures that the injustice which the frame addresses is a reality rather than an abstract reality in the lives of constituents (Snow and Benford 1992, 140-141; Snow and Benford 1988, 207-210). These three conditions address whether a particular frame strikes a "responsive cord" with its target audience,

creating alignment between the movement's frame and the beliefs of adherents or constituents (Babb 1996; Jasper and Poulsen 1995; Snow and Benford 1988).

Other scholars argue that cultural resonance, which emphasizes the alignment between movement frames and symbols and meanings in the cultural environment, is a more appropriate concept for studying the connection between a frame, its audience, and the broader cultural environment. Frames that use language and symbols that draw on larger cultural themes will be more potent (Gamson 1992b, 1998; Gamson and Modgalini 1989; Kubal 1998). Cultural environment then emerges as an important factor, and the effectiveness of frames can be addressed according to the extent that they resonate with the broader culture (Kubal 1998, 542). For example, Zuo and Benford showed that the students' frame strategies and nonviolent tactics in the Chinese democracy movement resonated with citizens' experiences, drawing on traditional Chinese cultural themes, such as Confucianism, nationalism and communism, thereby making it difficult for authorities to discredit the students (1995). Sperling (1999) and Caiazza (1999) also demonstrated the importance of cultural resonance. In their studies of Russian women's groups, they found that some women's groups enjoyed less success because they framed their issues in ways that critiqued the dominant Russian culture. Activists in the *Moscow Gender Studies Center*, for instance, used the word 'gender' which was recently introduced into the language and did not mean anything to most Russians while critiquing traditional relationships between men and women.

Kubal (1998), Gamson (1992b) and others, argue that frame resonance is a flawed concept because it addresses participant mobilization, while ignoring the construction and presentation of frames. In addition, frame resonance never clearly connects frames to

participant mobilization. Frame resonance arguments often employ redundant reasoning. Frames are successful because they resonate, and they resonate because they are successful (Kubal 1998, 542). Lastly, frame resonance tends to overlook the impact of a movement's cultural context and the influence of larger cultural themes (Jasper and Poulsen 1995, 493). Therefore, these theorists claimed that cultural resonance is a preferable concept that overcomes the pitfalls in discussions of frame resonance.

The arguments for cultural resonance versus frame resonance seem to have yielded little. Noakes and Johnston's (2005) overview of important concepts in framing literature ignores the distinction altogether and combines concepts from both in a single list of six factors that affect frame resonance drawn from Gamson (1992a) and Snow and Benford (1992): frame consistency, empirical credibility, credibility of the frame's promoters, experiential commensurability, centrality and narrative fidelity. They admit that some of the six concepts contain quite a bit of overlap. For instance, empirical credibility (the fit between a frame and events in the world) and experiential commensurability (the fit between a frame and everyday experiences of the target audience) are essentially the same (Noakes and Johnston 2005, 11-16). The finer distinctions and often overlapping dimensions of what constitutes resonate framing has produced studies that focus usually on one or two conceptual aspects of resonance (see Levin 2005, Mika 2006, Nechemias 2006, Williams 1995 and 2002, and Zuo and Benford 1995 for examples) or simply collapsing categories without comment (see Babb 1996). For example, Levin (2005) examined whether social movement organization frames resonated with current events. Zuo and Benford (1995) showed how students drew on Chinese cultural traditions to create resonate frames. Nechemias (2006)

examined the extent to which the frames of Russian women's organizations reinforced or critiqued prevailing views of women in Russian society. Mika (2006) studied the effect of frames that drew on, but intentionally misrepresented, values and moral beliefs held by many in American society. Finally, Williams (1995 and 2002) discussed activists' use of language that connects their frames to larger themes in American political and religious culture.

This research examines the frames Ukrainian women's activists created, and their resonance with local cultural contexts. Frames drawing on values, beliefs, traditions and myths from Ukrainian culture will appear "natural and familiar" and are more likely to produce desired outcomes than those that do not. For example, several women activists referred to the myth of the Ukrainian *Berehynia* (Hearth Mother) to increase the appeal of their nationalism or gender discrimination frames. This study also examined how activists drew on the lived experiences (experiential commensurability) of local Ukrainian women in attempts to construct resonate frames. Frames that resonate with their local cultural contexts and draw on Ukrainian women's lived experiences are expected to be more potent than those that do not. Culturally resonate frames are expected to produce desired outcomes more. Since this study includes analysis of the three primary frames employed in the Ukrainian women's movement (nationalism, gender and discrimination, economic crisis) in 2002-2003, it allows for comparison among frames with varying degrees of resonance.

The focus in framing literature on resonance naturally led to the inclusion of cultural context in the study of social movements² (Penney 2006, 143; Snow 2004; Williams 2004). The above discussion shows that the creation, interpretation, and potency of frames are mediated by its cultural environment. Cultural context has come to be included as one of the external contexts important for social movement studies, especially those that use the framing perspective (Banaszak 2006; Gamson 1988; Johnston and Klandermans 1995; Meyer, Whittier, Robnett 2002; Penney 2006; Polletta 1997, 432; Steinberg 2002; Swidler 1986, 1995; Williams 2002). These studies contain a strong emphasis on culture as a resource while at the same time acting as a constraining element. Williams (2002) emphasized that movement activists draw on the culture in creating their frames. Culture provides dominant discourses and accepted “symbolic repertoires” much like Tilly’s (1979) repertoires of action. Cultural context can serve as a resource providing a cultural “tool kit” from which activists draw in constructing movement frames (Swidler 1986 and 1995). However, the constraints of culture can not be ignored in the framing process and in evaluating their effectiveness (Penney 2006; Williams 2004, 95).

Social movements draw on the culture in constructing their frames using existing symbols, myths, etc. in order to make their frames familiar to their audiences as they are simultaneously trying to produce change with these same frames. To be effective agents

² Following Poulson (2005) I use Zald’s definition of culture. Culture consists of, “the shared beliefs and understandings, mediated by and constituted by symbols and language, of a group or society” (1996, 273). Culture is observable in social practices, language, symbols, and traditions and provides a way of ordering reality (Polletta 1999, 67-68). Movement scholars now including cultural context in their analysis tend to focus on dominant discourses, deeply held beliefs, values, symbols and traditions within a society to help them understand the connection between individuals or groups and social structures or institutions (Mika 2006; Penney 2006; Swidler 1986; Williams 2002).

of change, activists must express their innovative meaning within the culturally symbolic repertoire that is familiar and legitimate to the target audience (Conrad 2006; Reese and Newcombe 2003; Swidler 1995). Williams (2002) explains that cultural context “shapes the meanings that movements can successfully generate” (265). Cultural context provides a template for how frames and actions of social movements will be interpreted. This is not an argument for cultural determinism, but recognition that activists have agency within the boundaries of the existing culture which is both a resource and a constraint.

This dissertation takes up the challenge in the preceding literature by examining how frames generated by Ukrainian women activists intentionally draw on their cultural context. At the same time, many of the frames critique the culture and advocate change. This study examines the extent to which culture acts as a resource and a constraint for women activists. What happens when women are represented outside of the dominant cultural perspective? How have women activists drawn on the culture in constructing their frames that are intended to bring about change for Ukrainian women?

This view of cultural context as a resource or “tool kit” and a constraining factor with an accepted repertoire also includes the idea of social movements as innovators of cultural change. Movements while drawing on the culture for their frames are simultaneously critiquing that very same culture and proposing innovations (Broad, Crawley and Foley 2004; Snow and Benford 1988; Williams 1995 and 2002). D’Anjou and Van Male (1998) show that social movements’ frames have to be contrary to culture, but resonate by drawing on that same cultural context (212). Movement activists sometimes create frames that critique the dominant culture more than it is willing to

accept (Berbrier 1998; Mika 2006; Reese and Newcombe 2003) and at other times successfully use dominant cultural themes to advocate change in a way that is considered acceptable (Zuo and Benford 1995). For example, Armenian women's activists worked to promote changes in gender consciousness while using language that was traditional and familiar to local Armenians (Ishkanian 2004). These scholars view the cultural context which social movements operate within as relatively stable but also malleable.

At this point there is not as much research on how specific cultural contexts constrain and limit the kinds of meaning that may be produced (Penney 2006, 144). This dissertation takes up the literature on frames and cultural contexts at this juncture. It examines frames as a dependent variable by studying ways the local context acts as a resource and a constraint in the construction of frames in each city. Cultural context is analyzed as an independent variable influencing how activists choose to construct their frames.

Ukrainian women's activists are often innovators of cultural change in the frames they create. Studying the range of frames within the Ukrainian women's movement provides opportunities to observe ways in which cultural context acted as a resource for activists while other elements of culture simultaneously constrained the meaning activists could create and the change they could bring about. This study also examines frames as an independent variable examining the outcomes associated with the use of particular frames in varied local cultural contexts. An emphasis on the ways that social movement activists facilitate change necessitates a focus on outcomes or at least progress toward desired outcomes. By considering how cultural context served as a resource and a constraint, this dissertation necessarily studies the varying outcomes associated with the

different frames used in the Ukrainian women's movement. In 2002 and 2003 the three primary frames used by Ukrainian women activists were nationalism, gender discrimination, and the economic crisis. Each of these frames drew on elements of Ukrainian culture, while many critiqued it at the same time, attempting to bring about change. In particular, the gender discrimination frame, as used by women activists, often critiqued the prevailing image of women and traditional Ukrainian relationships between men and women.

The findings from this study will help us understand the extent to which the outcomes of women's groups were constrained by culture and whether those representing women outside of the dominant cultural perspective succeeded in bringing about their desired changes. The findings from this study also contribute to the social movement literature on outcomes, of which Benford and Snow (2000) in their overview of the framing perspective, note there is very little. Cress and Snow (2000) and Morgan (2004) are notable exceptions.

Thus far I have discussed culture as a monolithic context within a country. Culture does not have to be uniform throughout a country. Scholars have long recognized that subcultures exist within a single country. For instance, Pye and Verba (1965) focused on differences between mass and elite political cultures within a country. Sociologists have studied subcultures of violence, deviance, working-class subcultures, disaster subcultures, youth subcultures, etc. (Fine and Klienman 1979; Kornhauser 1978; Suttles 1968; Willis 1977). Johnston and Snow (1996) studied accommodative and oppositional subcultures within the Estonian nationalist opposition.

What has been much less frequently addressed is the variation in cultures based on region within a country. According to Penney (2006), “Place matters. And the particular contexts in which collective action campaigns occur play an important role in the kinds of discursive practices that may emerge” (144). His study of unionization attempts at two different hospitals is, in part, an answer to McAdam’s call to consider local contexts, each with their own local history, local culture and local politics (2004, 206). One of the few scholars to address cultural contexts in different regions of a country was Raka Ray in her study of the women’s movement in India (1999). Ray found different political cultures in Bombay and Calcutta noting how they influenced the women’s movement in each city. Ukraine is also well known for its regional variation in culture (Hrytsak 2000; Solchanyk 2000; Wanner 1998; Wilson 1997; Zimmerman 2000). The women’s movement in Kyiv, Kharkiv and L’viv, cities in central, eastern and western Ukraine respectively, are included in this study to capture some of Ukraine’s regional subcultures. Variations are expected in the frames in the Ukrainian women’s movement according to the subcultures that exist in different regions. Women’s activists will likely adapt frames to fit the local culture and context in their city. Additionally, some frames may resonate more strongly in one local cultural context than another, leading to differing outcomes. Frames may vary in their content and ability to produce desired outcomes depending on the location (Kyiv, Kharkiv or L’viv) in which they are employed.

Thus, Ukrainian women activists are expected to draw on their local contexts and the lived experiences of Ukrainian women in constructing their frames. Kyiv, Kharkiv and L’viv present varied cultural contexts which will each act as a resource and a

constraining factor for activists as they frame their issues to Ukrainian women. The local cultural contexts also influence how the frames will be interpreted by their target audiences and therefore the outcome women's leaders are able to attain. Frames with greater local cultural resonance are expected to be associated with desired outcomes.

The preceding discussion emphasized the importance of meaning construction and cultural context, but we should not assume that social movement organizations are successful simply because they created culturally resonate frames adapted to their local contexts (Noakes and Johnston 2005, 16). Material resources and political opportunities are also important to movement mobilization, operation and outcomes (Baldez 2002 and 2003).

Resources

Social movements engage in meaning construction as they seek to achieve their goals, as well as rely on material resources, both domestic and international, and respond to the political opportunity structure (Franceschet 2004; Hrycak 2007; Levin 2005; Myer, Whittier, and Robnett 2002; Sperling 1999; Zdravomyslova 1996). The Ukrainian women's movement operates in a context where material resources are scarce, yet it continues to exist (Hrycak 2000 and 2006). A central tenant of the resource mobilization perspective is that before collective action can occur, resources must be aggregated, and fluctuations in movement activity can be attributed to the ebb and flow of resources available to movements (McCarthy and Zald 1977). Most of the women's

NGOs in Ukraine were formed after independence when the economy plummeted and has since continued to remain at a low level, making material resources difficult to acquire. This study looks at the material resources acquired by Ukrainian women activists, their connection to frames, and the outcomes women's NGOs were able to achieve.

The term resource has been used broadly, encompassing anything from money, support from sympathizers, membership, loyalty, rights, space, information, and the skills of participants (Banaszak 1996; Cress and Snow 1996; Gamson 1986, 94; Jenkins 1983, 533; Oberschall 1973, 28). The work of Cress and Snow (1996) on homeless people's movements is useful for studying Ukrainian women's groups because of the similar resource deprived situation confronting the homeless and Cress and Snow's specificity about which material resources were necessary. Cress and Snow (1996) explain that homeless people could often provide very little beyond their voices and physical presence. Ukrainian women, while usually not homeless, often have only their ideas, concern, and personal skills (from their educational background or job training) to offer. Therefore, they must often rely on external sources for material resources (Grunberg 2000; Hrycak 2000 and 2007; Sperling 1999). Cress and Snow's research also showed that office supplies, office/meeting space were necessary for movements. They did not find that money was necessary, but only one group did without it (1996). Cress and Snow also found that informational support in the form of knowledge about how to run a meeting, organizational development and maintenance are also important resources for a group to mobilize.

Informational resources were not included in this study since Ukrainian women are generally well educated, and those that participate in NGOs tend to be among the well educated (Grunberg 2000; Sperling 1999). Thus, informational resources in terms of how to run meetings and organizations are not expected to vary a great deal between groups. Women's groups are expected to vary, however, in the extent to which activists are able to obtain office supplies, space, and money to assist them in making progress towards their goals. Women's NGOs that are able to obtain these material resources will likely make more progress toward their goals than those that are unable to acquire material resources.

Ukrainian women's NGOs are expected to search for external benefactors to provide material resources from domestic sources, such as local business or local government. However, Ukraine's economic crisis affects not only women, but all Ukrainians making it generally difficult to acquire material resources from domestic sources. For this reason, external benefactors are expected to come from within Ukraine, but, perhaps even more so, from international donor agencies since potential domestic donors may not possess substantial resources.

In her study of Russian women's organizations, Sperling (1999) found that most women's groups lacked material resources such as office space, money to implement projects, access to copiers, fax machines, and money to make long distance phone calls. For this reason many women's activists turned to foreign sources of funding (foreign governments and private organizations). She argues that funding from foreign organizations had positive and negative consequences for the women's movement. Foreign funding can make it possible for a group to simply exist and pay a small staff or a

few leaders. It can allow groups to have access to copiers and fax machines and simply provide money which could help them to implement their activities. Unfortunately, external funding sometimes caused groups to focus solely on meeting the requirements of the granting agency, losing their original focus. Their publications and activities became focused on the granting agency rather than Russian women. The outside organizations were essentially able to control the goals and activities of the organization through their grant guidelines. Grunberg (2000) and Hrycak (2007a) noted similar effects of foreign funding on women's groups in Romania and Ukraine.

The above examples demonstrate that external foreign sources of funding might help women's groups to emerge but hinder women's groups from reaching their original goals by redirecting their goals and activities to ones foreign donors consider important. Other movement studies reach similar conclusions about the tendency of external support to influence the goals and activities of groups (Alvarez 2002; McAdam 1982; Keck and Sikkink 1998; Naples and Desai 2002; Piven and Cloward 1977.) Conversely, Cress and Snow (1996) found that obtaining resources externally was crucial to reaching viability, and that deriving resources from a benefactor or external source did not alter (moderate) the actions of homeless movements. However, their external benefactors were not international donors. In Ukraine many of the women's groups receive external support from foreign organizations (Hrycak 2000, 2006, 2007a). Therefore, we might expect to see some positive influences from foreign funding in that it provides the necessary material resources to implement projects and offer services to Ukrainian women. Without this foreign money, Ukrainian women's NGOs might not be able to operate. But, it might also hurt the development of the women's movement, as other

others have concluded, by redirecting the focus of the movement through funding priorities and encouraging activists to make foreign donors their target audience instead of Ukrainian women (Henderson 2003; Hrycak 2007, 2006, 2005; Mendelson and Glenn 2002; Sperling 1999). This study examines the positive and negative influences of foreign funding on the Ukrainian women's NGOs. In particular, I focus on the relationship between the frames created by activists and foreign funding and the connection between foreign funding and desired outcomes. Differences in the impact of foreign funding in Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv are incorporated into the analysis.

Political Opportunities

In addition to frames, culture, and resources, political opportunities often influence how groups emerge and operate and impact their success (Franceschet 2004; Levin 2005; Poulson 2005). For example, women's groups in Ukraine did not begin to mobilize until Gorbachev's *glasnost* policies increased political space and decreased state repression for groups independent of the state. In this study, I focus on ways in which political opportunities influence the operation and success of women's NGOs rather than emergence. Political opportunities refer to "the relative openness or closure of the institutionalized political system, the stability or instability of that broad set of elite alignments that typically undergird a polity, the presence or absence of elite allies, and the state's capacity and propensity for repression" (McAdam 1996, 27). There is debate about which dimensions are typically included in a political opportunity structure, but

McAdam's dimensions synthesize across several approaches (Brockett 1991; Kriesi et al. 1992; Rucht 1996; Tarrow 1994). I argue here that political opportunities are important to the activities that Ukrainian women's groups will undertake. For example, the relative openness or closure of the political system will influence the avenues that groups use to seek influence. Sperling (1999) and Caiazza (1999) found that the Russian political system is relatively insulated from societal groups, meaning that groups tend to be more effective when they can participate in drafting legislation rather than lobbying to pass a particular piece of legislation. In Ukraine, the executive and the legislature are each vying to become the dominant branch, and the party system is still in formation, creating a general instability of parties and leaders in power (Wise and Brown 1999). Women's organizations rarely attract enough attention for the state to have any reason to repress them. Therefore the openness or closure of the political system, the stability or instability of elite alignments, and the state's propensity for repression are unlikely to vary across women's groups in Ukraine.

In contrast, the presence or absence of elite allies will vary by group. There are a few powerful female political leaders in Ukraine who may choose to support a women's group, although in general they have not chosen to do so (Pavlychko 1997). However, more than just females among politicians may choose to support a women's group. Groups may also have contacts with other individuals in places of power who may provide active support. They could be key individuals in relevant government agencies besides elites in the legislature (Chomiak 2000; Popson and Righter 2000). Women's NGOs with elite allies are expected to make more progress toward their goals. Elite allies may support women's NGOs by providing material resources or information about

progress of legislation important to women. Women's NGOs with elite allies might be more likely to direct their activity toward the state and pursue policy as one of their goals. The political opportunities available to women's NGOs may also vary according to local context. For instance, Kyiv women's NGOs are more likely to have contacts in the national legislature than those in Kharkiv and L'viv. Women's activists in Kharkiv and L'viv may be more inclined to focus their attention on their city governments where they might enjoy more access.

Outline for the study

This chapter discussed relevant social movement theory and expectations used in this study of the emerging Ukrainian women's movement. Women activists are expected to create frames that resonate to varying degrees with their local cultural context. Frames with a greater degree of cultural resonance are expected to help women's NGOs attain their desired outcomes. Domestic and international resources are also expected to lead to progress toward goals, although international funding will likely create mixed effects. The presence of elite allies is also expected to help women's NGOs achieve their goals. The next chapter describes the data and methods used for studying Ukrainian women's NGOs in 2002 and 2003. Specifically, I describe the research design, the sample selection, the interviews, observation and measurement of the variables discussed above. Chapter 3 discusses the local culture and context confronting the women's movement in Kyiv, Kharkiv, and L'viv, the three cities where the women's movement was studied.

Chapters 4 through 6 examine the three dominant frames created by women activists in each city. Chapter 7 examines how international funding impacts the women's movement. The effects of domestic resources and elite allies are discussed in chapter 8. In chapter 9, I synthesize the analysis from chapters 4 through 8 and discuss implications of this study and directions for future research.

Chapter 2

Data and Methodology

Introduction

The goal of this dissertation is to analyze the influence and interaction of frames used by women's activists, local culture and context, domestic resources, international funding and elite allies on outcomes of organizations in a developing women's movement. This research seeks to clarify how the frames chosen by leaders of women's organizations interact with the culture and context in which they operate to influence the progress a group is able to make towards its stated goals. Resources, both domestic and international, and elite allies were also studied for their impact on outcomes and interaction with frames and local culture and context. The substantive focus of the analysis is women's nongovernmental organizations in Ukraine from the end of September 2002 through the middle of July 2003. The scope of this inquiry requires information that is inherently qualitative in nature. Understanding the ways in which women's activists framed their organizations' messages, obtained and used resources, elite allies and interacted with the international funding community in a specific cultural context requires details and subtleties that can be acquired only through first hand information from women's activists.

This chapter discusses the overall design and methods for this dissertation. It also describes the type of data and the methods of collection. The chapter proceeds as follows. The first section describes the research design and why it was chosen. The second section elaborates on the ethnographic data (in-depth interviews, observation and group literature), as well as what each type of data contributes to the analysis.

Design: Why Ukraine and why Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv?

Why study women's organizations in Ukraine as opposed to any other country? Ukraine provides a unique opportunity to study an emergent post-Soviet women's movement. Until 1991 Ukraine was part of the Soviet Union, and not until Gorbachev's *glasnost* and *perestroika* was freedom of speech and association tolerated in the Soviet Union. All groups independent of the state that existed prior to the Soviet period in Ukraine were forced to cease operation during it. The only women's organizations existing during the Soviet era were the state led Soviet Women's Committees that were designed to carry out party goals. In the late 1980s a few pre-Soviet women's organizations were revived. Shortly after Ukraine declared its independence in 1991 a handful of Ukrainian women seized the opportunity to organize, motivated by the growing economic crisis, the reduction and even cessation of many social welfare benefits, and simply the freedom to be allowed to organize around issues of their choice. Feminist, consciousness raising, self-help, employment retraining, professional, nationalist oriented, and cultural organizations began to form, along with the social

welfare groups. A few works discussing the plight of the Ukrainian women's movement in the early 1990s exist (Bohachevsky-Chomiak 2000; Hrycak 2000; Liposvskaia 1992; Pavlychko 1992 and 1996; Popson 2000).³ On the whole, these assessments provided a dismal picture of a struggling women's movement and offered little hope for Ukrainian women generally. This dissertation looks at the women's movement in 2002 and 2003, a little more than a decade after independence. As yet, no analysis of the Ukrainian women's movement systematically examines women's organizations' progress and obstacles and opportunities that influence them in connection with framing activities and local sub-cultures. How do variables such as frames, resources, and political opportunities, which social movement theorists have identified as influential to outcomes, influence a developing women's movement in a post-Soviet context?

Furthermore, the Ukrainian women's movement provides an opportunity to study the influences of sub-cultures within a movement by studying the women's movement in three distinctly different regions of the country. Ukraine provides a particularly interesting post-Soviet context because of the cultural variation within it. Ukraine scholars have long noted regional variation in culture between cities in east, west and central Ukraine. Western Ukraine, which spent much less time under Soviet rule, maintains stronger Ukrainian traditions, was the basis for the national democratic movement, speaks more Ukrainian, and tends to associate Ukraine with western Europe more than Russia. Western Ukraine is inclined to view itself as the guardian of the 'true' Ukrainian national identity. In contrast, eastern and central Ukraine reveal stronger

³ A considerably larger amount of research on the developing Russian women's movement has been published.

Russian influences since they spent more time under Russian and Soviet rule and nationalist orientation does not tend to be as strong. Many in eastern Ukraine have strong ties to Russia and associate Ukraine with Russia more than Western Europe. Kyiv, in central Ukraine, was a more Russian oriented city, but as the capital of independent Ukraine, developed a slightly more Ukrainian and national orientation. It serves as somewhat of a middle ground between western and eastern Ukraine.

Therefore, women's organizations from different regions can be compared with each other. This study uses Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv which are each in different regions of Ukraine. Kyiv is located in central Ukraine and enjoys special status as the capital city. Kharkiv is located in eastern Ukraine very close to the border with Russia, and L'viv is situated in western Ukraine not far from the Polish border. To date little work has been done on regional variation within the Ukrainian women's movement.⁴ This selection of cities allowed me to study the women's movement within different subcultures and variations within the movement itself. Through in-depth interviews with women's activists, their elite allies, movement literature and observation from a representative sample of women's organizations in three regionally distinct Ukrainian cities this research works to answer what variables are influential in helping women's NGOs make progress toward their goals in the Ukrainian post-Soviet context.

⁴ Hrycak is an exception. She also interviewed women's activists in Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv although her work does not necessarily focus on comparisons among the three cities.

Methods and Data

Semi-structured in-depth interviews with leaders of women's organizations are the primary source of data for this dissertation. The interviews provide information about the organizations' history and founding, goals, activities and accomplishments, resources, international funding, elite allies, obstacles and knowledge about other women's NGOs in the city. In-depth interviews allow women's activists to tell their stories which explained why they felt their organizations needed to be formed, what problems they hoped to remedy or ameliorate, and how much progress (or lack thereof) has been made thus far toward their desired ends. Interviews also shed light on how frames, local cultures, international funding and domestic resources interacted with each other. For instance, a particular frame may help organizations to secure finances from international donors, but this same frame may not resonate equally well with Ukrainian women. In-depth interviews are particularly suited for eliciting this type of information because they allow the interviewer to probe for more information when necessary. They also create the opportunity to develop a rapport with women's activists often making them more open to divulging information they might not otherwise discuss such as, obstacles, opinions about international funding or relations with other women's NGOs in their city. Through relationships created during interviews, invitations to observe events of the women's NGOs were also elicited. Furthermore, the information provided by women's

activists through interviews was not available through any secondary source. There are few published materials about Ukrainian women's organizations and none that provide the range and extent of information needed about individual women's NGOs. Therefore, interviews were the only means to acquire in-depth information about organizational goals, changes in goals, domestic resources, international funding, activities, successes and obstacles.

In addition to interviews, observation of group activities and analysis of available literature produced by the organizations were also used to examine women's groups. This helped to balance the self-reported information provided by the activists and the degree to which other members held the same opinions. Observing movement activities shed light on the extent to which groups were actually doing what the leaders claimed they were doing. It also allowed me to observe how women participating in the activities reacted to and interacted with the organizations. The group literature and observation of activities provided further information about how groups framed themselves and their activities to the populations they sought to reach. It also sometimes filled in gaps from the interviews or helped to clarify information from the interviews.

The Sample

Interviews fell into three categories: women's NGO leaders, elite allies and knowledgeable and involved women's activists. Sixty-six interviews were conducted in

total, representing 49 women's organizations from Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv.⁵ In Kyiv 24 women's NGOs were studied and 34 interviews were conducted. Twenty-five were leaders of women's organizations and four were women's activists in the organizations who were not the formal heads of the organizations but intimately involved and knowledgeable about the NGOs. Four were considered elite allies by women's activists.⁶ One interview was conducted with an American working in Kyiv for Winrock International, an international granting agency. In Kharkiv 17 women and one man were interviewed. There were 13 different organizations studied, two elite allies, and three involved and knowledgeable women interviewed. In L'viv, 14 women were interviewed from 12 women's organizations, one elite ally and one knowledgeable woman. One well known and highly recommended scholar on Ukrainian women's organizations was interviewed in Odessa.

Informants were initially identified through the *Ukrainian Women's Non-Profit Organizations Directory* published in 2001 by the Center for Innovation and Development in Kyiv. The directory lists registered women's NGOs by region in Ukraine. Each entry included contact information, the name of the leader, and a short paragraph about the organization's goals. A list of all the women's organizations in each of the three cities under study was compiled. Since the objective was to learn how several variables impacted the ability of women's NGOs to make progress toward goals,

⁵ A handful of informal interviews with women's activists were also conducted and not included in the totals.

⁶ An elite ally was anyone women's activists identified as a member of the political, social or economic elite and claimed as an ally. Women's activists who claimed an elite ally only mentioned persons who occupied a government position. No one claimed social or economic elites as allies.

a representative random sample was used. Excel was used to generate random numbers to sample approximately 1/5th of the organizations in Kyiv and 1/4th of the organizations in both Kharkiv and L'viv. Unfortunately, the contact information in the directory was not always accurate and sometimes outdated. Some of the organizations were impossible to contact for one reason or another.⁷ If the directory's contact information was unhelpful and after asking other women's activists I could not locate the group, I used Excel to generate another random number and chose a replacement organization. I also used this replacement method for activists that declined to be interviewed. In the total sample of 49 women's NGOs, 18 were replacement organizations.

While the selection of women's NGOs was random and intended to produce a representative sample in each city, selection bias most likely entered into the sample. First, NGOs that were no longer in operation were inherently more difficult to contact. Their contact information was more likely to be outdated if the phone number in the directory was that of an office and not a personal apartment. Even if an activist was contacted they were sometimes more difficult to persuade to consent to an interview, although this was not always the case.⁸ Second, women's NGOs that had international

⁷ In Ukraine, the postal system is rarely used. It is not uncommon for people to know their street address, but not their zip code. As a result addresses were of little use. Phone numbers in Ukraine belong to a location. If a person or organization moves to a new location the phone number always changes. There was an information number to call, but a person's complete address was required to obtain their new phone number. For this reason, if a phone number changed it was very difficult to locate a person. Also, some women's activists used their work number or the number at the office of their NGO if they had an office. They may have only been at their work a few hours a week or the NGO office sporadically making it difficult to contact them. There was no way of knowing if this was the case when trying to contact women's activists.

⁸ Some women's activists whose organizations were no longer active were very willing to be interviewed and often more candid in their answers to interview questions. One women's activist in Kyiv asked to do a second interview in addition to the first three hour interview. Four women's activists of defunct NGOs were interviewed in Kyiv. In the Kharkiv sample no inactive NGOs were included in the sample, although

funding were probably more likely to be active since they had money to implement programs, and as a result, more easily contacted. Since, 80% of the sample of 49 women's NGOs had international funding this is highly likely.⁹ Despite these likely biases, in all three cities my samples included variation in terms of the types of goals pursued, size of organization, activity level, types and amount of funding and resources and age of organizations.

My original intent was to mail introductory letters to women's activists before I called for an interview. Upon arriving in Ukraine I realized this plan was impractical. Most Ukrainians do not use the postal system regularly and many do not check their mail regularly or even have a place to receive it. Mailing addresses were difficult to obtain and unreliable at best. A phone call in which I introduced myself and explained the information contained in my Institutional Review Board approved introductory letter was more effective and a more accepted practice for meeting women's activists and scheduling interviews than an introductory letter. I initially mailed or faxed several introductory letters to which I received only one response from an activist who only wanted to meet with me if I was a possible funding source.

two organizations that had significantly reduced their activity were included in the sample. Among those that had to be replaced in Kharkiv, one was defunct and declined an interview. Four could not be contacted and no one was able to give me any information about them. It is impossible to know whether those four were defunct NGOs or the contact information was outdated. In L'viv, the same applied; no completely defunct women's NGOs were included in the sample, but two that were barely functional were included. Three women's organizations in the L'viv sample could not be contacted, and no information was obtained about them, making it impossible to know whether they were defunct or not present at the number when I called or the contact information was incorrect.

⁹ However, international funding certainly did not ensure organizational survival. All four of the Kyiv women's NGOs that were no longer operating had international funding.

In Kyiv eight women's NGOs or one third of the original random sample of 24 women's organizations could not be contacted. The contact information was outdated for two of the organizations. Other women's activists in Kyiv knew that the organizations were still in existence, but no one had the new phone numbers or addresses. No one answered the phone at the other six women's NGOs that could not be contacted in Kyiv and other women's activists knew nothing of them. In Kharkiv, seven women's NGOs or 53% from the original random sample of 13 could not be interviewed.¹⁰ One of the organizations was no longer active, and its leader declined to be interviewed. Another one was well known and active, but its leader also declined an interview. I met informally with two university students that participated in her organization and gave a presentation for members hoping to meet its leader in person to request an interview or find a suitable replacement interviewee. None of the people I spoke with at the organization were knowledgeable enough to substitute as an interviewee for the leader of the organization so that organization was dropped from the sample. The other five women's NGOs could not be contacted because the contact information provided in the directory was outdated. A few women's activists I interviewed were able to tell me that one of them was still active. The leader had moved recently and no one knew how to contact her. I was not able to find any information concerning the status of the other

¹⁰ The higher proportion of women's activists that could not be contacted based on the original random sample in Kharkiv than Kyiv and L'viv was probably in part due to my living situation in that city. In Kharkiv I lived with a Ukrainian family that had a party phone line. Consequently, I had more difficulty using the phone at certain times of the day. I also could not leave that phone number as a call back number and had to leave my cell phone number instead. Since cell phones are more expensive to call in Ukraine people are much less likely to return a call to a cell phone number. All cell phones had one of two area codes and were therefore easily identified as cell phones. In Kyiv and L'viv my apartments had single family phone lines, answering machines, and I was able to distribute those numbers.

four. In L'viv, three, or one fourth of women's NGOs could not be contacted from the original sample of 12, and no information was obtained about them from other sources.

Usually only the leaders of organizations were interviewed because they were more likely to know the most about the organization. In most cases the leader was also the founder of the organization and/or had been involved in it since its inception. They were able to answer questions about original goals and changes in goals, accomplishments, resources and funding, as well as obstacles to the organizations' success that the average lay member would not be able to answer. In some of the larger organizations, women who were heads of specific projects were interviewed for additional insight into the organization.

In five instances, after the interview was already scheduled, the interviewee did not appear for the interview. In that case, I tried to find someone who had been involved in the organization for a long time and knew the appropriate information since I was already at the location and did not know if I would have another opportunity. Usually these informants were very helpful and able to provide the necessary information. I also tried to reschedule with the originally intended respondent but could not always do so. In one case I was able to reschedule for a later date. Only one organization had to be eliminated from the study because the interviewee did not appear and declined to reschedule. There were also two organizations where the leader was more of a symbolic head and would not have been able to answer many of the questions adequately. Again, a more informed respondent was found who was able to answer the questions.

Whenever possible elite allies identified by the women's organizations themselves were interviewed. Only eight elite allies across all three cities were

interviewed. I hoped to interview quite a few more, but was not able to do so for two primary reasons. First and most importantly, most women's organizations did not name any allies among political, social or economic elites. Second, even if they mentioned someone, it was very difficult to contact them. Sometimes the women themselves had no current contact information for them. Often even with a phone number it was difficult to reach the identified elite ally. If the person was too high up in the organs of power (for instance, a member of parliament) they declined to speak with me. Those in the lower levels (usually at the local level) of government were often in their offices and reachable by phone only a few days a week, if that. This made contacting them next to impossible unless my phone call happened to coincide with the few hours a week they were in the office. They also tended to be very suspicious of me and my reasons for wanting to interview them. The most successful strategy was to ask the leader's of the women's organizations themselves to set up the interviews. Very few actually followed through on this promise.

The Interviews

The interviews ranged in length from 20 minutes to 4 hours with the average interview lasting 45-60 minutes. Sometimes longer interviews were desired, but busy schedules did not allow for more time. Because interviews were difficult to schedule, I used whatever time interviewees were willing to allow during scheduled interviews, even if it was shorter than needed to complete the entire interview schedule. The interviews

were open-ended and informal. This allowed me to follow the flow of the conversation and listen to what the women's leaders chose to emphasize. However, a prepared list of questions was used in every interview, although the order varied depending on the flow of the conversation¹¹. All interviews began with the same question. Depending on the information supplied in the first answer, the questions were asked in various orders. This method usually fostered a rapport between the interviewer and respondent, although some respondents were more candid than others.

All but three of the interviews were recorded on tape. The presence of a tape recorder had varying effects. Some women were accustomed to it and had no observable reaction to its presence. The tape did not seem to affect their behavior. Others were flattered by the presence of a tape recorder. It seemed to give them a sense of importance and pride. These were usually the same women that would tell anyone who walked into the room during the interview that "a journalist from America is here interviewing me."¹² Other women were uncomfortable with the tape recorder or perhaps more guarded with their answers, at first. I suspect they feared that their answers might be used against them or that other women that they mentioned during the course of the interview might find out what they said. They were assured before the interview began that they would remain anonymous and the information was only being used for the purposes of my dissertation. During these interviews I sometimes felt that responses were shorter than they would have been otherwise or that I had to extract responses from them.

¹¹ See Appendix A for a copy of the interview schedules. Elite allies were also interviewed using the same method but with a different interview schedule, also in Appendix A.

¹² Respondents were always given an informed consent form that explained my status as a graduate student, what the information was being used for and the confidentiality of their responses.

The three respondents who did not allow me to tape did so for differing reasons. Two women did not want their interviews taped. One did not allow me to tape the interview because she had negative things to say about other women's organizations which she felt should not be recorded. The other leader who declined to be taped did so because she was a member of the opposition and felt it would not be wise to record what she had to say. The information given during these interviews did not appear any more sensitive than what other women were willing to divulge, but these two believed their information was highly sensitive. I took notes during these interviews and filled in the rest at my earliest opportunity. One interview was not recorded because it was unplanned, and I did not have my tape recorder with me at the moment.

The informed consent forms required by the Institutional Review Board (IRB) had varying effects on the women being interviewed. Each interviewee was given one before the start of the interview. Some did not care to read them or only glanced at them quickly without spending enough time to read what it explained about the project and their rights. They indicated they thought it was strange to give them this American piece of paperwork and preferred not to waste time reading it. Some women read them carefully and expressed their appreciation. They were happy to be told they had rights and could contact me again if they had any more questions. A few even wanted to start the practice in Ukraine. Other women were clearly intimidated by the form. In these cases I usually explained that it was only a law in America that I had to give these to people, and I only do it because I promised my university I would give it to people in Ukraine. I made it clear that it had nothing to do with laws in Ukraine and was only a requirement of my university in the United States. Most interviewees appeared more

comfortable after this assurance, although a few still asked why I gave it out if it had nothing to do with Ukraine.¹³

My status as an American also impacted the interview process and elicited a range of responses from the women activists. Many people thought it interesting that any American should be interested in them and their organization. Often this made them more willing to allow me to interview them and/or observe some of their organization's activities. While simply being an American frequently aided me in scheduling interviews, my identity also had undesired effects. Since a lot of women's organizations in Ukraine receive, have received, or hope to receive money from the United States, several women asked me for money and/or asked me to find them a sponsor in America to fund their organization. I referred them to some of the well known U.S. or Canadian granting organizations with offices in Ukraine and told them that I would search the internet for a possible funding source for them. Many of them were disappointed with this response finding it hard to believe that I or any number of my acquaintances could not afford to fund them. Because many viewed me as a possible source of funding I sometimes felt that people were trying to impress upon me the worthiness of their cause or the extent of their accomplishments in the hopes that I would somehow give them money or find someone to fund them. Others, who had already received money from American organizations, sometimes thought that as an American, I was evaluating their use of American money. I always made it clear at the beginning of the interview that I

¹³ The informed consent was an unsigned one. Respondents were only expected to read it and keep it if they chose. Had they been required to sign the forms I am confident that a few of the women would have refused to be interviewed and caused others to be more guarded during the interviews. Another American woman conducting research at the same time in Ukraine had a few interviewees change their minds and decide not to allow her to interview them because of the signed informed consent form.

had no affiliation with any funding organizations and was only a graduate student doing research. Usually, throughout the course of the interview those who hoped I might somehow bring them money realized that I really was just a graduate student. Nonetheless, I felt that it was harder to acquire information about the failures and struggles from some of the organizations because I was a person from a wealthy foreign country.¹⁴

Most of the interviews were conducted with only one primary respondent. I chose this in the hopes that people might talk more openly with me, and the interview could be more relaxed. It was also easier to schedule an interview with one person at a time. In about one third of the cases there was someone else sitting in the room during the interview. This was not unexpected since many organizations had very little office space or none at all. Not only would it be considered rude to ask them to leave the room, but there was often nowhere else for them to go. If interviews were conducted in personal apartments instead of at an office or café there were frequently family members in the room during the interview. Again, this was difficult to avoid because many families live in one room apartments. If the other person in the room was involved in the organization they often interjected a sentence here, and there and sometimes became highly involved in the interview. Since the leader usually welcomed their participation or even invited it, I welcomed it also. There were six occasions when the women invited another person in

¹⁴ I expect that the effect would have been very similar had I been a citizen of another wealthy Western country that provided grants to women's NGOs.

the organization to come to the interview.¹⁵ I simply included the other woman in the interview since there was nothing else that could be done at that point. Sometimes women chose to invite another person to the interview because they thought that I would like to interview the woman they invited as well, they were not sure that they would be able to answer all my questions on their own, because the other person wanted to meet me or just because they seemed to enjoy having someone else with them. I never knew in advance when another person would be at the interview and had no choice but to accept it.

With four exceptions, the interviews were conducted in Russian and/or Ukrainian. Russian and Ukrainian are the dominant languages in Ukraine, and most are able to understand and speak both. Some chose not to speak Russian on principle. Since I spoke better Russian than Ukrainian I usually spoke in Russian, and the informants spoke in the language of their choice. Many who started the interview in Ukrainian would often switch to Russian simply because they observed I was more comfortable in Russian. There were a few interviews where the informants spoke only Ukrainian throughout the interview. I always explained that I appreciated the Ukrainian language but did not speak it very well so that they would not think I had pro-Russian sentiments. The four interviews conducted in English were in English for a variety of reasons. One was with an American woman working for an organization that gave grants to Ukrainian women's organizations. Two were in English because the women would only speak English with me. One of these two was fluent in English and always spoke English or German with

¹⁵ The extra women brought to interviews were not counted as an additional interview, but the information they provided was used in the analysis.

her international colleagues. The other woman was very proud of her English speaking ability and seemed insulted when I spoke Russian to her. The last interview in English was also with a woman who was fluent in English, but she allowed me to choose the language. Since we were in a large office with several other people working in it I chose English in the hopes that it would make our conversation less accessible to others and therefore more private.

The elite ally interviews were often severely limited by time constraints, more so than interviews with most NGO leaders. It was more difficult to establish a rapport with these informants because they often began the conversation by saying they only had 20 or 30 minutes to spare. This also sometimes limited the questions I had time to ask and not all the questions on the interview schedule could be covered. These interviews focused on what the elite ally perceived were important issues for women in Ukraine, causes for problems specific to women, what the government was doing about it, any specific legislation relevant to the issues identified by the respondent, the general openness of those in government to women's concerns and what information they knew about the women's organization(s) that identified them as an elite ally.¹⁶

Besides time constraints, two other factors limited the information gleaned from elite ally interviews. Often the identified elite ally was a woman in the local government who dealt primarily with one specific issue area. These women frequently felt they were not qualified to answer some of the questions that dealt with how open they thought the government was to women's concerns and information about legislation affecting

¹⁶ See Appendix A for the interview schedule.

women. Secondly, they were sometimes very hesitant to talk about what they knew about specific women's organizations. They usually provided brief and vague responses about ways in which they were able to help specific organizations. In general they were not inclined to provide detailed information on aide to women's organizations.

Observation and Printed Materials

At the close of every interview I asked each women's activist if their organization was holding any events or conducting any meetings during the time I would be in their city and if I could attend any of them.¹⁷ This was so that I could watch the organization in action, listen to how they spoke about themselves to others and observe women's reactions to the organization. Observation was also intended to serve as a double check on the self-reported information from the interviews. Unfortunately, many of the organizations were not holding any events or activities during the time I was living in the city. They often held events only a few times a year or perhaps were primarily a research organization that never or rarely holds events. Therefore, the extent of observation was more limited than originally anticipated, and I was not able to attend an activity for every organization studied. In Kyiv, I attended 17 different events, meetings or classes from 11 different women's NGOs, in addition to what I could observe during interviews if they were conducted at the office of a women's organization. Ten meetings were observed in

¹⁷ There were a few organizations that I did not ask to observe because of the nature of their activities. These were primarily organizations that provided counseling to women and children. I did not think it appropriate to observe counseling sessions.

Kharkiv from nine different women's organizations. In L'viv, six different events, meetings and classes were observed from four women's NGOs.

When it was possible to observe activities or meetings, permission was acquired ahead of time. Usually the leader introduced me at the start, and then I tried to observe inconspicuously. In four situations I was requested to participate, but otherwise I tried not to participate. Non-participant observation was preferred in an attempt not to impact the situation. Observations included anything from sitting in on a group's regular meeting, to attending workshops and classes, lectures, presentations, annual meetings and concerts.

I also collected the literature groups produced about themselves. This usually meant a pamphlet, brochure, booklet, occasionally a poster, or a summary of their goals and activities. A few organizations had a newsletter or magazine. The purpose of collecting this data was to learn more about group frames, their activities and how they presented themselves to women outside the organization. If the informant skipped over some information about the organization in the interview it might appear in the written material. Sometimes women's NGOs had written materials available and other times they explained they had them at some point, but not at the time of the interview. It was not uncommon for an organization not to publish any printed materials. Not surprisingly the written materials from women's NGOs were often scant, since they cost money to produce and distribute. Usually the literature was not intended to reach a wide audience and often only those already in the organization seemed to know that it existed.

In-depth interviews with women's NGO leaders, observation and organizational literature provided the necessary detail and nuanced information to learn about activists'

choice of frames, resources, obstacles, opportunities, activities, success and failures. The three sources of data provide thorough information about the variables and processes affecting the success of women's NGOs, although there is most likely some selection bias in the sample as a result of the difficulty in contacting NGOs and obtaining updated contact information.

Measurement

Qualitative assessments and discussions of variables are used throughout this dissertation. The variables used in this study (frames, domestic resources, international funding, local culture and context and outcomes) could be quantified, but this would not provide fine grained information needed to study processes and understand subtle variation. Qualitative discussions of each variable are used throughout the study. The chapters on frames, local culture and context, domestic resources and international funding contain detailed examinations of the nature of each variable and its connection to outcomes of women's NGOs in Ukraine.

Frames

Following Cress and Snow, I looked for evidence of diagnostic and prognostic frames used by women's activists (2000, 1071, 1078-79). A diagnostic or injustice frame

problematizes an issue (identifies the injustice) and focuses attention on it as well as identifying its causes. Prognostic frames specify remedies for the group to work towards and the means for accomplishing the objectives. Evidence of diagnostic and prognostic frames was found in women's activists' discussions about the reasons for founding or becoming involved in their organizations, their goals and activities, as well as observations and organizational literature if it existed. This approach moves away from simply describing different types of frames used by movements and presses towards an understanding of how frames operate (Benford 1997, 414-15).

International Funding

Information about international funding was obtained from the interviews with women's NGO leaders. The intent was to learn whether their organization received any money from international donors, if so, from what sources and the extent of the funding.¹⁸ For instance, some organizations only received one start up grant and nothing else. Others won several grants over a period of years and were able to finance the activities of their organizations on a continued basis primarily on the basis of international funding. Sometimes those who had received several grants and of large quantities were less willing to discuss the extent of the grant money they received and

¹⁸ The relative extent of international funding was information women's activists were usually willing to divulge. Only a few activists, usually those who received smaller amounts, gave the exact amount of the money they received. It was more important to know whether it was a lot or a little money and enough to finance activities or perhaps pay a small staff. The exact dollar amount would not necessarily provide this information, particularly since, for example, a two thousand dollar grant in 1995 could finance significantly more than a two thousand dollar grant in 2003.

noticeably more guarded in their answers. Conversely, those who won only one grant or none but had attempted to win others were often the most willing to discuss the extent of their international funding. They were also often able to discuss funding received by other women's NGOs in their city.

Women's activists were also asked for their opinions regarding the effects of international grants on their own organizations, the women's NGO community in their city, and the larger women's movement in Ukraine. Again, sometimes very candid discussions followed these questions, and sometimes very guarded answers were given depending on the activist. Some of the most interesting and open discussions of international funding came from women's activists whose organizations were already defunct or significantly less active than before. Enough women's activists in each city were willing to candidly discuss their thoughts and concerns in relation to international funding that I felt I was able to understand how it was operating in the women's NGO community in Ukraine as a whole, and in each of the cities studied.

Domestic Resources

Domestic resources were more varied than international funding. Domestic resources came in various forms. Interviewees were asked if they received any money from local or national government institutions and by what means they were able to acquire it. Some received assistance from local or national government institutions, but not in the form of money. They were asked to explain the nature of the assistance. Often

it was passing along information to women's activists or donations of food or a letter of support. Office space was the most common domestic resource. Again, they were asked how they obtained it and whether they used it. Some were given office space to use, but it was in such a state of disrepair that activists were not able to use it. If they did not have or use an office, activists were asked the reason, whether they were seeking it and whether this hindered their activities. Lastly, some local businesses gave money, goods or services to women's NGOs. Usually it was small amounts of money, donations of train or circus tickets or food. Women's activists were usually very candid about the types and amounts of domestic resources they received. Often they deplored the lack of domestic support available to them.

Elite allies, in the form of individual political elites at the local and national level, were also considered a domestic resource. The majority of women's activists did not have elite allies. Some of the people identified as elites were in local low level government positions and were able to provide assistance in small ways, such as providing information or facilitating a request for assistance to a needy individual. A few were in more influential positions at the city level and provided tangible resources in the form of money, free utilities or rent and sometimes small grants. A few women's activists had contacts at the national level with members of parliament or individuals in the State Committee of Family and Youth Affairs that was supposed to cooperate with women's NGOs. Women's activists were asked about the type of assistance the elite allies were able to give them, why those allies were willing to help them and the extent of the assistance. On the whole, most women activists felt they received very little or no support from elites. Not a lot of information was gathered about elite allies, primarily

because they were scarce and often did not have extensive contact with women's organizations. Women's activists were usually fairly open about their relationships with elites. Elites tended to be more guarded in their responses rendering their interviews less helpful.

Political parties were another possible source of domestic resources. Because of the timing of the study I was not able to gather much in-depth information about the relationships with political parties. The parliamentary elections in the spring of 2002 resulted in a loss of seats for women candidates and none of the women's political parties were successful. My interviews were conducted in the fall and winter of 2002 and spring and summer of 2003. At that time women's activists were largely disillusioned with political parties and felt they had been manipulated and used for the benefit of political elites that cared nothing about women's concerns. They were unwilling to talk about their previous relations with political parties and usually responded that they had no current affiliations with any parties.

Outcomes

The outcomes of the Ukrainian women's movement were difficult to assess. The women's NGOs were not unified around one or even a few specific goals. Several of the women's activists saw themselves as part of a larger women's movement in Ukraine. Others had little or no awareness of the operations of other women's organizations and did not see themselves as part of something larger than their own organizations. Since

there was not a set of collective goals held by the movement as a whole it was difficult to discuss outcomes in these terms or even outcomes of the movement within each city. Therefore the outcomes associated with each individual women's NGOs had to be evaluated rather than the movement in general.

Assessments of outcomes for individual women's organizations were not easily observed or measured either. A few of the women's organizations were formed or resumed activity shortly before or directly after independence in 1991, however, most were not formed until later. The majority of women's NGOs in 2002 and 2003 were formed in the mid to late 1990s. Since most of the women's NGOs had been in operation for less than ten years I felt it was too early to assess them by whether they achieved their goals, particularly since some of them had goals that included changing the gender consciousness of the population, something they expected to occur over the course of a generation. Thus, it was too early to judge their outcomes by accomplishment of goals because the time period was too short. Secondly, based on assessments of the Ukrainian women's movement from the early 1990s a dismal picture of women's organizing exists creating very low expectations of success.¹⁹

For the above reasons, outcomes are discussed as progress toward stated goals. An organization had to be operational, which was defined as engaged in any sort of activity, and, in addition, engaging in a campaign, a series of activities related to one of their goals. Following Cress and Snow (1996) the activities needed to constitute a campaign were defined as "packages of collective action organized around particular

¹⁹ See Pavlychko 1996 and 1997, Hrycak 2000 and Zhurzhenko 2004.

issues” (1096). A campaign is sustained activity focused on a particular issue rather than unrelated events or isolated actions. Thus organizations could be active without their actions focusing on particular issue, or maintained over a period of time, but they would not be considered as progress toward goals. For instance, an organization that once held a round table on gender issues and never again addressed the issue in any of their activities would not be considered one that was executing a campaign. One that continually sought to raise awareness of human rights among women could be considered to be conducting a campaign, and for the purposes of this study, progressing toward their goals. It is admittedly a low threshold for assessing outcomes but was chosen because of the short time period women’s organizations have had to achieve their goals and the low expectations that existed for Ukrainian women’s organizing.

Progress toward goals was coded along a couple of dimensions. First, at a very minimal level, organizations had to be in operation. Organizations were coded a zero for no longer operating and a one for still operating. Second, I examined whether they had a campaign in the past and the present. Women’s NGOs were coded zero for having activities that did not amount to a campaign. A one indicated that it was unclear whether their actions constituted a campaign, and a two indicated they had clearly conducted one or more campaigns in the past. Women’s organizations receiving a zero were not considered to be making progress and those receiving a two were considered to be making progress. A one represented an unclear category. Past and current campaigns were differentiated because some organizations had been sustaining campaigns, but were no longer active by 2002-2003. Thus, current campaigns were also considered. Organizations were again given a zero, one or two depending on whether their actions

amounted to a campaign. A fourth category was included which was no longer active to distinguish those that had been active, but were not at the time of the study. Outcomes were thus considered in terms of organizational maintenance and the presence or absence of campaigns in the past and the time of the study. Throughout this study outcomes will be referred to as organizational maintenance and the ability to sustain campaigns.

This measure of organizational maintenance was chosen because it was too early to expect outcomes, but looking at organizational maintenance and the ability to carry out campaigns has a few drawbacks. First, it captures maintenance and activity focused around a particular issue, but it does not tell us whether these campaigns were effective. Impact or influence is not captured by this measure. Second, conducting campaigns usually requires money. In the Ukrainian women's movement international granting agencies were the largest and most consistent source of money. Thus, women's NGOs that received international funding were expected to be coded as successful because they were more likely to have money to conduct campaigns. Those that were forced to rely on sporadic domestic resources were less expected to be able to conduct campaigns requiring sustained activity around an issue.

Summary

This chapter describes a research design that captures sub-cultural variation by studying a representative sample of the Ukrainian women's movement in Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv. The ethnographic methods and data used in the chapters which follow are also

explained. Semi-structured in-depth interviews with Ukrainian women activists and their elite allies are the primary source of data. Observation and movement literature supplement the information gathered from the interviews. The data is used to understand influential variables (frames, local culture and context, domestic resources, international funding and elite allies) that affect the progress women's groups in Ukraine made toward their goals.

Chapter 3

Cultural and local context

Introduction

Movement activists construct frames as they strive to influence interpretations of reality among targeted audiences. Theorists recognize that cultural context creates societies with accepted ways of understanding the world. It predisposes people to view events, messages and images from a particular view point. Each movement operates within a unique context that influences the impact activists' frames will have and the outcomes the movement will achieve. Theorists expect movement activists to be cognizant of their cultures in their efforts to construct meaning. But, cultural and local contexts vary within countries, and Ukraine, in particular, is known for its regional diversity (Ray 1999; Wilson 1997). Thus, we expect Ukraine's women activists to be sensitive to their locality in their framing attempts and similar frames to elicit varied responses depending on the cultural and local context into which it is launched. The divergent cultural and contextual influences in the three cities included in this study are expected to play a role in the framing and outcomes of women's NGOs.

Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv are located in separate regions of Ukraine, each with their own historical influences. These three cities are known within Ukraine for their distinct cultural climates and local contexts. The local culture and context for each city is discussed below, starting with a brief overview of Ukrainian history intended to

demonstrate the varied histories of these three regions. Next, each city is discussed separately with a focus on what sets it apart from the other two. Kharkiv and L'viv from eastern and western Ukraine respectively are examined first since they are in the regions frequently described as most different. Kyiv, in central Ukraine, representing somewhat of a middle ground, is discussed last.

Ukraine's historical regional diversity

Ukraine has never before existed as the unified independent geographic territory that it is today. Nationalism developed differently in Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv, and the Soviet experience differed according to region as well. A brief overview of the historical roots of Ukraine shows that regional variation has been a consistent theme throughout the centuries as the regions that make up Ukraine today have largely existed at the periphery of other empires or territories. (Reid 1997; Wilson 1997, 1-25).

Ukraine, aptly, means borderland. Its regions have functioned as the borderlands of the Russian, Polish, Lithuanian, Czechoslovak, Romanian and Austrian empires since the mid 1600s. L'viv, in western Ukraine, spent much of its history as the eastern most part of Poland. Kyiv, in central Ukraine, was the southern most part of Lithuania, eastern most part of Poland, and western edge of Russian territory. Kharkiv, in eastern Ukraine, existed as the western region of Russia. The following overview summarizes Ukraine's borderland history through independence in 1991.

Kyiv was established as the center of Kievan Rus which was a combination of various Slavic tribes unified under Viking influence. At its high point, Rus included most of what is now Ukraine, Belarus and north-western Russia. The Mongol defeat of Kyiv (1240) began the first of many partitions of Ukrainian territory (Reid 1997, 5-15; Subtelny 2000, 27-41; Wilson 1997, 2-3; Wilson 2002, 5-17).

By the 1300s, the lands of Rus were divided among several states. Galicia, in the west (where L'viv is located) was part of Poland, and Kyiv (center) was under Lithuanian rule. The treaty of Lublin (1569) later reunited Kyiv and Galicia by placing Kyiv and the surrounding area under centralizing Polish control. The Cossack uprising (1648), led by Bohdan Khmel'nys'kyi, attempted to unite left and right bank Ukraine but instead ended in an alliance with Moscow (1654). This led to Kyiv and eastern Ukraine (where Kharkiv is located) falling under Russian rule and west of Kyiv to Polish rule (1667).

Kyiv grew and contributed to Russian development as Russia used an assimilation policy that co-opted the military and secular elite. In contrast, western Ukraine, under Polish rule did not encounter strong Polonising efforts. When Poland was partitioned (1772) areas of western Ukraine that included L'viv, went to the Hapsburgs. The Uniate Church that predominated in western Ukraine was allowed to continue operating. It remains important throughout the history of western Ukraine, functioning as a "Ukrainian" national institution throughout centuries of statelessness. The Uniate Church, in western Ukraine, served as a means of preserving Ukrainian culture from Polish and Catholic domination (Subtelny 2000, 125-157; Wilson 2002, 47-71).

In the mid 1800s a Ukrainian national revival began. The national movement was strongest in Galicia (western Ukraine) where the Uniate church helped preserve a sense

of a separate national identity. Western Ukraine also enjoyed more political freedom and serfdom ended sooner than in the Ukrainian lands under Russian control (1848) (Markus 1984, 61).

The parts of Ukraine under the Russian empire did not enjoy favorable conditions for a national revival. The Cossack elite had been largely assimilated into Russian society, and political repression was strong. In the Russian empire, the Ukrainian language was associated with a peasant parochial culture, and language restrictions limited the use of Ukrainian. High culture was in Russian to such an extent that the writer Gogol chose to write about Ukrainian themes in the Russian language. Furthermore, most Ukrainians in the Russian empire remained on the land as industrialization passed them by, and what is now eastern Ukraine experienced an influx of Russian workers. Consequently, Ukrainians in Russian territory lacked a sense of a separate identity that had been preserved in the more western regions of Ukraine (Subtelny 2000, 201-335; Wilson 1997, 9-11; Wilson 2002, 72-90, 101-110).

In the following revolutionary period of the early 1900s, Ukrainian nationalists formed three passing governments in Kyiv: the Ukrainian People's Republic (November 1917 to April 1918), the Hetmanate (April 1918 to December 1918) and the Directorate (December 1918 to December 1919). Ukrainians never achieved complete control, and Kyiv existed largely in a state of anarchy as one army replaced another. Internal dissent also undermined the authority of these governments.

The Directorate, in January of 1919, combined with the West Ukrainian People's Republic that was formed by Galician (western) Ukrainians when the Hapsburg Empire collapsed in November 1918. The two Ukrainian governments never cooperated well,

and, in 1922, Ukraine was again partitioned. Kyiv, eastern and southern Ukraine belonged to the Soviet Union. Western Ukraine was divided among three countries as Galicia once again became part of Poland. One of the explanations for Ukraine's failure to establish a national state in 1917-1920 is that Ukrainians in eastern and southern Ukraine supported the Bolsheviks. Nationalists were not able to sustain support in rural central Ukraine either, leaving only western Ukraine to support the nationalist agenda (Subtelny 2000, 355-379; Wilson 1997, 11-15; Wilson 2002, 123-129).

Western Ukraine did not fall under Soviet rule until 1939, although western Ukraine under Polish rule in the 1920s and 1930s did not enjoy the autonomy they were originally promised in 1923. Ukrainian language use was restricted in administration and education, and Ukrainian organizations were harassed. The strong civil society that managed to develop under the Hapsburg Empire and within the Uniate Church remained the centers of Galician nationalism, continuing to thrive despite repression (Subtelny 2000, 425-440; Wilson 1997, 7-15).

Soviet Ukraine during the 1920s was actually encouraged to practice Ukrainian language as part of Lenin's *korenizatsiia*, allowing for limited intellectual and cultural revival that came to an abrupt end in the early 1930s. The Ukrainian intelligentsia was purged, and collectivization and the man-made famine of 1932-1933 broke the spirit of the peasants. In 1939 Stalin annexed most of the rest of western Ukraine to Soviet Ukraine. Stalin's treatment of western Ukraine after World War II was particularly harsh and was most likely his attempt to silence Ukrainian nationalists. Ironically, the annexation of western Ukraine did at least unite Ukraine into one territory creating a single geographic entity with which Ukrainians could identify.

Ukraine's Soviet experience raised the education level of much of the population and industrialized Ukraine. The effects of industrialization varied considerably by region as did urbanization. In western Ukraine it had the effect of homogenizing the ethnic make up of cities, into largely Ukrainian after World War II (Czaplicka 2005, 15). The ethnic make up of Kyiv also became more Ukrainian, although it tended to function in Russian. The Russian language and culture continued to dominate in eastern Ukraine (where Kharkiv is located) (Subtelny 2000, 380-424; Wilson 1997, 15-17; Wilson 2002, 147-151).

In the mid and late 1980s movements for national revival and independence began to resurface in Ukraine as *glasnost* and *perestroika* opened a political space. Activity began in western Ukraine and spread to Kyiv as it gained momentum. Throughout, western Ukraine remained the broadest base of support for the national movement. Small protests and a few mass demonstrations in support of Ukrainian independence were organized in western Ukraine and Kyiv. Support for Ukraine's sovereignty was not strong in eastern Ukraine, a fact that was exploited by opponents. By late 1990, earlier enthusiasm for independence was eroded (Subtelny 2000, 575-578).

The declining economic conditions in the Soviet Union which included food shortages, even longer lines, and rising prices encouraged the wider population of Ukraine (including blue-collar workers this time) to be more willing to accept a new alternative. Russians and non-Ukrainians within Ukraine began to support Ukrainian sovereignty if it would improve their living standard. Kravchuk, Communist chairman of Ukraine's parliament, began to show cautious interest in Ukrainian sovereignty (Subtelny 2000, 580-581). On August 24, 1991 after the failed coup against Gorbachev, the

Ukrainian parliament seized the opportunity to declare its independence in a unanimous vote. Independence was declared in Kyiv, relatively unexpectedly and in an atmosphere of relatively low morale and growing apathy among Kyiv residents (Pavlychko 1992b). Independence was won as a result of the decline in power of the Soviet Union rather than actions in Ukraine's capital city (Wilson 1997).²⁰ In the years immediately following independence, western Ukraine, followed by Kyiv, remained the strongest base of nationalist support, although Kyiv lagged significantly behind western Ukraine (Wilson 1997, 135-137). The difficult political, economic, and social transition that began with independence remained the setting for the Ukrainian women's movement in 2002 and 2003.

The varied historical roots of Ukraine's regions created a unique context for each of the three cities included in this study: Kyiv in central Ukraine, the capital, Kharkiv in eastern Ukraine, close to Russia geographically and culturally, and L'viv in western Ukraine, close to Poland geographically and in other ways. The following sections describe the varied local culture and context of each city in 2002 and 2003 that are at least partially the result of their differentiated historical trajectories. First, Kharkiv and L'viv's local cultures and contexts are discussed as the two cities that appear the most different from each other. Kyiv, serving as somewhat of a middle ground between Kharkiv and L'viv, in some respects, and important because of its position as the capital of Ukraine, is discussed last. The table below summarizes the cultural and local contexts of Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv that are discussed in greater detail in the rest of the chapter.

²⁰ Historians often call it independence by default because its causes appeared to be largely external and not a result of the actions of Ukrainians (Reid 1997; Wilson 1997; Wilson 2002).

Table: 3-1 Summary of cultural and local context in each city

<u>Kyiv</u>	<u>Kharkiv</u>	<u>L'viv</u>
-More mixed historical roots: part of Lithuanian, Polish & Russian empires	-Spent modern history as part of Russia	-Most of its modern history under Poland
-Annexed to Soviet Union in 1922	-Annexed to Soviet Union in 1922	-Annexed to Soviet Union in 1939
-More mixed Russian & Ukrainian orientation: speak Russian & Ukrainian, ethnically mixed, not adamantly Ukrainian or anti-Russian	-Russian orientation: speak Russian, choose Russian popular culture, higher proportion of ethnic Russians, disinterest in Ukrainian nationalism & cultural traditions	-Nationalist orientation: speak Ukrainian, ethnically Ukrainian, preserved separate Ukrainian identity & culture
-More mixed association with Russia & Western Europe	-Looks to Russia for economic solutions, close association with Russia	-Associates itself with Western Europe instead of Russia or Eurasia
-Slightly more mixed religiously, generally Orthodox	-More secular orientation	-Higher degree of religiosity & Uniate instead of Orthodox
-Capital city with earlier & greater economic prosperity, more foreign investment, higher standard of living	-Experienced a loss of status associated with educational, scientific & industrial collapse following independence	-More socially conservative than the rest of Ukraine

Kharkiv (eastern Ukraine)

Kharkiv is a large industrial city located in the north east of Ukraine, not far from Russia's western border. With a population of about one and a half million it is Ukraine's second largest city. Like the rest of Ukraine, Kharkiv has fallen on hard times since Ukraine declared its independence in 1991. Kharkiv, however, maintains a distinctive cultural climate which differentiates it from much of the rest of Ukraine. It is the former educational and scientific center of Ukraine, but because of the economic dislocations associated with the transition to an independent Ukraine has lost that status. Perhaps most noticeably, Kharkivites tend to orient themselves towards Russia in terms of their language and culture and are generally uninterested in Ukrainian language and culture.

Russian Orientation

The historical overview at the beginning of the chapter highlights the varied historical roots of the east, central and western regions of Ukraine. Kharkiv, as part of eastern Ukraine, was under Russian and Soviet domination from the mid 1600s until Ukrainian independence in 1991. The ethnic composition, language and cultural orientation of Kharkiv reflect its history and differentiate it culturally from central and western regions of Ukraine.

The ethnic composition and dominant language of the Kharkiv region and eastern Ukraine more generally has been well documented and the subject of debate concerning

the potential of Ukraine to divide along ethno-linguistic lines (Hesli 1995; Hrytsak 2000; Kravchuk and Chudowsky 2005; Liber 1998; Wilson 1997). Data on the ethno-linguistic composition of Ukraine's regions is used by scholars under the assumption that the choice of language is more indicative of national identification than any other indicator (Arel 1995, 169; Hrytsak 2000, 263; Subtelny 2000, 607-609). According to Wilson (1997), eastern Ukraine's population in 1989 from Soviet census data was 36.1% Russian and 59.3% Ukrainian with higher percentages speaking Russian than Ukrainian.²¹ In eastern Ukraine 86.6% spoke Russian and only approximately 13.4% spoke Ukrainian. Thus, in eastern Ukrainian regions, a little over one third of the population is ethnically Russian, but almost more important, linguistically, Russophones, dominate. In contrast, in the more western regions, particularly Galicia (where L'viv is located) 93% of the population is ethnically Ukrainian and 95% speaks Ukrainian. Kyiv, in central Ukraine, was 79.7% ethnically Ukrainian in 1989, but linguistically 54.2% Russian speaking and 45.8% Ukrainian speaking. Wilson used this data to show that even though Ukrainians may numerically dominate in most regions, the linguistic patterns more accurately depict regional differences. In the east and south of Ukraine, Russian cultural traditions tend to dominate, particularly in urban centers. In urban central Ukraine (including Kyiv), Russian language and cultural traditions also prevailed (Wilson 1997, 22-25). Even, following the influx of Ukrainians into urban areas after

²¹ Data on the ethnic composition of Ukraine is Wilson's (1997) own calculations from the 1989 Soviet census data. The linguistic data are Wilson's (1997) own calculations from a series of surveys by Valerii Khmel'ko of Kyiv Mohla Academy from 1991 to 1994. The total sample size was 18,000 throughout the whole of Ukraine (Wilson 1997, 23).

World War II, Ukrainian cities remained culturally Russian, with the exception of western Ukraine (Liber 1998, 197).

The language spoken on the streets of Kharkiv in 2002 and 2003 was still Russian and not Ukrainian which reflects their overall orientation toward Russia. The average person in Kharkiv is comfortable with Russian and rarely uses the Ukrainian language. Even in universities where teaching officially occurs in Ukrainian, students from the Kharkiv National University explained that most lecturers still taught in Russian. These same students said they chose not to take classes from professors who lectured in Ukrainian. One student explained that she once signed up for a class where the professor decided to speak only Ukrainian. She and most other students simply stopped going to class and attended the lectures of another professor teaching the same topic, but in Russian.

Kharkiv University students said they spoke Russian at home as well, and watched Russian TV and listened to Russian music. Since they are so close to the border with Russia they had access to Russian TV stations and usually chose not to watch Ukrainian television shows. Their preference for the Russian language was more than a feeling that Russian was more convenient for them. They were choosing Russian culture over Ukrainian culture in their daily lives. One leader of a women's organization concerned with supporting the arts and a local television personality explained her attitude toward speaking Ukrainian and promoting Ukrainian culture. "I'm just not interested in promoting "Ukrainian" culture. Besides I feel my culture is Russian" (Interview with women's NGO leader, 2/7/2003). Her television show educated people about cultures and places around the world in the Russian language.

Comments, such as the quotation above confirm findings from surveys conducted in the early 1990s that those in eastern Ukraine tend to feel there is little difference between themselves and Russians (Liber 1998, 1999). Kharkivites in 2002-2003 expressed little interest in learning about Ukrainian culture and continued to treat Russian culture as their own. A professor of linguistics in Kharkiv who spends part of her time in Germany and the rest in Russia and Ukraine explained that people in Kharkiv were essentially the same as Russians. She felt that generalizations about Russians applied equally to Ukrainians. Her attitude toward Ukrainian culture was ambivalent at best.

I identify as a Russian. I think in Russian and dream in Russian. I'm not interested in Ukrainian shrines and culture. I know all about those things, but it's not my culture. It does not impact me on an emotional level. My family has a "Ukrainian" history, but I feel that my culture is Russian (Interview with Kharkiv Professor, 2/23/2003).

The linguistics professor further explained that she guest lectured at several universities in Ukraine, including one in L'viv on several occasions. She said she was comfortable in Ukrainian and spoke it without problems when she was in L'viv, but still did not feel like she belonged in L'viv. She claimed that Moscow felt more familiar to her and was more similar to Kharkiv than L'viv. Others in Kharkiv, many of which had never traveled to L'viv or western Ukraine, said they did not want to visit L'viv because of their aggressive attitude towards being Ukrainian. The mentality was too assertively "Ukrainian," and Kharkiv residents felt judged or even looked down upon because they did not speak Ukrainian fluently.

Loss of status: educational, scientific, and industrial collapse

Many in Kharkiv and the rest of Ukraine feel that Kharkiv lost a lot of its status as an important city when Ukraine became independent. Industry, scientific research and education were its primary commodities during the Soviet era. After Moscow and St. Petersburg it was the third most important educational center in the Soviet Union (Hesli 1995, 100; Wanner 1998, 21). A local government official summed up the feelings of many in Kharkiv when she explained what she thought was important to know about Kharkiv's local culture.

Kharkiv is indeed more advanced, because Kharkiv is the scientific center. Here we have a lot of research institutes and colleges which provide people with higher education. Also, Kharkiv is located on the border with Russia. All these factors make Kharkiv a bit different than the other cities of Ukraine (Interview with Kharkiv local government official, 2/20/2003).

Data from Ukraine's state statistics committee partially supports Kharkiv's position as a significant educational center. Table 3-1 below shows the percentage of the population with complete higher education in Kyiv city, the urban areas of Kharkiv and L'viv oblasts. The educational level of Kyiv is over emphasized since the data is only from the city of Kyiv, while data from Kharkiv and L'viv includes all urban areas in the oblasts which under emphasizes their educational levels.

Table: 3-2 Percent of Population with complete higher education

	<u>Kyiv City</u>	<u>Urban Kharkiv Region</u>	<u>Urban L'viv Region</u>
1989	22.4	15.9	15.2
2001	27.1	20.5	19.2

Data based on the 2001 Ukrainian Population Census

The high level of education in the Kharkiv population is credited with facilitating progress in the city in terms of economic advancement (discussed below) (Center for Economic Initiatives 2004).

All educational institutions in independent Ukraine suffer from a severe lack of funding and are generally considered to exist in a state of disarray. Kharkiv is no exception. It still has several major universities and institutes, but the prestige and importance attached to them have diminished. Furthermore, Kyiv has now eclipsed Kharkiv as the educational center of Ukraine with more universities and the most prestigious universities in the country (Education Network of Ukraine 2006; Universities in Kyiv).

Kharkiv also enjoyed high status as a scientific research center in the Soviet Union (Aberg 2005, 290). With the collapse of the Soviet Union, scientists in Kharkiv found themselves unemployed and their cooperative research projects with other Soviet scientists outside Ukraine's borders in jeopardy (Wanner 1998, 21). In addition, much of the scientific research in Kharkiv was connected to the Soviet Union's military industrial complex or other research institutes and industry that were related to the whole Soviet Union. The military industrial complex and administrative central planning units which employed many in Kharkiv ceased to function (Aberg 2005, 289). Kharkiv's scientists had to look for new ways to earn a living. The U.S. government, fearing that Kharkiv's population of displaced scientists with expertise in sensitive military and space technology might choose to sell their services to other nations as a result of their dismal economic situation, decided to provide special economic development assistance to the Kharkiv region (Department of State 1999, 61).

Kharkiv is also important as one of the leading industrial centers in Ukraine. In the Soviet era the Kharkiv region produced up to 6% of mechanical engineering products in the whole USSR. The industry was focused on engineering with factories producing tanks, tractors, agricultural machinery, electrical equipment, steam turbines and some food processing which largely collapsed with the dissolution of the Soviet Union. In the mid-1990s Kharkiv's industrial output was continuing to plummet at a higher rate than the rest of the Ukraine. In 1995 it was still only producing 44% of what it produced in the Soviet era (Lukovyk 1997). Managers of large factories in Kharkiv were forced to search for business partners in the U.S. and elsewhere who might be willing to invest in their formally strategic factories that were struggling to stay in operation in 2001 (U.S.-Ukraine Foundation 2001). Thus, Kharkiv, a city of highly educated people contributing to what was an area of importance in the Soviet era, almost over night became home to a large number of unemployed engineers, scientists and factory workers with skills that were formerly considered strategic to the USSR, but could not earn a living in independent Ukraine.

Furthermore, because of the former importance attached to the work in Kharkiv, residents felt their job loss included a loss of prestige as well. The economic crisis that impacted all of Ukraine felt particularly harsh to Kharkiv residents (O'Laughlin and Bell 1999, 238-239). However, economic reform given some time to work was anticipated to produce better than average improvement in the Kharkiv region (Lukovyk 1997). By 2002 and 2003 Kharkiv was behind Kyiv in terms of economic improvement, but significantly better than much of western Ukraine, including L'viv. Table 3-3 below demonstrates that Kharkiv had higher wage arrears than Kyiv and even L'viv and did not

start to regain its footing until about 2001. Table 3-4 shows a steady increase in wages in the Kharkiv region, as well as Kyiv and L'viv, pointing to its economic recovery.

Kharkiv residents, by 2003, felt their city enjoyed positive economic prospects and that the worst was behind them.

Table 3-3: Wage Arrears by Region, 1997-2003

	<u>1997</u>	<u>1998</u>	<u>1999</u>	<u>2000</u>	<u>2001</u>	<u>2002</u>	<u>2003</u>
Kyiv	104.9	110	144.7	124.4	83.9	46.4	37.3
Kharkiv	295.9	323	416.7	434.1	306.2	139.5	88.9
L'viv	163.6	196.8	273.6	219.5	176.5	114.3	131.5

beginning of year, mln UAH

Source: State Statistics Committee of Ukraine
All Ukrainian Population Census 2001

Table 3-4: Average Monthly Wages by Region (1995-2003) (Wage accruals per pay-roll, UAH)

	<u>1995</u>	<u>1996</u>	<u>1997</u>	<u>1998</u>	<u>1999</u>	<u>2000</u>	<u>2001</u>	<u>2002</u>	<u>2003</u>
Kyiv City	100	177	215	247	303	405	549	643	761
Kharkiv oblast	72	127	149	159	184	230	310	370	455
L'viv oblast	62	107	122	132	152	196	272	339	419

Source: State Statistics Committee of Ukraine
All Ukrainian Population Census 2001

Thus, Kharkiv represents the Russian orientation of eastern Ukrainian regions. It contains a higher percentage of ethnic Russians than Kyiv or L'viv, and Russian remains the dominant language in the region. Its residents do not perceive a significant cultural difference between themselves and Russians. They tend to identify with Russian culture and are not particularly interested in developing a Ukrainian culture. Kharkiv also enjoyed a former status as an educational, research and industrial center in the Soviet Union. It has now been eclipsed by Kyiv as the educational center of Ukraine. Collaborative research projects across borders and funding for scientific research is

minimal in independent Ukraine. Eastern Ukraine, known for its industry, has suffered in the economic transition, but by the beginning of this decade, was finally starting to see improvement.

L'viv

L'viv has been called the most Ukrainian city in Ukraine (Hrytsak 2000, 264; Voznyak 2005). This is so for several reasons. It is home to more ethnic Ukrainians than most areas of the country and one of the few regions where Ukrainian is the language of everyday use. L'viv, Galicia, and much of western Ukraine has traditionally been a hotbed of nationalist sentiment viewing itself as the protector and promoter of the true Ukrainian national identity and cultural traditions. It is also more religious in nature than other areas of Ukraine with most of its church attendees belonging to the Uniate (Greek Catholic) church rather than the Orthodox. Residents claim their greater religiosity contributes to their more socially conservative mentality. The choice of language, support of Ukrainian culture, consistent desire to preserve a Ukrainian identity throughout centuries of statelessness, more religious orientation and social conservatism are all intertwined creating a distinct local culture and context in L'viv.

Nationalism

Within Ukraine, L'viv is known for its national orientation. The brief historical overview at the beginning of the chapter highlights the consistent efforts of western Ukrainians, particularly those in Galicia where L'viv is situated, to maintain a separate Ukrainian identity even under the domination of other empires. They seized opportunities to create their own state in 1918 and 1919, albeit with limited success. Soviet leaders, recognizing the threat of national aspirations of western Ukrainians, through the system of internal passports, work and residency permits made it difficult for Ukrainians from regions with a high level of national consciousness to move to areas with a low level of national consciousness in the hopes of preventing a spread of western Ukrainians' nationalist sentiment (Liber 1998, 197).

Despite Soviet era purges, arrests, deportations, and executions, the desire for an independent Ukrainian state was never completely squelched in L'viv. While most of the rest of Ukraine was not particularly active or involved in the movement for independence, national activists in L'viv were meeting in cafes and universities in the mid 1980s discussing a Ukrainian nation. Students and dissident intellectuals in L'viv began cautiously circulating *Ukrains'kyi Visnyk* (Ukrainian Herald), a samizdat journal, when Viacheslav Chornovil and Mykhailo Horyn' were released from prison. A university student organization called, the Lion Society, was formed in the late 1980s that at first cautiously celebrated long dormant cultural traditions. When the group publicly practiced a Christmas tradition called *vertep* in January 1988, it had a revolutionary religious, national and civic effect for the people of L'viv. Gradually, more and more

suppressed/"lost" cultural traditions were revived for the purpose of creating/reviving a Ukrainian culture that was defiantly Ukrainian. Meetings with Polish activists also helped to encourage Ukrainian activists (Kenney 2005, 305-307).

Others who were not necessarily nationalist activists in L'viv were observing the actions and becoming interested as well. One such formally passive observer decided to establish a society to preserve the Ukrainian language in the factory where he was an engineer. Quickly many other societies similar to the Lion Societies were formed throughout L'viv. Advancing the cause of Ukrainian sovereignty and culture was on the agenda of many of these organizations and at public events which were attracting numbers in the thousands. In L'viv and throughout Galicia, Ukrainians started changing signs from Russian into Ukrainian. The authorities, not perceiving this Ukrainization as a threat, left organizations like the Lion Society and the Taras Shevchenko Language Society alone (Kenney 2005, 308-309; Subtelny 2000, 574-576).

The USSR's election to the Congress of People's Deputies in 1989 was a turning point in L'viv (Kenney 2005, 309). For the first time there were a few multi-candidate races, demonstrating the desire for change rather than creating more trust in political institutions as Gorbachev had hoped. With great effort (because the Communist Party still controlled the nominations) a Lion Society candidate was included on the ballot. The candidate from L'viv, Bratun', was a symbol for the people of L'viv of their independent civic and political participation. L'viv's residents became active in promoting Bratun', and other independent candidates that supported Ukraine's sovereignty. Several independent candidates won and were able to speak publicly about sovereignty and other issues. At public meetings, in L'viv, the Ukrainian blue and

yellow flag was raised, which had previously been disallowed by Soviet authorities, as a reactionary symbol. When no repercussions ensued the Ukrainian flag appeared throughout L'viv and then other areas of Ukraine. The momentum for Rukh grew out of the L'viv demonstrations in the summer of 1988, and many of leading members from L'viv organizations were involved in drafting Rukh's charter. The focus of Rukh naturally centered on Kyiv, the capital. Kenney believes the national oriented actions in L'viv led Kyiv to take action starting in the spring and summer of 1989. The focal point of the movement for independence then moved to Kyiv, but L'viv is credited with spreading the nationalist virus to the rest Ukraine (Kenney 2005, 309-311; Subtelny 2000, 574-576; Voznyak 2005).

In addition to evidence based on the activities of residents of L'viv promoting an independent nation, evidence in the form of referendums in support of independence demonstrate that L'viv and the surrounding Galician region has a higher level of national sentiment than the rest of Ukraine. For instance, in March of 1991 the nationalist vote in the L'viv region was 71%. In Kyiv city, the nationalist vote was 53% and only 22% in the Kharkiv region. In December of 1991, after Ukrainian independence was already declared, a referendum concerning support for independence showed increased support in all regions, but with the same pattern. In L'viv 93% of the total electorate supported independence, 75% in Kyiv city, and 65% in the Kharkiv region (Wilson 1997, 127-129). More recent voting patterns from the presidential race in 2004 (Orange Revolution) reveal a continuing division between west and east Ukraine. Western and central Ukraine voted for Yushchenko, the darling of the nationalists. Eastern Ukrainians supported

Yanukovich, a Russian speaker from Donetsk (eastern Ukraine), and supported by Moscow.

Figure: 3-1. Breakdown of Ukraine's Presidential Vote 2004.



Hrytsak (2000) used evidence from surveys in L'viv and Donetsk (an industrial and mining city in eastern Ukraine) in 1994 and focus group interviews in 1994 and 1996 to show that even after the economic collapse L'vivites continued to exhibit a high level of national consciousness, especially compared to those in eastern Ukraine. In spite of the sharp economic decline following independence L'vivites continued to maintain a high level of support for Ukrainian independence. In contrast, in Donetsk over half the population supported unification with Russia (Hrytsak 2000, 271-272). Residents in L'viv identified themselves first as Ukrainian and then as L'vivites in the surveys. In contrast, residents in Donetsk (eastern Ukraine) chose a Soviet identity for a national identity (Hrytsak 2000, 266-267). Hrytsak's surveys also showed L'viv's residents were

more inclined to accept versions of history propagated by Ukrainian historians while those in Donetsk accepted the version taught by Soviet historians (Hrytsak 2000, 272).

The ethno-linguistic composition of L'viv and the Galician region is also cited as further evidence of the strength of nationalism in L'viv just as the same information is used as evidence for the lack of a Ukrainian national identity in eastern Ukraine (Aberg 2005; Hesli 1995; O'Loughlin and Bell 1999; Wilson 1997). Wilson, using the 1989 Soviet census data for ethnic balance and a series of surveys conducted in Ukraine in the early 1990s demonstrates that Galicia where L'viv is situated was 93% ethnically Ukrainian with 95% of the population linguistically Ukrainian (Wilson 1997, 23). Much of the Ukrainization of L'viv occurred in the post-war era as peasants migrated into L'viv making its ethnic and linguistic make up more homogeneously Ukrainian (Aberg 2005, 285-289; Wilson 1997).

Unlike cities in central, eastern and southern Ukraine, in L'viv the rural residents did not adapt to the urban, Soviet/Russian culture. In L'viv, the peasants brought the Ukrainian countryside into the city. They remained close to the land, their relatives in the countryside, and their traditional Ukrainian peasant customs. On holidays and vacations they did and often still do return to the country to work on the land as a means of providing adequate food for their families. They did not adapt well to the Soviet factory culture, keeping themselves socially and cultural distinct from the Russian population in the city. Aberg claims that L'viv was more homogeneously Ukrainian than other urban areas in Ukraine based on its ethno-linguistic composition, but also because of greater ethnic segregation. Nationalities lived in separate areas of the city, and there was a lower rate of inter-ethnic marriage than other parts of Ukraine. (Kyiv in central Ukraine, Odessa

in southern Ukraine and Donetsk in eastern Ukraine were the comparison cities.) (Aberg 2005, 292-294). Thus, throughout the centuries and still today, L'viv remains a Ukrainian nationally oriented city.

Religion and conservative social climate

Closely tied to L'viv's nationalist orientation is the religious orientation of the city and western Ukraine as a whole (Markus 1984, 59-62). Czaplicka (2005) asserts that religion has remained a central theme throughout L'viv's history, even during the Soviet era (14-22). L'viv is known for being more religious than most areas in Ukraine. Its church affiliation is also distinct because it is primarily Uniate (Greek Catholic) rather than Orthodox. The Uniate church was created in the late 1500s and is a combination of the Catholic and Orthodox churches. The vast majority of its adherents live in western Ukraine, with few Uniate churches outside of the region. In 1991 only 0.3% of its churches were located outside of western Ukraine (Wilson 1997, 87).²² The Uniate church managed to survive throughout the empires often functioning as a Ukrainian national institution that preserved a sense of a separate Ukrainian identity (Markus 1984, 59-62; Wilson 1997; Yelynskyi 2001).

²² Wilson (1997, 91) presents evidence from a 1994 survey of church affiliation in Ukraine. The sample size was 2,123, but 1,235 responded that they were not religious or did not identify themselves with any particular church. Based on the survey data, Western Ukrainians who affiliated themselves with a church were mostly Uniate with a significant percent Ukrainian Orthodox (Kyiv Patriarchate). The area labeled Kyiv/Right Bank was largely Ukrainian Orthodox (Kyiv Patriarchate). Eastern Ukraine was Ukrainian Orthodox (Moscow Patriarchate)/Russian Orthodox with a fair number of Ukrainian Orthodox (Kyiv Patriarchate) as well.

In the late 1940s the Uniate church was forced to dissolve, but still maintained an underground network and support of some nominally “Orthodox” priests (Markus 1984, 62,69-72; Wilson 1997, 61). It was revived, in L’viv, in 1982, and a mass rally of 150,000 in 1989 resulted in its re-legalization by Soviet authorities (Wilson 1997, 86). Thus, for western Ukrainians the Uniate church is a religious institution, and an integral element of Ukrainian culture, and their way of life. In the eastern regions of Ukraine religious institutions do not serve this function (Yelynskyi 2001).

Furthermore L’viv residents claim to be more religious than other parts of Ukraine, particularly eastern Ukraine. Data on the number of religious organizations in Ukraine shows that the L’viv region contains significantly more religious organizations than Kyiv or Kharkiv. Statistics, from the National Committee on Religious Matters of Ukraine (January 2001), show that in the L’viv region there were a total of 2,765 religious organizations. In Kyiv city, 663 religious organizations existed in January of 2001, and in the Kharkiv region only 490 religious organizations existed (Yelynskyi 2001). Sociological research conducted in Ukraine has shown that those who identify themselves as Orthodox and then choose either the Kyiv Patriarchate or the Moscow Patriarchate are quite often only nominally so or non-practicing. Their choice of Kyiv or Moscow patriarchate is more a choice of identity as either Ukrainian or Russian rather than religious behavior. Further, surveys measuring the percent of the population associated with the Orthodox Church tend to over represent its strength in Ukraine. For instance, a survey conducted by the Center for Democratic Initiatives in Ukraine showed that 12.2% of respondents in Donetsk belonged to the Russian Orthodox Church even though there were no Russian Orthodox churches in Donetsk (Yelynskyi 2001).

Evidence in support of the greater religiosity of L'vivites can also be found in the 1999 World Values Survey which asked respondents how important God was in their lives on a scale of one to ten. In the total sample, 23.3% ranked God as very important in their lives.²³ In the L'viv region, 56.4% ranked God as very important, while in Kyiv and Kharkiv respectively only 31.2% and 19.3% ranked God as very important. When asked whether the church provided adequate answers to social problems, 60.3% in the L'viv region responded positively while only 33.4% in the Kharkiv region and 22% in Kyiv city responded that the church provided adequate answers to social problems. The significantly higher number of religious organizations in L'viv than either Kyiv or Kharkiv, and more important position of religion and God in the lives of L'viv residents than those in Kyiv or Kharkiv points to a greater amount of religiosity in L'viv.

L'viv residents and those from other regions of Ukraine claim that because L'viv is more religious, it has a more socially conservative environment than the rest of Ukraine. Again, the 1999 World Values Survey in Ukraine lends some support to this assertion. When asked about socially justifiable actions, a higher percentage in L'viv than either Kyiv or Kharkiv responded that abortion and divorce were never justifiable. In L'viv 55.5% responded that abortion was never justifiable. In Kyiv city 31.3% believed it was never justifiable, and in Kharkiv 25.9% believed it was never justifiable. Again, in L'viv 40.6% responded that divorce was never justifiable while only 15% in both Kyiv city and Kharkiv believed it was never justifiable. The World Values Survey

²³ The World Values Survey (1999) sample is representative for all of Ukraine, but not at the regional level. Unfortunately, no similar attitudinal data was found for the local level for Ukraine, making this the best available. The sample size for each region was relatively small. The total sample consists of 1195 respondents with 61 interviews in Kyiv city, 68 in the Kharkiv region and 70 in the L'viv region.

(1999) also asked respondents “If a woman wants to have a child as a single parent but she doesn't want to have a stable relationship with a man, do you approve or disapprove?” In L’viv, 55.5% disapproved. In Kharkiv, 43.9% of respondents disapproved, and in Kyiv city only 30% disapproved. Those in L’viv also exhibited a more conservative attitude towards women’s economic role. Almost 40% of respondents in L’viv agreed with the statement, “When jobs are scarce, men should have more right to a job than women.” In the Kharkiv region, 29.3% of respondents agreed with the statement and only 22.5% agreed in Kyiv city. Based on 1999 World Values Survey responses, L’viv respondents tend to be more socially conservative than the other two cities included in the study.

The more socially conservative attitude in L’viv compared to the rest of Ukraine has implications for gender relations. Traditional gender stereotypes are held by most Ukrainians, but L’viv residents and Ukrainians outside of L’viv claim that gender stereotypes are more strongly held in L’viv as a result of its greater social conservatism. This implies that L’viv residents may be less likely to challenge existing gender roles and less likely to desire changes in traditional relationships between men and women. Data on divorce rates from the 2001 all Ukrainian census supports this assertion. The 2001 Ukrainian census revealed that a lower proportion of the population was divorced in L’viv than in Kyiv and Kharkiv. In L’viv only 6.9% of those 15 and over were divorced compared to 12.9% in Kyiv and 11.9% in Kharkiv (State Statistics Committee of Ukraine, 2003-2004). Results from a survey conducted in Ukraine in 2007 by the Eurequal project lend support to this assertion as well.²⁴ Respondents were asked to what

²⁴ I would like to thank Stephen Whitefield for providing results from a Ukrainian survey conducted in 2007 as part of the EC FP6-funded project ‘Eurequal: Social Inequality and Why it Matters for the Economic and Democratic Development of Europe and its Citizens: Post-Communist Central and Eastern Europe in Comparative Perspective.’ This survey is a nationally representative survey, and the results are not intended to be representative at the regional level. No similar representative data was found at the local

degree they agreed with the following statement. “Men ought to do a larger share of childcare than they do now.” While a majority of respondents in all three cities agreed men should do more childcare than they do now, a lower proportion of respondents in L’viv strongly agreed and agreed with the statement. In L’viv, 68.6% of respondents strongly agreed and agreed, while in Kyiv and Kharkiv respectively 96.5% and 81.4% agreed that men ought to do a greater share of childcare. Respondents were also asked to what degree they agreed that, “A man’s job is to earn money; a woman’s job is to look after the home and family.” In L’viv 60.2% of respondents strongly agreed and agreed with the previous statement, while only 22.7% strongly agreed and agreed in Kharkiv. Respondents were also asked the degree to which they agreed that, “Both the man and the woman should contribute to the household income.” Again, most respondents felt that both should contribute, but a lower proportion of the L’viv respondents strongly agreed and agreed compared to those in Kyiv and Kharkiv. In L’viv, 74.3% agreed, while in Kyiv and Kharkiv respectively 93% and 85.6% agreed both the man and the woman should contribute to the household income. Based on the preceding survey results, L’viv residents are less willing to challenge traditional gender roles than residents of Kyiv and Kharkiv.

Western Orientation

The religious affiliation of L'viv and western Ukraine is closer to Western Catholicism than Orthodoxy, and in general L'viv residents feel they are more a part of Western Europe than Russia or Eastern Europe. While many in eastern Ukraine sought closer ties with Russia as an answer to their economic problems, those in L'viv looked to the West and the European Union. L'vivites claim to have a more Westward orientation than much of the rest of Ukraine, particularly eastern Ukraine (Voznyak 2005).

Taras Voznyak, editor of the online cultural journal, *Yi*, in L'viv, wrote a lengthy article explaining that L'viv belongs to Western Europe (2005). Voznyak advocates that L'viv should be the center of the new "Ukrainian idea" which would demonstrate to Ukraine and Europe that Ukraine belongs to Europe and not Eurasia. L'viv would serve as a pro-European lobbyist for Ukraine. It has the potential to be the place that convinces Europeans of the European quality of Ukraine because pro-European projects and ideas develop in L'viv (Voznyak 2005).

Surveys contrasting L'viv and Donetsk (an eastern Ukrainian city) in the early 1990s show that those in L'viv tend to identify more with the West than Russia or Eurasia, lending support to the opinions expressed by Voznyak above (Hrytsak 2000; Liber 1998). When asked to choose an identity, 38.1% of respondents in L'viv chose Westerner. In contrast, in Donetsk, Westerner was not included in the top ten preferred identities (Hrytsak 2000, 267). A majority of L'viv respondents (52.8%) considered Ukraine a part of the West, and only 5.4% saw Ukraine becoming part of a larger

federation with Russia. Almost half (49%) of L'viv respondents said they listened to Western radio compared to 15% in Donetsk (Liber 1998, 201-202).

Thus, L'viv differentiates itself from Kharkiv, in particular, and also Kyiv by its long history of protecting and promoting a Ukrainian national identity. Residents in independent Ukraine still feel they have to struggle for an independent Ukrainian identity against an encroaching Russian state and culture. They are also more homogeneously ethnically Ukrainian than other areas of Ukraine and speak predominately Ukrainian. L'viv's Uniate Church also distinguishes it from most of the rest of Ukraine. It is also home to a substantially greater number of churches than other areas of Ukraine, particularly eastern Ukraine. L'viv residents claim that their greater religiosity has created a more socially conservative climate than other areas of Ukraine that is less willing to challenge gender roles. This is supported by data from the World Values Survey and the Eurequal project. Lastly, L'viv has a Westward orientation as opposed to Russian or Eurasian orientation.

Kyiv

Kyiv also enjoys a specific local culture and context. Kharkiv is known for its strong Russian orientation and L'viv its Ukrainian nationalism and Western orientation. Kyiv, located in the center of the country has somewhat of a nationalist orientation, although not to the extent found in L'viv, and a largely Russian speaking population. Ukrainian, Polish and Russian have each at times been the dominant language in Kyiv as

part of its long history of a city containing multiple nationalities and cultures (Hamm 1993).

Mixed Historical Roots

Located in central Ukraine, Kyiv was the center of Kievan Rus dating back to the 8th and 9th centuries. In the partitioning of the lands of Ukraine throughout the centuries Kyiv fell under Lithuanian and then Polish rule. It was a center of Orthodoxy in the early 1600s. By the mid 1600s it came under Russian rule as a result of Bohdan Khmel'nys'kyi's (1654) alliance with Moscow. It remained under Russian domination until Ukraine declared its independence in 1991 (Reid 1997, 1-23; Wilson 1997, 1-21, 195-196).

The Russian state under Tsar Nicholas I exerted pressure on Kyiv to create a "Russian" population, making Russian the language of education and administration. However, in the 1830s Kyiv was a site of Polish national activity. Despite Russia's efforts, in the late 1800s the city was still home to Germans, Poles, Jews, Turks and visiting Tatars, Chinese, and pilgrims coming to the cave monastery. In the mid 1800s Kyiv was the center of a small Ukrainian national movement that resulted in increased efforts by Russia to squelch the use of the Ukrainian language in the city. These events were really at the periphery of events occurring in the city, but Kyiv did remain the center of the Ukrainian national movement in the Russian empire.

On the whole, Kyiv was a Russian city at the turn of the century. Even some of the Ukrainian parties advocating Ukrainian autonomy did so using the Russian language.

The small nationalist movement enjoyed little support (Hamm 1993, 223-227). In 1917, Kyiv was still dominated by the Russian intelligentsia with less than a quarter of the population ethnically Ukrainian (Wilson 1997, 20).

From 1918 through 1919 there were brief, unsuccessful attempts at the creation of an independent state. In the 1930s, Kyiv's elite suffered along with the rest of the Ukrainian intelligentsia in Stalin's purges. During the Soviet era Kyiv came to be dominated by ethnic Ukrainians although Russian language and culture continued to prevail in the city, in part because the administration was in Russian. In the 1960s there was national dissent in Kyiv, but it never managed to spread outside the city to the surrounding countryside (Wilson 1997, 196). The roots of Ukraine's movement for independence in the late 1980s did not start in Kyiv, but as it became more political some of the focus naturally shifted to Kyiv (Kenney 2005, 311-313).

Support for Independence

In early 1989 Rukh was formed in Kyiv and was comprised of well known writers and scholars. By September 1989 it held its first congress with approximately 280,000 members and was continuing to gain popularity. Rukh's platform included Ukrainian sovereignty, Ukrainian culture and language, ecological concerns and support for democratization. It was an inclusive movement that was not primarily nationalistic and included Russians, Jews and members of other ethnic groups. It did, however, pose a challenge to the Communist party. In Kyiv the intelligentsia was its support base, with broader support in western Ukraine. Rukh made use of mass demonstrations following

L'viv's example. The largest organized demonstration was a human chain from Kyiv to L'viv on January 19, 1990 commemorating the union (albeit unsuccessful) of the West Ukrainian People's Republic and the Ukrainian People's Republic in 1919 (Subtelny 2000, 575-576).

As in L'viv, the election to the Congress of People's Deputies in 1989 was a turning point in Kyiv. Democratic Bloc members won seats (although not as many from the Kyiv region as in western Ukraine), creating a challenge to the Communist party. Taking advantage of Communist party confusion, the Democratic Bloc pushed through a declaration of Ukrainian sovereignty on July 16, 1990. Small protests continued to occur in Kyiv, such as hunger strikes by students, although the Communist establishment sometimes decided to clamp down on demonstrations. Rukh also experienced internal disagreements and lost some momentum as many other weakly organized political parties began to appear (Subtelny 2000, 575-578). Morale and enthusiasm for independence had declined in Kyiv by the fall of 1991, but the failed coup attempt in Moscow motivated the parliament to rather unexpectedly declare Ukraine's independence (Pavlychko 1992b). Kyiv continued to be a base of national support, although not to the same extent as L'viv and western Ukraine (Wilson 1997, 135-137).

Mixed Ukrainian and Russian orientation

The above brief historical overview of Kyiv's more recent history and activity in the city around the time of independence is intended to highlight what makes Kyiv culturally distinct at the local level compared to Kharkiv and L'viv. Kyiv, unlike L'viv,

does not immediately strike visitors as a city that is striving to be distinctly Ukrainian. Its history of centuries of Polish rule followed by centuries of Russian rule have created a city that is neither predominately Russian oriented nor a Ukrainian city (Reid 1997, 16-17).

Ethno-linguistic data shows the mix of Russian and Ukrainian elements in the city. While Ukrainians dominated numerically, more than half of the population was Russian speaking in 1989 (Wilson 1997, 23). Russian and Ukrainian are the languages tracked in surveys, but *surzhyk*, the mix between Russian and Ukrainian is heard throughout the city. The ethnic background of residents is often mixed, with one parent or grandparent from Russia and another from Ukraine. Ukrainians raised in Russia and Russians raised in Ukraine make up the population. The city is home to several Orthodox cathedrals and monasteries along with a Catholic cathedral. The hammer and sickle can still be seen on buildings in the down town area (Reid 1997, 16-18). Some streets have been given Ukrainian names, but for convenience most people use the Russian names. Parents are choosing to send their children to Ukrainian, rather than Russian schools, although teachers at Ukrainian schools still often prefer to teach in Russian. Most Kyiv residents are not offended by Russian speakers as in L'viv, and many can converse comfortably in Ukrainian.

Thus, Kyiv represents a middle ground between Kharkiv with its strong Russian orientation and L'viv with its passionately Ukrainian orientation. It is not adamantly Ukrainian, like L'viv, nor predominately pro-Russian, like Kharkiv. In Kyiv there is a constant blending of Russian and Ukrainian cultures and languages. Its residents are not loyal promoters of Ukrainian culture nor do they despise Russia.

Economic context and capital city

Kyiv's local context is also distinct because of its position as the capital city. It is home to the institutions of national government, foreign embassies, the largest airport, and more foreign investment than either Kharkiv or L'viv or any other city in Ukraine. As many a Ukrainian will point out, since Kyiv is the capital more money circulates in Kyiv than the rest of Ukraine. Visitors to multiple cities in Ukraine will easily observe that Kyiv does enjoy greater economic prosperity than the rest of Ukraine with more expensive retail stores in the downtown area and expensive new apartment buildings. However, the city did not escape the economic crisis that followed the transition (Reid 1997, 1-4). For instance, the job loss in state sector employment in 1992 and 1993 in the Kyiv region was 20.9%. In Kharkiv it was 29.3% and 16.8% in L'viv (Kravchuk and Chudowsky 2005, 160).

Yet, signs of recovery were evidenced first in Kyiv with other regions following at a slower rate. Regional economic data for Ukraine shows that incomes are higher in Kyiv than Kharkiv and L'viv. In 1995 the average monthly wage in Kyiv was 100 UAH, 72 UAH in Kharkiv and 62 UAH in L'viv. In 2003 the average monthly wage in Kyiv was 761 UAH compared to 455 UAH and 419 UAH in Kharkiv and L'viv respectively. Table 3, earlier in the chapter, shows a consistent increase in wages across the three cities, but a faster increase in Kyiv than either Kharkiv or L'viv. As the capital, Kyiv also enjoys more foreign investment than the rest of Ukraine. Almost 30% of foreign investment in Ukraine is in Kyiv (Center for Economic Initiatives, 2004).

With higher incomes and more foreign investment comes a higher standard of living in Kyiv. For instance, Kyiv city has more telephone lines per person than the rest of the country. In Kyiv there are 64 telephone lines per 1000 families, and the average for the whole of Ukraine is 35 lines per 1000 persons (Center for Economic Initiatives, 2004). In most regions of the city there is electricity and running water 24 hours a day, with infrequent absences of hot water. In contrast, the city of L'viv in 2002-2003 only had running water from six to nine in the morning and evening. Water and electricity in the city of Kharkiv in 2002-2003 might shut off at any time and return at any time, although in general electricity was available. Kharkiv residents reported that this was an improvement over just a few years earlier when the electricity was available only a few hours a day, and those hours were often between two and four in the morning. In 2002, an underground Western style shopping mall opened in downtown Kyiv. Kyiv residents could be found shopping in the expensive stores and eating in its food court. Several Western style restaurants had also opened in Kyiv. Thus, Kyiv benefits from its position as the capital city with earlier and greater economic improvement than the whole of Ukraine and in comparison to Kharkiv and L'viv.

Kyiv, largely as a result of its status as the capital city, enjoys greater economic prosperity than either Kharkiv or L'viv. Higher amounts of foreign investment have created a city with more Western amenities and a higher standard of living than the rest of Ukraine. Its historical roots are more mixed than either Kharkiv or L'viv. Historically, it has evidenced mild support for Ukrainian nationalism, but it has never been the focal point of the city as in L'viv. The medium level of support for independence in Kyiv demonstrates its more moderate position as well.

Relevance

The purpose of this chapter is to lay out the cultural and local context unique to Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv. Based on the differences between the cities, the content and resonance of frames are expected to vary by city. Local culture and context provides a setting within which frames are interpreted by their target audiences. As we shall see in future chapters, depending on local cultural and contextual differences, the same frame may not resonate equally throughout all regions of Ukraine. The local cultures and contexts of Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv offer varied opportunities and constraints to social movement activists which can lead to variations in the construction of the same frame across cities and different outcomes for women's NGOs in each city.

The next three chapters examine the three primary frames used in the Ukrainian women's movement in 2002 and 2003, that of nationalism, gender discrimination, and the economic crisis. As Ukrainian women activists, sensitive to their locality, construct frames, they are expected to draw on specific components of the culture and context unique to their city. Based on the preceding discussion of cultural context in each city, the framing of nationalism, gender discrimination, and the economic crisis will vary regionally, as will their resonance with their local target populations. More specifically, women's activists in Kharkiv are not expected to emphasize Ukrainian nationalism, while those in L'viv will likely draw on their city's long history of fighting for a Ukrainian nation. Kyiv women activists using the nationalism frame may draw on the city's capital context. When the frame is used in L'viv it may be associated with more favorable outcomes than when it is used in Kyiv and particularly Kharkiv. Women's activists in

Kyiv and Kharkiv are expected to be more willing to address gender issues than those in L'viv. The gender discrimination frame will probably enjoy less popularity in L'viv compared to Kyiv and Kharkiv. Frames challenging traditional gender roles are less likely to produce desired outcomes in L'viv compared to Kyiv and Kharkiv as well. The economic crisis frame is expected to be used widely overall, but more so in Kharkiv and L'viv than Kyiv, which experienced earlier and greater economic recovery. Thus, the content of frames and outcomes associated with frames are expected to vary by city in conjunction with aspects of each city's local culture and context.

Chapter 4

Nationalism Framing

The nationalism frame was one of the three most commonly used frames among women's NGO leaders in 2002 and 2003. This chapter analyzes the construction of the nationalism frame in Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv, highlighting the similarities and differences in its construction in each city and the influence of local culture and context on framing activities. The degree to which women's NGOs using the nationalism frame were able to maintain their organizations and sustain campaigns is also examined. The influence of local context is also included in the analysis of outcomes.

The nationalism frame enjoys a pre-independence history in women's organizing in Ukraine. Women's organizations using the nationalism frame in Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv were working to create what one Kyiv nationalism activist called a Ukrainian Ukraine. A Ukraine in which its population spoke Ukrainian as a first language was considered essential to a Ukrainian Ukraine. Reviving the nation's spirituality, along with creating a love of its history and cultural traditions were also necessary for Ukraine to be a truly independent state, free from Russian domination. In L'viv the nationalism frame included a revival of western Ukrainian culture as opposed to reviving Ukrainian culture generally. The national revival was not going as smoothly as had been hoped, creating disillusionment among women's nationalist activists in L'viv. Women's relationship to nationalism was discussed by women activists using the nationalism frame. Women activists in Kyiv and Kharkiv nationalism oriented NGOs believed a

more equal role for women in society and politics was part of the process of becoming a great democratic Ukrainian nation. Greater gender equality was included in national revival. In contrast, women's activists using the nationalism frame in L'viv emphasized the role of women in families as transmitters and protectors of culture and therefore the nation.

Table: 4-1 Summary of similarities and differences across cities in the construction of the nationalism frame

Similarities in emphasis across cities

-Emphasis on building an independent Ukrainian Ukraine with revival of its language, cultural traditions and history

Variations in nationalism frame by city

<u>Kyiv</u>	<u>Kharkiv</u>	<u>L'viv</u>
-Emphasis on statehood & sovereignty issues		
-Revival of non-region specific cultural traditions	-Revival of non-region specific cultural traditions	-Revival of western Ukrainian cultural traditions
-Revival of Ukrainian religion & spirituality		-Revival of Ukrainian religion & spirituality
		-Disillusionment with high level of corruption
-More equal role for women in politics & society	-More equal role for women in politics and society	-Role of mothers as preservers of nation through family life
		-Critique of the use of nationalism by gender researchers

Gender was not included in L'viv's discussions of nationalism. Variations in the content of nationalism existed across Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv; nevertheless it was associated with a high degree of organizational maintenance and the ability to sustain campaigns in all three cities. The above table lays out the similarities and differences in the construction of the frame in each city summarized above and outcomes associated with NGOs using the nationalism frame.

Among the three most common frames used by the sample of women's NGOs, nationalism was used the least frequently in the three cities. A total of nine NGOs from the sample of 49 organizations used the nationalism theme. The L'viv sample contained the highest percentage of NGOs using nationalism as a frame. One third (4 of 12) of the organizations studied in L'viv included nationalism in their frames. This was the expected outcome since L'viv is situated in western Ukraine, known for its long history of fighting for an independent Ukraine. In Kyiv, a certain amount of interest in nationalism was expected because of its position as the capital. Four out of a sample of 24 NGOs (17%) in Kyiv used the nationalism frame. In Kharkiv, a Russian oriented city, very little interest in nationalism was anticipated and very little was found. Only one out of a sample of 13 (8%) NGOs used the nationalism frame. The lone organization using the nationalism frame was founded more recently, in 2000.

The sample of nine women's NGOs using the nationalism frame can be divided into two groups; those that existed in the pre-war era and those that formed shortly before or after Ukrainian independence in 1991. Soyuz Ukrainok (Ukrainian National Women's League) and Zhinocha Hromada (Women's Community) had a history dating to the late 1880s until the Soviet era. Particularly in western Ukraine, Soyuz Ukrainok played an

active role in the community, working to foster a national consciousness and engaging in community work. Zhinocha Hromada also promoted Ukrainian culture, nationalism and community projects that focused on needy women and children. When the restrictions on independent group activity were relaxed by the Soviet government in 1989, Soyuz Ukrainok and Zhinocha Hromada revived their organizations. Soyuz Ukrainok and Zhinocha Hromada both had branches of their organizations in Kyiv and L'viv.²⁵ The rest of the organizations were formed shortly before or after Ukrainian independence in 1991. The League of Ukrainian Women in Kyiv was formed after independence as was the Olena Teliha Society. The Olena Teliha Society²⁶ had branches in Kyiv, Kharkiv, and L'viv. The Association of Olha Basarab²⁷ in L'viv was formed shortly before independence. Thus the sample of women's nationalism NGOs includes nine organizations with Soyuz Ukrainok and Zhinocha Hromada enjoying a history prior to Ukrainian independence.

The following sections elaborate on activists' framing of what was necessary for a Ukrainian nation. First the similarities in nationalisms across the three cities are discussed. In all three cities the revival of the Ukrainian language and Ukrainian cultural traditions were considered essential to the creation of a Ukrainian Ukraine. Next an

²⁵ A branch of Zhinocha Hromada (Women's Community) existed in Kharkiv at the time of the study, but did not use the nationalism frame. It was founded in 1996 and had no connection to the pre-war Zhinocha Hromadas or nationalism. It is discussed in the gender discrimination chapter.

²⁶ Olena Teliha, born in 1906, was a female Ukrainian poet who was killed by the Nazis in 1942 and buried in Babi Yar, a famous mass grave in Kyiv. She was an activist for the Ukrainian nation, language and literature. In her own poetry she gave special attention to the portrayal of Ukrainian women and the Ukrainian nation.

²⁷ Olha Basarab, born in 1899, was a western Ukrainian civic and political activist. She did charitable and educational work as well as military work in L'viv. She was arrested and tortured to death by the Polish police on the night of February 12-13 1924 for her involvement in the Ukrainian Military Organization. She is considered a martyr for her country.

analysis of the differences between cities which includes differing views of the relationship of women to nationalism. Lastly, the relationship between success and the nationalism frame is explored.

Similarities in Nationalism: A Ukrainian Ukraine

Organizations concerned with nationalism varied slightly from each other in their emphasis, but certain similarities across the cities became apparent in interviews with women's NGO leaders. Below is a discussion of similarities from activists' description of a Ukrainian nation. An independent state was not all these women intended when they talked about building a Ukrainian nation, it was a bare minimum. Ukraine had to become a distinctly Ukrainian nation.

Language

Language, for many activists in these organizations, was a definitive feature of Ukraine and one they felt was threatened because of the high proportion of Russian speakers in Ukraine. Activists from all organizations using the nationalism frame expressed differing degrees of resentment concerning the perceived dominance of the Russian language and therefore, Russia over Ukraine as illustrated by the following quotation from the leader of the Kyiv branch of Soyuz Ukrainok.

We have long realized that for a very long period of time the Ukrainian language was either greatly limited or even forbidden. I remember when I first came to Kyiv as a girl from the Chernihiv province. I was greatly surprised that all programs and curriculums were being transferred into Russian. Back then I was

wondering how and why that could be, but such was policy at that time – the genocide policy. There has always been this pressure and dominance of the Russian language over Ukrainian (Interview with NGO leader, 7/01/2003).

Kyiv and Kharkiv activists discussed the language issue at greater length than those in L'viv probably because most people in L'viv already spoke Ukrainian. Activists in Kyiv and Kharkiv repeatedly emphasized that if the nation was Ukrainian its people had to speak its native language.

In the first years after independence Soyuz Ukrainok in Kyiv made the language issue one of their highest priorities. They spoke at Rada hearings and wrote many letters in an effort to ensure the constitution declared Ukrainian, and only Ukrainian, the official language (Interview with women's NGO leader, 7/01/2003).

Even though Ukrainian was declared the official language, activists from Kyiv and Kharkiv organizations were disturbed that large sectors of the population continued to speak Russian. For instance, members of League of Ukrainian Women in Kyiv monitored the lecture halls and corridors of Kyiv universities listening to the languages spoken by professors and students. Based on their observations, in which they heard primarily Russian, they concluded that Ukraine still lived under Russian supremacy because its residents spoke more Russian than Ukrainian. As a demonstration of their commitment to the Ukrainian language, League of Ukrainian Women in Kyiv held a yearly vigil outside the presidential palace protesting the government's unwillingness to uphold the constitution (Interview with women's NGO volunteer, 6/30/2003). The leader of the Olena Teliha Society in Kyiv explained that choosing to speak Russian over Ukrainian was viewed as a significant problem because it was a sign that people did not

know their own country or care to know its rich cultural traditions. It also showed that Ukrainians preferred to remain under Russian domination (Public speech, Kyiv, 6/28/2003).

In Kharkiv activists with the Olena Teliha Society also believed that speaking the Ukrainian language was essential to being Ukrainian. The leader of The Olena Teliha Society in Kharkiv founded the organization largely because she was distressed by the absence of national sentiment in Kharkiv. The choice, by most of the population in Kharkiv, to continue speaking Russian instead of learning Ukrainian demonstrated Kharkiv's lack of interest in creating a distinctly Ukrainian state.

Very few of the women's organizations are involved in development of Ukrainian culture, the Ukrainian language and Ukrainian traditions. I liked this organization especially because its priorities are the development and propaganda of Ukrainian traditions and the Ukrainian language. It's a big problem in this country and in this city in particular, because for some reason everybody says we are to support the Russian language, although everybody speaks Russian anyway. But Ukrainian has status as the official language, yet no one speaks it (Interview with women's NGO leader, 2/20/2003).

Many of the members of the Olena Teliha Society in Kharkiv lectured at universities. They supported the Ukrainian language by giving their lectures in Ukrainian rather than Russian even though most university instructors in Kharkiv continued to lecture in Russian. These activists believed that by speaking Ukrainian to their students they were spreading Ukrainian culture.

L'viv women's organizations using the nationalism frame also believed speaking the language was essential to building a Ukrainian nation. Most people in L'viv already spoke Ukrainian. For this reason, activists involved with Soyuz Ukrainok in L'viv chose to focus some of their efforts on the military. The military was russified in the Soviet era,

and the Ukrainian military continued to operate largely in Russian rather than Ukrainian. In an effort to spread Ukrainian language and culture among military personnel living in the L'viv region Soyuz Ukrainok began a program to teach military families the Ukrainian language.

Our women work in schools at military bases because in our military bases children are very Russian-oriented, and they can't speak Ukrainian. We have to turn their faces towards Ukraine. It is a Ukrainian army after all, not Russian. A person who speaks a language which is not official in this country believes he/she serves the country of the language he/she speaks (Interview with NGO activist, 5/23/2003).

The above quotation highlights two themes that were common in all three cities in discussions of the importance of speaking the Ukrainian language. Building a Ukrainian nation involved throwing off Russian domination and becoming a distinctly Ukrainian nation. Organizations using the nationalism frame were concerned that independent Ukraine still behaved as if it were under Russian domination. Even the military spoke Russian which to these activists meant they preferred to serve Russia rather than Ukraine. Unwillingness to speak Ukrainian also signified a lack of interest in learning about Ukraine and therefore, a lack of devotion to the Ukrainian nation.

Revive spirituality, history, and cultural traditions

Building a Ukrainian nation included much more than speaking the Ukrainian language. Nationalism also meant the people needed to know their own traditions, history, literature, music and religion. For example, an activist with the Olena Teliha Society in L'viv explained that the national idea meant, "inform(ing) people that without

Ukrainian language and Ukrainian culture and without knowledge of history, we cannot have our own country (Interview with women's NGO activist, 4/11/2003). All cities emphasized cultural traditions, history, literature and music. Ukrainian spirituality, vaguely defined, was also discussed by some activists in Kyiv and L'viv. Activists believed that if people observed their Ukrainian traditions and learned its culture they would come to see their country as much more than a geographic territory. A key to creating the Ukrainian Ukraine was fostering a love of Ukrainian culture in the population which would then become patriotic Ukrainian citizens rather than ambivalent citizens. The youth, the future of Ukraine, were given special attention. Their generation had the opportunity to learn about Ukraine's history, cultural traditions and religion.

Spirituality

Religion was highly restricted during the Soviet era, and largely discouraged. The importance of religion and spirituality was not as strongly emphasized as other cultural traditions in the nationalism frame. For instance, it was not discussed at all in Kharkiv. Those that did discuss it in Kyiv and L'viv felt it was central to reviving the nation. One activist from Soyuz Ukrainok in Kyiv felt so much of what was Ukrainian (in terms of their culture) was either forbidden or repressed during the Soviet era that Ukrainians were now lacking in the ability to appreciate things spiritual and matters beyond immediate material interest. One of their goals was to restore the spirituality of the people in hopes of contributing to Ukrainian's revival.

First of all, we are striving to return the lost spirituality which was lost during the many years of the Soviet system. The church was forbidden during those years,

the literature was forbidden, our masters of Ukrainian art, literature and culture were prohibited (Interview with women's NGO activist, 5/23/2003).

A Ukrainian Ukraine was not a material goal, and therefore, one this activist believed most Ukrainians would have no interest in unless they could recover their spirituality.

In L'viv, activists with the Association of Olha Basarab and Soyuz Ukrainok also spoke of the need to revive Ukraine's spirituality/religion. The leader of Soyuz Ukrainok in L'viv believed that religion was central to the Ukrainian national identity. Nearly every family used to observe religious traditions that held them together. Its absence was eroding families and with it the national morality. The head of the Association of Olha Basarab in L'viv was concerned primarily with the youth and their lack of religion. She felt they were interested only in material possessions, drinking or using drugs. They were becoming hooligans en masse rather than patriotic Ukrainian citizens in part because of their lack of spirituality. She prayed for "God's mercy to be poured out upon the youth" (Interview with women's NGO leader, 3/18/2003). A young generation concerned with religion would be able to see beyond material possessions and more concerned with creating a Ukrainian Ukraine. They would be enabled to appreciate their cultural and historical heritage more fully if they could also appreciate their spiritual heritage.

The only organization in Kharkiv using the nationalism frame did not discuss spirituality or religion and its connection to nationalism.

History and cultural traditions

In addition to language and religion, activists from these organizations desired that Ukrainians know and love their history and cultural traditions. This tended to be the main focus of the activities for these NGOs in all three cities. They wanted Ukrainians not to know just a few traditional folk songs and dances, but to appreciate who they were as a nation, in part by knowing where and what they came from. The following discussion of history and cultural traditions will address each city individually.

Kyiv

Activists in all three cities hoped everyone, especially the younger generation, would love their land and take pride in their culture. To this end, each year Soyuz Ukrainok in Kyiv held a nationwide competition called “My Native Land.” Its goal was to foster a love and knowledge of Ukraine among the youth. Participants could write scientific or investigative research about Ukrainian literature, geological or ecological topics in Ukraine. They could write histories of individual towns, districts, schools or community organizations. Biographies or accounts of heroic deeds, especially of women fighters were encouraged. Written genealogies of relatives and natives of their own town as well as regional ethnographic or native craft developments were also included in the competition. The awards ceremony held in Kyiv incorporated speeches full of praise for the participants, bandura²⁸ performance, poetry recitations and traditional folk songs.

²⁸ The bandura is a traditional Ukrainian instrument that many associate with Ukrainian folk traditions.

Participants were usually dressed in brightly colored traditional Ukrainian garb. Since Ukrainian literature, history, art, and music were no longer forbidden, activists hoped contests such as “My Native Land” would spark an interest in Ukrainian culture and thereby revive the nation. Lilia Hrihorovich, head of the All-Ukrainian Soyuz Ukrainok, opened the ceremony with these comments.

I believe that it is contests like this one that raise patriots and true citizens of their land.... With all my heart I would like to greet participants of our contest and heartily thank our children for their sincerity, loyalty and devotion. I hope all your dreams and goals expressed in your works will come true. I am sure that if everything portrayed in your works comes true then our Ukraine will become what we have been dreaming about (6/28/2003, Kyiv).

Daria Husiak, the head of League of Ukrainian Women in Kyiv, addressed the audience at the competition as well. Her statement illustrated their intention of building a distinctly Ukrainian Ukraine and echoed the hopes of Soyuz Ukrainok activists.

I envy you (the participants) because when we lived in the Soviet Union, Ukraine was merely a part of it. We were never allowed to let people know about it as a separate land with its beautiful mountains, rivers and land. You explore your native land. You explore the land, cities, mountains, forests and fields. The knowledge of our native land and words of our native tongue show that these rivers and fields flow into you. When this knowledge and language enter your awareness, your soul, and your heart, then no national minority, no matter how dominating it is, can uproot it from your heart. With such awareness you can stand firmly on your land and know that it is your land, the land of your ancestors and your history. It is only then that we can build a Ukrainian Ukraine that still does not exist for the time being (6/28/2003, Kyiv).

The Olena Teliha Society (in all three cities) was equally committed to building a Ukrainian Ukraine. Several of its members were artists, musicians, historians or authors who believed they were using their talents to increase interest in Ukrainian culture. They also held yearly poetry contests in which young people could win prizes for their

dramatic performances of Olena Teliha's poetry. Again, the desire was for people to grow to love Ukraine, coming to regard it as more than a territory, rather as their nation of which they could be very proud. If they were to take pride in Ukraine they would also need to take responsibility for it according to its leader in Kyiv.

When I look at you, my dear children, winners of the contest, and see your burning love for Ukraine which you have expressed in your works, I hope that this love is not pretend, that it is not only in works that you speak of your love for Ukraine, and its people, but also that you are aware that this is your land for which you are responsible (6/28/2003, Kyiv).

Activities to instill a love of Ukraine among adults were also a focus of these organizations. For instance, the Olena Teliha Society in Kyiv was working on museum exhibitions of events in Ukraine's history. They commemorated the battle of Kryt in which 300 Ukrainian students died fighting the Bolshevik army in the name of independence. Volunteers also held a ceremony at graves of the students who died at a nearby cemetery in Kyiv. Activists in League of Ukrainian Women and Zhinocha Hromada in Kyiv also wrote histories of those who suffered for the idea of a Ukrainian nation. They also taught Ukrainian history in schools for the teachers. Activists in all three cities felt young people were not given adequate teaching about their own history because teachers did not know it and were not being given opportunities to learn it. A volunteer in League of Ukrainian Women in Kyiv explained why those who knew Ukrainian history had an obligation to teach it to others.

...when people my age went to school we did not study Ukrainian history. It is the younger people, my grandson, for instance, who studies this history. You know, when a person studies and knows their history, the roots of their nation, he/she has a totally different worldview. As to those who studied earlier, they did

not have this chance, in fact, still now not everybody can study Ukrainian history (Interview with women's NGO volunteer, 6/30/2003).

Volunteers for Zhinocha Hromada in Kyiv maintained a lively ethnographic community among many of its members. They shared their knowledge and talents with each other as well as the general public.

Ethnography is one of our (Zhinocha Hromada's) major fields. Famous Kyiv representatives of ethnography and fine art studies make up this section of our organization and go around Kyiv promoting Ukrainian culture and traditions. They work in the museum – the Open-air Museum of Architecture and Lifestyle which is in Pyrohiv village. They always try to bring Ukrainian ideas to people's awareness. Our women were one of the first to begin lessons on folk culture in their schools. In the past nobody taught Ukrainian ethnography, while now there is a special course on folk study. Our Zhinocha Hromada sent their teachers to different schools with presentations (Interview with women's NGO leader, 6/5/2003).

Soyuz Ukrainok in Kyiv also included activities and events aimed at adult education about Ukrainian traditions. One activist explained that many adults probably were taught something of Ukrainian culture by grandparents; however, most of it was buried as distant memories or simply forgotten by a lifetime of Soviet rule. Their choir sang in public hoping to remind people of their roots.

Sometimes when we take the metro we start singing and people around us appreciate that because our songs are so appealing, and people have really missed those songs. People come to us and thank us. They are glad that there are people who can take care of our culture, our language (Interview with women's NGO leader, 7/01/2003).

Activists for Zhinocha Hromada in Kyiv believed it was important for the government to nationally recognize traditional Ukrainian holidays, particularly those that were banned during the Soviet regime. They worked to have St. Nicholas' Day, Christmas and Easter restored and observed. They, along with activists from Soyuz

Ukrainok, often celebrated holidays publicly in order that others could observe and learn. Sometimes women from other cities even came to watch and learn how to properly observe these holidays. Proper enthusiasm and observance of traditional holidays was essential to creating a Ukrainian Ukraine. The national oriented NGOs in Kharkiv and L'viv also held public celebrations of holidays to promote a national awareness.

Kharkiv

Kharkiv, with only one NGO using the nationalism frame, also promoted a knowledge and love of Ukrainian culture among the general population. The Olena Teliha branch in Kharkiv bused women to Ukrainian plays and musical performances. Their activists tried to find aid for those whose livelihood was preserving Ukrainian culture.

We help namely those who are connected with Ukrainian culture; we help Ukrainian families. This is our narrow focus, because for everybody else there are community services. They sort of coordinate other services. But we support those who develop the Ukrainian culture, spread it among people, those who prepare dramas for St. Nicolas' Day and tell others about it, those who organize festivals and dramas for Christmas and the Old New Year and tell others about it. We help those people, because no one else helps them. But we help them (Interview with women's NGO leader, 2/20/2003).

You have just seen the woman who came here. She has five children. They have a very hard life. They have no place to live. They have a house in a remote village. Her husband is a poet and composer; he sings Ukrainian songs. Now there is very little demand for this service. There is some demand, because he is invited to sing, but he cannot make enough money to feed his five kids. Therefore, we help him.

Our Ukraine-wide organization is helping him. We have found a family that supports them financially (Interview with women's NGO leader, 2/20/2003).

Their charitable aid was given to individuals involved in spreading Ukrainian culture. They gave support by finding people to provide some supplemental income for Ukrainian artists, musicians or actors.

L'viv

In L'viv, much like Kyiv, there were extensive cultural and ethnographic activities aimed at children and adults. There was an equally strong emphasis on developing a love of Ukraine's cultural heritage so that Ukraine could become a great nation. However, a slight difference emerges. Women's nationalism activists in L'viv tended to emphasize the history and cultural traditions of western Ukraine when they spoke about reviving Ukrainian traditions. Their emphasis was on western Ukrainian history, artists, traditional handicrafts, and folk music. They spoke of Ukraine as a whole, but examples they gave, history they taught, folk art they practiced and music they performed was frequently from western Ukrainian regions. Thus, they spoke about the revival of Ukrainian cultural traditions like the women's nationalist oriented activists in Kyiv and Kharkiv, but it tended to be region specific.

Soyuz Ukrainok, the most prominent of the nationalist oriented women's NGOs in L'viv, hoped to create a national renaissance from the disorder of Ukraine's newly independent state and civil society. They called their work national-cultural. Their

revival of the culture among the people would bring about national revival according to activists. The L'viv section of Soyuz Ukrainok took it upon themselves to establish museums of Ukrainian heroes and set up memorials throughout L'viv and the rest of Galicia (Bilek 2002, 7-8). They held fashion shows with displays of clothing, embroidery, and beadwork from the Galician region. Members organized Schevchenko evenings, Mothers Day events, competitions of Ukrainian music, held parlor nights to acquaint people with prominent individuals of L'viv and Ukraine, popularized traditional holidays, and held many children's competitions that focused on different aspects of Ukraine's culture (Bozhenko 2002, 13-19). Many of the women in the organization were professional musicians, writers, poets, historians or philologists who hoped to draw attention to and create audiences for their own work, as well as forgotten Ukrainian writers, scientists, historians, actors and artists. Some of the women gathered together weekly to do traditional embroidery together. Their work was displayed in a local museum, and Soyuz Ukrainok opened its own museum in a school. Every Easter the women set up a painted egg display in the Palace of Culture.

The leader of L'viv's Soyuz Ukrainok explained they were hoping to throw off much of what had been forced upon them by the Bolsheviks and return to practices of the pre-Soviet era. L'viv activists from Soyuz Ukrainok claimed that before the Bolsheviks took over western Ukraine their people were much more civilized. They were free to observe their own traditions and the language was not threatened. The women in L'viv seemed to think many social ills would be alleviated if they could return to the pre-Bolshevik era. For example, the leader of L'viv's Soyuz Ukrainok explained that there was a lot that seemed very unrefined among Ukrainians today from the way people

behaved in their homes, to manners on public transportation. It was not like this, she claimed, before the Bolsheviks took over western Ukraine.

There are a lot of things in our people that does not suit us. You know a terrible paradox is taking place in recent years. Until 1939 (when the Russians came here) to sit at the table and not to set it with a white table cloth and with spoons and forks, and with napkins – that was something unbelievable. It was unthinkable not only in the city (in L'viv), but in small towns and even in villages as well. When the Bolsheviks came here in 1939 everything became neglected, and the cultural values confessed by people in Galychyna were turned inside out. All the religious traditions were trampled. That was one of the things we wanted to change when we revived and started the organization again. That's what we wanted to return from 1939. It is a must to stand up and give a place to a woman in a tram. If you consider yourself an intelligent person you have no right to shout or cry out, and so on. You should kiss a woman's hand (that's for men) (Interview with women's NGO leader, 4/24/2003).

Soyuz Ukrainok activists were hoping that throwing off the Soviet influence would progress at a faster rate than it was in 2003. The next section discusses these sentiments in greater detail.

The Olena Teliha Society and the Association of Olha Basarab in L'viv also engaged in activities to propagate Ukrainian traditions. Like Soyuz Ukrainok in L'viv, they celebrated holidays together, held bandura concerts where the youth could display their talent and others had the opportunity to hear Ukraine's traditional instrument. One volunteer with the Olena Teliha Society explained their organization had the "national idea" which meant nurturing the knowledge of Ukrainian history, culture and language to create a Ukrainian nation. Without that, Ukraine would never become a Ukrainian nation (Interview with women's NGO volunteer, 4/11/2003). The Association of Olha Basarab held events commemorating events in Ukraine's history such as a conference dedicated to the 80th anniversary of the West-Ukrainian People's Republic. They also held a march

through the city to Olha Basarab's grave. They published a small newsletter a few times a year with information about their activities and important events or individuals in Ukraine's history.

The branch of Zhinocha Hromada in L'viv was barely active at the time of the study, but still existed. Its leader also associated a Ukrainian nation with revival of its cultural traditions and language. She believed the role of all women's organizations was to save the nation and the language from dying out. Women were expected to be involved in preserving the language, crafts and churches of Ukraine. This way even when Ukraine was under the domination of another country the nation would be preserved (Interview with women's NGO leader, 3/21/2003).

In summary, Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv women's NGOs using the nationalism frame included a heavy emphasis on the revival of the Ukrainian language, spirituality, history and cultural traditions in their discussions of building a Ukrainian nation. Much of their energy was focused on activities that encouraged the youth and the population at large to know their Ukraine as much more than a geographic territory, but a nation with a rich language and culture. Their hope was to create patriotic Ukrainian citizens. L'viv women's activists using the nationalism frame engaged in similar activities to their counterparts in Kyiv and Kharkiv but with an emphasis on the revival of western Ukrainian history and cultural traditions. Kyiv and Kharkiv women's activists did not specify a revival of a particular regional culture.

Disillusionment

Among organizations using the nationalism frame in L'viv there was some disillusionment about the slower than expected pace of national revival that was not verbalized in Kyiv and Kharkiv. The leader of Soyuz Ukrainok in L'viv described this feeling succinctly.

Maybe at the beginning we were big romantics. We thought that all of us (not just Soyuz Ukrainok but other political parties, different public movements) would not only revive our country but also make it strong and powerful and Ukrainian. Unfortunately that did not happen, and it weighs heavily upon us. It really knocks you down. It's hard to talk to people not related to our organization. For example, you go to a village, and tell them to work, but then you hear "How much longer can we work? We've been working for 12 years, and we have been reviving the country for 300 years." And they talk about examples of America and other countries... I don't know. That's difficult. Maybe it's not complicated, but it's tough. To feel the corruption in authority, or when your country is not accepted so well in the world – that hurts (Interview with women's NGO leader, 4/24/2003).

In L'viv many of the activists had mothers or grandmothers that were active in the pre-war Soyuz Ukrainok in western Ukraine. They had the sense that they had been laboring for an independent Ukraine for decades. So, while others in Ukraine were disillusioned by the economic collapse following independence, these women were disheartened more by the corrupt behavior exhibited by Ukrainians following their independence. They felt their people were much better than the criminal behavior so many seemed willing to accept. Instead of a renaissance of Ukrainian culture they were regressing to a criminal society.

Activists in the L'viv branch of the Olena Teliha Society also explained that national revival was not progressing as they hoped. It seemed Ukrainians were not able

to solve problems on their own and thrive in a free society. Personal thinking was destroyed by the Bolsheviks according to some of them. People used to know how to think for themselves, but over the years they seemed to have lost this ability. During the Soviet era they and their children were sent to camps to “rest” in the summer. Children were required to march in lines from place to place, everyone doing the same activity at the same time, with no choices. One activist explained that even if they built a house they had to do it in a very specific way or else pay heavy fines. Much of their intelligentsia was exiled or killed during the Soviet era which also damaged the population as a whole. They felt the Soviet era filled people with terror, making people afraid to think on their own, handicapping their ability to adjust in the transition. It was not this way before the Bolsheviks came to western Ukraine.

The leader of the Association of Olha Basarab also believed the national revival should be progressing differently. Many women, according to this activist, were less active in reviving the nation now, 2003, than they were at the time of independence. In addition, Ukrainian youth, who showed quite a bit of interest in the church when it was forbidden by the Bolsheviks, no longer had any interest in attending church. Instead, they were focused on material possessions, entertainment, drinking, smoking and drugs. They did not seem to care about their nation (Interview with women’s NGO leader, 3/18/2003).

The preceding discussion highlights a difference in the nationalism frame in L’viv from that in Kyiv and Kharkiv. Those in L’viv were disillusioned, not primarily by the economic dislocation the country suffered (by which most were disillusioned), but by the behavior of its people. Not only were many Ukrainians uninterested in Ukraine’s cultural

traditions and building a great Ukrainian nation, but they were uncivilized. Their country was becoming known for its corruption and coarse way of life, rather than taking its place among the great nations. Despite their disillusionment, they still believed their hard work would eventually produce the nation they envisioned, according to a Soyuz Ukrainok activist in L'viv's national university. "I wanted to emphasize that Ukraine remained, remains and will remain because we have the national idea. That's a very strong thread which keeps Ukraine great" (Interview with women's NGO leader, 4/29/2003).

Summary

The existence of an independent state did not mean these organizations obtained their goals. Most of them were organized after independence because they still believed much had to be done to create the type of Ukraine they envisioned. They wanted to build a Ukrainian Ukraine which requires much more than a sovereign state. When activists involved in organizations using the nationalism frame in Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv spoke about reviving the nation and building a Ukrainian Ukraine they had specific goals in mind. Their dream was a great nation with citizens that spoke its native language, knew its history and practiced its cultural traditions. Its citizens were to think of it as their native land, which they loved rather than simply a geographic territory. Some of the organizations in Kyiv and L'viv also believed it was necessary for Ukrainians to rediscover their spirituality/religion in order to appreciate and value their history and culture. In all cities there was a strong emphasis on socializing the youth to know and

love Ukraine along with the adult population. In L'viv, this entailed knowing and practicing western Ukrainian cultural traditions from before the Soviet era while activists in Kyiv and Kharkiv spoke of Ukrainian culture in more general terms. L'viv activists were also disillusioned with the pace of revival and corrupt behavior being exhibited by its citizens. They were concerned that Ukraine was becoming distinctly corrupt, instead of distinctly Ukrainian. In all three cities activists from these organizations believed Ukraine had yet to reach the goal of a great Ukrainian nation.

Differences

All organizations using the nationalism theme framed the Ukrainian nation as one that should be distinctly Ukrainian. Yet, there were also differences among the cities in their framing of nationalism. Kyiv organizations included a discussion of Ukraine becoming a sovereign state that was absent in L'viv and Kharkiv. The framing of women's role in building a strong Ukrainian nation also varied by city. Kyiv and Kharkiv activists focused more on gender and women's involvement in politics. In contrast, L'viv activists focused more on women as the preserver and transmitter of cultural traditions.

Sovereign State

Since Kyiv is the capital of Ukraine, it is not surprising that NGOs using the nationalism frame in Kyiv included some discussion of Ukraine actually becoming an independent and sovereign state. Only organizations in Kyiv included this in their frame. In Kharkiv, the only organization using the nationalism frame was founded in 2000, nine years after independence. Two of the L'viv organizations existed prior to and during the independence movement, but chose not to discuss it in their frame.

At the most basic level an independent and sovereign state was a necessary feature of a Ukrainian nation. Since Ukraine's history includes very little independence, this goal was not an insignificant or small step. Zhinocha Hromada in Kyiv was initially the women's branch of Rukh, and its leader was married to the head of Rukh. Several of the activists originally became involved in the organization as protesters for Ukraine's independence through Rukh. Therefore, most of the older activists in Zhinocha Hromada initially joined because of their desire for an independent Ukraine. Similarly, many activists for League of Ukrainian Women were older women who fought for independence most of their lives according to one of its activists.

Most women who are in the League are the women who were in that struggle during World War II. These are women who continued fighting in the Carpathians because the fight went there on until the mid 50's. Many people were imprisoned, sent into exile, and driven to Siberia. And the people who survived the Russian servitude are aware that they have to keep fighting for an independent Ukraine. Thus, they are members of our organization (Interview with women's NGO volunteer, 6/30/2003).

Concern with independence included a desire to see that Ukraine had sovereignty over its own territory and a constitution. Initially there was controversy over whether Sevastopol would belong to Russia or Ukraine. Russia believed it had strong claims to Sevastopol, in part because of their military base there. The Olena Teliha Society in Kyiv explained one of the initial goals of their organization was to ensure Ukraine's sovereignty over Sevastopol. To this end they wrote a petition to the UN in favor of Sevastopol remaining Ukrainian territory. The women believed their petition was one of the deciding factors in keeping Sevastopol part of Ukraine as opposed to Russia. They also lobbied for the adoption of the 1996 constitution. Activists from all four NGOs concerned with nationalism in Kyiv felt their cooperation helped prevent the communist forces in the Rada from blocking its acceptance. It was after these matters of statehood were resolved that these women believed they could turn their attention to other issues according to the head of the Olena Teliha Society in Kyiv.

Once the Constitution was adopted, we understood that we had the state, so more time could be dedicated to purely women's problems, like working with children without parental guidance, women's reproductive health, etc. (Interview with women's NGO leader, 1/30/2003).

For these organizations this involved the aspects of nationalism discussed earlier, such as reviving traditional holidays, learning Ukrainian music, literature, and studying Ukrainian history.

Women and Nationalism

The nationalism theme also included discussions of women's role in creating a Ukrainian nation. A quotation from the president of the All-Ukrainian Soyuz Ukrainok made it clear that women considered themselves and their organizations central to building Ukraine. "If the soul of the Ukrainian nation, all her selfless devotion and sacrifice materialized in a concrete image – then it would be Soyuz Ukrainok!" (Soyuz Ukrainok brochure 2001) However, each organization varied slightly in their perception of the relationship between women and nationalism. Differences between the cities can also be observed.

In Kyiv and Kharkiv there was a stronger emphasis on women's relationship to the state in building a Ukrainian nation, particularly their participation in politics. In Kyiv the discussion was of national level politics and in Kharkiv more attention was given to local politics although national politics were also included. In Kyiv, the Olena Teliha Society and Zhinocha Hromada believed that a more equal role for women in politics and society was essential to Ukraine becoming a strong and democratic nation. Becoming a strong democracy was included in building a great Ukrainian nation, and this could not happen without more equal treatment for women. For instance, the Olena Teliha Society volunteers in Kyiv claimed to be following in the progressive traditions of the historical women's movement whose nationalist activities included the advancement of women. The historical Ukrainian women's movement, dating back to the late 19th and early 20th centuries advocated women's political involvement and opportunities for women as part of an independent Ukraine. Members of Soyuz Ukrainok, Zhinocha

Hromada and the Olena Teliha Society in Kyiv were aware of the historical activities of the Ukrainian women's movement. League of Ukrainian Women activists may have been aware, but the interview gave no indication that the pre-war women's movement informed their actions in an intentional manner. Building a Ukrainian state in which women were full participants was part of the agenda of the historical Ukrainian women's movement.

In addition to their cultural activities, volunteers in Kyiv's Olena Teliha Society were proponents of gender equality for Ukrainian women. The historical Ukrainian women's movement was progressive and a space in which new social ideas were developed. Gender equality, a new concept in Ukraine, was important, they believed, to the development of the Ukrainian nation and something they could further through their organization.²⁹ The women's movement should be a site for the development of new social ideas, according to one activist (Interview with women's NGO leader, 1/30/2003).

Our organization believes that at the present historical stage new ideas can spring up in our society. There are many famous women in our society; Nadya Strishenets (Ph.D. in History), Dr. Myronets, Dr. Dmytrienko, Dr. Borysenko. That is why we organize research conferences. Thus in 1994 we held the first All-Ukrainian conference "From Emancipation to Feminism." ... In 1995 we held an international conference. There were 17 women from other countries participating. These were not women from the Ukrainian Diaspora. The conference was called "Self-Help for Women's NGOs." In other words, it was about women being able to help themselves. There were delegates from Germany, France, England, Nigeria, the Netherlands, and from many other countries, who came to share their experience on how to help new women's organizations stay vibrant and continue to develop.... We also held some other important conferences, "Women's Movement in Ukraine and State-Forming Processes." We have materials on this conference. Then we had a conference, "NATO and

²⁹ Gender equality meant the betterment of women's position in society and politics based on publications of the Olena Teliha Society.

the European Union: Challenge for Ukraine” (Interview with women’s NGO leader, 1/30/2003).

Olena Teliha Society activists in Kyiv believed it was in Ukraine’s best interest and their patriotic duty to improve the status of women. Most of Ukrainian society and its government were far from accepting this, according to activists. They believed that Ukraine would not be a true democracy without equality for women and betterment of their current situation. Volunteers remained current on the state’s provisions for women and children, often criticizing the government for its inadequate support of them. “We see the state power in Ukraine at this time does not realize the importance of this fact, that the situation of women in society determines the level of its democracy” (Kobets’ 2002a, 26).

Zhinocha Hromada in Kyiv also believed the position of women reflected the quality of democracy in Ukraine. Like Kyiv’s Olena Teliha Society activists, they felt improvement in women’s immediate physical condition as well as long term change in attitudes and treatment of women was essential to building a strong Ukrainian nation. They recognized the state was unable and often unwilling to address most of the social problems which greatly impacted women. To compensate for deficiencies in government programs, Zhinocha Hromada initiated projects to improve women’s condition. They focused on health information and programs that could help women and children live healthier lives, along with leadership and business training. A credit union was also established that was sometimes helpful to women.

In addition to immediate assistance to women, Zhinocha Hromada volunteers in Kyiv believed that gender roles should be examined and the general attitude toward

women needed to be changed in order for Ukraine to develop into a great democracy. One activist explained that everyone in Ukraine was used to associating women with housework. She felt people needed to start associating women with positions of leadership. Another volunteer explained that these very attitudes toward women were part of what made them adopt their goal of helping, "...women to find their place in society, to give back confidence in her strength, to provide her with the knowledge needed to stand alongside men, to hold a high position, to fight for the President's seat" (Interview with women's NGO leader 6/5/2003). They held a conference, separate from the Olena Teliha Society's conference on a similar topic examining women's role in the state building process in 1993. In it they boldly asked for legislation that would be gender related and protect against discrimination, sexual harassment and support women's studies centers. An improvement in women's status and change in gender attitudes would build a stronger and more vibrant Ukrainian nation according to these activists. A strong Ukrainian democratic state would not develop by ignoring women's concerns and discriminating against them.

The Olena Teliha Society and Zhinocha Hromada in Kyiv viewed an increase in the status of women and greater gender equality as an integral part of national restoration. The nation would not be revived until women were given a more equal role. A quotation from a brochure advertising the Olena Teliha Society succinctly summarized the perspective that was more representative of the Olena Teliha Society and Zhinocha Hromada. "The main cause of the All-Ukrainian Olena Teliha Society is the continuation of the progressive traditions of the 100 years of the Ukrainian women's movement which

works towards Ukrainian democracy and gender equality in the process of Ukrainian development” (Olena Teliha Society brochure).

In contrast, League of Ukrainian Women in Kyiv made no mention of the relationship between women and nationalism. Soyuz Ukrainok in Kyiv, tended to view women’s role as the transmitter of culture as their first priority. Greater equality for women was an additional concern they would address after Ukraine was a fully thriving independent state. They did not consider it part of the process of building a Ukrainian state, but something to be addressed once their nationalism project was completed. Some activists from other women’s NGOs in Kyiv felt Soyuz Ukrainok should place a higher priority on women’s political involvement and more actively join with them in addressing gender concerns in Ukraine’s democratic development. Atena Pashko, a former head of Soyuz Ukrainok (1991-2001), answered these accusations in the organization’s paper, *Ukrainka*.

As to our being an organization interested keenly in political matters, our opponents are quite right. [...] The whole history of Soyuz Ukrainok [stressed] the struggle for freedom of Ukraine, hence it could not be a purely feminist organization, because in conditions of colonialism (*bezderzhavnosti*) the social emancipation of women was inconceivable without national emancipation. But that does not mean that with the achievement of an independent state all women’s issues will be automatically solved. Hence today we view feminist demands favorably and do not avoid them in our work, but above those we also consider our broader tasks (quoted in Bohachevsky-Chomiak 1997, 4).

Soyuz Ukrainok in Kyiv was not completely uninvolved in matters related to improving women’s status in society and increasing their role in the political process. The leader of the Kyiv branch of Soyuz Ukrainok explained that their organization wrote letters in support of the passage of a gender bill in the Rada, but her brief discussion of

the issue revealed little depth of understanding of the issue and involvement on the part of the organization.

In Kharkiv, the Olena Teliha Society also believed that greater gender equality and democracy went hand in hand. They supported the progressive traditions of the Ukrainian women's movement along with gender equality and democracy. The women involved in the organization supported a variety of political parties, ones they felt addressed issues important to them. For instance, some of the women worked with the Green Party because of their interest in ecological problems and the environment. Women were free to affiliate with parties of their choice as the NGO had no official attachment to any party. Their goal was for women to be involved in democratic politics generally and use the democratic process to improve Ukraine.

L'viv, where the history of women's organizing was more recent than either Kyiv or Kharkiv, had a very different discussion of the relationship between women and nationalism. It was much less focused on the state and there was no mention of gender equality or improving women's status in society. The role of mothers as preservers of culture through family life was emphasized instead. The leader of L'viv's Zhinocha Hromada explained that women's organizations were to keep the nation alive by preserving the family and its language, and its culture.

I can say that women's organizations have always existed in Ukraine. And as you know, western Ukraine didn't exist as such. It was either a part of the Austria-Hungarian empire or under Poland. That's why a lot of different organizations, especially women's organizations, were created to save the nation and language from dying out. Children had to be brought up in the right spirit. Family had to be preserved. Because if the family was preserved, it meant that Ukraine still existed, even though it was under the power of some other country. That's why there were so many politically and socially active Ukrainian women during the period of the Austro-Hungarian Empire, even more than when Ukraine was under

Poland. A lot of women's magazines and organizations appeared at that time. And what was the role of a women's organization? Language, first of all, then crafts, and church for children to be believers. All that referred to the role of the mother. That was the reason for establishing women's organizations (Interview with women's NGO leader, 3/21/2003).

The goal of Zhinocha Hromada in L'viv was in keeping with her explanation of the role of women in preserving the nation.

There is only one common goal: to bring up a young person as a patriot, as an educated and good person. It's the aim of a woman. And also to do everything possible for young people to be healthy and not be hooligans. That is the goal (Interview with women's NGO leader, 3/21/2003).

The leader of Soyuz Ukrainok in L'viv also discussed the need for revival of cultural values which were practiced in families. The Ukrainian nation rested upon the family which was continuing to disintegrate even though Ukraine was no longer under a foreign empire. Before 1939, she believed families were stronger and observed traditions which held them together and therefore the nation.

Our morale constantly stood upon the Ukrainian family, and our national identity stood upon it. That's the way it always used to be. Every family had a cult of Our Lady (the Blessed Virgin), because people were very religious. It was the cult of the mother; it was also a cult of love toward the motherland. So until 1939 it was unthinkable for a Ukrainian family not to have all these things (Interview with women's NGO leader, 4/24/2003).³⁰

The leader of the Association of Olha Basarab also emphasized the connection between the family and the nation and therefore women and nation. "The nation is

³⁰ Soyuz Ukrainok was founded in 1922. Until western Ukraine was absorbed into the Soviet Union Soyuz Ukrainok enjoyed a strong organizational structure and influence in society. Some of their nostalgia for the pre-Bolshevik era may also be a longing for their past prominence in society.

formed in the environment of family, and the family is the smallest cell of the nation. And the nation makes up the state” (Interview with women’s NGO leader, 3/18/2003).

Thus, the nationalism theme in L’viv described women as the protectors and transmitters of culture through the family. Strong families would build the nation. Interviews with L’viv activists using the nationalism frame contained no mention of gender or greater equality for women. In Kyiv and Kharkiv, activists in the Olena Teliha Society and Zhinocha Hromada believed that greater gender equality and improvement in women’s status would help to build a better Ukraine, one more in line with their vision of a Ukrainian nation. Soyuz Ukrainok in L’viv believed that the status of women was an issue to be addressed after Ukraine became the great nation they were working toward.

Critique of Nationalism

None of the L’viv NGOs concerned with nationalism engaged in any discussion that connected gender to building a Ukrainian nation. However, there was a gender studies center in L’viv, Women and Society, that discussed the issue. Some of their work included a critique of nationalism as it related to the condition of women. They had no interaction with the four nationalism oriented NGOs in L’viv.

Their critique was of nationalism as used by the state and a general acceptance by women, without question, of their condition, especially in western Ukraine. Women and Society leaders discussed the national myth of the Berehynia. The Berehynia was a strong hearth mother who protected the home and was the transmitter of culture. This myth implied that Ukrainian women were strong and that they historically enjoyed rights

which had always been protected. It also implied that the place of a woman was in the home, rearing children, away from the public life of politics.

I've been thinking about it, and realized that the myth about the special Ukrainian woman, Berehynia, and some other myths are supported from different sides. On the one hand, women accept it because this is some ideal image, and if one believes in that it seems everything is really like that. "I always lead, and I have rights. I can make decisions, and that's the way it always was. Ukrainian women lead in all areas, and so on." For a woman it's like a way to flee from reality. It's easier to believe that I have some rights, even if I don't have them in reality. For men it is understandable. If a woman believes she has rights then she won't try to change anything. The status quo is kept, nobody is troubled, and everybody is satisfied. Besides, the image of the Ukrainian Berehynia as the keeper of the hearth who makes all decisions and reproduces not only people but culture as well, I think such an image is really convenient for the authorities. It's like a cause or a reason to offer a woman to go back to her family and move away from the labor market or from politics. It's like saying, "You go to your family and be Berehynia, and everything will be all right with you." That's the case. So the myth of the Berehynia and this image of the Berehynia is just convenient for everybody. However, I believe this is why it's so dangerous. To see the reality behind the image is impossible. Actually, nobody even tries to do so. Well, some try, of course, but just very few people (Interview with women's NGO leader(a), 3/22/2003).

Another researcher with Women and Society further explained that the myth of the Berehynia was also easily perpetuated in Ukraine because nationalist oriented Ukrainians felt it was part of the lost national identity they were trying to reclaim or create. Women and Society activists did not appear convinced, however, that the Berehynia really was part of their history.

Besides, in my opinion, another facet is that now an attempt to return to the national identity, the way it was at the end of 19th- beginning of 20th century, is manifested. It's a return to the point we were at before the revolution. A lot of old myths are revived and accepted as traditional, as ours. So the elements of the Berehynia are recreated at this time. The return to different old traditional national myths includes a return to that myth as well (Interview with women's NGO leader(b), 3/22/2003).

The leader of Soyuz Ukrainok in L'viv, while not using the term Berehynia, explained their organization was trying to restore cultural practices that were observed in the years directly before western Ukraine became part of the Soviet Union in 1939. Women's nationalist oriented NGOs in L'viv also emphasized the importance of mothers in Ukraine's past as preservers and transmitters of culture. Again, an activist with Women and Society elaborated on how and why the Berehynia was used and why it was so appealing for many. She also explained more specifically how it became part of the national ideology making it even more difficult to challenge the idea of the Berehynia and existing stereotypes of women.

I really think it is a serious obstacle in the way of solving women's problems, on the way to changing women's mentality. It is an obstacle for women to realize the problems of the situation they are in, problems of women's discrimination in Ukraine, and the sharpness of the problems, as well as the need to change anything. This is a serious obstacle that just prevents women from seeing all of this. In practice, the myth is very difficult to destroy or unveil, as it became a part of the national ideology, or the state ideology of the new Ukraine. Even the monument at Maidan Nezalezhnosti [*Independence Square*] in Kyiv, when it was unveiled, the president called her Berehynia. So even the term "Berehynia" is becoming a part of the state ideology. Therefore, to speak critically about it is really difficult. It's hard to criticize something that became legitimate or moved on to higher levels. It's not just on the level of common people's consciousness, or some pseudo-scientific talks, rather it's on the level of state ideology, so this is really serious (Interview with women's NGO leader(b), 3/22/2003).

Women and Society's critique was not necessarily of the L'viv NGOs, but the situation generally in Ukraine. It was their explanation as to why more women were not concerned about gender stereotypes in Ukraine, or discrimination against them.

However, the L'viv NGOs concerned with nationalism did represent what Women and Society activists were critiquing. The four nationalism oriented NGOs in L'viv described

women's role in the nation building process much like the Berehynia. Women were to preserve the nation through their role in families. They were to be the transmitters and protectors of culture at the hearth. No role in politics and government was accorded them. In contrast, some of the women's nationalism NGOs in Kyiv and Kharkiv explained that women were to help build a strong Ukrainian nation through greater involvement in politics as well as through their families. Only two other women's NGOs in the L'viv sample besides Women and Society included any discussion of discrimination against women and gender awareness. As Women in Society activists noted, there were only a few in L'viv willing to challenge the prevailing image of women.

No other organizations in the sample included a critique of nationalism. A few activists in Kharkiv briefly mentioned that they felt people in L'viv were too aggressively nationalistic. These comments were asides and not a critique of nationalism and the place of women within it.

Outcomes and Nationalism

Activists using the nationalism frame tended to be passionate about building the Ukrainian nation they envisioned. Some of the women in the organizations were volunteering in them before independence. Were women's NGOs using the nationalism frame progressing toward their goals? Were organizations still in operation, and were they able to sustain campaigns?

Ukraine is its own sovereign state, but that was not the end goal of these organizations. Over half of the NGOs using the nationalism frame were formed after independence was achieved. Their goal was to create a Ukrainian Ukraine which they felt they were still far from achieving. The measure of outcomes used in this study is not whether goals have already been achieved since the oldest of these organizations had only been operating since 1989 in recent times. Organizational maintenance (outcomes), defined as the ability to carry out a campaign, was engaging in sustained activities toward stated goals. Were these organizations using the nationalism frame sustaining campaigns enabling them to make progress toward creating a Ukrainian Ukraine? The nationalism frame was used the least often of the three major groups of themes discussed in this study. Yet, it enjoyed the highest rate of organizational maintenance. Only one of the nine organizations using this frame was not able to sustain a campaign. All of the organizations were coded as maintaining their organization, although Zhinocha Hromada in L'viv was barely operational. All the other organizations were actively engaged in one or more campaigns intended to build a Ukrainian nation. Among women's NGOs using the nationalism frame 89% in 2002-2003 were sustaining campaigns and in the past as shown by the tables below.

Table: 4-2 Comparison of past rates of organizational maintenance for NGOs using the nationalism frame to those not using it by city and across all cities

	<u>Kyiv</u>		<u>Kharkiv</u>		<u>L'viv</u>		<u>All Cities</u>	
	<u>Nationalism</u> <u>Frame</u>	<u>No</u> <u>Nationalism</u> <u>Frame</u>	<u>Nationalism</u> <u>Frame</u>	<u>No</u> <u>Nationalism</u> <u>Frame</u>	<u>Nationalism</u> <u>Frame</u>	<u>No</u> <u>Nationalism</u> <u>Frame</u>	<u>Nationalism</u> <u>Frame</u>	<u>No</u> <u>Nationalism</u> <u>Frame</u>
Past Campaigns								
0-active, not campaign	0 (0%)	3 (15%)	0 (0%)	2 (17%)	1 (25%)	0 (0%)	1 (11%)	5 (13%)
1-hard to tell	0 (0%)	2 (10%)	0 (0%)	1 (8%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	3 (8%)
2-clearly campaign	4 (100%)	15 (75%)	1 (100%)	9 (75%)	3 (75%)	8 (100%)	8 (89%)	32 (80%)
Totals	100%=4	100%=20	100%=1	100%=12	100%=4	100%=8	100%=9	100%=40

Table 4-3 Comparison of current rates of organizational maintenance for NGOs using the nationalism frame to those not using it by city and across all cities

	<u>Kyiv</u>		<u>Kharkiv</u>		<u>L'viv</u>		<u>All Cities</u>	
	<u>No</u>		<u>No</u>		<u>No</u>		<u>No</u>	
	<u>Nationalism</u>	<u>Nationalism</u>	<u>Nationalism</u>	<u>Nationalism</u>	<u>Nationalism</u>	<u>Nationalism</u>	<u>Nationalism</u>	<u>Nationalism</u>
Current Campaigns	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>
0-active, not camp	0 (0%)	3 (15%)	0 (0%)	2 (17%)	1 (25%)	0 (0%)	1 (11%)	5 (13%)
1-hard to tell	0 (0%)	1 (5%)	0 (0%)	2 (17%)	0 (0%)	2 (25%)	0 (0%)	5 (13%)
2-clearly campaign	4 (100%)	12 (60%)	1 (100%)	8 (67%)	3 (75%)	6 (75%)	8 (89%)	26 (65%)
3-no longer active	0 (0%)	4 (20%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	4 (10%)
Totals	100%=4	100%=20	100%=1	100%=12	100%=4	100%=8	100%=9	100%=40

The ability of these organizations to maintain themselves and sustain campaigns represents somewhat of an anomaly. Nationalism was not a topic that received a large amount of international funding. International funding provided the monetary resources for most of the Ukrainian women's movement. This meant that the organizations using the nationalism frame were able to implement campaigns to spread Ukrainian traditions, language, knowledge of history and cultural practices, largely without funding from international donors. Three of these organizations did win grants from international donors but not for their campaigns using the nationalism frame. The large international grants they did receive were for projects related to economic development. Domestic resources were scarce in Ukraine in 2002-2003, and most activists said they were unable to do much of anything relying solely on resources from Ukraine. Thus, not only were these organizations actively engaged in campaigns, they were able to do it without the international funding upon which most of the other successful organizations in the sample of women's NGOs depended.

Why were the nationalist oriented women's NGOs able to sustain campaigns with very little money and few resources to implement their campaigns? Why did this frame have the highest rate of organizational maintenance and ability to sustain campaigns among the three major themes in the women's movement in 2002-2003? The

nationalism frame enjoyed a lot of resonance with segments of the Ukrainian population, especially in western Ukraine. Some of the activists in these organizations were working for independence as dissidents during the Soviet era. A woman's activist from League of Ukrainian Women in Kyiv explained that many of the women in her organization had been struggling for the idea of an independent Ukraine much of their lives.

Most women who are in the League are the women who were in that struggle during WWII. Those are women who continued fighting in the Carpathians, because the fight went on until the mid 50's. Many people were imprisoned, put into exile, driven to Siberia. And the people who survived the Russian labor camps are aware that they have to keep fighting for an independent Ukraine. Thus they are members of our organization (Interview with women's NGO activists, 6/30/2003).

Perhaps the activists in these NGOs had a more intense commitment to their organizations than activists in other women's NGOs. These women saw their work in their organizations as a continuation of what they had already been working toward.

The nationalism frame also enjoyed resonance with Ukrainians that were not dissidents and did not feel they had been laboring for the Ukrainian nation most of their lives. They did not have to be historians to know that in modern times until the present most of Ukraine was under the domination of one empire or another. Each empire used Ukraine for its own purposes instead of for the good of Ukraine. This was the first time the entire geographic territory of present day Ukraine had the opportunity to be its own Ukrainian nation. Their language was no longer considered the lesser language or the language of the peasants. They were not imprisoned for developing their own literature or practicing their own traditions. They could study in their own language rather than the language of another nation. Their soldiers could serve their own nation instead of

fighting the battles of other nations. Thus, the nationalism frame had an appeal to many Ukrainians because it resonated with their life experience of having been under the domination of foreign powers, such as Russia and Poland. Ukrainians could at last serve Ukraine.

In addition, many Ukrainians were disillusioned with the economic collapse and high level of corruption at all levels of society following independence. Focusing on literature that was previously forbidden, studying a language that was their own, learning songs their grandparents used to sing and the cultural traditions of their own land was a positive outcome of the transition. In some ways the nationalism frame poignantly highlighted what Ukrainians were missing, but it also gave them an opportunity to experience a few immediate benefits of independence.

The nature of the measure of outcomes should also be taken into consideration when explaining the high success rate of the nationalism frame. Outcomes were measured as the ability to sustain a campaign which is a relatively low threshold that was chosen because academics are often unaware of the existence of a Ukrainian women's movement, and those who are, maintain low expectations. Furthermore, most of the organizations have been in existence for a short period of time, leaving them little time to achieve outcomes frequently used as measures of success, such as acceptance or new advantages. Consequently, a minimal measure was chosen. Thus, all but one of the nationalist oriented women's NGOs was able to sustain campaigns. An outcome measure that relied on achievements such as, new rights or acceptance might have shown more variation in outcomes across the three cities.

Conclusions

Nationalism, the least frequently used frame, had the highest rate of organizational maintenance of the three dominant frames in the Ukrainian women's movement. The frequency of its use in each city reflects the local contexts. In L'viv, the most enthusiastically Ukrainian nationalist of the three cities, the frame was used in one third of the sample. In Kyiv, a city that is more mixed in its orientation, but is now the capital of independent Ukraine, the frame was used by 17% of the sample. In Kharkiv where Russian/Soviet influence was the strongest the frame was used by only one organization (8%) in the sample.

The brand of nationalism advocated by women's activists in 2002-2003 emphasized building a Ukrainian Ukraine. The Ukrainian language, its religion, history and cultural traditions were considered central to this endeavor. However, within this discussion the contextual differences of each city emerged as the frame was adapted by women's nationalist oriented activists to resonate in their own city.

There were different emphases in each city depending on the context. Kyiv, the capital, emphasized statehood and sovereignty issues in addition to developing Ukrainian cultural traditions. Women activists in Kyiv involved in these NGOs had easier access to individual members of parliament or leaders within political parties (sometimes through their husbands). They could lobby their concerns about the language issue or the constitution more easily than women's activists in Kharkiv and L'viv.

In L'viv, western Ukrainian cultural practices were given preference over other regions, while Kyiv and Kharkiv women's nationalist oriented NGOs were not focused

on a particular region of Ukraine. The stress on western Ukrainian traditions in L'viv no doubt contributed to the resonance of the nationalism frame. Residents of L'viv often feel their region of the country better preserved the true Ukrainian culture than other parts of Ukraine, which spent more time under Russian and Soviet rule. For that reason, a stress on the revival of western Ukrainian cultural traditions meant a revival of Ukraine to women's nationalist NGO activists in L'viv. In Kyiv and Kharkiv, particularly in Kharkiv, a focus on western Ukrainian traditions would not resonate with the population. In Kharkiv, many of the residents felt they were equally Russian and Ukrainian. Many in Kharkiv were more familiar with Moscow than L'viv. Thus, the Kyiv and Kharkiv brand of nationalism did not emphasize traditions specific to western Ukraine, but Ukraine generally. In addition, Kharkiv, with its stronger atheistic Soviet influence, did not include revival of religion or Ukrainian spirituality in their frame. L'viv, with its more religious social climate and to a lesser extent Kyiv, included a return to Ukrainian spirituality in their nationalism frame.

The role of women in building a Ukrainian nation also varied by city and reflected the city's cultural context. In Kyiv and Kharkiv, improving women's status and creating greater equality for women was considered part of the process of developing a Ukrainian nation. (Only two of the four women's nationalism NGOs in Kyiv advocated this. The two that did not had closer ties to L'viv, and the L'viv branches of their organizations were stronger than in Kyiv or Kharkiv.) The women's movement in Kyiv and Kharkiv contained a greater emphasis over all on overcoming gender discrimination and improving the status of women. L'viv residents pride themselves on being more socially conservative and not surprisingly were less inclined to critique the dominant cultural

image of women. L'viv's variant on nationalism discussed the role of mothers as preservers of the nation through family life rather than increased gender equality as central to the development of a Ukrainian nation.

Thus, the close to equal levels of organizational maintenance of the nationalism frame across the three cities masks the impact of local cultural context in the use of the nationalism frame. The frame was used least frequently where nationalism was least expected to be found, in Kharkiv, and most frequently in L'viv where it was most expected. It was also tailored by the women's activists of each city to their cities' cultural contexts. The ability to sustain campaigns, even in Kharkiv with its relatively hostile environment to Ukrainian nationalism, was likely aided by the women's activists' sensitivity to local cultural context.

Chapter 5

Gender Discrimination Framing

Probably you are aware that there are many myths in Ukraine, like how well women live in Ukraine. They have no problems, and all their rights are protected, and that's the way it always was (Interview with women's NGO leader, 3/22/2003).

The above quotation from a women's NGO leader, in L'viv, illustrates that admitting to the existence of discrimination against women was a new step for many in Ukraine. During the Soviet era they were told that all forms of discrimination had been eliminated. One of the great accomplishments of the Soviet Union was to be the emancipation of women and equality between the sexes. "On November 28, 1917, the principle of a complete economic, legal, political, cultural, sexual, and even biological equality of the sexes was proclaimed" in Russia (St. George 1973, 13). Lenin, drawing on Marx and Engels, believed that to build the new world order, the traditional role of women had to be destroyed. The Soviet government declared its intention to set up communal nurseries, kindergartens, communal dining rooms, kitchens, repair shops, children's homes, and laundries. These facilities and education were intended to give women complete equality (Jancar 1978, 66; Lapidus 1977, 58-61; Schneir 1972; Smith 1928, 1-2; St. George 1973, 226,230).

Research has shown that instead of creating equality between the sexes women were discriminated against on the basis of gender in Soviet society (Gal and Kligman 2000). Women tended to be concentrated in low paying, low prestige jobs that were often in manual labor. They usually earned significantly less than men (Buckley 1992;

Lapidus 1978; Marsh 1998; McAuley 1981; Pavlychko 1992a; Sacks 1976).

Politically, women did not occupy high positions. Generally, the weaker or less important the political institution, the more women were found in it (Atkinson et al. 1977; Buckley 1992; Jancar 1978; Lapidus 1978; Marsh 1998; Pavlychko 1992a).

Women also continued to bear almost full responsibility for home life which included waiting in food lines, cooking, cleaning, washing cloths, caring for children and sewing.

This was not lessened by modern time saving appliances as they were never made widely available (Buckely 1992; Lapidus 1978; Marsh 1996 and 1998; Pavlychko 1992a).

Despite evidence to the contrary, the Soviet government never publicly declared that it failed to create gender equality or eliminate discrimination against women. Ukraine's constitution also officially declared equality for women in all spheres in article 24. The Ukrainian state, even after independence, hid information that pointed to discrimination against women. Public opinion polls from 1995 showed that society did not acknowledge discrimination against women existed and many believed women and men enjoyed equal rights and opportunities. Yet, lived experience continues to tell a different story even as women are still socialized to believe they are not discriminated against (Pavlychko 1997, 225-227). Women's activists with League of Women Voters 50/50, and Women in Mass Media explained that many in Ukraine prefer to think that discrimination against women occurs in African third world countries, but not in places like Ukraine. League of Women Voters 50/50 believed a first initial step was to help women recognize that their experience was discrimination and not equality.

Basically we were the first ones in Ukraine to gather those international documents emphasizing women's rights and we published that information in

small brochures.... So when people saw the word “discrimination” with regard to women and then the ratification date of that convention in Ukraine, they began to realize that if the convention had been ratified that meant that the country recognized the existence of women’s discrimination. Ukraine did acknowledge that there was women’s discrimination in the country. It was very revealing for many. Nobody ever thought or believed that Ukraine would ever admit that we had discrimination. We always heard the same, “We have no discrimination of any kind.” However, when they saw that such a convention had been signed by other countries (highly developed European countries), they said, “Do the Swedes indeed have discrimination? And the British? Then, of course, we are not ashamed to recognize that we also have discrimination” (Interview with women’s NGO leader, 11/15/2002).

League of Women Voters 50/50 and other women’s NGOs using the gender discrimination frame showed women that Soviet Ukraine signed the UN document to End Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) after the Nairobi Conference in 1985. Most in Ukraine know nothing of these documents signed by Ukraine’s government and were not aware of presidential decrees signed by the Kuchma administration admitting to the existence of gender inequalities in Ukraine. In 2001, the president signed a decree giving equal rights and opportunities in public and political life. The national government also adopted national plans of action for 1997-2000 and 2001-2004 that were supposed to improve the status of women outside the family and create gender parity in all spheres of life. The 1999 National Action Plan on Improving the Status of Women in Ukraine included gender equality as a central issue, however, Ukraine’s government never adequately funded any of the above programs (Hrycak 2005; Interview with women’s NGO leader 1/26/2003).

Given the existence of discrimination and the need to publicize gender discrimination among the public, how did women’s NGOs take on the issue of gender? This chapter analyzes the gender discrimination theme in the Ukrainian women’s

movement in 2002-2003 in Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv. The frequency and use of the words gender and discrimination by women's activists are discussed. After examining the types of gender discrimination identified by women's activists, I will then analyze the goals and activities adopted to address gender discrimination. Gender studies centers are examined as a separate category from the rest of the women's NGOs using this frame. Lastly, the relationship between outcomes and the gender discrimination frame is discussed. Throughout, the similarities and differences in the frame in Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv are highlighted.

Use of gender and discrimination

Although many in Ukraine did not admit that discrimination against women existed in Ukraine, gender discrimination was a frequently used frame among women's NGOs in all three cities, particularly in Kyiv and Kharkiv. In the sample of 49 women's NGOs, 27 (55%) used the gender discrimination theme. In Kyiv, 16 of 24 (66.6%) organizations mentioned gender discrimination in some form in their interviews and eight of 13 (61.5%) in Kharkiv also used the frame. The theme was not quite as popular, although still present, in L'viv, with three of 12 (25%) women's groups addressing discrimination and/or gender concerns. L'viv, with its more conservative cultural climate, was expected to exhibit less interest in gender issues critiquing the dominant cultural perspective of women in Ukraine. Kyiv and Kharkiv, which tend to be a little less conservative than L'viv and had more interaction with foreign donors, showed more interest in gender issues.

Women's leaders that used the word gender and/or discrimination to explain an injustice or goals and activities of an organization resulted in an organization being coded as using the gender discrimination frame. Some of the women's activists using this frame used the word gender to describe their injustice, others used only discrimination and others used gender and discrimination in their frames. Table 5-1 below shows the use of these two words by city. The table also highlights differences between cities. Gender alone was used by 38% and 31% of the women's NGOs in Kyiv and Kharkiv respectively and by none of those in the L'viv sample. Discrimination was used much less frequently on its own than gender. One women's leader each in Kyiv and Kharkiv used discrimination alone in their frames. Gender and discrimination were used together in frames by 21% of Kyiv women's NGOs, 23% of Kharkiv's, and 25% of L'viv's in the sample.

Table 5-1: Number of NGOs using Gender and Discrimination in their Frame

	Gender <u>Only</u>	Discrimination <u>Only</u>	Gender And <u>Discrimination</u>	No Mention <u>of Either</u>	<u>Total</u>
Kyiv	9	1	5	9	24
Kharkiv	4	1	3	5	13
L'viv	0	0	3	9	12
Total	12	2	12	23	49

Gender, as acknowledged by many activists, was new to their language and stood out when used in interviews. Yet, it was a widely used term among women's activists. Therefore, it is important to understand what women's activists meant when they used the term gender. During interviews women's activists were asked what they meant when they used the term. Gender tended to be discussed in three contexts by activists: to

indicate a social construct, to discuss more equal participation for women in all spheres, and to identify problems of discrimination.

First, those involved in the academic research centers or concerned with spreading awareness of gender in all three cities usually described it as a social construct that consisted of a set of socially prescribed roles for men and women in a society within a particular time frame. Activists emphasized that gender does not mean biological sex and varies through time and space. Women in Mass Media defined gender for Ukrainian journalists in the following manner.

Gender is the understanding about the system of roles and relations between men and women, as defined it is not of biological origin, but from social, political and economic contexts. Sex is given from nature; gender-understood, is a construction.... Sex characteristics are defined in the uterus at the moment of conception. Gender individuality develops in childhood and expands into adult life. The creation of gender roles and connections is a constant process. Parents and teachers, relatives and friends – all play a role in strengthening certain behaviors of boys and girls (Women in Mass Media 1).

Several women's activists explained the importance of realizing that gender analyzes the relations between men and women and was not about acquiring advantages for women at the expense of men. Women's activists in Kyiv and L'viv which educated youth about the gender concept included girls and boys in their activities, encouraging them to recognize gender stereotypes. The leader of School of Equal Opportunities in Kyiv believed that Ukrainians, "needed to see the society as a harmony of men and women. It is not right to improve women's position at the expense of men and through diminishing men's rights. Men need to see us as their partners" (Interview with women's NGO leader, 1/28/2003). Panna, in Kharkiv, conducted gender training for men and women in the city government. Creating gender awareness meant that men, as well as

women, should understand what gender means and be able to evaluate the roles ascribed to men and women in Ukraine.

The concept of gender applies to all spheres and is not limited to discussions of equality for women, according to activists, although this point was emphasized more in Kyiv than in Kharkiv and L'viv. For example, the Kyiv Institute for Gender Research conducted a gender analysis of women in the media. Besides counting references to men and women, they also examined the images created by the media of men and women. Men, they found, were more often portrayed as experts and competent commentators on issues than women. When specific women were the topic of a story, they tended to be depersonalized and described as the wife of so-and-so. If a man was interviewed, his full name was more likely to be reported (United Nations Development Program 2003, 78-82). Women's activists involved in media, in Kyiv, hoped to change the way society viewed women as a whole through changing their image in the media.

Second, other women's activists, in Kyiv and Kharkiv, used gender to mean primarily more equality for women in terms of their political representation. For instance, an activist might explain that Ukraine needs greater gender equality or has gender inequality. This statement was often followed by reference to the low percentage of women in the national parliament and their loss of seats in the 2002 elections. Several organizations in Kyiv supported parties that included women on their lists in an effort to create more gender equality. Others engaged in programs that encouraged women to participate in the election process. Spilka Zhinok (Women's Union), the Olena Teliha Society, Rozrada (Comfort), League of Women Voters, and Zhinocha Hromada (Women's Community) all made some reference to women's lack of representation in

parliament and the executive branch. A draft of a bill on gender equality was also in progress. It included a proposal for a quota for women's representation in legislative bodies. Achieving parity in this regard was sometimes described as gender equality by Kyiv women's activists.

Women's NGOs, in Kyiv, that were more intimately involved in the gender law thought of it as much more than simply equal political representation. These women activists believed that gender equality included equal participation for women in the economy, social and civic life, in addition to more equal political representation. All laws governing economics, politics, and society should be gender sensitive according to these activists. For instance, League of Women Voters 50/50 activists coordinated a gender analysis of legislation in several different areas of legislation. Other women's NGOs were involved in projects to help local governments create gender sensitive development strategies. A few women's activists explained that laws intended to protect women in the workplace only helped to reinforce discrimination in hiring practices, demonstrating the need for greater gender sensitivity in legislation. These women activists understood that their understanding of gender equality in all spheres was in line with EU expectations of gender equality. Playing on the desire of some in the national government to become part of the EU, League of Women Voters 50/50 submitted a draft of the gender bill to visiting EU deputies for review. They hoped that the recommendations of the EU deputies would make Ukrainian politicians aware that gender equality extended to all areas of governance, not merely political representation.

Third, other women activists used the term gender to refer to particular forms of discrimination in society. An activist for Miroslava, in Kharkiv, explained that women

were not considered as intelligent as men. Therefore, fields considered particularly difficult and important were dominated by men. She was a graduate of an aviation university where women were always given lower grades. Women's Fund and Women's Perspectives' activists, in Kharkiv and L'viv respectively, discussed the business sector's male dominance. Men did not treat women entrepreneurs equally and often felt business was not the place for women. This made it more difficult for women to acquire the necessary resources to start and maintain their own businesses. Strong gender stereotypes fostered discrimination, manifesting itself in hiring practices where women were frequently not given jobs because they had children and might need to take time off of work as a result, according to women's activists in Kyiv and Kharkiv.

If the word gender was used by women's activists in these three contexts to mean the socially constructed roles for men and women in a given society, more equal participation of women in all spheres of life, and specific forms of discrimination faced by women, some women's activists' understanding and activities encompassed all of the above uses of gender and some one or two of the uses. Kyiv women's activists used gender to emphasize political representation more than those in Kharkiv. In L'viv, gender was not used in reference to gender equality through political representation. In Kyiv and Kharkiv, but particularly in Kyiv, women's activists used it in connection with legislation they hoped would create greater equality for women in Ukraine. Women's activists in all three cities used gender to talk about stereotypes of Ukrainian women that kept them out of certain professions and sectors of society.

The word discrimination was used on its own only twice by women's NGO leaders in the sample, once in Kyiv and once in Kharkiv. The women's activist using

only the word discrimination in Kyiv, used it to describe gender discrimination against women in the arts. Without saying gender she discussed ways in which men were always preferred above women in the arts, particularly theater. The leader of Zhinocha Hromada, in Kharkiv, also used only the word discrimination to describe a pervasive image of women in Ukraine. She pointed out that women were not the ones traveling to Kyiv on business and TV commercials often showed violations of women's rights. Thus, when discrimination was used on its own, it implied the word gender and often pointed to forms of gender discrimination in Ukraine that women's activists defined as an injustice.

To better understand the use of gender in frames, the underlying causes of gender discrimination that women's activists identified are examined. This will help us better understand how women's NGO leaders framed the gender discrimination they experienced and observed to their target populations. The following table summarizes the similarities and differences across the cities in the construction of the gender discrimination frame that are elaborated on in the following sections.

Table: 5-2 Summary of similarities and differences across cities in the construction of the gender discrimination frame

Similarities in emphases across cities

- Three types of gender discrimination discussed: institutional, Ukrainian cultural, and universal cultural
- Ukrainian cultural gender discrimination discussed the most frequently in all three cities
- Women activists addressed gender discrimination through the formation of service, advocacy and research NGOs for particular groups of Ukrainian women or Ukrainian women as a whole

Variations in gender discrimination frame across cities

<u>Kyiv</u>	<u>Kharkiv</u>	<u>L'viv</u>
-Institutional discrimination focused on women in professions & national politics	-Institutional discrimination focused on local politics	-Institutional discrimination barely mentioned
-Ukrainian cultural discrimination focused on Ukraine generally	-Ukrainian cultural discrimination focused on Ukraine generally	-Ukrainian cultural discrimination specific to western Ukraine
-Universal cultural discrimination discussed	-Universal cultural discrimination discussed	-No discussion of universal cultural discrimination
-Some interaction with local & national governments to address gender discrimination	-Some interaction with local & national governments to address gender discrimination	-No interaction with local or national governments to address gender discrimination

Types of Gender Discrimination

Women's activists in all three cities described the gendered discrimination they observed in a few different ways. Some described the gendered discrimination women faced as a result of institutions in Ukraine. For example, the town of Ivano-Frankivsk (located in western Ukraine) in 2003 was considering passing a law that would not allow mothers to work after 4 p.m. so they would be home to care for their children after school and cook dinner for their husbands (Interview with Winrock International worker, Kyiv, Ukraine, 6/23/2003). For the purposes of this discussion, gender discrimination that activists attributed to Ukraine's institutions I labeled as institutional gender discrimination.

Women activists also described experiences of cultural gender discrimination they felt was the result of Ukrainian culture. The form of gender discrimination may not have been unique to Ukraine, but women's activists identified Ukrainian culture as the root cause of it. For instance, a women's activist in Kharkiv explained that women were not considered as smart as men in mathematics. This occurs in more than just Ukraine, but the activist clearly attributed the cause of the gender discrimination specifically to Ukraine's culture. I labeled this Ukrainian cultural gender discrimination, even though it was not always unique to Ukraine's culture. Sometimes, it was unclear whether the gender discrimination was attributed to Ukraine's culture specifically, or whether it was a function of me, as a Westerner, that resulted in the activist speaking of it as specific to Ukraine. In cases such as this I included it in the Ukrainian cultural gender discrimination category.

The last type of gender discrimination women’s activists discussed was cultural gender discrimination, but unlike the Ukrainian cultural discrimination category, women’s activists were not attributing it specifically to Ukrainian culture. It appeared to be gender discrimination that women’s activists felt occurred in other cultures as well. This category will be labeled universal cultural gender discrimination. The leaders of Women’s NGOs in this category described the discrimination women faced in their search for employment or efforts to start their own businesses. A women’s activist, in Kyiv, explained that men were always chosen for leadership positions in work places regardless of qualifications. The three different types of gendered discrimination described by women’s activists are discussed in detail. Table 5-2 below shows the breakdown of categories of gender discrimination described by women activists by city.

Table 5-3: Types of gender discrimination by city

	<u>Institutional</u>	<u>Ukrainian Cultural</u>	<u>Universal Cultural</u>
Kyiv	4	4	3
Kharkiv	2	2	2
L'viv	1	3	0
Totals	7	9	5

Institutional Gender Discrimination

Women’s activists in all three cities described institutional discrimination in the sciences, politics and business. Ukrainian women were not able to advance in politics because the structure of Ukraine’s political institutions privileged men, making it very difficult for women to gain a foothold in the upper echelons of politics and government.

The leader of Spilka Zhinok in Kyiv explained that Ukrainian women were given equality in the constitution, but, in practice, this was not the case as evidenced by their unequal representation in the government.

The Ukrainian constitution has declared this (equality); however this has never been achieved in reality. Our women are discriminated against because there are only about 5% of women in the Rada; there are only two women in the state government. There are no women holding executive positions in the regional administrations (Interview with women's NGO leader, 6/6/2003).

The leader of Spilka Zhinok in Kharkiv also listed examples of the shortage of women in the upper levels of politics at the local level.

We also have few women in leadership in the state and local governments. Although, if you look at statistics, there are a lot of women in lower positions in the local governments. But that is simply because their salaries are low and the work load is great. I can give you specific examples. Last year, in 2002, we had an election. Deputies of all levels were elected.... I can quote the statistics on our region.... But if you look at the chairpersons of village councils, there are 60 village councils, and only eight chairwomen. Here we see fewer and fewer women. There are many fewer women in all the higher levels of local government and state administration. This is one of the reasons why women need to be supported (Interview with women's NGO leader, 2/27/2003).

Other women's organizations, such as Zhinocha Hromada in Kyiv, The Olena Teliha Society in Kyiv, and Women's Perspectives in L'viv also noted that women were not included in influential decision making bodies in Ukraine. Each organization in one form or another, verbalized that the more influential the position, whether in politics or economics, the less likely a woman was to be found in it.

The Olena Teliha Society, in Kyiv, went a step further in explaining exactly why they thought women were unable to penetrate the higher levels of government. In an article in her organization's magazine, Ol'ha Kobets' wrote that the mechanisms for

creating and furthering gender equality in politics were still absent in Ukraine. Political parties often did not include any women on their lists, and when they did, they were so far down the list that none of the women actually won seats in parliament. Furthermore, when women's parties were created they were usually puppets for the political aspirations of other groups or individuals who were simply seeking to use the label of women for their personal gain. As a result of the attempts by others to manipulate women's parties and women's NGOs, the women's movement was divided in the 2002 parliamentary elections and unable to become an effective political force. Furthermore, the State Committee on Family and Youth Affairs that was supposed to implement documents, such as the Peking Platform of Action (1995) signed by Ukraine, was utterly ineffective as a body to improve the status of women because the structure was repeatedly dissolved and reformed by the government and always under funded (Kobets' 2002a, 25-26). Thus, according to these women's activists, in Kyiv, Kharkiv, and L'viv, women faced gendered discrimination and would continue to do so in large part because political institutions continued to advantage men.

However, women's activists varied by city in the site of institutional gender discrimination. In Kyiv, the emphasis was on national institutions fostering gender discrimination. This was particularly apparent to them since all of these organizations were involved in promoting women candidates or women's parties in the 2002 parliamentary elections in which women's representation decreased. With good reason, women's activists promoting women in politics were searching for explanations for their lack of success in the 2002 elections as evidenced by Ol'ha Kobets' article discussed directly above.

In Kharkiv, Spilka Zhionk also believed that institutional discrimination led to fewer women in positions of political power, but they focused on local and regional politics. Given Kyiv's position as the capital, it is not surprising that women's NGOs there concentrated more on national level politics. Kharkiv women's activists had more contact with local government, and, as a result, took more notice of women's absence from their city and regional governments. Furthermore, Kharkiv is located in the eastern region of Ukraine that sometimes seems ambivalent about Ukraine's independence. Their greater interest in their own local politics instead of national level politics might be reflective of this attitude.

In L'viv, the almost complete absence of a discussion of institutional gender discrimination may be explained by its local cultural context. L'viv's gender studies center, Women and Society, explained that L'viv had a very conservative atmosphere, and, as a result, few people were willing to challenge the status quo and re-evaluate the role of women. The Women and Society activist believed challenging societal institutions was not something many women in L'viv were willing to do. Based on this activist's assertions and what we know about L'viv's more conservative social climate, it is possible that the lack of a discussion of institutional gender discrimination in L'viv's women's movement demonstrates their unwillingness to challenge the status quo. However, more women's NGO leaders in L'viv, as well as in Kyiv and Kharkiv, were critical of gender discrimination they attributed to Ukraine's own culture.

Ukrainian Cultural Gender Discrimination

Other women's NGO leaders discussed a gendered discrimination that was cultural, and they attributed it specifically to Ukraine's culture even though what they described exists in other societies. The following discussion of Ukrainian cultural gender discrimination contains examples of gender discrimination given by Ukraine's women activists that are not necessarily unique to Ukraine. Much of it echoes the experiences of Soviet and post-Soviet women generally, with the exception of L'viv, where the discussion was tied explicitly to the western Ukrainian context. According to most of these activists, gender discrimination was a result of the way women were thought about in Ukrainian society. They did not expand their discussions to generalizations about other countries and cultures. For this reason, I discuss it as the Ukrainian women activists chose to describe this form of gendered discrimination. For instance, the leader of League of Women Voters 50/50 in Kyiv went so far as to explain that women were not even thought of as persons. When their organization tried to explain that it defended the rights of women as persons and promoted gender equality they were told, "A woman as a person sounds like an amphibian as a person" (Interview with women's NGO leader, 11/15/2002). The leader elaborated further that, "Such a perception was the result of traditional thinking that has been promoted in our country about the tasks and objectives of women's organizations and which was supported and followed by the Ministry of Justice³¹" (Interview with women's NGO leader, 11/5/2002). This attitude toward

³¹ In Ukraine, NGOs must officially register through the Ministry of Justice.

women could be generalized beyond Ukraine, but in this discussion, she was describing what she felt was particular to her culture.

Women were also viewed as unequal or lesser partners in Ukrainian families, according to leader of a women's NGO in Kyiv that provided counseling for families suffering from domestic abuse. Counselors at the center believed that domestic violence was a universal phenomenon, but there were some causes that they identified as specific to the Ukrainian experience. One reason it occurred frequently in Ukrainian families was a lack of gender equality in the relationships between husbands and wives in Ukraine. Ukrainian men, according to activists, often tried to strengthen themselves by humiliating their wives. Furthermore, with the added economic hardships and loss of status brought on by the transition to a market economy, men were even more inclined toward this behavior. Wives were the lesser partners with no power which was one reason they believed domestic violence was a common phenomena in Ukrainian families (Interview with women's NGO leader, 11/6/2002). Here the gender discrimination described, domestic violence, was a result of the differential status of men and women in Ukrainian society, although domestic violence was not labeled as specific to Ukrainian culture.

The Ukrainian attitude that women belonged in the home instead of the work place also created gender inequality in Ukraine. For instance, the leader of Women's Perspectives in L'viv explained that they decided to help women start their own businesses because women faced extra obstacles compared to men in Ukraine, one of them being Ukrainian tradition. "I think that the one of the reasons is Ukrainian tradition. Usually, Ukrainian women are working in their families and always cooking. This is one of our Ukrainian traditions" (Interview with women's NGO leader, 3/24/2003). A

significant result of this attitude was that women were passed by in the process of privatization, leaving them with very few resources to adjust to the economic crisis brought on by the transition. Women's Fund, in Kharkiv, also noted that Ukrainians were accustomed to thinking of women as strong only in their homes, but not in other spheres of life. "We believe it's always harder for businesswomen than for businessmen, although, they supposedly do the same job. But women are not treated equally in the business world. It's not an ordinary area for us Ukrainians to have women" (Interview with women's NGO activist, 2/12/2003).³²

In L'viv, the leader of the gender studies center explained why she thought strong gender stereotypes existed in Ukraine, more specifically in L'viv, and created gender discrimination. Her explanation is specific to L'viv's local culture.

The consciousness in L'viv, and the consciousness of women, and public opinion are quite conservative when it comes to women's roles, the status of women, their destiny... L'viv is a very conservative, very traditional environment. It's pretty understandable: there was a time after the war, when a lot of people came to L'viv from villages, and they brought their traditional thinking. Now it still remains here – it did not go anywhere (Interview with women's NGO leader, 3/22/2003).

The more provincial atmosphere in L'viv, they realized, would make change slow.

L'viv also enjoyed a different history compared to eastern Ukraine. Because of this activists felt a change in gender consciousness might come about more easily in eastern Ukraine and require more time in western Ukraine.

³² In this case, the implicit reference category was the West. The interviewee was explaining to me, the Western interviewer, that Ukrainians were not accustomed to women in business.

It seems to me that in eastern Ukraine, where women were under more pressure, as their rights were limited more because of Russian influence and so on, there was higher resistance against limiting their rights, and so the awareness that something was taken away from them was more obvious. Here it's more subtle. It seems that women are respected, everything is fine, and there is nothing to talk about, as if there is no topic for discussion. Limitations of women's rights and discrimination are not seen in Lviv so much. At least it looks like it. And because of that, when one starts talking about it, people think the problem is artificially brought up. Like it's not here, that we invented it and try to solve something, when in fact the problem is there (Interview with women's NGO leader, 3/22/2003).

Because women in L'viv were less inclined to notice gender discrimination, these researchers believed their work was particularly necessary. Some of this attitude was apparent in the slower rate of acceptance of gender as a legitimate subject among university faculty in L'viv. Researchers in Kyiv and Kharkiv reported that gender was perhaps not considered the same as the other subjects in the university but had gained a lot more acceptance than it previously enjoyed. Activists with Women and Society reported greater initial resistance to gender studies and felt there was still a lot of improvement that could be made. For instance, the entire history department was still very resistant to gender studies at the L'viv National University.

Ukrainian specific cultural gender discrimination was considered an injustice by women's activists using the gender discrimination theme in all three cities. In Kyiv, women's activists highlighted the image of women as something less than human. Their low status in the family is evidence of this. Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv women's activists using the Ukrainian cultural gender discrimination frame all emphasized Ukrainian gender stereotypes. The Ukrainian attitude that women belonged in the home and not in the labor market, business, or politics created further gender discrimination. This made it

more difficult if not impossible for women to advance to leadership positions at their work places, presented extra obstacles in their business ventures, and left them with the sole responsibility for housework and childcare. Activists in one women's NGO, in L'viv, used western Ukraine's historical experience to explain the persistence of gender stereotypes.

Universal Cultural Gender Discrimination

Women's activists in Kyiv and Kharkiv also described universal cultural gender discrimination that Ukrainian women faced. Men were preferred to women in media, the arts, business and employment. It was also a discrimination they attributed to culture but not specifically to Ukrainian culture.

Women in Mass Media and Women's Art Center in Kyiv both described gender discrimination in their professional fields. Women in Mass Media activists noted that there was discrimination against women not only in the image of women portrayed in the media, but also in their absence from decision making positions or any positions that entailed authority or power. In the leader's personal experience women rarely became chief editors or leaders because men did not think women belonged in these positions. They were not even seen as fit to interview male respondents.

I remember there were a number of cases when I was trying to do an interview on an especially hard topic. The procurators usually were men over 50 years old. They were most often personally offended that a young woman journalist came to ask questions, and they would call my editor saying, "What is this young woman journalist coming to interrogate to me? What right does she have?" So, it's like,

first of all you're young and secondly you're woman, and it's kind of a big insult... (Interview with women's NGO leader, 12/14/2002).

Competing with men was always difficult in her profession because women were considered inferior. She saw that women often made up more than 90% of the journalists for an organization, but they were almost never the editors-in-chief or even deputy editor-in-chief (Interview with women's NGO leader, 12/14/2002).

Women's Art Center was also formed because its leader recognized that women needed extra support in the arts, and it was more difficult for women than men to advance. Women directors were not accepted in theater, and only a very few could be accepted into Ukraine's theater departments.

The profession of women directors in theaters is taboo. Even the Kyiv Theater Institute does not accept women in the Director's Department. Once I brought my friend there – I knew someone there ... I knew many people. I brought my friend to the President (of the Kyiv Theater Institute) and told him that my friend was a very talented woman, and they needed to accept her. He replied that he would love to accept her and that he believed me, but they did not accept women in that department (Interview with women's NGO leader, 11/12/2002).

Those who were able to receive training still had to combat constant discrimination. "You see, when another director comes, and he is a man, then he has an advantage. This is a problem, and it happens, especially in art. The advantage is on men's side" (Interview with women's NGO leader, 11/12/2002). Women's organizations describing this type of gender discrimination felt that when there was a choice between a man or a woman, men were always chosen.

In Kharkiv, two leaders of women's organizations described cultural discrimination faced by women when they tried to find employment and succeed in the

business world. A women's activist with Kharkiv's Spilka Zhinok explained that Ukrainian women were discriminated against not just in specific professions, but in general when they searched for employment.

Everybody knows that today there is no explicit discrimination of women. But, at the same time sometimes they may be denied certain things like a job. Because now the unemployment rate in Ukraine is high enough, and the majority of the unemployed are women. This is due to the fact that young women have children. Therefore they are employed with reluctance (Interview with women's NGO leader, 2/27/2003).

Kyiv and Kharkiv women's NGO leaders that identified universal cultural discrimination described situations where men were consistently preferred over women. Unlike the Ukrainian specific gender discrimination, the cause of the discrimination was not attributed to Ukraine. The women's activists in L'viv did not discuss this more general cultural discrimination. The likelihood that it did not also exist in L'viv is low. The women's movement in L'viv tended to be more concerned with Ukraine and western Ukraine more narrowly, which may be why activists in L'viv focused their frames on Ukrainian cultural discrimination rather than universal cultural discrimination.

Summary of types of discrimination

Activists from organizations using the gender and discrimination theme identified institutional, Ukrainian cultural and universal cultural gender discrimination in Ukraine. Women were not able to advance in politics because the structure of Ukraine's political institutions privileged men making it difficult for women gain a foothold in the upper echelons of politics and government and the sciences. Activists were especially aware of

women's inability to become a force as national level members of parliament and in the executive branch of government. Women's activists in all three cities explained that women were not considered equal to men in Ukraine. Women's status is lower than their husbands' in Ukrainian families. Gender stereotypes in Ukraine place women in the home doing housework and childcare. Women's activists explained that because women are associated primarily with the home, their ability to succeed in business and positions of leadership is considered inferior to men's. Lastly, in Kyiv and Kharkiv, universal cultural discrimination, was described by women's activists using the gender discrimination frame. Men were preferred to women for most employment positions. The next section elaborates on the goals and activities used by these NGOs to address gender discrimination.

Goals and Activities to Address Gender Discrimination

The women's organizations discussed above chose to help women fight and cope with gender discrimination through various means. Some of them adopted goals intended to benefit a particular group of women, such as those who suffered from domestic abuse, and trafficking, or women who wanted to find new employment or start businesses. Others chose goals that would improve the situation for all women and improve the status of Ukrainian women more generally. Changing the image of women presented in the media, educating women about their human rights, or increasing women's political representation were goals intended to benefit all women in Ukraine. Table 5-3 below shows the breakdown by city of the universal or particular goals and activities adopted by

women's activists. Kyiv stands out as different by focusing on assisting women in their professions, while Kharkiv and L'viv activists did not focus on women in their professions. Assistance to victims of domestic violence, human trafficking and businesswomen was common to all three cities. Next is a discussion of women's NGOs with goals aimed at a particular population of Ukrainian women, followed by a discussion of those with goals to help all Ukrainian women.³³

Table 5-4: Assistance to particular groups or all Ukrainian women

	Particular Groups of <u>Women</u>	All Ukrainian <u>Women</u>
Kyiv	6	8
Kharkiv	5	5
L'viv	2	1

³³ Most of the goals and activities of women's NGOs using the gender and discrimination theme fit nicely into these two categories. There were a few exceptions. Miroslava, in Kharkiv, described the injustice of gender discrimination against Ukrainian women, but the activities it engaged in did not address this. Women's activists for Miroslava engaged in tolerance trainings designed to help individuals resolve their inner conflicts and teach patience. They also held a Super Grandmother contest and provided assistance to invalids. Its leader was in the process of searching for a sponsor to fund a TV series on civic education and establish a peace and ethics institute. Their goals and activities did not appear related to their concern for gender discrimination that resulted from Ukrainian cultural discrimination. Cirin, in Kharkiv, also did not fit into the categories used to discuss gender discrimination. The leader of Cirin explained that politics and business were a man's world in Ukraine. In order to succeed, in either of them, women had to behave like men. Instead of adopting goals to address gender discrimination this women's NGO adopted a withdrawal strategy. Women's activists in Cirin encouraged women to explore their creative and artistic abilities. They organized displays of art work and cultural traditions from other cultures and supported local artists. The leader of Cirin explained that arts and culture was a realm where women could be women. She wanted to provide women with the opportunity to create things and discover their inner potential. No other women's NGO using the gender discrimination theme adopted this withdrawal approach.

Assistance to particular groups of Ukrainian women

In Kyiv, leaders of three women's organizations discussed discrimination against women in their chosen professional fields. Women in Mass Media and Women's Art Center decided to assist individual women and help them to overcome the gender discrimination they faced, while Women in Science activists sought to help all women succeed in the sciences. Women in Mass Media, in Kyiv, tried to help individual women overcome the discrimination they faced in journalism. To combat the discrimination, women shared their experiences and discussed the problems they faced at organization meetings. This helped them to know that they were not alone. Women in Mass Media started publishing their own magazine called *Through Women's Eyes* to draw attention to issues related to Ukrainian women (Interview with women's NGO activist, 11/5/2002). Women in Science adopted slightly broader goals of promoting women scientists and paving the road for future generations of women scientists to succeed in their scientific endeavors. Their intent was to create gender awareness among women scientists and encourage them in their work (Interview with women's NGO leader, 1/24/2003). These women activists advocated on behalf of women in their professional fields and offered their services to individual women.

Other women's organizations seeking to overcome gender discrimination sought to provide services such as, counseling to specific groups of women. For instance, Rozrada, in Kyiv, opened a center to provide counseling to women and children who suffered from domestic abuse as well as victims of human trafficking. They also published several pamphlets and booklets encouraging abused women to seek help and

information about how to improve relationships between men and women. The organization also set up an online newsletter promoting gender equality in families. In Kharkiv and L'viv women's organizations also offered counseling to women who suffered from domestic abuse and trafficking in their efforts to help women combat discrimination against them.

Other service oriented women's organizations, in Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv, assisted women in starting their own businesses or developing skills to find new employment in an effort to help women overcome the effects of gender discrimination. For example, in Kharkiv, Women's Fund founded a business center that taught women with higher education the basics of business and marketing and offered micro-crediting. In a further effort to assist women in overcoming discrimination in business, they instituted what they called a "gender based approach" to business that included teaching women to think of themselves as capable and successful outside the home. They also worked with local government to introduce the concept of gender.

Therefore, we are not really trying to reverse time, but enabling society to take a new look at women, because a woman may be strong, not only at her house, but also in society, in politics and the economy. And, we should agree, this is normal. Well, it also takes time. It is only during the past year that our government officials began to understand what gender is. Before, they did not understand it (Interview with women's NGO activist, 2/13/2003).

Based on their gender analysis of the labor market and feedback from women they proposed a program to support women's business development in the Kharkiv region to the regional council (Interview with women's NGO activist, 2/13/2003).

The above women's activists in Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv sought to help women overcome or cope with the effects of gender discrimination with goals and activities

designed for particular populations of Ukrainian women. The goals and activities were similar across the three cities, except Kyiv had a focus on helping women in particular professional fields that was not seen in Kharkiv and L'viv. The following discussion includes women's organizations whose goals and activities were intended to better the situation for all Ukrainian women and assist them in overcoming gender discrimination.

Improving the status of all Ukrainian women

Women's NGOs using the gender and discrimination theme also adopted goals and activities that were intended to benefit all women in Ukraine rather than a specific subset of women. This included consciousness raising efforts, increasing women's political representation, legislating gender equality, human rights education, and gender education for children and individuals within government institutions. L'viv differentiated itself with the least attention to promoting gender awareness and human rights education among the three cities. In Kyiv, there was considerable discussion of women's increased political representation and the gender bill that was not found in Kharkiv and L'viv.

Women in Mass Media (Kyiv), School of Equal Opportunities (Kyiv), Humanitarian Initiatives (Kharkiv), and Younka (Young Girl) (L'viv) all hoped to create an awareness of gender among the general population and in that way to lessen the gender discrimination against women. School of Equal Opportunities, in Kyiv, and Younka in L'viv were concerned primarily with creating gender awareness among school age students. Volunteers for School of Equal Opportunities and Younka felt their work

of educating the youth about gender issues would eventually spread a gender consciousness throughout all of society and create a new Ukraine with greater equality for women according to a Younka activist (Interview with women's NGO leader 3/20/2003). These women's activists were creating new individuals for a new society according to the leader of School of Equal Opportunities in Kyiv.

The objective which is stated in our statute is forming and realizing gender policy in Ukraine. However, we have specific goals. Our specific goal, so to say, is forming a new individual in a new society. How do we want to see a new society, and how do we want to see a new individual? So what we are doing is modeling an individual and a society (Interview with women's NGO leader, 1/28/2003).

In Kyiv several advocacy organizations adopted the goal of increasing women's political representation and legislating gender equality. These women's activists believed that more women in decision making positions in government institutions would lead to greater gender equality for women. The Olena Teliha Society (Kyiv), Zhinocha Hromada (Kyiv), Rozrada and Spilka Zhinok (Kyiv) were all active before the 2002 parliamentary elections. Rozrada, in Kyiv, hoped to promote more gender equality in politics by encouraging women's participation in the 2002 parliamentary elections. They trained women to evaluate whether party programs were promoting women's interests. The women were given information to distribute to their communities and encouraged to train other women to do the same (Interview with women's NGO leader, 11/6/2002; Bondaraskova 2002, 17).

Spilka Zhinok, The Olena Teliha Society and Zhinocha Hromada activists, in Kyiv, all supported particular women running for parliamentary office or parties that were either "women's" parties or included women on their party lists. Spilka Zhinok

leaders decided one of their main goals was to have more women elected to the national parliament, local councils, and women in high executive positions within the government. Towards this end, their organization cooperated with the Women for the Future political party in the 2002 national Rada elections³⁴ (Interview with women's NGO leader, 6/6/2003). The Olena Teliha Society in Kyiv supported the political party Sobor in the 2002 elections, and its leader Ol'ha Kobets' ran on the party list. However, she was too far down on the list to win a seat in parliament (Kobets' 2002b, 19).

League of Women Voters 50/50 did not support a political party or a particular woman running for office, but it was closely involved with attempts to pass legislation on gender equality. Women's activists from the preceding organizations and League of Women Voters 50/50 were attempting to legislate equality through the passage of a gender bill (Interview with women's NGO leader, 11/15/2002).

In addition to the gender bill, League of Women Voters 50/50 activists were also involved in educating women about their human rights. This was also the primary goal of Kharkiv's Zhinocha Hromada. Leaders of both women's NGOs explained that gender discrimination was pervasive and so much apart of the fabric of life in Ukraine that women did not even know they were being discriminated against. These advocacy organizations translated international documents for women in an effort to teach women what rights they had and to recognize when they were being violated.

³⁴ This party was unsuccessful in clearing the threshold, and none of its members were elected to parliament.

Summary of goals and activities to address gender discrimination

Women's organizations using the gender discrimination frame sought to improve the situation for women through goals and activities aimed at particular populations of Ukrainian women and all Ukrainian women generally. In Kyiv there was a focus on assisting women in their professional fields that was not seen in L'viv and Kharkiv. Sample size may account for its absence in L'viv and Kharkiv. It also may be that Kyiv, as the largest city and capital of Ukraine housed the most influential media, theater and scientific bodies. As a result, women in Kyiv in these fields were more likely to witness women's absence from upper echelons in their fields. Counseling and business and employment centers were found in all three cities for victims of domestic violence, human trafficking and women trying to start their own businesses.

The goals and activities intended to improve the situation for all women in Ukraine showed more variation by city than those to improve the situation for specific populations of women. In Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv women's NGOs sought to promote gender awareness among the population in their city. There was more interest in Kyiv and Kharkiv than in L'viv in promoting gender awareness. For instance, Younka, the women's NGO in L'viv that was promoting a gender consciousness among the population worked primarily with children, but most of their time was spent addressing other social problems, such as smoking, drugs or free time. Compared to their counterpart in Kyiv, School of Equal Opportunities, Younka spent much less of its energies on gender education. Again, L'viv, which tends to be more conservative in its

attitude toward women than other parts of Ukraine, was not expected to exhibit as much interest in changing the prevailing cultural image of women.

Increased women's political representation and passage of the gender bill were other goals women's NGOs using the gender discrimination frame hoped would promote gender equality in Ukraine. Only women's NGOs in Kyiv were actively involved in this. Even though the parliamentary elections had already occurred, these activists expressed a continuing commitment to increase women's political representation. They saw their past electoral participation as laying the ground work for future elections. Given Kyiv's position as the capital this is the expected outcome. Had the interviews been conducted shortly before the 2002 parliamentary elections this may have been a goal in L'viv and Kharkiv women's NGOs as well.

Lastly, human rights education and enforcement were used by women's NGOs in Kyiv and Kharkiv, but not L'viv. Again, the more conservative attitude, particularly its attitude toward women's roles, is a likely explanation for the absence of a human rights focus in L'viv. Furthermore, the perception/myth that western Ukrainian women always enjoyed rights and still did may explain the absence of a human rights focus in L'viv.

In addition to the NGOs discussed above, Ukraine had a number of women's research NGOs focusing on gender studies and spreading knowledge of gender at the university level. The proceeding section examines the gender studies centers in each city.

Gender Studies Centers

The above organizations identified discrimination or inequality in society and chose to ameliorate the situation by through advocacy and service projects. The Ukrainian women's movement also included several NGOs that were oriented towards academic research in gender and gender education, primarily in universities. In Kyiv, three such NGOs were studied and one each in Kharkiv and L'viv. None of these organizations included projects that included service and advocacy, such as helping women to start businesses, counseling or charitable aid. In Kyiv, two of the gender studies centers in the sample had already ceased to operate at the time of the study, The Ukrainian Center for Women's Studies and The Center for Gender Studies. These women's organizations tended not to operate in the same circle as those I examined in the preceding sections, but there were sometimes connections between them.

All of the organizations adopted research on gender in academic fields and making gender studies into a legitimate field of study in Ukraine as their goals. All but the Ukrainian Center for Women's Studies in Kyiv also hoped to generate interest in gender studies among university students. These women's activists explained that it was an approach to research which was not previously open to them during the Soviet era. The following discussion proceeds by city focusing on what was unique to each city.

Kyiv

In Kyiv, the emphasis on research within disciplines and creating a networked community of academics was stronger than in Kharkiv and L'viv. Members of the three Kyiv organizations tended to focus on research within their own disciplines. The leader of The Ukrainian Center of Women's Studies, in Kyiv, explained that the members of her organization each carried out research within their own field. They met and presented their research to each other for a while, but they gradually drifted apart as they each focused on their own field and many had opportunities to travel abroad. The organization eventually dissolved as a result (Interview with women's NGO leader, 12/9/2002 and 12/18/2002). The Center for Gender Studies in Kyiv consisted primarily of women in the literature and philosophy department of a Kyiv university. There were only three primary members conducting research, and they did not involve other academics in their work. They were successful at winning grants to publish their books and receive time off for research. When one of their members suddenly died, the organization soon ceased to operate (Interview with women's NGO leader, 5/27/2003). The Kyiv Institute for Gender Research was still in operation in 2003. It was comprised of female sociology and psychology faculty at Shevchenko University. Their research centered on women's economic, political and social status in Ukraine. For example, they conducted a gender analysis of the media for the 2003 UNDP Gender Issues in Ukraine publication. They also initiated several seminars on gender in their own fields and were working on developing an interdisciplinary methodology (Interview with women's NGO activist, 6/3/2003).

The three gender studies centers in Kyiv also hoped to create a scholarly gender studies community. All expressed disappointment with their lack of progress in this area. The women felt that researchers remained unaware of each other's work, often duplicating each other. A researcher with the Kyiv Institute for Gender Research commented on the result of the lack of networking among gender researchers.

Therefore frequently those local gender centers just duplicate each other – their subjects, functions, etc. For instance, three years ago it was very vivid when two centers were doing the same subject research. I guess it was very acute then. They did seminars on the same topic at the same time (Interview with women's NGO activist, 6/3/2003).

Kharkiv

Humanitarian Initiatives in Kharkiv also conducted research and taught classes in universities. However, its activists were also involved in supporting the larger women's movement and participating in some of the activities of other women's NGOs in Kharkiv. The organization sought to introduce gender into the universities and promote gender awareness in society at large. The NGO was established primarily to achieve, "a democratic society where women's knowledge and potential are accounted for and assessed in all areas of life" (Smolyar 2001, 37). They participated with other women's NGOs in Kharkiv, conducted their own research projects, and worked on the issue of trafficking of women. They worked with other women's NGOs, schools and local government in Kharkiv educating people about their rights and how to defend them. The original leader of Humanitarian Initiatives moved to Kyiv to become the director of the

anti-trafficking organization, La Strada, but the organization in Kharkiv remained in operation.³⁵

Humanitarian Initiatives activists felt their organization enjoyed a certain amount of success. According to one women's activist, ten years earlier, no one knew what gender meant. Now it was a popular topic among university students and one that many students chose for paper topics. It was recently accepted as a legitimate field of study by the Ministry of Education. No one in the government used to know what the word gender meant, but now the local government was establishing a gender council. There was still room for much improvement, but awareness of gender was spreading in Kharkiv (Interview with women's NGO leader, 2/6/2003).

L'viv

L'viv's Women and Society also conducted gender research and taught university classes with a gender focus. Their research explored the position of women in L'viv and western Ukraine. They hoped their teaching and research would change the consciousness of women in western Ukraine. Society needed to understand what gender was, become aware of the traditional stereotypes, and the position women occupy in Ukraine, especially in the L'viv region according to Women in Society activists. This

³⁵ La Strada International is a Dutch organization against trafficking in women, which organizes and finances anti-trafficking NGOs and activities in several post-socialist states, including Ukraine. It appeared to be the most well known and well financed anti-trafficking organization in Ukraine. Several of the women's NGOs with anti-trafficking activities received a lot of their information and support from La Strada.

was why they chose to focus on western Ukrainian women. Some of their research projects included a gender analysis of professional career advancement at the L'viv National University, women's positions in 19th and 20th century western Ukrainian rural families, an oral history of western Ukrainian women of the 20th century, and an anthology of gender research in the humanities.

Summary of gender studies centers

Each city had gender studies centers that engaged in research and teaching related to gender. Kyiv's centers were more focused on research in their particular fields and creating a network among gender studies researchers. The consensus was that the networking had largely failed up to that point. However, the Kyiv Institute for Gender Research was working on a UNDP project to develop a basic course on gender theory for universities and a textbook to be used for the course (Interview with women's NGO activist, 6/3/2003). The project was finished and the course and textbook approved by the ministry of education (<http://www.un.kiev.ua/en/pressroom/news/577/>). It was completed with the cooperation of women from a number of gender studies centers throughout Ukraine. It could be considered an important step toward creating a networked community of researchers.

Humanitarian Initiatives in Kharkiv was more involved in the larger women's movement in its city than centers in Kyiv and L'viv. Some of this can be attributed to personal friendships, and the women's movement in Kharkiv tended to be more

connected than in Kyiv and especially L'viv. Some of this is the result of foreign initiatives in Kharkiv that are discussed in chapter eight.

Women and Society, in L'viv, focused on the plight of western Ukrainian women as opposed to all Ukrainian women. This again showed L'viv's tendency to focus on its own region rather than all of Ukraine. This same pattern was observed in the nationalism frame in L'viv. L'viv women activists using the nationalism frame tended to concentrate on the revival of western Ukrainian cultural traditions, rather than Ukraine more generally. Throughout its history western Ukraine maintained more of a separate national identity than parts of Ukraine under the Russian empire (including Kyiv and Kharkiv). Perhaps this partially explains the narrower focus on western Ukraine among L'viv women activists.

Thus, women's activists identified gender discrimination as an injustice and adopted goals and activities to address it. Were these organizations making progress toward their desired outcomes? This next section examines the success of women's NGOs using the gender discrimination frame.

Outcomes and Gender Discrimination

Outcomes, for the purposes of this study, were defined as maintaining operation at any level and the ability to sustain a campaign. The ability to sustain a campaign is admittedly a low threshold and does not necessarily mean the campaigns achieved the desired end. Women's activists using the gender and discrimination frame sometimes even admitted to limited accomplishments. Women's activists that worked for increased

political representation carried out campaigns that did not achieve the desired end of increasing women's political representation. These women's activists recognized their failure in the 2002 elections, but believed they were laying the foundation for future improvement. None of those promoting a gender consciousness in the population expected the changes to occur in the space of five or even ten years. Women's activists using this frame felt that a lot of what they were working toward would be realized in the next generation. Thus, these organizations were able to implement campaigns, but the campaigns did not always immediately achieve their end goals. Furthermore, most of the women's NGO leaders using this frame also had international funding for their projects which provides resources to implement activities regardless of local resonance. (This is discussed further in chapter seven.) Thus, a shortcoming of the outcome measure used in this study is that it focuses on the ability to sustain campaigns, regardless of whether the desired end was achieved.

Gender is an imported word in Russian and Ukrainian and still unfamiliar to most of the population. Activists using the gender discrimination theme were asking women and men to view women outside the dominant cultural perspective and to critique their own culture, sometimes using language that was unfamiliar to most Ukrainians. The frame, therefore, was not expected to enjoy strong resonance among Ukrainian women. Were NGOs using the gender discrimination frame able to sustain campaigns?

Women's NGOs using the gender discrimination frame enjoyed a high rate of organizational maintenance as shown in the tables below, although not as high as the nationalism frame (89%). In 2002-2003, 75% of all the organizations using the gender discrimination frame were sustaining campaigns. Three of the organizations using the

frame were no longer active, but when they were active they also sustained campaigns. Past rates of organizational maintenance, which includes the three organizations no longer in operation, for the gender discrimination frame was 92%. In Kyiv, the organizational maintenance rate in 2002-2003 was 70%, 72% in Kharkiv and 100% in L'viv. Thus, despite the imported nature of the frame, women's NGOs using this frame were successful in maintaining their organizations. Gender is a foreign word, but discrimination is not. However, it too was not expected to enjoy strong resonance in the population since during the Soviet era people were told that discrimination was eliminated and did not exist in their country. How then was the gender discrimination theme able to enjoy a high rate of organizational maintenance?

Even though gender was a foreign concept and discrimination was officially abolished, gender discrimination still existed. Women's activists using this frame were able to provide many concrete examples, often from their own lives, of gender discrimination. The experiences of gender discrimination described by women's activists most likely resonated with their target populations even if the word gender was unfamiliar. Women's activists using this frame sometimes helped women label the experiences of gender discrimination they encountered and presented an alternative for women that involved greater equality and respect for their rights. Once they had a way to discuss the gender discrimination they experienced, they could begin to address it. Therefore, even though the vocabulary may not have resonated, experiences of gender discrimination individual women experienced most likely resonated with the life experiences of many women in Ukraine.

Table: 5-5 Comparison of past rates of organizational maintenance for NGOs using the gender discrimination frame to those not using it by city and across all cities

	<u>Kyiv</u>		<u>Kharkiv</u>		<u>L'viv</u>		<u>All Cities</u>	
	<u>Gender</u>	<u>No Gender</u>	<u>Gender</u>	<u>No Gender</u>	<u>Gender</u>	<u>No Gender</u>	<u>Gender</u>	<u>No Gender</u>
Past Campaigns	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>
0-active, not camp	1 (7%)	2 (20%)	1 (14%)	1 (17%)	0 (0%)	1 (11%)	2 (8%)	4 (16%)
1-hard to tell	0 (0%)	2 (20%)	0 (0%)	1 (17%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0	3 (12%)
2-clearly campaign	13 (93%)	6 (60%)	6 (86%)	4 (67%)	3 (100%)	8 (89%)	22 (92%)	18 (72%)
Totals	100%=14	100%=10	100%=7	100%=6	100%=3	100%=9	100%=24	100%=25

Table: 5-6 Comparison of current rates of organizational maintenance for NGOs using the gender discrimination frame to those not using it by city and across all cities

	<u>Kyiv</u>		<u>Kharkiv</u>		<u>L'viv</u>		<u>All Cities</u>	
	<u>Gender</u>	<u>No Gender</u>	<u>Gender</u>	<u>No Gender</u>	<u>Gender</u>	<u>No Gender</u>	<u>Gender</u>	<u>No Gender</u>
Current Campaigns	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>
0-active, not camp	1 (7%)	2 (20%)	1 (14%)	1 (16%)	0	1 (11%)	2 (8%)	4 (16%)
1-hard to tell	0	1 (10%)	1 (14%)	1 (16%)	0	2 (22%)	1 (4%)	3 (13%)
2-clearly campaign	10 (70%)	6 (60%)	5 (72%)	4 (67%)	3 (100%)	6 (66%)	18 (75%)	16 (67%)
3-no longer active	3 (21%)	1 (10%)	0	0	0	0	3 (13%)	1 (4%)
Totals	100%=14	100%=10	100%=7	100%=6	100%=3	100%=9	100%=24	100%=24

The higher rate of organizational maintenance of women's NGOs using the gender discrimination theme in L'viv compared to Kyiv and Kharkiv also warrants explanation. In L'viv, the organizational maintenance rate in 2002-2003 was 100% and in Kyiv and Kharkiv it was only 70% and 72% respectively. Based on discussions of the cultural context in L'viv and fewer women's NGOs using this frame there, a lower organizational maintenance rate was expected. Only three of 12 women's organizations in L'viv used the gender discrimination frame compared to 14 and eight in Kyiv and Kharkiv respectively. In Kyiv and Kharkiv, four of the women's NGOs using this frame were coded as not maintaining their organizations because they were no longer in operation or not sustaining campaigns at the time of the study, but in the past they sustained campaigns. Women in Mass Media and the Ukrainian Center for Women's Studies were so successful that their members were recruited to more lucrative work in the field. The leading activists for Women in Mass Media were offered positions with

UNDP in Kyiv which was why their organization was not operating in 2002-2003. Several of the women's activists in the Ukrainian Center for Women's Studies were successful enough in that organization that they decided to found their own separate organizations. Similarly, the founder of Humanitarian Initiatives in Kharkiv was also recruited to more profitable work in her specialty.

In addition, while it was too early for most of these organizations to expect concrete outcomes from their activities, particularly since many of them included a change in gender consciousness as their goal, there were some outcomes that women's activists using the gender discrimination theme discussed. Qualitative discussions of success did not show L'viv's gender oriented NGOs to be more successful in terms of concrete achievements than Kyiv and Kharkiv women's NGOs with comparable goals. Gender studies centers in Kyiv and Kharkiv reported greater progress in integrating gender studies into the university curriculum and more knowledge of gender among students. Gender academics in L'viv still felt there was a lot of resistance to the topic in universities in their city, and most students still did not know what it meant. In Kyiv and Kharkiv, the centers that offered counseling to victims of domestic violence and trafficking reported greater willingness on the part of women to use their services than in L'viv. Kyiv's School of Equal Opportunities and L'viv's Younka were very similar women's NGOs working with the youth in each city to create gender awareness. Younka focused much less of its efforts on gender awareness than did School of Equal Opportunities. Younka sustained campaigns but reported greater difficulty than School of Equal Opportunities in sustaining their campaigns over a long period of time.

In Kyiv and Kharkiv, women's NGOs using the gender discrimination theme were working to increase women's political representation and foster greater gender sensitivity among government officials. In Kyiv, the focus was at the national level and in Kharkiv at the local level. Small steps were being made in 2002-2003 and have continued since. (See Hrycak 2006 and 2007a for evidence of progress related to gender issues in trafficking and gender equality legislation.) Kharkiv, in 2003, was in the process of creating a municipal gender council. In L'viv, there was no dialogue between women's NGOs and the local government to address gender concerns. L'viv's women's NGOs working on gender issues were not even attempting to influence the local government. (See the chapter eight for further discussion of differences in local opportunities.) Women's gender discrimination activists in L'viv even explained that they expected slower rates of change in L'viv compared to the rest of Ukraine in the area of gender issues. Thus, the higher rate of organizational maintenance for women's NGOs using the gender discrimination theme in L'viv compared to Kyiv and Kharkiv, is most likely a result of the low threshold for outcomes and low numbers of women's organizations using the gender discrimination frame.

Conclusions

Gender issues in the Ukrainian women's movement in 2002-2003 were largely discussed within the frame work of different types of gender discrimination and goals and activities to address it. I labeled the types of gender discrimination described by

women's activists as institutional, Ukrainian cultural and universal cultural gender discrimination. Institutional gender discrimination framing was primarily limited to Kyiv and Kharkiv, with a little mention of it in L'viv. Kyiv focused on national level institutional gender discrimination and Kharkiv women's activists focused on the local level. Only one women's activist in L'viv mentioned this, and only very briefly. L'viv's more conservative climate most likely decreased the likelihood of women choosing to challenge existing institutions. Ukrainian specific cultural gender discrimination received the most discussion in all three cities. Non-Ukrainian specific cultural gender discrimination received some attention in Kyiv and Kharkiv, but not in L'viv. L'viv women's activists showed a tendency to focus on issues specific to western Ukraine which may be a reason why they did not discuss gender discrimination they felt was not unique to Ukraine.

Goals and activities to address gender discrimination were divided into assistance to particular populations of Ukrainian women and assistance to all Ukrainian women. Kyiv had an emphasis on assisting women overcome gender discrimination in professional fields. All cities provided business assistance to women seeking to find new work and counseling centers for victims of abuse and human trafficking. Political representation and gender consciousness in policy making were focuses in Kyiv and Kharkiv, but not in L'viv. L'viv's women's movement had very little interaction with local government, and when it did it was not on issues related to gender. L'viv's Women and Society activists explained that western Ukrainian women as a whole tended not to challenge the status quo which is probably why there was not a political focus among L'viv's women's organizations using the gender discrimination frame.

The gender studies centers also varied by city even though all of them maintained research and teaching on gender at the university level as their goals. In Kyiv, women concentrated on research in their specific academic fields rather than including women from several different academic disciplines in one organization. They were also more concerned about creating a networked community of gender studies academics, a goal they felt they failed to reach in 2002-2003. The Kharkiv, the gender studies NGO that was studied had more interaction with the Kharkiv women's movement generally. In L'viv, Women and Society's research focused on western Ukrainian women rather than all Ukrainian women.

Thus, like the nationalism frame, the gender discrimination theme was adapted by local women's activists to achieve a degree of resonance. However, unlike the nationalism frame, the gender discrimination frame had to be adapted to fit the Ukrainian context and individual local contexts. Gender had to be set in the Ukrainian context which activists did by discussing forms of gender discrimination. Gender discrimination was prevalent in Ukraine according to women's activists using this frame, although not previously labeled as such by Ukrainians. Women's activists discussed their own experiences of gender discrimination and pointed to their absence from influential decision making positions in Ukraine. They also showed Ukrainian women that the national government admitted discrimination against women existed in Ukraine based on international and national documents it signed despite official declarations to the contrary. This is not to say that all the target populations embraced the frame, but activists were able to show some relevance to the lives of Ukrainian women.

Further, the gender discrimination frame was used slightly differently in each city depending on the local culture and context of each city. In Kyiv, the gender discrimination frame was used more in relation to the national government and professional occupations. In Kharkiv, where the women's movement enjoyed more dialogue with the city government than in Kyiv and particularly L'viv, its women's gender activists had more interaction with city government officials to address gender discrimination. In L'viv, the frame was used much less frequently than in Kyiv and Kharkiv. When L'viv activists used the frame, they primarily discussed Ukraine specific gender discrimination with very little discussion of institutional and universal gender discrimination. This is perhaps reflective of the tendency in L'viv to concentrate on western Ukraine rather than Ukraine as a whole as was observed in the use of the nationalism frame. Thus, the frame was adapted to each city's local context.

Chapter 6

Economic Crisis Framing

The collapse of the Soviet Union and the declaration of independence for Ukraine created a great deal of political and social optimism in Ukraine. However, by 1992 the mood was drastically altered as a result of the severe decline in production, high inflation, and ubiquitous corruption. As people lost their jobs, savings, status and sense of security words such as ‘democracy’, ‘market’, ‘capitalism’, and ‘the West’ quickly lost their appeal. The transition to a market economy turned out to be a cruel reality that lasted more than the first few years. Eleven years later in 2002, Ukraine was still transitioning to a market economy, and only a few (rarely women) were able to reap the benefits that were supposed to result. Ukrainian women, along with most post-Soviet women were already in low paying and low prestige jobs. In the transition to a market economy they were the first to lose their jobs. Women constituted 70-80% of the unemployed in Ukraine in 1995. Their average income remained considerably lower than men’s. A United Nations sponsored human development report from 1993 showed that the average income of women was 45% of men’s in the energy sector and 90% compared to men’s in light industry (Pavlychko 1997, 219-225). In 2002 women’s average monthly wages were still 30.7% below that of men (United Nations Development Program 2003, 28).

Women’s NGOs formed across Ukraine to address issues related to the plight of women and children resulting for the ongoing economic crisis. Many of the women’s organizations focused on the practical everyday needs of women and children. In the

sample of women's NGOs from Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv, 45% (22 of 49) framed their concerns around the economic crisis. The frame was least popular in Kyiv where only 29% (7 of 24) of women's NGOs in the sample used the economic crisis frame. In Kharkiv and L'viv the frame was used more frequently with 62% (8 of 13) and 42% (5 of 12) respectively of women's organizations discussing the economic crisis. Women's activists tended not to discuss the causes of economic crisis at great length in their frames. They did not try to explain why the economic crisis came about or how the transition could have been orchestrated differently to avoid unemployment, inflation and the general drop in the standard of living most Ukrainians experienced. Most of the women's activists discussing the economic difficulties accepted it as an unfortunate part of their transition to a market economy.

Women's activists in organizations using the economic crisis frame across the three cities recognized it was a country-wide phenomenon and described the results for everyone in essentially the same manner. They knew the transition was affecting all Ukrainians, women and men, as shown by a comment from an activist in L'viv's Olena Teliha Society.

Unemployment started everywhere, and even the people who worked were stressed.... Suddenly they were fired... There was not enough money, cloths, food and other things (Interview with women's NGO leader, 4/11/2003).

Instead of discussing causes and the impact of the economic crisis on Ukraine as a whole, women's activists using the economic crisis theme more frequently discussed its effects on women and children. Women in the economic crisis were largely framed either as mothers or workers and sometimes both within the same organization. With a

few exceptions, women's NGOs using the economic crisis frame were not looking to return to the old system even though some wished for the social services that were formerly available.³⁶ Instead, women's activists were looking for ways to help women survive and adapt to their new situation. NGOs in the three cities provided combinations of immediate charitable aid to women along with services, such as business training that facilitated long term adaptation and greater self sufficiency.

Table: 6-1 Summary of similarities and differences across cities in the construction of economic crisis frame

Similarities in emphases across cities

- Women framed as mothers or workers within the economic crisis
- Self-help and charitable assistance provided
- Frame varied by city less than the nationalism and gender discrimination frames

Variations in economic crisis frame across cities

<u>Kyiv</u>	<u>Kharkiv</u>	<u>L'viv</u>
-Women framed as workers least frequently & always in conjunction with motherhood	-women framed as mothers or workers	-women framed as mothers or workers

This chapter examines how women's NGOs framed the economic crisis as a problem for mothers and workers, followed by a discussion of the goals and activities

³⁶ There were two exceptions to the general acceptance of an independent Ukraine along with its difficult transition to a market economy. They were not particularly well integrated with the rest of the women's movement in part because of their political orientation.

adopted by organizations.³⁷ The table above summarizes the construction of the economic crisis frame across the the three cities. The connection of the economic crisis frames to outcomes is also examined. Throughout, city distinctions are highlighted.

Women as Mothers

Several of the women's NGOs using the economic crisis frame discussed it as a problem from women as mothers. Among the 22 women's NGOs in the sample using the economic crisis theme, 11 of them described it as problem for women as mothers and one women's NGO framed it as a problem for women as wives. In Kyiv, five of the seven framed women as mothers, in Kharkiv four of eight, and in L'viv three of five women's organizations using the economic crisis theme framed women as mothers struggling to adjust to Ukraine's new economic situation. Some of these organizations also simultaneously framed women as workers, which will be discussed later in the chapter. The economic crisis was a considered a problem by these women's activists because mothers could not adequately care for their children.

Women's activists reported that mothers were not able to provide even the basic necessities such as adequate food, clothing and health care. A good education and summer camps/vacations for children were also high on the list of important things that

³⁷ Two Kyiv organizations did not fit into the two general framing categories of women as mothers or workers. Council of Women of Chernobyl talked about the economic crisis in terms of the problems Chernobyl invalids faced. International Women's Club of Kyiv (IWCK) explained that poverty was universal. Women in the club were primarily ex patriots who raised money to give to NGOs in the Kyiv region that provided assistance to the indigent.

many mothers could no longer afford and felt were necessary for their children. The lack of social services as a result of the economic crisis also contributed to the general inability to care for children according to women's activists using this frame. Families/mothers with many children received special attention from these women's NGOs as well.

Lack of social services available to mothers and children

Particularly in Kyiv, women's activists using the economic crisis frame discussed it as a problem for mothers who no longer had social services available to them, and as a result they could not properly care for their children. One of the leaders of Zhinocha Hromada (Women's Community) in Kyiv explained that the situation immediately following Ukrainian independence necessitated their focus on social services to mothers and children. They believed that the effects of the economic hardships resulted in poor or no access to social services which could be seen in the poor health of many of Ukraine's children. "Social service in Ukraine and in Kyiv in particular is very poor, and at that time (early 1990s) it didn't exist at all, so it was women who undertook that sphere...." (Interview with women's NGO leader, 6/5/2003). Similarly the head of Kyiv's Spilka Zhinok (Women's Union) also believed that the economic hardships created a lack of social services making it very difficult for women to care for their children.

In the Soviet period women were more protected, they had more or less appropriate salaries, jobs, opportunities to provide vacations for their children to recover their health, to send their children to kindergartens, schools, etc. It was easier then and women were more protected. Nowadays it is difficult to provide all this due to the country's economic situation. However, we are trying to get all

that back gradually so women who want to work (not all women want to work) could work, that their children could have opportunities for healthy vacations.... If women and children were protected in the Soviet times it is not here anymore. At that time we did not know what unemployment was, we did not understand how it could be possible not to send a child to a camp/sanatorium to get his/her health recovered (Interview with women's NGO leader, 6/4/2003).

The head of Kyiv's Union of Women Workers for the Future of the Children of Ukraine (UWWFCU) explained that their organization was founded to help women, "who appeared to be unprotected in the beginning of the 1990s, and also of those who have been unemployed for over five years, having problems educating their children and sustaining their families." (Interview with women's NGO leader, 1/29/2003). They felt the state should be providing some protection and services to mothers to enable them to care for their children.

In Kharkiv and L'viv, the leaders of UWWFCU also framed the economic crisis as a problem for mothers who could not adequately care for their children in part because of a lack of government services. According to the Kharkiv women's activists in UWWFCU the new capitalist system treated women very harshly, and given a choice, they preferred the old Soviet system which provided many services to support mothers and children.

The women experienced the care of our government. They could get extra vacations, and the policy of the government was to enable the women to spend more time at home and rearing children. There were the so-called home-made food stores, so that women would spend less time in the kitchen, but cook using the half-ready foods from the store. There were extra leaves for women: before and after the delivery of a child. Our children used to rest in pioneer camps for free, especially favorable conditions were created for families with many children. This is what we had in the Soviet times (Interview with women's NGO leader, 2/24/03).

Under the Soviets women and children were socially protected. Now, each woman had to struggle just to survive and often could not provide the basic necessities for their children. Only the leader of the Kharkiv branch of UWWFCU actually preferred the Soviet era to an independent Ukraine. The organization also discussed reunification with Russia in a round table event because they felt it enabled mothers to take better care of their children. The leader of UWWFCU in L'viv also believed the economic crisis resulted in inadequate social services for mothers and children and that their situation was better during the Soviet era. Unlike the Kharkiv branch of UWWFCU she did not prefer the Soviet era or desire its return, but instead strongly supported Ukraine's socialist party.

Women's NGOs in Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv framed the economic crisis as a problem for mothers who could not adequately care for their children. The crisis was made worse for mothers because the system of social services that was in place during the Soviet era collapsed and was not replaced by the Ukrainian government. Women's activists in all three cities using the economic crisis frame explained that this left women and children unprotected. Kyiv women's activists were especially aware of the lack of social services. They may have been more acutely aware of the government's neglect of women and children because they were located in the capital. As the capital city they probably enjoyed more of the social services available under the Soviet Union than the other cities. Furthermore, they saw the government spending money on expensive restorations/renovations in Kyiv and the wealth that many corrupt politicians accumulated. They witnessed Ukraine's scarce resources being spent in ways other than caring for women and children. They may also have been more aware than women's

activists in Kharkiv and L'viv of the national legislation guaranteeing protection and services for women and children that clearly were not being provided by the government.

Despite the harsh realities of the economic crisis for women and children, only the leader of UWWFCU in Kharkiv actually claimed to prefer the Soviet era and was a proponent of reunification with Russia. Other women's activists in Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv using this frame acknowledged some benefits of the Soviet era, but did not desire its return. Since Kharkiv tends to be a more Russian oriented city that is not interested in Ukrainian nationalism, it is not surprising that some there would express nostalgia and even desired the return of the Soviet past.

Care for children

Other women's NGOs using the economic crisis frame and discussing women, primarily as mothers, focused on the effects of the economic crisis for children.³⁸

Women were not even always discussed. Instead, hardships faced by children were framed as the injustice created by the economic crisis. These women activists acted as mothers on behalf of the children. The leader of Mother's Happiness in Kyiv expressed it succinctly: "Our organization is a women's and children's organization. I can't call it

³⁸ One women's activist in Kharkiv framed women as wives in the economic crisis and was the only one in the sample to do so. Harmony's leader explained that wives needed to help keep their families together through the stress of the economic crisis. The role of wives, according to this activist, should be to support and encourage their husbands in their search for new employment, instead of nagging and becoming angry with them as so many wives were prone to do. Harmony's leader was the only women's activist to explain that women were making the crisis worse for themselves and their families by their negative behavior. However, like the other women activists using this frame, she framed women as the ones struggling to solve family problems.

purely a women's organization. It is more a children's organization in a sense."

(Interview with women's NGO leader, 5/28/2003). An activist with Women of Chernobyl Fund in Kyiv explained their organization also functioned as a women's organization that focused on the needs of children.

Our other goal was to help children living on the territories, which were mostly exposed to radiation (from Chernobyl)... By taking care of children's health we make sure that women can remain active. These aspects are very interrelated; therefore it is impossible to separate children and women's programs (Interview with women's NGO leader, 1/30/2003).

A women's activist with Nadia in Kharkiv, again connected women's and children's issues when she explained that they decided to add a reproductive wellness campaign to their activities because so many Ukrainian babies were born sickly. They decided to address the health of mothers because of its harmful effects on children.

The Olena Teliha Society in L'viv had a strong emphasis on the difficulties of Ukrainian children as well. According to their activists, L'viv had many musically gifted children who wanted to study and sometimes even received free education, but they did not even have enough money for transportation to and from their lessons. If they boarded the public transportation without paying the children were thrown off. The women's activists explained that children often came to their classes without adequate clothing in the winter or not enough food to eat. Its leader recalled a time when one of her pupils did not come to his concert. When she asked him why he answered, "I did not have shoes and could not come." (Interview with women's NGO leader, 4/11/2003). Several of the women's activists in L'viv's Olena Teliha Society were employed in positions that involved education and care of children. They witnessed the effects of the economic crisis for children daily and saw the very practical needs of those they taught.

Mother's Happiness in Kyiv is representative of many women's groups that gave special attention to families/mothers with many children. Families with many children were defined as three or more, a category used in the Soviet era. In Soviet times they received allowances and other benefits depending on the number of children. In independent Ukraine they were still entitled to very small allowances. According to the leader of Mother's Happiness the allowances were so small that the amount of paper work they had to complete and lines they had to wait in to receive the money discouraged most people from even applying for it. The head of Mother's Happiness explained that families with many children were usually socially insecure and unable to provide for their children.

There is also a very bad situation with caring for children. Earlier (in the early 1990s) it was easier to find ways but with each year it is more and more difficult. There is always a question of money. Mothers do not make enough money even to cover a trip for their children to camp. Not every mother can provide medical treatment for her child. (Interview with women's NGO leader, 5/28/2003).

All branches of UWWFCU and the Olena Teliha Society in L'viv also believed that families with many children were particularly vulnerable as a result of the Ukrainian economic crisis.

Women's NGOs using the economic crisis theme that focused their frames on the effects on children in particular, and often families with many children, were common to all cities. These women's activists believed that women's and children's concerns could not be separated and that children's issues were women's issues. There were no clear distinctions between the cities in the way that women's activists framed the necessity of women's NGOs providing assistance to children. Since the economic

crisis affected all and produced similar results all over Ukraine, as acknowledged by women's activists, similar framing of mothers and children within the crisis is not surprising. There was only slightly more differentiation by city in activists framing of women as workers.

Women as workers

Women's activists using the economic crisis theme also framed women as simply needing help finding new employment, although more of them framed women as mothers. Among the 22 women's NGOs using the economic crisis frame, eight of them framed women as workers. In Kyiv activists from two women's groups framed women as workers, Zhinocha Hromada and Spilka Zhinok. The leaders of both of these organizations also framed women as mothers. The women's activists in Kharkiv and L'viv that framed women as workers did not also frame them as mothers. In Kharkiv, women's activists from four women's organizations framed women as workers and in L'viv two used the women as worker frame.

Kyiv women as workers

Women's activists in Kyiv's Spilka Zhinok and Zhinocha Hromada both framed women as mothers and workers. The head of Kyiv's Zhinocha Hromada also sometimes spoke about women as people who needed help regaining their footing, explaining that many women lost their jobs and needed help finding their place in the new society and

regaining their confidence. She spoke about how difficult it was for women to find new employment or start their own businesses when all of their capital disappeared in the transition. The leader of Spilka Zhinok in Kyiv also discussed helping women after the economic crisis began.

Unemployment significantly affected families and women. Pensions are low, salaries are low, and women are the first to be fired. It is the young women who can find a job, but if a woman is over 30 then it is not so easy for her to find a job. We help women in a social way (Interview with women's NGO leader, 6/04/2003).

Both Zhinocha Hromada's and Spilka Zhinok's leaders spoke about helping women find new jobs because they were people who needed incomes to support themselves. As discussed above they also equated the economic crisis as a crisis for mothers trying to care for their children. This framing of women simultaneously as mothers and workers is reminiscent of the Soviet era working mother policy. Spilka Zhinok was organized from the Soviet women's organization and retains the same leader. She explained that their task in Soviet times, "was to help women to be a mother, to be a state leader, to be a teacher, a doctor, etc." (Interview with women's NGO leader, 6/04/2003). She believed that their goals were fundamentally changed to meet women's needs in independent Ukraine. "Nowadays our task has changed radically because now we think more about how to help women financially, how to protect them socially, how to help them find a job, to help them with money, clothing, shoes, etc." (Interview with women's NGO leader, 6/04/2003). However, her framing of women, mothers and children in the economic crisis showed a link to the Soviet framing of women as mothers and workers (Zhurzhenko 2004). The difference lay in the acknowledgement that

women could choose not to be workers in independent Ukraine, although the realities of the transition to a market economy left few women with that option. Other activities of Zhinocha Hromada and Spilka Zhinok in Kyiv demonstrated that their goals were expanded beyond the Soviet working mother policy. They each addressed gender discrimination against women and improvement of their status in society (See the gender discrimination chapter for further discussion).

Kharkiv and L'viv women as workers

In Kharkiv and L'viv, women's activists using the economic crisis frame did not make as close a connection between women as workers and women as mothers within the same frame. There was also more use of the women worker frame in Kharkiv and L'viv than in Kyiv. Four of the eight women's activists using this theme framed women as workers in the economic crisis in Kharkiv compared to two of seven in Kyiv. In L'viv, two women activists from the five women's NGOs using the economic crisis theme framed women as workers. In Kharkiv and L'viv, women's activists tended to frame women in the economic crisis as talented women who needed jobs and sometimes mentioned that they had families or children. These women's activists recognized that women had families, but were not rendering assistance to them primarily because they wanted to help them care for their children. The injustice was that the economic crisis made it difficult for women to find employment.

Women activists spoke about finding employment and assistance for women because they needed help adjusting to the transition. For example, a leader in Kharkiv's Women's Fund explained why so many women of Kharkiv, even highly educated ones, were having trouble finding work.

Kharkiv was a city of great significance in the former Soviet Union. It was the third greatest city in its intellectual resources. When the Soviet Union crumbled, the connections with Russia were broken. And what was even more crucial, the military-industrial complex collapsed. It was, in fact, the most profitable area. In other words, we contributed our "brains" to the military-industrial complex. And a great number of women worked in the research institutes and establishments related to the whole Soviet Union. All these research institutes and design offices were closed down. As a result, it was mostly women who were left unemployed. The men started getting adjusted, many of them left the country, I mean those who had been involved in that research. But the ladies were bound to their families, so they stayed in this country (Interview with women's NGO leader, 2/12/2003).

The leader of Perspecitva in Kharkiv provided a very similar explanation as to why Kharkiv's women, particularly scientists, needed special assistance. No connection to families or children was made by this women's activist.

Because Kharkiv is a well known scientific center and research center of the former Soviet Union; it used to be the third after Moscow and St.Petersburg. So we have a huge number of universities and research institutions here in Kharkiv. And in the beginning and middle of the 90s there were so many women who lost their jobs and who were not paid. It was really difficult for them to survive. And all of them were and are so bright and talented that it was just a shame to lose the potential for the economic development of our region (Interview with women's NGO leader, 2/27/2003).

Similarly, the leader on Nika in L'viv explained that the old system fell apart causing many women to lose their jobs. L'viv was not part of the military industrial complex, but still had many highly skilled women workers. She was dismayed that when the economy collapsed many women ended up selling goods in the outdoor markets

which were known for their poor working conditions (Interview with women's NGO leader, 4/22/2003).

The leader of Panna, a women's NGO in Kharkiv using the economic crisis theme, also discussed the general economic plight of the city and all of Ukraine. She noted that many Ukrainians were emigrating because they felt they could only earn a living in a different country while also using their skills. She was concerned that much of Ukraine's educated class was fleeing. She believed that if women were able to realize their individuality and uniqueness, then they would find ways to support themselves and use their talents at the same time. Women's Perspectives activists in L'viv also identified women leaving the country to find better employment as an injustice. Its leader was concerned because women often unwittingly became human trafficking victims when they accepted employment abroad. The leader of Women's Perspectives believed that as long as women could not find employment in Ukraine they would continue to go abroad to look for work.

Thus, unlike women's activists in Kyiv who framed women as workers within the economic crisis, the Kharkiv and L'viv women's activists did not closely connect women to motherhood in their frames. Women workers were described as talented women, often among the more educated and highly trained in Ukraine, who needed some help finding new employment as a result of the economic collapse. They possessed skills and talents needed in the economic development of their cities. In Kyiv, women workers were also simultaneously framed as mothers who needed employment so they could care for their children. One might expect to find a higher proportion of organizations in Kyiv than in L'viv framing women as workers. Given L'viv's self-proclaimed conservative social

climate it is surprising that women's activists in L'viv framed women as workers but not also as mothers within the same frame. It is also surprising that so few (only two) Kyiv women activists used the women worker frame. Possible explanations are discussed in the conclusion.

Assistance to women and children

Women's NGOs framing women in the economic crisis in all three cities provided services to women and children in Ukraine. Some of the women's organizations helped women with long term adaptation to Ukraine's new economic situation through various types of employment training or employment counseling programs. Other women's NGOs provided immediate charitable aid, such as distribution of food and clothing or activities for children.

Self-help

Providing women with a means of finding new employment was one way several women's NGOs hoped to assist women in the economic crisis. Women's organizations offered business and skills training or forms of psychological adaptation to help women with long term adjustment to a market economy. Among the eight women's activists that framed women as workers, seven headed NGOs that offered self-help programs to women. Self-help programs were provided by six of the 12 women's NGOs whose activists framed women as mothers.

In Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv women's NGOs developed forms of business training or classes teaching new skills for employment. Spilka Zhinok and Zhinocha Hromada in Kyiv founded credit unions to give women the opportunity to take out low interest loans to start their own businesses. All the women's NGOs giving business and economic training in all three cities organized seminars and workshops teaching women the basics of business. Perspektiva, in Kharkiv, also included what they named "soft skills". Their activists taught women how to make presentations confidently, search for jobs, write resumes, manage their time, communicate and think creatively and treat customers respectfully. According to a Perspektiva activist, the business, computer and English courses often enabled women to find a job or start a business. The soft skills helped them to become successful in their new line of work (Interview with women's NGO leader, 2/27/2003).

UWWFCU in Kyiv, felt women needed to learn the new laws in Ukraine, and this would better equip them to provide for their children in the market economy. They founded a leadership school in Kyiv, and from that women went into the villages to train other women about the new laws and how government institutions functioned. They taught women business basics and were exploring new avenues for women's business in Ukraine, such as green tourism. UWWFCU's leader explained that their goal was, "to educate women, to influence upon their conscience, make them understand that it is only due to their active participation that they and their children will be able to survive" (Interview with women's NGO leader, 1/29/2003). Soyuz Ukrainok (Ukrainian National Women's League) in L'viv also reached out to women in villages by offering their business and economic education courses to them. Their topics included basics of

business, legislation concerning businesses, foundations of marketing, planning and credit. In the rural areas they maintained business clubs for women who started their own businesses (Hrisky-Palazhii 27-31, 2002).

In Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv there were women's NGOs that helped women find employment, not by teaching them new skills, but by encouraging them to think of new ways to use the skills and talents they already had. Sometimes this was referred to as psychological adaptation and sometimes employment training. Zhinocha Hromada in Kyiv believed that since women were rarely found in leadership positions, they did not know how to properly lead a business or an organization. They offered women's leadership trainings to teach women confidence and give them experience. In Kharkiv, women's activists with Panna and Harmony believed women needed to develop and use skills they already possessed in order to find new ways to earn money. Panna's leader believed they had to turn pessimism into optimism in order for people to believe they could live a decent life in Ukraine. To this end, they held fashion contests to display works made by amateurs. According to Panna's leader, many women who were trained in a variety of fields discovered they could make unique and valuable items of fashion. Their contest taught women that they were more than their jobs which was a new way of thinking to many Ukrainians. Panna also published a magazine under the same name that gave numerous examples of people who accomplished important tasks with very little for the purpose of encouraging people to make something of themselves, no matter how much or how little they had.

In L'viv, Nika, sought to help women find employment with psychological training as well. Nika activists felt too many Ukrainians had become passive. They

organized training sessions that were intended to teach women to be independent of the government instead of waiting for government to do something for them.

And so the goal of all the training is to stir up a person. It's about faith in your strengths. For us, for our level, on our psychological ground it is needed. ...At the beginning of 1990's we had 80% helpless people. Do you understand? They've been waiting for a good president to come, for a good boss to come who would give us something. But democracy requires people to be active. But they kept waiting – "Give us something. Give us work. Give us money. Give us..." (Interview with women's NGO leader, 4/22/2003).

They hoped to give a woman self confidence in exploring her skills and abilities and then help her think of how to use them to earn a living. Sometimes feeling successful and thinking positively was the most important part of helping women find employment, according to Nika's leader.

Thus, women's NGOs in Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv worked to help women adapt to the economic crisis by providing business training, a means to obtain small loans and other skills to help them find employment. They also encouraged women to think about themselves and their abilities more creatively in order to find new employment. They believed women needed to have confidence in their abilities to succeed.

Charitable aid

In all three cities women's activists concerned about the effect of the economic crisis on children also provided immediate charitable aid to women and children to help them survive the difficult economic times. For example, the leader of Mother's Happiness in Kyiv stated, "We all work to provide support and humanitarian help to

these families to let them survive somehow in this difficult period of time. We also provide medical and cultural assistance” (Interview with women’s NGO leader, 5/28/2003). These women’s NGOs usually did not have a constant supply of food and clothing to give away, but when they had it, they gave it to those who came to them. Charitable assistance was provided by nine of the 12 women’s organizations whose activists framed women as mothers and by one who framed women as workers.

In Kyiv, UWWFCU and Mother’s Happiness provided charitable aid to children. UWWFCU helped those who came to them with a wide variety of needs. For instance, an orphan who had been waiting for a public apartment for nine years came to them for assistance. They helped him eventually receive his apartment. Women who had not received their salaries from the state often came to them asking for help. They helped them to address the right office to receive their pay checks.

Mother’s Happiness focused on humanitarian aid to families with many children. The leader petitioned charities in Kyiv and other organizations for donations that she knew received shipments of humanitarian aid from abroad. Her volunteers then distributed the goods, whatever they were, to families in their organization. Sometimes it was shoes, other times it was used clothes or food. The leader of Mother’s Happiness was also dismayed at the limited cultural activities and extra curricular programs in which these children were able to participate. Mother’s Happiness provided piano lessons, craft sessions, and Sunday school classes. They asked the circus and ballet for free tickets and took as many children as they could. Activists hoped they were not only giving children the basic necessities, but also offering them other experiences which used to be available

to almost all children. Council of Women of Chernobyl in Kyiv also took Chernobyl children to cultural events when tickets were donated.

Among the Kyiv women's NGOs providing charitable assistance to women and children there was a focus on making health services and information available that was not seen in Kharkiv and L'viv. This is most likely because of Kyiv's close proximity to Chernobyl; many families from areas surrounding Chernobyl were evacuated to Kyiv and given housing there. Zhinocha Hromada in Kyiv and Women of Chernobyl Fund engaged in preventative health campaigns aimed specifically at Chernobyl children. Zhinocha Hromada also had preventative health campaigns aimed at the larger population, such as AIDS awareness, breast cancer and tuberculosis.

In Kharkiv, UWWFCU and Spilka Zhinok provided charitable aid for women and children. Spilka Zhinok distributed clothing and medicine when it was donated to their organization. Much like UWWFCU in Kyiv, volunteers with UWWFCU in Kharkiv helped those who came to them on an ad hoc basis with a variety of problems. UWWFCU's goal in Kharkiv was to help the government carry out its programs for women and children. Ukraine, activists explained, had many noble programs and laws on the books with little or no budget money allocated for them. De facto, UWWFCU in Kharkiv implemented government programs simply by helping women and children who came to them with almost any type of assistance requested. Women would come to them asking for some clothing for their children, and if the activists had any second hand clothes available they donated them. Women whose electricity was turned off sometimes came to them asking for help. Activists would ask the company to restore their power on the grounds that her children should have light to do their homework. Or, a grandmother

raising two grandchildren on her own came to them. Her apartment was about to be demolished, and her request for a free apartment had been denied. Activists petitioned different people through letters and were finally able to help her receive a free apartment in which to raise her grandchildren. UWWFCU members would use their connections in the lower levels of municipal government to try to help these women with their specific requests.

In L'viv, UWWFCU, the Olena Teliha Society and Soyuz Ukrainok provided charitable aid for children. UWWFCU volunteers collected items for poor children, such as food, clothing and toys. Some of the items they gave directly to orphanages and others they gave to people who came to them asking for help. There were a few orphanages in L'viv to which they regularly donated humanitarian aid. They also did volunteer work at the orphanages. For example, once a year they painted the playgrounds. They also asked local businessmen for donations for the children, such as tickets to the Crimea or toys. Families with many children were another category they tried to help in similar ways. Volunteers felt they needed to give the children some of the benefits that had been available in the Soviet era.

The Olena Teliha Society in L'viv also gave charitable aid to children in need. They shared whatever they might have with poor children they each encountered in their work places. It might mean just giving a pair of shoes to someone or finding a way for a child to get to school. Sometimes it included looking for sponsors who might pay for a needed surgery for an orphan. Occasionally the Olena Teliha Society received goods from the U.S. which it distributed. Soyuz Ukrainok, while it did not discuss any problems for children as a result of the economic crisis, still provided similar

humanitarian aid. They received goods and money from Soyuz Ukrainok in America and distributed it to orphans and elderly women. They used the money to send children to the theater and the circus. They also worked with street children.

In all three cities women's organizations focused on employment problems for women and immediate charitable assistance to women and children. In Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv some of the NGOs started business and employment training programs to help women find new jobs with a livable income. Several women's NGOs gave charitable aid to children as they were able. In Kyiv, a few women's organizations focused on health care for women and children, particularly Chernobyl children. There was very little differentiation across the three cities in the types of aid they gave to women and children as a result of the economic crisis. This may be because the economic crisis was experienced relatively similarly throughout Ukraine or because the injustice was identified relatively similarly either as a problem for mothers attempting to provide for their children or women as workers. There was some differentiation according to whether women were framed as workers or mothers and the type of assistance offered. When women were framed as workers self-help assistance was provided by the women's NGOs 88% of the time. Self-help activities were associated with the women as mothers frame 50% of the time. Charitable assistance was associated with framing women as mothers 75% of the time while only 13% of the time with the women as worker frame.

Outcomes and the economic crisis frame

Were women's organizations using the economic crisis frame able to sustain campaigns? The economic crisis frame was associated with organizational maintenance 68% of the time in 2002-2003 across the entire sample. The past organizational maintenance rate was 77% across the three cities. This is a generally high rate of organizational maintenance, but not as high a rate as the other frames. The gender and discrimination frame was associated with organizational maintenance 75% of the time in 2002-2003 and 92% of the time in the past. The nationalism frame enjoyed an organizational maintenance rate of 89% both in 2002-2003 and in the past. While the percentage of women's organizations able to sustain campaigns was lower than the nationalism and gender discrimination frames, 100% of the organizations using the economic crisis frame were still in operation in 2002-2003. Thus, the economic crisis frame was associated with organizational maintenance more often than not, although its maintenance rate in terms of carrying out campaigns was noticeably lower than the other two primary frames used by women's activists in 2002-2003.

Table: 6-2 Comparison of current rates of organizational maintenance for NGOs using the economic crisis frame to those not using it by city and across all cities

	<u>Kyiv</u>		<u>Kharkiv</u>		<u>L'viv</u>		<u>All Cities</u>	
	<u>No</u>	<u>No</u>	<u>No</u>	<u>No</u>	<u>No</u>	<u>No</u>	<u>No</u>	<u>No</u>
	<u>Economic</u>	<u>Economic</u>	<u>Economic</u>	<u>Economic</u>	<u>Economic</u>	<u>Economic</u>	<u>Economic</u>	<u>Economic</u>
	<u>Crisis</u>	<u>Crisis</u>	<u>Crisis</u>	<u>Crisis</u>	<u>Crisis</u>	<u>Crisis</u>	<u>Crisis</u>	<u>Crisis</u>
	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>
Past Campaigns								
0-active, not campaign	1 (14%)	2 (12%)	2 (25%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	1 (20%)	3(14%)	3 (11%)
1-hard to tell	1 (14%)	1 (6%)	1 (13%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	2 (9%)	1 (4%)
2-clearly campaign	5 (71%)	14 (82%)	5 (63%)	5 (100%)	7 (100%)	4 (80%)	17 (77%)	23 (85%)
Totals	100%=7	100%=17	100%=8	100%=5	100%=7	100%=5	100%=22	100%=27

Table: 6-3 Comparison of current rates of organizational maintenance for NGOs using the economic crisis frame to those not using it by city and across all cities

	<u>Kyiv</u>		<u>Kharkiv</u>		<u>L'viv</u>		<u>All Cities</u>	
	<u>No</u>	<u>No</u>	<u>No</u>	<u>No</u>	<u>No</u>	<u>No</u>	<u>No</u>	<u>No</u>
	<u>Economic</u>	<u>Economic</u>	<u>Economic</u>	<u>Economic</u>	<u>Economic</u>	<u>Economic</u>	<u>Economic</u>	<u>Economic</u>
	<u>Crisis</u>	<u>Crisis</u>	<u>Crisis</u>	<u>Crisis</u>	<u>Crisis</u>	<u>Crisis</u>	<u>Crisis</u>	<u>Crisis</u>
	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>	<u>Frame</u>
Current Campaigns								
0-active, not camp	1 (14%)	2 (12%)	2 (25%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	1 (20%)	3 (14%)	3 (11%)
1-hard to tell	1 (14%)	0 (0%)	1 (13%)	1 (20%)	2 (29%)	0 (0%)	4 (18%)	1 (4%)
2-clearly campaign	5 (71%)	11 (65%)	5 (63%)	4 (80%)	5 (71%)	4 (80%)	15 (68%)	19 (70%)
3-no longer active	0 (0%)	4 (24%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	4 (15%)
Totals	100%=7	100%=17	100%=8	100%=5	100%=7	100%=5	100%=22	100%=27

In Kyiv, 71% of women's NGOs using the economic crisis theme were sustaining campaigns in 2002-2003 and in the past. In L'viv, the economic crisis theme had an organizational maintenance rate of 71% in 2002-2003 and 100% in the past. In Kharkiv, where the frame was used the most frequently and the highest percentage of the time, the organizational maintenance rate was the lowest, 63% in 2002-2003 and the past. A lower percentage of women's NGOs were sustaining campaigns in Kharkiv in 2002-2003, but given the small sample size this is probably not statistically significant. Outcomes according to whether women were framed as mothers or workers were also examined. Here again, we see some variation in organizational maintenance rate, but probably not enough to be statistically significant. When women were framed as mothers the maintenance rate was 83% compared to 75% when women were framed as workers.

What does this pattern reveal? As discussed earlier, women's activists did not do a lot of framing of the economic crisis itself. When they did it was usually broad statements about the extent of unemployment and general hardships faced all over Ukraine. The variation in the economic crisis frame lay in the way women were framed within the economic crisis, as mothers and/or workers. Their goals and activities were largely similar across cities as well. It is not unexpected then that outcomes among cities

did not vary considerably. It is surprising that the lowest rate of organizational maintenance for the economic crisis frame was the Kharkiv sample where it was used the most frequently. One of the eight women's NGOs using the economic crisis frame in Kharkiv appeared to be a victim of the competition within Kharkiv's women's movement for international grants and scarce local resources. (See the international funding chapter for further discussion of competition among women's NGOs.) Moreover, with a small sample size, one unsuccessful women's NGO in Kharkiv lowers the organizational maintenance rate by 12.5 percent.

What perhaps warrants more consideration than the slightly lower rate of organizational maintenance in Kharkiv is the lower organizational maintenance rate over all compared to the other two dominant frames in the Ukrainian women's movement in 2002-2003. The nationalism frame was expected to enjoy a high maintenance rate in parts of Ukraine but not all of it. The gender discrimination frame was least expected to resonate because of its imported vocabulary and critique of the dominant culture. Yet, both of these frames enjoyed a higher organizational maintenance rate than the economic crisis. The economic crisis, however, was not an imported word or issue and common to all of Ukraine. Why then was its organizational maintenance rate lower than that of the nationalism and gender discrimination frames when it seemed to resonate so strongly with the life experiences of Ukrainian women?

Part of the answer may lie in the type of assistance some of the women's NGOs provided. Women's organizations focusing solely or even primarily on providing charitable assistance often had more trouble sustaining campaigns than those providing business and employment activities for women. For instance, the chief activity of

Mother's Happiness in Kyiv was to distribute donated items to families with many children. The leader explained that in the early 1990s many donated items were shipped to Ukraine from other countries. In 2002-2003 the flow of charitable aid from abroad had slowed significantly. Additionally, many of those who received shipments of clothing, medicines or food from abroad started selling it rather than giving it to the charities for which it was intended. The head of Mother's Happiness was experiencing more and more difficulty obtaining items to give to the women and children in her organization (Interview with women's NGO leader, 5/28/2003). Other women's organizations that distributed charitable aid to women and children relied on donations from members of their own organization or from local businesses and politicians. This aid was sporadic and often of a very limited amount making it difficult for women's NGOs to carry out sustained activity. Furthermore, as a result of the economic crisis most Ukrainians were in need of assistance and not in the position to donate items. Therefore, these organizations were active, but not necessarily able to implement campaigns. This may be one reason the organizational maintenance rate was lower for the economic crisis frame than the nationalism or gender discrimination frames. An examination of outcomes by type of assistance provided demonstrates that women's NGOs engaged in charitable assistance were able to sustain campaigns only 64% of the time. In contrast, those offering self-help activities enjoyed a higher organizational maintenance rate of 91%.

Table 6-4: Outcomes by Type of Activities

	<u>Self-help</u>	<u>Charitable Assistance</u>
Unable to maintain organizations	1 (9%)	4 (36%)
Able to maintain organizations	10 (91%)	7 (64%)
	100%=11	100%=11

International funding also plays a crucial role in the ability of organizations to sustain campaigns. Women's NGOs that only provided charitable assistance were not the ones receiving grants from foreign donors. Foreign donors tended to favor projects that helped women find new employment or start their own businesses and not organizations that simply gave items to women. Those women's NGOs that relied on donations were facing a reduction in the amount of charitable aid being sent to Ukraine and did not have international grants, which most of the women's organizations claimed were necessary to implement their projects. Therefore, the women's NGOs providing principally charitable assistance faced greater difficulties in obtaining resources and therefore, had greater difficulty sustaining campaigns which may account for the lower rate of organizational maintenance overall.

Conclusions

The economic crisis was discussed by women's activists in Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv. Women tended to be framed as mothers or workers struggling to survive in the economic crisis. In all three cities similar activities were engaged in to assist women and children. Employment and business training were offered as well as immediate charitable assistance to women and children by women's organizations in all three cities. The only significant difference in framing across the three cities was in Kyiv where the frame was used a lower percentage of the time (29% compared to 62% and 42% in

Kharkiv and L'viv), and the women as workers frame was used less frequently than in Kharkiv and L'viv.

Why was the economic crisis frame less popular in Kyiv than Kharkiv and L'viv? There is no clear answer to this question based on the interviews with women's NGO activists. Kyiv experienced the economic crisis along with the rest of Ukraine. Women's activists in Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv gave similar accounts of poverty and hardship for women and children. Perhaps because Kyiv is the capital and enjoyed greater foreign investment and a slightly higher standard of living than the other cities fewer women's activists chose to use the frame.³⁹ However, the average person in Kyiv was still poor and struggling to survive. The frame may also have been used less frequently because women's activists in Kyiv were perhaps attempting to follow donor priorities more closely than those in Kharkiv and L'viv. Economic development was no longer the hot button issue among international donor agencies in 2002-2003. Human trafficking and gender issues had become significantly more important to them by that point. Therefore, women's activists who framed injustices in terms of the economic crisis were less likely to receive grants for their projects. Also, if women's activists were attempting to follow donor priorities they may have been trying to use a frame they thought would appeal to me, an interviewer from the affluent West that they hoped might be tied to a source of funding. This supposes that women activists in Kharkiv and L'viv were less

³⁹ By slightly higher standard of living I mean that running water and electricity were usually available 24 hours a day instead of limited hours as in Kharkiv and L'viv. Residents in Kyiv were more likely to have their own telephones than in Kharkiv and L'viv as well. This speculation about a higher standard of living is based only on my own observations and experiences while living in Ukraine in 2002-2003.

sophisticated and aware or possibly less interested in following donor priorities than those in Kyiv, although there was no mention of this in the interviews.

The other major difference among the cities lay in how Kyiv women activists framed women as workers in the economic crisis less than the other cities. Why were women framed as workers in the economic crisis less often in Kyiv than in Kharkiv and L'viv? Zhinocha Hromada and Spilka Zhinok were the only two women's NGOs with activists framing women as workers. Not only were women framed as workers less frequently, but when that frame was employed in Kyiv women were simultaneously framed as mothers. Zhinocha Hromada in Kyiv began its activity before Ukraine declared its independence in 1991. They initially organized around issues that were safe at the time such as the damaging effects of Chernobyl for children and bringing Ukrainian soldiers back from wars or protecting them from Soviet military hazing. Zhinocha Hromada activists originally organized themselves as concerned mothers. Later, they moved to include several other issues, and women's activists expanded their frames to include economic issues for women.

Spilka Zhinok, the successor of the former Soviet women's organization with the same leader, perhaps continued to think of women in both capacities, and as a result, its activists framed women as mothers and workers maintaining the working mother contract of the Soviet era.⁴⁰ However, the leader of Spilka Zhinok in Kharkiv only framed women as mothers in the economic crisis and not as workers. She did discuss employment issues

⁴⁰ The goal of the social programs for women and children in the Soviet era was to create conditions that assisted working women in fulfilling their most important mission, that of motherhood (Nechemias 2006, 171). See Attwood 1990 for more on Soviet women's work and family responsibilities.

for women, but focused instead on gender discrimination faced by women in Ukraine. The frames created by Spilka Zhinok activists in Kharkiv did not resemble the Soviet era working mother rhetoric. The Soviet history of Spilka Zhinok then does not wholly explain why its Kyiv leader framed women as mothers and workers, although it is perhaps a partial explanation.

The above discussion explains why Zhinocha Hromada and Spilka Zhinok leaders in Kyiv framed women both as mothers and as workers. It does not explain why the women as workers frame was only used 29% of the time in Kyiv when it was used by 50% and 60% of women activists in Kharkiv and L'viv respectively. The framing of women within the economic crisis by women's activists in Kyiv more closely resembles what I expected to find in L'viv. Based on how women's activists used the nationalism and gender discrimination frames in L'viv compared to those in Kyiv and Kharkiv I expected L'viv's women's activists to employ the women as workers frame the least frequently. L'viv women's activists using the nationalism frame emphasized the role of mothers within the family in building a strong Ukrainian nation. The gender discrimination frame was used the least frequently in L'viv among the three cities. As a result, I expected the women as workers frame to be employed the least frequently in L'viv rather than in Kyiv.

Perhaps the lesser use of the women as workers frame in Kyiv where one might expect to see it used more frequently than in L'viv ties into the larger picture of the lower success rate overall for the economic crisis frame. As discussed throughout, there was not a lot of variation by city in the economic crisis frame. The nationalism and gender discrimination frames showed more variation and adaptation by women's activists to

their specific local contexts. Possibly the lack of adaptation at the city level explains the lower success rate.

Chapter 7

International Funding and the Ukrainian Women's Movement

Introduction

International funding permeated the women's movement in Ukraine. Women's NGOs that provided services to women and children and those interested in gender research were equally reliant on foreign sources of support. Among the NGOs included in the study 80% (39 of 49) received some form of international assistance, usually in the form of money, but sometimes also materials, such as clothing, computers or medicines.⁴¹ Women's organizations received grants from large donors, as well as support from individuals. In each city studied well over 50% of the NGOs in the study received some form of international aid. Although, international funding permeated NGOs in all three cities a clear pattern emerges. In Kyiv, 91.6% of the NGOs received international aid, in Kharkiv 84.6% and in L'viv the percentage drops to 66.6%. This was a high percentage in each city, although Kyiv and Kharkiv clearly had a higher proportion of foreign support. This chapter explores foreign funding and its influence within the Ukrainian

⁴¹ Although the sample was intended to be random, selection bias most likely entered into it which may be over emphasizing the proportion of women's NGOs receiving international funding. (See chapter 2 for details of the sampling process.) Those with international funding may be more likely to afford a telephone line and staff to answer the phone. For this reason, it is likely that those with foreign funding were easier to contact. However, the sample does include women's NGOs with no international funding. Sydorenko (2001, 57) reported that 45.5% of women's NGOs receive international funding based on their survey of women's organizations in Ukraine in 2000. Hrycak (2007) reports a heavy dependence on foreign funding among the women's organizations in Ukraine. Henderson (2003, 47) claims that the feminist movement in Russia is almost completely dependent on foreign funding.

women's movement. I begin by briefly outlining the major sources of foreign funding, their priorities and Western scholars' criticism of it. Next I turn to activists' own assessments of foreign funding. Section three discusses international funding and its interaction the frames women activists created. I end with a discussion of the outcomes of women's NGOs with international funding.

Primary International Donors

Ukrainian women's NGOs received material sources of support from several different sources, some of them private individuals or branches of that organization in other countries. For instance, Soyuz Ukrainok (Ukrainian National Women's League) received small amounts of money from Soyuz Ukrainok in the U.S. On the whole, there are a few Western governments and foundations that provided the bulk of aid which are discussed below.

Who are they?

Foreign funding came from a variety of sources, yet there were a few primary donors that developed initiatives and programs in Ukraine from which many women's organizations in all three cities received funding. The International Renaissance Foundation (a branch of the Open Society Institute), the U.S. Agency for International Development (USAID), the United Nations Gender in Development Program (UNDP), Technical Aid to the Commonwealth of Independent States (TACIS) through the

European Union, and the Canadian Ukrainian Gender Fund. The Swedish equivalent of USAID, Swedish International Development Agency (SIDA) was also active in Ukraine among women's organizations.

USAID distributed grants to several U.S. foundations and development agencies that operated programs and initiatives in Ukraine. For instance, the U.S. Ukraine Foundation received money through USAID for their Community Partnership Project. Winrock International and the Women's Consortium of Ukraine (formerly the NIS-US Women's Consortium) received large portions of their funding through USAID as well (Hrycak 2006, 79; Sydorenko 2001). Smaller U.S. NGOs, such as the Cincinnati-Kharkiv Sister City Project, also received funding through USAID to use in Ukraine.

Funding Priorities

The International Renaissance Foundation (IRF) which is the Ukrainian branch of the Open Society Institute partnered with Winrock International and UNDP to provide a large number of grants to women's NGOs. Together they supported several women's empowerment programs. Priorities included prevention of trafficking, domestic violence, economic empowerment for women, gender education, women's rights, and strengthening civil society (Hrycak 2006, 79-83; Interview with Winrock International worker, 6/23/2003; Interview with Women's Consortium of Ukraine volunteer, 12/16/2002). Anti-trafficking was the largest empowerment campaign at the time of this study (2002-2003). Based on feedback from women's NGOs and followed by their own research, Winrock International and the IRF found that lack of economic opportunities

and violence at home or elsewhere were the most common reasons women chose to go abroad and became victims of traffickers.

In the beginning when the project started it was based mostly on what women's NGOs were saying. They were seeing women coming to them for assistance. They were having problems finding jobs, or they were victims of domestic violence, and many of them were thinking about going abroad. Later, we did conduct some research in 2000 that did show that violence is a contributing factor to why some women decide to leave. Particularly, domestic violence for women and then for children or youth in schools.... And then the economic reasons are basically... We don't need to do much research on it when women's unemployment is 60-80% (Interview with Winrock International worker, 6/23/2003)

Winrock International, IRF and other foreign donors funded Ukrainian NGOs with projects such as hotlines for victims, women's health providers, psychological and legal counseling, shelters for battered women, credit unions, and business and job skills training. Trafficking and domestic violence education programs were also funded. Direct partnerships with women's NGOs in several Ukrainian cities were established that included violence prevention, counseling and a job training component. Smaller grants were also given to support NGOs that implement trafficking prevention activities generally. This could include information campaigns, a hotline, or a variety of economic activities based on the expertise of individual NGOs (Interview with Winrock International worker, 6/23/2003). Not only Winrock International and IRF gave money for women's economic empowerment. Most of the other large foreign donors did as well. For instance, Spilka Zhinok (Women's Union) in Kyiv received a large grant from TACIS to hold women's business trainings to help them adapt to market conditions.

Gender education and gender equality projects were also heavily supported by foreign donors. For instance, IREX distributed grants to foster women's leadership by teaching them to recognize gender inequality and advocate for women's rights. UNDP provided money for gender education and dissemination of information. NGOs could receive money for projects such as, a seminar on gender resources on the internet. The Canadian Ukrainian Gender Fund gave larger grants for informational campaigns and research and publication about gender (Interview with Canadian Ukrainian Gender Fund worker, 10/2002).

Criticism by Western Scholars

The foreign funding has had a mixed effect on the development of women's movements in the post-Soviet context. It provides material resources in resource deprived contexts, facilitates the flow of information and knowledge about networking and building a movement and has popularized issues, such as domestic violence (Keck and Sikkink 1998; Sperling, Ferree and Risman 2001). Criticisms, however, have been more numerous. Since the late 1990s, many Western scholars have criticized the aid given to post-Soviet states. The aid intended to build and strengthen civil society and thereby strengthen democracy has produced some unintended negative results (Henderson 2003; Hrycak 2006 and 2007a; Mendelson and Glenn 2002; Sperling 1999, 220-256; Sperling, Ferree and Risman 2001). Six major criticisms emerge from this literature. First, international funding influences activists to choose an agenda different from the one local women's activists identify as women's issues or issues with little local

relevance (Henderson 2003; Hrycak 2007a; Richter 2002; Sperling 1999; Tarrow 1998 and 2005). For instance, anti-trafficking campaigns receive considerable international attention, but may not necessarily be the most important issue to Ukrainian activists. However, since the money lies in anti-trafficking activities many women's NGOs engage in anti-trafficking activities. Second, the frames created may also not be appropriate to local contexts making it more difficult for local NGOs to engage their target audiences with frames that do not resonate locally but do resonate with foreign donors (Hrycak 2006, 94-96; Mendelson and Glenn 2002; Nechemias 2006, 172; Sperling 1999; Tarrow 1998 and 2005). As a consequence of their desire to appeal to foreign donors, local activists may choose to use words and phrases that fail to resonate in the local context. Third, foreign assistance fosters competition among local NGOs for foreign funding and splinters local movements instead of fostering ties among NGOs and activists (Grunberg 2000; Hrycak 2005, 80; Mendelson and Glenn 2002; Sperling 1999; Sperling, Ferree and Risman 2001, Tarrow 1998). Fourth, it also splinters the movement by focusing on the quantity of NGOs created, resulting in activists forming separate smaller organizations rather than working together (Hrycak 2007a; Sperling 1999). Fifth, it can also create a set of elites that are drawn away from a grassroots movement and instead work primarily with foreign donors (Sperling 1999; Sperling, Ferree and Risman 2001; Mendelson and Glenn 2002; Naples and Desai 2002; Hrycak 2007a). Last, foreign funding also tends not to provide long term funding for projects forcing women's activists to cease working in one area and adopt a new issue in order to continue to win grants (Hrycak 2007).

In sum, foreign donors have failed in terms of creating a sustainable women's movement in Ukraine and other post-Soviet states and instead cultivated weak movements dependent on foreign donors (Henderson 2003; Hrycak 2007a; Sydorenko 2001, 57). Hrycak argues that foreign funding for the women's movement in Ukraine is guilty of most of the above. This chapter focuses on ways in which foreign funding has created competition and divisions in the Ukrainian women's movement, its impact on the frames created by women activists, and the association between international funding and outcomes (2006 and 2007a). The table below summarizes the similarities and differences of the impact of international funding on the construction of frames discussed in the rest of the chapter.

Table: 7-1 Summary of the similarities and differences across cities in the influence of international funding on the construction of frames

Similar influences on frames

- International funding had an observable influence on the construction of frames in all three cities
- Activists engaged in frame bridging and extension to appeal to foreign donors and local Ukrainian women

Variations in the influence of international funding on frames

<u>Kyiv</u>	<u>Kharkiv</u>	<u>L'viv</u>
-Moderate influence on frames	-Strongest influence on frames	-Least influence on frames
-Moderate level of incomplete framing associated with foreign funding	-Highest level of incomplete framing associated with foreign funding	-Lowest level of incomplete framing associated with foreign funding
-Frame abandonment & extension associated with foreign funding	-Frame abandonment & extension associated with foreign funding	-No frame abandonment, some extension

Ukrainian Activists' Assessments of foreign funding

Western scholars formulated their own criticisms of foreign funding, and Ukrainian women activists also formulated their own assessments of the place of foreign funding in their women's movement. Many of them had highly positive evaluations, which is not surprising given their dependence on it. Others viewed it as a mixed blessing and were keenly aware of some of its negative consequences.

Positive Assessments

One of the most common complaints among activists was the lack of domestic sources of funding for their work. They explained that wealthy individuals and businesses in Ukraine did not have an attitude of philanthropy. They rarely gave money to social organizations. In addition, the tax code did not provide incentives for philanthropy, instead it punished donors. The government (local and national), according to activists, paid no attention to them and certainly did not allocate budget money for NGOs. For this reason, activists felt they were forced to rely on foreign sources of funding.

Activists most often felt that foreign funding gave them the opportunity to implement their projects. Activists across the three cities felt that foreign funding was essential to executing their projects. Without money and support from foreign donors they would not be able to do their work at all or at most on a very small scale. The international aid provided a means of accomplishing goals that they would not otherwise have given the lack of domestic support, according to an activist in Kharkiv.

It is very influential, because it is extremely hard to do any activities without financial aid. The international funds help us in promotion of our ideas. And we are trying to spread these ideas in our region. Therefore we greatly appreciate this aid, this support. They certainly support our beliefs, our ideas.... But due to the funds, we have grown to such stage when we are helpful for the community and the government. This is very significant (Interview with women's NGO leader, 2/12/2003).

Contrary to critiques made by Western scholars, Western money, according to activists has not distracted them from accomplishing their goals, but given them an opportunity to put their ideas into practice. Many of these women did not see how it was possible to view the foreign money as something that impeded the progress of women's organizations. From their perspective, most of the organizations would not be functioning or providing their much needed services without international support. "I believe these grants are very essential for developing a women's movement, for they allow people to do the things they're interested in" (Interview with women's NGO leader, 5/20/2003). This same Kyiv activist believed that the foreign money was allowing NGOs to provide services to women that were very much needed, but would not otherwise be available to them. For example,

How can they hinder? Of course, not. On the contrary, they promote organizations' development because this way people do not only work in the NGOs but also realize themselves professionally. For instance, if we take Professor Hanovska, through these grants she is able to solve certain medical problems in our country. Thus, this does not only support the NGO but also the professional organization. That is why I believe this is very necessary. Like the seminars we conducted. Those were the seminars and workshops where we taught women to use computers. Nowadays children can learn this at school, but what about the older women? You can't make them learn on their own. While in our case we got them all together to learn. By the way, this also was through the grant. This way those women could move on faster and develop their idea of the modern society. I believe by no means a grant can impede, it can only promote and develop especially in women's organizations. Each won grant is a step ahead for us. It may not necessarily be something global but rather on a smaller scope

and in a narrow direction, but still it lets us move on (Interview with women's NGO leader, 5/20/2003).

Activists for gender studies centers in all three cities also acknowledged that foreign funding gave them the opportunity to carry out the research they were interested in. Their salaries were so small that in order to earn a living many of them gave lectures at multiple universities. This left them with no time for their own research projects unless they had a grant, according to a Kyiv researcher.

For me to support my family I have to give lectures at several universities. It is very difficult, and I get very tired. But I also want to do research work, and when we had all those grants they allowed me to dedicate myself to the studies without having to work at universities. It was a very unique opportunity (Interview with women's NGO leader, 5/27/2003).

The grants gave them time to work on their research, often paid for publishing and gave them the opportunity to organize professional conferences. For instance, the Kyiv Institute of Gender Research published an introductory textbook on gender theory for use in universities. They used only works by Ukrainian authors and included input from gender studies centers throughout Ukraine. It was funded and published through a UNDP grant (United Nations in Ukraine press release, no date).

Activists appreciated not only the financial support, but often the relationships established with foreign activists. For instance, Rozrada (Comfort) maintained active communication with psychologists and counselors in the U.S. They emailed regularly about difficult counseling cases. Women in Mass Media benefited from trainings on content analysis of the media from a group of Canadian media experts which visited

Ukraine. In Kharkiv, two battered women's shelters were established by NGOs with activists who visited the U.S. on a trip for NGO leaders. They each explained the importance of such international exchanges for the projects they chose to implement in their organizations.

They support us not only with cash, but also with the training, trips, contacts, when they come over to us, with the contacts through the internet when they send us information. We may learn both through the internet and when we can go there to see and touch it. There is a saying here that "a Ukrainian will not believe until he touches it with his own fingers." I also went to Cincinnati to the home for abused women. I came back and said, "I will do it." I saw the way it's supposed to be. Therefore if we are doing something, it should be done properly. We don't do things just for their outward appearance. Therefore, we are very grateful for the support, especially to America and its tax payers, the residents of the US that they help with money and training. This is very, very important (Interview with women's NGO leader, 2/7/2003).

Cincinnati is our sister city. We have been cooperating for many years. I was in Cincinnati on the Public Relations program. And they came here to us, as well. There I was introduced to the work of crisis centers and homes for abused women. Then, when I came back home we made a final decision to start a home. At that time all we had was the crisis center. We started the home in 2000. That is what prompted us to start a home for women (Interview with women's NGO leader, 2/7/2003).

The Center for Help for Women in Lviv was also established in part because of interaction with foreign activists. The center provides free counseling to women with crisis pregnancies. They received a small amount of money on a monthly basis from a woman in the U.S., but they also received many educational materials from their contacts in the U.S. as well. For example, informational videos on abortion, HIV, and STDs which they used in school presentations also came from contacts abroad.

Activists in Kyiv, Kharkiv and Lviv all explained that international funding aided the women's movement by providing monetary resources they would not otherwise be

able to acquire. This gave them the funding to implement their projects and provide services to Ukrainian women that would not be available if NGOs were forced to rely solely on domestic sources of funding. Intellectual support from activists abroad and experiences gained while traveling abroad on various programs also gave support and resources to Ukrainian activists. Many Ukrainian women's activists believed foreign donors and activists were providing essential assistance to the women's movement without manipulating the movement.

In response to the accusation that NGOs often selected their issues and activities based on the priorities of international donors, many women in Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv claimed the opposite. They explained that they chose what they wanted to do and then looked for grant competitions that fit their priorities.

- (a) There are some ideas, there are some needs, so we define them for ourselves, and then we look for someone who is ready to support the idea or the business.
- (b) It is a reversed feedback. At first, we define what we want to do at that moment, and then we open the book with the list of foundations...
- (a) ...and we offer that to the foundations, and they either support or deny our suggestions. But not the opposite way. The very last example is with Ann Sneetle. We offered her the prepared project, and she said, "Yes, it's important, and we are ready to support it." Also, when we dealt with Soros Foundation, in the same way we told them that we really badly needed to have a few courses on gender research at the University. And they gave us some money for it. So it is us who suggested what to do or what not to do, and not the opposite way (Interview with women's NGO leaders, 3/22/2003).

Not surprisingly, no activist in Kyiv, Kharkiv or L'viv claimed the reverse effect. Soyuz Ukrainok in L'viv even explained they returned a grant they received because the international granting agency imposed requirements they felt were counterproductive in the Ukrainian context. This was the only organization in the study which reported turning down a grant they received.

Negative Assessments

Despite the above positive assessments of foreign funding by Ukrainian activists, there were many in the women's movement who felt foreign funding also created problems. Some of them were also the same ones who recognized the positive aspects of foreign funding. Activists who were recipients of foreign funding as well as those who did not receive any criticized the influence of foreign money. Many of these criticisms were similar to those leveled by Western scholars. Activists discussed ways foreign funding tended to splinter the movement by encouraging many smaller NGOs that could each receive their own grants as well as creating competition for a limited pool of grant money. They also criticized foreign funding for encouraging the creation of organizations simply for the purpose of receiving grants.

Splinters movement

One of the most common criticisms, among Western scholars and Ukrainian activists, was the tendency of international funding to splinter the women's movement. Women tended to split apart and form several smaller organizations rather than larger ones in an effort to receive more grant money. The earliest gender studies center in Kyiv eventually ceased to exist as women realized they could receive more grants if they separated and formed their own organization. Therefore, the NGO actively operated for a few years and gradually dwindled as activists left to create their own NGOs for which they could each receive a start up grant.

In Kharkiv, where the population of women's NGOs was smaller than in Kyiv, and women's groups seemed to be well networked, there was a lot of discussion of separate smaller NGOs being founded solely to receive more funding. In particular, one activist that was the leader of three officially separate organizations was frequently discussed in interviews by activists as a prime example of this trend. She did not try to mask her intentions and even recommended the tactic to another activist in order to increase her grant potential.⁴²

Natasha and her organization were there since 1992, i.e. from the very beginning. It pays. One of their organizations receives a start-up grant. Right then they create another organization and get a grant for it. They can even apply for a grant for the three organizations in one fund, and they receive three grants.... Many people go this way. After we were registered, we went to greet Natasha. It was back in 1996. Her question was, "Hey, why are you Women's Community? Why did you decide to be a branch of a large Ukraine-wide organization? Why didn't you just register a small organization and call it 'Manya', 'Tania' or 'Natasha'? You won't receive a single cent! Ukraine-wide organizations do not receive financial support!" This is what she said.... Then, later "Katya"⁴³ appeared. At that time it had not existed. "Katya" is a younger organization (Interview with women's NGO leader 2/28/2003).

Another means by which foreign funding often served as a divisive instrument was the competition in created among women's NGOs. There were only so many grants available and women soon realized they were competing against each other for the same sources of funding. As a result, women's NGOs tended to compete with each other rather than cooperate. A Kyiv activist commented that this was particularly evident shortly before the Beijing conference in 1995. A lot more foreign money was made

⁴² The name of the activist and her organizations has been replaced in this quotation. Throughout the rest of the chapter when names of women activists are given they have been replaced to protect anonymity.

⁴³ Katya was another one of the NGOs founded by Natasha.

available shortly before the conference and created divisions within the women's movement. Women were fighting with each other for the money before the conference and after. Those at the conference did not want to interact with each other because everyone was suspicious of how each managed to secure a place for herself at Beijing.

In Kharkiv, it resulted in a refusal to cooperate with each other and sometimes duplication of activities. For instance, two NGOs in Kharkiv both operated crisis centers that offered psychological and legal counseling to victims of domestic violence and trafficking. They also had hotlines for women to call. One opened a battered women's shelter and another was in the process of opening their shelter. They offered almost identical services to women yet did not cooperate. One of these organizations received significantly more grant money than the other. The NGO with less grant money felt that the other organization was trying to create a monopoly and run her organization out of operation. Neither made any attempt to combine their efforts to be a more effective force for women in the city.

A different activist in Kharkiv explained that her organization did not receive any grant money. When they were first founded, they applied for a grant but did not win one. After that she decided not to apply any more because of what she saw occurring among the other women's NGOs.

You see, this is what is going on. Social organizations are a kind of business as well, especially those that live on grants. And when in the common field of activity one finds another organization which is doing similar work, suspicion arises – what if they snatch your grant. On the outside it's something like, "Let's be friends," but just in case, "not very close friends" (Interview with women's NGO activist, 2/20/2003).

Most Kharkiv activists were not so distressed by the competition as to cease applying for grants. However, there was a general consensus in Kharkiv that the women were in competition with each other. Sometimes this kept them from cooperating with each other and other times, they simply acknowledged that they did not like a certain woman but her NGO may still be a good one.

Exist just for grant

Activists in Kyiv, but especially Kharkiv, explained that some women's organizations existed simply to receive grants. This sometimes meant that they existed only on paper or they chose their issues based on the funding available. No activist said they were guilty of this, but simply that they knew this went on among women's NGOs. For instance, a Kyiv activist of a now inactive NGO believed that people who had friends at granting agencies might be told that there was money available for certain types of projects. They would then form an organization and immediately write a proposal for that type of project. Most of these NGOs, she believed, only lasted the life of the grant and then quietly disappeared. The real goal of the activists in these organizations was to provide money for a brief period of time for its activists. When the money was gone the activists disappeared.

A women's activist in Kharkiv believed that many social organizations formed for the wrong reasons. Grants were a great motivator, especially in their economic situation.

She believed that Kharkiv had many such organizations that lived for a brief time and then disappeared, and it was all tied grants.

So, an organization was registered. It hopes to receive support. They write a project or pay money to someone else to write it (it often happens). They fail once, twice; they can't do without support. And just like the organization was born, so it died in the quiet. And such cases are numerous. Another example. An organization was established, everything is fine; they receive a grant, buy and install ten computers. When the grant runs out, the organization dies. Somehow these computers disappear. That's it. This year's finances run out, and there is no grant for the next year. A third situation: an organization is born; everything seems to be ok. It works very well. Three to four years later you look and see that there is only one member in it, the same person who was in the beginning. There is an organization like that here. It's called _____. It exists since 1992, and since 1996 we haven't seen any other members but the president. There aren't even two more members. Let there be just three people, it would be a real organization. But one person does not make an organization. There are a lot of situations like this (Interview with women's NGO leader, 2/28/2003).

Other activists in Kharkiv also expressed a similar belief that NGOs were forming just to receive grants and were often nothing more than a paper organization or an organization of one person. Two NGOs included in the Kharkiv sample appeared to be made up of only the leader of the organization. Other women may have joined them for a specific project, but the leader seemed to be the only person working in the organization on a consistent basis. This did not stop them from receiving grants, although neither of these organizations received steady funding.

A woman in the Kharkiv city council whose job it was to cooperate with social organizations that provided services also believed international funding had created some obstacles to the women's movement in Kharkiv and Ukraine in general. She was familiar with the population of women's NGOs in Kharkiv and acquainted with the activities of many of them. Several activists mentioned her as an ally in the city government. She

believed that women's organizations were doing a lot of good for Kharkiv, but that international funding, while it was necessary also created a certain amount of chaos.

The thing is that both Europe and America broke into our life very forcefully. We still haven't figured out our internal problems. We do not understand yet what we have torn down and what we want to build. But everybody gives us ideas which we are not able to put into practice. In general, the influence from Europe and America brought a certain degree of disorder into our life. We still find it hard to figure out what is going on. But nevertheless, there are people who can take the information, put pieces together and try to create a model which would work in Ukraine (Interview with city council member, 2/20/2003).

Despite negative influences, no activist, even those with harsh critiques of international funding, felt the women's movement would be aided by the removal of international funding. International funding therefore, maintained somewhat of an ambiguous status among women's movement activists. They realized they were forced to rely on it, and sometimes felt the information gained from it was useful. Yet, it also created divisions, competition, and generated paper organizations thereby hindering the growth of the women's movement.

The negative comments about foreign funding were only from women activists in Kyiv and Kharkiv. L'viv activists did not discuss negative consequences of international support, while those in Kyiv and Kharkiv did. This may be because only 66% of the women's NGOs in L'viv were recipients of international money while in Kyiv and Kharkiv 91% and 84% respectively, received international support. With less international money in L'viv, the negative consequences may have been fewer. Also, in Kyiv and Kharkiv a larger proportion of NGOs were receiving support from large granting agencies and several were able to turn their NGO activism into full time jobs with salaries. In L'viv, fewer were able to provide a living for themselves from the

grants they received and more were doing it on a strictly voluntary basis. Thus, fewer of L'viv's women activists had their livelihoods at stake when they discussed international funding. Or conversely, L'viv women activists may have been less likely to criticize the foreign funding they did not have and were hoping to win.

International funding and framing

So far the influence of international funding on the women's movement as a whole has been discussed. The following section focuses on the ways in which international funding and framing interact. Specifically, I examine the connection between the issues adopted by women's NGOs and international funding. How do Ukrainian women activists negotiate the priorities of foreign donors and local understandings of women's concerns? Do Ukrainian women's activists adapt or bridge the language foreign donors use to talk about their issues to better resonate with the local Ukrainian populations (Hrycak 2007; Ishkanian 2004; Nechemias 2006)? The following discussion shows that women activists are struggling to balance appealing to foreign donors and local women sometimes, and this plays out in their efforts to construct meaning through frames.⁴⁴

⁴⁴ I do not use organization identifiers when the information given could produce harmful effects and instead speak of general patterns.

Does it influence the issues adopted by women's activists? Yes

Western scholars and activists in Kyiv and Kharkiv claim that donor priorities often determine the issues adopted by women activists. As discussed above, if activists knew there was money available for gender equality projects or human rights advocacy then many chose those issues. As table 1 indicates, this does appear to be the case. In 2002-2003 gender equality/women's rights, trafficking, domestic violence, and economic empowerment appeared to be the most popular issues among foreign donors. In each city, a high proportion of organizations adopted one or more of these issues, especially issues having to do with gender equality.

Table 7-2: Number of NGOs by city working in international donor issue areas

<u>International Donor Priorities</u>	<u>Kyiv</u>	<u>Kharkiv</u>	<u>L'viv</u>	<u>All cities</u>
Gender Equality/Women's Rights	62.5% (15)	61.5% (8)	25% (3)	53% (26)
Trafficking	16.6% (4)	38.5% (5)	16.6% (2)	22.4% (11)
Domestic Violence	16.6% (4)	23% (3)	25% (3)	20.4% (10)
Economic Empowerment	25% (6)	38.5% (5)	25% (3)	28.6% (14)
Total number of NGOs sampled in each city	100% = 24	100% = 13	100% = 12	100% = 49

Table: 7-3 Proportion of NGOs by city that received or tried to receive international funding for their activities in donor priority areas

<u>International Donor Priorities</u>	<u>Kyiv</u>	<u>Kharkiv</u>	<u>L'viv</u>	<u>All Cities</u>
Gender Equality/Women's Rights	93.3% (14 of 15)	87.5% (7 of 8)	100% (3 of 3)	92.3% (24 of 26)
Trafficking	75% (3 of 4)	100% (5 of 5)	100% (2 of 2)	90.1% (10 of 11)
Domestic Violence	100% (4 of 4)	100% (3 of 3)	100% (3 of 3)	100% (10 of 10)
Economic Empowerment	83.3% (5 of 6)	100% (5 of 5)	100% (3 of 3)	92.8% (13 of 14)

The tables show a strong connection between foreign funding priorities and issues adopted in the women's movement. Women's rights advocacy was one of the earlier priorities of USAID (Hrycak 2007a). A total of 26 of the 49 (53%) organizations sampled included gender in/equality or women's rights as one of their issues. This

includes all women's NGOs in the study that addressed these issues at any point in time during the life of the organization. This was an interesting choice for women activists given that the Soviet Union declared official equality and emancipation for women, making it a largely discredited concept among women in many post-Soviet states. Furthermore, because of the catastrophic decline in the standard of living and continuing economic crisis, most women in Ukraine remain more concerned with survival issues than theoretical concerns such as gender (Bull, Diamond and Marsh 2000; Sperling 1999). Trafficking became USAID's next top priority (Hrycak 2007a). Not as many, but several women's groups now work in the area of trafficking that includes a focus on domestic violence and economic empowerment. Their almost total dependence on foreign sources led activists to believe they have no choice but to become concerned with donor priorities (Henderson 2003; Hrycak 2007a). The second table also shows that almost 100% of the organizations that adopted these issues received foreign money or tried to receive foreign grants. Those who did not receive any international support applied for grants, but simply did not win any of the grant competitions. Foreign donor priorities strongly influence the issues adopted by the women's movement in Ukraine.

How does foreign funding influence framing?

Those who received foreign support, especially on a repeated basis, usually knew how to speak a lingo that would appeal to their international audience (Hrycak 2006; Nechemias 2006). The above section demonstrated that women's activists often chose issues in line with foreign priorities. Did the presence of international funding also

influence how they framed the issues? The following discussion shows that it did sometimes influence the frames the activists used. Activists tended to adopt an issue and create incomplete frames, transform, abandon, extend, or bridge frames sometimes creating more local resonance and sometimes not.⁴⁵

Incomplete framing

Some organizations that received foreign funding adopted issues, such as trafficking or domestic violence, and created incomplete frames. A total of 19 (from the sample of 49) women's NGOs failed to construct complete frames for at least one of the issues they chose to work on. Most often the diagnostic aspect of the frame was incomplete with either the injustice and/or the culpable agent missing from the frame, or the diagnosis was present but the solutions proposed in the prognosis did not logically follow from the injustice described. Women's activists simply chose to start working on the issue and developed programs, which were often funded, to address their issue. For example, a Kyiv organization decided to assist trafficking victims and train policemen to better assist victims. The only part of the frame that was created was what should be done about trafficking. The same leader later went on a trip to the U.S. for leaders of women's NGOs. She saw an example of a small business incubator and decided to try to

⁴⁵ Frame transformation is one of four frame alignment strategies identified by Snow et al. It involves changing old understandings and meanings to create new ones. Frame extension is extending a frame to new areas that are thought to be important to the target audience. Bridging involves linking two or more frames that have similarities, but have not been previously connected as such (Snow et al. 1986). Frame abandonment occurs when activists cease using a previous frame in favor of a new issue, creating a new frame.

start one in Kyiv. The leader never provided reasons as to why her projects were needed in Ukraine. She simply decided to provide services to women without discussing the injustices or naming responsible agents. When this women's NGO failed to win further grant money after the initial grant it ceased to exist.

In the same way, two very similar organizations in Kharkiv provided services, primarily to victims of domestic violence and trafficking without creating diagnostic frames for the issues. Many NGOs discussed domestic violence and trafficking within the frame of gender and discrimination against women. These two organizations while both very active NGOs never mentioned why trafficking and domestic violence were problems or identified culpable parties. This did not stop the organizations from effectively providing services to women. The first was particularly well financed and consistently sustained multiple campaigns. The NGO received several international grants for their work from the Open Society Institute, the American Embassy in Ukraine, Peace Corps, Philip Morris, the Cincinnati-Kharkiv Sister City Project, Winrock International, International Renaissance Foundation, La Strada and the World Bank that provided them with computers, copiers, fax machines and furnished most of the shelter. The grants also provided enough money to pay a small staff to operate their crisis center and shelter. The second NGO that addressed these same issues virtually duplicated the above NGO's activities. They had a smaller staff with less funding, but were attempting to carry out largely the same activities. A third organization in Kharkiv addressed several issues at different points in time, for instance, gender discrimination, technology issues, civic education, problems among invalids and support for elderly women. Only gender discrimination was discussed as an injustice. The campaigns to assist invalids or support

elderly women or creation of a peace and ethics institute were not connected to the injustice of gender discrimination. She simply offered various services to women and other disadvantaged populations when she had funding.

L'viv also had organizations that adopted issues for which they received international funding, but only developed partial frames for their activities. For example, one women's NGO received large amounts of foreign funding for economic development for women in the L'viv region. Its leader and literature produced by the organization never explained why they thought these programs were necessary for women or why women in particular needed assistance starting their own businesses. Another adopted a domestic violence program for which it received a large foreign grant. The domestic violence trainings had nothing to do with the organization's diagnostic frame and were never given a rationale. The activist simply explained that she once worked for a foreign granting agency and understood how they operated so she knew how to win a grant. She conducted the trainings, and once the grant ran out, the domestic violence trainings stopped.

These examples show that women's organizations often created incomplete frames, and many of the organizations with incomplete frames received international funding. In the total sample of 49 organizations, 19 women's NGOs created incomplete frames for at least one of the issues on which their organization worked. In Kyiv nine (37.5%) women's groups had incomplete frames, six (46%) in Kharkiv had incomplete frames, in L'viv four (33%) articulated incomplete frames for at least one of their issues. Across all three cities, 84% (16 of 19) of those with incomplete frames had foreign funding for the issue that was only partially framed. In Kharkiv, the trend was most

prevalent where six women's NGOs had incomplete frames, and 100% of those organizations received foreign funding for the issues they incompletely framed. Kyiv was in the middle with 88% (7 of 8) of those with incomplete frames receiving foreign funding. In L'viv, 75% (3 of 4) of the women's NGOs with incomplete frames had international funding for the issues which they only partially framed. The failure to create complete frames is closely associated with the presence of international funding.

These numbers show another distinct pattern. In Kharkiv, there was more incomplete framing, and it was associated with international funding 100% of the time. Kyiv was not far behind. L'viv continues to stand out as different with the lowest proportion of organizations creating incomplete frames and only 75% (compared to 100% and 88%) of those creating incomplete frames also receiving international funding for the issue.⁴⁶ As discussed earlier, a lower proportion of women's NGOs in L'viv received international funding, and women's activists in L'viv did not discuss the negative effects of foreign funding in their interviews. This could be the result of less foreign funding creating fewer negative consequences as hypothesized earlier which seems to be born out by the data here. In Kyiv and Kharkiv where there was more foreign funding the negative consequences are more pronounced.

⁴⁶ It is important to recognize that not all women's NGOs that received foreign funding neglected framing activities. Thirty-nine of the 49 women's NGOs studied received international funding, and 16 (41%) of them created incomplete frames.

Frame transformation, abandonment, and extension

International funding sometimes led activists to adopt an issue without creating a frame, but it also sometimes appeared to lead them to transform their frames, abandon old frames in favor of new frames or extend their frames to include new issues. They may have begun framing an issue in one manner and later changed their language to frame the issue differently. Other women activists abandoned an earlier issue in favor of a new one with a subsequent change in frame, or simply added another issue creating a new frame to go with it. The women's NGOs that transformed, abandoned or extended their frames were all receiving or trying to receive international funding for their activities.

Transformation

Many women's NGOs formed to help women adapt to the new economic conditions. Several of them taught women business skills or new job skills in order to help them earn a living wage. Activists sometimes initially explained their issue as an economic concern for women. They were helping women to start businesses because of the difficult economic situation or women needed assistance so they could care for their children which had become increasingly difficult given the economic crisis. Later, the issue was sometimes reframed as one of discrimination and gender inequality. Women needed extra assistance because gender discrimination made it more difficult for them to survive the economic transition. The discrimination against women that resulted from strong gender stereotypes in Ukraine created the need for business and job skills programs for women. Those organizations that transformed their frame from one of

economic crisis to gender discrimination received international funding for their activities. Activists were consciously negotiating local needs and donor priorities through their frame transformation.

Abandonment

Women activists sometimes also abandoned a frame in favor of a new one when a new donor priority appeared. For instance, one began with a focus on gender equality and moved on to more popular issues (with foreign donors) of trafficking and domestic violence. As USAID and other donors switched their funding priorities to trafficking (Hrycak 2007a) this organization also changed its focus and its frame. They instead concentrated on sexual violence and exploitation of children. They taught children the need to protect their rights to avoid trafficking. Activists created workbooks and presentations to inform children of the dangers of trafficking. While they managed to maintain funding to remain operational, they abandoned their original goals changing their focus to pursue the latest hot button issue among foreign donors.

An organization in Kharkiv which framed itself as addressing gender discrimination, then moved to peace and ethics for Ukrainians, to tolerance and conflict resolution, to assistance to invalids, to technology development among women, and finally civic education was representative of this tendency to abandon one frame for whatever one will receive funding. The new frames she adopted were not necessarily the latest hot button issue, but they were ones for which she was able to find funding.

Extension

Many more women activists engaged in frame extension. They did not transform or abandon old frames, but instead added new issues and extended their organizations' frames. This was often accompanied by a decrease in activity or cessation of one campaign in favor of a new one with funding. The frames of these organizations were more fluid and their activities could often be perceived as bouncing from one campaign to another, although some were able to sustain multiple campaigns.

An NGO in L'viv that primarily worked on issues facing youth, such as smoking, drugs, alcoholism, abortion, gender equality, trafficking, and human rights represents this trend. Their organization originally used a gender frame to discuss equality and human rights. They were not able to win grants in one issue area over an extended period of time. So, to stay in operation activists extended the frame to smoking, drugs and trafficking in attempts to secure funding. Because of this, they did not consistently work in any one area with their youth. One woman activist even collected data on smoking rates among youth in a school before and after their anti smoking campaign. She collected the data a third time a year after the project ended and saw the rates had again increased. They were aware that their impact among the youth could be much greater if they had money to continue their projects long term rather than programs that lasted a few months to a year each.

Another women's organization worked in the area of women's rights using primarily a gender frame. They initially translated international documents and distributed them to women. Later as more funding was available for domestic violence projects they also worked in that area with less focus on international human rights documents. During the 2002 parliamentary election campaigns they also included activities that helped women engage the election process. The leader continually extended the original frame to include different issues that were related to gender equality.

The above examples demonstrate that activists sometimes extended their frames, while continuing with the same activities and new ones important to foreign donors. The organizations extending their frames, in what appeared to be adaptation to donor priorities, were able to remain operational and continued providing services to women and children even as donor priorities changed.

Other women's organizations with foreign funding besides the examples above transformed, extended and abandoned frames as funding priorities changed. This occurred among women's organizations in Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv, although the tendency was strongest in Kharkiv and weakest in L'viv. In 69% of the women's NGOs with foreign funding in the Kharkiv sample women activists transformed, abandoned or extended frames. This phenomenon was present in 41.6% of the organizations in the Kyiv sample and 25% of the women's NGOs with foreign funding in the L'viv sample. None of the women activists from organizations in the L'viv sample abandoned their original frames.

Again, L'viv stands out as different in its relationship to international funding.

This could indicate that women activists in L'viv were less aware of donor priorities, and as a result did not extend or abandon their frames because they were not aware of the new hot button issues among foreign donors. Or perhaps L'viv's women's organizations were aware of donor priorities, but still unwilling to change in order to win grants. Those in Kyiv and Kharkiv appeared to be more aware and/or willing to extend frames and occasionally abandon them to include new issues in an effort to win further grants. Perhaps they felt the local cultural contexts in Kyiv and Kharkiv allowed them to incorporate more imported ideas. The local cultural context in L'viv may have been more of a constraining factor. L'viv tends to be more socially conservative than Kyiv and Kharkiv, and many of the donor frames presented women outside of the dominant cultural view of women. Perhaps for this reason, activists in L'viv were less willing to embrace issues and frames that represented women outside of the dominant cultural perspective.

The above discussion also points to another shortcoming in foreign funding. Foreign donors fund a specific issue for a period of time and move on to another one. Ukrainian women's organizations that are largely dependent on international funding for their activities are forced to do the same or find a way to make their old issue fit into a new priority (Hrycak 2007a). This limits the impact women's NGOs can have in a specific area if they only have funding for it for a short period of time. It suggests that to be more effective foreign donors need to fund a priority over a period of several years rather than a few years at a time.

Frame bridging

In addition to changing or expanding frames to include foreign donor priorities, activists occasionally bridged or adapted frames important to foreign donors to better resonate in the local context. This usually included some expansion of their original frame to include the new concept, but also a bridging of the foreign donor priority so that it better resonated among Ukrainians. Activists sometimes adapted foreign donor issues, such as gender equality or domestic violence, to show how it could have practical relevance to the lives of Ukrainian women.

Instead of presenting gender as a theoretical concept they focused on its practical importance to Ukrainian women. They consciously tried to frame issues so they would have local resonance and not contain foreign words that held no meaning for most Ukrainian women. Even gender studies centers referred to their work as gender studies rather than feminist studies because women activists were keenly aware of the negative connotation attached to the word feminism in Ukraine (Interview with women's activist 6/10/2003). In their interactions with students some of the researchers worked to demonstrate the relevance of gender to everyday life in Ukraine. For example, a member of a gender studies center turned a discussion about resources in her management theory class into an examination of the discrimination women faced daily in terms of access to resources. Students came to the conclusion on their own that Ukrainian women faced additional obstacles resulting from societal stereotypes about women. She intentionally did not use the words gender, inequality, or discrimination, but let students come to the conclusion on their own that women were treated differently than men. After the

discussion some of the students (males and females) in her class talked with her further and expressed interest in feminism and the women's movement (Interview with women's NGO leader 3/22/2003).

Other women's NGOs adapted international donor issues, such as gender equality and domestic violence, to give them relevance to their counseling activities for women and children. For instance, one women's NGO began with a focus on counseling women and children to help them overcome the consequences of the totalitarian regime and cope with life in the transition. Activists wanted to give women a feeling of responsibility for their own lives, help them believe they could live a good life and surmount problems they faced in providing for their children and raising them. They continued this focus, while incorporating foreign donor priorities of gender equality and domestic violence into their frame. The organization had its early beginnings in 1991, and its early language reflected an emphasis on overcoming the harmful effects of the dependent and powerless mentality created by years of totalitarianism as evidenced by the following quote.

Our main objective is to assist in overcoming consequences of the totalitarian regime. Here we can speak of psychological methods to overcome family abuse and the "screw" complex. This is a result of the Stalin era which created a feeling of insignificance and dependence on a great social machine. We want to help people gain a feeling of responsibility and liability for oneself and one's family, the ability to live a beautiful life, the ability to work in a market economy and sell goods, and the ability to surmount crises in bringing up children (Interview with women's NGO leader 11/6/2002).

Their projects in the mid 1990s were focused on women and children learning to live safe and healthy lives. A list of their projects included topics, such as programs entitled, "Family, Women and Health," "Training women at risk focusing on living in a

safe, healthy manner,” “Avoiding burnout and physical and mental stress,” and “Peaceful conflict resolution” (Women’s NGO web site).⁴⁷

As gender became an important donor priority in the mid to late 1990s creating gender equality in families and prevention of domestic violence were included in their diagnostic and prognostic frames as they continued to help women deal with family abuse and learn to take responsibility for their lives. The NGO’s projects from the late 1990s and early 2000s had titles that included phrases, such as “gender based violence,” “gender equality,” and “domestic violence” (Women’s NGO web site). The booklets and pamphlets created for many of these projects discussed ways that gender inequality lead to abuse in families and problems in raising children, however, often (but not always) without using these foreign terms that would have little local resonance. For example, the differences between men and women and the importance of understanding these differences for mutual understanding relationships was described in a booklet on domestic violence. Instead of writing that gender inequality lead to domestic violence, as the activist described in our interview, the booklet discussed ways that men and women are different but still equal partners. The language used was familiar to Ukrainians instead of filled with a lingo that would appeal to Western women’s rights advocates.

This booklet is dedicated to all men and women who found themselves in a situation when they cried out to their partner, “Why don’t you understand me.” Mutual understanding disappears. Men can not understand why women do not behave themselves in a certain way and vise versa. Men differ from women, but it does not mean that one sex is better than the other.... Without a doubt men and women are equal, but they are also different. But we can see the good side in these differences. You can use them for your relationships. You can even find

⁴⁷ The correct bibliographic information is not given here because it would disclose which organization is being discussed and violate the anonymity promised to the interviewee.

them rather attractive. Men want to have power, success and sex. Women tend to prefer warm relationships, stability and love.” (Didkovska no date, 1).

Gender equality in families was discussed as being important to raising children and protecting them from unnecessary trauma in their lives.

This brochure provides materials on what is a totalitarian and a partner family. What rights do you have as a person, and what rights other people have? How do we not exceed our power over children? How do we overcome children’s fears, teach safe behavior, answer difficult questions, and prevent psychological trauma to children? It turns out that knowing simple things will help you, dear readers, to prevent domestic violence in your families, make your lives happier, build partner relationships between parents and children, and to build harmonious relationships between people of different generations (Bondarovska 1999).

Protecting children was more culturally accepted than creating more gender equality in Ukraine and also appealed to the activist-mother frame that women initially organized around during and immediately following independence (Hrycak 2001, 2002 and 2007; Zhurzhenko 2001). Women activists from this NGO also showed how greater gender equality could help women succeed in the market economy and help them better provide for their children. By following foreign donor priorities the organization was able to offer free counseling services to women and their children on a consistent basis because of the grants they received. They were able to craft a frame that addressed issues important to international funding agencies and win several grants. Simultaneously, they were able to create frames that resonated enough with local Ukrainian women so that many women were willing to come and use their counseling services even though counseling of this type was also somewhat new to Ukraine.

Thus, a few activists were able to include frames important to foreign donors and demonstrated their importance for local Ukrainian women. They incorporated foreign

frames, but in ways that resonated within the Ukrainian context. Feminism became gender studies, gender equality improved family life, and women's rights created equal opportunities for women (and men). This corroborates Hrycak's (2006 and 2007a) study of Ukrainian women's NGOs and her discussion of the development of hybrid-feminists who became familiar with Western feminism and were able to adapt it locally. This section provides examples of successful frame bridging, but not all or even most women's NGOs did this. Because this is a cross-sectional study it is also difficult to gauge the extent to which this was occurring. A study over a longer period of time would be better suited to learning the nature and extent of frame bridging occurring. In addition to being associated with the construction of frames, international funding was also closely linked to outcomes.

Outcomes and international funding

Is international funding connected with organizational maintenance and the ability to sustain campaigns? Women activists acknowledged that without foreign funding they had few resources to implement their projects and make progress toward their goals. Ninety percent of women's NGOs in the sample that were still active in 2002 and 2003 had international funding. Among those with foreign funding, 87% were able to sustain a campaign at some point in the past, and only 60% of those without it were able to sustain campaigns.⁴⁸ In 2002 and 2003, 72% of those with international funding were sustaining

⁴⁸ Throughout this study outcomes were examined in the past and the present. References to past outcomes refer to whether women's NGOs were sustaining campaigns at some point during the life of the

campaigns and again 60% without it were also able to sustain campaigns. Perhaps what is most striking is that only ten organizations in the sample had no international funding at all.

Table: 7-4 Comparison of past rates of organizational maintenance for NGOs with international funding to those without it by city and across all cities

	<u>Kyiv</u>		<u>Kharkiv</u>		<u>L'viv</u>		<u>All Cities</u>	
	<u>Internationa</u> <u>l Funding</u>	<u>No</u> <u>l Funding</u>	<u>Internationa</u> <u>l Funding</u>	<u>No</u> <u>l Funding</u>	<u>Internationa</u> <u>l Funding</u>	<u>No</u> <u>l Funding</u>	<u>Internationa</u> <u>l Funding</u>	<u>No</u> <u>l Funding</u>
Past Campaigns								
0-active, not campaign	1 (5%)	2 (50%)	1 (9%)	1 (50%)	0 (0%)	1 (25%)	2 (5%)	4 (40%)
1-hard to tell	2 (10%)	0 (0%)	1 (9%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	3 (8%)	0 (0%)
2-clearly campaign	17 (85%)	2 (50%)	9 (82%)	1 (50%)	8 (100%)	3 (75%)	34 (87%)	6 (60%)
Totals	100%=20	100%=4	100%=11	100%=2	100%=8	100%=4	100%=39	100%=10

Table: 7-5 Comparison of current rates of organizational maintenance for NGOs with international funding to those without it by city and across all cities

	<u>Kyiv</u>		<u>Kharkiv</u>		<u>L'viv</u>		<u>All Cities</u>	
	<u>Internationa</u> <u>l Funding</u>	<u>No</u> <u>l Funding</u>	<u>Internationa</u> <u>l Funding</u>	<u>No</u> <u>l Funding</u>	<u>Internationa</u> <u>l Funding</u>	<u>No</u> <u>l Funding</u>	<u>Internationa</u> <u>l Funding</u>	<u>No</u> <u>l Funding</u>
Current Campaigns								
0-active, not campaign	1 (5%)	2 (50%)	1 (9%)	1 (50%)	0 (0%)	1 (25%)	2 (5%)	4 (40%)
1-hard to tell	1 (5%)	0 (0%)	2 (18%)	0 (0%)	2 (25%)	0 (0%)	5 (13%)	0 (0%)
2-clearly campaign	14 (70%)	2 (50%)	8 (73%)	1 (50%)	6 (75%)	3 (75%)	28 (72%)	6 (60%)
3-no longer active	4 (20%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	4 (10%)	0 (0%)
Totals	100%=20	100%=4	100%=11	100%=2	100%=8	100%=4	100%=39	100%=10

The breakdown of organizations with international funding by city was similar.

In Kyiv, 85% of those with international funding were sustaining campaigns in the past, 82% in Kharkiv, and 100% in L'viv. The difference between L'viv and the other two cities disappears when looking at outcomes in the present. In 2002 and 2003 70% of women's NGOs with international funding in Kyiv were sustaining campaigns, 73% in

organization. Present outcomes refer to those that were sustaining campaigns at the time of the study. Some of the organizations included in the study were no longer operating at all, but had sustained campaigns in the past. Their earlier ability to sustain campaigns is noted in discussions of past outcomes, but they are not coded as able to sustain campaigns at the time of the study. Other organizations were clearly sustaining campaigns in the past, but at the time of the study the organization was not as active as it was previously, and it was unclear whether they were sustaining any campaigns. Again, their past ability to sustain campaigns is incorporated in discussions of past outcomes. For these reasons, past outcomes and rates of organizational maintenance at the time of the study often differ from each other.

Kharkiv and 75% in L'viv. The difference in L'viv for past outcome rate is most likely a result of small sample size since the difference is only one organization. These findings are not surprising since several activists explained they relied on foreign funding to implement their projects and were not able to find enough domestic resources to support their campaigns.

The only persistent difference in the outcome rate among cities is related to those without international funding. Those without it in L'viv were consistently more able to maintain their organizations and sustain campaigns. In the past and at the time of the study, those without international funding in L'viv had an outcome rate of 75% and only 50% in both Kyiv and Kharkiv. Again L'viv is different in its relationship to international funding. A higher proportion of organizations there seem to be able to survive without it. This could also be the result of a small sample size since the difference is only one and two organizations. However, international funding has interacted differently with the women's organizations and their frames in L'viv throughout, and this continues the pattern. Perhaps the women's NGOs in L'viv without international funding were engaging in campaigns that did not require much in the way of material resources. The conclusion section explores in more depth possible explanations for L'viv's consistent differences.

As discussed in earlier chapters a higher threshold of outcomes than the ability to sustain a campaign might reveal a different picture. Focusing on campaigns biases the outcomes measure towards organizations that have resources. Since the resources in the Ukrainian women's movement tended to come from foreign sources the measure of

outcomes is biased toward finding a strong connection between international funding and outcomes.

Conclusions

Without foreign funding few of the women's NGOs would have means to implement their goals as demonstrated by the high rate of organizational maintenance of organizations with international funding and the much lower rate for those without it. Foreign funding provided the material resources for the organizations. Activists across the three cities acknowledged their dependence on foreign money to operate their organizations. Contacts with women's activists abroad, access to new information and methods were also benefits that came with foreign funding. Examples of how to lobby, programs for battered women, business incubators and credit unions were often learned through experiences abroad that activists enjoyed as the result of foreign donor interest in Ukraine. International funding even helped to popularize new issues, such as domestic violence and gender quotas to increase women's representation, among several local NGOs (Hrycak 2007a, Sperling, Ferree and Risman 2001). At the same time, international funding also created divisions within the women's movement as activists competed for a limited pool of resources. The rivalries and jealousies prevented NGOs from cooperating on projects and improving their effectiveness. It also encouraged the formation of "paper organizations" that existed solely for the purpose of winning grants. These organizations formed and quietly disappeared once the grant was finished. All of this only served to increase competition and divisions among movement activists.

In addition to competing with each other, local activists who pursued foreign funding were forced to negotiate foreign priorities while simultaneously framing for a domestic audience. The difficulty lay in following shifting donor priorities while maintaining relevance to local Ukrainian women. A few organizations were able to identify and follow donor priorities while continuing to implement their original goals through frame transformation and bridging. They adapted their frames to resonate with donor priorities, but continued to frame their actions so that they resonated locally.⁴⁹ Ishkanian observed a similar phenomenon among women activists in Armenia (2004). However, sometimes activists abandoned their initial frame in favor of one with more foreign donor appeal. Other times the frame extension was also close to dropping an original frame in favor of one that might bring funding. Furthermore, attempts to follow donor priorities sometimes resulted in the failure to complete the framing tasks that framing theorists identify as important to obtaining outcomes (Cress and Snow 2000). Incomplete framing, frame abandonment and extension were closely linked to international funding and most likely reduced appeal to local Ukrainian women.

Connected with the above findings, are the consistent differences between the three cities included in this study. For most of the above findings L'viv stands out as different from Kyiv and Kharkiv in its relationship to foreign funding. First, while activists explained that they were forced to rely on foreign sources to finance their

⁴⁹ Whether they are still able to do so given the steady decrease in international funding to Ukraine once donors shifted their focus to other parts of the world remains to be seen. This applies to every NGO dependent on foreign funding. In 1996 USAID received 225 million in the Freedom Support Act to give aid to Ukraine (USAID Budget Report to Congress 1996). Since 2000 there has been a steady and significant decrease in the amount given to Ukraine with an intentional phase out process begun in 2004 (USAID Budget Report to Congress 2005). In 2005 that amount was reduced to 82.25 million (USAID Budget Report to Congress 2006).

campaigns, a higher percentage of L'viv NGOs without it were maintaining their organizations and sustaining campaigns, making foreign funding seem not quite as necessary in L'viv. Only activists in Kyiv and Kharkiv mentioned competition among NGOs, splintering of the movement and the formation of paper organizations in their interviews. There was also less incomplete framing in L'viv than Kyiv and Kharkiv. Frame abandonment was only seen in Kyiv and Kharkiv and not in L'viv. Frame extension was more common in Kharkiv (54%) and roughly equal in Kyiv (29%) and L'viv (25%). Why was there less incomplete framing, frame abandonment and extension in L'viv? Why less splintering of the movement and competition among organizations in L'viv?

A possible explanation was the greater amount of foreign money and attention in Kyiv and Kharkiv compared to L'viv which lessened the influence of international funding. Foreign donors often begin giving money in capital cities and then work their way out to the regions (Nechemias 2006; Sperling 1999). Hrycak (2007a) noted that Kharkiv received more attention from international donors than many other cities in Ukraine. The U.S. government intentionally gave special attention to the Kharkiv region to assist its economic recovery (USAID Budget Report to Congress 1998, 61). In addition, more of the organizations in Kharkiv and Kyiv received support from large foreign donors which usually meant greater amounts of money, and more NGOs were receiving it on a consistent basis. In Kyiv, 58% of organizations in the study received at least one grant from large foreign donors and 37% were receiving it on a fairly consistent basis. In Kharkiv 61% of the NGOs received at least one grant from large foreign donors and 38% were receiving it on a relatively consistent basis. In contrast, in L'viv only 41%

of NGOs received money from large international donors, and only 16% were receiving consistent support from major foreign donors. Because Kyiv and Kharkiv received more international attention its effects may have been more pronounced than in L'viv. They were also more likely to be aware of shifting donor priorities and grant opportunities because of the greater attention from foreign donors, making them more likely to change their frames or expand their frames.

Remarks from women's activists that did not receive any international money in the three cities lend some support to the above explanation. In L'viv, activists from NGOs that did not receive any international funding seemed to have very little knowledge of how to go about attaining it or simply expressed no interest in it at all. In contrast, those in Kyiv and Kharkiv who did not have international money seemed more aware that opportunities for foreign grants existed and more knowledgeable about what was required to receive international money. Some had even applied, but simply never won a grant. All of this would help explain why organizations in L'viv might be less tempted to change frames to follow donor priorities and compete with each other for grants.

Other possible explanations for fewer frame changes and fewer NGOs following donor priorities in L'viv than Kyiv and Kharkiv include the higher percentage of organizations concerned with nationalism in L'viv. As discussed in the nationalism chapter, NGOs concerned with nationalism tended to be less concerned with international priorities, particularly in L'viv. Nationalism organizations were more likely to promote an ideal of motherhood and mothers as bearers of culture than to call into question gender stereotypes or address women's status, especially in L'viv. In addition, as discussed in

the gender and discrimination chapter, fewer organizations in L'viv were concerned with gender issues and discrimination against women, topics which tended to be funded by foreign donors and often critiqued the culture. Fewer organizations in L'viv were critiquing or challenging the culture than in Kyiv and Kharkiv. Since L'viv tends to be more socially conservative than the rest of the country, perhaps in part because of its nationalist orientation, it is not surprising that fewer women's organizations would be challenging the local culture by talking about gender or women's rights. Therefore, fewer NGOs might be enticed to change their frames and/or issues to follow donor priorities that often embraced these frames.

L'viv's women's activists may also have been less tempted to follow donor priorities because they had somewhat of their own agenda before international donors arrived with their priorities. Many of the women involved in the nationalism organizations in L'viv had a history of supporting nationalism in western Ukraine. Some of their mothers were active in the pre-war Soyuz Ukrainok. Some of them did not feel that the women's movement was emerging in Ukraine, but was resuming its previous activity. The pre-existing nationalism agenda may be one reason why L'viv activists were less willing to adjust their frames to donor priorities and why more of them were successful without foreign funding. As noted earlier in Kharkiv, one local government official working with women's NGOs, felt that foreign funding created a certain amount of chaos by arriving with its own ideas before women had the opportunity to decide for themselves what their issues were. Perhaps this lack or perception of a lack of a pre-

existing agenda in Kyiv and especially Kharkiv made activists more open to foreign donor influences.⁵⁰

We see that international funding has a strong influence in the issues chosen and the construction of frames created by women activists, primarily in Kyiv and Kharkiv. It is also closely linked to outcomes, although more so in Kyiv and Kharkiv than L'viv. Throughout the chapter, L'viv remains different from Kyiv and Kharkiv in its relationship to international funding. Now we turn to domestic resources which have a much less observable impact on the frames and an inconsistent connection to outcomes. But, like foreign funding, they behave differently in L'viv than Kyiv and Kharkiv.

⁵⁰ Women in western Ukraine were not the only ones to organize starting in the mid 19th century until the creation of the Soviet Union (Bohachevsky-Chomiak 1988). Smolyar (1998) wrote a history of Ukrainian women's organizing in the Russian empire from the mid 1800s through the beginning of the 20th century. However, unlike women's activists in western Ukraine, those in Kyiv and particularly in Kharkiv did not reference this previous activism. None of the women's NGOs in the Kharkiv sample spoke of earlier women's activism in their region or even seemed to think of themselves as continuing an historical movement.

Chapter 8

Domestic Resources and Elite Allies

Introduction

Social movement literature considers resources essential to the course and outcome of social movements (McCarthy and Zald 1977). In the Ukrainian women's movement many activists turned to foreign sources funding to acquire material resources. Several activists asserted that it was not possible to sustain their organizations solely on the basis of the domestic resources available them, and as a result, turned their attention to foreign donors. However, many women's organizations acquired at least a small portion of their material resources from within Ukraine. In the sample of 49 women's NGOs, 38 (78%) received at least some form of material resources from domestic sources.

The next sections examine the types of domestic resources acquired by women's NGOs. Analysis of variations in the local and national resources available to NGOs in each city follows. Kharkiv offered more opportunities for NGOs at the city level than either Kyiv or L'viv. L'viv seemed particularly closed to NGOs at the local level. In Kyiv, more activists had contacts with national level elites than in Kharkiv and L'viv. I also examine connections between frames and domestic resources, which are weak. These findings related to the opportunities for domestic resources in each city, and their role in the construction of frames, are summarized in the table below. The role of

political parties in women's organizations is considered as well. Their role was found to be marginal, in part because of the timing of the study, and their unwillingness to discuss their interaction and connections with parties. Women's involvement with political parties in the 2002 elections failed to further women's interests and divided movement activists. Last, the outcomes of women's groups with different types of domestic resources are analyzed. The presence of domestic resources was not consistently connected with higher rates of organizational maintenance for women's NGOs, yielding some counter-intuitive findings. Domestic resources tended to aid women's NGOs on an inconsistent basis, forcing their reliance on foreign funding.

Table: 8-1 Summary of the similarities and differences across cities in the influence of domestic resources on the construction of frames and opportunities for resources

Similarities

- No observable influence on the construction of frames in all three cities
- Office space and donations from local businesses received by about half of the women's NGOs in all three cities

Variations in opportunities for domestic resources

<u>Kyiv</u>	<u>Kharkiv</u>	<u>L'viv</u>
-Moderate amount of material support from local government	-Highest amount of material support from local government	-Least material support from local government
-Highest amount of material support from national government	-Very little material support from national government	-Least material support from national government

Material resources

The following section is an overview of the types of domestic resources women's groups were able to obtain. The nature of the material resource, the relative extent to which it was available, and general quantities are discussed. Women's activists' explanations as to why they could not more acquire domestic resources are also included. Domestic resources were categorized into four different types: office space, donations from local businesses, local level assistance and national level assistance.

Office Space

Office space, usually a small amount, was the most frequently mentioned resource that women's groups obtained from domestic sources. A space to meet, implement activities, use as a legal address, and store supplies was needed. Several activists mentioned that it was difficult to acquire office space. They could pay rent for it themselves, which was difficult to do since most foreign grants did not allow their money to be used for rent. Or, they could wait in line at the mayor's office to receive a room or two. The difficulty in this lay in the condition of the space allotted to NGOs. Often it was only uninhabitable space that was given to NGOs, and businesses were given a higher priority because they could pay taxes. Women activists then had to have the resources to renovate the space (Interview with women's NGO leader, 12/18/2002). Activists still had to be able to afford utilities for the office which was a further challenge for them. The office could also be taken away at almost any time if the city decided it was to its advantage to use the space differently. One activist reported having to move

her office three times because the local government decided to reclaim the space, even though she enjoyed good relations with local officials. Another claimed her office space was revoked shortly before the last elections because of her support for opposition parties (Interview with women's NGO leaders 11/6/2002 and 11/7/2002).

Despite these difficulties several organizations managed to obtain office space, in varying degrees of usability. In Kyiv, 15 of the 24 (63%) NGOs in the study had their own office space or could use rooms regularly at a university, seven of 13 (54%) had offices in Kharkiv, and six of 12 (50%) in L'viv. Some of the organizations were able to use it as an office where they kept their computers, faxes, held meetings, and regular activities. Others had the space and simply used it as more of a storage room. Still others had space, but because of its poor condition were not able to make use of it. A few activists in each city claimed that it was easier for them not to have their own office because they could hold their meetings in someone's apartment or just rent a space for a specific activity. They felt it was more beneficial not to use their resources renovating and maintaining an office. Others also mentioned that they simply could not afford utilities so they found ways to function without it.

Donations from local businesses or individuals

Women's organizations were also able to acquire small amounts of material resources from local businesses in all three cities. Activists frequently complained that Ukraine lacked a spirit of philanthropy, however, several received small amounts of goods, services or money from local businesses. Sometimes this was very small amounts

of money. One activist mentioned a donation of 100 UAH (a little under \$20 in 2003) from local businesses to print a small calendar. More often, it was donations of goods such as sugar, flour, or chocolates to be used as prizes for competitions or gifts at holiday parties. Sometimes a local business might be willing to donate money for train tickets for children or tickets to the circus or another event. A business might also be willing to print some materials for a conference or event. For example, a local business was willing to print conference materials for a Kharkiv women's organization. A business donated some candy for holiday gifts for Chernobyl children to a Kyiv NGO. A private school in Kyiv donated some of its old toys to a counseling center in Kyiv. None of these donations were on a large scale or enough to sustain consistent organizational activities, but they were, nonetheless, helpful to organizations. In Kyiv, exactly half (12 of 24) of the women's NGOs mentioned this type of aid from local businesses, seven of 13 (54%) in Kharkiv and seven of 12 (58%) in L'viv. Activists made it clear that they had to ask for this support and often felt as if they were reduced to begging. Some said they were tired of constantly asking for donations.

In addition to being given material resources, some NGOs were able to use computers and office equipment of a local establishment, particularly universities. For instance, a gender studies center in L'viv had internet access and use of a room through a university. Most of the gender studies centers used rooms at universities for meetings rather than renting their own office space and had access to copiers and printers through the university. If they held a conference, they could usually do it in university space. Non-academic NGOs were also sometimes able to use others' space and equipment. For instance, in Kharkiv, a group held technology trainings using the computers and space of

a local establishment. Chernobyl Women's Fund in Kyiv used the medical equipment from activists' workplaces to examine Chernobyl children. In L'viv, the Olena Teliha Society held meetings and concerts at an academy where an activist taught. Permission to use another's space and equipment was another domestic resource helpful to several women's NGOs.

Local Government Assistance

Women's organizations could also sometimes receive assistance from their local governments. This came in varying forms. Some women's NGOs, particularly those in Kharkiv, won small grants from the city government to implement social service projects. The grants were not large, but \$300-600 was often enough to help with a campaign. A Kharkiv activist was awarded a small grant to study the treatment of orphans in orphanages and write a report about human rights violations. A few others were awarded free rent and, more often, free utilities by the city government. For instance, an organization that opened a women's shelter in Kharkiv did not have to pay rent or utilities for it for the first few years. Three women's NGOs in Kyiv pressured the city government to give them a two-story house to use as a women's center. They received it rent free.

Other types of assistance from the local government came in the form of cooperation, or as some women activists explained, the local government would not hinder them from carrying out their activities. For instance, nationalism oriented organization, in L'viv, explained that the city let them hold a march through the

downtown area and allowed them to close off a few streets. Another women's activist in L'viv felt the city government cooperated with their organization when its representatives came to the round tables it held. On the whole, women activists explained that the local governments gave them very little attention, and most had no expectation of assistance from their city governments.

National government assistance

Some women's organizations, mostly those in Kyiv, received assistance from the national government. One nationalism oriented NGO won a grant from the national government. Most often those who received assistance from the national government had a personal connection with one of the members of parliament and were able to lobby their concerns through them or request money through them. For instance, the leader of a Kyiv women's organization asked one of the parliamentary deputies to request the government set aside money to pay for plane tickets for their activists to go to a conference in Australia. This organization was a member of a world wide confederation of women's organizations and also requested money set aside in the budget to pay their annual \$700 membership fee. Another woman activist had a husband who was a member of parliament. She lobbied some concerns of her organization through her husband. Other activists' benefits were less tangible. For instance, an activist in Kharkiv replied that they received support from a particular member of parliament. A female deputy would pass along information on issues the activist was interested in.

The State Committee on Family and Youth Affairs was a committee in the national government that several women's activists, in Kyiv, mentioned as a source of support. The State Committee on Family and Youth Affairs was the state structure that dealt with women's status. From 1995-1996 there was the Presidential Committee on the Status of Women and Children which was dissolved when the Ministry of Family and Youth was created in 1996 and lasted until 1999. In 2000, it was incorporated as a department under the State Committee of Youth, Sport, and Tourism. From 2000-2001 there was the State Department on Family and Youth. In 2002, until the present the State Committee on Family and Youth Affairs was formed to address issues of women's status, including gender equality issues, and bring Ukraine into line with international norms of gender equality (Interview with State Committee worker 1/22/2003). It still had a family-centered approach to policy with most of its budget designated for children's recreation. In 2002 only \$5,000 (25,600 UAH) was allotted to improving women's status and most of it went to children's programs (Hrycak 2005, 79). Thus, while the State Committee existed and was considered an accomplishment of the women's movement, by some activists, de facto, it was not able to play a significant role in the improvement of women's status or creation of gender equality in Ukraine. It seemed women's activists hoped it would be a resource for them and a useful point of access to the government, but with so little money allocated to it, its ability to assist women's organizations was severely limited. A few activists did say that someone on the committee wrote a letter of support for their organization to receive a foreign grant.

On the whole, organizations received small amounts of material aid from domestic sources. The most important and prevalent resource tended to be office space

which came in varying forms of usability. Small donations of goods and services from local businesses were also sometimes given. None of this was enough to sustain an organization on a consistent basis. Local governments and the national government gave small amounts of material aid to women's organizations, but most activists felt the government largely ignored them.

Obstacles to acquiring more domestic resources

In Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv activists mentioned difficulties that all NGOs faced which made it more difficult for them to take advantage of domestic resources. They noted that while a majority of the population was poor, there were wealthy individuals and businesses in Ukraine. Unfortunately for NGOs, Ukraine lacked a spirit of philanthropy. It was not considered an obligation or prestigious to donate money. In addition, the tax laws did not encourage philanthropy by giving deductions for charitable donations. A negative attitude toward philanthropy and the absence of tax incentives for charitable donations made it more difficult for NGOs to convince wealthy Ukrainians to give money to their organizations (Interviews with women's NGO leaders 11/5/2002; 11/6/2002; 11/15/2002; 12/9/2002; 1/28/2003; 2/7/2003; 2/7/2003; 2/12/2003; 2/20/2003; 2/28/2003; 3/18/2003; 3/18/2003; 3/20/2003; 4/24/2003).

NGOs, by law, were not allowed to earn their own money. One activist complained that they were not even permitted to sell their own goods in order to raise money for their own projects (Interview with women's NGO leader 3/18/2003). If they engaged in activities to make money they would lose their non-profit status (and their

ability to win foreign grants). Even the NGOs that were well funded with resourceful leaders saw no way to become self supporting as a result (Interview with women's NGO leaders 11/5/2002; 11/6/2002; 1/28/2003; 2/12/2003; 2/27/2003; 3/18/2003; 3/20/2003). The tax laws also made it difficult for NGOs that were trying to help women start their own businesses. Activists claimed the tax laws for businesses were complicated and often unreasonable. Often the taxes on businesses were close to 100%, making it hard to expect businesses to operate legally (Interview with women's NGO leader 2/12/2003).

The absence of a philanthropic spirit in Ukraine and the inability to generate their own revenue contributed to dependence on foreign funding according to activists. However, despite the difficulties in securing domestic resources many organizations did receive support domestically. The following section discusses opportunities at the local and national level. Differences between the cities are discussed throughout.

Variations in local opportunities

Activists felt the quantity of domestic resources they received was inadequate to sustain their organizations, but most of them still managed to obtain at least a small amount in one of the four forms discussed above. Most of it came from local level sources, however, with the exception of office space, the opportunities at the local level varied considerably. The women's NGOs in Kharkiv and Kyiv interacted differently with their local governments than those in L'viv, showing differences in opportunities for women's NGOs at the local level. The starkest contrast was between Kharkiv and L'viv,

with Kyiv falling in the middle. Almost 50% (6 of 13) of the NGOs included in the Kharkiv sample reported having won small grants through the Kharkiv city government for specific projects. The grants were just enough to fund or partially fund one project or event, but not enough to sustain an organization. They were, however, large enough to be considered helpful to organizations and worth the effort of applying. In Kyiv only 25% (six of 24) of women's organizations reported assistance from either the Kyiv city government or their local district administration. In contrast, in L'viv, only one organization out of 12 (8%) received assistance from the city government. What made the Kharkiv local context different from Kyiv and especially L'viv? Why did proportionately more activists in Kharkiv than Kyiv or L'viv report positive interaction and even monetary support from the city government in a country where resources were scarce and the government often suspicious of NGOs? This section explores opportunities for domestic resources that existed at the local level in each city. It seeks to explain why there were more local level opportunities in Kharkiv, some in Kyiv, and almost none in L'viv.

Kharkiv

In Kharkiv, the women's NGOs were surprisingly well aware of what others were doing, and several reported winning small amounts of money through the city government. Activists, in each city, reported that on the whole the government either paid no attention to NGOs, yet, despite this, 46% of Kharkiv women's NGOs had some regular interaction with the city government.

Kharkiv received a surprising amount of attention from international donors (Hrycak 2007a; Interview with Winrock International employee 6/23/2003) including from an organization formerly known as the Cincinnati-Kharkiv Sister City Project (CKSP)⁵¹. This U.S. based non-profit began working in Kharkiv in 1989. CKSP organized hundreds of exchanges and programs between Cincinnati and Kharkiv with the intention of creating friendships, cooperation and goodwill between the people of Kharkiv and Cincinnati. Several of their projects included trips to the U.S. and small grants for women's NGO leaders and local government officials. Women's leaders visited women's organizations in Cincinnati and saw the types of projects they engaged in to assist women. A visit to Cincinnati inspired two women activists to create shelters for abused women in Kharkiv. They also learned that many American NGOs financed their projects by winning grants from their local governments. Through these interactions several activists learned that the city government could be a potential source of cooperation and support rather than an obstacle to their work (Personal communication with NGO worker 8/19/2004). As a result, many of the activists knew about the U.S. model in which the government awards grants to NGOs to carry out work that might otherwise be considered the government's responsibility. They also understood more about how to look for opportunities that might be available through the local government.

City council members and other municipal level workers also had opportunities to either go to Cincinnati or participate in programs that included local government training

⁵¹ Several of the NGO leaders and other individuals associated with the women's movement called Cincinnati Kharkiv's sister city and reported having participated in one or more of the CKSP projects. Many of them also won grants through CKSCP (Interview with women's NGO leaders, 2/7/2003, 2/7/2003, 2/7/2003, 2/12/2003; Interview with women's movement supporters 2/20/2003 and 2/22/2003).

and education through CKSCP and other foreign initiatives. This encouraged the Kharkiv city council to choose to use NGOs as service providers and NGOs to look to the local government as a potential source of support, according to a Kharkiv women's activist who participated in some of the CKSCP initiatives.

I think the West showed us a good example because we have learned that abroad the state supports social organizations, and many social organizations carry out certain social functions. It simply is a relief for our government. They don't have to do this work. Social organizations will do that work for them, and will do it well. It just takes some of the load off their shoulders. I think, they (the city government) understood it and decided to cooperate. For many years we have been talking about it, meeting and telling them it should be efficient. This is the second year, and it really works (Interview with women's NGO leader 2/7/2003).

Some city government officials learned that NGOs could often be more efficient and effective with a small amount of money than the government apparatus. A member of the Kharkiv city council explained that the city council decided to set aside a certain amount of money for NGOs and award small grants to them on a competitive basis. She claimed to be familiar with the work of all the NGOs in Kharkiv (Interview with local government official 2/20/2003). In addition to offering grants on a competitive basis, she also helped to facilitate their work by holding events, such as an outdoor NGO fair in a downtown park. This provided opportunities for NGOs to learn more about each other's work and the public to become aware of the opportunities available to them through NGOs.⁵² For instance, when an NGO dealing with women's economic and gender concerns held a conference, they were able to know what other NGOs in the city

⁵² Despite her efforts to encourage women's NGOs to cooperate this government worker recognized that several of the women's groups strongly disliked each other and invested time and energy in rivalries and arguments rather than cooperation (Interview with local government official 2/20/2003).

were working on topics that might be relevant and invited them. Therefore, as a result of long term interaction with foreign donor organizations, particularly the CKSP, many city government officials chose to think of NGO activists as a potential resource for the city and provided cooperation and some amount of assistance for their work. In addition, because of this assistance on the part of the city government, women's NGOs in Kharkiv were given the opportunity to network with each other, although, as discussed in the international funding chapter this did not lead to cooperation among women's NGOs.

Besides making city government officials aware of ways NGOs could serve as a resource for the city, exchanges through the CKSCP also introduced local government officials to some women's concerns they might not otherwise have considered. For instance, one city council member learned that the U.S. had laws against domestic violence. He became active on the issue and helped draft Ukraine's law on domestic violence. He also assisted a women's NGO that helped victims of domestic violence by setting aside some budget money for this organization and petitioning national Rada deputies for funding on behalf of this organization (Interview with Kharkiv city council member 2/22/2003). Another city council member discussed the dangers of trafficking, something she learned more about through an exchange trip, and connections with an international NGO in Ukraine (Interview with Kharkiv city council member 2/20/2003). Thus, members of the Kharkiv city government were perhaps more familiar with issues, such as domestic violence or trafficking, that were also in line with foreign donor priorities and addressed by women's NGOs in Kharkiv.

Interactions with CKSCP and other foreign initiatives resulted in a city government that was perhaps more open to cooperation with women's NGOs than it

might otherwise have been. Furthermore, some of those in the city government who learned through experiences abroad also provided special assistance to a specific women's group in Kharkiv, acting as a local patron within the city government. Six women's activists in Kharkiv reported receiving a grant and/or free rent and utilities for their premises from the city government. Five of those six organizations had a close personal connection to someone on the city council. One member of the city council was also a leader of two women's NGOs. The benefits she secured were for her own NGOs (Interview with women's NGO leader 2/7/2003). Another secured free rent and utilities for a NGO starting a women's shelter. He was the same city council member who learned about domestic violence laws in the U.S. (Interview with Kharkiv city council member 2/22/2003). The benefits he secured were only for one women's organization in Kharkiv and did not include the others that were also working in the area of domestic violence. Another women's organization, that appeared to consist of only the leader and one personal assistant, seemed an unlikely candidate to win a grant, but was able to win one through the city council. The individual who administered the grant process in the city government was a former member of this organization (Interview with Kharkiv city council member 2/20/2003). One women's NGO that reported winning a grant through the city government did so without any personal contact/patron in the local government.

Thus, Kharkiv women's NGOs enjoyed a city government that was fairly open to cooperation with women's NGOs. In part, this was a result of NGOs and city officials learning through interactions with foreign initiatives. The personal connections to individuals in local government also appeared to open up opportunities to women's NGOs they might not otherwise have enjoyed. It is difficult to discern whether there was

any connection between the organizations that received local government assistance and the frames they used. All of women's groups that received a grant or rent and utilities from the city government were ones that used the gender and discrimination frames. The projects for which they received the funding also used the gender discrimination frame. They also happened to be projects that tended to follow donor priorities, such as a hotline for trafficking victims to call, funding for women's shelters, establishing a municipal gender council, a guide to services in the city or a conference on women's professional careers. Perhaps the foreign initiatives, in Kharkiv, particularly the CKSCP, created local opportunities. Women activists were also more likely to take advantage of them, as a result of their international experiences. As discussed in the international funding chapter, many women's NGOs in Kharkiv appeared to be following foreign donor priorities, and this was reflected in their frames. With a city government more familiar and sympathetic to foreign donor priorities, women's activists using frames that appealed to foreign donors could simultaneously appeal to the local government. The personal connections seemed to create more of a back door route to receiving city resources and also tended to be with individuals who participated in foreign initiatives. Thus, it is difficult to discern the relationship between the frames used by women's activists and the resources received from the city government.

L'viv

In contrast to Kharkiv, women's NGOs in L'viv had very little interaction with local government. Most of them had absolutely no interaction with individuals in the city government and no expectations of receiving any support from the local government. There was no individual in the city government concerned with the work of NGOs or trying to facilitate their operation as in Kharkiv. Most activists reported that the city government helped them by not actively trying to hinder their activity. Occasionally they might be consulted on a particular topic. For instance, one that provided business and job training to women was sometimes consulted by the city's economic council and the city unemployment services. No money or assistance was provided to this women's organization rather, the opinion and advice of its leader was sometimes taken into consideration by the city. They considered this an improvement in their relationship with the city government. When their NGO was initially founded the city government tended to regard them as a competitor and refused to work with them (Interview with women's NGO leader 3/24/2003). Another women's NGO that provided assistance to children also reported positive relations with the local government, but much like the preceding one, the assistance flowed from the NGO to the local agency (Interview with women's NGO leader 4/14/2003; Interview with local government official 4/25/2003).

Only one women's NGO, from the sample of 12 in L'viv, reported receiving any financial or material support, apart from office space, from the local government. A few other women activists complained that the NGO receiving support from the local government enjoyed a special status in L'viv, but no one elaborated on the nature of it or

showed a strong interest in discussing it (Interview with women's NGO leader 3/20/2003). The women's group receiving local government assistance had a nationalist orientation. They were the only ones who felt the local government was highly supportive of their activities, particularly in terms of material support. Its leader reported they were awarded money for economic education of women in villages, and in general, they enjoyed regular cooperation with local authorities.⁵³

We very successfully co-work with the Department of Economics. In particular, we start our economic programs with them. Our women who do the educational work are working quite well with the Family and Youth Department. Now the city entrusted us to organize the Mother's Day celebration in the second week of May. We are totally responsible for that. We started to revive this holiday, and now every year we organize it. I mean our organization is the only one that does it.... There are a lot of deputies among our women. Many of our members are deputies of local city administrations or the village administration where they live.... So the organization of some events, some cultural and educational programs are connected better with each other. We can count on some support with buses, or with money, or with apartments... (Interview with women's NGO leader 4/11/2003).

None of the other three nationalism oriented women's NGOs in L'viv enjoyed this type of a relationship with the local government. No one mentioned any personal connections to city council members or other local government officials, including the NGO receiving the support.

There was also less networking occurring among women's NGOs in L'viv, and many activists blamed this on the lack of anyone in government who might help to facilitate connections among NGOs. One woman activist reported that there was once a woman in the local government who helped women's NGOs network with each other, but

⁵³ No other L'viv activists mentioned any money available to NGOs through the local government.

she was gone, and the person who replaced her had no interest in working with women's NGOs (Interview with women's NGO leader 4/11/2003). As a result, women in L'viv did not mention events that they were invited to by women activists from other NGOs as in Kharkiv and Kyiv. There appeared to be only two women's organizations in the city that were widely known by several women activists. Other activists could refer to the work of these two organizations but not the rest of the population of women's NGOs. Conversely, in Kharkiv and Kyiv, when asked, activists were usually able to give at least some information on the activities of several other NGOs in the city. A few women activists were cognizant of the absence of networking among organizations in L'viv. Activists in the L'viv gender studies center explained that they tried to engage other women's NGOs in some of their activities but met with no success. They instead cooperated with a few gender studies centers in Kyiv.

On the whole, women's NGOs in L'viv appeared to have much less interaction with the local government than those in Kharkiv. None of the activists mentioned anything like the CKSP which helped facilitate the NGO and city government relationships in Kharkiv. Consequently, there was less interaction with each other. There were also no personal connections among NGOs and local elites, in L'viv. Since women's activists tended not to know a whole lot about women's NGOs in other cities, they did not know that in Kharkiv, for instance, women's groups were able to win grants through their city government. Interviews with L'viv women activists contained no or very little discussion about connections with the local government. They did not seem to think of it as a potential resource, with the exception of the one nationalism oriented women's NGO.

Since only one women's NGO in L'viv was the recipient of local government assistance it is particularly difficult to determine whether there was any connection to the frame used. It was a nationalist oriented NGO that enjoyed a pre-Soviet history in western Ukraine, particularly in the L'viv region. The nationalism frame has strong resonance in L'viv which would lead one to anticipate more local support for a nationalism oriented organization. However, the other three nationalism oriented women's groups in L'viv did not receive any support from the local government. In addition, some of the projects of this women's NGO that were supported had to do with spreading Ukrainian traditions, but the other projects that seemed to receive more local government support were economic development projects. The economic crisis was a frame that resonated in L'viv, but it did in the rest of Ukraine as well.

Kyiv

Kyiv presented a mixed picture in terms of interaction between women's NGOs and city government. There were some organizations that managed to receive some money from the local government, but on the whole women activists reported that the city government paid no attention to them. The local context did not seem as closed to women's NGOs as in L'viv, but not as accessible to NGOs as in Kharkiv. Kyiv is also a much larger city with more varied opportunities and more women's NGOs. Sometimes activists may not have been aware of opportunities available through the city

government. Others may have chosen to ignore them and focused on international funding or opportunities at the national level.

As in Kharkiv, there was some financing available through the Kyiv city administration. The Kyiv City Department on Gender Politics had some money available to Kyiv and all-Ukrainian organizations, but only one women's NGO mentioned its existence. The Department had only been in existence for a year in 2003, and one of its staff explained that they do not seek out organizations. Organizations have to come to them. It may not have been well advertised and too new for many women's NGOs to know about it. Two women activists mentioned support from their specific district in Kyiv which may have been funded through the city administration. For instance, a women's NGO assisting disabled children and their mothers received some money for teachers' salaries in support of their classes, as well as rent and utilities for their meeting space from their district administration. Two other women's NGOs, both with a national orientation, had their rent and utilities paid by the city government. Two women's activists in the Kyiv sample explained that they tried to obtain support from the city for their projects but were unsuccessful. An organization for women road workers and one concerned with educating youth about their Stalinist past tried but failed to receive city assistance. Thus, 25% (six of 24) women's NGOs in Kyiv received either money or rent and utilities from local governments.

One larger accomplishment at the city level, resulting from the work of women's organizations stands out in Kyiv. In 1997, the Ukrainian parliament approved a National Plan of Action that was a follow up to the International Platform for Action signed by Ukrainian government representatives in Beijing in 1995. The National Plan of Action

and the Beijing Platform for Action included commitments to take concrete measures to improve the lives of women and increase government cooperation with NGOs. Despite the plans of action, no steps were made by the government to improve women's lives or increase cooperation with the government. Using the National Plan of Action and the Beijing Platform as a basis, three women's NGOs in the Kyiv sample (Rozrada (Comfort), Women in Mass Media and League of Women Voters) working together with other women's organizations in the city, decided to pressure the city government to establish a women's center, House for Work with Women, in Kyiv in 1998. The mayor's office responded favorably to their proposal and work began on the project (Griffiths 1998, 15). The women's center includes a renovated independent two story structure at which counseling, education and legal services are provided free of charge to women. Women's NGOs are also permitted to use the facility for meeting space and as a place to hold their activities. For instance, School of Equal Opportunities held regular meetings for high school students at the women's center. There was also a separate shelter for battered women which was part of the women's center (Interview with women's center worker 5/30/2002).

A connection between the frames used by women's activists and the NGOs that received city level support is difficult to discern. Women's NGOs using the gender and discrimination frame, nationalism and one supporting the rights of disabled children were the recipients of either city level grants or free rent and utilities. All, but one of them, were also the recipients of foreign grants. The gender and discrimination frame was the most frequently used frame in the Kyiv sample, but only half of the organizations with local government support used that frame. Two of the women's organizations used the

nationalism frame, and one used a discrimination against disabled children frame. Unlike in Kharkiv, there does not appear to be a link between the frame used and local government support.

In part, it is also difficult to observe a connection between frames used by women activists and support received from the city governments because, unlike with foreign donors, it is unclear that the city governments in each city had any specific priorities regarding women. Since most women's activists felt that their city governments did not care about their existence, amounts of money received were not large, and city level money appeared to be a recent phenomenon, if any specific funding priority was present it was not obvious. Even in Kharkiv, where all the women's groups that won grants or other assistance through the city government used the gender and discrimination frame, it was still unclear whether a connection existed between the frame used and the money received. All but one of the women's organizations in Kharkiv, also had personal connections with individuals on the city council which also helped them to win the grant. In L'viv, only one women's organization received the support, and it was one using the nationalism frame, which might be expected in L'viv. But, it was only one organization.

As in Kharkiv, international experiences combined with foreign funding created opportunities for women's NGOs at the local level. The women activists had to be aware of the opportunities and take advantage of them by their own initiative. The city government was not seeking them out to offer their services. Even the Kyiv City Department of Gender Politics did not encourage organizations to come to them for assistance. L'viv was the only city where there did not appear to be openings at the local level as a result of international experiences and/or funding. This could be because there

was less of a foreign donor presence in L'viv than either Kyiv or Kharkiv. It also seemed that in L'viv women activists were less willing to change their frames to adapt to foreign donor priorities. I speculated that this may have been partly due to the more conservative social climate in L'viv. Since this is part of L'viv distinct cultural context this reasoning could extend to the city government as well. There may have been individuals in it who participated in foreign programs, making them more aware of the ways city governments in the U.S. and other Western democracies cooperated with NGOs. But, like the women activists in their city, they were perhaps less inclined to accept these foreign models. It could also be that there were opportunities at the local level, but L'viv's women's activists were not aware of them like those in Kyiv and Kharkiv. This seems unlikely since some of the activists offered their advice and services to local government departments, such as employment, business and education.

Local business assistance

Women's NGOs received some support from the local government, and several received small amounts of money, goods or services from local businesses. Again, most women activists explained that what they received from local businesses was rarely enough to sustain a campaign and not enough to continue operating on a consistent basis. The amount of assistance from local businesses did not vary as much by city as local government assistance. Roughly half of the women's NGOs in each city received some assistance from local businesses. This aid was often used to buy small gifts for children

at New Years or prizes for contests for children. Sometimes it was used to publish specific issues of an organization's magazine, hold one event (often a party or cultural event), or provide charitable aid to children. The ways in which women's activists used the local business assistance across the three cities was roughly equal as well.

In each city there was one organization that received more consistent support from local businesses. In Kyiv and Kharkiv, it was the former Soviet Women's Council that was able to maintain its connections and receive larger amounts and more support from local businesses. However, this support did not appear to be used to sustain campaigns but for rent and renovations in Kyiv and charitable aid in both Kyiv and Kharkiv.

In L'viv, an organization providing counseling for crisis pregnancies had its rent paid regularly paid by a local businessman. The idea to found the organization was a joint project between an American missionary and a Ukrainian member of that church. The local businessman attended this same church, and volunteered to support this organization. This could be considered an instance where foreign initiatives and support created an opening at the local level in L'viv, but more along the lines of acceptability in L'viv with its more conservative social climate and higher level of religiosity. Crisis pregnancy counseling was new to Ukraine, but probably more likely to be accepted in L'viv than either Kyiv or Kharkiv.

A connection between frames used by women's activists and organizations that received support from local business is again difficult to discern. As with the local government assistance, there are no known priorities and support was only received by those who sought it. No activists said a business came to them and volunteered support.

In Kyiv and Kharkiv, activists using all three frames received local business support, and it was spread relatively equally by frame. In L'viv, none of the organizations using the gender frame received support from local businesses, but none of them mentioned seeking it either. Thus, no consistent pattern between the frames used and women's groups receiving local business support emerged.

National level opportunities

In addition to local level opportunities, national level opportunities were available to women's NGOs as well, although almost exclusively in Kyiv. Opportunities for domestic resources from the national government varied by city, much like opportunities at the city government level varied. Not surprisingly, women's NGOs in Kyiv enjoyed more support from the national government than those in Kharkiv and L'viv.

Kyiv

In Kyiv, ten of 24 (42%) women's organizations were assisted by either individuals in the national government or a structure in the national government. Usually, it was a member of parliament or the State committee on Family and Youth Affairs. For instance, two women's NGOs in Kyiv both received support for their ideas and initiatives from Mikhail Kovalko, a former member of the national Rada. Kovalko introduced a gender bill to the Rada, which was not passed. Another, reported that a

member of parliament helped to finance the electronic publication of their book about the horrors of Stalinism in Ukraine. A parliamentary member often appeared at the events of a women's Chernobyl organization and sometimes provided gifts for the children at New Years. The leader of another women's NGO explained they had a member of parliament who requested financing from the national government for their organization, although the individual's efforts were not able to produce the desired results.

One of the nationalism oriented women's NGOs was able to gain the attention of individuals in the Rada, particularly since some of the leaders' husband's were in the Rada. They were able to use their husbands' contacts with wealthy individuals in the Rada to secure goods and services from people who would not otherwise support them.

It is easy. Sasha's⁵⁴ husband was a member of parliament at that time. Sasha is the President of our organization, and my husband was a member of parliament. So they both addressed those members of parliament who had their businesses and inquired whether they would be interested in and willing to help. In other words, we used our husbands. How else can I know those people? How can I know about Igor Bakayak who was involved in the oil and gas business? From nowhere, except for TV (Interview with women's NGO leader 5/20/2003).

They received small amounts of money and/or goods from these parliamentary members. Activists also said that through their organization's affiliation with Rukh⁵⁵, they were able to have some of their concerns lobbied. For example, a law was passed concerning the provision of vitamins for children, however, no action resulted from the law (Interview with women's NGO leader 6/5/2003).

⁵⁴ Names have been substituted to preserve anonymity.

⁵⁵ A political party in which their husbands were leading members.

The formal head of another women's NGO focused on nationalism was a member of parliament. None of the leading activists in this organization admitted to any specific benefits for their organization resulting from this advantageous situation. Other women leaders in the organization simply said she acted as an inside source of information telling them when and where to write letters in support of or against specific bills of interest to their organization. They were usually interested in bills related to women's and children's concerns (Interview with women's NGO leader 7/1/2003). This organization was also one of only two that mentioned winning grants from The State Committee on Family and Youth Affairs. Probably this inside connection helped them to win the grant.

The former Soviet Women's Council in Kyiv still managed to maintain a privileged status in the state apparatus even though it was officially an NGO (Hrycak 2006). Its leader referred to the Cabinet of Ministers as their primary sponsor. This was the only women's organization in the sample that mentioned any connections within the executive branch. They were also given prime offices near the presidential palace for which they could afford renovations, a guard, rent and utilities. They were also well connected with the State Committee on Family and Youth Affairs (Interview with women's NGO leader 6/4/2003). No specific individuals were mentioned as allies in the national government, but most other's women's NGOs believed this women's organization benefited from its connections in the national government.

Thus, the types of assistance received from the national government by Kyiv NGOs tended to be personal connections to members of parliament, and in one case the executive. They received direct material benefits and support for their causes even if they support did not usually yield results. Two women's organizations in Kyiv received

grants from the State Committee on Family and Youth Affairs, and a few others had support in the form of letter of recommendation.

Women's organizations using the gender discrimination frame, nationalism and economic crisis frames all received national level assistance. Usually the support was the result of personal connections and most likely not a consequence of the frames employed. However, some of the women's leaders using the gender discrimination frame that received support from members of parliament on the gender bill, probably did so, not because the parliamentary members wanted to create greater gender equality, but because of their desire to become members of the European Union (Interview with women's NGO leader 11/15/2002).⁵⁶ In this case, national government aspirations to improve Ukraine's international status created opportunities for women's NGOs in Kyiv using the gender discrimination frame (Hrycak 2007b). This pattern did not extend to Kharkiv and L'viv.

Kharkiv and L'viv

A few organizations in Kharkiv and L'viv also mentioned connections with specific members of parliament. Only two NGOs in Kharkiv mentioned such connections. Their activists were not very specific about exactly what the support entailed. It appeared to be information or updates on laws or simply a connection that did not necessarily yield any benefits. In L'viv, only one mentioned an elite ally at the national level, the former prime minister, Pustovoitenko. His assistance consisted of

⁵⁶ See Hrycak (2007b) for further discussion of Ukraine's EU aspirations and women's NGOs.

informing the organization about expense paid travel, learning opportunities for youth, and an expense paid training for the NGO's own activists (Interview with women's NGO leader 4/22/2003). None of these allies was having a significant impact on the women's NGOs in Kharkiv or L'viv. Since women's organizations in Kharkiv and L'viv tended to be less interested in national legislation, in particular, the gender bill mentioned by many Kyiv women's activists was not discussed in Kharkiv and L'viv, it is less likely that opportunities at the national level would create opportunities locally for NGOs in Kharkiv and L'viv.

Political Parties

Political parties were another possible source of resources and allies for women's NGOs. However, because of the timing of the study, there was very little current interaction and activists were unwilling to discuss their relationships with political parties. Activists were interviewed from November 2002 through July 2003. In the spring of 2002 Ukraine held parliamentary elections in which women's representation fell from 8% to 5%. The interviews were only months after the elections, a time when political parties were no longer concerned with courting women's activists' support. Therefore, at the time of the study, women's NGOs were not the recipients of significant attention from political parties. Many activists were disheartened and disillusioned with the results of their participation and preferred not to discuss it.

What happened in the 2002 Rada elections to disillusion women's movement activists? Their representation declined despite efforts on the part of several women's

organizations to support women's political parties, women candidates and increase the participation of women in all parts of the electoral process. Few women were included on party lists, and when they were, they were usually too far down on the list to win a seat. Women's issues were not addressed in many of the party programs, and there were no women in the government (executive) at the time of the study. Women's NGO activity and increased involvement in the electoral process resulted in their decreased representation. Political power in Ukraine in 2003 was "almost exclusively in male hands" (United Nations Development Program 2003, 10-17).

In addition, during the campaign process centrist pro-presidential women's parties were formed for the purpose of dividing women's movement activists. They operated primarily during elections and were closely affiliated with Leonid Kuchma. Valerii Pustovoitenko (former prime minister) of the People's Democratic Party (Narodno Demokratychna Partiya) formed a women's wing named Action (Diia) (Hrycak 2005, 72-73). Some felt it was really just a front for other political forces using the brand of women to win votes. Other activists joined them and very actively supported the pro-presidential initiatives, thus dividing women. For instance, the widely known women's parties, Women's Party and Women for the Future, were believed to be puppet parties for the Kuchma regime (Hrycak 2005, 73; Kashyrska 2002, 7; Kobets 2002b, 19; Kobets 2002a, 25). More men than women were on the party lists of the women's parties. The women who were included were not generally active in the women's movement, but merely the wives of famous men. The men on the party list cared nothing for women's concerns and presented a mixed message to society. Not surprisingly, Women for the

Future failed to win seats in the 2002 Rada (Kobets 2002a, 25). The only thing these women's parties managed to achieve was division among women's activists.

For these reasons, at the time of the study, most activists who aligned themselves with political parties and participated in the election process were disillusioned based on their experiences. Only Spilka Zhinok (Women's Union) in Kyiv, Women's Fund and Nadia in Kharkiv, and Nika in L'viv mentioned their affiliation with a pro-presidential women's party. No one discussed Women for the Future even though Maria Orlyk, the leader of Spilka Zhinok, was heavily involved in it (Kobets 2002a, 25). The Olena Teliha Society and League of Ukrainian Women never mentioned their funding from the Organization of Ukrainian Nationalists (a far right party) in interviews (Hrycak 2005, 73). The Olena Teliha Societies, in Kyiv and Kharkiv, mentioned their support of the Sobor and Green parties, both center right parties. The nature of their support and what their organizations did to promote these parties was not a topic these activists were willing to discuss.

All other women's organizations said they had no affiliation with political parties or were only given attention by them immediately before elections. For instance, the leader of the Olena Teliha Society, in L'viv, said politicians would pay attention to them shortly before elections. They felt the politicians used their organization for their own purposes and were not interested in helping women (Interview with women's NGO leader 4/29/2003). An activist from Soyuz Ukrianok explained her experience with politicians and political parties in the last elections.

What hinders us? Maybe it's not difficulties, and it may sound funny, but with every election many politicians and authorities start remembering us and respect us. There is a group of people that we constantly keep in touch with, but there are

some others who come to us just before elections. Probably you can guess why they don't come in other times (Interview with women's NGO leader 4/24/2003).

Zhinocha Hromada (Women's Community) in L'viv reported a similar experience.

When there was the election campaign, they themselves offered us their service, to advertise themselves, of course. For example, they will help with the gifts for children, and it's already a kind of advertisement that they will be good deputies. They offered themselves. But it was only during the election campaign. (Interview with women's NGO leader 3/21/2003).

Activists felt they had simply been used by the political parties to win votes with no intention of seriously addressing women's concerns (Kobets 2002a, 25). Despite efforts to teach women to evaluate party platforms and choose ones that addressed women's interests, activists felt the results of the elections were far from representing women's concerns. Consequently, at the time of the study, activists were not interested in discussing their relationships with political parties. Had the interviews taken place before the 2002 elections the responses may have been different. Based on interview responses in late 2002 and 2003, political parties played an insignificant role in the lives of women's NGOs.

Women's NGOs in all three cities with larger membership bases seemed to be the ones targeted by political parties, although this was not always the case. In Kyiv, the four nationalism oriented groups were membership organizations and each was affiliated with a political party. Their branches in Kharkiv and L'viv did not necessarily have the same party affiliation or any party affiliation. Spilka Zhinok and UWWFCU, also federated women's organizations, were each affiliated with a political party. However, UWWFCU

activists in Kharkiv and L'viv explained that since they were members of the opposition, Kuchma ensured their organizations had no resources. In Kharkiv and L'viv, a few of the women's organizations that were not membership organizations also had connections to political parties. How these women were able to serve political parties' interests was not clear from the interviews. Each was headed by women with personal connections to people in the party. Thus, larger membership based women's organizations seemed most frequently to be associated with political parties, or mentioned being targeted by them shortly before elections.

Women's NGOs with nationalist orientations tended to be aligned with political parties with a more national bent, although, again this was not always the case. For example, in Kharkiv, one of the nationalist women's NGOs supported the Green Party. Spilka Zhinok, which was the successor to the Soviet Women's Councils and maintained many of its former connections in the state apparatus, was consistently aligned with Diia (a pro-presidential party). There was no branch of this organization in L'viv. UWWFCU was always aligned with the Socialist party. All of these are also membership organizations with more sizable memberships than most women's NGOs in the sample. Political parties seemed to choose women's groups that used frames that coincided with their interests, usually nationalist, pro-presidential, or socialist and communist, but not always. However, some women's leaders mentioned that political parties paid attention to them shortly before the elections but not which ones making it difficult to discern a pattern.

Some women's organizations using the gender discrimination frame in Kyiv discussed ways in which they trained women to participate in the election process. They

encouraged women to evaluate candidates and parties based on their concern for issues important to women. The leaders of these two NGOs did not mention an affiliation with a political party. In L'viv, one NGO, with a national orientation, said it also trained women and men to evaluate candidates and parties to learn whether they were supporters of their (each individual person's) interests. No women's NGOs in Kharkiv were involved in these activities.

Women activists' connections to political parties seemed to be based partially on the frames used by the organization and the size of membership rather than location. The extent of material resources they provided for NGOs was unclear. Women's activists in all three cities did make it clear that political parties were more interested in using them for their own interests than furthering the interests of women. Since the information provided about political parties was vague, political parties were not evaluated in their relationship to the success of women's NGOs.

Outcomes and domestic resources

The domestic resources examined in this dissertation were office space, local government support, local business assistance, and national government support. The relationship of each with the rate of organizational maintenance of women's NGOs is considered individually.⁵⁷

⁵⁷ Throughout this study outcomes were examined in the past and the present. References to past rates of organizational maintenance refers to whether women's NGOs were sustaining campaigns at some point

Women's NGOs that had their own offices were consistently more likely to sustain campaigns than those without it across all three cities. At the time of the study, those with office space had an organizational maintenance rate of 86% and those without it of 56%. The same pattern holds when examining cities separately. This is the expected pattern, since those with an office have a meeting space and a place to hold their own activities. They probably also have other resources, either domestic or foreign, that enable them to afford the rent and/or utilities for the office space which would also increase their likelihood of making progress toward their goals. The other three forms of domestic resources examined in this study were not consistently associated with higher rates of organizational maintenance.

Table: 8-2 Comparison of past rates of organizational maintenance for NGOs with office space to those without it by city and across all cities

	<u>Kviv</u>		<u>Kharkiv</u>		<u>L'viv</u>		<u>All Cities</u>	
	<u>office space</u>	<u>no office space</u>	<u>office space</u>	<u>no office space</u>	<u>office space</u>	<u>no office space</u>	<u>office space</u>	<u>no office space</u>
Past Campaigns								
0-active, not campaign	0 (0%)	3 (25%)	0 (0%)	2 (25%)	0 (0%)	1 (14%)	0 (0%)	6 (22%)
1-hard to tell	1 (8%)	1 (8%)	1 (20%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	2 (9%)	1 (4%)
2-clearly campaign	11 (92%)	8 (67%)	4 (80%)	6 (75%)	5 (100%)	6 (86%)	20 (91%)	20 (74%)
Totals	100%=12	100%=12	100%=5	100%=8	100%=5	100%=7	100%=22	100%=27

during the life of the organization. Present organizational maintenance refers to those that were sustaining campaigns at the time of the study. Some of the organizations included in the study were no longer operating at all, but had sustained campaigns in the past. Their earlier ability to sustain campaigns is noted in discussions of past organizational maintenance, but they are not coded as maintaining organizations at the time of the study. Other organizations were clearly sustaining campaigns in the past, but at the time of the study the organization was not as active as it was previously, and it was unclear whether they were sustaining any campaigns. Again, their past ability to sustain campaigns is incorporated in discussions of past organizational maintenance, but they were not considered as maintaining their organizations at the time of the study. For these reasons, past organizational maintenance rates and rates at the time of the study often differ from each other.

Table: 8-3 Comparison of current rates of organizational maintenance for NGOs with office space to those without it by city and across all cities

	<u>Kyiv</u>		<u>Kharkiv</u>		<u>L'viv</u>		<u>All Cities</u>	
	<u>office space</u>	<u>no office space</u>	<u>office space</u>	<u>no office space</u>	<u>office space</u>	<u>no office space</u>	<u>office space</u>	<u>no office space</u>
Current Campaigns								
0-active, not campaign	0 (0%)	3 (25%)	0 (0%)	2 (25%)	0 (0%)	1 (14%)	0 (0%)	6 (22%)
1-hard to tell	1 (8%)	0 (0%)	1 (20%)	1 (13%)	1 (20%)	1 (14%)	3 (14%)	2 (7%)
2-clearly campaign	11 (92%)	5 (42%)	4 (80%)	5 (63%)	4 (80%)	5 (71%)	19 (86%)	15 (56%)
3-no longer active	0 (0%)	4 (33%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	4 (15%)
Totals	100%=12	100%=12	100%=5	100%=8	100%=5	100%=7	100%=22	100%=27

Assistance from local governments did not produce consistent results. Across all three cities the past organizational maintenance rate for those with local government assistance was 85% and 81% for those without it. At the time of the study, organizational maintenance rates for those with local government assistance dropped to 77% and 67% for those without it. We expect women's organizations receiving material assistance from their local governments to enjoy a higher rate of organizational maintenance. When each city is examined individually the pattern reveals some counter-intuitive findings in Kharkiv. In Kharkiv, in the past, those with local government assistance were sustaining campaigns only 67% of the time, while those without it had a rate of 86%. The gap is closed somewhat when examining the organizational maintenance rate at the time of the study. Women's NGOs with local government support remained at 67%, and those without local government assistance dropped to a 71% organizational maintenance rate. In Kyiv, NGOs with support from the Kyiv city government were sustaining campaigns 100% of the time in the past and 83% of the time at the time of the study. Those without it had a lower organizational maintenance rate of 72% in the past and 61% in the present. In L'viv, there was only one organization with local government assistance, and it was sustaining campaigns in the past and at the time of the study. Local government

assistance was expected to promote progress toward goals, and it did in Kyiv and L'viv, but not in Kharkiv.

Table: 8-4 Comparison of past rates of organizational maintenance for NGOs with local government assistance to those without it by city and across all cities

	<u>Kyiv</u>		<u>Kharkiv</u>		<u>L'viv</u>		<u>All Cities</u>	
	<u>Local</u>	<u>No Local</u>	<u>Local</u>	<u>No Local</u>	<u>Local</u>	<u>No Local</u>	<u>Local</u>	<u>No Local</u>
	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>
Past Campaigns	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>
0-active, not campaign	0 (0%)	3 (17%)	1 (14%)	1 (14%)	0 (0%)	1 (9%)	1 (8%)	5 (14%)
1-hard to tell	0 (0%)	2 (11%)	1 (14%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	1 (%)	2 (6%)
2-clearly campaign	6 (100%)	13 (72%)	4 (67%)	6 (86%)	1 (100%)	10 (91%)	11 (85%)	29 (81%)
Totals	100%=6	100%=18	100%=6	100%=7	100%=1	100%=11	100%=13	100%=36

Table: 8-5 Comparison of current rates of organizational maintenance for NGOs with local government assistance to those without it by city and across all cities

	<u>Kyiv</u>		<u>Kharkiv</u>		<u>L'viv</u>		<u>All Cities</u>	
	<u>Local</u>	<u>No Local</u>	<u>Local</u>	<u>No Local</u>	<u>Local</u>	<u>No Local</u>	<u>Local</u>	<u>No Local</u>
	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>
Current Campaigns	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>
0-active, not campaign	0 (0%)	3 (17%)	1 (17%)	1 (14%)	0 (0%)	1 (9%)	1 (8%)	5 (14%)
1-hard to tell	0 (0%)	1 (6%)	1 (17%)	1 (14%)	0 (0%)	2 (18%)	1 (%)	4 (11%)
2-clearly campaign	5 (83%)	11 (61%)	4 (67%)	5 (71%)	1 (100%)	8 (73%)	10 (77%)	24 (67%)
3-no longer active	1 (17%)	3 (17%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	1 (8%)	3 (8%)
Totals	100%=6	100%=18	100%=6	100%=7	100%=1	100%=11	100%=13	100%=36

A similar pattern is revealed for national government assistance. Ninety-three percent of women's NGOs with national government assistance were sustaining campaigns in the past and at the time of the study. Those without it were sustaining campaigns only 77% of the time in the past and 66% of the time at the time of the study. Again, in Kharkiv, women's NGOs with national government assistance were less likely to sustain campaigns than those without it. In both the past and at the time of the study, the organizational maintenance rate for those with national government assistance in Kharkiv was 75%, but 78% for those without it. But in Kyiv, those with national government assistance are significantly more able to sustaining campaigns than those without it. All of the women's organizations with national government assistance in Kyiv were sustaining campaigns, and the organizational maintenance rate of those

without it was only 69% in the past and 50% at the time of the study. In L'viv, only two women's groups received national government assistance, and they had a higher rate of organizational maintenance than those without it in past, but not at the time of the study. The small sample size explains the reversed pattern in L'viv at the time of the study.

Table: 8-6 Comparison of past rates of organizational maintenance for NGOs with national government assistance to those without it by city and across all cities

	<u>Kyiv</u>		<u>Kharkiv</u>		<u>L'viv</u>		<u>All Cities</u>	
	<u>National</u>	<u>No National</u>	<u>National</u>	<u>No National</u>	<u>National</u>	<u>No National</u>	<u>National</u>	<u>No National</u>
	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>
Past Campaigns	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>
0-active, not campaign	0 (0%)	3 (19%)	1 (25%)	1 (11%)	0 (0%)	1 (10%)	1 (7%)	5 (14%)
1-hard to tell	0 (0%)	2 (13%)	0 (0%)	1 (11%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	3 (9%)
2-clearly campaign	8 (100%)	11 (69%)	3 (75%)	7 (78%)	2 (100%)	9 (90%)	13 (93%)	27 (77%)
Totals	100%=8	100%=16	100%=4	100%=9	100%=2	100%=10	100%=14	100%=35

Table: 8-7 Comparison of current rates of organizational maintenance for NGOs with national government assistance to those without it by city and across all cities

	<u>Kyiv</u>		<u>Kharkiv</u>		<u>L'viv</u>		<u>All Cities</u>	
	<u>National</u>	<u>No National</u>	<u>National</u>	<u>No National</u>	<u>National</u>	<u>No National</u>	<u>National</u>	<u>No National</u>
	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>	<u>Government</u>
Current Campaigns	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>	<u>Assistance</u>
0-active, not campaign	0 (0%)	3 (19%)	1 (25%)	1 (11%)	0 (0%)	1 (10%)	1 (7%)	5 (14%)
1-hard to tell	0 (0%)	1 (6%)	0 (0%)	1 (11%)	1 (50%)	1 (10%)	1 (7%)	3 (9%)
2-clearly campaign	8 (100%)	8 (50%)	3 (75%)	7 (78%)	1 (50%)	8 (80%)	12 (86%)	23 (66%)
3-no longer active	0 (0%)	4 (25%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	4 (11%)
Totals	100%=8	100%=16	100%=4	100%=9	100%=2	100%=10	100%=14	100%=35

Donations from local business also revealed unexpected results. Local businesses when asked sometimes provided small amounts of money or goods, and according to social movement theorists the presence of material resources helps organizations to emerge, operate and reach their goals (McCarthy and Zald 1977). Across all three cities the organizational maintenance rate for women's NGOs that received assistance from local businesses was lower than those that did not. Those with it had an organizational maintenance rate of 78%, while those without local business support were sustaining campaigns 85% of the time in the past. At the time of the study, the organizational

maintenance rate for those with it was still lower (63% compared to 76%) than those without local business assistance. This same pattern held for Kyiv and Kharkiv in the past and at the time of the study. Women's NGOs with local business assistance were less likely to sustain campaigns than those that did not receive anything from local businesses. However, in L'viv, local business assistance produced the expected results. Women's NGOs with it were sustaining campaigns 80% of the time, while those without it had an organizational maintenance rate of 71% at the time of the study. The pattern was the same in the past.

Table: 8-8 Comparison of past rates of organizational maintenance for NGOs with local business donations to those without it by city and across all cities

	<u>Kyiv</u>		<u>Kharkiv</u>		<u>L'viv</u>		<u>All Cities</u>	
	<u>Local</u>	<u>No Local</u>	<u>Local</u>	<u>No Local</u>	<u>Local</u>	<u>No Local</u>	<u>Local</u>	<u>No Local</u>
	<u>Business</u>	<u>Business</u>	<u>Business</u>	<u>Business</u>	<u>Business</u>	<u>Business</u>	<u>Business</u>	<u>Business</u>
Past Campaigns	<u>Donations</u>	<u>Donations</u>	<u>Donations</u>	<u>Donations</u>	<u>Donations</u>	<u>Donations</u>	<u>Donations</u>	<u>Donations</u>
0-active, not campaign	2 (17%)	1 (8%)	1 (17%)	1 (14%)	0 (0%)	1 (14%)	3 (13%)	3 (12%)
1-hard to tell	1 (8%)	1 (8%)	1 (17%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	2 (9%)	1 (4%)
2-clearly campaign	9 (75%)	10 (83%)	4 (66%)	6 (86%)	5 (100%)	6 (86%)	18 (78%)	22 (85%)
Totals	100%=12	100%=12	100%=6	100%=7	100%=5	100%=7	100%=23	100%=26

Table: 8-9 Comparison of current rates of organizational maintenance for NGOs with local business assistance to those without it by city and across all cities

	<u>Kyiv</u>		<u>Kharkiv</u>		<u>L'viv</u>		<u>All Cities</u>	
	<u>Local</u>	<u>No Local</u>	<u>Local</u>	<u>No Local</u>	<u>Local</u>	<u>No Local</u>	<u>Local</u>	<u>No Local</u>
	<u>Business</u>	<u>Business</u>	<u>Business</u>	<u>Business</u>	<u>Business</u>	<u>Business</u>	<u>Business</u>	<u>Business</u>
Current Campaigns	<u>Donations</u>	<u>Donations</u>	<u>Donations</u>	<u>Donations</u>	<u>Donations</u>	<u>Donations</u>	<u>Donations</u>	<u>Donations</u>
0-active, not campaign	2 (15%)	1 (9%)	1 (17%)	1 (14%)	0 (0%)	1 (14%)	3 (13%)	3 (12%)
1-hard to tell	1 (8%)	0 (0%)	2 (33%)	0 (0%)	1 (20%)	1 (14%)	4 (17%)	1 (4%)
2-clearly campaign	8 (62%)	8 (73%)	3 (50%)	6 (86%)	4 (80%)	5 (71%)	15 (63%)	19 (76%)
3-no longer active	2 (15%)	2 (18%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	2 (8%)	2 (8%)
Totals	100%=13	100%=11	100%=6	100%=7	100%=5	100%=7	100%=24	100%=25

The preceding discussion shows that material resources from domestic sources of support were not consistently associated with higher rates of organizational maintenance for women's NGOs. In Kyiv, local government assistance and local business support

was associated with lower organizational maintenance rates among women's NGOs. In Kharkiv, women's NGOs with resources from local and national government and local businesses had lower organizational maintenance rates than those without it. In L'viv, domestic resources were most consistently associated with higher rates of organizational maintenance except for national government support at the time of the study. The findings for national and local government resources in L'viv possess less explanatory power since only two NGOs had national government support, and only one received local government resources.

Why did domestic resources from the city and national governments and local business behave in the opposite than expected manner in Kharkiv? Why were women's NGOs with domestic resources from local businesses in Kyiv less likely to sustain campaigns than those without it? The women's organizations that received support from the national government in Kharkiv tended to receive substantially less material resources than those in Kyiv who had national government assistance. This could explain why it did not behave as expected in Kharkiv. The small sample size is another possible explanation. Only four women's NGOs had national government resources in Kharkiv. One unsuccessful NGO caused a 25% drop in rate of organizational maintenance.

The lower organizational maintenance rate of women's organizations with local government and business resources in Kyiv and Kharkiv is more puzzling. Particularly in Kharkiv, it appeared the women's NGOs had more opportunities for access and resources from the local government than might be expected. Some of the lower organizational maintenance rate for those with local government assistance could be explained by the competition among women's NGOs in Kharkiv for foreign funding that extended to

competition with each other in general. The local government official responsible for dealing with NGOs in Kharkiv, reported that some leaders of women's NGOs wasted their energies feuding with each other and hindering their own progress (Interview with Kharkiv city council member 2/20/2003). Two of the six organizations receiving resources from the local government were significantly less successful than others in the city in their attempts to secure foreign funding. They were forced to rely almost exclusively on domestic resources which were significantly less sums of money than foreign grants and highly inconsistent. Consequently, their ability to sustain campaigns was lower than those that had foreign funding and domestic resources.

The above explanation might also be extended to resources from local businesses. Some, but not all, of those receiving resources from local businesses were women's organizations without any foreign grants. Among the 23 women's NGOs receiving donations from local businesses seven (30%) of them had no foreign money. They either applied for them and never won a grant competition or never applied. As discussed earlier in the chapter, donations from local businesses were usually very small amounts of money or goods. They were not given to the NGOs on a continuous basis but often only once, making it possible to hold an isolated event but very difficult to sustain a campaign. Consequently, some of the organizations with support from local businesses were ones forced to rely on a very small amount of material resources limiting the possibilities for the organization. Perhaps this is indicating that domestic resources were helpful as a supplement, but if they became the primary source of support they often were inadequate to sustain a campaign. However, if this were the case, then why were women's groups in L'viv with donations from local businesses more able to sustain campaigns than those

without them? One women's NGOs with support from a local business was receiving it on a consistent basis in L'viv. Others that were receiving it, in L'viv, were carrying out campaigns but on small scales. These campaigns tended to be ones, such as cultural activities, that required relatively small amounts of material resources.

In general, it appears that domestic resources are only sometimes, and not as often as expected, connected to the ability to sustain campaigns. One possible explanation is that those who have domestic resources only have them because they were forced to seek them out after they failed to acquire money from foreign sources. However, among the 38 women's NGOs with domestic resources, 29 (76%) also had international assistance. This reveals that, for the most part, those with domestic resources also had resources from foreign sources, and they were not being forced to implement their campaigns solely on the basis on scarce domestic material resources.

Conclusions

Examination of the material resources received from domestic sources of support shows that they are not the main sources of support for women's NGOs. Analysis of organizational maintenance rate reveals that the presence of some types of domestic resources is not even associated with higher rates of organizational maintenance. Those that are relying exclusively on domestic resources were sometimes less able to sustain campaigns because the amount of material resources from domestic sources is relatively small and inconsistent compared to foreign grants, although most were not relying exclusively on domestic resources. Even when more opportunities for resources exist at

the local level as in Kharkiv, this does not necessarily produce more successful women's NGOs.

Variations in opportunities for women's NGOs at the local level and the national levels varied by city. Kharkiv enjoyed proportionately more opportunities from the city government for material resources. Kyiv women's NGOs also enjoyed some, while L'viv's city government appeared mostly closed to interactions with women's NGOs. Kyiv women activists received the most material resources from the national government, probably due to their proximity to those in the national government. The connection to frames and support from either the national or local government in all three cities was weak and difficult to discern. Perhaps, this indicates that where the women's organizations are locally (Kyiv, Kharkiv or L'viv) is more of a determining factor for the frames chosen by women's activists and their outcomes than domestic resources.

What was more apparent was that international experiences and the desire for improved international status created opportunities for women's NGOs at the local level in Kyiv and Kharkiv. The opportunities had to be pursued by the women's activists. Local and national government officials were not seeking out women's NGOs, but nonetheless there were opportunities even in a situation where women's leaders felt the government was unconcerned with their issues. The opportunities it provided were often, but not always, for campaigns in line with foreign donor priorities, such as a women's center.

Where variations in domestic resources existed (local and national government), L'viv was repeatedly different than Kyiv and Kharkiv. Furthermore, while close to half of all women's NGOs in Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv received donations from local

businesses, they seemed to behave differently in L'viv. Local business donations seemed more helpful in L'viv than either Kyiv or Kharkiv. What explains L'viv's persistent differences?

Foreign funding also behaved differently in L'viv than Kyiv and Kharkiv. There was less of it, and women activists seemed less inclined to adapt their frames to follow donor priorities. I speculated that the different interaction with foreign funding, in L'viv, was, in large part, due to its local cultural context that was less inclined to accept foreign donor priorities that critiqued the broader culture. In Kyiv and Kharkiv, interactions with foreign donors and initiatives, along with the desire to improve Ukraine's international status, produced opportunities for women's NGOs at the local level. Since there was less foreign funding among L'viv's women's NGOs, there may also have been fewer individuals in its local government with experiences abroad designed to facilitate cooperation between the city government and NGOs. This may be why there were fewer opportunities for material resources at the city government level in L'viv. In addition, L'viv already views itself as belonging to Western Europe where as, Kyiv and Kharkiv do not to the same extent, particularly Kharkiv. In L'viv, local government officials, believing they were the West, may have been less likely to look to it as an example to emulate. Since they already felt their attitudes and behaviors were those of Western Europeans, they were less inclined to examine the example of Western governments and thereby, learn that the West uses NGOs as a resource for the city and provides resources for NGOs. Local officials with more of a sense of difference from Western Europe, but still desiring to attain the prosperity of Western European democracies and having received greater attention from them, were more willing to look to the West as an

example and feel the need to work with NGOs. Furthermore, since there was less foreign funding among the women's NGOs in L'viv than in Kyiv and Kharkiv, L'viv women's activists may have learned to do more with fewer material resources. This may be why those with local business assistance in L'viv were generally more able to sustain campaigns than those without it, while the reverse was true in Kyiv.

Determining the Causal Process between Frames, Resources and Outcomes

These chapters on framing and international and domestic resources all contain an analysis of the influence of frames on outcomes and the influence of resources on outcomes. Which is more influential to making progress toward desired outcomes, frames or resources? The relative importance of frames compared to material resources is an important question for social movement scholars. Answering it would allow movement activists to determine whether it is more productive for them to invest their time amassing material resources or concentrating on meaning production. This research does not lend itself to a definitive answer to that question, in large part because the measure used to capture outcomes biases the findings toward finding those with more resources more able to sustain campaigns. (See chapter two for further discussion.) Furthermore, this study is capturing the start of the modern women's movement making it difficult to discern if the outcomes that have even been achieved thus far are lasting

ones that will eventually produce the social change many activists. A future research project over a period of at least ten years would be better suited to measuring outcomes and understanding whether frames or resources have a greater impact on movement outcomes.

Nevertheless, the findings from this study do provide some preliminary ideas about the relative influence of each. Based on the findings from the outcomes sections of chapters four through eight, it appears that the relative importance of frames versus resources depends on the content of the frame and the nature of the resource. For instance, domestic resources were only occasionally found to assist women's NGOs in sustaining campaigns, whereas international funding was consistently linked to higher rates of organizational maintenance leading to the conclusion that international resources are more likely to have a greater impact in helping NGOs make progress toward desired outcomes. Domestic resource in 2002 and 2003 were still too scant to have a strong impact on outcomes.

The relative importance of frames to international funding seemed to vary by frame. For example, at the time of the study, the nationalism frame had the highest rate of organizational maintenance (89%), followed by the gender discrimination frame (75%), and the economic crisis frame (68%). Nationalism oriented NGOs did not have international funding, unless it was for campaigns that used other frames, such as the economic crisis or gender discrimination. However, activists using these frames were able to maintain their organizations despite the absence of international funding. In the case of the nationalism frame, it appeared that the frame was more closely linked to progress toward desired outcomes than material resources to outcomes. The gender

discrimination frame presents a less clear picture. Women's leaders from 24 NGOs used the gender discrimination frame. Twenty-two (91.6%) of these NGOs also had international funding, with 17 (77%) of them able to sustain campaigns and five (23%) unable to sustain campaigns at the time of the study. The two NGOs without international funding and the gender frame were sustaining campaigns, while five of the NGOs with international funding and the gender frame were not sustaining campaigns at the time of the study. Since only two women's NGOs did not have international funding, it is difficult to draw any conclusions. It does seem that the women's NGOs using the gender discrimination frame tended to be heavily reliant upon international funding. Since international funding to the post-Soviet region is steadily decreasing (USAID 2003) a study conducted about ten years after this one could more conclusively determine whether the gender frame or international funding was a more important factor in determining outcomes for these women's NGOs. It does seem safe to conclude that the frame itself would not be employed as frequently but for the presence of international funding and probably the ability of these organizations to sustain campaigns as well. The reader should keep in mind that the measure of outcomes is biased toward finding those NGOs with more resources more likely to progress toward their goals.

In general, it appeared that among the NGOs where women's leaders used the economic crisis frame, international funding seemed to have a greater influence on the ability to sustain campaigns. Seventy-three percent of those with the economic crisis frame and international funding were sustaining campaigns compared to 50% of those NGOs with the economic crisis frame but no international funding.

Thus, based on the data at the time of the study it is not possible to unequivocally conclude that either frames or resources are more important in determining outcomes for women's NGOs. It appears to depend on the content of the frame (nationalism, gender discrimination, or the economic crisis) and the nature of the material resources (international funding or domestic resources). When the nationalism frame was used it appeared that the frame was more influential in determining the outcome than resources. The gender discrimination frame was particularly difficult to draw conclusions about since only two of the NGOs with this frame did not have international funding. The economic crisis frame appears to lend support to international funding having more impact on outcomes than the frame.

Chapter 9

Conclusions

Introduction

Opportunities for Ukrainian women to organize exploded when *glasnost* followed by independence created a space for them to form voluntary groups. Ukraine was still mired in its transition to a market economy and democratic political system eleven years later. Women's activists were struggling to maintain their organizations and create better conditions for Ukrainian women and children. This dissertation examined the Ukrainian women's movement in 2002 and 2003. I focused on the dominant frames being used by Ukrainian activists as they voiced their concerns and solutions to local Ukrainian women, foreign donors and the broader public while seeking to acquire material resources from foreign and domestic sources. How did these variables interact, each within three different local contexts, and connect to outcomes for women's NGOs? This research helps us understand the extent to which the success of women's groups and groups generally is constrained by culture. Can groups that represent women outside of the dominant cultural perspective succeed in bringing about their desired social changes? To what extent do the three different local cultural contexts act as resources and constraints to social movement actors in their attempts to bring about change? What are the influences of large amounts of international funding and severely limited domestic resources on a women's movement in a post-Soviet context?

I. Summary of main findings

The framing perspective has become central to social movement studies as scholars realize that meaning construction is important to the process of social movement emergence, operation and outcomes. Activists are expected to create resonating frames that will appear natural and familiar, and therefore, be more potent. These frames are created and interpreted within a particular cultural context that acts both as a tool kit from which activists can draw in constructing their frames and a constraining factor that limits the meaning that can be fruitfully created. However, we should not assume that social movements are successful or not simply because they created culturally resonating frames. Material resources and political opportunities are also important to the context of social movement and their outcomes. Material resources from foreign sources are particularly important in the post-Soviet context where domestic resources are scarce. Foreign funding was expected to influence the construction of frames and the outcomes social movement organizations were able to attain creating both positive and negative effects. Domestic sources of support were also considered for their influence on the construction of frames and outcomes.

I studied the Ukrainian women's movement in Kyiv, Kharkiv and L'viv, cities from three different regions of Ukraine with three distinct cultures and contexts. The local cultures and contexts acted as constraining factors and as a resource for activists in their frame construction. Local culture and context provided a framework within which target audiences interpreted the meaning constructed by movement activists. Each city's

culture and context presented different opportunities and constraints for activists, causing some frames to be more prevalent and more successful in one city than another.

In each city one frame in particular enjoyed a greater amount of popularity corresponding with aspects its local context. The nationalism frame was most frequently used in L'viv a city known for its strong national sentiment. This same frame was used least frequently in Kharkiv that has a strong Russian orientation and little interest in Ukrainian culture. The gender discrimination frame was employed the most frequently in Kyiv, followed closely by Kharkiv. These two cities were more willing to import foreign ideas relating to gender and incorporate them into the Ukrainian context. In contrast, L'viv, with its more socially conservative context, was less accepting of a frame that critiqued the dominant cultural view of women. The economic crisis, a ubiquitous phenomenon throughout Ukraine, was used most frequently in Kharkiv and L'viv where signs of economic recovery were slower in coming than in Kyiv, the city with the earliest and greatest amount of economic recovery.

While each frame was used in all three cities, the frames were accordingly adapted by women's activists to the particulars of their city, although the economic crisis frame followed this pattern less than the other two. The nationalism frame, as used in L'viv, emphasized aspects of western Ukrainian culture and the role of mothers as preservers of the nation through family life, drawing on L'viv's long history of fighting for and preserving a Ukrainian nation, and its more socially conservative atmosphere. Women activists in Kyiv and Kharkiv chose to emphasize the revival of Ukrainian culture and history more generally and the necessity of a more equal role for women in politics and society in building a democratic Ukrainian nation. Their more inclusive

nationalism frame had a greater likelihood of resonating with the populations in Kyiv and Kharkiv that were less concerned with the ideal of a distinctly Ukrainian nation.

The gender discrimination frame which critiqued the dominant cultural view of women was also adapted by women activists to better suit their city contexts. In this case, the frame had to be adapted to fit the Ukrainian context, which activists did by talking about gender in terms of the different types of discrimination women faced in their own lives. The frame was then further adapted to the specific cities. When the frame was used in L'viv, women activists discussed it with a focus on western Ukraine and gender discrimination they attributed to Ukrainian culture. In Kyiv, women activists pointed to the absence of women in political decision making positions and the upper echelons of professions. Kharkiv women activists enjoyed more dialogue with the local government interacting more with the city government to address gender discrimination than in Kyiv and L'viv.

However, the popularity of the gender discrimination frame within the women's movement suggests the tension between foreign donor priorities and those of local Ukrainian women. The frame critiques the culture, and was not one that women initially organized around (Hrycak 2002). The strong connection between it and the presence of international funding indicates that the prospect of foreign grants may have encouraged many Ukrainian women activists to adopt the frame even though it may not have been an issue of great concern to large numbers of Ukrainian women.

Comparison of rates of organizational maintenance among NGOs using each frame did not reveal a strong impact of local context on outcomes. This is probably due to the low threshold used to measure outcomes and the small sample size. The measure

of outcomes, because it focused on the ability to sustain campaigns, was also biased toward finding those women's organizations with more resources more able to maintain their organizations and sustain campaigns. An outcome measure that incorporated impact or influence would have been more likely to show the effects of local culture, however, this does point to the importance of material resources in the Ukrainian women's movement.

Material resources, from both foreign and domestic sources, were important to the operation and success of Ukrainian women's organizations. In particular, funding from foreign donors played an influential role in the choice of frames, their construction, and the outcomes of women's groups. Ukrainian women's activists, in need of material resources, were forced to simultaneously appeal to foreign donors while maintaining relevance to local Ukrainian women. Some women activists bridged and transformed their frames in efforts to win grants using the appropriate foreign donor lingo and creating practical meaning for Ukrainian women. Other women activists completely abandoned an initial frame in favor of one that would more likely win them a grant, or extended their frames to continuously include new foreign donor priorities. Others extended their frames to include foreign donor priorities.

While foreign funding permeated the women's movement in 2002 and 2003, its negative influences seemed strongest in Kharkiv and weakest in L'viv with Kyiv falling in the middle. Its effect on frames seemed strongest in Kharkiv, as well as negative consequences on the women's movement there in terms of competition and splintering of the movement and the formation of organizations for the purpose of winning a grant. Some of this is expected since there was more foreign funding among the women's

NGOs in the Kyiv and Kharkiv samples than in L'viv. The consistently different interaction between foreign funding and the frames created by women's activists in the L'viv sample is important, as it points to the constraining influence of L'viv's local cultural context. L'viv women activists were less willing to bend their frames to foreign priorities, perhaps in part because of the strong national orientation in L'viv, which was not a foreign donor priority. The more conservative social climate also created an atmosphere less accepting of foreign donor priorities that challenged the prevailing societal gender stereotypes. Furthermore, there was the perception of a pre-existing national agenda for women's organizations in L'viv that existed in a much lesser degree in Kyiv and did not seem to exist in Kharkiv.

This pattern continues in the relationship between domestic resources and women's NGOs. Unlike with foreign funding, there appeared to be no consistent relationship between the frames used by activists and the presence of material resources from domestic sources, pointing to the greater influence of local context and international funding. However, there are differences in the opportunities to attain domestic resources by city. In Kyiv there were greater opportunities to acquire material resources from the national government. In Kharkiv, there were greater opportunities to acquire material resources from the city government. In both instances, this was at least partially the result of experiences abroad on the part of city or national political leaders, perhaps making them more willing to support NGOs. Furthermore, local activists were also shown that their governments could be a potential source of resources through foreign initiatives. The desire to become part of the EU by meeting their standards of greater gender equality produced opportunities to acquire domestic resources for women's

NGOs. In contrast, in L'viv, the city government was largely closed to women's NGOs and opportunities from the local and national government largely absent. Again, L'viv's local culture and context acted as a constraining factor creating an atmosphere that was less willing to incorporate foreign gender priorities.

L'viv's relationship to domestic resources and international funding continued to look different when rates of organizational maintenance were examined. Domestic resources had little connection with the frames used by women activists, and unlike foreign funding, there was not a strong connection between the presence of domestic resources and outcomes.

Women activists claimed that domestic resources were insufficient to sustain their organizations forcing them to rely on foreign funding sources. This was substantiated by the often lower rate of organizational maintenance of those with domestic resources than those without it. Primarily in Kyiv and Kharkiv, domestic resources were not connected to higher rates of organizational maintenance, despite more opportunities for them at the local and national levels, further heightening the importance of foreign funding in Ukraine's women's movement. L'viv was consistently different here too. If women's organizations had various forms of domestic resources they were consistently linked to the ability to sustain campaigns. This indicates that activists in L'viv were able to do more with fewer resources, or that the campaigns they engaged in were ones that did not require a lot of material resources.

In contrast to domestic resources, the ability of women's organizations with international funding to sustain campaigns was consistently higher than those without it across all three cities. The only difference in the three cities lay in the lesser amount of it,

and a higher proportion of organizations sustaining campaigns without it in L'viv, making foreign funding appear less necessary in L'viv than in Kyiv and Kharkiv. In the long term, domestic resources may become more important as international donors shift their focus to other parts of the world lessening the aid given to post-Soviet states. And, if Ukraine's economic situation continues to improve, more domestic resources should become available, making them more important to the women's movement. Perhaps L'viv's women's activists, by not allowing themselves to become as dependent on foreign funding, will be better equipped to survive in the future.

These findings depict a Ukrainian women's movement using frames which both resonate with local contexts and also critique them as activists struggle to reach local Ukrainian women while simultaneously negotiating changing foreign donor priorities. Their ability to sustain campaigns or create change within their cities was varied as each local cultural context presented different opportunities and constraints. The next section discusses implications for the study of post-Soviet women's movements and social movements generally.

Implications

What do these findings add to the study of Ukraine, post-Soviet women's movements and social movements generally? First, this dissertation adds to our understanding of democratic processes occurring in Ukraine since its independence in 1991. Scholars tend to focus on national democratic institutions, Ukraine's foreign

policy orientation, the Orange Revolution, the economic plight of the country, ethno-linguistic differences, or attitudes concerning democracy and national identity. Civil society and women's organizing in particular has received much less attention. A few early works discussed women's organizing shortly before and immediately after independence, primarily in Kyiv, when women were organizing around issues such as, Chernobyl, nationalism and military reform. The studies were usually confined to a few relatively well known, larger, membership organizations (Bohachevsky 1997 and 2000; Pavlychko 1997). Since then, few scholars have focused specifically on the development and direction of women's organizing. Hrycak's work on the Ukrainian women's movement is an exception. This study examines the direction of the women's movement after the accomplishment of independence and issues women activists consider relevant to women and children in Ukraine. It goes beyond looking at the few larger federated women's organizations and examines the range of organizations, many of which are small and have emerged after the initial studies.

This study also joins a literature that examines regional variation in Ukraine. Several studies documenting the differing ethnic composition and language preferences among Ukraine's regions debated the potential of Ukraine to divide along ethno-linguistic lines (Hesli 1995; Hrytsak 2000; Kravchuk and Chuowsky 2005; Liber 1998; Wilson 1997). The general conclusion was that these differences existed, but were not of the nature that would cause the country to split apart. My research shows that these differences continue to exist. Local cultures and contexts influenced the content and choice of the frames used by women activists. It also created variation in the availability and effects of foreign and domestic resources. Ukraine's regional variation is not going

to pull the country apart, but analysis of the women's movement within three different subcultures shows that it does cause democratic processes to develop differently. Foreign initiatives designed to develop civil society with the intent of consolidating Ukraine's democracy should adapt their strategies to local subcultures and expect results to vary according to location.

Further, voting patterns from the Orange Revolution and September 30, 2007 parliamentary elections illustrate that regional variation remains an important factor in Ukraine's political development. (See figure 3-1 in chapter 3 and figure 9-1 in this chapter.) Western Ukraine consistently supports candidates with a national and pro-Western orientation while eastern Ukraine supports candidates with a pro-Russian orientation. Western and central Ukraine's support for Victor Yushchenko in 2004 and Yulia Tymoshenko in 2007 contrasted with eastern Ukraine's support for Victor Yanukhovich validate findings that nationalism continues to have more resonance with residents of western Ukraine. Eastern Ukrainians continue to associate themselves more closely with Russia and remain disinterested in nationalist causes. Yanukhovich maintains close ties to Russia with the support of Putin giving him electoral majorities in Russian speaking eastern Ukraine. Tymoshenko's signature traditional Ukrainian braid and white clothing symbolizing purity visually resonates with voters in western and, to an extent, in central Ukraine, but not in eastern Ukraine as evidenced by the most recent parliamentary electoral results. (See Figure 9-1.)



Figure: 9-1 Breakdown of September 2007 electoral results by region
 Source Central Election Commission of Ukraine

Tymoshenko's most recent electoral success and ability to repeatedly return to prominence in politics also has important implications for the women's movement. Rather than associating herself with women's rights or women's issues, Tymoshenko addresses issues coded as male concerns, such as big business, finance, energy and general political concerns (Hrycak 2007b). However, by tackling corruption in the energy and finance sectors she is addressing some of the social and economic conditions that often exclude women from the legitimate and regulated economy, making them easy prey for traffickers in the sex industry. Creating a social, economic, and political context that is not ruled by a few oligarchs and political elites will eventually allow more room for women in these fields, who themselves are rarely in possession of significant material or political resources. Creating more legitimate opportunities to earn a living and provide for children in Ukraine does indeed address the concerns of Ukrainian women activists

even if Tymoshenko does not frame her activities using the language of women's rights and women's issues. Tymoshenko's continued presence as a political force addressing traditionally male concerns in Ukraine may also contribute to an eventual change in gender consciousness as women come to be associated with power and issues not traditionally labeled as women's concerns.

This dissertation also adds to our understanding of post-Soviet women's movements more generally. It reveals the tenuous nature of women's NGOs which are highly dependent on foreign sources of funding as a result of insufficient domestic resources. Many women activists are keenly aware of their dependence on foreign support (Hrycak 2007a, 88). This creates an added framing task for women activists in post-Soviet states, or any social movement dependent on foreign sources of support. They must negotiate the world of foreign donors with its own lingo and priorities, but still create frames that resonate locally. This builds on a literature that examines strategies women activists use to simultaneously negotiate these foreign and local spaces (Grunberg 2000; Hemment 2004; Hrycak 2007a; Ishkanian 2004; Kay 2004; Nechemias 2006; Sperling 1999). This literature focuses on language used by women's activists, particularly imported words, and issues adopted as a result of foreign initiatives. With the exception of Hrycak (2007a) these studies focus on a subset of women's NGOs or one NGO. Along with Hrycak, I go a step further examining the range of women's NGOs within the women's movement capturing regional variation in the movement as well. My study analyzes the effects of foreign donor initiatives on the frames activists created and variation in these differences across regional subcultures. The analysis of frames from a representative sample of the women's movement in three different cities

also shows what issues and strategies are developing in a post-Soviet context where women were given little chance to decide for themselves what issues were important before Western assistance arrived with its own agenda.

The dependence on foreign sources of support has also created a women's movement more integrated into the global women's movement and oriented to the West than it might otherwise have been. In many cases well intended foreign assistance has caused women's activists to shift their focus and work on what foreign donors and Western activists deem important. Their relevance to local women is in many cases likely diminished. As foreign donors shift their attention to other areas of the world and assistance to post-Soviet states declines (Nechemias 2006, 174) what will become of these women's movements comprised of NGOs that have stopped framing to local women? My research indicates that locations with cultural contexts that proved less malleable to foreign priorities and acted as more of a constraining structure (as in L'viv) may be better equipped to survive in the future for two reasons. They maintained more consistent frames that focused on issues which arose naturally out of their post-Soviet context and may attract women to their causes. These organizations were also often ones that managed to survive on the limited domestic resources available to them.

This dissertation further contributes to our understanding of post-Soviet women's movements and social movements more generally by telling a story of local (sub-national) opportunities and constraints. Each city's local culture and context helped to shape the women's NGOs in that city and influenced their outcomes. We can speak of a (one) women's movement in Ukraine, but the women's movement in each city revealed different directions of focus and varying rates of success. This study contributes to

women's movement literature which recognizes that within the feminist movement and women's movements there is rarely one brand of feminism or women's organizing, within a single country or cross nationally (Bull, Diamond and Marsh 2000, 1; Ray 1999). This dissertation, while recognizing some of the commonalities of the socialist and post-socialist experience for Ukrainian women, explores the differences within a post-Soviet women's movement based on local context. Just as we can not speak of an American feminism or one European women's movement, we can not assume that there is only one form of women's organizing developing in Ukraine or within other post-Soviet states. The analysis of the Ukrainian women's movement contributes to social movement literature focusing on the ways in which meaning construction and movement outcomes are influenced by their cultural context, and in this case local cultural context (Goodwin and Jasper 2004; Meyer, Whittier and Robnett 2002; Penney 2006; Williams 2004). This study demonstrated how cultural context functioned as a resource for activists while also constraining the meanings activists could fruitfully generate in each city. Kyiv and Kharkiv women activists faced local cultures and contexts that were more accepting of frames that critiqued the prevailing attitude toward women. In contrast, L'viv's context was slightly more constraining for activists using the gender and discrimination frame but presented greater opportunities and tools for activists using the nationalism frame.

This study also showed that cultural contexts presented different opportunities for women's NGOs to acquire material resources and interact with local or national governments. L'viv's was more constraining, while Kyiv's and Kharkiv's contexts permitted more opportunities to cooperate and benefit from the local and national

governments. The differing local opportunities were also in part a result of interactions with foreign initiatives at the city and national level contributing to a literature that examines how international funding and international structures can create opportunities for local civil societies (Chessa 2004; Hrycak 2007b).

Further, this research shows that material resources do not always help a social movement organization, or a larger movement, achieve its desired outcomes, contrary to Cress and Snow's findings (1996). In the Ukrainian case, domestic resources were not consistently associated with the ability to sustain campaigns. This implies that perhaps to contribute to NGOs' success, material resources need to be more substantial than they were in Ukraine or available on a more consistent basis. Further, it matters whether the resources are from domestic or foreign sources in terms of their effect on movements.

Suggestions for future research

This study opens up several avenues for further research. A snap-shot of the Ukrainian women's movement is insufficient to discern longer term trends, particularly outcomes. A study covering a period of years would allow the adoption of a measure of success that takes into consideration not only activities, but also impact or influence. For instance, many of the activists reported that they hoped their work would eventually bring about a change in gender consciousness or a change in the way Ukrainians thought about domestic violence. The measure of success used in this study only looked at whether these organizations were sustaining campaigns toward these ends. What it did not evaluate was whether these campaigns were achieving the desired outcomes. A dynamic

study would provide more understanding of the ability of women's NGOs to achieve their desired outcomes within their local contexts. A study over a period of years would also allow us to more fully understand the interaction with foreign and domestic sources of funding. Foreign funding was already starting to decline in 2003, and some women activists were aware of this. How have women's NGOs since then managed to acquire resources? Have domestic sources of support become more substantial, and are more organizations seeking them? Have issues, such as human trafficking and domestic violence that were heavily supported by foreign donors become casualties of the war on terror as foreign donors have switched their attention to the Middle East and away from post-Soviet states?

The inclusion of other regions within Ukraine would also give us more understanding of the processes of women's organizing. In particular, regions such as the Crimea that has recently experienced the return of Crimean Tatars would provide further fruitful comparison among Ukraine's regions to give a fuller picture of women's organizing and local cultural variation. Comparing cities in Ukraine to other cities in neighboring post-Soviet states could also provide further insight as to the nature of post-Soviet women's movements and their interaction with their local cultural contexts as well as foreign and domestic sources of support. For instance, women's NGOs in Kharkiv could be compared to those in a similar city in Russia and L'viv's to a similar city in Poland to understand more fully the constraints and opportunities of their local cultural contexts. Do the findings from Ukraine travel to other post-Soviet contexts?

Thus far studies of women's organizing in Ukraine have focused on women in cities. Women's NGOs in smaller towns and villages have not been explored even

though they do exist. Are the NGOs in smaller towns and villages addressing the same concerns? What frames are activists creating, and to what extent do they draw on the local context and critique it? What resources are available to these women activists? Are the activists connected to those in the larger cities or working primarily in isolation? These questions demonstrate that there is still much more we need to learn about the Ukrainian women's movement, success, local cultural influences, and resources.

Bibliography

- Aberg, Martin. 2005. "Paradox of Change: Soviet Modernization and Ethno-Linguistic Differentiation in L'viv, 1945-1989," in *L'viv: A City at the Crosscurrents of Culture*, ed. John Czaplicak. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press. 285-302.
- Alvarez, S. E. 2000. "Translating the Global: Effects of Transnational Organizing on Local Feminist Discourses and Practices in Latin America." *Meridians: feminism, race, transnationalism* 1(1).
- Arel, Dominique. 1995. "The Temptation of the Nationalizing State," in *The Political Culture and Civil Society in Russia and the New States of Eurasia*, ed. Vladimir Tismaneanu. Armonk, NY and London.
- Atkinson, Dorothy, Alexander Dallin and Gail Warshofsky Lapidus, eds. 1977. *Women in Russia*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Attwood, Lynne. 1990. *The New Soviet Man and Woman: Sex-Role Socialization in the USSR*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Babb, Sarah. 1996. "A True American System of Finance: Frame Resonance in the U.S. Labor Movement, 1866 to 1886." *American Sociological Review* 61:1033-1052.
- Baldez, Lisa. 2003. "Women's Movements and Democratic Transitions in Chile, Brazil, East Germany and Poland" *Comparative Politics* April:253-272.
- Badez, Lisa. 2002. *Why Women Protest: Women's Movements in Chile*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Banaszak, Lee Ann. 2006. "An Introduction to the U.S. Women's Movement in Global Perspective." In *The U.S. Women's Movement in Global Perspective*, ed. Lee Ann Banaszak. Lanham, Maryland: Rowman and Littlefield. 1-21.
- Banaszak, Lee Ann. 1996. *Why Movement Succeed or Fail: Opportunity, Culture, and the Struggle for Woman Suffrage*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Beckwith, Karen. 2000. "Beyond Compare? Women's movements in comparative perspective." *European Journal of Political Research* 37:431-468.

- Beckwith, Karen. 1996. "Lancashire Women against Pit Closures: Women's Standing in a Men's Movement." *Signs* 21(4):1034-1068.
- Benford, Robert D. 1997 "An Insider's Critique of the Social Movement Framing Perspective." *Sociological Inquiry* 67: 409-430.
- Benford, Robert D., and Scott A. Hunt. 1992. "Dramaturgy and Social Movements: The Social Construction and Communication of Power." *Sociological Inquiry* 62:36-55.
- Benford, Robert and David Snow. 2000. "Framing Processes and Social Movements: An Overview and Assessment." *Annual Review of Sociology* 26:611-639.
- Berbrier, M. 1998. "Half the Battle: Cultural Resonance, Framing Processes, and Ethnic Affectations in Contemporary White Separatists Rhetoric." *Social Problems* 45:431-450.
- Bilek, Zoryana. 2002. *Shliakhetnist' ideii-Enerhiia Pratsi: Zhittepis Soyuzu Ukrainok L'vivshchini (1990-2002)*. [Pathway of Ideas: Energetic Work: Biography of Soyuz Ukrainok L'vivites (1990-2002)] L'viv, Ukraine: Logos.
- Blumer, Herbert. 1969. *Symbolic Interactionism*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Transaction Books.
- Bohachevsky-Chomiak, Martha. 2000. "Women in Ukraine: The Political Potential of Community Organizations." In *Cultures and Nations of Central and Eastern Europe: Essays in Honor of Roman Szporluk*, eds. Zvi Gitelman et al. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Bohachevsky-Chomiak, Marta. 1997. "Women's Organizations in Independent Ukraine: Prospect of Power." The 1997 J.B. Rudnyckyj Distinguished Lecture. University of Manitoba. Manitoba, Canada.
http://umanitoba.ca/libraries/units/archives/grants/rudnyckyj_lecture/lecture_4.htm . (November 20, 2001)
- Bohachevsky-Chomiak, Martha. 1994. *Political Communities and Gendered Ideologies in Contemporary Ukraine*. Cambridge: Ukrainian Research Institute, Harvard University.
- Bohachevsky-Chomiak, Martha. 1988. *Feminists Despite Themselves: Women in Ukrainian Community Life, 1884-1939*. Edmonton, Canada: Canadian Institute of Ukrainian Studies.
- Bondarovska, Valentyna. 2002. "Moving to Gender Equality in Political Life." *Open World: Special Issue Dedicated to the IRF Program Gender Integration*. 4:17.

- Bondarovska, V. 1999. *What Can We do to Prevent Domestic Violence*. Kyiv, Ukraine.
- Bozhenko, Vera. 2002. "Holova Kyl'tyrno-prosvitnits'koi komicii." [Head of Cultural Enlightenment Committee] in *Pathway of Ideas-Energetic Work: Biography of Soyuz Ukrainok L'vivites (1990-2002)*, ed. Zoryana Bilek. L'viv, Ukraine: Logos. 13-19.
- Broad, K. L., Sarah L. Crawley, and Lara Foley. 2004. "Doing Family Values: Social Movement Framing, Discourse, and Interpretive Practice." *The Sociological Quarterly* 45(3): 509-27.
- Brockett, Charles D. 1991. "The Structure of Political Opportunities and Peasant Mobilization in Central America." *Comparative Politics* 23:253-274.
- Buckley, Mary, ed. 1992. *Perestroika and Soviet Women*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Bull, Anna, Hanna Diamond and Rosiland Marsh, eds. *Feminisms and Women's Movements in Contemporary Europe*. New York: St. Martin's Press.
- Caiazza, Amy. 1999. "Military Service and Maternal Obligation: Gender, Citizenship and Civil Society in Contemporary Russia, 1993-1997." Ph.D. diss. Indiana University.
- Center for Economic Initiatives. 2004. "Ukraine – A look at the 21st Century." January 19. <http://www.ukrainebiz.com/Articles/ukraine_regions.htm> (July 17, 2007).
- Chessa, Cecilia. 2004. "State Subsidies, International Diffusion, and Transnational Civil Society: The Case of Frankfurt-Oder and Slubice." *East European Politics and Societies* 18(1): 70-109.
- Conrad, Browyn K. 2006. "Neo-Institutionalism, Social Movements, and the Cultural Reproduction of a Mentalite: Promise Keepers Reconstruct the Madonna/Whore Complex." *Sociological Quarterly*. 47:305-331.
- Cress, David M., and David A. Snow. 2000. "The Outcomes of Homeless Mobilization: The Influence of Organization, disruption, Political Mediation, and Framing." *American Journal of Sociology* 105:1063-1104.
- Cress, David M., and David A. Snow. 1996. "Mobilization at the Margins: Resources, Benefactors, and the Viability of Homeless Social Movement Organizations." *American Sociological Review* 61:1089-1109.

- Czaplicka, John, ed. 2005. *L'viv: A city at the Crosscurrents of Culture*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Czaplicka, John. 2005. "L'viv, Lemberg, Leopoldish, Lwow, L'vov: A City at the Crosscurrents of European Culture." In *L'viv: A City at the Crosscurrents of Culture*, ed. John Czaplicka. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press. 13-46.
- d'Anjou and John Van Male. 1998. "Between Old and New: Social Movements and Cultural Change." *Mobilization: An International Journal*. 3(2):207-226.
- Didkovs'ka, I. No data. *Cholovik i Zhinka*. [Man and Woman] Kyiv, Ukraine.
- Educational Network of Ukraine. 2006. "State Higher Educational Institutions of III and IV Accreditation Levels." <http://www.ednu.kiev.ua/vuz/kharkiv34_e.htm> (July 7, 2007).
- Fine, Gary and Sherryl Kleinman. 1979. "Rethinking Subcultures: An Interactionist Analysis." *American Journal of Sociology* 85: 1-20.
- Franceschet, Susan. 2004. "Explaining Social Movement Outcomes: Collective Action Frames and Strategic Choices in First- and Second-Wave Feminism in Chile." *Comparative Political Studies*. 37(5):499-530.
- Gal, Susan and Gail Kligman. 2000. *The Politics of Gender after Socialism: A Comparative Historical Essay*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Gamson, William. 1992a. *Talking Politics*. New York and Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Gamson, William A. 1992b. "The Social Psychology of Collective Action." In *Frontiers in Social Movement Theory*, Eds. Aldon D. Morris and Carol McClurg Mueller. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.
- Gamson, William A. 1988. "Political Discourses and Collective Action." *International Social Movement Research*. 1:219-244.
- Gamson, William A. and Andre Modigliani. 1989. "Media Discourse and Public Opinion on Nuclear Power: A Constructionist Approach." *American Journal of Sociology* 95:1-37.
- Gerhards, Jurgen, and Dieter Rucht. 1992. "Mesomobilization: Organizing and Framing in Two Protests Campaigns in West Germany." *American Journal of Sociology* 98:555-595.
- Goffman, Erving. 1974. *Frame Analysis. An Essay on the Organization of Experience*.

Boston: Northeastern University Press.

- Goodwin, J. and James Jasper, eds. 2004. *Rethinking Social Movements, Structure, Meaning, and Emotion*, eds. J. Goodwin and J. Jasper. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield.
- Griffiths, Rachel. 1998. "Women's NGOs Speed Implementation of Beijing Platform." *Give and Take* 1(2):15. <<http://www.isar.org/pubs/GT/GT1-2.pdf>>
- Grunberg, Laura. 2000. "Women's NGOs in Romania." In *Reproducing Gender*, eds. Susan Gal and Gail Kligman. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Hamm, Michael F. 1993. *Kiev: A Portrait, 1800-1917*. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press.
- Hemment, Julie. 2004. "Strategizing Gender and Development: Action Research and Ethnographic Responsibility in the Russian Provinces." In *Post-Soviet Women Encountering Transition: Nation Building, Economic Survival and Civic Activism*, eds. Kathleen Kuehnast and Carol Nechemias. Washington, D.C.: Woodrow Wilson Center Press.
- Henderson, Sarah. 2003. *Building Democracy in Contemporary Russia: Western Support for Grassroots Organizations*. Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press.
- Hesli, Vicki, L. 1995. "Public Support for the Devolution of Power in Ukraine: Regional Patterns." *Europe-Asia Studies*, Vol. 47, No.1, pp. 91-121.
- Hrisky-Palazhii, Anna. 2002. "Holova Komiciii 'Reformi.'" [Head of the Reforms Committee] *Pathway of Ideas – Energetic Work: Biography of Soyuz Ukrainok L'vivites (1990-2002)*, ed. Zoryan Bilek. L'viv, Ukraine: Logos. 27-31.
- Hrycak, Alexandra. 2007a. "From Global to Local Feminisms: Transnationalism, Foreign Aid and the Women's Movement in Ukraine." *Advances in Gender Research* 11: 75-93.
- Hrycak, Alexandra. 2007b. "Gender and the Orange Revolution," *Journal of Communist Studies & Transition Politics* (23)(1): 152-179.
- Hrycak, Alexandra. 2006. "Foundation Feminism and the Articulation of Hybrid Feminisms in Post-Socialist Ukraine." *East European Politics and Societies*. 20(1):69-100.
- Hrycak, Alexandra. 2005. "Coping with Chaos: Gender and Politics in a Fragmented State." *Problems of Post-Communism*. 52(5):69-81.

- Hrycak, Alexandra. 2002. "From Mothers' Rights to Equal Rights: Post-Soviet Grassroots Women's Associations." In *Women's Activism and Globalization: Linking Local Struggles and Transnational Politics*, eds. Nancy Naples and Manisha Desai. New York: Routledge.
- Hrycak, Alexandra. 2001. "The Dilemmas of Civic Revival: Ukrainian Women Since Independences." *Journal of Ukrainian Studies* 26(1-2):135-158.
- Hrycak, Alexandra. 2000. "Women's Groups in a New Civil Society: Opportunities and Threats." Presented at the annual meeting of the Association of Nationalities, Washington D.C.
- Hrytsak, Yaroslav. 2000. "National Identities in Post-Soviet Ukraine: The Case of Lviv and Donetsk." In *Cultures and Nations of Central and Eastern Europe: Essays in Honor of Roman Szporluk*, eds. Zvi Gitelman et al. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press. 263-282.
- Hughes, Donna and Tatyana Denisova. 2003. "The Transnational Political Criminal Nexus of Trafficking in Women from Ukraine." *Trends in Organized Crime*. 6(3,4): 43-67.
- International Humanitarian Center "Rozrada." No date. "Our History: The Main Projects and Activities (1994-2002)." <<http://www.rozrada.kieva.ua/hist-e.htm>> (8/8/2006).
- International Humanitarian Center "Rozrada." No date. "Editions for Adults on the Issues of Family, Overcoming Violence, Conflict Resolution." <http://www.rozrada.kiev.ua/pub-e.htm> (8/8/2006).
- Ishkanian, Armine. 2004. "Working at the Local-Global Intersection: The Challenges Facing Women in Armenia's NGO sector." In *Post-Soviet Women Encountering Transition: Nation Building, Economic Survival, and Civic Activism*, eds. Kathleen Kuehnast and Carol Nechemias. Baltimore: Woodrow Wilson Press and Johns Hopkins University Press. 262-287.
- Jancar, Barbara Wolfe. 1978. *Women Under Communism*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Jasper, James M. 2004. "A Strategic Approach to Collective Action: Looking for Agency in Social Movement Choices." *Mobilization: An International Journal*. 9:1-16.
- Jasper, James M. 1997. *The Art of Moral Protest: Culture, Biography and Creativity in Social Movements*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

- Jasper, James and Jane D. Poulsen. 1995. "Recruiting Strangers and Friends: Moral Shocks and Social Networks in Animal Rights and Anti-Nuclear Protests." *Social Problems* 42:492-508.
- Jenkins, Craig J. 1983. "Resource Mobilization Theory and the Study of Social Movements." *Annual Review of Sociology* 9:527-553.
- Jenkins, J. Craig and Charles Perrow. 1977. "Insurgency of the Powerless: Farm Workers' Movements, 1946-1972." *American Sociological Review*. 42:249-268.
- Johnston, Hank and Bert Klandermans, eds. 1995. *Social Movements and Culture*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Johnston, Hank and John A. Noakes. 2005. *Frames of Protest*. Lanham, Maryland: Rowman and Littlefield.
- Johnston, Hank and David A. Snow. 1996. "Subcultures and the Emergence of the Estonian Nationalist Opposition 1945-1990." *Sociological Perspectives* 41(3): 473-497.
- Kashyrska, Valentyna. 2002. "How the men won by playing a women's card." *Through Women's Eyes*. 5-11.
- Kay, Rebecca. 2004. "Meeting the Challenge Together? Russian Grassroots Women's Organizations and the Shortcomings of Western Aid." In *Post-Soviet Women Encountering Transition: Nation Building, Economic Survival and Civic Activism*, eds. Kathleen Kuehnast and Carol Nechemias. Washington, D.C.: Woodrow Wilson Center Press.
- Keck, Margaret and K. Sikkink. 1998. *Activists Beyond Borders: Advocacy Networks in International Politics*. Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press.
- Kenney, Padraic. 2005. "L'viv's Central European Renaissance, 1989-1990." In *L'viv: A City at the Crosscurrents of Culture*, ed. John Czaplicka. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press. 303-312.
- Kobets', Ol'ha. 2002a. "Zhinka na Prozi XXI Stolittia. Genderna Politika. Mekhanizm Vprovadzhennia v Ykraiina." [Women on the Threshold of the XXI Century. Politics of Gender. Mechanism of Introduction in Ukraine] *Zhionchii Svit*. 3,4(10,11): 25-26.
- Kobets', Ol'ha. 2002b. "National Council of Women of Ukraine." *Zhionchii Svit*. 3,4(10,11):19.

- Kornhauser, Ruth. 1978. *Social Sources of Delinquency*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Kravchuk, Robert S. and Victor Chudowsky. 2005. "Ukraine's 1994 elections as an Economic Event," *Communist and Post-Communist Studies*. 38 pp.131-165.
- Kriesi, Hanspeter; Ruud Koopmans, Jan Willem Duyvendak; and Marco G. Giugni. 1992. "New Social Movements and Political Opportunities in Western Europe." *European Journal of Political Research* 22:219-244.
- Kubal, Timothy. 1998. "The Presentation of the Political Self: Cultural Resonance and the Construction of Collective Action Frames." *Sociological Quarterly* 39:4 pp.539-554.
- Lapidus, Gail Warshofsky. 1978. *Women in Soviet Society: Equality, Development and Social Change*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Levin, David. 2005. "Framing Peace Policies: The Competition for Resonant Themes." *Political Communication*. 22:83-108.
- Liber, George, O. 1998. "Imagining Ukraine: regional differences and the emergence of an integrated state identity, 1926-1994." *Nations and Nationalism* 4(2), pp.189-206.
- Lipovskaia, Olga. 1992. "New Women's Organizations." In *Perestroika and Soviet Women*, ed. Mary Buckley. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Lukovyk, Victor. 1997. "*Kharkivshchyna: Leader of the Pack*." *Eastern Economist*, March 24.
- Markus, Vasyl. 1984. "Religion and Nationalism in Ukraine." In *Religion and Nationalism in Soviet Ukraine after 1945*, ed. Pedro Ramet ed. Durham, N.C.: Duke Press Policy Studies. 59-81.
- Marsh, Rosiland. 1998. "Women in Contemporary Russia and the former Soviet Union." In *Women, Ethnicity and Nationalism: The Politics of Transition*, eds. Rick Wilford and Robert L. Miller. London and New York: Routledge.
- Marsh, Rosiland, ed. 1996. *Women in Russia and Ukraine*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Martyniuk, Jaroslaw. 1993. "Religious Preferences in Five Urban Areas of Ukraine." *RFE/RL*. 2(15): 52-55.

- Martyniuk, Jaroslaw. 1994. "The State of the Orthodox Church in Ukraine." *RFE/RL*. February 18: 34-41.
- McAdam, Doug. 2004. "Revisiting the U.S. Civil Rights Movement: Toward a More Synthetic Understanding of the Origins of Contention." In *Rethinking Social Movements, Structure, Meaning, and Emotion*, eds. J. Goodwin and J. Jasper. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield. 201-232.
- McAdam, Doug. 1996. "Conceptual origins, problems, future directions." In *Frontiers in Social Movement Theory*, Eds. Aldon D. Morris and Carol McClurg Mueller. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.
- McAdam, Doug. 1982. *Political Process and the Development of the Black Insurgency, 1930-1970*. Chicago: Chicago University Press.
- McAuley, Alastair. 1981. *Women's Work and Wages in the Soviet Union*. London: Allen and Unwin.
- McCarthy, John and Mayer Zald. 1977. "Resource Mobilization and Social Movements: A Partial Theory." *American Journal of Sociology*. 82:1212-1241.
- Mendelson, S.E., and Glenn, J.K., eds. 2002. *The Power and Limits of NGOs: A Critical Look at Building Democracy in Eastern Europe and Eurasia*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Meyer, David, Nancy Whittier and Belinda Robnett, eds. 2002. *Social Movements: Identity, Culture and the State*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Mika, Marie. 2006. "Framing the Issue: Religion, Secular Ethics and the Case of Animal Rights Mobilization." *Social Forces*. 85(2):915-927.
- Morgan, R. 2004. "Advancing Indigenous rights at the United Nations: Strategic Framing and its Impact on the Normative Development of International Law." *Social and Legal Studies*. 13(4):481-500.
- Mulvey, Stephen. 2004. "Analysis: Divided Ukraine" *BBC News*. November 25. <<http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/europe/4043315.stm#map>> (October 19, 2007).
- Naples, Nancy. 2002. "Materialist Feminist Discourse Analysis and Social Movement Research: Mapping the Changing Context for "Community Control."" .” In *Social Movements: Identity, Culture and the State*. Eds., David S. Meyer, Nancy Whittier, and Belinda Robnett. New York: Oxford University Press. 226-246.

- Naples, Nancy and Menisha Desai. 2002. *Women's Activism and Globalization: Linking Local Struggles and Transnational Politics*. New York: Routledge.
- Nechemias, Carol. 2006. "Women Organizing Women in the Russian Federation." In *The U.S. Women's Movement in Global Perspective*. Ed., Lee Ann Banaszak. Lanham, Maryland: Rowman and Littlefield. 151-176.
- Noakes, John A. and Hank Johnston. 2005. "Frames of Protest: A Road Map to the Perspective." In *Frames of Protest*, eds. Hank Johnston and John A. Noakes. Lanham, Maryland: Rowman and Littlefield. 1-29.
- Oberschall, A. 1973. *Social Conflict and Social Movements*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall.
- Olena Teliha Society. No date. No author. Brochure. (English)
- O'Loughlin, John and James E. Bell. 1999. "The Political Geography of Civic Engagement in Ukraine." *Post-Soviet Geography and Economics* 40(4): 233-266.
- Pavlychko, Solomea. 1997. "Conservative faces of women in Ukraine," in Mary Buckley, ed. *Post-Soviet Women: from the Baltic to Central Asia*. Cambridge, UK: University Press.
- Pavlychko, Solomea. 1996. "Feminism in post-communist Ukrainian Society." In *Women in Russia and Ukraine*, ed. Rosiland Marsh.
- Pavlychko, Solemea. 1992a. "Between feminism and nationalism: new women's groups in the Ukraine." In *Perestroika and Soviet Women*, ed. Mary Buckley. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Pavlychko, Solemea. 1992b. *Letters from Kiev*. New York: St. Martin's Press.
- Penney, Robert. 2006. "Interpretation, Meaning and Worker Solidarity." *Social Problems* 53(2): 139-160.
- Phillips, Sarah D. 2000. "NGOs in Ukraine: The Makings of a "Woman's Space?"" *Anthropology of East Europe Review* 18(2): 23-29.
- Piven, Francis F. and Richard A. Cloward. 1977. *Poor People's Movements*. New York: Vintage Books.
- Platt, Gerald M. and Rhys H. Williams. 2002. "Ideological Language and Social Movement Mobilization: A Sociolinguistic Analysis of Segregationists' Ideologies." *Sociological Theory*. 20(3):328-359.

- Polletta, Francesca. 2004. "Culture Is Not Just In Your Head." In *Rethinking Social Movements, Structure, Meaning, and Emotion*, eds. Jeff Goodwin and James Jasper. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield. 97-110.
- Polletta, Francesca. 1999. "Snarls, Quacks, and Quarrels: Culture and Structure in Political Process Theory." *Sociological Forum* 14(1): 63-70.
- Polletta, Francesca. 1997. "Culture and Its Discontents: Recent Theorizing on the Cultural Dimensions of Protest." *Sociological Inquiry* 67:431-450.
- Popson, Nancy and Kimberly Righter. 2000. "Politics and Gender in Ukraine: The Next Generation of Women Politicians?" Paper presented at the annual meeting of the Association of Nationalities, Washington D.C.
- Poulson, Stephen C. 2005. *Social Movements in Twentieth-Century Iran: Culture, Ideology and Mobilizing Frameworks*. Lanham, Maryland: Rowman and Littlefield Press.
- Pye, Lucian and Sidney Verba, eds. 1965. *Political Culture and Political Development*. Princeton, Princeton University Press.
- Ray, Raka. 1999. *Fields of Protest: Women's Movement in India*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Reese, Ellen and Garnett Newcombe. 2003. "Income Rights, Mothers' Rights, or Workers' Rights? Collective Action Frames, Organizational Ideologies, and the American Welfare Rights Movement." *Social Problems*. 50(2): 294-318.
- Reid, Anna. 1997. *Borderland: A Journey through the History of Ukraine*. Boulder, Colorado: Westview Press.
- Richter, James. 2002. "Promoting Civil Society? Democracy Assistance and Russian Women's Organizations." *Problems of Post-Communism* 49(1):30-41.
- Rucht, Dieter. 1996. "The impact of national contexts on social movement structures: A cross-movement and cross-national comparison." In McAdam, Doug, John D. McCarthy, and Mayer N. Zald, eds. *Comparative Perspectives on Social Movements*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Sacks, Michael P. 1976. *Women's Work in Soviet Russia: Continuity in the Midst of Change*. New York: Praeger.
- Skocpol, Theda. 1979. *States and Social Revolutions*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

- Smolyar, Liudmyla. 2001. "The Women's Movement as a Factor of Gender Equality and Democracy in Ukrainian Society." (Ukrainian) In *Ukrainian Women's Non-Profit Organizations Directory*, ed. Oleksander Sydorenko. Kyiv, Ukraine: Innovation and Development Center.
- Smolyar, Liudmyla. 1998. *Mynule z rady maibut'n'oho: Zhinochyi rukh naddniprians'koi ukrainy II pol. XIX –poch. XXst. Storinky istorii*. [The past for the sake of the future: The women's movement in Trans-Dnipro Ukraine. Second half of the nineteenth and beginning of the twentieth centuries. Pages of History] Odessa, Ukraine: Astroprint.
- Snow, David A., and Robert D. Benford. 1992. "Master Frames and Cycles of Protest." In *Frontiers in Social Movement Theory*, Eds. Aldon D. Morris and Carol McClurg Mueller. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.
- Snow, David A., and Robert D. Benford. 1988. "Ideology, Frame Resonance, and Participant Mobilization." *International Social Movement Research* 1:197-217.
- Snow, David A., E. Burke Rochford Jr., Steven K. Worden, and Robert D. Bendord. 1986. "Frame alignment Process, Micromobilziation and Movement Participation." *American Sociological Review* 51:464-481.
- Snow, David. 2004. "Framing Processes, Ideology, and Discursive Fields." In *The Blackwell Companion to Social Movements*, edited by D. Snow, S. Soule, and H. Kriesi. Malden, MA: Blackwell. 91-115.
- Solchanyk, Roman. 2000. "Russians in Ukraine: Problems and Prospects." In *Cultures and Nations of Central and Eastern Europe: Essays in Honor of Roman Szporluk*, eds. Zvi Gitelman et al. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Soyuz Ukrainok 1921-2001. 2001. No author. Brochure. (Ukrainian)
- Sperling, Valerie. 1999. *Organizing Women in Contemporary Russia: Engendering Transition*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Sperling, Valerie, Myra Marx Ferree, and Barbara Risman. 2001. "Constructing Global Feminism: Transnational Advocacy Networks and Russian Women's Activism." *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*. 26(4):1155-1186.
- State Statistics Committee of Ukraine. 2007. "All Ukrainian Population Census 2001." <<http://www.ukrcensus.gov.ua/eng/regions/>> (July 17, 2007).
- Steinberg, Marc. 2002. "Toward a More Dialogic Analysis of Social Movement Culture." In *Social Movements: Identity, Culture and the State*. Eds., David S.

- Meyer, Nancy Whittier, and Belinda Robnett. New York: Oxford University Press. 208-225.
- Subtelny, Orest. 2000. *Ukraine: A History*. Toronto, Canada: University of Toronto Press.
- Suttles, Gerald D. 1968. *The Social Order of the Slum*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Swidler, Ann. 1995. "Cultural Power and Social Movements." In Johnston, Hank and Bert Klandermans, eds. *Social Movements and Culture*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Swidler, Ann. 1986. "Culture in Action: Symbols and Strategies." *American Sociological Review* 51:273-86.
- Sydorenko, Oleksander. 2001. "Women's Organizations of Ukraine: Development Tendencies." In *Ukrainian Women's Non-Profit Organizations Directory*. Ed., Olesksander Sydorenko. Kyiv, Ukraine: Center for Innovation and Development.
- Tarrow, Sidney G. 2005. *The New Transnational Activism*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Tarrow, Sidney G. 1998. *Power in Movement: Social Movements and Contentious Politics*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Tarrow, Sidney. 1994. *Power in Movement: Social Movements, Collective Action and Mass Politics in the Modern State*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Tilly, Charles. 1979. "Repertoires of Contention in America and Britain, 1750-1830." In *Dynamics of Social Movements*, eds. Mayer Zald and John D. McCarthy. Cambridge, MA.: Winthrop. 126-155.
- United Nations in Ukraine. No date. Kyiv, Ukraine.
<<http://www.un.kiev.ua/en/pressroom/news/577/>> (8/8/2006).
- United Nations Development Program. 2003. *Gender Issues in Ukraine: Challenges and Opportunities*. Kyiv: UNDP.
- United States Agency for International Development. 1995. *U.S. Government Assistance to and Cooperative Activities with the New Independent States of the Former Soviet Union: Submitted to the Congress pursuant to Section 104 of the FREEDOM Support Act*.
<http://www.state.gov/www/regions/nis/nis_assist_index.html> (8/6/07)

United States Agency for International Development. 1996. *U.S. Government Assistance to and Cooperative Activities with the New Independent States of the Former Soviet Union: Submitted to the Congress pursuant to Section 104 of the FREEDOM Support Act.*
<http://www.state.gov/www/regions/nis/nis_assist_index.html> (8/6/07)

United States Agency for International Development. 1997. *U.S. Government Assistance to and Cooperative Activities with the New Independent States of the Former Soviet Union: Submitted to the Congress pursuant to Section 104 of the FREEDOM Support Act.*
<http://www.state.gov/www/regions/nis/nis_assist_index.html> (8/6/07)

United States Agency for International Development. 1998. *U.S. Government Assistance to and Cooperative Activities with the New Independent States of the Former Soviet Union: Submitted to the Congress pursuant to Section 104 of the FREEDOM Support Act.*
<http://www.state.gov/www/regions/nis/nis_assist_index.html> (8/6/07)

United States Agency for International Development. 1999. *U.S. Government Assistance to and Cooperative Activities with the New Independent States of the Former Soviet Union: Submitted to the Congress pursuant to Section 104 of the FREEDOM Support Act.*
<http://www.state.gov/www/regions/nis/nis_assist_index.html> (8/6/07)

United States Agency for International Development. 2000. *U.S. Government Assistance to and Cooperative Activities with the New Independent States of the Former Soviet Union: Submitted to the Congress pursuant to Section 104 of the FREEDOM Support Act.*
<http://www.state.gov/www/regions/nis/nis_assist_index.html> (8/6/07)

United States Agency for International Development. 2001. *U.S. Government Assistance to and Cooperative Activities with the New Independent States of the Former Soviet Union: Submitted to the Congress pursuant to Section 104 of the FREEDOM Support Act.*
<http://www.state.gov/www/regions/nis/nis_assist_index.html> (8/6/07)

United States Agency for International Development. 2002. *U.S. Government Assistance to and Cooperative Activities with the New Independent States of the Former Soviet Union: Submitted to the Congress pursuant to Section 104 of the FREEDOM Support Act.*
<http://www.state.gov/www/regions/nis/nis_assist_index.html> (8/6/07)

United States Agency for International Development. 2003. *U.S. Government Assistance to and Cooperative Activities with the New Independent States*

of the Former Soviet Union: Submitted to the Congress pursuant to Section 104 of the FREEDOM Support Act.

http://www.state.gov/www/regions/nis/nis_assist_index.html (8/6/07)

United States Agency for International Development. 2004. *U.S. Government Assistance to and Cooperative Activities with the New Independent States of the Former Soviet Union: Submitted to the Congress pursuant to Section 104 of the FREEDOM Support Act.*

http://www.state.gov/www/regions/nis/nis_assist_index.html (8/6/07)

United States Agency for International Development. 2005. *U.S. Government Assistance to and Cooperative Activities with the New Independent States of the Former Soviet Union: Submitted to the Congress pursuant to Section 104 of the FREEDOM Support Act.*

http://www.state.gov/www/regions/nis/nis_assist_index.html (8/6/07)

United States Agency for International Development. 2006. *U.S. Government Assistance to and Cooperative Activities with the New Independent States of the Former Soviet Union: Submitted to the Congress pursuant to Section 104 of the FREEDOM Support Act.*

http://www.state.gov/www/regions/nis/nis_assist_index.html (8/6/07)

United States Agency for International Development. 2007. *U.S. Government Assistance to and Cooperative Activities with the New Independent States of the Former Soviet Union: Submitted to the Congress pursuant to Section 104 of the FREEDOM Support Act.*

http://www.state.gov/www/regions/nis/nis_assist_index.html (8/6/07)

Universities in Kyiv. < <http://www.ukraine-today.com/education/universities/universities-kyiv.shtml> > (July 7, 2007).

U.S. Department of State. International Information Programs. December 10, 1999. *Joint Statement of the U.S.-Ukraine Binational Commission.* Washington: Department of State.

<http://www.globalsecurity.org/wmd/library/news/ukraine/991208-ukraine-usia1.htm> > (July 20, 2007).

U.S.-Ukraine Foundation. 2001. "U.S.-Ukraine Foundation's Business Links for Economic Development." 2(4) October 29, 2001. <<http://www.ukraine-today.com/business/oppo/kharkiv.htm>> (July 20, 2007).

Voznyak, Taras. 2005. "Lviv. Sine qua non: Philosophy of a Town." *The Independent Cultural Journal "Yi"* 36. <<http://www.ji.lviv.ua/engl-vers/arhiv-eng.htm>>. (October 17, 2006).

- Wanner, Catherine. 1998. *Burden of Dreams: History and Identity in Post-Soviet Ukraine*. University Park, Pennsylvania: The Pennsylvania State University Press.
- Whitefield, Stephen. 2007. *Eurequal: Social Inequality and Why it Matters for the Economic and Democratic Development of Europe and its Citizens: Post-Communist Central and Eastern Europe in Comparative Perspective*
- Whittier, Nancy. 2002. "Meaning and Structure in Social Movements." In *Social Movements: Identity, Culture and the State*. Eds., David S. Meyer, Nancy Whittier, and Belinda Robnett. New York: Oxford University Press. 289-308.
- Williams, Rhys. 2004. "The Cultural Contexts of Collective Action: Constraints, Opportunities, and the Symbolic Life of Social Movements." In *The Blackwell Companion to Social Movements*, eds. D. Snow, S. Soule, and H. Kriesi. Malden, MA: Blackwell.
- Williams, Rhys H. 2002. "From the "Beloved Community" to "Family Values": Religious Language, Symbolic Repertoires, and Democratic Culture." In *Social Movements: Identity, Culture and the State*. Eds., David S. Meyer, Nancy Whittier, and Belinda Robnett. New York: Oxford University Press. 247-265.
- Williams, Rhys H. 1995. "Constructing the Public Good: Social Movements and Cultural Resources." *Social Problems*. 42(1):124-144.
- Williams, Rhys H., and Timothy J. Kubal. 1999. "Movement Frames and the Cultural Environment: Resonance, Failure and the Boundaries of the Legitimate." *Research in Social Movements, Conflicts and Change*. 21: 225-248
- Willis, Paul. 1977. *Learning to Labor: How Working Class Kids get Working Class Jobs*. New York: Columbia University Press
- Wilson, Andrew. 2002. *The Ukrainians: Unexpected Nation*. New Haven, Connecticut: Yale University Press.
- Wilson, Andrew. 1997. *Ukrainian Nationalism in the 1990s: A Minority Faith*. Cambridge, MA: Cambridge University Press.
- Wise, Charles and Trevor Brown. 1999. "The Separation of Powers in Ukraine." *Communist and Post-Communist Societies*. 32:23-44.
- Women in Mass Media. No date. "Pozyminnia Poniattia "Gender" [Understanding the Definition of Gender] Kyiv, Ukraine.

- Yelenskyi, Viktor. 2001. "The Process of Institutional Religion in Ukraine." *Liudyna i Svit*. January. 39-42.
<<http://www.risu.org.ua/eng/religion.and.society/processes.of.religion/>> (July 18, 2007).
- Zald, Meyer. 1996. "Culture, Ideology, and Strategic Framing," in *Comparative Perspectives on Social Movements*, eds. Douglas McAdam, John McCarthy, and Mayer Zald. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Zdarvomyslova, Elena. 1996. "Opportunities and Framing in the Transition to Democracy: The Case of Russia." In *Comparative Perspectives on Social Movements*, eds. Douglas McAdam, John McCarthy, and Mayer Zald. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. 122-137.
- Zhurzhenko, Tatiana. 2004. "Strong Women, Weak State: Family Politics and Nation Building in Post-Soviet Ukraine." In *Post Soviet Women Encountering Transition: Nation Building, Economic Survival and Civic Activism*. Kathleen Kuehnast and Carol Nechemias eds. Woodrow Wilson Center Press: Washington D.C.
- Zhurzhenko, Tatiana. 2001. "Ukrainian Feminism(s): Between Nationalist Myth and Anti-Nationalist Critique." Vienna: International World Bank Working Paper.
- Zhurzhenko, Tatiana. 1999. "Nation-Building, Citizenship and Women's Political Identities in Post-Soviet Ukraine." *Working Papers on Ukrainian Studies*. <<http://www.unl.ac.uk/ukrainecentre/>> (November 20, 2001).
- Zimmerman, William. 2000. "The Diminishing Burden of the Soviet Past: Russian Assessments of Russian-Ukrainian Linkages." In *Cultures and Nations of Central and Eastern Europe: Essays in Honor of Roman Szporluk*, eds. Zvi Gitelman et al. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Zuo, Jiping, and Robert D. Benford. 1995. "Mobilization Processes and the 1989 Chinese Democracy Movement." *The Sociological Quarterly* 36:131-156.
- Zurcher, Louis A., and David A. Snow. 1981. "Collective Behavior: Social Movements." In *Social Psychology: Sociological Perspectives*, eds. Morris Rosenberg and Ralph H. Turner. New York: Basic Books.

Appendix A

Interview Protocol

Activists interview protocol

- 1) I would like to ask your permission to record our conversation today. The comments made on tapes will remain confidential; no one, outside of myself and my research assistant who will transcribe them, will have access to the tapes or transcripts. As I mentioned in the introductory letter, no information from the interview will be presented in a way that allows you to be identified, and no quotations will be attributed to you unless you give me prior written approval. Of course, at any time during the interview you may ask that the tape recorder be turned off. Is it all right to use a tape recorder for today's interview?

- 2) Can you tell me why you became involved in this organization? When?

- 3) Can you tell me why this organization was originally founded? What are the goals of the organization?

Probe for why the organization thinks this problem exists in Ukraine. Who or what does the organization see as responsible for creating/perpetuating the problem?

- 4) How do you plan to go about addressing [problem/s identified above]?
- 5) Have the goals of your organization changed at all since it was founded?

Probe for why they changed, what they changed to, and when they changed.

- 6) Can you tell me what your group is doing to meet [goals stated above]?

Probe for all achievements and progress towards goals-what done, doing, will do, and results of all actions.

- 7) What have been the problems and difficulties in achieving [goals stated above]?

Probe for specific resources they are lacking.

- 8) What types of material resources (office space, money to pay salaries, computers, email, etc.) does your organization currently possess? What ones to do you feel you need?

Probe for specific resources –computers, office space, etc.

- 9) Do you receive any type of support from foreign organizations? If so, what do you receive from them?

Probe for how long they've received aid from foreign organization.

- 10) Did you have to do anything to receive [whatever they listed above]? If so, what? (write a proposal, hold a seminar, engage in certain types of activities)

Probe for how foreign support influences the goals, activities, and target audience of the group.

- 11) How has support from [organization mentioned above] helped to accomplish [goals mentioned above]?

- 12) Does your organization have any connections with people in positions of power who can help your group? (Rada, executive, bureaucracy, oligarchs, anyone in local government or an influential individual community)

Probe for the type of relationship the group has with this individual, how they've helped them in concrete ways.

- 13) May I contact [individual mentioned in #12] to interview them as well?
Get contact information if possible. Maybe ask them for a letter of introduction.
- 14) Can you tell me of other organizations you know about?
- 15) Are there other things that I haven't asked you which you think are important?

Elite Allies Interview

- 1) I would like to ask your permission to record our conversation today. The comments made on tapes will remain confidential; no one, outside of myself and my research assistant who will transcribe them, will have access to the tapes or transcripts. As I mentioned in the introductory letter, no information from the interview will be presented in a way that allows you to be identified, and no quotations will be attributed to you unless you give me prior written approval. Of course, at any time during the interview you may ask that the tape recorder be turned off. Is it all right to use a tape recorder for today's interview?

- 2) Can you tell me what you think are important women's issues in Ukraine?

Probe for what they think is important related to women.

- 3) What do you think are the causes of the issues you just mentioned?

- 4) What is the government doing related to these issues?

Are there particular people in government who think that something should be done?

Are there people who are opposed to doing anything about the issues you mentioned and why?

Probe for how open they think the government is to women's concerns, political environment generally for these concerns.

- 5) Is there any policy that has already been enacted concerning these issues, or in the process of being made?

Probe for very specific legislation.

- 6) Now I would like to ask you about a specific women's organization that mentioned you had helped them in some way. Can you tell me about your affiliation with [whatever organization mentioned this individual as an ally]?

Probe for how long individual has known about and helped the organization, specifics about how has helped the organization (now and past).

- 7) Can you tell me as much as you know about the goals of [organization]?
What problems does it see itself addressing?
- 8) What do you know about why [organization] believes [identified problems] exist in Ukraine?
- 9) What does [organization] believe needs to be done about [identified problems]? How do they plan on doing this?
- 10) Are there other organizations that you work with or have had contact with?

Get as much contact information about them as possible.

Appendix B

Women's NGOs and Founding Dates

Kyiv

Center for Gender Studies	1998
Council of Women of Chernobyl	1994
International Women's Club of Kyiv	1996
Kyiv Institute of Gender Research	1999
League of Ukrainian Women	1996
League of Women Voters 50/50	1997
Mother's Happiness	1994
National Council of Ukrainian Women	1999
Olena Teliha Society	1995
Rozrada (Comfort)	1994
School of Equal Opportunities	2000
Soyuz Ukrainok (Ukrainian National Women's League)	1992
Kyiv branch of Soyuz Ukrainok	1994
Ukrainian Center of Women's Studies	1992
Union of Women Workers for the Future of the Children of Ukraine (UWWFCU)	1993
Women in Mass Media	1995
Women in Science	1996
Women of Chernobyl Fund	1998
Women's Art Center	2000
Spilka Zhinok (Women's Union of Ukraine)	1993
Zhinocha Hromada (Women's Community)	1989

Kharkiv

Cirin	1999
Harmony	1999
Humanitarian Initiatives	1995
Miroslava	1989
Nadia	1995
Olena Teliha Society	2000
Panna	1995
Perspectiva	1999
Union of Women Workers for the Future of the Children of Ukraine (UWWFCU)	1997
Women's Fund	1994
Spilka Zhinok (Women's Union of Ukraine)	1999
Zhinocha Hromada (Women's Community)	1996

L'viv

Association of Ol'ha Basarab	1998
Center for Help for Women	1999
Olena Teliha Society	1995
Soyuz Ukrainok (Ukrainian National Women's League)	1989
Union of Women Workers for the Future of the Children of Ukraine (UWWFCU)	1994
Women and Society	1999
Women's Perspectives	1998
Younka (Young Girl)	1997
Zhinocha Hromada (Women's Community)	1994

VITA

Nicole Edgar Morford

Nicole Edgar Morford, daughter of John and Carol Edgar, was born on June 15, 1975 in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania. She earned her Bachelor of Arts degree in Political Science from Geneva College in Beaver Falls, Pennsylvania in May 1997. She began her graduate studies at the Pennsylvania State University in August 1998, earning her Masters of Arts degree in Political Science from the Pennsylvania State University in May 2000 under the direction of Professor Gretchen Casper. Her Masters thesis compared civil society development in four post-Soviet states. Her dissertation work was conducted under the direction of Professor Lee Ann Banaszak.