BOARDING SCHOOLS AND CAPITAL BENEFITS:
A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF STUDENT EXPERIENCE IN
UNITED STATES AND SOUTH AFRICAN SCHOOLS

A Thesis in
Educational Leadership and Comparative and International Education

by
Lisa Renee Bass

© 2007 Lisa Renee Bass

Submitted in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements
for the Degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

August 2007
The dissertation of Lisa Renee Bass was reviewed and approved* by the following:

Nona Prestine  
Professor of Educational Leadership and Policy  
In Charge of Graduate Programs in Educational Leadership  
Co-Chair of Committee  
Thesis Co-Advisor

Ladislaus Semali  
Associate Professor of Curriculum and Instruction  
Chair, Comparative and International Education  
Co-Chair of Committee  
Thesis Co-Advisor

Susan Faircloth  
Assistant Professor of Educational Leadership and Policy and Special Education

Edgar Farmer  
Professor Learning and Performance Systems  
In Charge of Graduate Programs in Learning and Performance Systems

Roger Shouse  
Associate Professor of Education Leadership and Policy

*Signatures are on file in the Graduate School.
This dissertation was a comparative study of two boarding schools and the prevalence and impact of Bourdieu’s (1977, 1983, 1986) capital benefits (economic, social, cultural, and educational) on student experience at the study schools. In a time when alternative approaches to schooling are so prevalent, this researcher sought to explore Bourdieu’s capital theories in the boarding school environment. According to this theory, students who are rich in and education capital will perform better at higher levels academically.

Wealthier students generally have more access to the type or quality of social and cultural capital that leads to successful academic performance. They have traditionally reaped the benefits that their higher social economic status affords, while withholding access to poorer students into their circle. According to Bourdieu (1983, 1986), those who hold the power in societies design economic and social systems that support their own value systems and attributes. These ‘designs’ keep people without economic capital out, protecting their position of advantage. Most boarding school environments cater to wealthier students and reinforce this notion.

In this study, I examined social, cultural and educational dynamics of two boarding school environments that served both wealthy and poorer students. I studied the environments of Douglas¹ in the United States, and Bailey² in South Africa. I compared their environments to determine the extent to which their environments promote social, cultural, and education capital of students of all backgrounds (Bourdieu, 1977, 1993,

¹ A pseudonym
² A pseudonym
1996), and discussed this impact on student experience. The data source was observations, oral and written interviews.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Tables ............................................................................................................ viii  
List of Figures ............................................................................................................ ix  
Acknowledgements .................................................................................................... x  

Chapter One. INTRODUCTION .............................................................................. 1  
  
Purpose of Study .................................................................................................. 1  
Background and Context .................................................................................. 2  
  
  Background of South Africa’s System of Education ........................................ 3  
  Approaches to Education over the Years ......................................................... 6  
  Bourdieu’s Capitals .................................................................................. 7  
  Education Capital .................................................................................. 7  
  Social Capital .................................................................................... 10  
  Cultural Capital .................................................................................. 11  
  Capital Benefits in Sum ........................................................................... 12  
  Boarding School Environment ....................................................................... 13  
  Worthy of Companionship? ........................................................................... 16  
  Why South African as a Basis for Comparison? ........................................... 17  
  Significance of the Study .............................................................................. 19  

Chapter Two. LITERATURE REVIEW .................................................................. 22  
  
Boarding School Histories ................................................................................... 23  
  North American Boarding School ................................................................... 23  
  Boarding School Models for African North Americans and Native North  
  Americans ........................................................................................................ 25  
  Native North Americans in Boarding Schools ................................................ 28  
  Bourdieu on Social and Cultural Capital ....................................................... 29  
  The Impact of Cultural Capital on Educational Achievement ....................... 30  
  Cultural Capital Imparted Through Educational Intervention ....................... 31  
  A Better Chance (ABC): Moving Students from the Ghetto to the  
  Ranks of the Elite .................................................................................... 33  
  Long Term Successes .................................................................................. 36  
  Greater Social Capital Gained Through Boarding School Environment? .... 37  
  At-Risk Students and Their Need for Social Capital ..................................... 38  
  Are Boarding Schools Better Designed to Meet Children’s Need  
  for Social Capital? .................................................................................. 41  
  Present Day Boarding and Residential Schools Models .................................. 43  
  The Mitchell Boarding School ....................................................................... 44  
  Chicago Cluster Initiative ............................................................................. 45  
  The North Carolina School of Science and Mathematics ............................. 46  
  Parent and Student Sentiment regarding Boarding Schools ......................... 47  
  Boarding School Success .............................................................................. 49
Chapter Three. METHODOLOGY ................................................................. 52

- Introduction .............................................................................................. 52
- Justification for Sites and Sample Selection ............................................. 52
- Qualitative Considerations ...................................................................... 53
- Qualitative or Quantitative Methodology .................................................. 55
  - The Case Study Approach ...................................................................... 58
  - Why Compare Internationally? ................................................................. 59
- Research Strategies ................................................................................... 61
  - Gaining Access and Entry ..................................................................... 61
  - Data Collection and Interview Strategies ............................................. 62
  - Keeping the Lines of Communication Open ......................................... 65
  - Reliability and Validity Concerns ......................................................... 66
- Limitations .................................................................................................. 68
- Data Analysis ............................................................................................ 72
- Obtaining IRB Approval .......................................................................... 75
- Research Protocol ..................................................................................... 77
- Research Questions .................................................................................... 77

Chapter Four. THE DOUGLAS SCHOOL ..................................................... 78

- Introduction .............................................................................................. 78
- Douglas’ Background and History ............................................................ 79
- The Douglas Ethos Demonstrated .............................................................. 80
- The Douglas Environment ........................................................................ 82
  - Social Capital ...................................................................................... 83
  - Cultural Capital .................................................................................. 89
  - Education Capital ............................................................................. 91
- Summary of Observations ........................................................................ 93

Chapter Five. BAILEY COLLEGE ............................................................ 95

- Introduction .............................................................................................. 95
- Bailey Background and History ................................................................. 98
  - Social Capital ...................................................................................... 104
  - Cultural Capital .................................................................................. 105
  - Education Capital ............................................................................. 108
- Summary of Findings .............................................................................. 115

Chapter Six. COMPARATIVE DATA ANALYSIS ....................................... 117

- Introduction .............................................................................................. 117
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Impact of Differences on Study Results .................................................................128
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Capital Model ..................................................................................................15
Figure 2: Students’ Attitudes Towards School: Douglas and Bailey .......................130
Figure 3: Students’ Favorite Aspect of Going to Boarding School .........................132
Figure 4: Relationships ...............................................................................................133
Figure 5: Mentorship .................................................................................................135
Figure 6: College Aspirations ....................................................................................136
Figure 7: Careers .......................................................................................................137
Figure 8: Race of Students Completing Questionnaire ...........................................138
Figure 9: How Students Spend their Leisure Time ................................................141
Figure 10: Do Students Feel That They are Better Off? ...........................................143
Figure 11: Students’ Grades ......................................................................................145
Figure 12: Students’ Perceptions on the Level of Difficulty of their Work in Boarding Schools ........................................................................................................146
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I first want to acknowledge God for imparting to me the dream of obtaining a doctorate degree. I thank Him for giving me the patience and persistence to complete this endeavor through many obstacles and much opposition. Next I want to honor the memory of my father by thanking him for being my hero, believing in me, and being the first to tell me that I would not be satisfied until I received a doctorate. I also want to thank my mother for her unyielding support throughout the process. I want to thank and acknowledge all the educators in my life who have gone above and beyond the duties dictated by their posts to teach, guide, and encourage me. Among these educators, I especially want thank my dissertation committee who helped me to bring this dissertation from concept to reality. And finally I want to thank my friends who were there to support me during the tough times, and to celebrate with me during my moments of success.
CHAPTER ONE

Introduction

This study is a comparative analysis of two boarding schools: one in the United States and the other in South Africa. The boarding schools will be looked at with the lens of Bourdieu’s (1977, 1983, 1986) social, cultural, and education capital. The researcher will study each school individually in regard to the influence the individual schools have on generating social, cultural, and education capital in its students, and how this impacts the quality of student academic experience. This information is of interest to the researcher because Bourdieu’s theory suggests that higher levels of social and cultural capital lead to higher education capital and positively enhances students’ overall academic experience. The researcher believes that this information can be used by policy makers, district administrators, and school planners to consider boarding schools for some of their students.

Purpose of Study

The purpose of this study is to examine the environment of two boarding schools in order to determine if their environments promote social, cultural, and education capital. I use this information to discuss student experience. For purposes of this study, the school environment is defined as the atmosphere of the school, which is made up of schedules, routines, academic offerings, extra-curricular offerings, dormitory life, student’s accessibility of and relationship with faculty and staff members, and the overall school structure. The above was observed and studied with an eye for the promotion of social and cultural capital. This information was studied in light of Bourdieu’s (1977, 1983,
1986) research, which suggests that students with more social, cultural, and education capital perform at higher levels academically.

Data was collected as the researcher carefully examined the environment of two boarding schools by observing students and faculty while in their regular activities at each selected site, interviewing current and former boarding students of all stages in life, interviewing boarding school faculty and staff, and examining relevant schedules and documents at each selected site.

The questions that this researcher addressed included:

1. Does the boarding school environment promote [Boudieu's] social, cultural, and education capital?
2. Does the boarding school environment/structure increase academic achievement?
3. Do boarding schools meet the often unmet needs of disadvantaged students?
4. How do North American and South African boarding schools compare as an intervention?

Sub-question:
Are boarding schools a remedy?

Background and Context

Public schools, initially developed as common schools, were the first attempt of the federal government to provide an education for all students in the United States. The founding fathers saw the value of providing a general education for all citizens towards the end of creating a democratic society. The government facilitated the opening of these schools with the goal of providing an education for all citizens. The founding fathers who
developed and implemented the concept of common schools believed that education would improve life in the United States because citizens would be more equipped to lead lives that were more productive and fulfilling. Early advocates of education believed that literate, enlightened, and informed citizens would have a clearer understanding of how to operate in a democratic society.

The goal of schools in both North America and South Africa is still to promote the development of citizens who are well-informed critical thinkers capable of making tangible contributions. Education in South Africa had a different beginning, however, the education goals of the ministry of education in South Africa mirrors those of the goals stated by the United States Department of Education.

Background of South Africa’s System of Education

According to Krisztina Tihanyi (2006), the history of formal education in what is now South Africa originated in the Cape Colony and dates back to 1658. She states that these schools used the Bible as the textbook and taught little more than basic reading and writing. This territory was slave territory, and according to Tihanyi, their owners thought they would be more useful if they were literate. As a result, the first mission school, Lovedale, was opened in 1841. Tihanyi notes that mission schools played a significant role in black South African education because prior to 1953, they were the only schools that would accept Black students.

The advent of Apartheid threatened Black mission schools since the government posed that the Christian design of these schools jeopardized traditional African culture. The protection of African culture remained central in the argument for Apartheid. Under the Apartheid system, schools remained segregated, which magnified the different
purposes for, and types of education in Black and White schools. It was clear to Tihanyi that the purpose of Black education was simply to make them better servants. They were provided with minimal quality education, while White South Africans were provided with higher quality education that would prepare them to attend prestigious colleges and universities, and to work in professional higher status positions. The ending of Apartheid caused the ministry of education to shift their focus, deepening the commitment to providing equal opportunity in education to Black students.

According to the White paper *Education and Training in a Democratic South Africa: First Steps to Develop a New System*, approved by Cabinet in February 1995, “South Africa has 12 million learners, 366,000 teachers and around 28,000 schools - including 390 special needs schools and 1,000 registered private schools. Of all the schools, 6,000 are high schools (grade 7 to grade 12) and the rest are primary (grade 1 to grade 6).” The report goes on to note that compared with most other countries, education gets a really big slice of the pie - usually at least 20% of the total budget. This year, education received $59.7 billion, amounting to 24% of non-interest expenditure. This sounds like a lot, but is still not enough to go around. The budget was projected to increase by 8.5% for the next year, with most of the additional funds to be ploughed into the provinces. Apartheid is responsible for the deficits in some areas that are way behind in the funding they receive. It is difficult to recoup what was lost over a 40 year period.

The effects of Apartheid manifest itself through statistics. While 65% percent of Whites over 20 years old and 40% of Indians have a high school or higher qualification, this figure is only 14% among Blacks and 17% among the Colored population. Presently, schools in South Africa are characterized by diversity. In spite of disparities, the report
notes that schools and universities vary greatly in terms of quality, financial resources, ethos, and size. Consequently, high quality schools and universities are to be found in both the state and the private education sector.

The report further noted that as in the United States, most South African state schools are state-aided to some extent: the government provides the minimum, and parents contribute to basics and extras in the form of school fees, just as parents in the United States pay for school supplies, field trips, and other activity fees. School fees vary considerably across different regions of South Africa depending on factors such as class size, facilities, and the quality of teaching offered. Private schools account for about 2% of the country’s 12 million learners. In terms of definite numbers, private schools account for about 1,000 schools, a number that is growing all the time.

Due to the very recent abolishment of Apartheid in 1994, the South African ministry of education recognizes that a complete restructuring of the system is in order. According to the report, “Cabinet has agreed that South Africa’s pattern of school organization, governance and funding, which is a legacy of the Apartheid system, must be transformed in accordance with democratic values and practice, and the requirements of the Constitution” (Ministry of Education White Paper).

The Ministry of Education’s first White paper contains these words: New education and training policies to address the legacies of underdevelopment and inequitable development and provide equal opportunities for all will be based principally on the constitutional guarantees of equal educational rights for all persons and non-discrimination, and their formulation and implementation must also
scrupulously observe all other constitutional guarantees and protections which apply to education....

It should be a goal of education and training policy to enable a democratic, free, equal, just and peaceful society to take root and prosper in our land, on the basis that all South Africans without exception share the same inalienable rights, equal citizenship, and common national destiny and that all forms of bias (especially racial, ethnic, and gender) are dehumanizing.

This requires the active encouragement of mutual respect for our people's diverse religious, cultural and language traditions, their right to enjoy and practice these in peace and without hindrance, and the recognition that these are a source of strength for their own communities and the unity of the nation. (Education White Paper 1, pp. 19, 22)

The words in South Africa’s report suggest the need for effective alternative approaches towards equalizing schools. They recognize that the education provided must be equal and democratic, and must be provided through a system that embraces diversity, and one that empowers students through positive exposure to social and cultural capital. 

*Approaches to Education over the Years in the United States*

In the United States, early education efforts included large multi-age classrooms in which a teacher would attempt to teach everyone the basic reading, writing, and arithmetic. Over the years, approaches to educate students have changed. These changes are the result of efforts to improve the education of students in general, as well as
students who have been difficult to reach. To this end, many programs and alternative
types of schools have been added to the list of options school districts provide. Though
there have been pockets of success in several programs, such as certain charter and
magnet schools, and some after school programs, none of these efforts have proven
successful on a wide scale – especially in urban areas and in problematic schools. This
suggests that in decentralized systems with diverse populations, such as in the United
States and South Africa, implementing alternative programs and solutions would be an
effective strategy for addressing inequities and failed education systems. It further
suggests that existing boarding schools could be uniformly structured to provide students
with an environment necessary to promote social capital, cultural capital, and education
capital. This study suggests that existing boarding school environments may be a viable
alternative to day school for students who lack the benefits gained by exposure to social,

Bourdieu’s Capitals

Historically, most societies have been, and still remain, segregated and stratified
according to race, ethnicity, religion, and other perceptible characteristics found
throughout the human race. This is true of every society in which there is diversity among
constituents. In each case, the advantaged class finds ways to distinguish themselves so
that they maintain their positional advantage. One way that those of a higher social
economic status distinguishes and secures the future of their posterity is to provide their
children a higher quality of education. People of higher social economic status know the
power of knowledge and education and thus provide it to their children. These parents are,
in a sense, endowing their children with human capital/education capital. This
researcher will use the term education capital since human capital encompasses not only education, but all training and development.

*Education capital.* As described, education capital is a dimension of human capital. Through education, human capital is created by changes in persons that bring about skills and capabilities that make them able to act in new ways (Coleman, 1988). It represents educational attainment and academic achievement acquired in school. Education capital is clearly a benefit, most affordable and available to those of higher economic status (Bourdieu, 1977; DiMaggio, 1982; Fryer, 2003; Sullivan, 2001). Though it is the policy of most countries to educate their youth, the quality of education received by children in most countries correlates directly and positively with their social economic status. Additionally, parents of means are careful to expose their children to other children who are in their social and economic class through education, cultural and athletic activities.

Middle class and upper class families have several advantages over poor families in the pursuit of educational capital. Parents from middle and upper class backgrounds understand the system of education, they know how to monitor their children’s progress, they know a repertoire of ways to help their children when needed, and they have the power to enact necessary changes and/or interventions to ensure their children’s academic success. In short, they are usually empowered to be more involved in their children’s education, maintaining a birds-eye view of their children’s education. This position affords them more power in helping their children to succeed. As will be discussed in the section below on cultural capital, economic capital precedes cultural capital. Bourdieu (1983) continues to weave connections between social, capital, and
education capital, as he connects cultural and education capital in his statement that education, or ‘academic qualification’ was the institutionalized form of cultural capital. He states:

more precisely, cultural capital, whose diffuse, continuous transmission within the family escapes observation and control (so that the educational system, i.e., converted into a capital of qualifications, is subject to a more disguised but more risky transmission than economic capital. As the educational qualification, invested with the specific force of the official, becomes the condition for legitimate access to a growing number of positions, particularly the dominant ones, the educational system tends to increasingly dispossess the domestic group of the monopoly of the transmission of power and privileges – and among other things, of the choice of its legitimate heirs from among children of different sex and birth ranks. (p. 254)

Sandra Kerla (2003) believes that social capital and education capital are possibly linked together through children’s intergenerational learning experiences in their families, which she believes are children’s first learning experiences. She states: “[t]wo dimensions of social capital development bear resemblance to intergenerational programs” (p. 2). Kerla cites further research by Loewen (1996); Granville, (2002); and Kaplan; (2001), which states that “intergenerational learning fulfills age-appropriate developmental needs of youth and adults, is relational and reciprocal, and creates a community in which learning results through collective engagement in authentic activities” (p. 2). The fullness of the processes and actions surrounding this, and the
above concepts, are encapsulated in Bourdieu’s (1977) concept of social capital. A key dimension of social capital is attained partially through having access to education capital. Ideally, it is first experienced in the home; however, some children’s circumstances limit the quantity and quality of family and intergenerational learning. Some children only obtain education capital in schools or other structured educational settings. Through education, individuals gain access to other educated people. Having a variety of educated peers, with their varying skills and their own connections can increase the quantity and quality of human and physical resources available to individuals in order to accomplish their goals. According to Coleman (1988), the functions of education [human] capital and social capital are similar. He states: “Just as physical capital and education [human] capital facilitate productive activity, social capital does as well” (p. 101).

*Social capital.* Social capital represents the social networks of friends, associates, and connections that an individual can benefit from having. According to Astone, Nathanson, Schoen, and Kim (1999), the concept of social capital originated in sociology is being widely incorporated into much current social science. Bourdieu (1993) defines social capital as:

The aggregate of the actual or potential resources which are linked to possession of a durable network of more or less institutionalized relationships of mutual acquaintance and recognition – or in other words to membership in a group – which provides each of its members with the backing of the collectivity – owned capital a ‘credential’ which entitles them to credit, in the various senses of the word. (p. 249)
Social capital is built through the education process, attending social affairs, and through attending exclusive cultural events.

According to Bourdieu (1993), “The amount of social capital possessed by a given gent thus depends on the size of the network of connections he can effectively mobilize and on the volume of the capital posses in his own right by each of those to whom he is connected” (p. 249). The benefits of having social capital are clear. The more friends and connections one has in the right places, the easier it is for one to accomplish in academic, professional, and social arenas. Having friends and associates in places of influence greatly enhances one’s opportunities. Individuals with wider social networks have opportunities to be included in beneficial offerings such as programs, schools, employment, and even the attainment of information that many others will not be privy to. The more exclusive and exotic events, which are generally reserved for those who are most socially mobile, contribute to an individual’s cultural capital (Bourdieu, 1983).

*Cultural capital.* Cultural capital is defined as “a form of value associated with culturally authorized tastes, consumption patterns, attributes, skills, and awards” (Webb, Shirato, & Danaher, 2002, p. x). According to Bourdieu (1993), cultural capital can exist in three forms:

Cultural capital exists in the *embodied* state, i.e., in the form of long-lasting dispositions of the mind and body; in the *objectified* state, in the form of cultural goods (pictures, books, dictionaries, instruments, machines, etc.), which are the trace realization of theories or critiques of these theories, problematics, etc. and in the institutionalized state, a form of objectification which must be set apart because, as will be seen in the
case of educational qualifications, it confers entirely original properties on
the cultural capital which it is presumed to guarantee. (p. 243)

As the definition suggests, the cultural choices that one makes based upon his/her
value system, acting to determine the degree of cultural capital a person has. As
with any other investment, the investor must first see value in the activity or the
cultural object that he/she chooses to enjoy. Education and/or repeated exposure
to cultural capital is required in order for individual investors to be able to see the
value of making investments in cultural capital. People are trained to appreciate
elements of culture such as music, books, theatre, varieties of performing arts, art,
and athletic activities that contribute to cultural capital. This training takes place
both in the home and in schools as children are introduced to various cultural
elements, and as they are explained to them. This allows the individual to make
meaning of his/her experience. If the activity occurs without prior education, then
the child or person is not able to assign meaning to it, thus, not allowing him/her
to appreciate it, or to gain the full benefit of cultural capital.

The more cultural capital an individual possesses, the more likely they are to
attend events and activities that will expose them to other individuals in their same
privileged category. However, because of the monetary expenses associated with
attending many cultural events and activities, it is often cultural capital that separates
those who have economic capital from those who have not.

Regardless of income, Bourdieu (1993) notes that cultural capital cannot be
attained overnight. It is acquired over time depending on the time period, society, and
social class. Because of costs associated with many cultural activities, cultural capital
may be exploited by the wealthy. Certain events such as the opera, ballet performances, and international vacations have set those in a higher income bracket apart from the poor for years. Likewise, the children of more wealthy parents usually also have the benefit of exposure to expensive lessons that poor parents are unable to afford. Instrumental music and voice lessons, dance lessons, training in foreign languages, specialized prepping and tutoring, martial arts training, drawing and various other art lessons, swimming and other sports lessons, are all activities and lessons enjoyed by those who are middle class and upper class, but are not economically feasible for poorer parents.

*Capital benefits in sum.* Factors present in the lives of more affluent families include social, cultural, and academic capital (Bourdieu, 1977; DiMaggio, 1982; Fryer, 2003; Sullivan, 2001). Middle class families know the value of networking and exposing their children to other children of well connected parents. Thus, these children are likely to have more exposure to opportunities, which result in an increased number of life chances. Middle class families are also more likely to expose their children to cultural events and experiences that enhance their lives, increase their conceptual understanding of school subjects, and ultimately their chances of success in school. Poor children lack the capital that generates other capital(s), leaving them susceptible to a life of continued poverty. These notions are supported by Bourdieu’s (1983) discussion of the forms of capital. He goes on to explain how social capital and cultural capital are interrelated and can later be converted into economic capital.

Just as it is said that it takes money (capital) to make money, it also takes capital to increase in the same, or to generate other types of capital. Educational, social, and cultural capitals build upon each other and there is a positive, correlative, and an
accumulative relationship between these measures of capital (Bourdieu 1977, 1993, 1996). As explained above in the relationship between education and social capital, attaining education presents opportunity for the development of worthwhile and beneficial social relationships. Further, the attainment of cultural capital takes education, and many cultural activities add meaning to more structured classroom education. Connections made through these social relationships often present opportunities for enhanced career opportunities, which further increase social capital. Social capital and education capital work together to open doors of opportunity for the attainment of cultural capital, especially since invitations to cultural events are often the result of school functions and social relationships. Further, expensive cultural events can be afforded through economic capital, education capital, or social capital; all earned as a result of attaining a quality and conclusive education. There is a great potential for social relationships to form as an individual attends more cultural events. This is how the benefits earned through social, cultural, and education capital multiply and reproduce.

The capital model (see Figure 1) is like a spiraling sphere. One must start with one form of capital, usually economic capital. From this, the other forms of capital build and spiral outward as the capital circle turns. The relationship between these capitals is such that they build and grow one another. In her operationalization of Bourdieu’s capitals, Silva and Edwards (2003) discusses the role of economic capital in the production of other capitals. She says of Bourdieu: “Bourdieu (1977) himself appears to place economic capital at the root of other capitals, although he regards each form of
Figure 1: Spiral Capital model

Explanation: Economic capital would be in the center (demonstrating that economic capital is generally necessary to start building other forms of capital), the other capitals (social, cultural capital, education) would be on the lines that spin off from the middle and would be written repeatedly. The model is to show how the various capitals (social, cultural, and education) are connected, and how the capitals build off of each other to create the spiral model.

capital as possessing its own dynamic, as well as varied possibilities of ‘packaging’ different levels and types of capitals” (p. 2). Silva further notes John Goldthorpe’s (1996) similar opinion. She discusses the fact that he also sees economic capital as central, extrapolating from his work: “Participation in culture depends on economic position rather than on taste and judgment, within a framework that views economic capital as more significant than cultural capital in allowing individuals to mobilize more resources” (p. 2). Educationally, this is good news for the capitalist, or middle class child, who is able to start life with an initial investment capital of connected parents with their own education and enough economic capital to provide their children with a quality education. According to Sullivan (2001), “Cultural capital is associated with social class, and is
transmitted from parents to children” (p. 911). The capital sphere model demonstrates why it is difficult for children from poor households to generate capital. This child will need ‘outside investors’ to endow him/her with the necessary capital to start building capital on his/her own. Outside investors for children like this often come in the form of a benevolent mentor or through superior schooling. The boarding school alternative is at the center of this analysis.

**Boarding School Environment**

For purposes of this study, the boarding school environment was defined as the following: a controlled residential educational environment in which students are scheduled in educational, social, and physical activities, from morning until the end of the day. These activities include classes, meal times, study times, intramural sports, clubs, tutorials, extra-curricular activities, and social time with dorm parents and peers. This ‘environment’ is generally universal, and can be termed a dimension of boarding school culture. Though usually very similar, the exact schedules, routines, and cultures, individual boarding schools vary due to school mission and the style of administration. Based on a review of the literature, this researcher believes that this controlled environment, unique to boarding schools, will have an impact on students’ academic experience.

**Worthy of Comparison?**

The fact that boarding schools or the residential structure is in existence in countries all over the world leaves room for comparison between various schools from a variety of cultures. Comparing phenomena brings an enlightenment that studying only one source cannot bring. Comparing is a way of making sense of and contextualizing
information from two different sources. Making comparisons brings about a deeper understanding of the phenomenon of interest. Without comparison, Berry (1980) notes, “[d]ifferences, similarities, co-variation, and cause cannot be observed or inferred” (p. 2). Comparison also brings forth a deeper comprehension of each of the two objects or places being compared. Ideally, the deeper understanding of the phenomena of interest will bring about a basis for the improvement of one or both of the phenomena being studied. According to Brown and Sechrest, (1980) cross cultural research “can fulfill a necessary and valuable role in the advancement of theoretical knowledge, particularly in those areas of study where answers cannot be found within an individual culture” (p. 315).

In this study, a comparison was made between elements of two different boarding schools, located in two very different geographical locations, in an effort to evaluate the degree to which the schools instill and promote educational, social, and cultural capital. The study was made between the Douglas Boarding School, located in the United States, and the Bailey Boarding School, located in South Africa.

*Why South Africa as a Basis for Comparison?*

A South African school was selected to compare to a school in the United States for three main reasons. The first is because of the comparable features between the United States and South Africa in that both countries struggle with similar issues for students who have been disadvantaged. This researcher preferred to compare the United States school with one that had students of African descent, European descent, and a smaller population of others. This was important to the researcher because this is the ethnic and racial makeup of the students of the Bailey boarding school in the United States and the researcher wanted to have as many comparable features between the study
schools as possible. Although the countries are geographically thousands of miles apart, the United States and South Africa have much in common. The main similarity is that both countries were colonized by Europeans. This colonization had a substantial and detrimental impact on both countries and their systems of education. Both countries experienced, and continue to experience, a great deal of segregation. Though 40 years apart, downtrodden and/or disadvantaged groups from both countries fought for the passage of desegregation laws in schools, as well as in society at large. A further similarity is that both countries continue to seek effective reform strategies for their schools. After Apartheid was officially abolished in 1994, South African ministers of education desired to dismantle and rebuild the system of education. “The overall plan for educational transformation was first focused on quantitative or structural reforms to dismantle the segregated systems which had existed for Whites, Africans, Coloureds, and Asians respectively” (Napier, Brook, Labela, and Zunga, 2003, p. 2). Ironically, South Africa selected the United States as a model even though the United States has been quite unsuccessful in desegregating and reforming its own system of education. As Napier and colleagues note: “[t]he blueprint for a single, nonracial education system was developed with significant infusions of influence from the United States…” (p. 2).

The second reason the researcher chose South Africa was to pursue a prior interest in South African education. After a short visit to the country, the researcher was fascinated with the life of South Africans before and after Apartheid. Being an educator, the researcher’s curiosity was piqued as to how schools were affected.

The third but most prevailing reason for using South Africa in this study was because of access and opportunity. Desire and compatibility for completing any study
mean very little without access and opportunity to enter the desired school, territory, or

country.

The researcher predicted that her research would find that the motives for sending
students to boarding schools in the United States and South Africa will be different. The
researcher also recognized that the structure of the schools would likely differ slightly.
However, notwithstanding these differences, the role of the selected boarding schools in
exposing students to academic, social, and cultural capital would be compared.

Significance of Study

Boarding or residential schools are a less common, though highly effective,
alternative to traditional public schools. Unlike in the United Kingdom where boarding
schools are widely accepted, most families in the United States do not think of sending
their children away to school before college (Levine, 1980). Since their inception,
boarding schools have been used as a transformative tool. Schools were developed to take
children as they were received, and to make capital deposits into the children, which in
turn would transform the children into the young adults that the school planners and
visionaries desired. Their goal was to develop children into young adults that would
become the most valuable contributors to society possible. Though many of the early
visionaries had the same basic goal, they had different target markets and different
strategies for reaching their various targets. The different markets included wealthy
children, who would be groomed for prestigious college prep schools; Native Americans,
who would be trained to work and function in mainstream society; African North
Americans who would be educated for college or gainful trades, and schools for orphans
and troubled youth.
Present day boarding schools can be structured to not only limit capital benefits of their environment to a fortunate few, but to endow more students with the necessary social and cultural capital to succeed in their various careers. Through their unique structure, offerings, and programs, they have the ability to expose their students to valuable forms of capital including social, cultural, and education capital. The extent that this is currently done through the boarding school structured environment was examined in this study. The researcher also examined the impact the manifestation of social, cultural, and education capital affected student experience. As previously stated, a boarding school in the United States and one in South Africa was studied to determine the degree of social, cultural, and education capital the schools offer their students.

This study examined the impact of the boarding school environment on the social cultural and education capital of the students who attended them. In this analysis, two schools were examined: one in the United States and one in South Africa. Presently, there is very little empirical data available on the benefits of boarding schools.

Since so little research has been conducted in this area, additional intensive study is warranted on boarding schools and their environments in order to reach concrete conclusions as to the degree of their impact on student academic experience. Like most private and alternative schools, boarding schools offer academic programs boasting varying strengths and points of academic focus. The large number of variables that may affect the outcome of boarding school studies limited the prospect for concrete conclusions. These variables included varying offerings between the schools being compared, varying cultures between the schools, both nationally and internationally,
varying desires of parents from school to school, and the varying needs and desires of the students.

According to Weatherford (2000), boarding schools are making a comeback. This researcher hopes that this study will contribute to the comeback. This study is important to the field of education because knowledge of the potential role of the boarding school environment towards the gain of social, cultural, and academic capital in students is powerful. This information might lead parents to consider and make different choices concerning their children’s education, and may eventually even lead to changes in educational policy in at least the two countries in the study. One of the goals of both the United States Department of Education and the South African Ministry of Education has been to close achievement gaps and to facilitate learning in a more equitable setting. The results of this study may lead to policies that would promote the establishment of programs that would allow students to attend existing boarding schools, or towards the establishment of public boarding schools as viable alternatives to the traditional public school system for students who lack the benefits of having social, cultural, and/or academic capital.

In sum, the researcher studied the two schools for their impact on students’ acquisition of social, cultural, and education capital. I acquired this information by conducting careful observations, surveys, interviews, and through studying relevant documents. After analyzing the data, the researcher believes that the research provided the information necessary to make a determination as to the impact of the boarding school environment on students’ acquisition of Bourdieu’s capitals on their academic experience (1977, 1983, 1986). The next chapter, the literature review, will discuss
relevant literature and delve further into the impact of Bourdieu’s capitals on student experience, boarding school history, the success of the A Better Chance Organization, and provide some examples of present day boarding schools.
CHAPTER TWO

Literature Review

This review of the literature will provide background information on how Bourdieu’s (1977, 1983, 1986) social and cultural capital influences students’ education capital and their overall academic achievement. This information will enlighten the reader on the important roles social and cultural capital play in student academic experience. A brief history of boarding schools in the United States is included to enlighten the reader on the longevity and purposes of past boarding schools. A history of boarding schools in South Africa would have been the next logical rendering; however, there was a lack in the literature in this area. Following the discussion on the history of boarding schools in the United States, the A Better Chance (ABC) organization is introduced and discussed since the mission of the organization is to expose talented, under represented minorities to social, cultural, and education capital. Likewise the book Blacks in the White Establishment is highlighted since it also demonstrated the power of providing talented African American students with the opportunity to attend prestigious boarding schools that were known to promote social and cultural capital. Next, the needs of students are discussed with regard to social and cultural capital; and finally, present day boarding schools are discussed for their mission and impact on students.

There is a dearth of research on boarding schools in general in both the United States and South Africa. Much is assumed; however, little research has actually been conducted on the effect that the boarding school environment can have on increasing social, cultural, and education (human) capital. Levine (1980) noted that at the time of his research, only two books had been written on boarding schools.
Boarding schools are once again slowly emerging as a solution for many of the problems facing low performing students. Boarding schools provide a stable, supportive, protective, and nurturing environment that facilitates students performing to their full potential. As stated above, there are currently no studies, however, that measure and/or evaluate the effectiveness of boarding schools for their ability to increase the education, social, or cultural capital in students, and nothing to measure how this affects student experience.

*Boarding School Histories*

*Boarding School in the United States*

Boarding schools began in the United States in the late 1700s when Phillips Academy opened in Andover, Massachusetts. The Andover academy and schools like it are evidence that boarding schools have long been utilized by the wealthy to expose and make available to their children educational, social, and cultural capital. Though boarding schools vary in purpose, clientele, prestige, and their ability to provide their students with what they need to succeed, these schools were designed to produce students who were better prepared in their future academic endeavors or their careers. Boarding schools were employed by the wealthy class when they wanted to distinguish their children from others.

Seven of the top 12 boarding schools were founded in the 23-year period between 1883 and 1906 Levine (1980). Levine discusses the work of Baltzell (1964) and McLachlan (1970), who have written books on the development of boarding schools, and note that the upper class began the practice of sending their sons to boarding schools in the late 19th century. Private boarding schools faced a major slump in the 1880s and
1890s due to the development of public high schools, but were able to rebound when they changed their focus to preparing students for college. At the same time, they raised academic standards, and tightened their control over the nonacademic aspect of student life. These distinguishing factors set boarding schools apart from public high schools and ensured their survival (Levine, 1980).

According to Levine (1980), boarding schools were prospering by 1906. He cites Baltzell’s explanation – rapid industrialization of the economy in the United States – as the basis for the success and rapid growth experienced by boarding schools. Levine’s research includes a theory that brings to light his explanation of why the boarding school concept was developed. This concept, adopted from Weber’s work (1960), is consistent with the work of Bourdieu (1977, 1983, 1986). Weber’s model, called social closure, emphasizes how specific subculture groups, especially those of higher social economic status, use education to advance their own interest.

Social closure is the result of the protection of one’s own social status and interest through the self promotion of academic, social, and cultural capital discussed above. Bourdieu (1977, 1983, 1986) further advances Weber’s (1960) model, noting that within his theory is the intention of those of higher social economic status to maximize their own rewards by restricting access to rewards and opportunities to a limited circle of ‘eligibles’ – those like themselves. Levine (1980) demonstrated the application of this theory by revealing that the founders of the top three boarding schools were also founders of the top universities: Princeton, Harvard, and Yale. In short, he believed that the creation and operation of these schools perpetuated a separation of the upper class and elite from other classes in society, and was the elite’s attempt to ensure that ‘commoners’
were not permitted within their ranks. This separation kept the schools exclusive, highly desired of the wealthy, thus highly selective, limiting their enrollment to a fortunate few.

Boarding School Models for African Americans and Native Americans

Boarding schools were used in an effort to provide African American students with adequate educational opportunity. African American boarding schools, also operational during the same time frame, reported success for their students. Social capital, as well as a commitment to providing a quality education, is no doubt part of the reason for their success.

Visionaries and missionaries also sought to provide African Americans with an opportunity for a structured and quality education through a boarding school education. They were first developed for African American students in the 1800s and 1900s when schools were still segregated. Piney Woods in Mississippi is an example of just one of these schools. Dr. Charles Beady Jr., the president of the Piney Woods, states: “[t]he schools that became boarding schools were the only places in a particular community where Blacks could be educated.” Though the onset of desegregation marked the demise of most of these boarding schools, they were extremely successful at providing a quality education while they were fully operational.

Dr. Lucy Reuben, provost of North Carolina Central University, who attended a Black boarding school known as Mather School in Beaufort, South Carolina, states: “[i]t was an excellent educational option, and it is the kind of option I wish we had available today” (Roach, p. 19). These schools played a significant role for African Americans in the 1800s and 1900s.
These African American boarding schools proved their ability to educate African Americans by noting the accomplishments and reactions of their alumni. Gilbert Academy, located in New Orleans, Louisiana, a private boarding school for African North Americans, boasts of its successful alumni. Their alumni include: former United Nations Ambassador, Andrew Young; noted writer Tom Dent, author of the critically acclaimed 1996 civil rights movement retrospective, *Southern Journey*; jazz pianist Ellis Marsalis, father of Grammy and Pulitzer prize-winning trumpeter Wynton Marsalis; and Mickey Patterson, a track star and the first African American woman to win an Olympic medal (Lomax, 2003). Dr. Rosa Payne Epps, graduate of an African American boarding school, Palmer Memorial Institute in Sedalia, North Carolina, says of the school: “[i]t was a wonderful education. It was culturally enriching and a great education.” Epps, who went to school as a 12-year-old ninth-grader, along with her brother, recalls having the time of her life as a student. Further, Delphine Patton Sneed, currently an arts instructor at the University of Maryland-Baltimore County, graduated in 1968 from Palmer. Sneed states: “[i]t was a wonderful experience...it was culturally enriching and a great education...it was the best thing my parents did for me...it was really a life-altering experience” (Roach, 2003, p. 20). Sneed says she was a shy awkward teenage girl who had grown up in the South Bronx before her mother sent her off as a tenth grader. She says that the school provided a transforming experience that helped her to develop into ‘quite a socially aware young lady.’ These testimonials represent a few of the many success stories that have come from boarding schools for minorities; however, these schools are no longer considered as viable options (Roach).
Dozens of private Black boarding schools were in operation in the 1800s and 1900s. For the first half of the twentieth century, Black boarding schools, which numbered between eighty and one hundred, were a safe place from racial strife during the Jim Crow segregation years. However, that number has dropped to just four schools: Laurinburg Institute, North Carolina; Pine Forge Academy, Pennsylvania; Piney Woods, Mississippi; and Redemption Christian Academy, New York (Hawkins, 1997; Roach, 2003). In her article, Hawkins quotes Joan Ratteray, president and founder of the Washington, DC based Institute for Independent Education, stating: “[t]his model for education is working, but like other independent schools, it isn’t taken seriously by the mainstream education community.” Additionally, Piney Woods president and urban education and motivation expert, Beady, blames a lack of support for the decline of Black boarding schools. In his interview, Beady notes the effect that integration had on Black boarding schools. He explains: “[i]ntegration led to the feeling that because we were free to attend schools of our choice, those schools that supported us when we had no choice were no longer needed. Most ceased to exist” (Hawkins, p. 20). Reports from The Association of Boarding Schools (TABS) in Washington, DC state: “[w]hile Black boarding schools are struggling to bolster the number of students on campus, the number of students of color entering traditionally White residential schools has tripled since 1985” (Hawkins, p. 20). Students of color are beginning to consider both public and private boarding schools in record numbers.
Native Americans in Boarding Schools

Educators with assimilation in mind used the boarding school model in educating Native American children. Boarding schools were used as a tool by missionaries to remove Native American children from their homes in order to teach them English and to teach them how to function in mainstream society. According to Marr (1998), “The goal of Indian education from the 1880s through the 1920s was to assimilate Indian people into the dominant culture of America by placing them in institutions where traditional ways could be replaced by those sanctioned by government.” Lomawaima (1994) calls the establishment of off-reservation boarding schools a ‘federal crusade’, part of its “grand civilizing plan to transform Native North American people” (p. xi). In short, the goal of the missionaries was to immerse Native North American children into the dominant culture. It was thought that it would be easier and more efficient to the student’s learning process to remove them from their homes where English was generally not spoken, and typical mainstream cultural behaviors were generally not observed. They wanted to immerse and indoctrinate these children. Though some of these schools still exist, their mission and end results remain controversial. The boarding school environment served to strip Native American children of the benefits (both social and emotional) of their being with their families at home; however, one factor that this researcher noticed in Lowawaima’s account of life at a Chilocco Boarding school is that social capital that was added to the students who attended.

In They Called it Prairie Light, Lomawaima (1994) discusses life at Chilocco Boarding School, a federal school for Native Americans. The closeness encouraged by the boarding school environment is noted as strengthening the students in some ways.
Lomawaima writes: “[t]he fact that schools often strengthened rather than dissolved tribal identity is not the only surprise tucked within alumni reminiscence” (p. xiii). She further notes the strength and closeness of the relationships formed in Chilocco. Lomawaima states: “Chilocco students defined successful adaptation to the boarding school in terms of their own experience, creating an honor code of admirable behavior that stressed peer group loyalty in kinship terms: ‘[w]e were brothers and sisters’” (p. xiv). So although these students suffered from a lack of social capital in their homes and communities, they were able to reap the benefits of other sources of social capital at school. The boarding school environment allowed the emergence of a new source of social capital for these Native American students, even under difficult, oppressive, and often uncomfortable circumstances.

*Bourdieu on Social and Cultural Capital*

Bourdieu’s (1977) groundbreaking work on the influence of social and cultural capital on educational achievement alerted educators to their importance. He found a strong and direct correlation between student academic experience and social and cultural capital, and further between social and cultural capital. Bourdieu asserts that school systems are designed to favor and facilitate the continued success of students who are rich in cultural capital. He writes that schools have built-in systems of reward that cater to students who come from higher status families that have higher levels of cultural capital making it difficult for students to succeed in the educational system (Bourdieu; Sullivan, 2001). This is because much of the education obtained in the classroom has traditionally been based on what is learned in cultural activities. This knowledge can empower educators and policy makers to make decisions that would increase the likelihood of
students benefiting from schools and educational program designs with the expressed purpose of increasing the quality and quantity of children’s social and cultural capital.

*The Impact of Cultural Capital on Educational Achievement*

Cultural capital is a key factor in upward mobility and in generating other forms of capital. According to Bourdieu (1977), DiMaggio (1982), and Roscigno and Ainsworth-Darnell (1999), class transmission is possible through the attainment of cultural capital. Lamont and Lareau (1988) define cultural capital as “widely shared, high status cultural signals (attitudes, preferences, formal knowledge, behaviors, goods, and credentials) used for social and cultural exclusion” (p. 156). This definition operationalizes cultural capital as a type of exclusive and elite club that only a select lucky few are privy to become members. However exclusive, cultural capital must be made available to all students if they are to have an equal opportunity at academic success. Sullivan (2001) states that if indeed the education system assumes the possession of cultural capital (as Bourdieu supposes), then “there is a great deal of inefficiency in ‘pedagogic transmission’ …because students simply do not understand what their teachers are trying to get across” (p. 894). Not only must students be exposed to cultural capital, they must also gain the education necessary to assign meaning to what they have been exposed to.

DiMaggio (1982) conducted a study in which he measured and evaluated the impact of cultural capital on school success. He found that cultural capital had a significant impact on grades when family background and measured ability were controlled. His study also discussed upward mobility as a result of enhanced cultural
capital. He finds: “[a]ctive participation in prestigious status cultures may be a practical and useful strategy for low status students who aspire towards upward mobility” (p. 190).

Sullivan (2001) concluded from her study that cultural capital is associated with social class, and is transmitted from parents to children. She also found that schools do not provide cultural capital. She notes:

Neither social class nor educational credentials are significant once parental cultural capital has been included. This shows the effect of these background variables on pupils’ cultural activities is mediated by parents’ cultural capital…. (p. 902)

According to Sullivan’s research, students who do not have parents possessing social or cultural capital are destined for lower levels of academic achievement. Therefore, schools that make it their aim and are actually able to increase their students’ cultural capital are theoretically setting themselves up to be more successful than those that only focus on raw test scores and other one dimensional measures of academic achievement.

*Cultural Capital Imparted Through Educational Intervention*

Fryer (2003) defines educational interventions as “any program that seeks to differentiate and improve the educational environment for inner-city youth by on-site or ‘remote training’” (p. 16). This definition is used in his discussion on programs that target secondary school students and have as their goal to increase students’ cultural capital. In his cultural capital model, he demonstrates that effective interventions – especially remote training, when students are removed from their homes – have a significant effect on student educational achievement.
In his discussion, Fryer (2003) notes the success of several programs that alter the student’s environments in order to achieve their goals. He presents the successes of Job Corps and Job Start. The difference between these programs is that Job Corps is residential, while students in Job Start live at home. Fryer points out that Job Corps boasts significantly higher rates of success. Fryer notes the distinction between the success rates being the residential component. This may be the result of higher quality social capital since the students are constantly surrounded by like minded peers and fewer distractions from outside negative peer pressure.

Another of the more successful programs Fryer (2003) discusses is *A Better Chance* (ABC) which is an organization designed to increase the life chances of high potential minority children who lack social and cultural capital. Most of the children selected for ABC are also economically disadvantaged. In one of their programs, students are enrolled in better schools that place them in other private homes that promise to be more conducive towards their goal of receiving a quality education. One of the students says this of her alternative living arrangement:

I felt I could be more involved with my studies here [in my host family]. At home, I would be distracted by peer pressures to hang out, smoke and drink. Here, I can focus on the academics. You face peer pressure wherever you go, but at Radnor there are more kids into their studies.

(Fryer, p. 18)

This student clearly appreciates the positive environment and higher quality of social capital provided by her new environment.
Radnor, being a school for more affluent students, likely offers curricula and activities that contribute to its student’s cultural capital. Additionally, this student is clearly experiencing valuable gains from a higher quality (educationally) of social capital through matriculating with and befriending other students who are serious about their studies. This student recognizes the combined positive impact of being placed in a more suitable environment and a quality school on her education capital. In addition to placing students in more conducive study environments, ABC also has a boarding school program which boasts even greater successes.

*ABC*:

As previously noted, moving up in social status is difficult (Bourdieu, 1977, 1983). Status and class are usually passed down from the parent to the child. Upper class (or lower class) status is usually gained as a birth right as opposed to through work or effort. The ranks of the middle and upper classes are protected by education, language, and private invitations. It is rare that members from low class backgrounds are inducted to middle or upper class ‘clubs.’ The founders of ABC sought to beat the odds by positioning lower class, poorer students to be accepted into the middle and upper classes through providing access to higher quality social, cultural, and education capital. Their strategy in doing this is to remove students from their negative home environments and to place them in culturally, socially, and education rich environments. ABC’s programs are founded upon, and base their structure upon, Bourdieu’s theory of the role of social, cultural, and education capital in providing opportunities for social mobility and better overall life chances for program participants. For this reason, ABC is discussed at length in this section.
ABC was formed in 1963 during the civil rights era in an effort to provide higher quality educational access and opportunity to low income students from lower socio-economic status environments. The over-arching goal of the organization was to prepare students for possible later entry into the middle class. Included in the programs designed and supported by ABC is the prep school program, after-school weekend, or summer tutoring aimed at improving student performance at their home schools, and upward bound. The program was founded by 16 independent secondary schools with the assistance of Dartmouth College, the Merrill Foundation, and the Rockefeller Foundation (Zweigenhaft & Domhoff, 1991).

In Zweigenhaft and Domhoff’s (1991) book, *Blacks in the White Establishment? A Study of Race and Class in America*, the ABC boarding school program is discussed. In this discussion, the impact of the opportunity for at-risk youth to attend elite boarding schools is examined in the case studies of several at-risk students who participated in the ABC boarding school program. The boarding school program “…took students away from their homes, their neighborhoods, and their local high schools to attend the finest secondary schools in the country. These students were being brought into contact with the top one-half of one percent of the social structure, the rich and the super-rich” (Zweigenhaft & Domhoff, p. 3).

Students were admitted to the ABC boarding school program by being selected by their teachers or counselors, participating schools, and by testing well. Students who participated in the program were first put through an eight week summer orientation program designed to act as a bridge to improve what were termed ‘social and academic deficiencies.’ After the summer program, students were placed in some of the most elite
boarding schools in the country. Students often faced prejudice and ignorance upon entering the boarding schools; however, the situation ended positively for most of the students who participated in the program. In 1966, the year pinpointed for study by Zweigenhaft and Domhoff (1991), 430 students joined the program. About 70% of the students were Black, and the other 30% included Hispanic, Asian, Native American and students from Eskimo backgrounds. The originators traveled to low-income junior high schools throughout the East, Midwest, and South to introduce and recruit for the program.

Most of the interviewees discussed above from Zweitenhaft and Domhoff’s (1991) research reported having enjoyed their experiences in their summer programs. These positive experiences were largely the result of the quality and quantity of social and cultural capital that they were able to develop through their participation. They had many exciting experiences that they may have never had if they had not been a part of ABC. Bobette Reed Kahn, a 1966 ABC participant, discussed her trip to Tanglewood to hear classical music, her experience playing field hockey, learning to swim, taking ballet, and learning to order a meal at a restaurant. Students were also taught ‘proper table manners’ during family meals with visiting friends and relatives. Girls were expected to wear dresses, and boys wore suit coats and ties. The researchers/authors report that most of the past ABC participants enjoyed their summer experiences at Dartmouth, Mount Holyoke, Williams, Duke, or Carleton. In addition to the cultural training and events, the summer program also had an academic component. The summer schedule included nine hours of English literature per week, six hours of reading instruction, and nine hours of Math. Informal athletics were also included in the daily schedule.
One of the beneficial features of the summer program was that the students who went through it together remained friends for life. Though they were often sent to different boarding schools, they were brought together on occasion for mixers. These students formed an invaluable network of other students of color who were students of prestigious boarding schools, and they remained in contact for years to come.

Unfortunately, the shortage of program funding later reduced the summer program from eight weeks, to six weeks, to two weeks, to one day; however, the ABC program still sends talented students of color to elite boarding schools.

*Reported Long Term ABC Successes*

Though a few of the students in the ABC study had adjustment issues and dropped out of the boarding schools, the majority of the students did extremely well in school and went on to prestigious colleges. The researchers (Zweitenhaft & Domhoff, 1991) conducted a study of the percentage of students who went on to college. In the study, the control group consisted of students who were selected for ABC, but were unable to obtain a placement at a boarding school. Of the students who actually attended and graduated from the boarding schools, 94% of the students went on to prestigious colleges. Of those who did not attend, only 62% entered college. Not only were the students more likely to enter college, but they were more likely to enter Ivy League schools. The most popular choices of schools for ABC graduates were Harvard, Dartmouth, University of Pennsylvania, and Tuffs. Others in the top choices also comprised prestigious schools.

ABC also appears to have an impact on students entering top graduate programs as well.
Perry’s study also supports our interview finding that after graduating from college, ABC students were likely to attend top graduate and professional programs. He found that among the first ABC college graduates, 40 percent entered graduate school immediately, and at least half the others expressed the intention of doing so… ‘It is apparent,’ noted Perry, ‘that they were continuing in the elite channel which began with their enrollment in independent [private] school nearly ten years ago. (Zweigenhaft & Domhoff, 1991, p. 70)

After graduating from top graduate and professional schools, many ABC graduates (both men and women) go on to become high ranking government officials, noted politicians, doctors, lawyers, and business officials. The boarding schools had not only given the ABC participants increased access and opportunity; they exposed the students to new possibilities and new ways of seeing, thinking, and knowing through their increased exposure to social and cultural capital. The elite boarding school experience permitted the students to dream wider. Their new dreams and ranges of perspective are perhaps what most motivated and inspired ABC students to achieve greater feats than they might have otherwise aspired to.

*Greater Social Capital Gained Through Boarding School Environment?*

The current structure of day schools in the United States is becoming less social. One example of this is that many elementary schools are no longer scheduling mandatory recess for their students, leaving discretion to the teachers. With this structure, there is no guarantee that students have an opportunity to play with those from other classes. And for the children who actually make it out to recess, many no longer choose to socialize in
traditional manners. Hand held games are fast becoming the chosen way to ‘play.’ The use of technology in the classroom and at home is also threatening the quantity and quality of social interaction in the classroom, as well as at home. At the high school level, many districts are shortening their days and removing classes that are thought to be ‘no longer necessary’ in an effort to save money for the districts. The net effect of these restructuring efforts at both the elementary, as well as the secondary level, is that students are matriculating with fewer social interactions, thus possibly gaining less social capital.

In boarding schools, students are together 24 hours each day. By design, students are forced to interact constantly. Typically boarding school days begin around 7:00 a.m. and end at 10:00 p.m. Students’ days include all meals, athletics, and a study period, all with the same peers. Although there is generally some free time built in, it too is usually spent with other students from school, unless students choose to rest alone. There are few ‘private’ spaces in the boarding school environment.

All of their social events, study time, work time, sports time, and classes are with the same group of students. Boarding schools often have fewer students, making it easier for students to become closer knit. Although this may be limiting in some respects, it opens doors in others. Boarding school students and staff function like family for the students, making the social capital richer and deeper (Zweigenhaft & Domhoff, 1991).

_At-Risk Students and Their Need for Social Capital_

At-risk students have the same needs as all other students. Studies by McWhirter (1993, 1998), Lerner, Fisher, and Weinberg (2001), and Csikszentmihalyi (1991, 1997, 2001) all support the fact that the effects of the factors that render children at risk can be minimized when key basic needs are met. These needs include food, clothing, appropriate
shelter, safety, security, appropriate academic instruction, consistency in surroundings, appropriate atmosphere for study, academic support and resources, encouragement, discipline imposed, and structure. In addition to their basic physical needs, children’s social and cultural needs must also be appropriately addressed. When one or more of these needs are not met, most students are unable to function at their ultimate levels and may never reach their full academic potential. They will not discover their ‘flow’ academically, socially, or occupationally, as Csikszentmihalyi (1983) discusses in his research.

Larson, Dworkin, and Gilman (2001) discuss the effect of family management on adolescents’ ability to manage their own time and to incorporate meaningful activities into their schedules. The variables they used to measure family management were mothers’ amount of time devoted to child-supportive activities, the presence of family routines, and firm parenting; which includes enforcing rules and maintaining parental control. Larson et al. hypothesize that routines make family life more predictable, facilitate communication, and coordination with parents.

Rathunde (2001) elaborates on the importance of family support in his research on the importance of family support on the quality of an adolescents’ experience. This family support provides the essential social capital necessary for optimal learning and scholastic performance. Rathunde conducted a longitudinal study in which he surveyed adolescents in an effort to find their perceived levels of family support. He surveyed 247 youth of diverse ethnic backgrounds and socioeconomic statuses over a period of three years. He found that youth (studied for one year), who perceived more family support, reported more positive moods two years later. Rathunde states, “Results confirmed that
levels of family support and challenge in Year 1 could predict adolescents’ momentary moods and focus on important goals two years later” (p. 168). It is important to note that family challenge (pushing by the family towards goals) is as important as family support in his study. He finds that “increases in support and challenge were linked with the development of undivided interest or a synchrony of positive moods while engaging in important goals” (Rathunde, p. 168). Rathunde demonstrates in his results that each dynamic (support and challenge) is equally important. He indicates that social capital in the form of family support is key in the development in a child’s interests and ability to set worthwhile goals.

In his longitudinal study, Hektner (2000) found, as the old proverb states, that “it takes a village to raise a child.” He set out to find what factors positively affected adolescent autonomy, concentration, intrinsic motivation, and goal-directedness during productive activities. He followed a diverse national sample over a two year period to measure the impact of the above variables. His results implied that the combined positive reinforcement by teachers, parents, and communities work in harmony to promote positive youth development by maintaining an environment rich in interpersonal support, autonomy, and opportunities to pursue challenges related to future goals. Hektner’s research indicates that social capital from many sources is necessary for adolescents to reach their optimal physical and academic development potential.

McWhirter, McWhirter, McWhirter, and McWhirter (1997) distinguish between at risk and resilient youth and note that there are definite categorical differences between the two. They believe that the characteristics including likes, dislikes, talents, disabilities, strengths and weaknesses that distinguish between at risk and resilient youth are
developed through their contact with society, home and school. The need for social capital is clearly indicated here in the research findings of McWhirter et al. They further state that these characteristics eventually become ingrained in the personalities of individuals. At-risk children, McWhirter et al. state, “…do not acquire all the knowledge behaviors, skills they need to become successful adults” (p. 81).

The cycle that most at-risk children follow demonstrates the importance of catching problems early and dealing with them aggressively. McWhirter et al. (1997) note that when they reviewed studies of at-risk youth, they found that these youth exhibit ‘multiple problem syndrome.’ In these unfortunate cases, one problem usually leads to another. School dropout, drug abuse, pregnancy, delinquency, teen pregnancy, and youth suicide, they state, are all problems (in various combinations) that often occur in at-risk youth.

Werner (1984) discusses characteristics of resilient youth that lead to their success. These characteristics include an active approach to life’s problems, a tendency to perceive pain, frustration, and other distressing experiences constructively, the ability to gain positive attention from others, and a strong faith that maintains a vision of a positive and meaningful life. These are all skills and abilities that come from constant and consistent modeling, coaching, and encouragement in this direction by parents, school, and society. In other words, the researchers above all found that children need quality social capital. Without proper social capital and positive reinforcement, children will likely suffer from one or several of the problems and issues associated with at-risk youth.
Are Boarding Schools Better Designed to Meet Children’s Need for Social Capital?

The connection between what the authors in the preceding section states and boarding schools is that there are many gaps between what at risk students actually have, and what they need. According to McWhirter et al. (1997), Werner (1984), Hektner (2000), Larson et al. (2001), and Rathunde (2001), these deficits qualify these students as at-risk for academic failure. At-risk students lack important elements necessary for the proper growth and development needed for them to become physically and emotionally healthy, good students, and eventually, productive adults. As can be seen, exhaustive research (Bourdieu, 1977, 1983, 1986; McWhirter et al.; Werner; Hektner; Larson et al.; and Rathunde) points to the importance of social capital in a child’s development.

Boarding schools provide an environment that can fill in many of the gaps present in the lives of at-risk students. This researcher hypothesized that by filling in these gaps, at-risk students who are fortunate enough to escape their negative surroundings and influences and attend boarding schools may have a greater possibility of performing at higher levels and escaping many of the negative effects of living in an environment not conducive to academic or personal success.

Some of the factors that may contribute to the success of students in boarding schools are the supportive environment provided in the boarding school structure, a supportive staff, and sufficient resources. The resources enjoyed by boarding school students that are not present in most day school structures, especially poor inner city schools, are 24 hour access to computers and the internet, unique course offerings, daily sports required for all, weekend activities, cultural offerings, abundant accessible books in the library on campus, tutorial sessions included, dorm parents and counselors, quiet
times, spaces designated especially for study, three nutritious meals, and an environment
disciplined through rules and consistent enforcement. Combined, these attributes
represent social, cultural, and academic capital, and fulfill the needs suggested in the
section above.

*Present Day Boarding and Residential Schools Models*

The first boarding charter school, Schools for Educational Evolution and
Development (SEED) opened in Washington, DC in 1998. It was started by two Ivy
League graduates, Rajiv Vinnakota and Eric Adler, who each conceived the idea of a
boarding charter school separately before they met. They believed that students are more
likely to achieve if they are placed in a nurturing environment where all their basic needs
are met; they also believed public boarding schools provide such an environment (Milk &
Ryan, 2004). Adler asserts: “[t]here are so many considerations that can jeopardize
academic instruction such as stability of the child’s home, health issues, truancy … the
list goes on” (Harman, 2004, p. 1). Further, Vinnakota believes that although boarding
school is not for everyone, the discipline and structure boarding schools provide can work
for many (Harman).

The SEED reports: “SEED provides an intensive college preparatory education
for urban children whose challenging circumstances might otherwise prevent them from
fulfilling their potential” (Harman, 2004, p. 1). The school’s student body is 100%
students of color (98% African American, 2% Hispanic), from grades seven to 12.
Ninety-three percent of the students have no family member who has attended college.
Their attendance at SEED is important because it helps to end the cycle of poor education
in their family (Milk & Ryan, 2004). Every member of SEED’s first graduating class,
class of 2004, went on to attend college. Students were accepted at prestigious colleges and universities such as: Boston University, Columbia, Cornell, Duke, Georgetown, Howard, Princeton, Spelman, Stanford, Trinity, and many others (SEED press release, 2004). Because the students in SEED are selected by lottery, Jung believes that, “[t]his shows that any student, given the right tools, can go on to college” (Wingert, 2004, p. 1).

Adler and Vinnakota target students who would do better in a structured environment and provide them with structure and other basic necessities to ensure their academic success. Adler says that “[i]f students are going to succeed in school, they need to have a good night’s sleep, a good meal, have taken a shower, be in clean clothes, and have done their homework to prepare for the day” (Harman, 2004, p. 1). In addition to basic needs, students have the benefit of attending a school where academic achievement is supported by students and staff, and where the school structure encourages it. Class sizes are small (14 students per class), courses are rigorous, the campus is spirited and growing, and the faculty is committed (Milk & Ryan, 2004). A demanding daily schedule keeps the students focused and from getting into trouble. Bacon (2004) notes the daily schedule at SEED: Classes begin at 8:00 a.m. and last until 4:00 p.m. The late-afternoon hours are filled with extracurricular activities that range from choir to flag football. After dinner, the students go back to their dorms for an hour-long study hall, followed by a half hour of ‘quiet time’ before going to bed. In contrast to SEED, operating in the urban setting is a boarding school in rural Mitchell, Oregon.

_The Mitchell Boarding School._ The Mitchell, Oregon boarding school was developed in an effort to provide students from urban and suburban schools a quiet atmosphere where they could revitalize their ‘dismal’ academic records (Bushweller,
The school, part of the public school system, is located in a small, isolated town that lacks such distractions as shopping malls, video arcades, or fast food restaurants. Bushweller believes that these factors would make the town a nightmare by many teenagers’ accounts. The secluded location of Mitchell supports the recovery of many of the students who themselves believe they would otherwise be failing or tied into the juvenile system. Tiah, a student at Mitchell, earned mostly Cs and Ds and did not participate in any extracurricular activities in the large suburban school she attended prior to Mitchell. At Mitchell, her class size has dropped from 30 to 20 students, and she now boasts a 3.0 grade point average. Also, she now participates in extracurricular activities as a member of the volleyball, basketball, and track teams. Her roommate Angela was earning Ds and Fs and now has a solid B average. She is also active in extracurricular sports. Other success stories are told by 11 Mitchell students who were on the edge of giving up, joining a gang, or running away from home. All credit the small class size, teachers who care, and a structured environment for their success (Bushweller). These students benefited from receiving quality social capital directed towards them as a result of participating in smaller classes in a caring and nurturing environment, and away from lower quality social capital that acts to provide negative influences. The concept of the public or common boarding school is becoming more popular as educators and policy makers search for alternative methods for helping students achieve to their highest potential.

*Chicago Cluster Initiative.* Public school officials in Chicago looked to the boarding school concept as a way to keep inner-city students away from drugs, gangs, and other lures of the streets. The Chicago Cluster Initiative, a nonprofit school reform
group, sought to convert the well known and the nation’s largest public-housing development, Robert Taylor homes, into a residential extended day school by fall of 1995. Miller (1995) cites Donna Williams as stating the goal of the school as the creation of a safe environment for the students. Their goal was to have 50 to 60 boarding students the first year, and then to add on each year until the school reaches its full capacity of 540 students.

The North Carolina School of Science and Mathematics. A residential magnet school in North Carolina provides a boarding school opportunity for students based upon merit and racial balance. The North Carolina School of Science and Mathematics opened in 1980 in Durham, North Carolina as the first publicly financed residential high school in the U.S. devoted to mathematics and science. Although this school is also public, it is different from the other schools discussed above because it is selective based upon test scores, primarily serving gifted students. In addition to test scores, students who attend the North Carolina School of Science and Mathematics are selected on the basis of involvement in academic and extracurricular activities, written essays, personal interviews, and recommendations from their home schools. Though the academic aptitude of the students is high, committee members are careful to pay attention to racial and gender percentages, as well as geographic balance in selecting a class. According to Sendor (1984), 53% of the students are male, 70% are white, and they come from 85 of the state’s 100 counties. The North Carolina School of Science and Mathematics is an ideal way to serve gifted children, including students of color, in an academically rich boarding school setting.
The North Carolina School of Science and Mathematics offers many of the advantages of a college or university (Sendor, 1984). Similar to a college or university, the school hosts a variety of guest instructors. The school has hosted fellow school educators, professors, and other public officials from 25 states and a dozen countries in the last several years. The school receives more attention than most institutions because it attracts 400 of the most creative high school juniors and seniors in the state. The North Carolina School of Science and Mathematics receives corporate sponsorship totaling $3 million per year. Private corporations, hungry for the possibility of benefiting from the pool of the brightest future employees, make sizeable contributions to the school and offer research and internship opportunities. The school also partners with Duke University, North Carolina in Chapel Hill, and North Carolina State University in Raleigh, encouraging students to engage in research projects with university faculty. Though many public educators were originally wary of its inception, many of their concerns were quelled with the success of the school (Sendor).

Parent and Student Sentiment regarding Boarding Schools

The SEED school reports that parents who send their children to boarding schools are often relieved that their children are receiving a quality education in a safe and structured environment. Students, however, do not always see going away to boarding school as positive. Canovan (2003) reports that an essay contest for boarding school students organized by the Boarding Schools’ Association revealed that boarding school is still hard for many pupils. Canovan stated, “[b]oarders have dealt a blow to the new fashionable image of their schools by revealing that they feel they were ‘sent away’ by their parents” (p. 18). Canovan also notes, however, that even if the experience was
difficult (in the beginning) for the students, they realized later that the experience was for their good. Canovan quotes Sofie Marsh of the Boarding School Association: “[m]ost of them came to the conclusion that although it may have been hard in the beginning, they benefited from the experience even though it may not have been their decision to go there” (p. 12). Henry Journigan, a 17–year-old junior from Pickens, Mississippi said he never wanted to attend Piney Woods, a mostly Black residential school. He says that the idea was his mother’s, who had wanted to go when she was his age. He reports, though, that since enrolling there in eighth grade, he has come full circle (Hawkins, 1997).

Tiah, a senior at the Mitchell, Oregon school agrees with this. She talks about how bored she gets living in the small town of Mitchell; however, she feels that the experience at the boarding school helped her to bring her grades from a C/D average to a 3.0. She considers being at the school a blessing because teachers care if students do not attend class, whereas at her other school, teachers did not seem to care where she was. Both Tiah and Angela, her roommate, say that the boredom is a small price to pay for the extra attention from the teachers. Benny, also a student at Mitchell, says that for him, there is nothing hard about being a boarding student. He analogizes his boarding school experience to a familial one, stating that it is like having lots of brothers and sisters.

Students at the North Carolina School of Mathematics and Science report that being away from home is difficult for them as well. According to Sendor (1984), “[t]he social aspect of life at the school are among the most difficult for many students. Being separated suddenly from families and friends and thrust into an environment that includes many new people comes as a shock; especially during the often-trying years of adolescence” (p. 1). The school’s cooperative, rather than competitive, attitude makes the
transition somewhat easier. Students also form bonds with other students that make their lives easier. Staff members reported to Sendor: “[h]ardships tend to bring students together” (p. 1). The staff believes that the cooperation brought about by the school’s requirement that students work together while doing chores also helps to enhance relationships.

*Boarding School Success*

Success of the boarding schools discussed is variable and must be considered from a relative sense. The reports from the schools mentioned (SEED, Mitchell, and the North Carolina School for Mathematics and Science), hail favorable results. All of the schools report that their school concepts work for their students, and that their students thrive in their boarding environment. However, success must be looked at as relative to the amount of progress students make at the school. Students can also be evaluated upon intangible benefits received from attending the school. The students from the SEED and Mitchell schools are from low-income, disadvantaged home situations. There is no way of knowing how much better each student is doing compared to how he/she would have actually done in the traditional public school setting.

Despite the resources poured into offering SAT preparatory courses, test scores at SEED are not much higher than those of the mainstream Washington, DC school population. There was only a small difference of 34 points between the average SAT scores of traditional public school students and SEED students. In 2004, the average SAT score for SEED students was 834, while that of students in mainstream Washington, DC was 800. As a result of the district attempt to strengthen its curriculum, 21 of SEED’s 63 eighth graders were unable to move on to ninth grade last year. Six of those youngsters
chose to drop out rather than repeat eighth grade. However, retention was a problem even before the tougher standards went into effect. Only 23 of the 40 students in the school’s first entering class are still there (Harman, 2004). Academically speaking, SEED continues to face challenges. However, factors other than test scores should be considered in determining school effectiveness. For example, the school allows students to travel internationally and teaches them to live and thrive in an environment similar to what they will find in college. This experience could be a measure of school effectiveness in providing cultural capital. Additionally, 100% of SEED’s 2004 graduating class went on to top colleges and universities – another measure of school success.

The Piney Woods boarding school faces similar academic challenges to SEED. According to Hawkins (1997), college entrance exam scores for Piney Woods seniors are still below the national average. Piney Woods students scored just 18.3 on average on the ACT test, while the national average was 20.3. Like SEED, intangible benefits are associated with attending the school. As noted above, Piney Woods students graduated with more confidence and after having thoroughly enjoyed the experience of attending the school. This could be a measure of school effectiveness.

Students from Mitchell generally have a B average; however, this is an accomplishment considering that many of the students came to the school with C, D, or F averages. The school did not report their college entrance exams scores. They did, however, report that not all of their students intend to go to traditional four-year colleges. However, students report that the school kept them from gangs, provided a supportive atmosphere where teachers really care, all have career goals that they might not otherwise
have developed, and students enjoyed the family atmosphere of the small school in the small town. These factors are typically used to be measures of school effectiveness.

Boarding schools clearly do not provide the perfect solution for all students; however, the research and examples of successful models above warrant further investigation and consideration as an alternative to be considered by district administrators and policy makers. The purpose of this study was to examine student experience in boarding schools to detect whether or not the boarding environment promotes Bourdieu’s social, cultural, and education capital.

The next chapter, methodology, provides a framework for how I conducted research to gather insight regarding the boarding school experience. This study utilized qualitative inquiry as I spent time in two study sites: a United States and a South African site in my search for answers.
CHAPTER THREE

Methodology

Introduction

This study was designed to examine Bourdieu’s (1986) concepts of social, cultural, and education capital (as a dimension of human capital) as they relate to the boarding school environments in two schools: one in the United States and the other in South Africa. The purpose of this chapter is to present the research methodology and conceptual model utilized in this study. This description of methodology includes limitations of both the quantitative and qualitative methods, a rationale for using the qualitative approach, and a discussion of the IRB approval process undergone for this study. As previously stated, the results of this study can be used to inform and remind policy makers and system developers of some of the capital benefits that might be associated with boarding schools.

Justification for Sites and Sample Selection

This study examined the presence and effects of Bourdieu’s (1986) capitals in the boarding school environment. The researcher evaluated the appropriateness of the schools used for purposes of this study. Selecting schools that were considered at least average, but actually slightly above average among other boarding schools in the area was important in giving a balanced view of Bourdieu’s effects in boarding schools. Average in this sense is defined in terms of student experience in grades as well as curricular and extra curricular offerings of the schools by boarding school standards. By selecting schools that represent the average boarding school environment, more schools
are represented and the effect provided by the ‘boarding school environment’ can be more accurately depicted. Also considered was the diversity of the student body population. Diversity in the research sample can serve to isolate the effects of race and other apparent measurable factors from the general study results. Inclusion of a school where the student body is diverse added balance to the study sample. The Douglas school was majority, (70%) white, but a significant number (30%) comprised students from a variety of ethnic backgrounds. Additionally, students come from a variety of socioeconomic statuses. This school was selected because it actively seeks to recruit a heterogeneous population of students. Some students are average or gifted and talented students of the economic means to afford the $30,000 tuition costs, others are international students, a small number represent scholarship students from underrepresented minority groups, and yet others are second chance students (students who previously had substance abuse problems).

The school in South Africa is also considered to be above average by the country’s local standards of quality, and is also a private boarding school. The school is also desegregated and accepts some students on a scholarship basis through specialized programs.

Qualitative Considerations

The researcher determined that the most thorough and efficient way to obtain the desired data was to observe participants in their natural school environment, ask appropriate questions regarding their boarding school related experiences, question aspects that remain unclear after subsequent observation and interview, and examine relevant documentation for further information. These strategies are in alignment with
and in support of Yin’s (2003) list of desired skills for investigators. The researcher applied the following from the list as I went about my research. In sum, I: (1) asked good questions; (2) was a good listener; (3) had a firm grasp of the issues being studied; and (4) was unbiased by preconceived notions (as much as possible).

In analyzing the effects of the South African and Douglas schools on promoting Bourdieu’s (1986) capitals, the attitudes and experiences of all actors and stakeholders must be considered objectively. The actors and stakeholders considered in this study were students, teachers, school faculty, and school administrators. As a researcher who had done some thinking and made several observations of the Douglas school, preconceived ideas were formed as to what the boarding school environment is like; however, I did not allow these preconceptions to bias my final analysis. As Yin (2003) notes, “the capacity of the researcher to be unbiased by preconceived notions” is a required skill for researchers conducting case study research (p. 59). Objectivity can be reinforced through the triangulation of sources in my data collection methodology (Fielding & Fielding, 1996; Maxwell, 2005). By observing, interviewing, using questionnaires, as well as document analysis, information came from a number of sources allowing the researcher to see the issues presented in the data from a number of sources and perspectives. The researcher’s analysis of the answers to all questions was based on the participant’s perceptions and by the researcher generating a consensus based on the answers of all of the stakeholders who were interviewed.

Student participants were observed and given a questionnaire containing questions that got to the heart of discovering whether they enjoyed the boarding school environment, if they believed they have relationships (with both peers and adults),
exposure to elements that promoted cultural capital, if academic successes were enhanced as a result of the boarding school experience, if they felt they have more opportunities for the future as a result of the boarding school experience, and other questions that addressed the overall quality of the boarding school environment. In addition to the questionnaire, interviews were conducted with selected students, faculty, and staff members. Students who are attending the school on scholarship or financial aid were selected first for the study. The faculty and staff members who asked to participate were ones who were familiar with the students, knew their backgrounds, and who had spent time working directly with students. These included teachers, dorm parents, the school counselor, and at least one administrator.

Qualitative or Quantitative Methodology

McMillian (2001) identifies the major function of research as advancing knowledge to improve practice. This study sought to develop a body of evidence for the purpose of arriving at conclusions that informed and eventually improved practice. Assessing the efficacy of boarding schools in promoting Bourdieu’s (1986) capitals is a multifaceted and complex undertaking. It is complex in that an understanding of the effect of Bourdieu’s capitals on student experience within the boarding school environment must be reached, as well as some conclusion as to the form that these ‘capitals’ are present in an North American context, as well as a South African one. In addition to determining the presence and effects of Bourdieu’s capitals within the boarding school environment, cultural factors must be teased out between the two environments and evaluated for their own separate effects on the outcomes in the two schools.
In order to accomplish these objectives, a method that facilitates the schools, students, and school staff members was thoroughly and objectively analyzed. In collecting and analyzing data, several viewpoints were considered. After considering the above factors and various approaches to answering the research questions, the researcher determined that using qualitative methodology was best for this study.

The qualitative research design allowed me as researcher the freedom to conduct open-ended research of a social phenomenon with as little disruption in its natural setting as possible (Merriam, 1998). Merriam also interprets the key philosophical assumptions of qualitative research as the view that reality is constructed by individuals interacting with their social worlds and its researchers as interested in understanding the meaning people have constructed. In other words, how people make sense of the world they live in. In this study, this ‘world’ is the boarding school environment.

Qualitative research gets to the heart of people in their day-to-day experiences and provides meaning for their actions and reactions. The issue at hand in this study was whether or not Bourdieu’s (1986) capitals were present as a result of the day-to-day experiences of the students in the two study schools. Merriam (1998) distinguishes the key concern of qualitative research as understanding the phenomenon of interest from the participants’ perspectives rather than the researcher’s. As stated above, I laid aside all of my preconceived notions upon entering my study environments, and did not allow these notions to blind me to factors that I had not considered, nor to influence my analysis of the data that I collected. In short, objectivity was required of the researcher since I would be the primary instrument for data collection and analysis. Next, Merriam further speaks to the importance of the researcher’s consideration of ‘total context’ in data collection

56
and analysis. In sum, the researcher’s function was to spend time in the environment containing the phenomenon of interest, collected data through observation and interviews and documents, and analyzed that data within the context that it was seen. In the boarding school environment, this meant thick description in my observation notes, as well as in the interviews – description that allowed the researcher and those reading the study to understand the underlying reasons for actions or reactions by the subjects. As much descriptive background as possible was provided in describing environments, events, and actions witnessed by the researcher so that an accurate account of what had occurred was noted within the proper context. This description provided by Merriam describes the research that the researcher conducted in this study.

According to Patton (2002): “Qualitative inquiry is particularly oriented toward exploration, discovery and inductive logic” (p. 55). Given these descriptors, this study was clearly given to qualitative analysis. If this study was to be credible, reliable, and valid, the researcher needed to explore the environment thoroughly in an attempt to discover what was unique in the environment, which was done. This required both inductive as well as deductive reasoning. As Patton further notes: “Categories or dimensions of analysis emerge from open-ended observations because the inquirer comes to understand the patterns that exist in the phenomenon being studied” (p. 56). It was through the study of patterns of behavior and attitudes manifested by the students and their parents, teachers, and school staff that conclusions were reached regarding the promotion of Bourdieu’s (1986) capitals in the environments of the study schools.

Merriam (1998) discusses the types of qualitative research most likely to be used in education research. She discusses Lancy’s (1993) exploration of what he refers to as
the major traditions of qualitative research in education. According to Merriam, these include anthropological, sociological, and biological perspectives, the case study, personal accounts, cognitive studies, and historical inquiry. She further notes that although these types can be distinguished from each other, “they all share the essential characteristics of qualitative research – *the goal of eliciting understanding and meaning, the researcher as primary instrument of data collection and analysis, the use of fieldwork, an inductive orientation to analysis, and findings that are rich and descriptive*” (Merriam, p. 3). These characteristics are found in this study design. This study was a case study with two sites which were thoroughly observed and evaluated. The two study sites provided the cases to be considered for comparison evaluation.

*The case study approach.* Due to the nature of this study, it was most suited to the case study design. This study fits well within Yin’s (2003) definitions and specifications for a case study. This study: (1) is an empirical inquiry that investigates a contemporary phenomenon within its real-life context; (2) relies on multiple sources of evidence, with data needing to converge in a triangulating fashion; and (3) benefits from the prior development of theoretical propositions to guide the data collection and analysis (Bourdieu’s (1986) capital theories). Yin also says: “The case study strategy is used in many situations to contribute to our knowledge of individual, group, organizational, social, political, and related phenomena” (p. 1). As stated above, this study sought to observe students, teachers, administrators, and parents in their natural states to determine the effectiveness of the boarding arrangement for the student subjects involved. Yin further notes: “The case study method allows investigators to retain the holistic and meaningful characteristics of real-life events...” (p. 1). This ‘real life’ holistic type of
observation was required to obtain the level of data necessary for arriving at valid and informing results.

*Why compare internationally?* Conducting a comparative case study between a boarding school in the United States and one in South Africa enlightened the researcher, as well as the audience, to the similarities and differences between culture in the United States and that of South Africa, and how these differences impacted student academic experience in the boarding school environment. More specifically, a cross cultural comparison allowed the researcher to determine if Bourdieu’s (1986) capitals played out the same way in two different cultures, and whether the capitals carried the same weight. Because of its complexity, comparative research requires a great deal of planning and careful delineation of results before conclusions are reached. This researcher believed that by comparing the two study schools, many questions were answered that brought light to answering the research questions, among others. As so powerfully stated by Hayashi, Suzuki, and Sasaki (1992, p. 17), “…comparison is a mirror which enables us to know more about ourselves. [I]t enables us to discover means for eliminating unwanted, unnecessary and useless conflict and obstacles and thereby promote mutual understanding.” As researcher, I believed that this comparison shed light, as well as made a strong statement, of the value systems held by the United States and South African systems of education, as well as issues relating to social class and status, and racial issues.

Comparisons were done very carefully. When comparing any two phenomena, the objects of comparison must be compared only after a system or scale has been devised to evaluate the differences in complementing characteristics. The researcher must either choose two phenomena that are already of comparable characteristics, or to devise a
sliding scale that will allow for a fair comparison. Berry (1980) calls this process ‘searching for equivalences.’ He articulates it this way, “It must be possible to place two phenomena on a single dimension in order to judge them validly in relation to each other; and for the comparative judgment to be of value they should not be identical in all respects” (p. 8). The method of cross cultural study “involves comparing two or more naturally occurring cases which differ substantially” (p. 2). The analogy of comparing apples to oranges can be used to describe the comparative method. Before an apple and an orange can be compared, it must be recognized that they are two completely different types of fruit. An apple cannot be evaluated based on the standards of what would make a good orange, and neither an orange based upon the standards of what is desirable in an apple. However, for two phenomena to be compared, they must differ on some level. Or as Berry notes: “[t]o compare two phenomena, they must share some feature in common; and to compare them to some advantage, they usually differ on some feature” (p. 8).

When comparing aspects of any two countries, or two different schools in two different countries, the same applies. This analogy and the processes described above were applied as the researcher compared the boarding school in the United States and South Africa.

Comparing aspects of two countries was difficult because of all of the differing characteristics within the countries. Social cultural issues came into play, as well as social political, economic, geographic, and differences in climate, when comparing two different countries. The many variables entered the equations when a system of education was being developed and executed and called for the researcher or evaluator to be extremely thoughtful during the process of comparing. In this study, the entire background of the two countries was taken into consideration before rushing to any
judgment, or before reaching any conclusions. Although these differences presented challenges when conducting research, they were necessary for the study to have value (Berry, 1980).

When interpreting the results of this study, this researcher considered historical and cultural dissimilarity in addition to the social ones. In the study, I as the researcher was careful to consider the historical role of boarding schools in each country, and compared schools that were as similar in make up as possible. To the extent that the researcher found differences, the analysis was so noted. The research compensated for a lack of similarities by providing rich description with explanations. This allows the reader to visualize the school being discussed, thereby understanding school context.

Research Strategies

Gaining access and entry. Once the researcher had chosen a research question, and framed the research, the researcher next found a site that allowed an opportunity to conduct research. Patton (2002) discusses entry into the field and notes that research involves two separate parts: (1) negotiate with gatekeepers, whoever they may be, about the nature of the fieldwork to be done; and (2) actual physical entry into the field setting to begin collecting data. According to Patton: “These two parts are closely related, for the negotiations with gatekeepers will establish the rules and conditions for how one goes about playing the role of observer and how that role is defined for the people being observed” (p. 310).

The researcher gained access into the Douglas school by establishing a working relationship with a former employee, then with an administrator. Gaining access to other boarding schools was attempted; however, other schools denied access. The Douglas
school administration was very interested in the information to be gained from research being conducted at the institution and was accommodating in granting the researcher access into the school.

The researcher was also granted access to the South African boarding school based on a recommendation. However, access in both schools was limited. Appointments had to be made in advance for visits, and students, faculty, and staff members were always aware of the presence of the researcher. Appointments had to also be made to meet personnel and students, as well as to observe, conduct interviews, administer questionnaires, and to look at student’s records. Although there was access, the access was controlled. Steps taken to address validity and reliability concerns were addressed in the reliability and validity section.

Data collection and interview strategies. After the researcher had gained entry, it was imperative that appropriate data collection techniques were used. The use of appropriate data collection techniques served to ensure that quality research was conducted. Merriam (1998) states that because human beings are the primary instrument of data collection and analysis in qualitative research, interpretations of reality are accessed directly through observing and interviewing them. For this study, the researcher observed and interviewed throughout the data collection phase.

Yin (2003) notes the complexity involved in data collection. Despite the complexity of the process, data must be collected effectively and accurately if the study results are to be deemed respectable, reliable, and valid. He further emphasizes this in stating: “If not done well, the entire case study investigation can be jeopardized, and all of the earlier work – in defining the research question and designing the case study – will
have been for naught” (p. 57). According to Owens (1982), the naturalistic investigator views the design as providing an emergent plan for a highly interactive process of gathering data from which the analysis will be developed. In this study, data collection and analysis occurred simultaneously, with analysis informing further research. In other words, the researcher did not go into the research sites which would allow preconceived notions to cloud the results, or have exact procedures or set boundaries for collecting data. Nor did she wait until the data was collected to begin analysis. The analysis and the collection occurred simultaneously. The full scope of the research unfolded as each step was executed and more questions arise.

The researcher considered the above literature in determining her methodology. In this study, the researcher spent the first few visits at the boarding schools only observing the environment. These observations raised questions that the researcher directed to the appropriate person(s) during formal, as well as informal, interviews.

Considering the above writings on qualitative research and interviewing, the researcher acknowledged that the research process was not simple or easy. The researcher carefully constructed her study so that her observation and interview notes were done in a way that produced reliable and valid results. The researcher heeded the warnings put out by Patton, Fontana, and Frey (2002). They say that qualitative interviewing is widely used, but not always conducted well. Patton cites Fontana and Frey (2000): “So much interviewing is being done so badly that its credibility may be undermined” (p. 646). That being said, I as researcher saw the value in the interviewing process as being carefully planned and executed in this study. I desired and aimed for credible, reliable, and valid results. Good interviews took the researcher into the minds of the participants in the study.
and provided valuable perspectives on the issue of the boarding school environment in the promotion of Bourdieu’s (1986) capitals. Patton (2002) further notes:

The purpose of interviewing, then, is to allow us to enter into the other person’s perspective. Qualitative interviewing begins with the assumption that the perspective of others is meaningful, knowable, and able to be made explicit. We interview to find out what is in and on someone else’s mind, to gather their stories…Program evaluation interviews aim to capture the perspectives of program participants, staff, and others associated with the program. (p. 341)

Much of the information sought in this study was attained through interviewing to gather data for consideration in analyzing the boarding school environment. Well constructed interviews allowed the researcher into the worlds of key players, and led the interviewer/researcher to the answers to the research questions. The combined approach to interviewing was most appropriate for this type of study. The informal conversational approach (Patton, 2002) provided the atmosphere for salience, and led the researcher further in the research process. However, this approach can lead to variance from interview to interview. The interview guide approach (Patton) allowed for consistency in the interviews. The downside to this approach was that important and salient topics may be omitted. The standardized open-ended interview (Patton) was good in that it also provided for consistency since the same questions were always asked. However, there was little flexibility in this method as far as varying the questions to arrive at new information. A combination of these three strategies will yield positive results if the interviewer is skilled and well prepared. The researcher in this study approached the task
of interviewing the participants seriously and produced quality interviews (Patton). The researcher used previously prepared questions, but allowed the interviews to flow naturally and asked follow up questions when appropriate or necessary.

The qualitative approach used by this researcher also included: observations of the natural environment, questionnaires and interviews to students, interviews to school faculty and staff, and document analysis. Questionnaires were administered to the entire student body prior to the individual interviews being conducted. After the questionnaires were reviewed, the interview questions were refined. Students and selected faculty and staff members were then interviewed. Once all of the data was collected, the researcher looked for signs of evidence of Bourdieu’s (1986) capitals in my observation notes, as well as my interview notes. The researcher then compared the scores of these students to similar students who did not attend boarding school. The researcher then discussed similarities and differences in the results obtained in the United States, versus those found in South Africa. The researcher also discussed any margins between the achievement differences in those who attended boarding school in the United States school versus the South African school.

*Keeping the lines of communication open.* To make the process operate most smoothly, the researcher contacted each school in order to reacquaint administration with the study. The researcher also sent reminder notices prior to arriving for each visit to confirm what was to be observed, who was to be interviewed, and what documentation was requested for analysis. This researcher believed that by keeping the lines of communication open, that the study schools would feel more comfortable with the
researcher and the project, and that the data collection process would operate more smoothly.

Prior to collecting data, the researcher was in contact with all of the selected interviewees to set up an interview schedule. At this time, participants were notified as to how long the interviews would last and also provided an explanation of the purpose of the interview and an example of the types of questions that would be asked. The researcher also informed the participants they have the option of anonymity and that they could opt out of answering any of the questions that they were not comfortable with.

After the interviews, a final trip was made to the schools for the purpose of doing member checks. During this visit, official thanks were given and the schools were presented with a gift. The last bit of communication to the schools will be after the researcher defends her findings. Each participating school will be provided with a copy of the research findings at the conclusion of the data analysis.

*Reliability and validity concerns.* Issues of reliability and validity were of concern in this study. As Guba and Lincoln (1981) note, “The problem of establishing validity and reliability in naturalistic inquiry is complicated by a series of issues that relate to social science as a whole” (p. 185). As with any study, there is no way to eliminate all of the factors that pose threats to the reliability and validity of the results. This is to say that in even the best planned and most efficiently executed social science research, there are usually factors that occur that are beyond the control of the researcher. Though these challenges will occur, it is possible to produce a quality study that has enough validity and reliability present to yield a credible study.
According to McMillan and Schumacher (2001), “Reliability refers to the consistency of measurement – the extent to which the results are similar over different forms of the same instrument or occasions of data collection” (p. 244). They further state that it is the degree to which measures are free from error. Merriam (1998) refers to reliability as “the extent to which research can be replicated” (p. 205). If the subjects can be observed over a period of time and yield the same results, then the experiment is said to be reliable. In this study, reliability was left to the honesty and stability of the interviewees, the questions asked by the researcher in the questionnaire and the interviews, and the ability of the researcher to select relevant documentation from which to take her data. Of these measures, the one that was geared most towards unreliability was several of the interviews and observations. Since the environment observed primarily comprised high school aged youth, and since several of the interviewees were also high school students, there was a chance that the immaturity of the respondents would affect the reliability of the data collected. Validity was more controllable.

According to Merriam (1998), internal validity refers to the question of how research findings match reality. She states that she sees internal validity as a strength of qualitative research because of the connection between the researcher (as instrument), and the data. The qualitative nature and design of this study helped me as researcher to present the most realistic picture possible of the school environments. The researcher did this by stretching her observations over time (especially in the United States school), and spent lots of time getting to know those who were in the two school environments. This was especially true the case of the South African school, where the researcher had many days, nights, and week-ends to observe over the period of a month. The researcher
scheduled quality time in both schools, whether the format was through a series of short visits, or an extended month long intensive visit. The more *quality* time a researcher spends at a research site, the more internally valid the research is likely to be.

Though the amount and quality of time the researcher spent at the two study sites helped to make the study more valid and reliable, it can still be said that if the amount of time spent at the schools was increased, that the results of the study would be even more conclusive. However, the amount of time that I spent was limited by the amount of resources available for completion of this study. If the researcher had more time and money for research, then an ethnographic design would have been selected and may indeed have yielded even more detailed results. However, the likelihood of the results of this study being reliable and valid are increased by the triangulation of methodology employed, and the diligence and the dedication of the researcher towards uncovering reliable, valid, and useful information. Because of this, the researcher vowed to observe, collect all data, and to analyze it as objectively as possible. The researcher as instrument in this study guided the direction of inquiry and data collection through personal experiences and the experiences of those observed. This also enhanced the internal validity of the study, as discussed above.

**Limitations**

The case study design was selected because it was best suited to answer the queries sought in the research question. However, the case study design posed some drawbacks. These drawbacks as stated by Prestine (2005) are as follows:

1. Case studies can oversimplify, or exaggerate a situation.
2. Structure of case studies depends heavily on preferences of researcher in terms of what gets used and what does not.

3. Case studies may only give a partial account, but give the impression of the whole. Case studies only present a slice of life.

4. Case studies tend to be politically sensitive. Because they focus on a particular unit of interest, they are easy to respond to.

5. To be effective, adequate time must be spent at the site. Spending enough time, over a long enough period of time is often neglected by novice researchers. (class notes)

The researcher noted these admonishments as she formed her study design. In examining this list, the researcher saw again the importance of objectivity in observing, collecting, and interpreting data. I also saw the need to be sure that enough quality time is spent at each site to render the study reliable and valid. The researcher had taken note and adjusted the study given these factors. When observing, the [any] researcher is an outsider in this and most studies. Patton (2002) notes the possibility of the observer affecting the situation in unknown ways. Staff, students, and parents at the boarding schools may (and likely will), behave differently as a result of being observed. They may be on their best behavior in an attempt to create a favorable impression, rather than a realistic one. (I as researcher noted this when it seemed to be occurring.) Participants may also feel special because they are being observed, giving rise to the Hawthorne effect discussed below.

The Hawthorne effect was named after an experiment Roethlisberger and Dickinson (1939) conducted at the Hawthorne plant of Western Electric Company
(Krathwohl, 2004). The study sought to show that improving a department’s working conditions leads to increases in production. However, the researchers found that production also increased after “negative changes, such as reduced lighting. They concluded that the real cause was the effect of giving special attention” (Krathwohl, p. 520). Likewise, performance and environment may be altered because of my presence at the school in this study. The students and administration may interpret my presence in the school as special attention or continue to try to impress me, coloring the results of the study. (I as researcher noted this when it seemed to be occurring.)

Hypothesis guessing could also result when people are being observed for study. Krathwohl (2004) describes hypothesis guessing as follows: “Reacting to what is perceived as wanted, subjects seek to facilitate the effect to get researchers to think well of them” (p. 520). Subjects may do this while the researcher is observing, when they complete the questionnaires, or in the interview sessions in an attempt to make a good impression for themselves or for the school. (I as researcher noted this when it seemed to be occurring.)

Patton discusses that observations are limited in focusing only on external behaviors. Participants may be experiencing internal discomfort, or other feelings important to the research that the observer may miss. The researcher needed to be aware and cognizant of the fact that non-verbal communication or other messages of participant discomfort may be transpiring. This type of information is critical to the interviewer in witnessing the essence of the interviewees’ true feelings. Without this type of perception and discernment, the interviewer may be completely off base as to what she perceives or reads from the interview. Patton (2002) notes possible limitations in interview data as
possibly “distorted responses due to personal bias, anger, anxiety, politics, and simple lack of awareness since interviews can be greatly affected by the emotional state of the interviewee at the time of the interview” (p. 306).

Also noteworthy is the fact that observational data are often constrained by the limited sample of activities actually observed. As an observer in the boarding schools, the researcher only made visits for limited blocks of pre-scheduled times. The lack of an opportunity to spend unlimited, uncensored time limits the researcher’s ability to be fully exposed to all aspects of the school over an unlimited amount of time.

Patton (2002) notes that document analysis can provide a behind-the-scenes look at a program that may not be directly observable and about which the interviewer might not ask appropriate questions without the leads provided through documents. However, documents and records can also have their limitations if they are incomplete or inaccurate. Though schools are required by law to keep accurate and truthful records, dishonesty and corruption in the system may prevent the researcher from having access to accurate records. For this study, the researcher was bound by the access granted by the directors of the schools. Though both schools gladly granted permission for entry, each might have controlled which students were studied, the times the researcher was allowed in the school, and which settings were studied. Well planned, skillful qualitative research can overcome many of these limitations posed; however, these factors must be acknowledged and taken into the thoughtful consideration of the researcher.

As noted above, another limitation worth consideration was that the school in South Africa was a single sex school (as is the custom in South Africa), while the school in the United States was mixed with male and female students. Though gender issues
arose, both schools were, however, racially diverse, which was more consequential in this comparative study than the issue of gender.

In conclusion, the researcher believes that a qualitative case study in which she observed, interviewed, and administered questionnaires best equipped her with the data necessary in order to discuss exhaustively whether the boarding school environment promoted a positive student academic experience of Bourdieu’s (1986) capitals, if the increase in Bourdieu’s capitals impacted student experience, and finally to compare the phenomenon and presence of Bourdieu’s capitals in a United States and a South African boarding school. The researcher conducted 32 interviews at Bailey in South Africa, and collected 63 questionnaires from boarding students. The researcher also interviewed six teachers, one counselor, two administrators, and two dorm parents. Two of the teachers interviewed served the dual title as teacher and administrator. In the United States at Douglas, a much smaller school, the researcher received a total of 32 questionnaires, and conducted 19 interviews with students. Five teachers, two counselors, and five administrators were also interviewed. The teachers doubled as dorm parents at Douglas, and one of the counselors doubled as an administrator.

The data were thoroughly discussed; however, the researcher was not fully able to provide definitive answers to the research questions. As far as the factors that have been acknowledged that may impede reliability and validity, as well as others that may arise, they were overcome by triangulation of data collection method and researcher determination.
Data Analysis

From research design to data collection, researchers take painstaking steps to ensure that their research is complete, valid, and reliable. In order for research to prove valid and reliable, not only must data design and collection be carefully administered and accurate, data must also be managed and analyzed accurately once it is collected. As Yin (2002) states: “...every case study should strive to have a general analytic strategy – defining priorities for what to analyze and why (p. 109). There must be an orderly method for analyzing the research data in order for it to be reliable or valid.

In order for the data to be the most meaningful and informative, it should be analyzed throughout the process of data analysis. Merriam (1998) notes the importance of ongoing analysis and note taking during the entire processes of data collection and data analysis. Maxwell (2005) also discusses the importance of on-going analysis during data collection in a statement that can also serve as an admonishment: “One of the most common problems in qualitative research is letting your analyzed field notes and transcripts pile up, making the task of final analysis more difficult and discouraging” (p. 95). In this study, the researcher realized the importance of keeping detailed notes during observations, as well as the importance of recording notes and reflections immediately following each interview. In these notes, the researcher’s feelings, thoughts, emotions, and speculations were noted so that she might be able to detect any and all patterns or contradictions in the answers received. In addition to keeping on-going notes, each interview was recorded and transcribed. At the end of the data collection period, all of the documentation that the researcher had from on-going notes and analysis, including notes containing thoughts, observations and reflections, written questionnaires, student records,
and interview tapes were listened to and all questionnaires were read. Maxwell states that reading through of the study data – even before transcription, is an opportunity for analysis. After listening to and reading through the data, the interviews were transcribed. Once the transcriptions were complete, the researcher brought them together with the other data, sorted and coded it (interview questions had been pre-coded as to what information they would bring (background information, social capital, cultural capital, or education capital), then the researcher employed an analytic strategy that allowed me to arrive at valid conclusions using the evidence presented in the study.

The employment of an analytic strategy is challenging for the novice researcher. Maxwell (2005) goes as far as calling the process of data analysis “the most mysterious aspect of qualitative research” for novice researchers (p. 95). Yin (2002) further states that there are no set formulae or ‘cookbook recipes’ to guide the novice researcher. Given this information, it was realized that patience was needed as various methods of data analysis were considered.

When analyzing the data, the researcher linked similarly themed stories, interviews, and questionnaires together to seek out patterns of behavior through the answers. To this end, Yin (2002) suggests using some of Miles and Huberman’s (1994) strategies such as: putting information into different arrays, making a matrix of categories and placing evidence with the created categories, creating data displays, tabulating the frequency of different events, and putting information in chronological order or using some other temporal scheme (p. 11). For this study, I found that creating graphs of the interview from the data discovered in the questionnaires was the clearest method of displaying the data. This allowed the researcher to see patterns in the responses. Finally, I
synthesized the knowledge that was obtained in the data analysis chapter. As a novice researcher, I had to experiment before arrival at the right analytic method or combination of methods for the mix of data sets.

The researcher presents data in the form of a narrative analysis in the next three chapters. Charts and graphs were generated in order to display the data in a snapshot fashion. The narrative analysis was used because as the researcher interviewed students, teachers, and faculty members, the researcher expected participants to tell stories as they answered probing questions. In the narrative analysis, the researcher provides the rich details, including excerpts from stories that she heard, observed, and experienced during data collection activities in order to bring the reader of the study into the boarding school environments that she occupied. The researcher’s goal is that those reading the analysis can follow the study through the narrative, and that readers of this dissertation are able to make sense of the path that was taken towards arriving at these conclusions.

*Obtaining IRB Approval*

Before beginning data collection, it was necessary to obtain IRB approval. Obtaining IRB approval for this study was somewhat complex since some of the participants were younger than 18, and also because of the comparative and international nature of this study. The researcher took an on-line test to qualify to do an IRB at Penn State. Once the researcher received approval to complete the application, she began to answer the numerous questions pertaining to most intimate the details of her study. Answering the many questions caused her to have mentally process the study and the steps to be taken in order to complete it.
Applying for IRB went through several stages. After the researcher submitted the initial application, she had to re-submit the proposal as questions were raised regarding the fitness and safety of the study for underage participants. To this end, the researcher clarified the fact that the study would be non-threatening for young participants and would be completely voluntary. The researcher also had to make it clear that those who wished not to participate would be protected. For such non-participants, an assent form was developed. Thankfully, no one signed an assent form in this study.

The researcher produced the interview protocols/questionnaires for the IRB committee and attached them to the application. The questions for both student and adult participants were given the stamp of approval. The researcher was informed that parents and adult participants were required to sign consent forms before participating. The steps the researcher had to take from the beginning to the end of IRB approval took more than a month. The researcher was happy that she was given approval in time to complete the research deadlines. The researcher had to push back her original date for her data collection in her school in the United States, but was fine for meeting her original departure date to South Africa.

Before distributing questionnaires to students, the researcher had an opportunity to address the groups at large. She gave them a synopsis of the purpose for being at their school to do research, as well as informed them that their participation was entirely voluntary, but appreciated. Students who returned consent forms and volunteered were used for the study. A few study participants were recommended by the school personnel; however, most of the students used in the study were self-selected. When questionnaires
were distributed, oral instructions were given on the expectations of thoroughness and honesty in their responses.

Research Protocol

Research Questions

1) Does the boarding school environment promote [Bourdieu’s] social, cultural, and education capital?
2) Does the boarding school environment/structure increase academic achievement?
3) Do boarding schools meet the often unmet needs of disadvantaged students?
4) How do North American and South African boarding schools compare as an intervention?

Sub Question:

1) Are boarding schools a remedy?
CHAPTER FOUR

The Douglas School

Introduction

The purpose of this chapter is to discuss Douglas in greater detail. This study began with observations at The Douglas School. Douglas is the United States High school, serving grades nine through twelve. Researcher data collection took place in three parts: observations of the school environment, student questionnaires, and interviews with the several student and faculty members. A total of 32 questionnaires were received, and 19 interviews were conducted at Douglas with students. Interestingly, close to equal numbers of male and female students completed and returned the questionnaire at Douglas. The researcher also interviewed five teachers, two counselors, and five administrators. The teachers double as dorm parents at Douglas, and one of the counselors doubles as an administrator. The student population of Douglas is majority (70%) White and the remainder of the students are Black, Asian, or International exchange students. The students of Douglas come from all over the United States, but the majority of the students are from various cities in New York State. Though only 32 students completed the questionnaire, the students completing questionnaires proportionately represented the make up of the student body, both racially and geographically.

Analysis of the three aforementioned data collection activities provides a detailed and accurate picture of the school’s role in promoting social, cultural, and education capital. The researcher observed students in a number of different settings, over four
visits. Discussions of what the researcher found in her visits are organized into sections that talk about social, cultural, and education capital. Before doing this, the researcher will share some of Douglas’s background and history.

Douglas’ Background and History

Douglas is a small boarding school of about 120 students, and serves grades nine through twelve. Though it was opened in 1932 as a boys-only school, it has since become co-ed with 53% boys and 47% girls. The school is on the original Shaker Village site of Mt. Lebanon. The Shakers are a very religious sect that originated in England in 1787. They practice celibacy and an ascetic communal life. The school was named “Douglas School” in 1939 in honor of the Douglas family who had first settled the land and had provided support and leadership in the early years of the Shaker community. Douglas is the only school in the United States located on the site of an historic Shaker village. The spirit of the shaker tradition permeates the spirit of the school.

Douglas’s early days looked very different from what is currently observable at the school. As previously stated, the school was opened by Shakers for boys only. In its early days, Douglas was attended by White middle class boys, boys who needed a second chance, and boys who were orphaned. A constant with the school is that it has always promoted traditional values, a strong work ethic, and the Shaker value of hard work and community. Though the school had solid values, it was not considered to be in the class of the more elite New England schools. In fact, the school has faced closure several times in its history.

The mission of Douglas has changed since its inception. In addition to traditional students, Douglas serves students with learning disabilities, a small number of Second
Chance students (students who have formerly had drug and/or alcohol problems), a small number of talented at-risk urban youth, and students who do not cope well in larger classes and schools. While the student population has historically been all White, Douglas now also comprises African American, Asian, Latino students, and also hosts International students. Douglas continues to serve students in need, but administrators are now also striving to promote academic excellence as well. During interviews, it was clear that the administrators at Douglas are striving to elevate the image of the school in order to attract high caliber students in addition to the ones they have traditionally served.

*The Douglas Ethos Demonstrated*

The Shaker values, including integrity, industry, and simplicity, continue to be observable at Douglas through several of the school’s traditions. One way the Shaker heritage is still honored is through the ‘hands to work’ program. This program is taken from the Shaker work ethic and commitment to pride of ownership. This program gives the students an opportunity to help maintain the school’s property – their school property. The students each take jobs either inside or outside the school that contributes to the upkeep of the school. During observations at the school, the researcher was surprised to see students so cooperative in performing manual work for the beautification of their school. They cooperated in doing this work even when temperatures were at their coldest in the dead of winter. The researcher witnessed the hands to work program during three of her four visits, and never once heard a student or teacher complain about the work that he or she had to do.

Another way the Shaker tradition can be seen is in the weekly town meetings. Fluid communication is important to the Shaker way of life, and this has also become a
part of the Douglas School culture. The purpose of these meetings is to give students a safe opportunity to speak their mind publicly to other students and/or teachers. During these meetings, only students speak. Students can use this forum to voice any school-wide or personal concerns, share poetry or other work, or speak on behalf of other students. The commitment to a quality education is also characteristic of the Shaker tradition. Douglas has a commitment to a solid traditional education. Smaller classes, tutorial sessions, and mandatory athletics all ensure that students will be educated in a supportive environment.

Douglas has a sincere appreciation for environmentalism. The school has an active sustainability program, which includes a campus-wide water purification system. In addition to its older buildings, the school has built what they call a ‘living machine’ and the Sampson Environmental Center. The living machine filters the water used on campus naturally and without the use of chemicals. This center opened in 1998, and hosts 500 visitors from other schools and the community per year to witness how it works. The building is also powered partially by solar panels. In addition to these buildings to remind students of the importance of being environmentally responsible, students are regularly reminded of energy saving measures – such as waste management and recycling during announcement times. The researcher was surprised to hear suggestions for recycling and limiting waste during morning announcements. In addition to their regular talks, environmentalism is fused into the curricula, and into their daily lives. So, students of Douglas not only get a traditional classroom education, but one in environmentalism as well.
"The Douglas Environment"

The researcher was invited to visit Douglas by a fellow graduate student who had worked there for three years. Because the referring student had taught at the school for three years, she did not need to get permission to visit the school. The first time the researcher stepped onto the campus of The Douglas School, she observed was how isolated the school was. It was in New Lebanon, New York, a town that she had never heard of before – despite having lived in upstate New York for six years. The long isolated roads to the school caused her to wonder whether or not she had gotten lost along the way. There was nothing around the entrance to the road that led to the school but a gas station and a couple of small eating establishments. The entrance to the school was almost hidden. After the researcher and her referee made the turn into the school property, they still had to drive down a winding road before any signs of a school property emerged. When they finally arrived, the researcher was impressed by the vastness of the property and overall peaceful serenity of the atmosphere. It was a sunny spring week-end, which allowed for lots of outdoor activity. At first the researcher was taken by the beautiful older buildings on campus. The school is located on more than 130 acres, and has 22 National Historic Landmark Buildings, in addition to several newer state of the art buildings. After gawking at the beautiful simplicity of the old buildings, the researcher noticed a few students talking and playing informally in small groups. Since it was the week-end, the researcher thought to herself that this scene would never occur at a day school. The fact that students were able to cultivate their relationships in
informal settings over week-ends added to the social capital dimension that the researcher was interested in capturing in her study.

The researcher was immediately drawn into wanting to study this school further after this visit. She met the principal, but did not speak with her about doing research there during this first visit because it was a week-end. The researcher waited until she returned to send an email and to telephone her about the possibility of her conducting dissertation research at her school. She graciously complied and put the researcher in touch with her assistant. Each time the researcher wanted to visit, she contacted the school ahead of time and by the time the researcher arrived, several teachers had agreed to accommodate her. Also, the principal gave the researcher permission to eat free meals in the school cafeteria. This gave the researcher opportunities to observe behavior in the cafeteria in addition to my being provided with food.

*Social capital.* Social capital is the degree to which people can garner friendships and relationships to benefit them in other ways. These relationships can be used in exchange for favors in the future. Social capital is very beneficial when someone is looking for a job, home, or some other opportunity and they know someone who can help to open doors towards their endeavor. The friendliness of the Douglas environment makes these types of friendships possible.

If the researcher were to use one word to describe Douglas students, she would use the word ‘relaxed.’ This level of relaxation showed in the students’ casual and non-uniform style of dress and the way they carried themselves. It could also be seen in the way they addressed their teachers and the way they behaved in their classes. They often addressed the teachers as though they were their friends. They used the teacher’s last
name, but the comfort level could be seen in their interactions and in their tone. It was not unusual to see students talking with teachers in or outside of the classroom. Since most students and teachers lived on campus, they felt as they were neighbors and friends in addition to students and teachers.

The affection of the members of the small groups extended towards each other made them appear to be close friends. The researcher observed students sharing food, drinks, and plenty of laughs. She saw students obtain passes to go off campus for a meal with teachers and with each other. During my first visit to Douglas, the researcher attended a girl’s softball game. While at the game, she noticed the number of teachers who were there supporting the students. The researcher noticed that there were far more teachers and faculty members present than parents who were able to come. With faculty members living on campus with the students, and parents often living many miles away, faculty members often out number the parents at most school events. The obvious enthusiasm of the staff was likely due to their constant contact and interaction with the students. As the researcher observed the students during their free week-end time, she questioned whether or not they behaved any differently than day school students. They, too, are often affectionate and share things with their friends. The researcher pondered this thought throughout her research.

Before ever visiting Douglas, the researcher had considered what the ideal site for a boarding school would look like. She imagined a site that was in the country, yet equipped enough to operate as a self sufficient entity. The researcher thought that this type of environment would be best for students who needed an environment that was not distracting. The researcher also believed that the isolation of this arrangement would
foster closer relationships between those who lived on the campus. The lack of outside involvement might facilitate more time on school work and closer friendships. She also thought this type of atmosphere would allow students more time for extra-curricular cultural activities.

The next three times the researcher visited Douglas, she visited classes. The classes that the researcher visited were all small. The average class size at Douglas is a mere nine students. The smaller class sizes appeared to facilitate a higher quality interaction from student to student and from teacher to student. The students were not afraid to speak out and the teachers spoke to the students in a very personal manner. For example, a math teacher conducted a class almost as though it was a personalized group tutoring session. The teacher appeared to be able to sense which students had done the homework by students’ participation (without having seen their assignments) and was able to assign problems according to difficulty without insulting or embarrassing any of the students. In addition to this, students could receive extra tutorials if and when they needed even more individualized attention. After observing a geometry class and an algebra class, the researcher felt that her own feelings towards mathematics might have been more positive if she had received such personalized attention in her own math classes. Again, the question arose as to whether or not this same dynamic could be reproduced in a quality day school environment. This would be a thought that the researcher would ponder throughout her research. The researcher observed a Russian literature class, and a Spanish literature class, where some students actually got involved in the readings while other students clearly had not completed their reading assignments. The smaller class size made it very clear which students had and had not read their
assignments. Noticing the exact degrees of individual students’ engagement is difficult in larger classrooms. This type of ‘teacher detective work’ would have been more difficult in a class of 30 students. The heightened level of teacher supervision may result in a greater degree of possibility of students attaining higher levels of education capital. However, again, the researcher had to wonder if this were more a function of good teaching or the boarding school environment.

During her second visit to Douglas, the researcher stayed in the home of a teacher. The home was actually a dormitory with the teachers’ quarters attached. One social activity that the teachers do for their students is called ‘in-home meals.’ These meals happen weekly in the home of teachers who live on campus. The students are randomly divided up and assigned to different teacher’s homes each semester. During these meals, the teachers either create a menu or develop it with the students. In some cases, the teacher will prepare the meal, but in most, the students prepare the meal together with the teacher. At the meal that the researcher attended, they made omelets and crepes, with each student cutting up ingredients, and others cooking the actual omelets. Students also flipped their own crepes. The researcher felt that the evening was positive and productive in that students had an opportunity to eat out of the cafeteria, as well as being placed with other students and a teacher with whom they may not have otherwise chosen to share intimate time. This level of closeness between students and staff members is something that likely would not happen in the day school environment. Day school students do not usually have the opportunity to make and share dinner with their teachers and fellow students.
Observing students in the cafeteria and in other public venues, one could not help but notice the family type affinity the students seemed to have with each other. The accuracy of this observation was validated when the questionnaires also bore witness to this fact. The overwhelming majority of students reported having positive feelings about being a student at Douglas. Most reported that it was because of their social networks and the close friendships they established in their small, close knit community.

In the cafeteria, a small number of students sat with students who were of a different race from themselves, greater numbers who sat with people who were like them. There was an obvious easy comfort and familiarity between the students as they shared food with one another, whichever arrangement they chose to sit in. While sitting with the students, the researcher was privy to table conversations that were more personal and flowed more freely than those she had observed in day schools. The researcher can still remember the animation of the students’ faces and the bad jokes they shared.

During one dinner in particular, some African American students opened up to the researcher with regard to the way they felt about race on campus. The topic was fresh for the students because several were members of Douglas’ students of diversity association and had just returned from a diversity conference. The students were not angry or bitter, but clearly wanted to discuss these issues with an adult African American. Douglas has no African American employees, so these students flocked to the African American researcher each time she entered the campus. The African American students at the table all said that they had friends outside their race that they often spent time with, but still found that there were some degrees of racism at Douglas. The students were familiar with
and referred to Tatum’s (2003) work concerning separation and racial identity. After the meal, the students invited the researcher to a ‘students of diversity’ meeting.

During the Students of Diversity Meeting, students representing all of Douglas’ cultures came together to discuss ways in which all students could unite to an even greater degree in order to maximize the amount of social capital that students would experience at Douglas. The ‘students of diversity’ was a multi-cultural group of students whose objective was to facilitate cultural understanding between racial groups, and to better knit the student body together. The researcher gladly accepted the invitation she received at dinner to attend a meeting. The meeting was different from what the researcher anticipated. She thought the students might be somewhat disorganized and use the organization as an excuse to come together for social purposes. However, the students came with a clear agenda and were under the instructional guidance of a faculty mentor, although the mentor allowed the students to run the meeting on their own. The researcher was impressed at the leadership skills, maturity, the students’ insights, and their ability to articulate their thoughts. Students who had the privilege of attending the diversity conference gave an overview for the students who were not able to attend. The floor was opened for all members to make comments and to voice their concerns, as well as positives, and to offer suggestions for strengthening the school through organization sponsored activities.

Douglas students could not say enough about their friendships. As reported in chapter four, Douglas students credited their social relationships as being their favorite aspect of being a student at Douglas. One student said this during her interview:

Back home, I didn’t have many friends, so it’s like getting a lot of new
friends. I have very vast friendships with a lot of people here.

A Korean exchange student said this when the researcher asked what his favorite thing about Douglas was: “The people are nice…it’s easier to get close to people.”

*Cultural capital.* Cultural capital is the benefit gained when students are exposed to different cultural elements that enlighten them and add to their personal experience. These cultural elements take the form of activities, sports, trips, music, or art in most schools. According to Bourdieu’s theory (1983), exposure to cultural capital allows access into higher social circles. Entry into higher social circles opens the door to opportunities. Disadvantaged students do not usually have access to the cultural activities and opportunities that middle class and wealthier students are freely exposed to. For this study, the researcher was interested in whether or not the activities provided in boarding school would allow disadvantaged children access to higher levels of cultural capital.

In addition to attending the meeting, the researcher accompanied the students on a fieldtrip to Williams College in Williamstown, Massachusetts. The program that they attended was one celebrating African American history and heroes. The evening ended in a candlelit march and vigil. As the researcher went to this event, she realized a difference between the events that day students could attend as a group, and those that boarding school students attended. If a day school would have recommended this out of town evening program, parents or the students themselves would likely have been responsible for individual transportation. Further, it is somewhat difficult to bring 100% of students back together after they have gone home. The Douglas students went together on the school’s bus, and then talked the faculty chaperone into stopping for ice cream on the
way home. Small details like these make a difference, strengthening the bonds that tie relationships together.

Students of Douglas are clearly exposed to cultural capital on a daily basis. They are exposed through the depth of their course choices, a wide variety of extra curricula activities and club offerings, extra trips, a culturally and geographically diverse student body, exposure to the extra knowledge they gain from having closer relationships with their teachers, and an enhanced awareness and knowledge of their environment. All of these exposures work together to increase the amount of cultural capital that Douglas’s students are exposed to.

The researcher asked students during their interviews which activities they participated in. A disadvantaged female responded:

I have a lot of sports commitments. I never played sports before I came to Douglas. And now I play sports all the time. So I have games on the week-ends, practice in the afternoon...I’m the junior class president, so I sit on student government. Then I have core leadership meetings as well as the diversity club.

Another student said this of his involvement at Douglas:

There’s hands to work that I enjoy. Up until this semester I played soccer.

I did mountain biking this year, snowboarding, and lacrosse. I’m also in chorus and I do some stuff for theatre.

When the asked if he would be involved in these activities if he were at his day school, he said, “No, I’d be too shy.”
*Education capital.* Education capital is a dimension of human capital, which is the overall value of a person’s contribution. It is the element of human capital that speaks to the degree to which education adds to the value of what a person has to offer as a direct result of the education he or she has received. Education capital is used to describe a person’s worth in reference to a job or a career. It is important in this study because the level of education a person has is considered before they are hired for most jobs. The researcher thought it important to include education capital because the amount of education capital attained in high school sets the stage for what students can and will attain in college, which ultimately is a major determinant of overall success and a major factor to determine the quality of lifestyles students will lead for the rest of his or her life.

The next three times the researcher visited Douglas, she visited classes. The classes that she visited were all small. The average class size at Douglas is a mere nine students. The researcher noticed that Douglas’ smaller class sizes appeared to facilitate higher quality interactions between students and teachers. She observed students who were not afraid to speak out and teachers who spoke to the students in a very personal manner. For example, the researcher witnessed a math teacher who conducted the class almost as though it was a personalized group tutoring session. The teacher appeared to be able to sense which students had done the homework by students’ participation (without having seen their students’ assignments), and was able to assign problems according to difficulty without insulting or embarrassing any of the students. In addition to this, students could receive extra tutorials if and when they needed even more individualized attention. After observing a geometry class and an algebra class, the researcher felt that her own feelings towards mathematics might have been more positive if she had received
such personal constructive attention in my own classes. Though what the researcher saw was wonderful and special, she wondered if it could also be replicated in a smaller classroom setting in a day school environment. This would be another thought that the researcher would ponder throughout the research. The researcher observed literature classes – a Russian literature class and a Spanish literature class – where some students actually got involved in the readings, and where other students clearly had not completed their reading assignments. The smaller class size made it very clear which students did and did not. Noticing the exact degrees of individual students’ engagement is difficult in larger classrooms. This type of ‘teacher detective work’ would have been more difficult in a class of 30 students. A Korean student said this, testifying to the importance of small class sizes:

I get more help with my studies because there are too many students in Korea. But here you have only 10 people maximum, so it’s really nice.

In addition to the extra attention they receive as a result of being students in smaller classes, students also reported in their questionnaires that they receive extra help during their prep and tutoring periods. Though students complained about the heightened level of teacher supervision and strictness of the school, the extra attention students receive at Douglas likely results in greater degrees of education capital obtained by students. One student said this about the teaching at Douglas:

Douglas specializes in the way teachers present material. Like if you don’t understand something, you can see a teacher after class and be like you know I don’t get this. Can you explain this to me? and I really like that about Douglas and it’s not like we only teach this way like in my previous
school...like they humiliate you if you don’t understand...Here at Douglas

okay we’re going to take it step by step and like to make you understand.

During an interview with several teachers, they indicated that with the freedom they had at Douglas, they were free to teach more deeply. They do not have to adhere to No Child Left Behind mandates and Douglas does not have Advanced Placement. This freed the teachers to teach at the pace of their students’ learning.

The most impressive aspect of academics at Douglas is a deep commitment on the part of the administration and teachers towards providing each student with the help they need to succeed. Students with emotional issues or learning disabilities are all catered to individually and are worked with until faculty and staff figure out how best to help non-traditional students. These children do not slip through the cracks, and are not castoffs as often is the case in larger public schools. Most students noted in their questionnaires that they felt the academics at Douglas was what set it apart from the day schools they had attended, and almost 100% of students completing interviews and questionnaires are college bound. Most of them also attributed their success to having gone to Douglas. On the surveys, many said that their grades were historically average or poor, but had improved at Douglas. A majority also said they were better off academically as a result of attending Douglas. This information is represented graphically in chapter six.

Summary of Observations

After observing at the Douglas School on four separate occasions, conducting interviews, and collecting questionnaires, it is clear that the boarding environment of Douglas fosters social, cultural, and education capital. The school holds high standards, provides an intimate and safe learning environment, and empowers students to become
leaders. The social activities, the opportunities for students to develop as leaders, the outside cultural activities that students participate in that they may not have otherwise considered in the day environment, and the intensive care that the Douglas students receive due to its small size and focus on individualized teaching all provide ‘capital benefits’ to students there.

The social capital benefits the researcher saw were found in the close knit relationships she witnessed being discussed with the students, and read about on their questionnaires. Almost all of the students enjoyed their friendships and said that they were committed to staying in touch with their friends even after leaving Douglas. Cultural capital benefits can be seen in the wide variety of activities offered at Douglas. Students can participate in a variety of clubs, sports, and cultural activities. Additionally, Douglas has active music and drama departments for interested students. And finally, education capital could be seen in the small class sizes and the quality teaching that was offered at Douglas. Their aim is different from that of many other independent schools, but their aim is still excellence in serving the individual needs of their students. Taken together, these capital benefits can assist students in achieving greater academic success.
CHAPTER FIVE

Bailey College

Introduction

The purpose of this chapter is to provide an inside look at Bailey College (actually a high school. High schools are called colleges in South Africa). Bailey College is the second boarding school in my comparative study. The school serves grades eight through twelve. In this section, the researcher discusses the background of Bailey College from the perspective of how the school promotes social, cultural, and education capital. The researcher spent four weeks at Bailey College, and did daily observations of different aspects of the school. As previously stated, the researcher conducted 32 interviews at Bailey and collected 63 questionnaires from boarding students. She also interviewed six teachers, one counselor, two administrators, and two dorm parents. Two of the teachers interviewed served the dual title as teacher and administrator. Information in this chapter comes from the data collected from these sources. The underlying theme in these discussions, as in the previous one on the Douglas school, is whether or not the things the researcher observed were a function of the boarding environment or if they would be present in any quality school environment. Researcher observations represented a month long capsule of activity at Bailey. Emerging themes specific to Bailey College were tradition, transition, and a steadfast commitment to excellence despite difficulty.

When one first walks onto the Bailey College Campus, one cannot help but notice the beauty of the campus, the well maintained buildings, and the well maintained
landscape. There are mature trees, beautiful flowers, and old buildings with ivy crawling on the sides of them and curious squirrels darting back and forth. Courteous clusters of male students in black and orange striped coats or shirts and orange and black striped ties stand in groups or walk in groups. Sometimes students walk with food as they leave the snack shop – other times they sit and talk with a soda in hand, or just empty handed – but they never hesitate to nod and speak when they see or approach an adult. If you walk through the grounds in the evening, or catch a group coming from a sports field, these students will be in shorts and sneakers with socks up to their knees, but they never forget to acknowledge the presence of adults. If you walk through the campus during time of infantry practice, you will see straight rows of boys marching down the street with tall rifles resting on their shoulders. They are marching to a field to practice their commands. Or, if you come during band practice, you will hear loud trumpets and drums playing in unison and on beat.

The scenes the researcher witnessed at Bailey were impressive. The school’s attempt to maintain discipline, structure and order is clear and well received by the students there. While in the hallways and streets, students are always reserved in their deportment – and it shows. The fact that there are student leaders (prefects) to further enforce rules is probably part of the reason that students seem to try harder to maintain order. All of this is part of the Bailey tradition that Bailey’ students enjoy. In their interviews and questionnaires, most of the boys answered that they felt proud to be a student of Bailey because of the strong traditions there. When asked how they felt being a student at Bailey College, the answer was almost always “I feel proud, mam.”
At Bailey, there were students who were from homes that were poor, as well as from rural farms and middle class backgrounds. Those who were poor came from homes or rural villages where students often lacked their basic needs, as stated in chapter four when I discussed the principal’s interview. Parents of these students scraped together whatever resources possible to be able to send their children to school for the hope of a better future. Some of these students could afford boarding, and others could not. Those who could not thought it a privilege just to be able to attend a school with a reputation as great as that of Bailey – even if only as day students. Middle class students and students from rural areas with better home lives often found it more convenient to live on campus. The town had no organized public transportation or school bussing systems, so many students found it more practical to live on campus.

Students of all backgrounds who could make it into Bailey saw the benefits of being able to study in an environment where there was structure, discipline, and sufficient resources to study, including the benefit of having people around who can actually help them with their work. This is often not the case in their homes. I asked students if they felt that they received more help with their work as boarders. One student said:

Yeah, it’s cause you’ve got friends around you all the time, so if you get stuck you can go to friends or you can come down to your housemaster, and they’re a teacher at the school so they help you. And your friends, you get your cleverer friends, and friends are cleverer in different subjects, so when you get stuck you just go to them and they help you out.

Bailey’s students in the category of students who had sufficiency at home, yet selected boarding school, were attracted to Bailey’s reputation and the honor of being a
part of the school tradition. Most often they were students who had someone such as a brother, father and/or an uncle who had attended Bailey, and they wanted to continue a family legacy. They felt that being a boarder of Bailey College made them better men and that it also helped to develop their character.

The third category of students mentioned during a few of the interviews were students who were wayward, or who had issues with the misuse of drugs or alcohol and wanted support. A few boys were sent to Bailey by family members or well-meaning friends to ‘get straightened out.’ Parents or other supporters who sent these troubled boys to Bailey hoped that the structure and discipline of the school would positively redirect them. Though there were no formal drug or alcohol counseling services or support groups, students without serious problems were able to come correct under the military style discipline, close supervision, and structure in the school culture. This group represents a very small number at Bailey.

*Bailey Background and History*

Bailey College began in 1858 serving boarding boys and a few day boys from grades eight through 12. The school is located in a small and quiet town in the Eastern Cape of South Africa. The Bailey College student body of the past is very different when compared to the present body of students served. Bailey College has a history of being an elite school for White boys. In those days, the school attracted boys from hundreds of kilometers away. It was selective and well sought out. Presently, the post apartheid school is more than 70% Black, and is expected to move toward the 100% mark in the upcoming years. More Bailey students are now local.
The history of Bailey includes years of success in a variety of sports, but mainly rugby, field hockey, and track and field. Bailey has received acclaim both regionally and nationally for its success in sports. An article from the *South Africa Rugby* magazine is included in the appendix which highlights Bailey’s success in rugby. The students and faculty are extremely proud of Bailey’s athletic accomplishments. A large amount of school pride and spirit come from this deep devotion and love of the school and sports. This came out very clearly in the interviews, and also in the questionnaires where students listed sports as their favorite aspect of being a student at Bailey.

In addition to sports, Bailey is also very strong academically. The school generally scores at the top in regional comparative academic poles each year, even after the ending of apartheid forced the school to include non-White boys. The principal of Bailey has been praised and studied for his ability to maintain high academic standards, even with a radical shift of demographics in his student body. An article from the local Bailey (The Rep, Jan 12, 2007, p. 1) paper attesting to this fact and ranking Bailey number one can be found in the appendix. This article also showcases the principal’s son, praising him for his high scores.

The town is still small enough to allow for about two degrees of separation. In other words, almost everybody knows everybody, or at least someone who knows any other person in town. Baileytown is very colonial and still segregated by race and social class. Even so, Bailey College serves as a source of pride for most people from Baileytown. While the researcher was in Baileytown, she was given a tour of the segregated sections of town. A Black teacher took me to her section, then to a section for more affluent Blacks, to an affluent Colored section, then to a section for less affluent
Coloreds. The researcher lived in the White section of town, so she witnessed the
dynamics of that area daily.

Another factor that sets Bailey apart is the discipline and respect fostered in the
Bailey environment. Even though South African children are expected to be more
mannerly in general, Bailey surpasses most of the other schools in the area. Many other
schools are losing a handle on discipline and structure within in their walls. While
interviewing Bailey’s school counselor, he shared with the researcher about the discipline
problems faced by many of the other school environments that he worked in. He also told
the researcher about a time when the Bailey boys entered a multiple school event and
how the room fell quiet at their presence as they entered. However, even Bailey faculty
report a decline in the level of discipline in their boys. They attribute the loss of the right
to paddle or ‘cane’ students to the lack of respect and discipline presently witnessed in
many of their students.

The researcher witnessed the shift in the level of discipline between Bailey and a
less privileged school when she was invited to visit one of the poorer schools in Bailey.
The visit to this school was arranged by the family that the researcher stayed with
because they felt it would give me greater prospective of the area and a greater
appreciation of Bailey College. The visit to this school did just that. This school was
originally opened for Colored students, but now serves a majority Black population like
Bailey College. However, the researcher immediately noticed a difference between this
school and Bailey College as she walked into the building. At Bailey College, the
researcher was immediately recognized by the staff and students. The office staff is
always dressed in impressive school outfits they call their uniforms. However, they are
colorful and stylish skirts or dresses, and they do not look like uniforms at all. Walking into this other school that I was invited to, I had to make myself known because of low levels of commotion in the office, and it was clear that the office personnel was not trying to make a fashion statement. One of the teachers was expecting the researcher’s visit, so she was told to just sit and wait. The researcher finally got to observe three classes and to talk to several students. The students did not show the respect that the students from Bailey College showed. For example, Bailey’s boys stand when teachers enter the room and do not sit until they are told to do so. Students at the other school did not do this. They talked more in class and seemed less prepared and less serious than the students from Bailey. The teacher whose classes the researcher observed later told the researcher that two of her sons went to Bailey College and how much better it was as a school. Other teachers that the researcher met said that the money at Bailey makes a big difference in the schools.

Early during the researcher’s data collection, the most surprising observation that the researcher immediately made was that the majority of the boys at Bailey were no longer boarders, but day boys. In fact, there were only slightly more than 180 students who attended Bailey as boarders, and about 320 who were day scholars. This aspect really intrigued the researcher as one who thought she was coming to a school that was primarily boarding. She did not necessarily see this as a negative, but as an opportunity to learn the reasons for this. When the researcher inquired about the reason for the low number of boarding students, the answers she received varied with the source they were from. The researcher figured the truth lay somewhere in the middle of all these various reasons.
The researcher was told that the Bailey College was originally a boarding school that served only a few day boys. The reason the school’s publicity director gave was because a change in parental preference. He believes that in days past, there were not enough local schools around to service students, so they often sent their boys to boarding schools. He said that he believes the parents of today feel a degree of guilt that prevents them from sending their children away. He said that modern parents want to enjoy their children at home and to keep them as close as possible. When I asked the principal about the trend towards fewer boarding students, the explanation he gave had to do with school policy. He said that the new school policies require schools to take in local students before taking in students who live farther away, and that the local students often choose to live at home due to the cost of boarding and other personal factors. The answer I got from another administrator involved race issues. He noted that before Apartheid, the school was 100% White, now it is more than 70% Black. For this reason, many of the White parents who would have allowed their children to board no longer do so because they do not want their sons living with Black boys. Another reason given to me from the family the researcher stayed with is cost. They pointed out that to board is just as much as tuition itself, which is expensive for many families to pay. As it is, many of the students can barely afford tuition.

As the researcher stated in the introduction of this section, transition comes to mind as she thought of Bailey College, thus guiding this discussion. As the country and the national education system is in transition, individual schools cannot help but be affected. Though Apartheid ended in 1994, long enough for the present students of Bailey to not even remember it, the remnants of the effects still linger. Remnants linger in the
attitudes of teachers, students, parents, and are further evident in the changeover in student populations. These changes are huge and are still ongoing. Even though years have gone by, it is difficult for many to make the necessary adjustments, which is why the school demographics (70% Black, 30% White) are the way they are today.

The change in demographics has caused Bailey and other integrated schools to slide down on the prestige scale. This is a dynamic that cannot be controlled. The country is mostly Black, and this is reflected in the enrollment of the school. The school receives some government funding, and is forced to abide by a fair standard of when enrolling new students. As White parents have seen the high levels of Black students, they have sent fewer and fewer of their sons each year. Effective leadership has minimized the damage this fast demographic shift might cause.

The principal of Bailey College made it clear that he is committed to excellence despite difficulty and change. He is a strong leader, who is very determined to keep the name of Bailey College in esteem. Changes and transition in student population have brought with it a fair number of difficulties and challenges. Dealing with a student body (and their parents) that the school was unaccustomed to, overcoming old prejudices and negative attitudes, while continuing to raise the standard of the school has won this principal recognition within his ranks. Bailey College has been looked to as a model school because she has managed to maintain high rates of student success, high rates of students who pass national tests (at least 95%), and high rates that are able to go on to college (see article in the appendix). The number passing was 98% last year according to the January 12th edition of The Rep. Principals from the United States who serve in schools and must deal with policies that appear damaging (such as NCLB) could learn
from this maintenance of high standards in spite of change. The principal’s steadfast commitment to excellence and a continual positive attitude no doubt attributed to this success.

*Social capital.* The dormitories were clearly a place where the boys cultivated social capital. They lived together in close quarters and reportedly made life-long friendships. As the researcher observed student interactions in and around the dormitories, she could not help but notice how close the boys seemed to be. They often played or enjoyed a favorite show they enjoyed in common during breaks; they shared food, teased each other, and stood up for each other. This sometimes happened across racial groups, but the researcher still found race to be an obvious barrier to the maximization of student social interactions. The hazing of younger boys also served as a barrier to some students developing healthy peer relationships with students who were of a different grade. The boys reflected this sentiment in both their interviews and questionnaires. All said that they had developed closer relationships as a result of living in the dormitory and that they will likely keep in touch with their dorm friends after graduation.

During the interviews, one boy said this of his experience living in the hostel with other boys:

I think relationships in hostel are a lot closer than day boys have. Hostel life helps you a lot. It…it teaches you social skills and how to adapt and to get along with people. If there’s somebody next door to you that you don’t really like, you have to make it work. And it teaches you, in that way social skills and you can really, you know, take a lot from hostel and the way that you will have to live life.
Another boy said the following when the researcher asked him what was his favorite thing about living in the dormitories:

We get to stay with each other, and get to know each other more, and we look out after each other a lot. And we’re basically a family here.

A third boy said:

I’d say most of my friends are here and I think we have…we’re more of a family here…we work together, live together, we do everything together.

Cultural capital. Cultural capital is very important in a class based society, such as observable in Baileytown and other cities that the researcher visited in South Africa. Racism and classism likely persist because of South Africa’s long history of separation and segregation. Involvement in cultural activities and sports is mandatory. To provide its boys with cultural opportunities, Bailey offers a variety of many extra curricular options. Boys can choose from clubs like adventure club, choirs, bands, computer club, student Christian association, a wide variety of athletic options, and working for the school newspaper.

The boys are also exposed to rich tradition and cultural capital during their morning convocation meetings. During these meetings, the boys sing, the principal speaks, and there may also be a guest speaker. One morning meeting the researcher especially enjoyed began with the traditional Christian hymn, *Near the Cross*, because this is the way morning meetings were always begun. The hymn was sung by more than 500 Bailey Boys from the Bailey College Hymn Book. The boys sang loud, strong, and with great conviction – the way (the researcher was told) that Bailey boys always sang.
Their singing was thunderous and emotion provoking as it echoed through the beautiful wood structure and the high ceilings in the auditorium. After the song, the principal handed over the podium to another administrator who read a speech about perseverance. During the speech, he used several examples from the school, then other outside examples such as Bill Gates, J.K. Rowland (Harry Potter), and Colonel Saunders to demonstrate that sometimes you have to be told no numerous times before you get your yes.

Following the speech, the principal quickly moved to the main purpose for that morning’s meeting after the speech. The main purpose for that morning’s meeting was to pay respect to a teacher who was retiring after 35 years at Bailey. The principal gave him a proper roasting, and the boys and teachers all sang a hearty round of ‘For He’s a Jolly Good Fellow.’ This was followed by something done by the boys that I would never forget: the stomp and the Bailey war cry. The stomp involved the boys making a large circle, arms linked around each other, heads down and stomping to an incredible tribal war cry. This war cry was a display of both brotherhood and tradition. Only rendered on special occasions, this one was sent up in respect for the retiring teacher who had devoted so many years of his life to service at Bailey.

Another proud display of the tradition of Bailey was the wearing of the school uniform at all times. The uniforms comprised of a bold crested, black and orange striped jacket with a crest, a pressed white shirt, a Bailey tie, gray pants, and polished brown shoes. The uniform brought a type of equality as all the boys wore the same thing. Boarders were required to wear their uniforms at all times, both on and off campus. If they were doing sports, there were uniforms that were designated for this as well.
After hearing the speech at the morning meeting, and later witnessing a series of sessions where the boys’ schedules were interrupted to hear special speeches, it was clear to me that character development was important to the principal. During the researcher’s visit, the principal allocated three sessions where the boys would leave their regular classroom sessions and attend special meetings organized by grade level. During these sessions, speakers, some from the inside and some from the outside, would speak to the boys on the topics of honesty and integrity. The boys would hear each speaker speak on the same topic from his individual perspective as they rotated over the three sessions from group to group. These sessions were held weekly. Boys also learned cultural as well as social capital as they learned to respectfully address adults. As the researcher attended the classes at Bailey, she was impressed by some aspects and less impressed by others. The one aspect that the researcher was most impressed with was the degree of respect the boys are expected to have for their teachers. The boys are to stand upon the teacher entering the room, they are taught to speak to their teachers in the hallways, they always respond with ‘mam’ or ‘sir’.

Bailey administration encourages and supports teachers in taking students on field trips. The researcher accompanied a tenth grade history class on a field trip to Fort Beaufort, which one of the history teachers invited her to attend. This trip was a joint venture with the tenth grade girls from the Bailey Girls’ High School, located right down the street. During this trip, they went to the Fort Beaufort war memorial museum, and to Healdtown, a town that was destroyed during riots prior to Apartheid. The town was comprised of a school, dormitories, and teacher training facilities. The only thing that remained after the riots and fires was the high school. It was sad to see so many beautiful
buildings and history destroyed by the fires. The students were well behaved during the trip, though like any normal tenth graders, took advantage of every opportunity to have fun.

The groups rode together on the three hour bus ride in three separate mini-vans. The school had a bus, but some of the roads would not have accommodated the larger bus. During the ride to and from the sites, the boys talked and laughed all the way over. The bus the researcher was on had no music, so the boys had to entertain themselves. Overall, the researcher felt the trip was successful, as everyone remained safe, had a good time, took notes on local history, and learned a lot about from what they saw. This cultural experience was especially good for boarders since they do not often leave campus, especially on a three hour bus trip.

*Education capital.* Education capital is extremely important in an environment such as is represented in South Africa. Without education along with social connections, it is difficult for students to be successful. With more opportunities come more educational requirements. The researcher visited classrooms and dormitories in the evenings to assess the degree to which Bailey College promoted education capital. Though mostly positive, the researcher had a few mixed reactions after visiting the classrooms, but more positive reactions from observing in the dormitories.

One observation that the researcher was less impressed with was the amount of talking that went on in some classes. This observation likely stems from the fact that the researcher had been a teacher. For a school that is usually so structured and disciplined, and where the boys realize how fortunate they are to go there, the researcher was surprised when a couple of teachers had trouble keeping the boys’ attention and keeping
them from talking during the lesson. The researcher was also unimpressed with the students who did not seem to be showing full effort by doing their work. During group work, several of the students chose to talk about unrelated things and slacked in the assignment given by the teacher. Although this number was the minority, the students who failed to show effort was very obvious. The researcher thought that this was due to the large class sizes. Each class had an average of 25-30 students. In classes this large, it is harder to keep order and to ensure that all students are making contributions. Putting her observations in the context of this boarding school study, the researcher had to ask if these couple of isolated and randomly occurring incidents were a function of the boarding school environment, the relatively large class sizes at Bailey, the fact that many of the boys are indeed day scholars, or the teacher’s level of skill and classroom management. The researcher realized that strong class management skills leave the teacher clearly in control, regardless of environment or the behavior of the students.

One of the classes that the researcher visited was a life orientation class. She thought that the premise behind beginning this class was noble on behalf of the country’s ministry of education. This class was designed to have students discuss such pertinent topics as relationships, communication, their future, career aspirations, sexuality, and environmentalism. The students in the particular class the researcher observed were extremely lively and passionate on their race related discussions. The discussion began with an environmental issue, but ended in a debate which was divided along racial lines. The students discussed the possibility of a positive future for South Africans. This went into a discussion on politics, selective separatism (as was seen even in the selected seated arrangement of that class), the government, and policies such as affirmative action. The
researcher admired the courage of the teacher who allowed the healthy debating, even in the presence of the researcher. The arguments on both sides were sound, well stated, logically supported, and the students benefited from hearing issues from both sides. At the end of the class, the researcher could tell that the students still had respect for each other as well as for their teacher.

Another class the researcher observed where the students were allowed to enjoy frank discussion was an eleventh grade history class. The teacher used a textbook to go through the discussion written in their texts. The discussion was dry at first, but perked up once she backed from the book and discussion ensued. The students in the class discussed the period during the 50’s and the resulting wars and national take-overs. They discussed dynasties of the world, world systems versus local systems, the world economy and the economic impact as a result of the activities of the countries involved. Students were attentive, asked meaningful questions, made contributions and were not afraid to challenge the teacher or to ask for clarifications. This discussion led into a discussion of Apartheid.

This particular history class was small, but very serious. There were only 10 students present, who represented all racial backgrounds, though not proportional to the student body population. I found this true of most classes that I visited due to the system that is used there to classify the students. Students are placed in an ‘A’, ‘B,’ ‘C,’ or ‘D’ class depending on the level scored on the English test given the students. This system placed more White English students in the A and B classes; while the students who speak native African languages as their first language were more heavily represented in the ‘C’ and ‘D’ classes. The justification behind this was that the classes could run according to
the pace of the student’s abilities in English, since all classes would be taught in English. Even still, there was pride attached to being a member of the ‘A’ class and a striving to advance out if one was placed in the ‘D’ class.

The researcher was also interested in spending time in the mathematics classes. Her interest was in seeing different teachers teach subject matter that is considered difficult and unpopular. The researcher was impressed by the teacher’s ability to engage a large class in the subject matter. She observed a tenth and twelfth grade classes. The twelfth grade class that the researcher observed was working on logarithms. The researcher noticed that Mathematics was taught differently in South Africa. Courses are not arranged by separate content topics in Math as they are in the United States. Math classes are arranged by grade level, and the course content is mixed. For example, a twelfth grade class contains sections of advanced mathematics, Algebra, Geometry, and Trigonometry, and Calculus at grade level. The sections are sometimes interwoven within an assignment. Each grade level math class is designed this way. The most similar example that we have to this in the United States is the elementary school mathematics series called *Everyday Math*, but this is for elementary school children.

In the class that the researcher observed, the teacher was engaging, and the researcher felt that he knew both his material and students well. Although the class was large, the students really seemed to enjoy the class and the teacher. They eagerly rushed to solve problems, and to be the one to come up the solutions to difficult problems. For a larger class, the researcher felt that the teacher was a very effective math instructor. Again, this is not necessarily a function of the boarding school environment, but of effective teaching – whether in a boarding school or any other.
Most of the classes the researcher observed were excellent and run well. In the majority of classes the researcher observed, the students showed respect towards their teachers and were active participants of the class. They asked and answered questions and discussions were lively yet controlled. The students really seemed to enjoy thinking up difficult questions for their teachers. Though the researcher was generally impressed with the classes, there were two, however, that she was not as impressed with. The first was a business economics class. The class was cut short because of a longer than usual morning assembly; however, the little time that was left was not used productively in the opinion of the researcher. The students were permitted to talk about current events, but there were no clear requirements for the students to link what they had learned to business or economics. The students used this class as an opportunity to play. Again, this may have been because the class was a short one. Another class where the students chose to play was a geography class. This class was full length, but the last class of the day. It was clear that by the time the students entered the class, they were ready to be dismissed for the day. The students were supposed to be listening to their teacher, going through exercises in the book, and then working in small groups to produce a finished piece of work. This did not happen. The students talked throughout the lesson, and produced nothing when placed in the small groups. The researcher was worried for this class because though it is their last class of the day, there will always be a last class of the day and students must learn to go through their entire day if they expect to learn the entire curriculum. What I saw here was definitely more a function of that teacher’s personal teaching style than what is typically found at Bailey College or any other boarding school.
The dormitories at Bailey College were dedicated to study as much as they were used for sleeping and socializing. The researcher made several visits to each dormitory to either observe or to conduct interviews. The account below is typical of what is found in the dormitories. However, there was an interesting factor in how the boys were assigned to their respective dormitories that the researcher would like to discuss before giving her account of dormitory activities. There were a total of three dorms, each with about 60 boys. The first was an eighth grade dorm. This dorm is seen as the transition dorm where boys learn how to be a student at Bailey. The boys are somewhat protected from hazing during this year because they are the only ones in the dorm outside of the student leaders and prefects. This dorm is racially mixed because all eighth graders come here regardless of any other factors. The other two dorms are a little more interesting. One is racially mixed with Black and White boys, and the other contains only Black boys. The researcher was told that the White fathers requested that their sons live in a certain dorm because of tradition. Most of the White boys remaining at Bailey are sons of farmers. They are also legacies. Back in the days when their fathers attended Bailey, farmers’ children typically stayed in this same dorm together. The other all Black dorm has no such history.

One of the nights that the researcher came to observe, she arrived to the dormitory just as the boys were beginning prep. Prep is the period at the end of the day where the boys are required to study or do homework. When I first arrived, attendance was being taken.

*The prep schedule is as follows:*

6:30- roll call
6:30-7:15 - Homework
7:15-7:30 - Break
7:30-8:00 Break
8:30-9:15 HW
9:15-9:45 – Shower/Prepare for the next day
9:45- Lights out!!!

After attendance, the researcher was given a brief tour of the quarters where the boys slept and of their bathroom area. The researcher found the dorms to be small, as might be expected. Their rooms were actually one large open area room with wooden walls and doors created to separate sleeping quarters. The rooms were for either one boy or two. The older (senior) boys were given slightly larger rooms with windows at the corners of the hallway. This was the mixed dorm. (The all Black dorm actually had larger rooms with more space.)

After the researcher went back downstairs to the room where the boys were doing prep, she found that the boys were quiet. They are given strict instructions not to talk unless they are given permission by the teacher who is in charge during their prep times. The boys usually asked for permission when they wanted to ask another boy from their classes about assignments, but this was not very frequent.

After observing the boys, it appeared that they do use their time constructively. They were tempted to talk, and sometimes did, but it appeared that many of their conversations were about their school work. Students occasionally asked each other for
help, as well as the teacher on duty. There was, of course, the occasional horseplay – especially as break times approached – but students who played kept it to a minimum.

During the 8-8:30 p.m. break, the student prefect came in to speak to the boys about some new enforcement of rules. He said that boys could be punished for breaking rules. The prefect told the boys that if they had any questions, that they or their parents could talk to him or the head master. It was amazing to the researcher how much respect the boys showed towards their student leader. He came to speak after the teacher had left, and no one stirred at all to leave, or found it strange that their parents would have to call him if they had questions! The researcher guessed this is what one of the students was speaking about during his interview when he said that the more time you spent, the more leadership you got – or as he put it, ‘the higher up you got’ within the ranks.

During the break, some of the boys went up for their showers, some talked to friends, and others watched television. They returned promptly at 8:30 for the last leg of their study period. They only had until 9:15 to finish for the night!

Summary of Findings

Results from the questionnaires support the fact that the environment at Bailey College fosters the development of social, cultural, and education capital in the students. Judging by their responses, students clearly loved the social interactions, felt academically challenged, and also enjoyed participating in cultural activities. This was both seen in the observations and heard in their interviews.

In conclusion, after observing at Bailey College for a month, the researcher saw that the environment certainly promotes social, cultural, and education capital. This promotion of the capitals clearly led to a greater student experience. As discussed in
excerpts from the interviews, friends are like family members and are important to students, students are required and enjoy participating in cultural and sports activities, and the teaching and overall results reflect success in the promotion of education capital in the school community. The school environment is, overall, very healthy. It allows for free discussion, as the researcher witnessed while observing classes, plenty of social interaction within a diverse student and faculty population, an endless array of extra curricular opportunities, and the education that is provided is complete and of high quality, as evidenced by the high levels of student’s reported success in the classroom, and on national exams.
CHAPTER SIX

Comparative Data Analysis

Introduction

In this chapter, the researcher compares her United States and South African study schools. By comparing the two schools for similarities and differences, critical themes and issues surfaced that explained and informed the research findings outlined in this chapter. Though the researcher has discussed the individual schools at length and has provided an adequate comparison, she realizes that the research questions were clearly addressed, but not explicitly answered. As a researcher, major limitations were recognized in the short time data was collected to implicitly answer the research questions.

The researcher was successful in collecting data from two study schools as planned. As the researcher observed and collected the data, she was careful to take into account socio-cultural considerations and other factors, including the type of schools being studied, their histories and their respective roles in their separate communities. The researcher was also careful to manage the study time that she had at each school carefully to be sure that she was capturing information that would prove valuable to the study. This in-depth degree of analysis was necessary to make for a fair comparison.

A major factor that surfaced when disseminating the data in order to determine the success of the schools in serving disadvantaged students was to first understand the backgrounds of the disadvantaged students entering the boarding schools. In the researcher’s analysis, she recognized that the students without the type of social, cultural,
and education capital that would make them successful academically had usually been marginalized prior to their entering school. These students often lacked the basic essentials to set them up for success; such as quality food, a structured, caring home, discipline, and an environment suitable for study. To make matters worse, students in this ‘underserved’ or ‘disadvantaged’ category were generally less favored by the societies in which they lived.

*The Transformative Power of Social Capital in North America and South Africa*

Students from the United States who fell into the category of disadvantaged were either poor, of an ethnicity other than White, from broken homes (homes where parents had divorced, or where there had been substantial interruptions so as to lessen the stability for the children in the home), or students who had drug or alcohol addictions. Many of the students from these categories typically do not do well in school and later fall through the cracks in society. These are the students who usually end up dropping out of school, in prison, or at best, graduating from high school and taking lower level, minimum wage positions – regardless of their level of intelligence. Conversely, a few students from this population have always managed to succeed in school, as well as in their professional careers, even in the United States system with ingrained structural discrimination. The few who succeed academically and professionally usually have someone, or a program, to attribute to their success. They somehow gained access to positive, transforming, social capital. Whether their inspiration was a program or a role model, they knew that if they got a good education and applied themselves, that it was possible to attain success. For this reason, successful schools, mentors, and programs that help disadvantaged children in the United States are priceless.
Students in South Africa who were poor, non-White, or without social capital generally remained poor. For this reason, social networks have especially come to take on a greater meaning now that apartheid is over. Unlike the discrimination practiced in the United States, the system of apartheid in South Africa would never allow anyone who was not White to slip by and become successful. However, with the abolishment of apartheid, Black and colored South Africans can now move into positions that were formerly only occupied by White citizens. Now that non-White citizens can occupy powerful positions, a good education, when added to access to powerful social networks, can gain this population access into fields that were previously closed off to them. These positions include many coveted government jobs that are now almost solely awarded to Blacks due to recent affirmative action policies. However, without education and social access, these opportunities are still closed off. Even the opportunity to get a good education is not open to all, as most of the country is still poor.

In both situations, having access to a good education can change the course of a student’s life. Students who can list prestigious schools on their resumes have a greater possibility of going to college. Likewise, students who can list a prestigious college on their resumes can gain entrance into better jobs.

In the United States, the term ‘old boys’ network’ has become more of a social construction describing how jobs and opportunities are sometimes reserved for family and friends who are connected in some way to those in positions of power. This form of old boys’ network is also still very much operational in the South Africa. In South Africa, this term is taken as literal with regard to Bailey College graduates. Boys who graduate from Bailey College and other prestigious or formerly prestigious institutions are called
the *Old Boys*. Many of these men are faithful to their Alma mater, and take the old boys’ club as serious as people are to their fraternities and sororities. The Old Boys network at Bailey is yet alive and thriving. There are even international chapters, such as the one in England. These old boys meet occasionally in reunions and still support each other when they can. Being a graduate of Bailey College equals immediate access to social capital through a long history of men who are in a position to help Bailey’s graduates.

*Social and Political Issues in United States and South African Racial Identity*

The historic complexity of the differences in racial breakdown between the United States and South Africa provides an interesting dynamic. Though Black people have traditionally been oppressed in both countries, the way in which diverse ethnic groups came to the countries is different, which created the basis used by each country to identify racial categories. The institution of slavery brought thousands of African Slaves to America. These slaves went on to reproduce offspring with other Africans, Whites, Native American Indians, and to a lesser degree, Asians. Their offspring’s identifying label went from being colored, to Black, to Negro, to afro-American, to now Black or African American. No matter what the concentrations or differences in the racial mixes, this group has primarily remained a single people within the Black or African American race. In addition to this group, all of the European groups have mixed and merged throughout the years and have come to be simply known as White. The exception of both groups (Black or White) are those who are recent immigrants, or those who have somehow managed to keep the family ethnic lines (gene pools) consistent or unmixed throughout their generations in the United States. In the last 25 years, however, the United States has welcomed many immigrants to the mix. Each of these groups identifies
as their own until they marry either Black or White Americans to create the bi-racial or multi-racial categories that also exist today.

The South African racial categories are a bit more complex – especially the Black ones. The most numerous group is Black South Africans who represent several indigenous tribes including the Xhosa, Zulu, Sutu. The Dutch later settled in South Africa. They eventually mixed with indigenous Black South Africans and created the Colored racial category – which is not to be confused with the Black categories of South Africans. The Dutch and the Colored group both speak the Afrikaans language as their mother tongue. This Colored group has managed to remain an accepted separate racial category, enjoying their own culture and identity. The next group, the A-Colored, have one present generation Black parent and a present generation White parent – not to be confused with the Colored group. These children usually speak English as their first language, unless one or both parents happen to speak Afrikaans. The second White group to come to South Africa is the British. They are English speaking, and not to be confused with the Dutch descended Afrikaans group. In addition to these groups are a small number of Middle Eastern Muslims, Eastern Indians and an even smaller number of Asians, typically from China.

Race and class have remained constant variables affecting the degree of access and opportunity citizens have in both the United States and South Africa. As noted above, each country had different racial categories and each country has spoken and unspoken social and political policies attached to racial identity. Though both countries claim to strive for racial equality, equity, and equal opportunity, neither has quite mastered the effects of human nature that prevent them from being comfortable living with those
different from themselves. The tendency in people to be most comfortable with those like themselves and to think in terms of racial comparisons prevents total integration. Neither country has successfully integrated neighborhoods or schools on a large scale. The phenomenon of White flight has extended the borders of many cities in the United States as non-spoken, non-written rules of conduct keep White South Africans from selling property in exclusive neighborhoods to Black South Africans. In both countries, when a Black family breaks through the invisible bonds and succeeds in moving into a White neighborhood, the integration is short lived as White families slowly begin to move out, often forming new and exclusive communities (at least for as long as they can keep them exclusive). There are a few exceptions in some American and South African communities, especially when the Black family has attained a higher degree of professional and social status.

Such racial and political dynamics weigh heavily on the climates that young students face when pursuing an education and in seeking employment. Though the job search for young people in both countries is competitive, each has professional areas that need to be filled. The situations in both the United States and South Africa are such that there are opportunities for students of any race who are the top in their fields. Though students must ‘know’ something to be competitive in either country, it is still most often not only ‘what’ you know, but also ’who’ you know. This dynamic intensifies the need for social capital. Young Black students are faced with an artificial sense of security as each country (on the surface), strives to manifest the concepts of ‘equal access’ and ‘equal opportunity’ in their hiring practices. Consequently, neither young South African nor students from the United States remember the struggles that their forefathers and
mothers fought to create the possibility for equality. This lack of remembrance, coupled with opportunities as a result of affirmative action efforts, frees them to aim for lofty goals when they have received a quality education, but often weakens their resistance to mediocrity and lessens the intensity with which they set and strive towards goals. It also blinds them to the remaining discrimination and the continuous need to fight for equality in their countries.

There are more similarities than differences in social climates of the United States and South Africa. The main differences the researcher noticed were (1) a heightened awareness and acknowledgement of racial issues in South Africa – especially among adults, (2) a more open conversation concerning racial issues with adult South Africans, but a greater reluctance in the students to discuss these same issues, and (3) a greater global awareness in South African adults and students. South Africans were more knowledgeable about and more open to being educated and to the pursuit of opportunities abroad. Adults in both the United States, as well as in South Africa, are more knowledgeable about racial issues because they have lived through more. The researcher found the issues more sensitive in South Africa than in the United States. There was also still visible racial stratification and open discrimination. The researcher experienced it personally until it was discovered that she was from the United States. Many White South Africans that the researcher talked with are still angry about the current state of political affairs, and many are trying to join the five million other South Africans who have immigrated to Australia. The researcher was especially exposed to this disposition through the family that she stayed with. Through theirs and others’ stories, the researcher learned that most White South Africans (as well as many Black South Africans) do not
trust the current Black leaders. They question their very ability to run the country, doubt their integrity, and talk against the affirmative action that are brought with the new regime. In fact, one teacher mentioned that she does not see racism lessening as time progresses, but getting worse because of the anger of the young adult generation of South Africans. She believes that the inability to find work as Whites (due to affirmative action) is going to keep friction between the races and that the racism they feel will be passed down to their children. The researcher witnessed a few students who were the recipients of this type of ‘passed down’ hatred in one of the classes she observed. The researcher discussed this story in the previous chapter. It was the class where the teacher provided a safe space for students to discuss issues as they pleased. The researcher observed a group of White students, led by one student, debate with a group of Black students, who also clearly had a leader, on a local racially charged issue. During the debate, both students mentioned things that they had to have been told about from an older person who had actually lived through apartheid since many of the things they spoke of took place before they were born. The researcher found the attitudes and boldness of these students more the exception than the rule. Most students were reluctant to even state their own race during my face to face interviews, stating that race did not matter.

After spending six weeks in the country, it was clear to me that race did matter. Because the researcher was considered an African American, rather than a Black South African, she was privy to conversations that she would not have been allowed to be present in if she were in the United States. Being from the United States, the researcher was considered different there. The White South Africans were very free with their conversations in my presence. People would say things like, “I don’t know what’s wrong
with that Black culture. They just destroy everything”...or “Baileytown used to be so beautiful before they took over...,” or, “We just don’t trust that Black leadership...” The researcher also heard a young girl say that she thought interracial dating was illegal as she watched an interracial on television. The most blatant display was possibly when the researcher saw another African American student discriminated against while attempting to find temporary housing. When she went to the house that was advertised, she was told not to get out of the car...that the house was already rented. Suspicious, she told a White person who later called to inquire, only to find out that the house was still available. Incidents like these made the researcher painfully aware of the importance of social, cultural, and education capital in South Africa. With as many people in this environment still discriminating against Black people, social capital becomes even more important. In some cases, if you do not know someone, entry and access to opportunity will be blocked by the visible and invisible structures in place.

South African students may have been likely to discuss these issues because apartheid times were so difficult for their parents that they may have chosen not to talk about them to their children. Also, South African curricula attempt to stress racial harmony and the similarities present rather than differences. Differences in global awareness between students from the United States and students from South Africa were due partially to the mental position of students from the United States as being superior to other nations, and the fact that they are generally not required to think about what is happening in other countries. Old school United States curricula that are weak in discussing things from a global perspective, and weak media, can be partially blamed for this. The news media in South Africa covers many global events – including those from
the United States and Europe. News in the United States generally covers either horrific events, sensational events, or events that directly affect people from the United States. This sparse coverage, which many Americans choose to ignore, come up short in helping people from the United States to tap into the lives of others. Additionally, the entertainment, television and movies put out by the United States are so popular worldwide that other countries routinely air North American programs, whereas this is not true of North American’s exposure to television from other countries.

A quality education is important for disadvantaged students based upon the impacts of political and historical events. Both the United States and South Africa offer private schools for parents who can afford better schools for their children. Boarding schools have been offered as an option in both countries. There is a slight difference in the reasons that students from the United States and South Africa chose to go to boarding schools in the past. Boarding schools were more common in Africa in general, including South Africa, due to the geography of the continent. The land is so wide and vast that people were once very spread apart. The lack of infrastructure development, developed public transportation systems, and people with motor vehicles made it difficult for people to travel. Since many African students lived in rural farming areas, often far from quality schools, boarding schools were more practical for these children. The presence of boarding schools is also likely due to colonization and the British influence in many areas, as the boarding school model was popular in England and was thus passed to Africans by early colonizers. A few African boarding schools were very elite schools, while most others served poorer students.
In the United States, most early boarding schools historically served wealthier students who sought entrance into elite boarding schools for the prestige attached to being members of elite institutions. These schools were and are seen as gateways into the more elite colleges and universities. However, there were also boarding schools developed to serve special disadvantaged student populations of society. Less prestigious schools for orphans, Native Americans, and African Americans were also opened. Detailed information regarding each of these types of school environments can be found in the literature review section.

This background information on why each and how the United States and South Africa used boarding schools in the past provides insight on their current use for these schools. It also helps the reader of this study to understand any differences in data or the existence of the possibility of the school environments promoting social, cultural, and/or education capital. Even more importantly, this discussion may help the reader to understand the roles of these capital benefits in the respective societies.

Similarities and Differences

The researcher summarizes the similarities in the two schools below. These similarities include the fact that both schools contain a boarding component, are somewhat isolated and located in a small town, offer excellent educational programs along with a wide variety of cultural activities, have similar schedules, have prep study times in the evenings, have strict demerit systems when students break rules, have diverse student populations and host international students – although one is primarily White, and the other primarily Black, respond positively to their environments and speak well of them (which can be seen in the charts below), are rooted in pride and tradition, are
located on beautiful sites surrounded by mountains and land, and are run by competent
administrators. These structural similarities likely account for the similarities in the
answers put forth by students in their questionnaires. These responses are graphed
beneath the chart of differences and limitations.

These similarities deal with the main elements of the school structure; however,
there are some major elements that remain that are different. The main three are the sizes
of the schools, the ratio of boarders to day students, and the fact that one school is co-ed
while the other is a single sex male school. These structural differences are noted below
that explains the impact of these differences.

Table 1: Impact of Differences on Study Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Douglas</th>
<th>Bailey</th>
<th>Impact on Study Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>School Size</td>
<td>120 Students</td>
<td>550 Students</td>
<td>Overlap in main study results. Similarities in conclusions despite differences in school size.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture</td>
<td>United States,</td>
<td>South African,</td>
<td>Similarities despite cultural differences strengthen the validity of common conclusions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Diverse</td>
<td>Diverse</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question-Aires returned</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>Participant responses were very similar despite sample size.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex of students</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Co-ed</td>
<td>Differences in gender type school erase the possibility of findings regarding the phenomena of interest being gender based.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age, grade of students</td>
<td>Ages: 14-19,</td>
<td>Ages: 13-19,</td>
<td>8th and 9th graders represent a very small number of my study. The answers between the 8th grade South Africans and the 9th grade North Americans showed no difference in their student’s levels of maturity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Grades: 9-12</td>
<td>Grades: 8-12</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uniform Policy</td>
<td>Very casual</td>
<td>Strict adherence</td>
<td>What students wore did not appear to have an affect on how they felt about each other, their</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>dress</td>
<td>to uniform</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Despite cultural and geographic separation, students from the two study schools responded similarly in a questionnaire that measured student’s attitudes toward their school, relationships formed as boarding students, how they spent free time, and their college and career aspirations. These graphs reflect strong similarities in student attitudes. The attitudes determine student motivation and the degree to which they will take advantage of the education, social, and education capital at their disposal.
Students from both Bailey and Douglas were very fond of their choice for a school. They did not always like everything about their respective schools, but generally had positive comments regarding their experiences. A disadvantaged United States male Douglas student had this to say about his school when asked how he felt about being a Douglas student:

It has its advantages and disadvantages. The advantages thankfully outweigh the disadvantages, which is why I’m still here, why I’m graduating as a senior. So yeah...I’ve met some really neat people and I’ve gotten to develop friendships here that I don’t think I would have if I went

Figure 2: Students’ attitudes towards school: Douglas and Bailey

![Bar chart showing students' attitudes towards school. The chart displays the number of students with positive, somewhat positive, neutral, somewhat negative, negative, and no response attitudes. The colors blue and purple are used to distinguish between Douglas and Bailey students.](chart.png)
to a day school in the city or anywhere else. So that’s what I’m most grateful for.

A White male had this to say:

I love it here. Like I’ve been going here for the last three years including this one; and I just, I feel like I fit in here and I’m comfortable.

A Korean exchange student responded this way to the question:

It’s like felling love each other...like it’s like living in the dorm and it’s more like family living together and if there’s faults we have to fix it...

I like it.

A student from Bailey College showed equally endearing sentiments when I asked him how he felt about being a student of Bailey. He said:

Very proud actually. It’s a very traditional school, and keeping traditions is what I’m passionate about.

Another student said:

I actually feel proud because it’s actually a good traditional school. My brother has passed through it and he’s been successful and so have many other people, I actually feel proud being a student at Bailey.

And finally, the head boy of Bailey expressed his sentiment this way:

My favorite part about it is that it’s like a second home. You learn to... you learn to get along with four kinds of races, people with different backgrounds. I think mostly you get to, get along, you get to understand people better, cause you spend every day with them, and not just like maybe a brother or sister, it’s like, 60-70 boys, and your, your relationship
with people improve and the way that you handle situations. I think you understand people better than other people do by being in hostal (the dormitory).

Figure 3: Students’ favorite aspect of going to boarding school

Most of the students from Douglas and Bailey enjoyed their school and were happy to tell why. The main reason that Douglas students enjoyed their school was because of the social relationships they were able to enjoy. Though several students and faculty members alike openly complained about their school’s social setting being like a
fish bowl, they still regarded the social life and their relationships as their favorite aspect of going to their school.

Bailey’s students mentioned sports as their favorite aspect. In most of the interviews and interactions that the researcher had with the boys, most of them mentioned that she missed out because she would not be there for the rugby season. Most of the interviewees expressed that this is the time when the most school spirit is exhibited. They are all proud to be a part of Bailey College during this time.

Though the schools differ in what they like most about their schools, both avenues – friendships and sports – are gateways to attaining social and cultural capital. During the interviews, it came out clearly that the boys who play sports form very close bonds with the other boys on the teams.
Figure 4: Relationships

The percentage of students at each school who reported having mentors on the questionnaires was about 50%. These mentors came from a variety of roles throughout the school such as other students, teachers, coaches, and older siblings who had attended the school (especially in the case of Bailey). During the interviews, it was clear, however, that many Bailey students did not fully understand the concept of what the word ‘mentor’ met until I explained it to them. And at both schools, some students had what could be described as mentors in their lives and did not acknowledge them as such. I think this made both schools’ numbers of students with mentors lower.
Slightly more than half of the respondents reported having role models at their school. The presence of role models proves to influence students in decision making and encourages students to continue positively.

Figure 5: Mentorship

The majority of students from both Bailey and Douglas planned to go on to college. Thirteen students answering the question from Douglas reported that their choice to go to college is as a direct result of attending that school, and 12 students of Bailey reported the same. It is likely these were disadvantaged students whose life chances and choices were positively altered as a result of selecting their boarding schools.
Most students who answered had clearly thought about what they wanted to do once they graduated college. They desired to be professionals, though a small minority were not sure or did not respond to the question. This demonstrates a possible positive influence of the boarding environment on student’s choices for their futures.
Figure 7: Careers
These graphs representing college and career aspirations and race demonstrate that regardless of race, the majority of the students interviewed planned to go to college and had already been considering the careers they wished to pursue once they graduate. This is a direct reflection of the education capital and the confidence instilled by each institution.

After considering findings from each school, it is clear that the differences in school size, culture, student race and ethnicity, sample size for questionnaire completion, the fact that the school is single sex, and the differences in uniform policies, or the fact that students in South Africa speak and refer to teachers as ‘mam’ or ‘sir’ while students
from the United States are less formal made no difference in the research questionnaire findings, which indirectly measured the impact of the Bourdieu’s (1977, 1993, 1996) capital benefits through students’ responses.

*Does the Boarding School Environment Promote [Bourdieu’s] Social, Cultural, and Education Capital?*

*The boarding environment and social capital.* The information that the researcher found in the research all supported the fact that people, including students who live together, foster closer relationships. Students both in North America, as well as South Africa, stated this over and over in their interviews. This fact was also backed up by the counselors and teachers who had observed students living on campus. After settling with this finding, the researcher had to ask whether this meant that the students necessarily had greater social capital. These students who spend all of their time on campus are omitted from activities that they may have participated in off campus. For example, a student who may be interested in dance and take their dance classes on campus might be excluded from making friendships with a dance troop that may meet off campus. This same scenario could play out for any sort of cultural lesson or intramural sport that a child may pursue in high school. Therefore, it would seem that the student who comes from either an economically disadvantaged background or from parents who do not have the time to take their children around to the various activities would benefit most from being in the boarding environment for social networking reasons.

Boarding school students gain social capital at school, but may lose it in their home environment. Social capital loss is a definite possibility when students attend boarding school for many years, such as in South Africa where some students begin
boarding in first grade. This loss is also seen in cases where a boarding student’s family speaks a different language or dialect at home, or is extremely poor. The student may especially lose out on family culture and social capital because he will be ‘different’ or ‘the other’ in his own home. The degree of gains and losses are relative to the type of capital and outside exposure his home life would have allowed him or her.

The boarding environment and cultural capital. The boarding environments of both the Douglas School and Bailey College each provide a rich setting for students to attain cultural capital. Both schools offer a wide variety of enriching extra curricular activities offered both during and after school hours. Further, students of both schools represented in this study report that they enjoy taking part in the schools’ cultural activities and that they probably would not be participating in such a wide variety of activities if they were day students. When interviewed and questioned on the questionnaires, most said that they would be spending more of their spare time watching television or playing video games if they went home after school. The manner in which students spend their time can be seen on the charts below, where nearly all respondents note that they spend their time far more constructively in boarding school than they would if they were to go home after school each day. At both schools, the majority of students chose to participate in some form of sport or athletic activity. Extra physical activity has implications for greater health benefits as well as enhanced cultural and social capital. Though it is clear that the boarding environment can provide plenty of access to cultural capital, the degree to which an individual student benefits depends on the environment he left at home, as well as his/her own desire to experience cultural activities.
The degree to which a student benefits from cultural capital also depends on the degree to which he/she is able to make meaning from the activities he/she participates in. Two factors that made the activities at the boarding schools provoke meaning in the students were the explanations given prior the activities and the discussions following. Also important is the frequency with which activities were offered to the students. Because the students had the benefit of repetition by participating in cultural activities daily, they were more likely to be able to make meaning and to make connections between their various activities and their lives.

![Student's Use of Time](image)

Figure 9: How students spend their leisure time
Students reported spending their time productively in activities that enriched them socially, culturally, and educationally. Many of these activities allowed the students to benefit from more than one capital, again demonstrating the interconnectedness of the capitals.

*The boarding environment and educational capital.* Whether or not the boarding environment contributes to a student’s educational capital depends first and foremost on the quality of the school and school’s programming. In this study, both the Douglas School and Bailey College provided a relatively strong academic program. Each of these schools operates under strong administrators who, while managing all of the other school business and affairs, keep the quality of education offered at their respective schools the main priority. Each school offered a wide variety of course offerings, opportunities for students to take either extra classes or tutorials, and each provided quiet time each evening for homework. And in each of these two schools, there are adults and other students present during the homework study blocks who can help students to overcome difficult spots. The support provided in good boarding schools provides a much more positive experience than a student being alone at home with no help and not understanding their homework. The majority of student respondents who responded to the question, ‘Do you feel that you are better off here than at a regular day school? Why?’ answered affirmatively. Most students credited the academics at their respective schools for making the environment better than their day school environments.

Students living in a home where he/she has access to resources that will help him/her to succeed, then he/she too will excel if he/she is motivated. For example, a home may provide the internet, an older brother or sister and parents who can all help
with homework, neighborhood friends who attend the same school, a local library, resource books in the home, and a nice quiet study office. A student with all of these resources may not benefit from the boarding environment; however, one who lacks the necessary supports will likely experience better success in the structure found in most boarding schools.

Figure 10: Do students feel that they are better off in their Boarding Schools?
Does the Boarding School Environment Increase Academic the Quality of Student Academic Experience?

The question of the link between boarding schools and the quality of student academic experience is what began this study. The researcher wanted to know whether or not the boarding school environment alone could make a difference in the educational achievement of disadvantaged students.

The boarding school environment has some definite benefits to students who attend. As seen above, most boarding school students feel they are better off as a direct result of studying in a controlled environment. As far as an increase in student academic achievement, students report a slight increase of achievement due to their attending boarding school. Of the 32 Douglas questionnaire respondents, only eight reported that their grades had historically been good, 10 reported that their grades were fair, and 12 reported a history of bad grades. Nineteen students reported that their grades were currently good. This shift may be a result of the boarding school structure, the extra attention Douglas provides in tutorial assistance, the individual attention provided students as a result of small school and class sizes, that students try harder because of the personal relationships they have formed with their teachers, the knowledge that this school is expensive and their desire not to waste their parents’ money, the appreciation by financial aid students of a great educational opportunity, or the fact that a small number of these students may be in ‘last chance’ situations. The source of student motivation in this case is difficult to pinpoint or measure, though students reported that they felt they were better off at Douglas than in their day schools, and they also reported that they were earning higher grades than they did at their day schools. The majority of students
answering the questionnaires for both schools reported they were doing more challenging work while earning better grades.

![Grades Before and After Boarding School](image)

**Figure 11: Students’ grades**

Even with harder work, most students reported currently having good grades as well as having grades better than their friends in day schools.

Most students believed that the work at boarding school is more difficult than the work required of them in day school. Only a small minority felt that the work was actually easier.
Is the Work in Boarding School more Challenging than that of Day School?

Figure 12: Students’ perception on the level of difficulty of their work in Boarding School

Do Boarding Schools Meet the Often Unmet Needs of Disadvantaged Students?

The often unmet needs of disadvantaged students include adequate food, clothing, and shelter as the most basic levels. On a higher level, students need supervision and caring. Taking things higher, students need opportunities to grow and seek ways to communicate effectively. Students need a quiet and safe place to do their homework and many need someone for reinforcement to ensure that it is done. Students may also need help and support for when they do not understand their assignments.
These are needs that often go unmet in the homes of disadvantaged children. Many disadvantaged children are economically disadvantaged and left without many of their more basic needs. The only food that some of these children eat is provided at school. These children are in survival mode and living hand to mouth. Their living conditions and lack of proper nourishment often prevents them from achieving at their greatest levels of potential. In some of these homes, parents are not able to pay utility bills, literally leaving their children in the dark, struggling to keep warm. Other parents are able to feed their children and to keep the utilities working, but fail to provide order, structure or routine for their children. These children come home to loud and disruptive atmospheres. There may be fighting, strangers coming and going at all hours, and an overall lack of cohesion within the dwelling. And finally, there may be parents who attempt to provide their children with what they need, but fail to because of their own lack of knowledge. They may not know what a quiet place for homework looks like or be able to help their children with their homework.

Boarding schools that are operated like Douglas and Bailey provide all of the unmet needs above. They provide healthy meals, beds to sleep in, a homework space, and more homework support and reinforcement than most students want. All students are required to follow schedules and routines and are given constructive activities to fill any spare time they may have. With this support, most disadvantaged students have enough help to succeed academically. This support, coupled with the strength of the nature of the institution, empowers students to perform. Even still, all students, disadvantaged or not, must also find an inner source of strength and motivation to perform academically.
Leadership Skill Development...An Unanticipated Finding

After observing at both the Douglas School and Bailey College, the researcher was amazed at how the boarding environment fostered the attainment of leadership skills, in addition to social, cultural, and education capital. All students at Douglas have an opportunity to lead because the school is small, accommodating of individuality, and always open to new ideas. Any student at any time can propose starting a new club, promote charitable causes, or embark on an extra education business related business. For example, one of the students proposed starting an internet radio station, and this was financed by the kitchen staff when they learned of his desire. The researcher saw students start clubs, run club meetings, and arrange and run special programs for the entire school. The researcher also observed students who spoke out in public arenas for causes that they believed in and wanted to support, and the researcher saw shy students take the lead in classes because of the freedom provided by the smaller class sizes. This was particularly impressive because so many of these students were lost in their large public day schools. These student leaders are gaining confidence and valuable leadership skills that will go with them when they reach college campuses and throughout the rest of their lives.

At Bailey, the researcher was equally surprised to see the degree to which students were respected as leaders. Students were given free reign to run the dormitories and other activities under very loose guidance of their dorm parents or school administrators. As a result, the students had just as much, if not more, respect for their student leaders as they had for adult leaders. The researcher witnessed a time when a student leader was speaking to a group (without an adult present) and there was not a sound in the room. The researcher heard the student leader tell the other students that if
they had a problem with what he said to have their parents talk to him. This was really surprising. During an interview with a dorm parent, she confirmed the degree to which student leaders are given responsibility. She said:

The leaders in our hostel, the run the hostel...we don’t interfere. We’re just here as a backup. We did interfere in the past and it didn’t work. The minute you interfere with the leaders, you sort of split them. The boys stick together. They learn to work as a team. That’s how we experienced it...The boys are so good here as leaders that we never - seldom have a problem. And if there’s something, we will go and sort it out. But we don’t overrule our leaders here...It’s funny how it works...If you interfere, you sort of break down the whole thing.

The level of responsibility held by student leaders gives them great confidence and prepares them for leadership positions in the future. There is one drawback to this, however. The drawback, though, is seen through the eyes of an outsider. Younger students often complained of the bullying done by older students and student leaders. Not all student leaders haze or ‘skunk’ (as South Africans call it) younger students, but many do. The majority of Bailey College students noted skunking as their least favorite aspect of living in a dormitory. This negative aspect of student leadership is seen as culturally accepted behavior because all students go through it and all of the students will have their turn to pay the behavior backwards to younger students when they become seniors. It is almost a rite of passage.
How do North American and South African Boarding Schools Compare as an Intervention?

Both Douglas and Bailey served students who needed intervention. Some because they were disadvantaged, and others because of the students’ own personal problems, shortcomings, and addictions to drugs or alcohol. The number of students in this latter category was much lower than the reasons that students were typically disadvantaged. Each school, in its own way, sought to help these students. Both Douglas and Bailey employed counselors, had strict structure and discipline, and kept a close watch on their students who were in need of measures of intervention.

There were observable differences in the quality of care students in need would receive from the two study schools. Douglas has the benefit of its smaller size, possibly enabling school personnel to intervene quicker when students need it. When a school is smaller, odd behaviors are noticed quicker than in larger environments. When the researcher asked the principal of Douglas how she saw at risk students benefiting from the boarding environment, she noted:

Mostly because of our, our close oversight of them and ability to interact with them in different roles. And so they don’t slip through the cracks, you know there’s no back row in the classroom. There’s no way that you’re going to sit alone in your room in your dorm and not have somebody observe and try to pull you in...

Any school, especially boarding schools, have procedures and buddy systems to monitor student behavior, but larger schools have more hiding places for students to hide problems for longer periods of time. Teachers are also more likely to notice problems...
more quickly at Douglas because most of them live on campus with the students and eat
with them on a daily basis. The students are also free to visit with their teachers as needed.
Also, the younger age of most of Douglas’ teachers might allow them to pick up on odd
or dangerous behaviors more quickly than teachers who are not as apt to know the latest
with teenagers. A final way that the teachers of Douglas get to know their students better
is that all students are assigned an advisor, and each student also has a one on one tutorial
session several times a week. Teachers have the opportunity to pick up on a lot by
spending quality one on one time with their students. Another factor is the youthfulness
of Douglas’ teachers and the more casual relationships observable between the Douglas’
students and their teachers. The increased time spent with their teachers may be the cause
of the ease with which teachers relate to the students and vise versa. Even with this
degree of closeness, though, one student reported that she was reluctant to discuss her
‘mistakes’ (such as involvement with drugs or alcohol) with adult teachers or faculty
members because of the mandatory reporting laws. The relationships at Bailey were more
formal with all of the ‘mams,’ ‘sirs,’ and respectful nods. The researcher noted some
exceptions with younger faculty members; however, these were exceptions. Though
many students reported they had easy relationships with their teachers, during their
interviews, the atmosphere was noticeably more formal than that observed at the Douglas
school.

Both schools provide a great sense of stability, structure, and discipline for
students in need of measures of intervention. Even when the students tire of it, they have
time tables that rule their days and are kept safe from the possibility of slipping into the
habit of poor time management, skipping classes and not doing homework. Students, of
course, may indulge in these behaviors, but they find that the temporary relief brought by the behaviors is not worth the hefty consequences. In boarding schools, privileges are much more highly appreciated because of the closed and controlled environment. When students’ privileges are taken away, they feel as though they have been imprisoned since there is no home to go to for reprieve. Both schools are strict in enforcing their policies. While at Douglas, a student that the researcher was scheduled to interview had been sent home for suspension...she was sent by plane to another state. And while at Bailey, it was clear after sitting in on a faculty meeting where problem students were discussed, that students would be dismissed either permanently or temporarily if they repeatedly failed to follow certain rules.

*Are Boarding Schools a Remedy?*

The answer to the question of whether or not boarding schools are a remedy is embedded in the discussions above. This question asks whether boarding schools are ‘a’ remedy, meaning one possible help – not the final answer. This research suggests that boarding schools can be a remedy for certain students who are motivated, but need to live in an environment that matches their desire to perform well in school. Capable students who come from homes that are unsupportive and not conducive for learning are ideal for the boarding school environment. These homes may include parents who are too busy to be attentive to their children’s learning needs, unable to provide the necessary transportation to enable students to participate in extra-curricular activities, or homes where parents are uninvolved in their children’s education. Students who needed separation from their parents were also ideal candidates for boarding school. The other important piece in determining whether or not boarding schools serve as a remedy is the
quality of the boarding environment. The boarding school must have a quality and positive learning environment that offers a quality education, social outlets, and a variety of cultural activities. These factors are used in determining the fitness of a school for serving a remedy for students.

In sum, though there were cultural, geographic, gender, and slight age differences in the students from both Bailey College and the Douglas School, they responded similarly to the questions posed on the questionnaires and in the face to face interviews. Students from both schools appreciated the extra social, cultural, and educational opportunities afforded but them living in the boarding school environment. Faculty members and administrators echoed the responses of the students at both schools stating that they believed that the boarding school environment enriched the educational experience of the students attending the schools. During observations, the researcher noticed that although the students experienced different day to day activities on a different schedule and in a different environment, the social, cultural, and educational benefits were similarly beneficial to students’ academic experience in the two study schools. The researcher also learned that although no academic environment is perfect for every student, the boarding school environment presents benefits for students whose personal situations dictate their fitness for the boarding school environment.
CHAPTER SEVEN

Conclusions, Implications, and Recommendations

Conclusions

This chapter discusses the general conclusions reached by the researcher, the implications for k-12 practice and further study, and finally recommendations for k-12 practice and further study. A detailed discussion of general conclusions is listed below. Researcher conclusions include a detailed discussion on the type of student most suited to the boarding school environment, how school quality impacts student experience, how student attitude and motivation affect student experience, and a section on avoiding harmful institutionalization by managing the ratio of advantaged to disadvantaged students. These general conclusions are followed by a section entitled implications, in which it is discussed the implications of the findings in the research. The recommendations section follows the implications sections and contains the recommendations made for k-12 practice as well as for research. The recommendations section is the last section of this chapter.

In the beginning of this study, the researcher sought the answer to several primary questions. The first and overarching questions were whether or not the boarding school environment promoted Bourdieu’s capitals and whether the presence of these capital benefits would positively impact student experience. A more central question having even greater implications focused on trying to determine the type(s) of student(s) who would benefit most from the boarding environment. As the researcher sought the answers to these questions, she began to realize that there were no quick or easy answers. The
researcher could see that the answers lay in a multiplicity of circumstances which
working together would frame various scenarios to determine student fitness for the
boarding environment. As stated earlier, the researcher exhausted her resources of time
and access to the study sites to address the questions and to provide a thorough analysis
only to find that it was impossible to answer the questions given the constraints. More
time in the field, more interviews, and an analysis of several other schools would have
perhaps brought the researcher closer to finding the answers, and an expanded
longitudinal study may have provided the data to answer the questions with some degree
of certainty.

In Figure 1 on page 15, the researcher illustrated the interconnectedness of
Bourdieu’s capitals and also linked them to economic capital. The point made with this
figure was that the capitals were not only interconnected, but also built upon each other.
This was reinforced as the researcher conducted her study. The researcher saw that
certain activities could qualify as two or more of the capitals. For example, an activity
such as field trip to a historically based play could provide a student with both cultural,
social and education capital. The same might be said for participation in chess club. To
both complicate the issue and further the point, the researcher also realized that two
students could attend the same event, but not derive the same benefits. One student might
gain social capital relating to his/her social interactions during an event, while another
may sit alone and have little social discourse. Also, the amount of cultural capital the
student is able to benefit from would depend upon his/her personal background, prior
knowledge, and the student’s ability to process the particular cultural experience. This
overlap in capitals was noticed throughout the study, making exact measurements of how much students benefited from each form of capital impossible.

Factors Suggesting Which Students Benefit Most from the Boarding Environment

Students’ home lives. Even before doing this study, it was clear to the researcher that there is no one school or school structure perfect for all students. Students bring with them a variety of intelligences, dispositions, learning styles, cultures, religions, and personal tastes and preferences. Diversity in school structures are necessary for dealing with the diversity of needs represented by the students. Knowing this going into the study, the researcher knew that she would not be making a recommendation for all students to be sent to boarding schools. The researcher believed, however, that after analyzing the data collected in this study that certain students with certain characteristics would emerge as being ones who would benefit from the boarding school environment.

In the interview that the researcher had with the school public relations director of Bailey College, even he indicated this when he made the statement:

All children, male or female, should be given the chance to go into boarding school. Some children are not boarding school material, but they should spend at least one year in a boarding institution...

He saw the many benefits that the boarding environment offers, but realizes that not all children need to live away from their parents to have the best possible school experience.

After interviewing students, administrators, and teachers, the data indicated that the student’s home environment is the most significant factor in determining whether he/she benefits from the boarding school environment. One of the main reasons that parents usually send their students to boarding school is so that their children can benefit
from discipline and structure offered in many boarding environments. Though reasons for attending boarding schools varied from case to case, parents in the school in the United States, as well as the South African school, sent their children to boarding school because they felt that they would benefit more from the environment provided by the school than they would if they lived in their own homes and gone to local schools.

The main reason students gave for choosing to attend Douglas was that they were not getting what they needed in their traditional public day school. Most students there had considered a variety of alternatives to their traditional day schools before deciding on coming to Douglas. Most Douglas students fall into one of several broad categories: average and above average students who are able to afford the tuition; gifted to average students who do not find a fit into traditional public schools because of learning differences and difficulties or issues with their emotions and/or social skills; and minority gifted and talented scholarship students there from a feeder program. Students from this latter group would have otherwise been exposed to various temptations such as drugs, alcohol, dangerous street life, negative peer pressure, and large inner city urban schools. One of these students stated the following during his interview:

Being here has definitely helped me from becoming another statistic as one of a Black male being shot or ending up in jail. Douglas has definitely changed my life.

Another category of students who tend to select boarding schools is students who have parents with demanding schedules and find most convenient to place their children in a boarding situation. Many of these parents travel extensively or move frequently for
work or other reason, creating an unstable environment for family life. One student said
the following when the researcher asked him where he was from:

    Well, I was born in Missouri. My parents lived in New York City, then
Pennsylvania. When I older I lived in Washington State on an island off
the Coast for 10 years. After that, I moved to California for less than a
year. Went to a boarding school in Arizona 7th grade. Then after that it
was Kansas, Lawrence, Kansas. And then Texas three years...

Movement such as this was echoed in a couple of other interviews that the researcher did
with students.

A last smaller category of students who attend the Douglas School include
students who have mild dependency, psychological, or emotional problems. The school
provides great supervision and support for these students. This support comes through the
counseling office, through individual and group support meetings, and also by formal and
informal monitoring. As noted above, the smallness of the school makes it difficult for
inappropriate behaviors to go unnoticed.

The students who fell into the disadvantaged category were usually from large
cities, mostly New York. These students missed the activity of the big city and felt that
although they were bored with the country and small town living, they were better served
by attending a small isolated school away from home. A male student and a female
African American student, both from New York, confessed that although they were on
the gifted track in their old schools, they had begun to slip in their home environment.
They both believed that Douglas, though boring, kept them out of trouble and provided a
safe and welcoming space for them to develop and hone their leadership skills. They both
also reported taking part in activities and organizations that they probably would not have
if they had not come to Douglas.

The students mentioned above who were talented, but found themselves lost and
unhappy in their larger day schools, found security in Douglas’ smaller family-like
atmosphere. They were able to assume leadership positions and to participate on sports
teams that they would have never been successful in at their large day school
environments. Although these students were generally people of financial means, they
lacked the social wherewithal to thrive in larger day environments. Several students who
fell into this category informed me that they were left unfulfilled by the day school
environment. They felt lost in the crowded classes of 30 students and with staff members
who were uncaring and only saw them as a number and a paycheck. These students felt
they needed something extra that traditional day school environments could not offer.
The students the researcher interviewed who fell into this category were particularly
satisfied with the opportunities that Douglas had to offer.

At Bailey, there were students who were from homes that were poor, as well as
those from rural farms and middle class backgrounds. Those who were poor came from
homes or rural villages where students often lacked their basic needs. According to the
principal, the very poorest represent about 10% of the Bailey College population.
Concerning the makeup of the student body, he says:

There’s a complete spectrum, for the poorest of the poor...who, some of
them, their families would live in shacks...to extreme wealth, at the other
end of the scale. And that’s always been a feature of Bailey; we are not
an elitist school.
Parents of these poorer students scraped together whatever resources possible to be able to send their children to school for the hope of a better future. Some of these students could afford boarding, and others could not. Those who cannot afford boarding think it a privilege just to be able to attend school with a reputation as great as that of Bailey College as day students. Those who make it into Bailey see the benefits of being able to study in an environment where there was structure, discipline, and sufficient resources to study, including the benefit of having people around who can actually help them with their work. This is often not the case in their family homes.

Middle class students and students from rural areas with better home lives often live on campus out of convenience. The town has no organized public transportation or school bussing systems, so they find it more practical to live on campus.

Bailey’s students in this category of students who had sufficiency at home, yet selected boarding school, were attracted to the Bailey’s reputation and the honor of being a part of the school tradition. Most often they were students who had someone such as a father and/or an uncle who had attended Bailey, and they wanted to continue a family legacy. They felt that being a boarder of Bailey College made them better men and that it also helped to develop their character.

The third category of students mentioned were students who had issues with dependency on drugs or alcohol and wanted support. Some boys were sent to Bailey to ‘get straightened out.’ Parents, relatives, family friends or other supporters who send troubled boys to Bailey hope that the structure and discipline of the school will positively redirect them. Though there is no formal drug or alcohol counseling services or support
groups, students without serious problems are often able to ‘come correct’ under the military style discipline and structure ingrained in the school culture.

*School quality.* In addition to leaving the home environment to attend boarding school, the *quality* of the boarding environment is a second factor influencing whether a boarding environment would be beneficial for a student. While the researcher was in South Africa, she was told about a free boarding school that was designed to serve students without parents or who may have problems at home. Though the researcher did not have an opportunity to find and visit this school, she was told that the environment was very different than that of Bailey College. According to the Bailey’s school counselor, the school lacked a sense of pride, structure, course and extra-curricular offerings and was operated by a staff that did not demonstrate a connectedness with the students. The researcher was also told that cigarettes were sold in the school store, while smoking cigarettes was altogether forbidden for students of Bailey College. The counselor says of that school:

The syllabus is the same as any other school; but it’s that environment, that ethos that makes it different. While at another school that I dealt with where there’s hostel facilities, there is a lack of discipline, no respect for teachers. Children, the one day I had to go and talk to the children of that school, spat at the teachers from the windows, threw stones...stuff like that. But now at the same time, the school sells cigarettes in the tack shop and the children speak to the teachers as they want to; there’s no disciplinary structure, and they don’t have the history and the culture within their school to be proud of their school...So that makes it a huge
Another school that the researcher visited in South Africa was also limited in resources. Although this was not my study school, the researcher was invited to see the school as a local comparison to Bailey College, my study school. Most of the students from this school were not able to afford the tuition at Bailey College and so attended this school. This particular school was not designed to be a boarding school, but had inside a small boarding component for poorer students who had no transportation or those who had families that were not able to support them in their home. At this school, evenings were mostly free for the boarding students. This school only required one hour of homework time of the students during the evenings. There were no extra planned sports or extra activities to supplement their schedules. After talking to students who were a part of the school’s boarding program, the researcher realized that there were other problems with their evening program as well. The students complained about the food being insufficient to satisfy them, as well as there being a lack of hot water for bathing. This dorm also lacked the support provided by the dorm parents at both Douglas and Bailey. Additionally, there was understandably a negative stigma attached to being a boarder at this school.

The environments described above would clearly not benefit the students socially, culturally, or academically. The students are not getting any additional help with their work, the only time allotted that students must do homework is one hour, and the standard of living is low. Students may also be losing out culturally. Students who go home with their parent(s) have at least the opportunity to experience some type of cultural enrichment, if their parents choose to provide it. Whereas these children are
pretty much locked into an environment that provides no cultural enrichment at all. The boarding environment there may even be damaging socially. Their boarding students were taunted because the other students all knew that they had to live there due to their personal circumstances of extreme poverty, rather than for the opportunity to experience a better education. These students are missing out on the social interaction of a family and home community, as well as socialization with some of their day peers. The researcher would venture to say that these students are at a general disadvantage by boarding at a school that has such a low quality boarding program. Though a quality and healthy environment is imperative to producing students who are academically sound, their own attitude and motivation can be seen as a greater predictor of their success. A sub-standard boarding arrangement does little to stimulate student attitude or to motivate them.

*Student attitude and motivation.* Student attitude towards school and their motivation to succeed cannot be overlooked or underestimated in determining student success. Social networks, cultural enrichment, and quality educational opportunities are all important, but if a student himself is not motivated, then no learning environment – including a quality boarding environment – will increase his levels of academic achievement. As both a teacher and as a researcher in this dissertation, the researcher has witnessed talented students who were set up to succeed by their parents and their school environment, yet chose to under perform due to laziness or their general lack of motivation. A student of Bailey makes this point well during his interview when I asked if students ever slept during prep times:

Yes, we can easily fall asleep...it’s really up to you. I mean in prep, you
can have a book open, and just draw pictures or just stare at the wall or just read a book or whatever. So it’s all up to you and if you want to learn or not.

At the same time, the researcher witnessed students who had excelled with all visible odds stacked against them. These students were highly motivated, and would succeed in any environment. During the Bailey College principal’s interview, the researcher asked him if the disadvantaged boarders of Bailey grew and developed as a result of their living within the structure of Bailey. He said this:

Absolutely. Hugely. You...you wouldn’t recognize some of these boys who’d come to us raw from a really rural situation where they had no amenities, no facilities, and no guidance even. Families, many of them dysfunctional. They develop at this school. It’s amazing...They become college prefects, house prefects in the system...Many of our top boys are driven by their desire to improve themselves and come out at the end of the day in matriculation exams with an ‘A’ average.

From all of the above, the researcher concluded that although the boarding environment can enhance students’ access to social, cultural, and education capital, the ultimate degree of impact on student academic experience depends on the quality of the environment that a student is leaving behind at home, the quality of the school and boarding program he/she attends, and the attitude and motivation of the student towards learning.
Managing the Ratio of Advantaged to Disadvantaged Students: Avoiding Harmful Institutionalization

All schools are institutions, and all institutions carry with them identities that are often transferred to the faculty, staff, and students. As Jepperson (1991) notes: “[i]nstitutions are not just constraint structures; all institutions simultaneously empower and control” (p. 143). This powerful statement alerts us to the importance of the atmosphere and/or ethos connected to a school. He further states that, “All institutions are frameworks of programs or rules establishing identities and activity scripts for such identities” (p. 143). These identities and internal scripts assumed by administrators, teachers, and students help to set the atmosphere of the school. This atmosphere in turn can impact student motivation either positively or negatively. A positive attitude and motivation are characteristics often found in successful students and often lacking in students who are not successful in school.

As noted above by the principal of Bailey College, it is a student’s drive and desire to improve themselves that enables them to come out in the end with an ‘A’ average. That statement was made about some of his disadvantaged students. He had previously noted that the ‘poorest of the poor’ only represented about 10% of the total student body and that approximately 50% of the boarding population could be considered disadvantaged. This represents a relatively small number since only 30% of all Bailey Colleges’ students board. One goal of Bailey clearly is to help students. Within this, however, the principal of Bailey also noted and discussed the deliberateness of Bailey College in being a diversified institution, serving boys who excel academically and athletically, in addition to those who struggle. He states:
We have very top academic boys; we have boys who are not very bright at all. We have very good sportsmen; we have boys who’ve got four feet instead of two feet and two hands. And the same applies as far as the socio economic situation is concerned. And it’s, it’s a worry, some of our boys, borders in particular...[s]o one is dealing with huge extremes in a school like ours; which again, is part of our uniqueness.

The principal of Douglas did not give an exact percentage of her students who would be considered disadvantaged; however, she noted that between 18% and 20% had learning differences, 30% were on financial aid (to help pay $40,000 tuition), 18% were students of color (inclusive of all ethnicities other than White), and the counselor noted that only about 10% had minor emotional or substance abuse issues.

When the majority of the students are poor, disadvantaged, or troubled, it is less likely that poor and disadvantaged students will be able to benefit from social, cultural, or education capital because it will be generally lacking in the school environment. Strong student role models are necessary for these students to benefit from. The numbers of students who could be considered disadvantaged or who had special needs varied per school; however, it was clear that the majority of students from both student bodies would be considered advantaged. Even if the students were considered to be disadvantaged before entering the schools, they would all be considered advantaged just from having had the opportunity of attending quality schools. This is not true of disadvantaged students who attend sub-par schools.

When a school has a majority of advantaged students, they are in a better position to serve students who have problems of any nature. At Douglas, 90% of the students
participate in one on one tutorials and are closely monitored by their teachers and tutors.

The principal said this of the level of monitoring that occurs:

Student’s progress is charted through quarterly grade reports and then all of our grade reports include an effort grade and also an extensive comment from each teacher, from the tutor, and then some of them have advisor comments. We also have weekly faculty meetings in which the primary focus is students of concern. So names are brought up and where there are issues raised about either lack of academic progress or perhaps issues that are arising on the sports field or in the dormitory, we gather information from those that interact with that student and then a group called guidance sits down and digests that information, and then a strategy is devised to help that child succeed.

Bailey College has a similar structure for handling problems that occur in the student body. Student leaders, as well as faculty and staff members, closely monitor the students and report any problems as they occur. The researcher witnessed one such meeting during her observation at Bailey when the principal updated the faculty on the progress of two problems with students.

This degree of intervention can take place because of three major factors: one, because the schools are small for high schools, especially the Douglas school; two, because the number and scope of problems and issues that arise are manageable; and three, because of close monitoring at each of the schools. In schools where problems are more numerous and severe, it is not practical to expect this level of monitoring to occur. In fact, deviant behaviors often become the norm and behaviors that would never be
tolerated at Bailey or Douglas are allowed as staff and faculty members tend to the more serious problems. The level of faculty burn out is high and there is a limit to the volume they can manage. These schools become almost like a prison where students increase in deviant behavior as they learn from each other. This can be seen in a boarding charter school in the United States which is opened to serve poor and disadvantaged children. The retention rate for students from this school is lower than 50%. The school for troubled youth in South Africa that the school counselor spoke of is another example of a well intentioned mission that did not prove favorable for the students. ‘Schools for trouble youth’ are generally seen in a negative light and do not provide the degree of hope and opportunity for the disadvantaged as schools like Bailey and Douglas that have good reputations and positive, healthy learning environments. These schools are thought more of as gateways to juvenile hall than college preparatory schools.

Conversely, the opportunity to attend a quality school gave disadvantaged students in this study a level of pride that they would not have had if they attended schools where the majority of the student body was poor or had major social problems. While non-diverse schools of this type carry with them a stigma that can strip a child of his or her pride, dignity, and motivation, the majority of students who were interviewed and who completed questionnaires in this study expressed high levels of satisfaction and a genuine appreciation for their schools. As indicated by the charts presented in the Comparative Analysis section, the majority responded that they were better off for having attended the school as boarders because of the educational opportunities that were afforded them.
Implications for Research and Practice

This section discusses the implications for research and practice for this study. In doing this study, the researcher’s intention was to uncover facts relating to Bourdieu’s capitals (1977, 1983, 1986) and education that would prove useful to the academic community as well as to school districts. The researcher wanted to examine the impact of the boarding school environment on students’ exposure to Bourdieu’s capitals and how such exposure would impact student academic experience. After spending time at two geographically different boarding schools with two distinctly different student body types, it was clear that Bourdieu’s theories on the benefits of social and cultural capital can lead to educational success. This research focused on whether or not the boarding school environment could promote these capitals to promote student experience. The research, however, uncovered the fact that there are more factors that need to be considered when looking into these issues within the context of the United States and South Africa. As stated in the findings above, there are other factors that complicate the answer to whether or not the boarding school environment can promote Bourdieu’s capitals to promote higher quality student academic experience. These factors include school quality, the commitment of staff and faculty members to students, the quality of teaching, characteristics of the other students in the school, the number and quality of the extra-curricular and cultural activities sponsored by the school, the degree to which administrators are able to instill structure and discipline into the daily routines of students, and the least controllable variable, students’ own motivation and desire to achieve. Also to be considered is the home environment left behind by the students. If it is supportive to
a child’s personal and educational development, then the child may be no better off in a boarding environment.

The implication is that boarding schools can be appropriate alternatives for certain populations of students. If a child’s home life is disruptive and prevents him from succeeding in school, then he or she may be a good candidate for boarding school. Before making the decision, parents and counselors should work together to determine the fitness of the particular boarding school for the child.

Recommendations

This purpose of this section is to discuss the recommendations that the researcher has for affected stakeholders in K-12 education. The researcher conducted this study on an alternative to the traditional school structure because neither public nor private school structures or environments have changed much since their inception. Schools have not kept up with students’ changing needs and demands. Districts have dealt with this by offering special programs and special education, but a large number of students still slip through the cracks. Additionally, there are parents and students who are seeking alternatives to the traditional school structure. One of the main reasons for conducting this study is because the researcher believes that school districts and administrators should consider other alternatives for students who do not succeed in the regular day school environment, as well as for parents and students who are seeking other schooling alternatives. Boarding schools are proposed as just one such option.

After doing this study, the researcher’s recommendations to school district administrators and parents would be to consider the boarding environment for students who are not succeeding in the traditional day school environment, for those whose
parents travel or move frequently, and for those who are seeking quality alternatives to the traditional day school environment. The researcher would especially recommend a quality boarding environment for students whose home situations do not provide healthy environments for the student’s physical, social, emotional, or educational well-being, for students who need more structure and discipline, students who need to develop a sense of independence, and students who desire ongoing opportunities for social interaction and activity. Students fitting these descriptions have been successful at both the Douglas School in the United States, and Bailey College in South Africa.

In terms of recommendations for the academic community, further boarding school studies could examine several different boarding school structures for their fitness in dealing with specific populations of students. For example, to discover the most successful boarding school model for serving disadvantaged students, a boarding school designed solely for the purpose of helping disadvantaged students could be compared with a school primarily for mainstream children that also serve disadvantaged students or boarding schools designed to nourish the needs of gifted and talented students. This study could be expanded into a longitudinal study in which the researcher follows students from boarding schools throughout their freshman year in college to determine how valuable their boarding experience was in preparation for college. These students could be compared to students who had not gone to boarding school to see if having attended boarding schools helped them to become more successful in college or their personal relationships than those who had not attended boarding schools. A twin or sibling study in which one student attended boarding school and the other did not might be especially
helpful to this end. This type of study would compare subjects that are more similar than subjects coming from different home environments, allowing for more valid results.

Other Considerations

As stated above, boarding schools are not suitable for all children. If a child’s home life is supportive and the family is able to provide adequate social interaction and exposure to culture, then a child is generally better off living at home; however, even some families who are able to provide a stable and supportive environment still choose the boarding school environment because of the independence, social skills, and constant exposure to cultural opportunities.

Since the boarding environment is not for every child, programs that seek to alter the home environment of students who are disadvantaged socially, culturally, or economically through external intervention should be considered by school districts. Parents want the best for their children, but sometimes fall short in knowing how to deliver it. This is especially true of parents who were themselves unsuccessful in school and/or who also grew up in a home that was not supportive of academic achievement. For this reason, school administrators could use the information learned from this study to design parent education classes. In these classes, parents could learn the importance of structure and scheduling in the home, a quiet time and place designated for homework, support structures such as tutors or an older brother or sister in place where necessary, the need for their children to become involved in extra-curricular activities, and the need for their children to befriend children who can add to the quality of their social network.

If parents are willing to provide the things mentioned above to their children, they will have the advantage of experiencing many of the aspects of the boarding school
structure that disadvantaged children have been unable to benefit from. The only piece missing would be social capital; that is, unless the children were able to meet children in their extracurricular activities who are of a higher social standing. If children are not able to increase the quality of their social capital through their involvement in extra-curricular activities in their home schools, then parents may consider moving to a neighborhood that has families of higher social standing or involving their children in social and/or cultural activities outside the school.

This type of parent education would only work in homes where parents are willing to consider making changes in their personal lifestyles in order to benefit their children. Children from homes where parents are unavailable, unreachable, addicted to drugs, too busy working to monitor their children’s activities, or just unwilling to work with the school would still be among the lost no matter how good the parent education is.

The sad reality is that many children come from homes like that described above. During her years teaching, the researcher witnessed many of such homes. In cases such as these, another alternative would be for the school to become more aggressively involved in instituting after school or during lunch study programs. These programs could be designed to provide free tutoring and study time after school or after lunch. This, however, would involve the cooperation of the student. When the researcher was a public school teacher, she offered free tutoring during the lunch recess time and during other break times for the students. Only a few students participated in the beginning and the numbers decreased as time went by. These students did not value what was being offered to them. Children need guidance and are often not mature enough to make rational decisions regarding their education. In the beginning of her efforts, the researcher went so
far as to pull students who needed extra help off the playground when they did not do their homework. In time the researcher noticed that the students who were not motivated to come on their own were usually not motivated enough to retain what they might have learned during their tutoring sessions. The issue of motivating students to learn is a whole new topic in and of itself. Motivation is an issue for even some of the boarding school students.

Based upon this research, schools might offer opportunities for students to study and research areas that have been typically closed to them in the past in order to promote social and cultural capital. This promotion of capital can be ensured by making sure the activity is of a high quality and that it is carefully designed to help the students to learn deep meaning. For example, if students are taken on a field trip that they prepared for, and the activities during and after, such assignment fosters understanding by the child.

In sum, this study could not only present boarding schools as an option for students who are not succeeding in typical day environments and students who just want a different schooling option, but also to present the idea of teaching parents how to provide an environment where their children can succeed, or developing programs in day schools that provide the same type of support as is found in boarding environments.
REFERENCES


http://www.centreforip.org.uk/research.htm


APPENDIX A

*Questions will address: bkgd = background, cultural capital = cult cap, edu cap = education capital, soc cap = social capital. Each is indicated in parenthesis after the question.

Student Survey and Interview Questions:

1. Where are you from? (bkgd)
2. How did select this school? (bkgd)
3. How do you feel about being a student of this school? (bkgd)
4. What is your favorite part about being here? Why? (bkgd, or soc, cult, and/or edu)
5. What do you like least? Why? (bkgd)
6. Do you feel that you are better off here than at a regular day school? Why? (bkgd, or soc, cult, and/or edu)
7. Besides sleeping away from home, what is the biggest difference between this school and day schools that you have gone to? (bkgd, or soc, cult, and/or edu)
8. What is different about how you spend your time outside of classes here and if you were in day school? (cult cap, soc cap, edu cap)
9. What types of outside/extra-curricular activities do you participate in here? Would you have participated in the same number of activities at your regular day school? (cult cap)
10. Do you feel like you get more help here than at your day school? What type of extra help do you get? (edu cap)

11. How is your relationship with your teachers? Staff members? Dorm parents? Other students? Does the boarding environment impact this? (soc cap)

12. Do you feel that you have a roll model or mentor here? (soc cap)

13. Do you think you will go to college? Which one? Do you think you would have gone if you would have attended regular day school? (edu cap)

14. What do you want to be when you grow up? (cul/edu cap)

15. How were your grades before coming to this school? How are they now? (edu cap)

16. Do you feel that the work is harder here? (edu cap)
APPENDIX B

Interview Questions for Teachers

1. How many years of teaching experience do you have in teaching? Have you taught in day schools before? (bkgd)

2. How do you feel about teaching in a boarding school? Why did you select this? (bkgd)

3. Did you attend boarding schools? (bkgd)

4. Describe your duties other than teaching? Describe your typical work week. (cult cap, soc cap, edu cap)

5. Do you feel the extra evening duties make a difference in the lives of your students? (cult cap, soc cap, edu cap)

6. Do you feel closer to the kids than if you had your students only in day school? (soc cap)

7. How do you see your at-risk students growing and changing as a direct result of being in the boarding school? Can you cite specific examples?
8. Describe the characteristics of the student do you believe benefits most from the structure of boarding schools? (cult cap, soc cap, edu cap)

9. How do you believe the school could be improved? (bkgd)
APPENDIX C

Interview or Questionnaire Questions for Administrators

1. What brought you to this school? (bkgd)
2. Have you worked in other institutions? Other boarding or day schools? (bkgd)
3. Describe your job responsibilities. (bkgd, cult cap, soc cap, edu cap)
4. What do you see as the major strengths of the school? Weaknesses? (bkgd)
5. From what you know of boarding schools in this area, is this school typical? If not, what sets this school apart? (bkgd)
6. Do you chart the progress of your students from when they enter until they leave? (edu cap)
7. Besides grades, how is success measured? (bkgd, edu cap)
8. What percentage of your students go on to college after graduation? (edu cap)
9. What is your favorite aspect of working here? What are your least favorite aspects? (bkgd)
10. How can things be improved at the school? (bkgd)
11. How are students expected to spend their time in the evenings, week-ends, or other free time? (cult cap, soc cap, edu cap)
12. In your opinion, do students spend their time constructively? (cult cap, soc cap, edu cap)
13. What types of extra-curricular activities are offered to the students? How are they selected? (cult cap, soc cap, edu cap)
14. What events or trips do you think students are able to enjoy being students here that they would probably not be exposed to if they attended regular day school? (soc cap, edu cap)

15. How are staff/faculty relationships with students different here than at regular day schools? Can you cite some examples? (soc cap)
Lisa Bass Vita

20 Joy Dr. Apt #203                                      lrb189@psu.edu; lbass@uvm.edu
South Burlington, VT 05403                                    814/571-3858; 802/656-1206/EST

Education:

Ph.D. Edward Medicinal Leadership and Policy/Comparative and
International Education (expected completion; August, 2007)
The Pennsylvania State University, University Park, PA

TESOL Validation The Ohio State University (2002)

M.S.T. Master of Teaching (1998)
Le Moyne College, Syracuse, NY
Masters Project, Created a parent/teacher partnership manual
the Syracuse City School District

M.B.A. Business Administration (1995)
Le Moyne College, Syracuse, NY
Masters Project, Created a business plan for an early learning
Center

B.A. Economics (1992)
Spelman College, Atlanta, GA

Employment:

2006-Present University of Vermont
Henderson Fellow
- Teach Courses
- Continue Personal Research Agenda
- Assist Faculty Members with Research

2005-2006 YSCP International Charter School State College, PA
Facilitator, Planner, and Teacher
- Served on Planning Board
- Served on Curriculum Development Team
- ESL Program Director and Teacher
- Co-Coordinator for Extended Hours Program

1998-2003 Columbus Public Schools Columbus, OH

Classroom and ESL Teacher, ESL Facilitator
- Developed district curriculum for elementary ESL programs.