A FEMINIST TEACHING ART RESIDENCY (IN)FORMED BY
AN ETHICS OF CARE

A Dissertation in
Art Education

by

Zena Mariah Tredinnick-Kirby

© 2022 Zena Mariah Tredinnick-Kirby

Submitted in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements
for the Degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

May 2022
The dissertation of Zena Mariah Tredinnick-Kirby was reviewed and approved by those noted with an asterisk:

*Karen Keifer-Boyd  
Professor of Art Education & Women’s, Gender, & Sexuality Studies  
Dissertation Advisor  
Chair of Committee  
Head of Graduate Program

*Aaron Knochel  
Associate Professor of Art Education

*Mark Kissling  
Associate Professor, Department of Curriculum and Instruction

Simone Osthoff  
Professor of Critical Studies
ABSTRACT

Inspired by the potentials of feminist and family art residencies and Nel Noddings’s *ethics of care* theory, my participatory action research study is an exploration of how my children and I experienced revisioning our home and homeschooling as a feminist teaching art residency (in)formed by an ethics of care. Our art residency, distinct from other conceptions of artist residencies, is best characterized as the experience and process of creating art that is plural, collective, and collaborative. At the heart of the study and the art residency design is a commitment to feminist pedagogy and its potential in challenging hegemonic cultural narratives, acknowledging the extant knowledge of students, questioning the hierarchy of ways of knowing (e.g., expert versus experiential learning), and renegotiating and re-forming the connection between teacher and student. The research question guiding and motivating this study asks: *What art education curriculum and pedagogical experiences will emerge from exploring four key components of Nel Noddings's ethics of care (i.e., modeling, dialogue, practice, and confirmation) within a 17-day home-based feminist teaching art residency conceptualized with my 4- and 8-year-old children?* Combining collaborative and dialogic participatory research methods, my children and I used Photovoice, interviews, and daily journaling to collect data during our 17-day residency. The curriculum was site-specific of indoor and outdoor learning at our home, which was the primary education site. My study offers an explorative pedagogical process theoretically grounded in *care*. Particularly compelling about my narrative of our art residency and research with my children is how care manifested in various ways through Noddings’s ethics of care components, *modeling, dialogue, practice, and confirmation*. Using Photovoice data generation in which my children and I took photos documenting our learning and expressions of care; and daily reflective journal writing, I learned how I modeled care...
throughout the residency to my children and our residency site, Dutch Lane. The documentation in the modeling of care by my children provided images for self-reflexivity. Dialogue emerged organically throughout the residency in learning about my children’s perspectives on life, learning, and curiosity. The emergence of the curriculum was reciprocal for the three of us in learning together. I was thrilled to find the practice of care that I modeled evident in expressions of care by my children, Andrew, and Cora, in ways not perceived or exhibited prior to the residency. Lastly, confirmation became evident in analysis of how Andrew, Cora, and I encouraged care throughout the art residency, in which the residency conditions afforded opportunity to affirm practices of care. Thus, this dissertation significantly contributes to expanding understandings in enabling art educators and students to infuse feminist pedagogy and care ethics into an emergent and negotiated curriculum.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF FIGURES .................................................................................. vii

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ..................................................................... xii

DEDICATION ......................................................................................... xx

PROLOGUE .......................................................................................... xxi

## CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION: A NEED FOR ETHICS OF CARE EMERGENT LEARNING ........................................................................... 1

- Context and Background of the Problem: Absence of Feminist Pedagogy ................................................. 4
  - Feminist Pedagogy ........................................................................ 4
  - One-Size-Fits-All Educational System ........................................... 5
  - Artists Practicing Care: Maternal Fantasies .................................... 12
- Research Question and Methodology ........................................................................................................ 14
- Significance of Study ........................................................................ 16
- Chapter Overview ........................................................................... 17

## CHAPTER 2 THEORECTICAL FRAME: NEL NODDINGS'S ETHICS OF CARE ........................................................................ 19

- Nel Noddings: Foundational Feminist Ethicist Educational Scholar ......................................................... 19
  - Experience, Learning by Doing, and Continuity .................................................................................. 21
  - Aligning with Nel Noddings ............................................................................................................. 25
  - Concerns about Caring ..................................................................................................................... 28
  - Differences within Care Ethics Theorists ............................................................................................ 32
- Significance of Home as an Educational Site to Nurture Care ....................................................................... 34
- Care Ethics: Four Key Components of Moral Education ........................................................................... 34
  - Modeling ............................................................................................................................... 35
  - Dialogue .............................................................................................................................. 37
  - Practice .............................................................................................................................. 38
  - Confirmation ......................................................................................................................... 40
- Meeting Nel Noddings ........................................................................ 41
  - A Date I Will Never Forget: April 22, 2021 .................................................................................. 44
  - Conversing with Nel: Ethics of Care and Freire ........................................................................... 47
  - The Formation of My Research Question: What are you Trying to Figure Out? .................................... 48
- Connecting Care Ethics with PAR Methodology ..................................................................................... 51

## CHAPTER 3 METHODOLOGY: PARTICIPATORY ACTION RESEARCH ........................................................................ 53

- Research Site: Site Specificity of Home ................................................................................................. 56
- Research Participants ............................................................................................................................. 60
  - Positioning Myself in Research: Entangling Mother and Researcher .............................................. 61
Unpacking Important Connections Between Insider Research, Reflexivity, and Outside Expert Insight .......................................................... 62
Family Research Entanglements: Ethical Implications and Limitations ................................................................. 66
Ethical Consent and Concerns ......................................................................................................................................... 67
Participatory Action Research Design: Data Collection .................................................................................................. 68
Photovoice ........................................................................................................................................................................ 69
Daily Journaling ................................................................................................................................................................. 72
Interviews ........................................................................................................................................................................... 73
Data Organization ............................................................................................................................................................... 74
Color-Coding Ethics of Care ............................................................................................................................................. 75
Inductive Thematic Analysis and Emergent Themes .................................................................................................... 77

CHAPTER 4 ANALYSIS: CARE AND ITS EMERGENCE IN THE RESIDENCY ............. 80

Analysis: Emergent Data Codes and Themes .................................................................................................................. 83
Modeling Care, a Component of Noddings’s Ethics of Care ......................................................................................... 85
Modeling: Mothering and Educator .................................................................................................................................... 92
Dialogue as an Ethics of Care .................................................................................................................................. 96
Dialogue: Negotiated Emergent Curriculum .............................................................................................................. 104
Practice in Action as an Ethics of Care ......................................................................................................................... 122
Practice: Mothering and Educator ............................................................................................................................... 126
Practice: A Self Awakening of Identity ........................................................................................................................... 127
Practice: Negotiated Emergent Curriculum ............................................................................................................. 138
Encouraging and Affirming Confirmation as an Ethics of Care .............................................................................. 146
Confirmation: Mothering and Educator ....................................................................................................................... 149
Confirmation: Anti-Childism .......................................................................................................................................... 150

CHAPTER 5 FINDINGS AND IMPLICATIONS: HOW AN ART CURRICULUM AND PEDAGOGICAL EXPERIENCES EMERGED FROM AND ETHICS OF CARE ................................................................................................................................................................................................. 158

Interpretation of Findings .................................................................................................................................................. 163
Implications and Recommendations for Future Research with Modification to Noddings’s Ethics of Care Theory ............................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................. 168

References .............................................................................................................................................................................. 180

Appendix A Reference of Artist Residences .................................................................................................................. 188
Appendix B Letter to Andrew & Cora Pre-Residency ................................................................................................. 195
Appendix C Penn State Institutional Review Board IRB Approval ........................................................................... 196
Appendix D Kitchen Series ............................................................................................................................................... 197
Appendix E The Day After Series .................................................................................................................................... 205
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1. Collaborative artmaking ................................................................. 2

Figure 2. The garage became our art studio ................................................... 2

Figure 3. HKW #Caring // Performance by Maternal Fantasies 14.06.2020 ............ 13

Figure 4. Graphic map for visual of the theorists ’ Dewey and Noddings .................. 22

Figure 5. Self-reflection of modeling ............................................................... 37

Figure 6. Providing modeling to Cora of care in using her new camera for the
method of Photovoice ...................................................................................... 37

Figure 7. Self-reflection of dialogue ................................................................. 38

Figure 8. Offering positive encouragement through dialogue to Cora ...................... 38

Figure 9. Self-reflection of practice ................................................................. 39

Figure 10. Cora practicing care in what was modeled to her about her
camera in the garden ....................................................................................... 39

Figure 11. Self-reflection of confirmation ......................................................... 41

Figure 12. Cora ventures out on her own with a camera .................................... 41

Figure 13. First email to Noddings ................................................................. 42

Figure 14. Noddings’s response to my first email ............................................. 42

Figure 15. My response to Nel’s first email ...................................................... 43

Figure 16. Second email I received from Nel .................................................. 44

Figures 17-19. Nel and I laughing together ..................................................... 45

Figure 20. Image of Nel and myself in Stanford and Penn State colors .................. 46

Figure 21. Nel dissecting the purpose of my study .......................................... 50

Figure 22. Research map for our feminist teaching art residency .......................... 55
Figure 23. Our Northeastern Home, Dutch Lane

Figures 24-25. Deirdre Colgan Jones Art-In-Place 2020. Container Portal

Figure 26. A photograph of the participants in the residency, Andrew, Me (Zena),
and Cora.

Figure 27. Mother-researcher (me) offering guidance to Andrew.

Figure 28. McClure Sweeny teaching children art.

Figure 29. Me losing my patience while reading a book on Bigfoot.

Figure 30. Cora excited about her new camera.

Figure 31. Andrew amazed at the new camera used for the method of Photovoice.

Figure 32. Cora testing out her new camera.

Figure 33. Andrew exploring with his camera outside.

Figure 34. Cora journaling.

Figure 35. Andrew journaling.

Figure 36. The front covers of our journals.

Figure 37. Image of interview folder.

Figures 38-39. Image of daily organized folder for data collection and a collective image of all the folders.

Figure 40. Four key components folders of coding of ethics of care.

Figure 41. Ethics of care components in moral education color-coded.

Figure 42. Image from shared Google® folder of McClure Sweeny and I collaborating and sharing our themes from the ethics of care theoretical frame and inductive coding.

Figure 43. Graphic narrative of themes presented in the findings and days themes.
occurred along with the subcategories of the emergent themes

**Figure 44.** Graphic map of the progression of the residency

**Figure 45.** Shared Google®/Messenger folder communication between McClure Sweeny and I in coding data together

**Figure 46.** Photograph taken by Cora

**Figure 47.** Andrew handling his emotions on the living room floor

**Figure 48.** Cora Photovoice image

**Figures 49-50.** Images of wearing the vest and not wearing the vest in the ocean

**Figure 51.** Andrew giving me a thumbs up from the ocean without a vest

**Figure 52.** Andrew documenting the roughness of the coneflower tip and honeybee

**Figure 53.** Cora capturing the fluffiness of the flowers and honeybees pollinating

**Figure 54.** Andrew observing Cora as she explains to him about what she is photographing

**Figure 55.** Andrew capturing his home and all its beauty

**Figure 56.** McClure Sweeny and I discovering themes

**Figure 57.** Book read during the residency, sparking participatory artmaking curriculum

**Figures 58-60.** Maps of Dutch Lane made from memory

**Figures 61-64.** Wooden silhouette of the first of four Bigfoot(s) for Dutch Lane

**Figures 65-68.** Collaboratively painting and cutting the Bigfoot Sculptures for Dutch Lane

**Figures 69-71.** Completed Bigfoot statues that were made site-specific to Dutch Lane

**Figures 72-73.** Andrew as a scientist in the kitchen and diagram of egg we used to learn

**Figures 74-76.** Images of cracking, photographing, and waiting

**Figures 77-78.** Time recorded screenshot from my Apple® iPhone and the scrambled egg from nature
Figures 79-83. Images of the book Andrew created called, The Story of Andrew and Cora.....118

Figure 84. Andrew and Cora watching John Lennon.................................................................120

Figures 85-87. Images of our Beatles inspired paintings..........................................................121

Figure 88. The practice of care between siblings......................................................................123

Figures 89-91. Left: Cora helping Ms. Alice from the pool Middle: Cora safely holds

Ms. Alice’s hand in guidance with walking Right: Cora focuses

on Ms. Alice’s steps to make sure she can offer care to her every

step of the way................................................................................................................................125

Figures 92-93. Image of Cora and myself in the garden, captured by Andrew and the
coding between McClure Sweeny and myself of the emerging theme of
mothering and educator..............................................................................................................127

Figures 94-95. Left: Keifer-Boyd gifted her mother’s camera to me for documentation

through the method of Photovoice Right: Original Polaroid camera
gifted to me from Keifer-Boyd................................................................................................128

Figure 96. Andrew cooking zucchini peach blueberry bread...............................................130

Figures 97-101. The Kitchen Series, medium: photography.....................................................131

Figures 102-103. Mother and son blueberry photographs.......................................................133

Figures 104-106. Fingerprint identity mural............................................................................137

Figures 107-109. The becoming of an identity of perseverance............................................138

Figures 110-111. Images of the Moai Tree Stumps- Uncarved..............................................139

Figures 112-113. The first cutting of the tree stump Moai at Dutch Lane Art Residency........140

Figures 114-118. Images of Andrew working on the details of the Moai and the end

of residency..................................................................................................................................141
Figures 119-120. Images of the Final Photography Series, The Day After..................................................145

Figure 121. Cora caring for Sadie.............................................................................................................147

Figure 122. Andrew and the first cherry tomato harvest.................................................................148

Figures 123-124. Images of me taken from Cora, Day 1.................................................................149

Figure 125. Discussions and learning from McClure Sweeny about anti-childism......................152

Figures 126-128. Images of Cora putting on “Mama Wears.”..........................................................154

Figure 129. Cora selected her own toothbrush at the grocery store.............................................155
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I first and foremost acknowledge my Lord and Savior Jesus Christ, who made it possible for me to pursue this endeavor. “In everything you do, put God first, and he will direct you and crown your efforts with success.” (Proverbs 3:6). Thank you, Lord, for helping me understand that every time I felt you were saying no, you meant not yet. This journey of discovering myself and pushing myself to new heights provided a closeness to you. The Bible verse that was my constant throughout this process comes from Philippians 4:13 “I can do all things through Christ Who strengthens me.” For you, always.

To my husband, Luke, for knowing me so well and trusting in me all the time. I love you. My gratitude for you in our journey together far exceeds any number of words in an acknowledgment section of a dissertation. You were it, the rock in giving me strength and the glue that held me together when I felt I was falling apart. Thank you for being there when I needed you the most to talk to; you gave me space when I needed to write, lifted me up when I needed encouragement, and celebrated each milestone I passed on this journey. The constant sacrifice of your time reading over my papers, learning all about pedagogy and feminism, and redirecting me to make my writing understandable to the world. You gave me the courage to take a chance and have unselfishly filled roles that I have neglected without hesitation. I share this accomplishment with you. You became so much more than my husband and best friend in this program. Thank you for always making me smile, encouraging me when I felt not good enough, and healing me with your hugs and kisses. Did you ever think we would be where we were at sixteen years old? Well, we did it, Loves, we did it! Now let’s enjoy us.

Andrew, and Cora, how amazing was this journey that we got to experience together? Truly unbelievable! Learning from you both of your passions during the residency will be
something I cherish forever. You both are incredible beings, and I am grateful to be your Mama and create this art residency with you both. This is all for you, always was. I would not have been capable of carrying on without feeling your support and encouragement from the very beginning to the very end of this journey. Your smiles and love helped me get through the most challenging days. I refused to quit because I knew your impressionable eyes were watching me. Thank you for putting up with an absentee Mama at points in these last three years and giving me so much more than you will ever know to get through the times of uncertainty. No more time away to write, no more. It is over, and it is pure bliss from here on out, dear ones.

Mom, can you believe it, the days of visiting Penn State as a family back in the 1980s, to earning my doctorate, I guess I was born to be a Nittany Lion! Finally, your little girl did it; this lofty dream has now become a reality! I am incredibly grateful for your love and always believing in me since I was a child. I know you know more than anyone else about my drive for life! You provided more to my family and me than you will ever know. You willingly put yourself through all kinds of strains to indulge in my aspirations as you retired and unretired to become the teacher to my children in the last months of writing this dissertation. It has been a joy to watch and listen to you teach them. Thank you for the countless days that you shouldered more than your fair share of cleaning our home, doing dishes, and being a shoulder to cry on when I needed it the most. From an early age, you instilled in me the values of education, service, and hard work; they have served as guidance as I approach the end of my doctoral journey. The impact that this dissertation will make in this world is a testament to your teachings of love, persistence, and dedication. I love you always, Mom. Thank you.

To my family near and far, thank you for your love and support. Uncle Bruce, thank you for being an immense contribution for my fondness of Penn State, as the university I dreamt of
being a part of, another Tredinnick Penn Stater! The nights in State College we spent together, I will forever treasure. Uncle Dick and Sue Tredinnick, you will never understand how the positive words you offered to me of your proudness and acknowledging my mothering and homeschooling philosophy sparked a light for me in times of darkness and doubt. To Michael, Elena, Calyssa, and Mike Hodgskin, thank you for supporting me in this journey. Zelenda Hodgskin, thank you for your words of proudness that you have for me and how you are inspired by what I have accomplished, that has meant a lot. And lastly, to Geri Edens, you will never know the words you offered me is what I needed for the final push, “so proud of you and know Dad is beaming down from heaven in awe of his little Peanut.” I yearned to hear this, and this journey without him physically has been the most difficult, but you did it; you gave all I needed with that; I am forever grateful for filling that absence of Pops when I needed it the most.

I sincerely thank my committee chair and most influential educator and scholar, Karen Keifer-Boyd. Thank you for your support and professional insight over the last five years, from my master’s to my Ph.D. I am so thankful for you encouraging and inspiring me with your passions of education and life. Your dedication invigorates students; I aspire to exude that passion in my journey as a college professor and scholar. I also thank you, Karen, for sharing with me your vast knowledge about feminism and residencies, which ultimately shaped my research and who I am today. You ignited that spark in aligning my research with your lived experiences of motherhood, art, and revisioning space as a residency from your fish hatchery days. I looked forward to our countless hours of conversations as we endured a lot together over the years; we have become family. You guided me with wisdom and much patience, which bolstered my confidence when needed most. Thank you for tirelessly going through drafts after
drafts and providing invaluable and thorough critical input. You propelled me forward when I was being weighed down. I am forever grateful for you; I love you and thank you for everything.

Additionally, I would like to thank my other committee members for their dedication to my research and providing me with the confidence to pursue this study. Aaron Knochel, thank you for pushing me to research deeper into precise components needed for a more robust study and centering me when my ideas became too broad. Simone Osthoff, thank you for always keeping it real, I truly appreciate all your narrative recommendations over the years and for introducing me to site-specific art. And lastly, the most prominent positive educational memories I have on campus at University Park were in your Places in Education course, Mark Kissling. Your kind and gentleness as an educator and human welcomed learning. Your teaching offered a more extensive analysis of place and lived experiences, which I incorporated into this study. Being a Jersey girl, we instantly connected with your many stories of Bruce Springsteen and your family visits to New Jersey. I am most grateful for your introducing me to Madeline Grumet and Nel Noddings, which changed my life and what my studies’ research revolved around, care.

I cannot begin to express my gratitude to Nel Noddings for the guidance and time to my study. Nel, your willingness to meet at your home in New Jersey and give insight into your theory in connecting to my research is incredibly cherished. Your ideology of life, family, and education is what I strive to be in this life. Your witty sense of humor about our educational system will be shared in future stories moving forward in my career. I will infuse care theory into all my teachings for the rest of my life. Thank you for our many conversations about the similarities between us as women, mothers, wives, and educators. I will treasure those talks for a
lifetime. Being introduced to your theory and your support has changed my pedagogy, which is my purpose in education to inform about care and how vital care is in education.

Marissa McClure Sweeny, I knew when I first met you that our paths would cross with all the similarities that we had, but never did I think you would be alongside me in my study. I am so grateful for you accepting my invitation to join as an expert consultant. You offered such valuable insights into the life of being a mom, educator, scholar, and artist. I learned so much from you in your knowledge of early childhood education. Thank you for the many hours you spent with me coding back and forth and all the time you gave with having a family and a full-time professorship. Your dedication to my study never went unnoticed. I look forward to our journey together in the future, what a team we are, we rock!

To my editor, Shannon McClellan Brooks, who I could never thank enough for all your time that you spent editing and providing suggestions to my papers. The last two years with you alongside me has been incredible, you are really have been my security blanket in this writing journey, teaching me in how to become the writer I am today. Thank you for giving so much in my study, your time was very much appreciated in this journey together!

To all my friends thank you for the much-needed laughs and support, especially Lauren Mallia who never let me falter and always said the right words when I needed them. You always love me and accept me for me, which I value so much. You listen always, you listen so well, and I cannot ever express to you how much you mean to me as a best friend, thank you for always being true to me and being real. I love you and thank you for being by my side.

Even though there are many miles between us, Sara Morton, you have never let that distance get in the way of our friendship. Since 1st grade we have been a unit of happiness and care for one another. Thank you for always being there for me throughout life, but even in this
journey. You provided words that were thoughtful and meaningful as you are the most genuine person I know with your love. Thank you for always seeing the best in me and loving me.

Anna Divinsky, our paths collided on this journey at Penn State, and I gained a beautiful friend. What an amazing friendship we have! Thank you for always looking out for me, guiding me, supporting me, reading everything I send to you, and advocating for me. Thank you for our many conversations and texts, which helped me get through, bringing so much positivity and laughs when I needed it the most! Your friendship is more precious than gold. Your words of motivation reinvigorated me to keep going when I was on the verge of a nervous breakdown. I love you.

To all my work colleagues and students that I have had the pleasure to work with and teach at Penn State and The College of New Jersey. Brendan Berthold, thank you so much for all the time you have given to helping me with ART001 at Penn State. Thank you for being my presentation buddy!

Thank you to all the homeschool mom’s and their friendships and support, especially Marilyn and Stephanie. Thank you for sharing the same ideology of education and creating a network that offers our children to grow together as well as us!

To my Penn State cohort in sharing these doctoral memories together; Melissa Leaym-Fernandez, thank you for being you and living this life of a wife and mother in a Ph.D. program, we rocked it! Thank you to Elham Hajesaieili Nooghi, for having a contagious smile and being there for me when I needed you, you are the most positive person I have ever met, thank you for sharing in this journey together. Lauren Stetz, thank you for sharing in motherhood with me and watching our children grow together as we did as well!
To my church family, thank you for always being genuinely interested in learning about my research and reiterating how the Lord is with me and that I would get through it, the power of all your prayers and time you devoted to me throughout the last couple of years is very much appreciated.

The whole O’Brien clan, thank you to Patrick, Mrs. O’Brien, and Mr. O’Brien for supporting me in my educational career. Mr. O’Brien, I can still remember our trip to meet Marcia Taylor at The College of New Jersey back in 2006 and how you advocated for me then, and you still are. Your time never was taken for granted, as I value you so much as a man, friend, and scholar. I’ll never forgot our dinner together in Flemington as you offered valuable professional insight into your journey of getting your Ph.D. when I was bouncing around the idea!

Nowak, thanks for always being a constant in my life since kindergarten, our friendship is never taken for granted, you mean so much to me. Thank you for listening to me and offering positive words of encouragement as you did throughout the journey. I can’t wait to garage it together as we drink and be merry in celebration!

Lastly, I will end with you, Pops. I had to save you last because I knew it would be an out-of-body experience to get out all I need to about my journey and you physically not being here but mentally and emotionally being here in this journey. I knew you were with me on my first walk through campus alone; I felt you walking behind me so strongly that I kept turning around to get a glimpse of you for only one second; oh, how I loved that moment together. Your presence was so strong; I knew then this journey of you being with me in the capacity of spiritually was more intense as you got to be with me in every moment I endured. Our bond always has been so strong and growing up as a child and witnessing your love of life, family, and
Penn State. I knew I needed to emulate that as an adult. I have done just that, and I know you are proud. I love life, love my family so much, and love Penn State. I promised you I would attend Penn State and gain the title of Dr. right before you passed, and I have fulfilled all the promises I made to you. You raised me never to give up, never to miss an opportunity, and this Ph.D. exercised just those ideals. In reflecting on care, the main component of this research with my children, I can't help but think about how we were; we cared for each other. Your little Peanut did it, I sure did, and I did it with what you instilled in me, love, and dedication. I feel you always; thank you for being my guardian angel. It feels good Pops to be done, so I must end with a loud WE ARE, I know you are finishing it with an even louder PENN STATE up above.

Pops and his Peanut (me), 1986.
DEDICATION

For my children, Andrew, and Cora—always share your passions with the world, stay true to yourself, and remain peaceful. There is nothing more extraordinary in this world than being your Mama; I am who I am because of you both.
PROLOGUE

I have been homeschooling my children, Andrew (8) and Cora (4), for three years, when one blistering summer day of 2020, while focusing on the up and down motion of writing the twenty-six letters of the alphabet, my then seven-year-old son declared in an exultant manner, “Mama, can you teach me differently?” In that moment, I realized I was my own worst enemy, I had created a rigorous curriculum that aligned with the district's public-school curriculum, which organized disciplinary knowledge into separate lessons. Since homeschooling in New Jersey does not require separation of disciplines, I can only surmise, in reflection, that I felt pressured to use a prescribed disciplinary-specific curriculum. I am a product of public schooling and taught art in the public schools for more than a decade. My passion for teaching art in public school classrooms diminished as my curriculum was increasingly structured according to my school district’s interpretations and enforcement of New Jersey state mandates.

I value my son's opinions and his beliefs and asked him how he wanted to learn. He expressed his longing to learn creatively through art, and through his experiences and interests. I thought that perhaps if we conceptualized our home as an art residency, art would center the curriculum but could merge with other disciplinary knowledge following Andrew's interests. In graduate school, I learned about artist residencies as an escape from the daily mundane obligations of life to retreat for time away to create art. Since such an artist residency seemed improbable for a mother with young children and in graduate school, I looked to family and feminist art residencies. From a study of family and feminist art residencies, I found inspiration for challenging my previously held assumptions about art education curriculum and pedagogy being exclusive of residencies and care.
I was introduced to ethics of care (Noddings, 1984) theory during my graduate studies, which brings me discomfort knowing that it took until graduate school to be introduced to a foundational theory relevant to pre-service k-12 educators. I was able to apply my knowledge of ethics of care when I created a curriculum for an introduction to pedagogy course for pre-service art educators at The College of New Jersey (TCNJ) in Fall 2020. I started the course by asking the students to reflect about educators they had encountered in their educational journey and which of those educators they vividly remember. Through additional investigative activities to learn about pedagogy, the students identified reasons as to why those educators left an impact on them; they taught through care. Thus, care is taught through modeling.

Given that care, as an aspect of education, resonated with the eleven students in my course, I introduced to them Nel Noddings’s ethics of care theory and its four key components guiding pedagogical application, (i.e., modeling as showing by example, dialogue as the primary format of the course, practice by doing and reflecting on one’s practice, and confirmation as support toward introspection. Every class, I would offer time for the students to engage directly with Noddings’s perspectives as they watched and listened to her online seminars where she presented her theory of an ethics of care. The students were astonished with how Noddings’s ethics of care theory, which seemed crucial to their pedagogical grounding, had not been previously introduced to them. Many students discussed embracing care in their pedagogy through course and instructor feedback. For example, one student wrote: “I think your added course materials, videos from Nel Noddings really helped me engage more with the subject matter and learn about my own personal pedagogy” (anonymous student TCNJ, 2020, p. 1).

I further examined the feedback reflected from the students as it was valuable to hear their newly gained knowledge, as the pedagogy course was my first opportunity in attempting to
bring the four key components of an ethics of care into my teaching. Students’ responses were not directed with regards to discussing the components of Noddings’s ethics of care theory. However, students mentioned each component in their course evaluations. For example, one student noted: “the use of dialogue and a roundtable discussion added to the retention of this course’s knowledge” (student, TCNJ, 2020, p. 1). Another wrote in anonymous course and instructor evaluations that the “class discussions being so open really helped as well to hear from my peers about their experiences and thoughts (student, TCNJ, 2020, p. 1). Additionally, student feedback revealed the component of practice as when a student claimed, “I really enjoyed how the class was open, and everyone was treated with care” (student, TCNJ, 2020, p. 1). Lastly, the confirmation of care implemented and shown through pedagogy was suggested by this student’s written comment: “I learned so much in this class that I will use it in my own classroom when I become an art teacher” (student, TCNJ, 2020, p. 1). After reading the feedback from those students, I discovered the value of studying the application and experience of an ethics of care in art education pedagogy—which supports the need for my research—through a rigorous and carefully designed research inquiry. Since the pandemic was in full swing in Fall 2020, I could only teach virtually at TCNJ; with this study, I wanted to explore embedding the four components of Noddings’s ethics of care theory into my in-person teaching practice.

Inspired by the potentials of feminist and family art residencies and Noddings’s theory, I developed the following dissertation to begin an exploration into how my children and I might experience revisioning my home and homeschooling as a feminist teaching art residency (in)formed by an ethics of care. What this study stands to offer is an inspiration for other art educators to merge an ethics of care within a feminist teaching art residency and guide changes to their approach to curricula development and pedagogy.
CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION: A NEED FOR ETHICS OF CARE EMERGENT LEARNING

In this study, I enacted an ethics of care\(^1\) in moral education\(^2\) within a feminist teaching art residency. Each evening of the 17-day residency, I reflected through journal writing on my pedagogy and my children's emergent and negotiated curriculum through the theoretical lens of four key components of Nel Noddings's ethics of care: *modeling, dialogue, practice, and confirmation*. The feminist teaching art residency\(^3\) was site-specific to our home with my two children, Andrew (8 years-old) and Cora (4 years-old).

The four components of Noddings’s theory not only informed my approach to teaching but also gives significance to my dissertation. Through modeling, dialogue, practice, and confirmation, my children and I collaborated in the art teaching residency curricular design and collected data together (see Figures 1-2). While there is extensive research on care theory, particularly in education, which I discuss in Chapter 2, my study contributes to art education praxis of care ethics and provides an example of a family-oriented feminist art residency.

---

\(^1\) In first referencing an ethics of care, I italicized the term to draw attention to the importance of the theory.

\(^2\) I define moral education as instilling ethical values through teaching and learning, which I believe encompass goodness of caring, respect, honesty, and responsibility.

\(^3\) I will refer to feminist teaching art residency as “residency” at points throughout the dissertation, simply to shorten the title.
Grounded in feminist principles and care ethics of relationality and collective knowledge production, my research responds to the interests of Andrew and Cora, as we co-developed a curriculum of interdisciplinary⁴ learning, which emerged through artmaking. The curriculum was a duality⁵ of indoor and outdoor learning, specific to our home in New Jersey. Learning transpired as we consciously cared for the environment, the planet, the community, our home,

---

⁴ For the study, my definition of interdisciplinary is linking knowledge from more than one discipline to develop robust insights from combined disciplinary knowledge, theories, perspectives, and practices.

⁵ Duality is defined for the sake of my dissertation as the curriculum within the 17-days of the residency was a hybrid of indoor and outdoor learning, rather than a singular learning location within our home.
and each other with heightened intent during the residency. I refer to the residency as an art residency versus the more traditional phrase, artist residency to characterize a process and experience of creating art that is plural\(^6\), collective, and collaborative. The conceptualization of a feminist teaching art residency was built from my children’s co-developed curriculum characterized by their sense of agency in their own learning shaped by the emergent educational experiences site-specific to our home.

From rigorous data collection, reflection, and analysis, I present vignettes to narrate how our teaching feminist art residency emerged experientially from my children’s inquiries. From 12 years of experience teaching art in U.S. schools, I recognized that one-size-fits-all curriculum,\(^7\) which is prevalent in the U.S. public education system, is detrimental to the varied learning needs of children. My dissertation developed from changing from public school teaching to homeschooling my children and learning about feminist pedagogy and art residencies. The differentiated nature of a feminist teaching art residency at home is in stark contrast to the rigid teaching of facts and punitive assessment unsupportive of learning that characterizes the dominant one-size-fits-all approach prominent in public schooling.

---

\(^6\) I define art that is plural as including numerous artmaking forms, methods, and media.

\(^7\) According to education scholar and Director of Marketing and Communications for the Whitby School, Sarah Mead (2021) states “One size fits all- teaching approach is flawed because it assumes all students learn in the same ways. Curriculums should be differentiated to suit the individual needs of each unique student. Only then can students receive the best possible education and be prepared for future success” (para. 1).
Context and Background of the Problem: Absence of Feminist Pedagogy

My feminist epistemological beliefs are foundational to my identity, consciousness, knowledge, and experience; thus, I teach through a feminist pedagogical approach. Feminist pedagogy is an overarching philosophy—a theory of teaching and learning that integrates feminist values with related theories and research on teaching and learning (Bostow et al., 2015). In my experience there is an absence of feminist pedagogy in the U.S. education system, an absence that is both systematically persistent and disadvantageous for students.

After being complicit in the one-size-fits-all curricular model of the U.S. educational system for 12 years, I awakened to feminist pedagogy during my master's program at Penn State in 2016 by professor of art education and women’s, gender, and sexuality studies, Karen Keifer-Boyd. What follows outlines major tenets of feminist pedagogy and how my coming-to feminist pedagogy informs the feminist teaching art residency at the heart of this dissertation.

Feminist Pedagogy

Feminist pedagogy stems from the “exertion to assemble praxis for students that recognizes the values of women’s contributions and lives, forming an emancipatory, humanizing understanding” (Onufer & Munoz Rojas, 2019, p. 5). Additionally, feminist pedagogy rebuilds relationships between teacher and student by disassembling hierarchy. Although feminist pedagogy disagrees with orderly definitions, several overlapping tenets distinguish teaching from a feminist pedagogical positioning, including “knowledge co-creation, community, empowerment, voice/experience, and reflection” (Onufer & Munoz Rojas, 2019, p. 2), which are all pertinent to my residency design. Through my research, and as an art educator, I reflect on my pedagogy, which is informed by Noddings’s (1984) ethics of care theory. I am motivated in a
commitment to feminist pedagogy in my teaching practice by what Jean Barr (1999), professor at Eastman School of Music, says:

[Feminist pedagogy] challenges those epistemological communities that have been dominated by privileged white men ... and creates spaces for women to speak, for listening to what women’s silence has to say ..., and the inclusion of the body and emotions in notions of rationality and knowledge. Its focus is on the knower that which is known, and the processes of coming to that knowledge. Thus, it incorporates a scrutiny of content, of learning processes and of relationships within the learning environment. At its heart is a political challenge to notions and structures of knowledge and power. (p. 137)

Lastly, feminist pedagogy seeks to dissolve hierarchical power structures to make an environment where the educator learns from the students and vice versa. In the next section, I discuss viewpoints on my educational positioning and how my pedagogy is the opposite of the one-size-fits-all standard of curriculum “which assumes all students learn in the same way” (Mead, 2021, para. 1). Instead, my feminist pedagogy is inclusive of each individual child’s ways of thinking and knowing.

One-Size-Fits-All Educational System

All too often, teacher-directed demonstrations or models of art production imprint upon students a “correct” way or the “accepted” way to do art. Through the one-way transmission of teacher-directed artmaking, students are tasked to produce similar looking art, which serves as the standard for evaluation and assessment. This teacher-directed approach is part and parcel of the one-size-fits-all curriculum common in the U.S. public education system. Art educators are teaching the one-size-fits-all material that can be tested and assessed (Foley, 2014). The one-
size-fits-all curricular approach disregards students’ lived experiences, their voices, and their agency in their own learning. My study is premised on reconceptualizing classrooms as art residencies that empower students to learn through their lived experiences and give them the freedom to be imaginative as they choose what they learn and create. In such an environment, students can generate their own curriculum, which makes learning an act of curiosity as students develop and investigate questions and engage their eager intentions.

The world is diverse, yet often school halls display student art that all look the same, a hallmark of the one-size-fits-all lesson plan. I was required to teach a one-size-fits-all curriculum as a College Board® Advanced Placement (AP) 12th grade art history and photography teacher. When I was first introduced to feminist pedagogy and Noddings, I began to see why, as Noddings says, “in education we need to get away from this tightly prescribed curriculum and performance which we have now, we just have to get away from it, that isn't real education” (Noddings, 2018, 54:05). In my own AP 12th grade art classes, I witnessed students’ ingenious creation fade. I observed the absence of creativity® as students did not connect to art. On one such occasion, I offered guidance to my AP photography students in building their portfolio for the AP exam. The students needed to create a portfolio of twenty-nine photographs, which was stressful for them. I consistently heard from the students about selecting work that would appeal to the judges instead of their own creativity. Their intense concern for satisfying judges—in the space of my art classroom—made shockingly clear the quick disposal of their own creativity and their own voices at the expense of high college-ranking scores.

According to multiple-subject elementary school educator, Julie Tamashiro (2014): “We need to dismantle the one size fits all mentality in creating art for others. Students never wanted to make mistakes, they are perfectionists but through art educators that let students know it is not about being perfect they can learn that art is about expression and freedom to explore” (5:12).
Education should not be prescribed and rigid, rather, an educational linear model is an outdated way to learn to live in contemporary times. For example, early industrialists in the U.S. were instrumental in creating and promoting universal education (Schrager, 2018) to prepare workers for an industrial society of docility and agreeability at the beginning of the 20th century. In Brazil, Paulo Freire (1993) compared a one-size-fits-all educational system to a banking model or banking concept where the educator recognizes students as vessels congested and plugged by a singular knowledge narrative of the dominant culture. In my time in U.S. public schools, I have witnessed Freire’s metaphor of the workers prepped for the dominant culture with the demand or familiarity of art educators to advertise “the best cookie cutter” artwork. I have listened to disheartened students rant about how their artwork will never be showcased because they do not know how to do art. It is a vicious cycle of art educators feeling the need to display art that the administration would be “proud” of, yet, excluding so many students’ work. When this occurs, students feel they are not measurable to their peers, repeatedly stripping the creativity and motivation away from the students making art. When students do not feel they are not measurable to their peers—according to some arbitrary administrative standard of acceptable or praiseworthy art—students internalize a singular knowledge narrative about value and acceptance of the dominant culture.

Curriculum, exhibitions, and portfolio assembling should not be forced in a stressful way that brings about anxiety to students or in a way that reinscribes singular narratives about knowledge and creativity values in society. Instead, the process might be better guided through care with modeling, dialogue, practice, and confirmation. Such a process offers more agency to students. If educators model respect and genuine care in their pedagogy through organic dialogue that welcomes and encourages, educational encounters would be more of a lifelong journey that
continues throughout students’ lives, not just within the walls of a classroom and in that moment (Noddings, 2006). Further, according to Noddings (2006), “if educators provide care in their pedagogy in the application of modeling and dialogue, a non-predetermined exchange of conversation, the educators will witness the practice of those positive examples of care from their students” (p. 34). From my self-reflection on the practice of an ethics of care in the 17-day art residency, I propose that experiential approaches to learning an ethics of care could, if practiced widely through life-long education, transform society to care for humanity and the environment. My self-reflection centers Noddings’s theory of care and moral life.

Since no two students are alike, I moved away from a one-size-fits-all curriculum in my exploratory study. Within my feminist teaching art residency, I intended for my children to experience an inclusive liberatory arts-based learning experience that was dynamic and engaging attending to the process of learning by doing (Dewey, 1926). Following experiential education scholar John Dewey (1926), educators who offer students’ freedom to develop curiosity and support to explore can trust that students will learn by doing, which is life-long learning. I aimed for my children to develop communication skills and respect diversity of ideas and people by creating their curriculum as an emergent experiential feminist pedagogical experience in a feminist teaching art residency that was inclusive of their lived experiences.

**Artist Residencies Exclusivity**

During my investigation of artist residencies, I discovered that various artist residencies, (see Appendix A, numbered 1-10) are places to expand artistic creativity in isolation away from daily mundane obligations (Archiebray.org, 2020). The allure of an artist residency is that one escapes from the reality of life to create art without interruption of people and responsibilities.
However, such liberation is frequently unrealistic to educators and mothers. Therefore, I examined feminist and family-based art residencies that welcomed family and place while fostering an inclusivity of children. These feminist and family-based art residencies served as the inspiration for the dynamic communal aspect of togetherness in my children’s and my residency design.

Even though the feminist and family-based residencies (see Appendix A, numbered 21-25) inspired the design of an art residency inclusive of children, I noticed a divide between teaching, learning, and making art within those residencies that I wanted to overcome. For example, in the family residency, SPACE, #24, “The family residency offers artist-parents structured time to create while their child(ren) participates in nature-focused arts programming under the guidance of professional educators” (SPACE, 2021, para. 3). The teaching and learning divide of the family residency, SPACE was between the separation of parent and teacher; our residency design, rather, is distinct in that my roles as and titles of an educator, artist, and mother are never separated while I am creating and learning alongside my children. Further, an additional unparallel attribute of our residency is the emphasis on teaching through care and the learning element from where my children produce the focal points of what we learn. Curiosity and interest from Andrew and Cora generated the curriculum I taught and what I researched throughout our residency as a unique aspect of collaboration in making art through interdisciplinary learning.

I was teacher, mother, and artist, always co-creating with my inquisitive children. This characteristic of our residency design stands in contrast to another family-based artist residency that I researched, #23, EMAR, a family residency, in which families are divided similar to SPACE. However, in #23, family members were separated during the day for the artist parent to
have uninterrupted time to create and for their children to learn as a group instead of one on one with a professional educator as in the SPACE. For example, in their description of the child-care attraction to their residency:

An integral aspect of our program is that we provide full-day (9 AM-5 PM) childcare in the form of a parallel creative residency for children of all ages that focuses on art and nature programming. Oftentimes there are after-dinner activities for children as well. While parent artists have uninterrupted time in the studios, their children are spending time in their very own EMAR Kids Art Studio, engaged in meaningful art projects, outside exploring nature through guided activities. (EMAR, 2021, para. 8)

EMAR's learning design is of children engaged in activities from another educator besides their parents, which offers that uninterrupted time for the parent artist to create without distraction. However, I dismantle that educational element in their design by our residency being the me the educator to my children while we learn and have artmaking time in creating together.

My feminist teaching art residency produced learning driven from my children’s passions as opposed to being told what they must learn in one-size-fits-all curriculum. I learned alongside my children. Through researching family-based residencies,⁹ I found that education and teacher are conceptualized as an additive element where the children are taught by someone other than the parent to give the parent time alone to create.

Upon beginning the residency with my children, I was not only curious about how the experience of being a teacher without separation from my role as mother could become feminist art pedagogy, but I also wanted to explore and undo society’s common preconceived ideas of artist residencies as places to live and work externally from one’s typical living conditions with  

---

⁹ See Appendix A for my synopsis of five family-based residencies that I researched.
freedom to reflect, research, and produce work (Neuendorf, 2018, para.1). As an art educator and practicing artist, my feminist teaching art residency challenged the exclusivity of residencies like those I researched, and the perceptions of artist residencies as separate from one’s children. My study actively worked to undo the exclusivity and separation of the art, the educator, the student, and the place. In my feminist teaching art residency, I did not need to physically leave my home to experience an art residency. By designing a residency that dislodges totalizing perceptions of home, schooling, multiple disciplines, artists, residencies, separation from one’s place, and isolation, my residency design is rather inclusive of all those perceptions mentioned. The inclusive design of the feminist teaching art residency atmosphere encouraged creative growth, experimentation, collective resolution of challenges, and creation of art together. My intent in recognizing and making visible the exclusive nature of artist residencies can contribute to scholarship on feminist and family art residencies from an ethics of care perspective.

Another element I focused on when examining art residencies to shape my distinctive residency design was the terminology and phrases used to describe these residencies as a vital practice in capturing what each residency offered. I discovered the predominant terms in artist residency descriptions were exclusive in nature. For example, in #4 Archie Bray Foundation for the Ceramic Arts, (see Appendix A) the residency call states, “an escape from daily routine to recharge their creative side” (ArchieBrayFoundation, 2021, p. 1). Distinct from most of the residencies #23, EMAR Family Residency, defines their residency as an “immersive, communal experience, where artists have time and space to grow and experiment with their works without choosing between their art and their families” (emar.org, 2020). Not having to decide between love for creating art and love of your family is the inclusiveness that I aspired to in my research. Additionally, #22, MOTHRA, illustrates the residency as “an immersive experience, where
families produce artwork with children relating to issues of caregiving and normalizing the idea of having children present in the arts sector” (mothra.com, 2020, p. 1). Ultimately, I synthesized terminology used in the residency descriptions I researched to inform my work in crafting an immersive and exploratory transforming of our home into a collective and collaborative feminist teaching art residency.

**Artists Practicing Care: Maternal Fantasies**

Of the family residencies I examined, family residency #21, *Maternal Fantasies*, is the residency I gravitated towards the most and drew from for my residency. When the pandemic altered society’s way of living, *Maternal Fantasies*, a Germany-based group of women artists, started a feminist art collective with their children composing performance art. All performance pieces focus on motherhood and domestic space, enhancing the visibility of contemporary feminist positions with their children while creating an equitable platform (maternalfantasies.com, 2021). Particularly expressed by Figure 3, which is relevant to care and being isolated at home, *Maternal Fantasies* describes themselves: “we operated as mother artists, we created this online performance from within our homes to demonstrate that care work is more essential than ever” (maternalfantasies.com, 2021).
Note: The image captures Maternal Fantasies creating a performance about caring between mothers and children during lockdown.

Further aligning with care through art creation, Maternal Fantasies brings validity to our residency from a theoretical positioning of art, care, and motherhood. As love, labor, intimacy, isolation, and survival, care as performance in Maternal Fantasies is between mothers and children in a state of lockdown. Maternal Fantasies (2021) explains care as art on their website as follows:

To care is to recognize all bonds, between both humans and non-humans; between humans and their systems, their infrastructures, and institutions, and to attend to their fragility. Ethics of care challenge us to construct social relations and systems based on situational and contextual morality, beyond abstract or universal notions of justice, to
allow us to turn to processes of care, re-pair, maintenance, and healing. These concepts, theories and practices of care offer diverse ways of relating and living, of perceiving and making, both as a society and as individuals engaged in mutual responsibility, attentiveness, and responsiveness. Concepts of care can also provide an ethical and political framework for action, as it situates the human as a caretaker, a custodial figure in the ongoing recuperation of a broken planet and its people. How can we practice care across different scales – the personal, the collective, the rural, the urban, the atmospheric in order to sustain more-than-human worlds? And how can we proceed to a thinking and doing with care in a way that challenges the uneven labor conditions upon which the field operates? Who cares for whom and what are the consequences? (p. 1)

(Maternal Fantasies) greatly influenced my research as the backdrops of our residency resembled those of Maternal Fantasies, being site specific to the home. Although the design of my study and the feminist teaching art residency is unparalleled and distinct from any residency I have investigated, discovering Maternal Fantasies offered me comfort and inspired confidence in knowing the particulars of what these feminist mothers overcame and accomplished with their collective.

**Research Question and Methodology**

The research question central to this exploratory study is:

*What art education curriculum and pedagogical experiences will emerge from exploring four key components of Nel Noddings’s (1984) ethics of care (i.e., modeling, dialogue, practice, and confirmation) within a 17-day home-based feminist teaching art residency conceptualized with my 4- and 8-year-old children?* The research question is inspired by my children’s initial
resistance to the traditional curriculum I was teaching them at home (see Prologue) and is responsive to the possibilities of emergent and negotiated educational experiences created through a curriculum Andrew and Cora designed from their passions. Moreover, the origin of my research question is further formed from the analysis of guidance in applying the four key components in Noddings' ethics of care in transforming my pedagogy.

My methodology is participatory action research (PAR), which aligns with a feminist ethics of care by revisioning hierarchal relations as rather participatory and collaborative relations. My methods included Photovoice, interviews, and journaling, which I discuss in Chapter 3. I have an extensive background in photography with years of art school and teaching advanced placement photography. Photovoice is originally inspired by Brazilian educational philosopher and theorist Paulo Freire (1970), in which Photovoice prioritizes participants’ collective production of and reflection on knowledge (Latz, 2017). As part of my children’s curriculum inquiry within the study, Photovoice acted as the main method of data collection through my children’s eyes and mine, while reflecting our experiences of an ethics of care (in)formed by emergent interdisciplinary encounters through artmaking. Procedurally, “Photovoice can be distilled down to eight steps: identification, invitation, education, documentation, narration, ideation, presentation, and confirmation” (Latz, 2017, p. 4). Putting the camera into the participants' hands helps them document, reflect upon, and communicate (Budig et al., 2018), while creating ownership of their learning and a voice in producing their curriculum. From an ethics of care perspective, Photovoice is dialogic.

I shared the data I collected, through Photovoice, interviews, and journaling with feminist art educator scholar Marissa McClure Sweeny, who served as an outside expert consultant in my study to avoid insular reflections. McClure Sweeny critically responded to my self-reflective
narratives that supported the data such as my journal observations and Photovoice collection. I provided all reflections privately to McClure Sweeny through a shared Google® drive.

**Significance of the Study**

As an exploratory study, this dissertation most significantly uncovers how a feminist teaching art residency—one guided by components of an ethics of care—provided a participatory artmaking experience with my children. Additionally, the study contributes an introspection of pedagogy emergent in the residency through the methodological components of Photovoice, journaling, and interviewing. The study is also significant in that it is focused on learning how my children's home-based feminist teaching art residency curriculum embodied experiences, education, and collaborative artmaking. The data collected from Photovoice, journaling, interviews, and reflections offered an understanding of each participant's involvement within the study. Moreover, to foster and share in participatory knowledge relations and avoid insular perspectives, the dialogic feedback from McClure Sweeny contributes an early childhood art education perspective relevant to my study involving my young children. My hope is that my dissertation will contribute perspicacity for prospective feminist teaching art residencies through ethics of care teaching. Future studies might build upon insights from the arts-based interdisciplinary approaches I foster and document during the feminist teaching art residency to give agency to children's curriculum of art encounters as the learning of care for the place, environment, and the interrelationships within the residency.

The study's uniqueness as a feminist teaching art residency can encourage art educators to examine their pedagogy from a theoretical positioning of care. Through my study, transforming teaching through an ethics of care can revolutionize education, as care was *modeled*, and
discussed through *dialogue, practice, and confirmation*. When we consider the damage of an educational one-size-fits-all approach, these components are much of what our educational structure lacks and needs. Additionally, my study considered the environment of our home, indoors and outdoors, lived experiences of self and my two children, and recognized that an art residency does not separate the art, the educator, the student, or the environment where art creation can collaboratively transpire. My feminist teaching art residency nurtured creative growth, experimentation, a joint resolution of challenges, and art produced with no exclusive divide in education and studio practice.

**Chapter Overview**

This introductory chapter offered background and rationale for examining my pedagogy through the lens of Noddings's feminist theory, ethics of care, and the inspiration for the study's design. In Chapter 2, I present my review of literature that supports and guides the study's theoretical framework of an ethics of care. In Chapter 3, I discuss participatory action research (PAR) as the methodology applied throughout the study; specifically, the chapter details data collection methods and data collected by Andrew, Cora, and me used for data analysis. Chapter 4 presents my analysis of the study’s data through a theoretical lens of an ethics of care. In Chapter 4, I discuss how ethics of care theory and its four key components—*modeling, dialogue, practicing, and confirmation*—can be integral to teaching. I also show in Chapter 4 how children's passions and lived experiences can guide their creative learning in building an interdisciplinary curriculum. Finally, Chapter 5 offers the study findings, implications, and the significance of the study as an example to guide others to develop feminist art pedagogy situated
in an ethics of care and to advocate for the value of art residencies in homes, schools, and communities.
CHAPTER 2

THEORETICAL FRAME: NEL NODDINGS’S ETHICS OF CARE

In Chapter 2, I present literature concerning foundational feminist ethicist Nel Noddings and provide an in-depth discussion about care ethics as the philosophical study of morality and my dissertation's theoretical underpinning. In doing so, I connect Noddings’s ethic of care theory to her inspiration, John Dewey, a moral educational theorist. Next, I map relationships between Dewey’s and Noddings’s ideology about moral education. I particularly, I dive deeply into the influence of Dewey's experience theory of continuity on Noddings's theory of care; and then discuss continuity relative to my study. Additionally, I analyze concerns in care scholarship about Noddings's theory.

Moreover, in Chapter 2, I examine the importance of home as an educational site in nurturing care conceptualized as teaching art residency. Further, I present my understanding of four key components in Noddings's ethics of care: modeling, dialogue, practice, and confirmation. Lastly, I discuss my experience of meeting Noddings in her home in New Jersey and the impact she provided on understanding care theory directly from her and providing guidance forming my research question and giving a context in shaping the study's design.

Nel Noddings: Foundational Feminist Ethicist Educational Scholar

Foundational feminist ethicist Nel Noddings10 (1929-) is an influential U.S. educational scholar who has significantly contributed to fields such as education, feminism, philosophy, social psychology, and equity (Lake, 2012). Noddings, a New Jersey native, taught for many

---

10 Throughout the dissertation I refer to Nel Noddings as Nel or Noddings.
years as a mathematics educator before receiving her doctorate degree in education from Stanford University and teaching at numerous universities. Noddings was one of the first care theorists to write about the comprehensive details of care theory and argued that caring is the foundation of morality. In her theory of an ethics of care, or theory of care (TC), Noddings recognizes her approach to care ethics as relation ethics.

The prioritization of and concern for relationships in respectful engagement characterized by recognition, support, and care of others and their experiences is at the center of relational ethics (Smith, 2020). Applying ethics of care from a relational ethical approach through the prioritization of listening to students emerges through dialogue and informs the educator what students want to learn and what motivates them. In addition, teachers fostering relational ethics attend to students feeling connected to teachers and the learning environment.

Ethics, the philosophical study of morality, has for the most part concentrated on moral reasoning; accordingly, the dominant model of ethics presents a hierarchical picture of moral reasoning (Noddings, 2013). Noddings’s ethics of care—the theoretical underpinning of my dissertation—recasts ethics from such dominant models of moral reasoning to focus instead on human relationships.

Noddings’s theory, however, influenced by John Dewey (1859-1952), a U.S. born philosopher, psychologist, and educational reformer, whose ethical theories emanate from his research of progressive education in connection to the function of the mind. In particular, “he originated the stage theory of moral growth and the theory of experience” (Connerty, 1998, p. 1). Noddings drew much from Dewey in her dissection of moral education and humankind. Like Dewey, for example, Noddings maintains that education should center on human experience.
Further, Noddings recognized the possibilities from Dewey’s philosophy of education to facilitate feminist principles\textsuperscript{11} useful for self-agency.

**Experience, Learning by Doing, and Continuity**

Dewey maintained that education should center on the human experience. Through hands-on engagement, Dewey (1934) argues, students learn through doing. Dewey’s philosophy of education included to foster students’ agency in their own learning, which Noddings points out aligns with feminist principles. As feminist principles aligned with Noddings’s ethics of care, I endeavored to promote my children’s agency of their learning during our art residency.

Dewey (1934) in his book, *Art as Experience*, discusses the aesthetic experience of artists in the midst of creating their art requiring periods of reflection, which Dewey calls observing experience. I agree with Dewey that reflection is significant in the educational process, developing one’s understanding of the observed experience. The hands-on design and agency that our residency offered Andrew and Cora aligns with Dewey’s philosophy of learning by doing. My research draws from a lineage of ethics scholarship, which culminates in Noddings’s ethics of care as the theoretical framing of my research. Doing care work fosters agency and experiential learning; caring is what we experienced in our residency of 17 days.

Knowing that Dewey inspired Noddings, I researched the two theorists’ side by side and created a graphic map of their theories and emergent correlations that applied to my research,

\textsuperscript{11} The feminist principles included in my research are guided by Oxfam Canada (OCA), aiming to support transformative change in the historical power of the imbalances among people, further identifying power and privilege in the history of the women's movement, uniting an intersectional lens to gender, power, privilege, and the merging of these inequalities (Oxfam, 2018).
Both are moral educational theorists, yet Dewey and Noddings examine, describe, and apply morality differently. Interestingly, however, their different approaches complement each other.

**Figure 4.**

*Graphic map for visual of the theorists’ Dewey and Noddings*

*Note:* I made a graphic map to see Dewey’s and Noddings’s theories side by side for reference and to better understand how their positions relate to our residency.

As shown in Figure 4, Dewey contends that morality is an ethic directed toward goodness through consciousness, whereas Noddings believes that caring is the foundation for morality. In contrast Dewey focuses on real-life experiences and Noddings focuses on empathy and kindness, which is care. Yet, both theories are relative to our residency as the real-life experiences that Andrew and Cora experienced shaped their educational encounters and knowing while applying empathy and kindness, which is care. Those applications, however, were experienced through care. The experiential component focusing on hands-on learning was important to the residency
design as in Dewey’s (1938) text, *Experience & Education*, in which he examined prevalent education practices in public school and revealed the absence of experience in developing knowledge. In our residency, we made and engaged in experiential learning together. According to Dewey, “knowledge is what students learn from their experiences” (Tordini, 2018, p. 17).

Through experience, “people build skills and insights from the only opportunities of the present that can apply to future endeavors. For experiences to be educative, they must lead out into the real world and prepare the person for future experiences” (Tordini, 2018, p. 17). In the spirit of Dewey’s contributions to education, our residency was child-centered experiential learning.

Enriching Dewey’s (1938) philosophy of education grounded in experience is his insistence on the importance of continuity of that experiential learning. Dewey (1938) maintained that “educational experience involves continuity and interaction between the learner and what is learned” (p. 10). Continuity and interaction encompass the two principles of Dewey’s theory of experience. He believed that in the continuity of experiences, being of the past and the present, are carried forward and influence future experiences and decisions (Dewey 1938). The principle of interaction refers to the objective and internal conditions of an experience (Dewey, 1938). Dewey’s experience theory more explicitly contextualizes my relationships as mother to Andrew and Cora prior to the residency and those relationships and experiences that emerged within the residency and what is still to come. Understanding the significance of the continuity of maternal experiences from my children's birth until the present is crucial as motherhood has shaped and transformed my life. The reshaping of importance in my life was an instant awakening in thriving to be a better person from the first time I cradled their soft newborn bodies in my arms and knowing the responsibility that comes along with parenting. Honestly, I had always dreamt of being a mother since I was a child myself, though the first
experience of being a mother no words can express, yet only that individualized understanding can define the moment. Andrew and Cora prompted me to mature in ways that involve me wanting to do better, more for me but ultimately more for them, including my doctoral journey. However, the most significant culmination of growth in part of our relationship transpired during the residency, which offered continuity of experience being undisturbed by demands beyond my children, leading to inquiries of who they are and what they want to be. During the residency, I evolved with Andrew and Cora in ways that challenged us to refocus on what we deemed vital in our lives, which ultimately is each other. The residency acts as the continuity of blossoming positive growth to our future direction in homeschooling as a collective, emergent curriculum learning experience.

The residency design, in following Dewey’s understanding of interactions that complete the principles of experience theory, had at its core objectives for interactions and experience that foster life-long learning. The learning was emergent and created from my children's passions. The residency also embodied Dewey’s ideas that students were all unique learners (Williams, 2017) and that education is a “process of living and not a preparation for future living” (Flinders & Thornton, 2013, p. 35; Gutek, 2014). The residency engaged us in the process of living and life-long learning rather than linear learning from a textbook and rigid test-taking, typically forgotten soon after the test. Dewey thought that schools and classrooms should be representative of real-life situations, allowing children to participate in learning activities interchangeably and flexibly in a variety of social settings (Dewey, 1938; Gutek, 2014). Our residency model was just that, real life situations for my children to create their curriculum from their passions and learning through interdisciplinary artmaking encounters that are flexible between indoor and outdoor learning through hands-on experiences all through care.
Aligning With Nel Noddings

I connect to Noddings’s theory in my research with my children from a maternal experience. In other words, one cannot disconnect the fact that I am my children’s mother; therefore, care was situated differently in my study of our art residency than with students in a classroom. It is normal that “our relation to our children is not governed first by the ethical but by natural caring. We love not because we are required to love but because our natural relatedness gives natural birth to love. It is this love, this natural caring, that makes ethical possible” (Noddings, 2013, p. 43). In the ethics of care theory, Noddings emphasizes reciprocity, asserting that caring is a relation which involves dialogue and exchange. Both student and educator can learn and gain from the experience; both can appeal to principles of care (Smith, 2020).

I focus exclusively\(^\text{12}\) on Noddings’s work relative to TC for my exploratory study; however, in TC literature more broadly, diverse perspectives of care representations exist from many care theorists,\(^\text{13}\) which I will discuss later within Chapter 2. Ethics of care challenges conventional ethical theories, recognizing them as male-centric and problematic because they neglect values typically linked with women or roles frequently deemed feminine (D'Olimpio, 2019). Noddings, too, avers dominant ethical theories remain too male-centered in that they profoundly concentrate on reason, law, justice, and not on values of compassion, relatedness, and

---

\(^{12}\) Noddings's viewpoint of TC and my ideology with Noddings is similar to our lived experiences as progressive feminist educators and feminist mothers.

\(^{13}\) Care theorists include Annette Baier, Sandra Bartky, Joan Callahan, Carol Gilligan, Virginia Held, Sarah Hoagland, Eva Feder Kittay, Christine Koggel, Tove Pettersen, Sara Ruddick, Maureen Sander-Staudt, Mary Lyndon Shanley, Michael Slote, Joan Tronto, Margaret Urban Walker, and Robin West (Sander-Staudt, 2021).
responsiveness (Smith, 2020). Noddings theorizes caring as the bond uniting humanistic connections, which directly translates to her conception of the student-educator relationship (Noddings, 1984). She believes educators are obligated to teach students the principles of care ethics and to foster experiences whereby students might navigate the world while caring. Using Noddings’s pedagogical application of care, I explored throughout this study the connections and relations between my children and myself. Further, Noddings’s ideology of care informed not only the residency design in this study but also contributed to the collaboration dynamics of our feminist teaching art residency in our home. Noddings was deeply influenced by her own experiences with schooling and caring teachers, which contributed to forming her feminist epistemological viewpoint. Noddings’s experiences cultivated a love of learning beginning in her childhood (Smith, 2020). Indeed, for Noddings, schooling played a central role in her life, and her early experiences with caring teachers contributed to a long interest in student-teacher relations (Flinders, 2001). In the literature about Noddings’s experiences, her life story demonstrates care can be infused in public school education, as it was for Noddings. Schooling forms an enduring impression on our lives.

In addition to Noddings’s education from caring teachers who influenced her work, Noddings also noted three categories in her life that mattered tremendously in self-examination: domestic life, learning and writing, and living life as a moral quest (O'Toole, 1998). Living life as a moral quest meant for Noddings that she was certain about some things, but not very many. She declares, “if you were to visit me on the New Jersey shore, we would take a long walk, and we would be talking about this uncertainty that is part of life as a moral quest” (O'Toole, 1998, para. 12). Noddings has, also, made clear in her writing her love of domestic life. Since her earliest publications in the 1984, Noddings repeatedly referred to herself as incurably domestic.
Noddings raised ten children, was married to the same man, Jim, until his passing in 2012, and often remarked about how she liked order in the kitchen (Smith, 2020). As O’Toole (1998) describes, Noddings liked having pets and kids around and “feminists ... sometimes find it hard to admit such things matter to them” (para. 5). The self-reflecting that Noddings declares as a feminist of her idea of domestic life, learning, writing, and living life as a moral quest aligns with my position as a feminist. For example, during our conversation in April 2021, Noddings was curious about my background. I explained about being married to my high school sweetheart, Luke, the passion I have for homeschooling, my children, and loving domestic life as well. After explaining my background, Noddings responded, “wow, we have a lot in common, as far as relationships to our husbands, domestic life, and a passion for children, as I have ten of them” (N. Noddings, personal communication, April 22, 2021, 8:16). Enacting the theoretical framework of ethics of care from a feminist theorist whose ideology parallels mine is significant. Noddings and I share the belief that feminist principles14 of autonomy, choice, empowerment, and meaningful engagement all of which can be a part of one’s life and does not conflict with enjoying domestic life and identifying your significant other or beloved as your husband.

Care theory enjoins the consideration of another person’s frame of reference and is a process that involves purposeful use of engrossment, motivational displacement, and reciprocity (Noddings, 1984). Noddings's "characterizes caring as an act of engrossment whereby the one-caring receives the cared-for on their own terms, resisting projection of the self onto the cared-for, and displacing selfish motives in order to act on the behalf of the cared-for" (Sander-Staudt, 2021, para. 6). Engrossment relative to ethics theory and the four key components acts at the attention for one another as the one-caring and the cared for, connecting to the component of

modeling in providing the visibility and attention of care. Motivational displacement occurs when the one-caring’s behavior is demarcated by the individual's needs for whom a person is caring-for. Noddings argues that the carer must reveal engrossment and motivational displacement, and the cared-for person must respond in some way to the caring. On its own, motivational displacement is flawed for ethical caring (Noddings, 1984, p. 32). Care theory and the components of practice and confirmation cannot be enacted if the cared-for does not embrace the care by the one-caring. Lastly, reciprocity is vital in the four key components of care ethics: modeling, dialogue, practice, and confirmation. Particularity as the relational of an ethics of care consists of at least two people, the “one-caring” and the “cared-for.” Such a relationship can certainly be more than merely dyadic as the one-caring and the cared-for may come to exhibit a reciprocal commitment to each individual’s well-being (Sander-Staudt, 2021). Reciprocity is predominantly correlated to practice and confirmation in care ethics. The cared-for responds and provides the caring back to the one-caring or made visible to see the caring applied to the environment and others. Noddings posits that caring and respect are vital elements in ethical human relationships (Paxton, 2014). Likewise, I believe caring is essential in healthy and happy relationships. My commitment to an ethics of care, as espoused by Nel Noddings, especially reciprocity, is critical to my feminist work; the mutuality of care is beneficial for the three of us in the residency.

**Concerns about Caring**

Theories do not align with all individuals and can evolve (Filmer, 2013), which does not make a theory false or invalid. Noddings’s theory of care has received criticism concerning the feminist positioning of care perceived as inaccessible to some. Nevertheless, Noddings (2012)
makes clear about this inaccessibility, stating, “the language of care ethics has arisen largely from women’s experience, but that is not to say that it is inaccessible to men” (para. 1). Ethics of care does not create a language more towards one gender than the other; care theory is about human relations, not specified gender relations. For example, Noddings addresses the relational ethical intersection of two people as the one-caring and the cared-for, yet, no matter what, scrutinization and debate of terms will occur in any way, uncovering some imperfection within the verbiage of care theory leading to the inaccessible to some.

An extensive critique of Noddings’s first work on caring comes from Sarah Lucia Hoagland, a professor of Philosophy and Women’s Studies at Northeastern Illinois University in Chicago. In Hoagland’s (1990) review titled, “Some Concerns About Nel Noddings’ Caring,” of Noddings’s Caring (1984) she asserts: “Nel Noddings argues that hers is not an ethics of agape. I want to argue, on the contrary, that it is a problem” (Hoagland, 1990, p. 109). Hoagland’s point, as Noddings notes too, is that Noddings’s ethics of care is not encompassing; instead, Noddings focuses on empathy and kindness.

Further, Hoagland criticizes Noddings’s analysis of caring, which uses mothering as a model. Hoagland (1990) states:

I object to the unidirectional description of caring. Second, I do not think mothering can be properly used as the model for an ethics of caring. Let me begin with the reciprocity of the cared-for; it is not a mutual engrossment and motivational displacement, not even a receiving of the other’s world to the extent of understanding it. Reciprocity amounts to acknowledgment of the other’s caring. Nel Noddings notes that the relationship can be heightened if the cared-for’s acknowledgment includes involving the one-caring in the
cared-for’s projects. However, there is no need for children to turn and exhibit concern for the mother’s projects. (p. 109)

My dissertation is based on a premise that children, even as young as four years old, can engage in an ethics of care, and doing so involves concern for their mother’s projects, as reciprocity of the cared-for and the care-giver goes both ways. Moreover, the roles of cared-for and care-giver shift over time and change situations. Throughout the residency, I enacted the four key components of an ethics of care as the modeling of care emerged through action and dialogue to my children. However, my children exhibited care bringing reciprocity of the key components of practice and confirmation, which, as noted, I contend young children can engage in an ethics of care.

Another point Hoagland advances in the article of her concerns with regards to Noddings’s theory of care is that “non-reciprocity-beyond-acknowledgement undermines the possibility of instilling the value of one-caring in the cared-for” (Hoagland, 1990, p. 110). Hoagland further asserts:

I am not convinced that a child, especially a male child, who receives one-caring from his mother will ever learn to be one-caring himself. Rather, as is more consistent with my observations, such children learn to expect more one-caring—unidirectional—from all females. In fact, that is what they look for in a wife. (p. 110)

Considering the context of two middle-class White woman in the 1980s and 1990s discussing the need for reciprocal care, it seems they lived in different worlds. Noddings had experienced and observed boys and men as caring, while Hoagland had experienced and observed boys to grow

15 “One-caring considers the cared-for's point of view, assessment of need, and expectations of the one-caring in formulating a response that provides the best opportunity for helping the cared-for” (Burton & Dunn, 2021, para. 1).
up to be like their fathers, who expected to be cared-for in ways not returned. In understanding
the definition of one-caring and the consideration of the cared-for’s point of view, their
assessment of need and expectations of the one-caring, Hoagland makes a bold statement that
boys and men look for one-caring in a wife. Hoagland critiques and criticizes Noddings (1984)
for her feminine approach, specifically the term feminine to moral ethics, however, Noddings
Approach to Ethics and Moral Education*:

> When *Caring* first appeared, I endured a multitude of criticisms for my use of the word
> “feminine.” Why not “feminist”? I am a feminist, certainty, and I believe that *Caring* fits
> into the theoretical category of relational feminism. But when I wrote *Caring*, I did not
> know much about feminist theory. I was working my own way through a set of problems,
> and I chose, “feminine” to direct attention to centuries of experience more typical of
> women than men. “Feminine” pointed to a mode of experience, not to an essential
> characteristic of women, and I wanted to make clear that men might also share this
> experience. I still believe that, if we want makes to participate fully in caring, a change of
> experience is required, starting in childhood. (p. xvi)

The 1984 edition of *Caring, A Feminine Approach to Ethics and Moral Education* to the second
edition from 2003, seems that Nel spends time justifying claims against her from the almost
twenty-year gap of time. In 1984 feminist scholarship was new, nearly only ten years since the
by Mary Wollstonecraft.
Differences within Care Ethics Theorists

Noddings’s (1984) book, *Caring: A Feminine Approach to Ethics and Moral Education*, offered the world a care-based perspective of moral philosophy. In this work, Noddings provided a detailed account of the definition, the scope, and the characteristics of her perspective, a way of living ethically using the moral value of care as the basis (Eken, 2017). Noddings discusses empathy in relation to ethics of care as the focus (Noddings, 1984). Investigating deeper within my research on empathy and Noddings care theory, I found that ethicists use different vocabularies, different focuses, yet still agree upon on many of the tenets of Noddings’s care theory.

For example, Michael Slote (1941-), a professor of ethics at the University of Miami and author of *The Ethics of Care and Empathy* (2007), contributes immensely to literature on care ethics focusing on empathy. Noddings writes of Slote’s two greatest contributions to care ethics: (a) connecting care ethics to moral sentimentalism and (b) employing empathy in a way that extends care ethics into justice and global affairs (Noddings, 2010). Care ethicists can sometimes use different vocabularies to mean the same principle. For example, Slote rarely uses the words *relation, attachment, attention, reciprocity, responsibility, interdependence, mothering, needs,* or *motivational displacement* as other theorists often reference in their literature (Noddings, 2010). However, Slote emphasizes the same core focus and does not ignore those ideas conveyed through terminology that Noddings uses.

Additionally, more examples of the different focuses and terminology in care theory are explored through Carol Gilligan’s (1982) *In a Different Voice*, emphasizes a “different voice” is that women, like men, are capable of thinking and acting in a manner associated with justice and with elements more associated with the value of care. Another care ethicist, Virginia Held
“analyzed feminism in order to move toward a transformation of moral theory” (Noddings, 2010, p. 7). Knowing of Held’s scholarship prior to a thorough literature review of Noddings’ writings, I was not surprised that Noddings would connect with Held’s views. However, I was awakened to the close connection that Noddings and Held have in their feminist belief that care is vital to human survival.

Lastly, I cannot neglect care ethics in association with the medical field even though I am focused on education as there are many similarities between education and nursing pertaining to care ethics. Closely connected to Noddings’s position in care theory is Jean Watson. Watson, an ethical care nurse theorist, developed the *Theory of Human Caring*. Watson contends that humans cannot be treated as objects and that humans cannot be separated from self, other, nature, and the larger workforce (Watson, 1997). Watson expresses that caring regenerate life energies and potentiates our capabilities as humans. Care is immeasurable and promotes self-actualization on both a person and professional level (Watson, 1997). In reflecting upon care in the medical field to care in the educational setting, both areas overlap in the need for care.

In deepening my literature review analysis through a theoretical discussion on various care ethicists, I contend that all theorists and their positions are relative to the next one. Noddings (1984), Slote (2007), Gilligan (1982), Held (2006), and Watson (1997) all agree that care is vital for our existence, yet, with variations on importance to gender, professional, and education. Noddings’s focus on empathy within mothering and education served as the guide and lens for my feminist teaching art residency.
Significance of Home as an Educational Site to Nurture Care

Home is crucial in the study from a theoretical standpoint of care. Home is where my children Andrew and Cora developed curriculum from their passions. Home is the site of my pedagogy of care for Andrew and Cora. In this section, I examine Noddings's (2002) theoretical concept of home as site of influential education in her book, *Starting at Home, Caring and Social Policy*. She writes, “education that starts at home is one that affects the lives of children for years to come” (2002, p. 7). She discusses how homelife has effects that, to some degree, shape us (Noddings, 2002). Noddings is a firm believer in children's connection to their home.

The art residency offered Andrew and Cora an in-depth connection to learn about the land on which they live and grow within; and the curriculum that is emergent based on their relationships within the home. In Noddings's (2006) book, *Critical Lessons: What Our Schools Should Teach*, she states that “natural history and ecology of our own backyards may be entirely ignored” in schools (p. 68). She further claims that learning in one's yard is necessary, and education in our backyards offer opportunities for “critical questions [to] abound: What creatures live there? How does my life affect theirs?” (Noddings, 2006, p. 68).

Care Ethics: Four Key Components of Moral Education

Noddings’s (2006) states that, “no task is more challenging and potentially more rewarding than parenting” (p. 119). Noddings’s conceptualization of an ethics of care is fundamentally grounded in her experience of the mother-child relationship. My study, too, takes

---

16 I do recognize that some homes do not have a yard in the conventional concept of yard, but all homes have a context, whether that home is living in a car, trailer, apartment, on a boat, motel, institution (e.g., boarding school) among other types of homes. The surroundings of one’s home is a pedagogical landscape.
up Noddings’s orientation to ethics of care from the standpoint of a mother. The mother-child relationship I experienced was strengthened through the collaborative feminist teaching art residency and research with my children. The residency and research we shared offered challenges and new rewarding dimensions to parenthood in ways that shifted the way I care for my children, enriched the mother-child relationship I experience, and cultivated the pedagogy and research ethics of care emergent from this study.

Noddings’s theory of an ethic of care “is a form of relational ethics [and] relational ethics remain tightly tied to experience (Noddings, 1988, p. 139). The substance of Noddings’s care ethics are the four key components of moral education: modeling, dialogue, practice, and confirmation (Lake, 2012, para. 15). All four key components are connected to my Participatory Action Research (PAR) methodology and align with my research of a feminist teaching art residency. The components offer direction in considering my pedagogy during the residency and in analysis of my daily journal reflections of the residency.

*Modeling*

The first of the four key components of moral education is *modeling*. Modeling is influential; when a child is secure in a caring relationship, the caring adult usually has a powerful effect on children’s learning, development, and world views (Slote & Noddings, 2016). With that said, it is imperative to acknowledge that parents are comprised of persons of various biological and nonbiological relationships and roles to children. And while secure caring relationships powerfully affect children, so do their lived experiences of parents’ death, addiction, incarceration, and poverty. As a result, children may face any number of lifelong challenges that systematically maintain inequities and marginalization. While this study does not focus on these
conditions, I am aware of the disparity children face with their parental relationships and such acknowledgement contributes to my careful consideration for future studies and economic policies needed to support raising all children in healthy, loving, caring environments. For the purposes of this study, it is understood that parent(s)\textsuperscript{17} are role models for their children, as children learn both from their parents’ direct teaching and indirectly by observing the ways in which their parents live.

Regarding care theory, modeling must “show what it means to care by caring, by demonstrating caring. However, the role of modeling should not overwhelm the actual caring. We do not ‘care’ in order to model caring; we model care by caring (Slote & Noddings, 2016, p. 147). Throughout the 17-days of data collection, I journaled and reflected on what I modeled for my children in acts of caring (see Figures 5-6). The caring captured in Figure 7, is not of hugging, but rather caring in educating Cora of how to use and care for her new camera that would need to be taken care of, as it could break. Modeling care is vital in teaching; if we teach with care to the cared-for, the cared-for will practice what is modeled of care in confirming and utilizing Noddings’s theory. Further, daily journaling revealed my care through reflections and Photovoice as a method visually reflecting my model of care throughout the residency. From my perspective, care with Andrew and Cora seems to come naturally for me as their mother; however, I anticipated that there might be visual evidence that depicts me as their mother in ways I did not expect.

\textsuperscript{17} I acknowledge the singular traditional connotation of the term parents that refers to biological mothers and fathers, but my use of the term also characterizes non-biological, extended family members, and guardians.
Left: *Self-reflection of modeling*

Right: *Providing modeling to Cora of care in using her new camera for the method of Photovoice*

*Note:* Image of my reflection in an excerpt from my daily journaling I wrote during our residency.

*Note.* Andrew captured this photograph documenting me, his mother, modeling the use of a camera to Cora, his sister.

**Dialogue**

*Dialogue* is an essential part of caring. I facilitated dialogue each day with my children, asking them directly about their lived experiences throughout the 17-day art residency (see Figures 7-8). Our dialogue was emergent. In other words, dialogue was unscripted with Andrew and Cora during the residency through daily interviews, which were organic in their questioning structure. Noddings discusses that emergent or unplanned dialogue is “genuine dialogue that is open-ended at the outset, and it is weightier than mere conversation, although conversation can also contribute to moral education. In dialogue, both parties speak, and both parties listen” (Slote & Noddings, 2016, p. 147). Dialogue with my children was important data on how lived experiences transform, create, and produce curriculum within an art residency environment.
Figures 7-8.

Left: Self-reflection of dialogue

Right: Offering positive encouragement through dialogue to Cora

Note. Image of daily journaling I wrote during our residency; this entry was Day 1. Right: Andrew captured this photograph of me offering positive reinforcement to Cora, encouraging that she can draw anything she puts her mind to, this occurred on Day 2.

**Practice**

The third component in Noddings’s moral education is *practice*. Noddings (1998) emphasizes practice as the experiences in which we immerse ourselves that tend to produce a ‘mentality’. Producing a positive mentality in practice is necessary for education, as mentality is the attitude or way of thinking applied in our practice. Modeling acts of positive mentality care practice are intricate and vital in the study’s home-based and site-specific feminist teaching art residency (see Figures 9-10). Noddings (2016) explains how modeling acts of positive mentality care practice might manifest in educational settings:

Good parents and teachers provide opportunities for children and students to practice caring. This practice involves the exercise of empathy or sympathy, and the parent or teacher watches to ensure that the interactions are rightly called caring. It is not simply a matter of correcting uncaring behavior, although that is certainly part of the teacher’s task; induction is clearly important in doing this. But the good teacher also takes note of
the kind of helpful behaviors and compliments the child who demonstrates care. This does not mean that caring behaviors should be *rewarded*; they should be acknowledged. When children are rewarded for the *caring* responses, we hope to encourage, the reward may displace the genuine impulse to care. (p. 148)

Figures 9-10.

Left: *Self-reflection of practice*  
Right: *Cora practicing care in what was modeled to her about her camera in the garden*

*Note.* Image of daily journaling I wrote during our residency, this entry was Day 1.  
Right: Andrew took this image of me helping Cora to practice taking photographs of our garden on the residency site.

My children and I documented our practice of care in our daily homelife responsibilities. Further, I analyzed our practice through data collected concerning the positive modeling and positive practice relating to care ethics, which influenced Andrew’s and Cora’s curriculum and my pedagogical positioning on care ethics. Practicing, learning, and exercising empathy (Noddings, 2016) and care for each other held promise to transcend to our property. We were entangled in the imperative to care for our environment and Earth. This entanglement inspired life-long learning and practicing of care for the Earth and all its inhabitants for my children.
**Confirmation**

Lastly, *confirmation*, “points a person toward a better self, and it is itself a beautiful moral act” (Slote & Noddings, 2016, p. 148). Confirmation becomes affirmation, visible implementation of care. Within my research, confirmation with my children is organic, not predetermined, programmed, or structured as it is not procedural (see Figures 11-12). Since I have known my children from their birth and understand their personalities, I recognized in my journal reflections when confirmation was appropriate or needed during the residency. Noddings's care theory reaffirms the ethical and moral foundations of teaching, schooling, and education from a feminist epistemological viewpoint. Also, Noddings perceives education as being central to the cultivation of caring in society. She defines education as a constellation of encounters, both planned and unplanned,\(^\text{18}\) that promote growth through the acquisition of knowledge, skills, understanding, and appreciation (Noddings, 2002). Noddings identifies and brings the efficacy needed for my research from a theoretical standpoint as my children shaped their curriculum.

\(^{18}\)Noddings discusses gratitude to Elliot Eisner’s null curriculum as her writings align with the unplanned curriculum that Noddings mentioned in her work. Eisner introduced null curriculum in 1979, which refers to the material that schools do not teach, by declaring, “it is my thesis that what schools do not teach may be as important as what they do teach” (Noddings, 2012, p. 83).
Figures 11-12.

Left: **Self-reflection of confirmation**

Right: **Cora ventures out on her own with a camera**

*Note.* Image of daily journaling I wrote during our residency; this entry was Day 1. Right: Andrew captured this image of Cora studying and analyzing her photographs after just learning how to use the new camera for the method of Photovoice.

**Meeting Nel Noddings**

I take chances and never miss an opportunity in life, so when I started writing my dissertation proposal chapter on an ethics of care, I decided to email Noddings in hopes of her responding. On February 22, 2021, I finally sent the email that I had been scrutinizing over for weeks on end (see Figure 13). During the next month I waited in anticipation, checking my email countless times daily, waiting for a response from Noddings. Much to my surprise, on March 21, 2021, I received the most glorious email a Ph.D. candidate could ever receive from the very theorist guiding her study (Figure 14). I remember calling friends and family to share the joyous news of Noddings's email. Not only did Noddings respond to me, but she extended an invitation to meet with me. I must confess I had to pinch myself to make sure I was not living a dream after receiving the email from Noddings.
Note: My first email to Nel Noddings, I decided to email her in hopes I would hear back!

Figure 13.

First email to Noddings

Note: I was overjoyed in receiving this email to the point where I felt weightless for hours afterward with a permanent smile on my face.

After 24-hours of living in the ether and being on cloud nine, I emailed Noddings back (see Figure 15). As she is 92 years old, I offered options in meeting and sharing with her that I am fully vaccinated from COVID-19, and if she wanted to wait until warmer weather, I would
respect her preference. After sending the email back to her, I felt refreshed; that moment of corresponding back and forth with Noddings was remarkable. Instead of a month of waiting with bated breath, Noddings responded within two days and offered a telephone number, opening her home to me and planning a date to do so (see Figure 16). After receiving the second email from Noddings, I called Noddings on March 24, 2021, to discuss plans to meet each other. Our conversation was delightful and lasted for more than an hour; Noddings was so cheerful as she shared her excitement in meeting a doctoral candidate applying care theory as the theoretical framing of the study. As the conversation progressed, I offered to share my working dissertation proposal with her. We mutually decided on April 22, 2021, as our meeting date since the weather down by the shore in New Jersey would be warmer. The warmer weather would allow for outside conversation and a possible walk to the beautiful beach in Ocean Grove, New Jersey.

**Figure 15.**

*My response to Nel’s first email*

*Note:* I shared with Nel options in meeting with me, as I wanted her to feel safe during the Pandemic of COVID-19.
A Date I Will Never Forget: April 22, 2021

Nel and I started our conversation concerning the pandemic and the disruption on human connection and she explained that because of the vaccine, her house was going to be open that summer. She seemed so thrilled about her ten children, grandchildren, and great grandchildren coming to visit her finally, after a year of absence due to the Coronavirus. In discussing her children, she mentioned that she adopted three Korean children from the Pearl S. Buck Welcome Home, and expressed that, “Pearl S. Buck was one of my most favorite examples in this world” (Noddings, April 22, 2021, 2:23).

In our discussion, Nel asked how online teaching was going, and I expressed a divide I could feel with certain students. I felt much resistance from a few in not wanting to contribute or even put their cameras on during Zoom® because they did not want their personal space at home to be seen. I understand the resistance to some extent because all of us in this world have been displaced somehow, yet Nel and my conversation quickly diverted to the outcome of test scores from this shift in education during the pandemic. Nel is no stranger to being transparent with the unnecessary pressures placed upon students and educators due to a testing emphasis of
assessment in education. I, too, have very similar viewpoints of standardized tests in our educational system. In relation to test scores, Nel mentioned, “it will be interesting to see the research that follows this pandemic; I’m interested particularly in the test results, especially since they will have gone down, I HOPE (chuckling), that will teach the educational system!” (Noddings, April 22, 2021, 4:35) (Figures 17-19).

**Figures 17-19.**

* Nel and I laughing together

*Note:* Nel I laughed over thinking about finally education will see the results from testing after the pandemic is not necessary and how testing in the educational system is detrimental to students.

I noticed right away the pride that Nel exuded in her bright red sweatshirt with the words, STANFORD written rather large in bold white letters across the front. In getting to learn more about her face-to-face versus reading her many books that I have over the past couple of years, I asked, “How did you like teaching at Stanford University?” She replied immediately without hesitation, “I loved it, I love Stanford, I love everything about that University” (Noddings, April 22, 2021, 5:37). In a playful manner, Nel than proceeded to ask me “why I was wearing such a small pin representing, Penn State?” (Noddings, April 22, 2021, 6:13). I laughed and said, “I will remember the next time we meet to wear the largest Nittany Lion logo I can find” (Tredinnick-
Kirby, April 22, 2021, 6:19), (see Figure 20) of us together representing our universities, of cardinal red for Stanford and blue for Penn State.

**Figure 20.**

*Image of Nel and myself in Stanford and Penn State colors*

*Note.* After a good laugh of university pride, we smiled for the camera together.

I knew that Noddings taught at Penn State at one point, so I asked her about that experience, and she replied, “that she was grateful for the opportunity to teach in the education department at Penn State, yet Jim (her husband) was not fond of the area as he was unable to find a job” (Noddings, April 22, 2021, 6:28). We joked about how probably not much has changed in the area, as my experience of moving out to State College, Pennsylvania from New Jersey when I first started the Ph.D. program was a complete shock for my husband and me. We have lived in New Jersey most of our lives, with my husband leaving for only a couple of years during his four years of active service in the United States Marine Corps, though, New Jersey has always been our home. We lived about an hour away from New York City, Philadelphia, and the Atlantic Ocean. So, when we moved away to State College, Pennsylvania, we were land-locked and felt
the effects of an isolated area that was solely focused on the University. Our transition was difficult, especially for my son, Andrew.

**Conversing with Nel: Ethics of Care and Freire**

During our time together, I expressed to Nel how I was first introduced to care ethics during my graduate studies. Because of my awakening later in my career to care theory, I feel sadness in how long it took in my educational journey to have that exposure. However, now knowing of care ethics, I shifted a comprehensive curriculum focused on pedagogy at my teaching position, The College of New Jersey (TCNJ), to concentrate entirely on her work. To say she was ecstatic is an understatement; I could see the delight on Nel's face of having a course focused directly on the arduous commitment she has made in over forty years to make the need for care ethics in education noticeable.

Our discussion continued about how vital care is within our educational system and whereby a demand in an increase of care, yet countless educators like me did not know of moral education and the four key components that could shift one's pedagogy to infuse that care element. She agreed, responding, “I think that it's true for many people of the not knowing of care ethics” (Noddings, April 22, 2021, 10:01). Besides the curriculum shift that I made in my course at TCNJ, my intense passion for Nel's work offered a place for me to entirely align my research design of a feminist teaching art residency around the infusion of the four key components of care ethics into my pedagogy. Nel has remained an inspiration to me, and her work is monumental not only as an educator but, also, in my parenting and worldviews.

Our time together was spent in her library where I immediately noticed the Dewey books that surrounded us. The room was all white and very tidy with a sunroom off the library with many plants occupying the space. Nel and I visited the sunroom only so that Nel could have me
look east at the beautiful view of the Atlantic Ocean. The view was incredibly clear, and the sound of seagulls filled the air. The whole experience was lifechanging being with Nel, the afternoon together was truly an amazing experience to converse with the theorist about my research and her inspiration in my life. We sat back down in the library, and I turned the question of inspiration to Nel, asking her of her inspirations besides John Dewey and Pearl S. Buck, to which she responded, Paulo Freire.

On the topic of Freire, Nel showed an interest in the Photovoice method from my proposal which I previously sent to her before our time together. She asked me to explain more thoroughly about the application to Photovoice as a method in my research. I explained about the photographs that will be taken by my children become their voice and the eyes of what they will see throughout our residency. Photovoice afforded the opportunity for my children's voices to be heard and to have their agency in the way they identify with the residency and the daily occurrences that transpire in our time together. Nel understood the standpoint of my research design and after further explanation she mentioned the “wonderful cohesion of Photovoice as a method and care ethics as the theoretical framework to your study” (Noddings, April 22, 2021, 22:23).

The Formation of My Research Question: What are you Trying to Figure Out?

Before meeting Nel, I shared my research proposal with her; I felt somewhat vulnerable to share such a document with the theorist I am proposing for my research, yet I was confident. Though, in repeatedly reviewing the film footage from our time together at Nel’s residence, she posed the question numerous times, what are you trying to figure out? At one point in the film, I mentioned to Nel that I felt overwhelmed answering questions that I was not prepared to answer,
which her response was, “well, it’s good that you are overwhelmed because you will be thinking deeper into what you are proposing” (Noddings, April 22, 2021, 26:06). In hindsight now, there is no other person on this planet that I would instead have to challenge me on my research question at that given time, where I still could shift and change my research question and design.

Before my conversation with Nel, the originally proposed research question for the study placed home as the core to my research, *How can conceptualizing one’s home as a feminist teaching artist residency, informed by an ethics of care (Noddings, 1986), build a generative living curriculum?* Yet, with Nel posing challenging questions that afternoon, repeatedly deciphering my research question, my research focus changed to my children leading the day’s curriculum and perceiving our home as the site of an art residency while infusing a pedagogy of care. In that moment of transitioning the focus, she mentions, “I know I am pushing you rather hard, but you need to know the basics of a research question and be able to defend your position in what you are studying. What are you hoping for in the outcome, what will you take from this research, all of that will be a part of the research question” (Noddings, April 22, 2021, 32:02). At that moment, I could hear Noddings in ways I could not hear others nor myself. First, from her advice, I realized I should pivot the study to be more focused on the emergent curriculum from Andrew and Cora. Second, Noddings added that my pedagogical inquiry of care ethics ought to be examined, which lifted much weight off my mind. From that experience with Noddings, I realized that learning is not always ready to be understood due to deeply maintained perceptions that are difficult to break through and consider differently. The perceptual filters I hold are similar to the filters that impact understandings formed in viewing art. Each individual, according to art educator Vincent Lanier (1975), perceives art through nine filters, which include: societal valuations of the art, the context of the art, an individual’s education,
knowledge of elements and principles of art, familiarity with the symbolism in the art, personal associations with the art, familiarity with the historical knowledge specific to the work, personal assessment criteria of art, and if and how the art relates to the viewer’s life. Many of these nine filters that impact perception of art impacted, without my awareness, how I understood my research until Noddings questioned modes and conditioned filters each person brings to perceiving their experiences. In the ways Lanier demystifies orientations to art, Noddings’s questions revealed much about my research and my purpose I had yet to realize. The advice was that “if you shift your research towards investigating your pedagogy and the emergence of your children’s curriculum through their passion and care applied during the art residency, you are answering the question that care should be in one’s pedagogy and within education, from your children’s experiential design in the study and with the findings you will discover in your research” (Noddings, April 22, 2021, 32:33). Listening to her guidance and collaboratively examining the purpose in generating what my research question should entail, I felt overwhelmed and grateful and couldn’t help but beam with a smile during those moments (Figure 21).

Figure 21.

*Nel dissecting the purpose of my study*

*Note: The smile in the image is of happiness by being guided by the theorist I am applying to my study, Nel Noddings.*
I thought if Noddings struggled to understand and delineate the purpose of my study, it was imperative that I consider her feedback, discuss it with my committee chair, and rearticulate my research purpose with greater specificity. My chair, Keifer-Boyd, was relieved that Nel had assisted in focusing the research question. The development of a doctoral research question cannot be forced or prescribed. Instead, the data collected answers a specific focus of inquiry and brings insight. So, with guidance from Nel and Keifer-Boyd, I formed my final question: *What art education curriculum and pedagogical experiences will emerge from exploring four key components of Nel Noddings's (1984) ethics of care (i.e., modeling, dialogue, practice, and confirmation) within a 17-day home-based feminist teaching art residency conceptualized with my 4- and 8-year-old children?* The guidance Nel offered is priceless. The dialogue generated during her questioning my purpose and research question was what I needed; I was blessed with the opportunity to learn from a profound educational ethicist who helped me to hear what I had resisted hearing.

**Connecting Care Ethics with Participatory Action Research Methodology**

Thus far, this chapter has drawn out the influences on Noddings’s ethics of care and exemplifies how her ethics of care work grounds my pedagogy and theory operational throughout the study. While much literature exists about care theory as discussed in Chapter 2, my reasoning for focusing on Noddings’s ethics of care is because of her progressive (in a Deweyian sense) ideology as a feminist educational approach to care ethics that includes motherhood and home. What is significant about this study is how I take up and apply Noddings’s ethics of care to the participatory nature of the research and data collection in the collaborative feminist teaching art residency I designed and implemented with my children.
Next, in Chapter 3, I elaborate on connections between care ethics and the participatory action research methodology employed in this study, which aims to identify emergent art curriculum and pedagogical experience through our residency.

Ethics of care aligns with the methodology of Participatory Action Research (PAR) through Noddings’s (2004) assertion that caring should be a foundation for ethical decision-making. As part of a PAR methodology, I consider care in a participatory approach to research (Pain et al., 2011). The visibility of care comes through Photovoice, the photographic framing of curriculum created by experiences initiated by my children, mutual interviewing, and daily journaling. The elements of Noddings's theory, upon which my study is based, maintain care as the root of character, which is grounded in humanistic connections and are subject to caring as their unifying bond. In more detail, in Chapter 3, I discuss the PAR methodology implemented in this study as the method of research and data collection most appropriate to embodying and enacting Noddings’s ideology of caring and human relationships.
Chapter 3 presents my participatory action research (PAR) methodology including how key components of Noddings’s ethics of care—modeling, dialogue, practice, and confirmation—guided my approach to teaching within the residency, data collection, family research entanglements, ethical implications and limitations, and analysis. I sought to create a caring and empowering environment through these ethics of care components by modeling respect, creating a dialogue of trust, practicing positive encouragement for my children, and fostering self-actualization and growth through confirmation. Not only do these four components guide my approach to teaching, but the ethics of care also aligns with PAR because of the respect, equality, and empowering nature PAR maintains as a methodology embracing a caring approach. The blending of PAR, exploratory design, and care components enables a democratic process of empowerment because it “involves incorporating opportunities for participants within a study to exercise choice and agency, building self-efficacy and confidence which could be expanded upon” (Pain et al., 2011, p. 2). PAR is a partnership through which my children and I worked together throughout our residency, complementing our feminist teaching art residency as a collaborative approach to research, education, and action (Pain et al., 2015). In short, PAR engages reflective practice and inquiry toward an action or change by participants in a collaborative approach with intention of change or improvement of the study.

PAR’s emancipatory approach focuses on the human experience and meanings created by individuals’ lived experience (MacDonald, 2012). PAR methodology aligns with my research problem statement and research question as well as with my feminist and progressive (in the
Deweyan\(^{19}\) sense) epistemological views of an inclusive environment. My goals for an inclusive learning environment are where all participants actively engage, hear each other, embrace agency, prioritize equity, and experience holistic processes of *learning by doing*. However, I understood and respected that non-participation as an individual participant's choice. No one in the study, Andrew, Cora, nor myself, were pushed into any action unless we agreed to participate. In this sense, PAR methodology was most appropriate for my generative living curriculum developed throughout the residency as PAR undoes hierarchy within a group, constituting a democratic, equitable, liberatory, and life-enhancing qualitative inquiry (Koch & Kralik, 2002). PAR is typically qualitative research with the purpose to understand or gain insights from inductive exploratory inquiry, rather than deductive quantitative study for statistically grounded probabilities. In PAR, each participant, as a researcher, encourages all participants to reveal feelings, views, and patterns without controlling or manipulating each other (MacDonald, 2012).

The rationale for employing a PAR research methodology is primarily because PAR invites collaboration and aligns well with care ethics. The invitation to my children to collaboratively develop curriculum provided opportunities for me to adopt and reflect on my pedagogical experiences from the lens of ethics of care key components. In Figure 22, Andrew, Cora, and I are depicted creating a concept map that organized and set the distinction between the research focus and the curriculum inquiry. Andrew and Cora decided upon the background photograph and the colors of the circles that identify individual processes during the collaboration in making this concept map. An engaging conversation transpired, and excitement

\(^{19}\) Deweyan relates to John Dewey works from (1887-1949) and his philosophy in education (Hildebrand, 2018).
grew, as we made decisions together about the trajectory of the residency. The partnership in developing the concept map proved to be an emergent experience and a marvelous communication builder for my children and me. The concept map distinguishes the roles my children and I took throughout the residency.

Figure 22.

Research map for our feminist teaching art residency

Note. My children and I created a plan for the relation between the research design and the teaching approach as a visual aid centering ethics of care.
Research Site: Site-Specificity of Home

The study site’s specificity of home is significant to my research as most of the study takes place at my home in the Northeast United States (see Figure 23). Our home has four bedrooms with a studio room for my children and me to make art. The residency site in total is 1.27 acres. The indoor and outdoor spaces of the property were the primary sites of engagement for my children’s lived experiences given the weather allowances of the summer months, July and August, during the residency. Included in my research is an inquiry into the significance of our home to our pedagogical experiences and the implications of its possible new meanings for us.

Figure 23.

Our Northeastern home, Dutch Lane

Note. A photograph of the residency’s site, our home, taken by Andrew as part of the Photovoice method.
Definitions of home and descriptions of our home within my study come from a place of happiness. I want to be transparent in my positioning: home is a place where I feel sovereignty, love, respect, and comfort. However, I recognize that many people might experience the opposite of my position, which is why it is critical for me to affirm and acknowledge my positionality of home in my writing. Home becomes the studio; home is integrated into the environment, providing a place where agency for my children transpire.

Noddings’s ethics of care—the theoretical framework guiding this study introduced in Chapter 2—is particularly appropriate to the study’s site specificity of our home as Noddings gives special emphasis to the home as a site for educational encounters. Indeed, she views the home as the primary educator and argues for the re-orientation of social policy to this end. The intention is not to sideline the role of schools but simply to recognize just what the home contributes to the development of children and young people (Lake, 2012). In Noddings’s (2002) view, every child should, first, “live in a home that has at least adequate material resources and attentive love; and second, that schools should include education for home life in their curriculum” (Noddings, 2002, para. 14). As I view my home as the primary educator for my children in this study of their curriculum as part of a feminist teaching art residency, I embrace these two tenets integral to Noddings’s ideology of the home as primary educator.

The decision to use our home for the study necessarily speaks to an understanding of how the pedagogical experiences and art-creating taking place in home spaces are transformative for the feminist teaching art residency and recasting the home as a site to create art. This idea of site-

---

20 Noddings’s stance on the re-orientation of the home as the primary educator aligns, for example, with components of the Build Back Better Act. The Act would make possible educational choice through financial assistance for parents to have safe and caring educational environments for their young children (Peterson, 2021).
specific was officially declared a contemporary art movement by architectural critic Catherine Howett in 1977 (theartists.org, 2020, p. 1). Site-specific art is “defined for a specific location; if removed from that location, it loses all or a substantial part of its meaning” (Tate.org, 2020, p. 1). For the purposes of this study, the site-specific experience means that the art produced in the feminist teaching art residency becomes integrated into the environment, the structural aspect, and the home itself. In the residency, everyday objects’ interactions and engagements transform into art encounters beginning with Andrew and Cora’s curiosity.

Interplaying home and the site-specific concept can take on simplicity but, also, complexity, jumbling collectively in a sculptural configuration. Take for example the work of Deirdre Colgan Jones, a Chicago-based contemporary site-specific artist. Colgan Jones creates new interactions with daily objects and cultivates an unconventionality in the objects new purpose (Figures 24-25). In other words, Colgan Jones grants a visibility to overlooked objects that may be of daily necessity. Colgan Jones is concerned with the idea of the “everyday void” or the glimpses of the infinite in everyday life; as a mother, “her investigations have been focused on the domestic realm” (Colgan Jones, 2020, p. 1). Of her own work, Colgan Jones (2020) remarks:

My work as an artist is to question the everyday realities and discarding, we take for granted and to bring awareness of that to other people. Conceptually based, my work explores “Neglected Space,” the space in-between object and form. The accumulation of ordinary household detritus comprises my primary material. Trained as an architect and an artist, my installations and objects are grounded within architectural theory and materiality yet seek to challenge the boundaries of traditional practice (p. 1).
In essence, the interplay of art and home as site-specific in her art offers insight into items engaged with every day in ways that push understandings of the boundaries and potential of the home and everyday realities. Produced during the isolation of the COVID-19 pandemic, Colgan Jones’s recent work portrays home in conjunction with the outside world, creating a meaningful transition with her art. She employs plastic vessels related to household essentials, converting them into symmetrical markers, punctuating the passage from outside to inside (Colgan Jones, 2020). Colgan Jones’s exemplification of the concept of site-specific points to opportunities my children and I had to fuse the inside and outside worlds. The interplay of our own home as site-specific art is, like Colgan Jones’s, both simple and complex; it is simple because it is natural for us to be home and learn about and within that space, and it is complex...
because as our art and pedagogical experiences emerge at home, the home takes on new meanings at the nexus of life, art, objects, and curriculum.

Research Participants

The research participants (Figure 26) include my two children, ages eight and four, and myself, age 39. The PAR methodology positioned all three of us as researchers and study participants in that we engaged in collaborative methods of data collection. My children are vital to this inquiry in that they participated with me in remodeling our home into a feminist teaching art residency. The remodeling of our home as a residency provided an exploration of different spaces throughout our home as a new place to learn and discover. The use of cameras as a data collection method of Photovoice provided insight into our home from a different view, seeing the three of us engage in a still frame from a new method. Further, the residency created a newness to our home, as we referenced our home as Dutch Lane Residency, versus the typical phrase of home or house.

Figure 26.

A photograph of the participants in the residency, Andrew, Me (Zena), and Cora.

Note. My children and I took a group selfie on our first day of the art residency to document the participants/collaborators in the study.
Positioning Myself in Research: Entangling Mother and Researcher

Motherhood is the most meaningful part of my life. Significantly contributing to my positive experiences in motherhood is the support of my husband, Luke. Not only are Luke and I the best of friends, but we built our home together and share the same feminist parenting values to cultivate a positive environment for our children. Luke’s unending support in facilitating the residency at our home has helped to make my research possible. We support each other and our passions, and this intense loving teamwork has made my doctoral journey possible amidst many challenges and sacrifices along the way. My feminist beliefs impact my parenting in a way that as “feminist mothering, affords women power and enables [me] to affect the societal changes [I] seek for [myself], [my] children, and the world at large” (Oke, 2017, p. 1). Including my children as an intrinsic part of the research and creative experience makes my heart full. My children contributed fruitful data to my research and had a voice in the research. In this way, we maintain feminist practices of “establishing a relationship of mutuality between researcher and subject of research through self-revelation and emotional support [to] produce […] better data and richer understanding (Sprague & Kobrynowicz, 2006, p. 32). My duality as insider-researcher and mother is an often-neglected entanglement that brings uncomfortableness to scholarship. Throughout my research, I work to make the dichotomy of insider-researcher comfortable in modeling care through teaching and offering guidance only if needed and requested by Andrew and Cora (see Figure 27). The mother-researcher role is difficult, but as with anything else, regular self-reflexivity guides the research. In the following section, I describe these intermingling positions of mother-researcher and teacher and consider the importance and effect of reflexivity and outsider expertise to this exploratory study.
Note. Using the method of Photovoice, Cora photographed an encounter where I (Cora’s mother) guided Andrew (Cora’s brother), helping him with writing a word he was having trouble writing.

Unpacking Important Connections Between Insider Research, Reflexivity, and Outside Expert Insight

Researching from the inside without an escape can be both challenging and rewarding. Although insider research is new to me, it is not a new phenomenon, and many accounts testify that it is not as straightforward as it might present on the surface. Resolving the issues of insider research is especially important since the researcher does not simply walk away from their fieldwork at the end of the study (Rowberry, 2015, p. 37). Knowing that I cannot walk away from my site of study at the end of the day means that the escape to “me” time might not be available. To provide validity and accountability, since I will be so close to the study, Marissa McClure Sweeney graciously served as an expert consultant. The term/title “expert consultant” is
used intentionally to differentiate Marissa’s role from that as member checking, a term often used in qualitative research. Member checking, also known as participant or respondent validation, is a technique for exploring the credibility of results: “Data or results are returned to participants to check for accuracy and resonance with their experiences. Member checking is often mentioned as one in a list of validation techniques” (Birt et al., 2016, p. 1802). However, my intention in working with Marissa was not to check for accuracy but rather to gain her insights given we share feminist perspectives as well as age, motherhood, White privilege, and our research focuses on young children. Marissa brought validity and accountability to my study helping me to recognize my biases, filters, and influence from being deeply inside the research as mother to young children who, along with me, generated data both as documentation and reflections.

A unique contribution to qualitative research methodologies from my study in inviting McClure Sweeny is how her role as expert consultant became more of a feminist collaboration. The novel approach of McClure Sweeny’s insights from her independently reviewing my reflective journal entries and photos from my children and me; and then sharing with me her analysis as we conversed about her insights, which supported, extended to other theoretical frameworks and lenses, and at times differed from my analysis, is a type of collaboration based in feminist principles in supporting knowledge through an intersectional approach of empowerment, accountability, and inclusiveness (Onufer & Munoz Rojas, 2019). In researching literature on feminist research methodologies, particularly by feminist authors Patricia Leavy, Contemporary Feminist Research from Theory to Practice, I discovered that McClure Sweeny and I adopted additional feminist principles. For example, we epistemologically respected each other in our mutual understanding bringing an equalness of validity in analyzing the data. Further, from an ontological standpoint and position, we brought separate ideas in
examining the data; however, we respected each other in that space (Leavy & Harris, 2019). As McClure Sweeney and I both identify as feminists, and we share similar motherhood, womanhood, scholarship, and life positions, our rapport and dialogue about our lived experiences contributed heavily to our collaborative approach to discussing our data analysis, individually and then together with in this study, which will contribute to feminist research.

McClure Sweeney is a feminist, artist, educator, and researcher interested in post developmental theories of children’s art, community-based art education, feminist new materialist theory, and curriculum inquiry and design. At the time of the study, she was an Assistant Chair of the Department of Art and Design, Associate Professor of Art Education and Women’s and Gender Studies Affiliate Faculty at Indiana University of Pennsylvania (M. Sweeney McClure, 2021). As expert consultant to this study, McClure Sweeney’s role was to give feedback on my narrative vignettes I shared with her via Google® drive. McClure Sweeney reviewed and critiqued my analytic narratives after the 17-day residency. The shared Google® drive permitted a secure location for McClure Sweeney to share her mothering and early childhood art education insights.

My connection to McClure Sweeney comes from an opportunity I had to meet her after she was invited by the Graduate Art Education Association (GAEEdA) at Penn State to give a presentation on graduates’ current positions and experiences (see Figure 28). McClure Sweeney shared valuable insight into her professional and personal life. After listening to her talk, I was excited about and inspired by our commonalities as artists, educators, researchers, and mothers. McClure Sweeney’s involvement in the study as an expert consultant is valuable in that she not only layers on another level of knowledge and expertise, but she also engages with me and the research in a participatory way that challenges my perspectives and insider biases I brought to
the study. Further, the innovative aspect of inviting an art educator who is an expert in early childhood art education to a working dissertation contributed much to value of my study to educational studies and beyond in terms of relationality and the feminist practices of mentoring and valuing collaborative knowledge production experiences.

Figure 28.

McClure Sweeny teaching children art

Note. McClure Sweeny was an expert consultant in the study and a source of valuable feedback to my analysis of my reflective journaled narratives and Photovoice data.

A myriad of meetings transpired between McClure Sweeny and me as she generously offered her time to work alongside me through all the data examination. She assisted in distinguishing the emergent themes of mothering/educating, identity/self-awakening, negotiated emergent curriculum, and anti-childism. McClure Sweeny and I corresponded through Zoom®,
email, shared Google® drive, and messenger. I shared my daily journal entries with McClure Sweeny via a secured Google® drive so that she could read and analyze the entries. I identified the themes that I discerned in interpreting the data before McClure Sweeny shared her analysis. I wanted the data interpretation to be from two diverse viewpoints in which we could cohesively discover nuances within the broad themes of the study’s theoretical frame.

**Family Research Entanglements: Ethical Implications and Limitations**

Researching with children can bring about many limitations and shortcomings and being flexible and open-minded was crucial as the researcher. Andrew and Cora volunteered to participate in the study, and they knew they could leave the study at any time. If they did not want to participate on a given day, they knew that was okay. I asked them daily if they still wanted to be part of the study, and if they did not want to participate for that day, I would individually create art.

Another limitation is the critical reflection of my daily reflexivity and vulnerability, visible through the data methods of photography, interviewing, and journaling. Inquiries with my children about their day led to harsh realities that I usually would not engage with daily. For example, in Figure 29, the photograph Andrew captured points to when I would lose my patience. I was in the middle of trying to read and Cora would interrupt, and it was taking forever to finish one paragraph. However, visually identifying my documentation as a mother and researcher is vital in understanding the focus of the research, and in analyzing my pedagogy applying the four key components in ethics of care. Documented in my reflections is discussion of the daily occurrences and limitations I encountered during the residency. As a researcher, I
knew that there would be unpleasant encounters with my children and their self-produced data even though I am their mother.

Figure 29.

*Me losing my patience while reading a book on Bigfoot*

Note: Andrew captured this photograph while I was reading and losing my patience with Cora.

Ethical Consent and Concerns

Prior to beginning research, I received approval from the Office for Research Protections\(^{21}\) at Penn State (see Appendix C), which reviewed my proposed study with my children according to the Institutional Review Board (IRB) protections. The consent process with my children is in accordance with IRB guidelines that protect children’s rights as research subjects (Freeman & Mathison, 2009). In addition to securing approval from Penn State, as

\(^{21}\) https://www.research.psu.edu/irb/faq/informed-consent
parents we, my husband Luke and I, discussed in great length the ethical considerations of having my children as collaborators in the residency. Luke was available at any time during the residency if the children needed him during those residency hours. Finally, after discussing risk—another ethical consideration for human subjects—my husband and I agreed that the risks of researching with my children were minimal.

Research involving children is controversial and challenging (MacDonald, 2012), especially if you are researching with your own children. However, my PAR methodology encouraged my children’s voices to be heard and prioritized their active roles as collaborators. In this way, we established trust and mutual respect and I entered the research environment as a participating adult who was sensitive, empathetic, and caring. In this way, our research relationship was based on trust and mutual respect which upholds the ethical imperatives when working with children (MacDonald, 2012).

**Participatory Action Research Design: Data Collection**

Data collection occurred between July 13 to August 15, 2021. The residency only took place Monday through Friday for a total of 17-days from morning until dinner time and did not extend past that timeframe. In creating the residency period and daily timeframes, I adhered to the protocols in which other established residencies used to decide working hours. The average family artist residency duration was one month (see Appendix A), but when my children wanted to stop, we democratically decided to stop together, and our residency became 17-days. The scope of data collection involves methods of Photovoice, daily journaling, and interviews. In what follows, I detail each data collection method.
Photovoice

One of the primary methods of data collection was Photovoice, which captures my children's positions in the residency. Photovoice is an approach that embodies the belief that “everybody should have the opportunity to represent themselves and tell their own story” (Photovoice.org, 2020, p. 1). The units of data collected through Photovoice are photographs. The photograph data provides insight into the cohesion of agency, lived experiences, site of the research, an emergent curriculum, motherhood, childhood, feminism, and art—a combination often omitted in scholarship, education, art, and research.

Photovoice as a method was used by my children and me to record our life collaboratively for the study, when they first received their cameras after learning of Photovoice, the excitement was too much to contain (Figures 30-31). Through this method, we display happiness, artmaking, learning, and vulnerability that rose through the emergent curriculum. Together, the photograph data and the later discussion of the data concerning our experience of the residency provide testimony to the difficulties in the contemporary representation of feminist motherhood (Latz, 2017). Although vulnerability presents itself in any situation, in this research, vulnerability is documented through the method of Photovoice and represented in a still image capturing the highs and lows of researching with one another.
Figures 30-31.

Left: *Cora excited about her new camera*  
Right: *Andrew amazed at the new camera used for the method of Photovoice*

*Note:* I had previously explained what Photovoice as a method of documenting their views of the residency, in these above images you can see the excitement of receiving their cameras.

I have an extensive background in photography, with years of art school and teaching advanced placement photography. The Brazilian educational philosopher and theorist Paulo Freire (1970) originally inspired Photovoice methods as Photovoice builds on Freire’s prioritization of participants’ collective production of and reflection on knowledge (Latz, 2017). As part of my children’s curriculum inquiry within the study, Photovoice was the main method to collect data through my and my children’s eyes, while reflecting our experiences of an ethics of care (in)formed by emergent interdisciplinary encounters through artmaking. Procedurally, “Photovoice can be distilled down to eight steps: identification, invitation, education, documentation, narration, ideation, presentation, and confirmation” (Latz, 2017, p. 4). Putting the camera into the participants’ hands helps them document, reflect upon, and communicate
(Budig et al., 2018), while creating ownership for them in their learning and a voice in producing their curriculum. From an ethics of care perspective, Photovoice is dialogic.

I consider Photovoice as a method that brings visibility of care as my children’s voices are heard through their photographic data collection; after all, as the adage goes, a picture is worth a thousand words.22 Putting the cameras in my children’s hands created ownership for them in the research and exemplifies an affirmation of the four components of the ethics of care theory (Figures 32-33). My Photovoice documentation will be important data as well as later discussion will consider the ways in which both my and my children’s Photovoice data interact, challenge, and enrich the other.

Figures 32-33.

Left: Cora testing out her new camera
Right: Andrew exploring with his camera outside

Note: They both were glued to seeing the image on the display screen and looking ahead of the camera and connecting the images together, creating their own ownership of the image.

22 “A picture is worth a thousand words” is an English language adage meaning that complex and sometimes multiple ideas can be conveyed by a single still image, which conveys its meaning or essence more effectively than a mere verbal description” (dictionary.com, 2020, p. 1).
Daily Journaling

My children and I practiced daily journaling to reflect on our residency as a communicative act of the daily lived experiences of learning and artmaking (see Figures 34-36). Journaling as a method of data collection, ultimately, is a “way of getting feedback from ourselves, and in so doing, it enables us to experience a full and open-ended way, the movement of our lives as a whole and the meaning that follows from reflecting on that moment” (Janesick, 1998, p. 5). Journaling provides feedback opportunities for the researcher and participants and was an interactive tool of communication for my children and me. The journaling data is not limited to alphabetic text, as there was no restraint to any form of reflection, which aligns with my educational philosophy. I believe that art is language; therefore, our journaling included illustrations with contextual and embodied meanings all their own inaccessible by merely alphabetic text alone. The organization of journal dates arranged chronologically afforded a lucidity in my dissertation writing. The precise dating of the journal entries collected also enabled my children and I to discuss interactions and document our reflections, which became part of the data collected. Also, the clarity of the precise date made it easier to discuss possible encounters that my children and I could reflect upon from the 17-day residency.
Figures 34-36.

Left: Cora journaling   Middle: Andrew journaling   Right: The front covers of our journals

Note: Working in their journals and an image of all three of our journals that we decorated together.

Interviews

A third method of collecting data was the utilization of communal verbal interviews among my children and me. My children’s emergent curriculum designed our feminist teaching art residency. Therefore, interview questions or expectations were both impossible to plan and structure given doing so would contradict the goals of an emergent and exploratory feminist study. During communal interviews, I had to make sure I didn’t ask questions that were too similar; rather, I mixed up my question-asking in ways that reflected the spontaneous nature of our daily experiences. For example, on some days, my children and I asked each other many questions throughout the day of the residency, but on other days, we wouldn’t ask each other any formal interview questions and just communicated through questions that emerged organically. As far as formal interviews throughout the residency, Figure 37 depicts the record-keeping method of the only organized sit-down interview during the residency. The reasoning for only having one formal interview is because Andrew and Cora shared that they would prefer to speak
organically throughout our residency days. I am grateful for their decision not to proceed throughout the 17 days with the formal interview process, as I feel the multifarious unprescribed dialogue, ultimately generated was a much more in-depth exchange between the three of us. The organic approach to interviewing aligned better with the emergent aspect of our residency design, not following rigidness, but guidance from each of the participants instead.

**Figure 37.**

*Image of interview folder*

![Image of interview folder](image.png)

*Note:* The image displays how the interviews were organized and labeled every day, so that when data analysis occurred, I was well prepared and organized.

**Data Organization**

As previously mentioned, the emergent nature of the curriculum and study design meant that I had to attend to data organization responsively and creatively in ways most appropriate to how data was organically produced and collected. Accordingly, data was organized daily, that is, data collected by each participant on each day of the 17-day residency was systematically saved and recorded through a digital filing system. Each participant had their own file folder collection and within that collection were file folders for each day of the residency labeled as such (Figures 38-39). Thus, my daily logging process ensured there was no data confusion; for example, I
uploaded Cora's data first, Andrew's second, and lastly, mine into their appropriate folder labeled by our names.

The means to assure accuracy was extremely time-consuming. I would spend a minimum of two hours nightly arranging and uploading data after Andrew and Cora's bedtime so that I would have no distraction and could complete data recording with my undivided attention. Even though the process was demanding of my time, I worked vigilantly every day, recognizing that the process would be cohesive and more efficient in delineating and understanding when it came time to interpret the data after the residency concluded.

**Figures 38-39.**

*Image of daily organized folder for data collection and a collective image of all the folders*

*Note: The image captures Andrew’s folders of each day in the residency. Right: The image shows the folders I would put data into and how they were organized.*

**Color-Coding Ethics of Care**

In examining each day's data, I implemented an approach based on analyzing qualitative data, called thematic analysis. Generally, thematic analysis is practiced with specific texts, such as interview transcripts, field notes, and journaling in research. First, the researcher closely examines the data to distinguish common themes—topics, ideas, and patterns of meaning that
repeat (Caulfield, 2021). In reading about thematic analysis, I further learned about an inductive approach to thematic analysis of patterns and layers, and how an “inductive approach involves allowing the data to determine your themes” (Caulfield, 2021, para. 6).

Throughout the residency, I stayed close to my research question, *What art education curriculum and pedagogical experiences will emerge from exploring four key components of Nel Noddings's (1984) ethics of care (i.e., modeling, dialogue, practice, and confirmation) within a 17-day home-based feminist teaching art residency conceptualized with my 4- and 8-year-old children?* Hence, applying Noddings's four key components as guidance created the lens of an ethics of care that focused the data collected and analysis from the 17-days of the art residency. In my approach to visually seeing each component of the theoretical lens of care ethics, I colored-coded the four key components by highlighting according to the first available colors in the Microsoft® drop-down tool (see Figures 40-41).

**Figures 40-41.**

**Left:** *Four key components folders of coding of ethics of care*

**Right:** *Ethics of care components in moral education color-coded*

_Note: Each day the data was categorized and organized by the ethics of care components. Right: Color-coded data of the four key components as an example._
Inductive Thematic Analysis and Emergent Themes

Once I completed the method of color-coding the theoretical frame of ethics of care to guide the data analysis, I then applied the inductive thematic analysis method to discover subsequent emergent themes. Taken together, the overarching theoretical framework and purpose of the study guided the analysis of the four key components; afterwards, the inductive approach enabled McClure Sweeny and me to discover emergent themes strongly linked to theoretical themes of an ethics of care (Caulfield, 2021). The process included working together through a shared folder that created layers and patterns back and forth with each other of themes that we both saw and how they relate together (see Figure 42). Most of the themes emerged more through the method of Photovoice than the daily journaling, which I explore in depth in the following chapter. The themes that emerged from my inductive thematic coding, the first layer of analysis was:

- mothering/educating
- emergent curriculum
- identity
- self-awakening

McClure Sweeny’s insight in giving me her feedback from an expert positioning in childhood education and mothering contributed these additional themes within my study, which some overlapped from my emergent data coding categories:

- mothering
- negotiated curriculum
• anti-childism

Applying an inductive analysis approach allowed the themes of mothering/educating, identity, self-awakening, negotiated curriculum, and anti-childism to emerge from the data, see Figure 42.

**Figure 42.**

*Images from shared Google® folder of McClure Sweeny and I collaborating and sharing our themes from the ethics of care theoretical frame and inductive coding*

Note: A working list of the themes that emerged in analyzing the data and coding the data to triangulate analysis with input from expert consultant, McClure Sweeny and myself.

In the next chapter, I discuss these thematic foundational and emergent findings according to Noddings’s four components of an ethics of care. Throughout the discussion of findings, I consider McClure Sweeny’s outside expert perspective, which enriched the data analysis by enlarging my understanding of curriculum theories and awareness of anti-childism theory in my teaching. Perhaps most salient in the subsequent chapter is the

---

23 The word: anti-childism is explained in the subsequent chapter; but, briefly, anti-childism is teaching children to do as you do, not as you say, bypassing the forcing of affection or interaction, and lastly, validating a child’s beliefs and emotions. Anti-childism is to treat children as adults and do not dismiss and exclude them merely for their age.
ways in which the findings challenge my own understandings of care and how it might manifest in pedagogy as care often crops up unexpectedly or demands something new of me when learning and experiencing the emergent curriculum with my children.
CHAPTER 4
ANALYSIS: CARE AND ITS EMERGENCE IN THE RESIDENCY

This chapter comprises the analysis from both the initial color coding of the four key components of an ethics of care and the inductive thematic analysis method McClure Sweeny and I independently and collaboratively employed to examine the exploratory participatory action research data. The data responds to my research question: *What art education curriculum and pedagogical experiences will emerge from exploring four key components of Nel Noddings's (1984) ethics of care (i.e., modeling, dialogue, practice, and confirmation) within a 17-day home-based feminist teaching art residency conceptualized with my 4- and 8-year-old children?* My analysis is of the four major categories of the key components of the theoretical framework of my study, an ethics of care as modeling, dialogue, practice, and confirmation while fusing the four emergent inductive themes to the foundational themes.

This chapter presents my analysis through the thematic categories that emerged rather than the chronological ordering of the residency. As a guide, I illustrate my analysis of the four foundational theoretical themes of ethics of care with each theme having the days in which the theme occurred; nonetheless, I am not presenting my data through days, rather themes as they materialized in the data coding. At the end of each ethics of care narrative are subcategories of the thematic emergent themes discovered in the data coding that relates to the foundational theme. To convey how I organized my analysis of data analysis, I made a graphic narrative (see Figure 43) of the foundational themes (left) and the thematic emergent themes (right) and where they are situated within...
the narratives of Chapter 4. At the bottom of Figure 43, I listed the foundational themes with the subcategories and the order in which they are presented in each themed narrative.

**Figure 43.**

*Graphic narrative of themes presented in the findings and days themes occurred along with the subcategories of the emergent themes*

**Note:** I developed the graphic narrative as a visual aid consisting of the foundational themes and the subcategories of the emergent themes presented in Chapter 4.

Accompanying and illustrating these themes are photographs that captured the 17-day residency within each theme narrative in Chapter 4 as visual guidance for understanding the Photovoice method and the written analysis. In addition, the photographs portray the voices of the three participants—my two children and I—through still-frame glimpses of our residency journey together at our home, Dutch Lane.
Finally, as a guide for the narrative themes in Chapter 4, I created a graphic chronology of the residency (see Figure 44) to provide contexts concerning the foundational theoretical themes of an ethics of care: modeling, dialogue, practice, and confirmation and the inductive thematic emergent themes of mothering/educator, identity, emergent negotiated curriculum, and anti-childism. In the subsequent sections, I examine the four key components of an ethics of care as themes with subcategories of the inductive thematic emergent themes correlating to the foundational themes. My logic for illustrating my data analysis through the themes versus the day-to-day occurrences of the 17-days is how I witnessed the emergence of the foundational themes of an ethics of care and the emergent themes connecting during data inquiry.
Note: The graphic map offers a chronological order of the activities, themes, and characteristics of an ethics of care daily during the residency.

Analysis: Emergent Data Codes and Themes

The theoretical frame that both McClure Sweeny and I used to guide analysis of the collected data were the four key components in ethics of care: modeling, dialogue, practice, and confirmation. In Figure 45, McClure Sweeny perceives her role as one angle of triangulation, a common qualitative research practice to triangulate data. Besides myself, as one angle of triangulation, and Noddings’s theory as another angle, McClure Sweeny, as an expert consultant in her role in the study, is the third triangulation angle of...
the triangulation important to my analysis process. Triangulation, common in qualitative research, integrates Noddings’s theory with the emergent themes discovered by McClure Sweeney and myself in the research study. The importance also ensures that fundamental biases arising from using a single method or a single observer are overcome. The analysis of the themes was not influenced by McClure Sweeney as we independently analyzed the data and then discussed what we saw emerge. McClure Sweeney did not persuade me to include divergent themes that she identified. However, her expertise as part of triangulation of data analysis did influence me to review literature on negotiated curriculum and anti-childism to reconsider emergent themes I had not recognized during my initial independent analysis.

**Figure 45.**

*Shared Google®/Messenger folder communication between McClure Sweeney and I in coding data together*

*Note:* Images taken from shared Google®/Messenger folder where McClure Sweeney and I communicated back and forth in coding data of themes.

During the inductive coding of the data and sorting through the patterns and layers of photographs, journal entries, and interviews, four additional and emergent themes developed during analysis which act as a subcategory to the foundational themes of an ethics of care: modeling, dialogue, practice, and confirmation. The data sorting was
exciting as I anxiously waited to see what coding system and themes McClure Sweeny would analyze and derive compared to my data coding and emergent themes that I experienced. As a result, perhaps because of our similar educational backgrounds at Penn State’s Art Education Program and interests, McClure Sweeny and I employed similar terminology independent of the other to categorize the inductive thematic emergent themes: mothering/educator, identity, negotiated emergent curriculum, and anti-childism. In what follows within the narrative of each foundational theme of an ethics of care are the subcategories of the emergent themes that connect.

Modeling Care, a Component of Noddings’s Ethics of Care

In the duality of a mother and researcher in this study, I expected modeling care would come naturally to me in caring for my children. However, in analyzing the data, I discovered modeling of care from the perspective of my children in ways I had not previously recognized. For example, Figure 46 captures Cora’s voice and her perspective with a photograph she took of me in the garden teaching Andrew how to care for the garden, a practice we engaged in for much of the residency. However, in further reviewing the photograph, I realized that I was modeling the importance of healthy eating through the cycle of growing a garden from seed to plant to food preparation, and then to eating. Also, as their mother, I taught crucial knowledge applicable in the present and their future life toward good health.
Cora captured how modeling care with growing cycles and healthy eating is a blueprint for making sustainable decisions to grow an organic garden and live a healthy life. The site of our garden became a frequently visited location throughout the residency site. Additionally, concerning Figure 46, McClure Sweeny states, “I reflected upon how central the garden is to your experience. You are all learning with the garden” (McClure Sweeny, 2021, p. 1). In her analysis McClure Sweeny exposed how we learned with the garden versus about the garden. It’s constant materialization in the data demonstrating how the garden acted as a learning hub during the residency and as an entanglement of self to nature that generated sensory learning.

Linking the garden in the image above to the method of Photovoice, I listened to Cora’s voice, explanation, and perspective of the image. Her curation of the photograph

Figure 46.
Photograph taken by Cora

Note: Photograph of me teaching Andrew about tomatoes and the health properties of tomatoes in our garden on our back deck.
was, “Mama and Andrew were thinking of healthy ‘some-a-getti’ (aka spaghetti) to make for dinner to be healthy, but I will eat it all.” Besides the growing of tomatoes in numerous varieties, our garden also has a bounty of herbs which served as the subject of much learning and discussion with Andrew in this moment. As Cora notes, I took the time to explain to Andrew the importance of the entire garden and what each herb smelt like, and we sniffed and felt the herb and talked about what I use the herb for in the foods we eat as a family. During this time, Andrew realized that he enjoyed the aroma and flavor of basil; he could not refrain from eating the rich green fresh basil leaves. His basil-eating habits inspired the nickname I gave him throughout the residency, basil rabbit. My descriptive words about the garden photograph invited McClure Sweeny to reflect, stating:

I think here, too, about how enveloping the experience of the garden is: Especially the olfactory experience of the herb garden. Just imagining what you all experienced through seeing your photos of the garden; they intersect in my mind with your description of the very hot summer and how fragrant that experience must have been, too! (M. McClure Sweeny, personal communication, October 29, 2021)

I am thankful for selecting the method of Photovoice to hear the voices of Cora and Andrew as they experienced the residency.

In the waves of emotion as a mother of not feeling good enough at times, the residency adventure, as research, gave teaching time to my children and emotional time for me. I had that precious time not typically experienced together to explain the garden to my son and the qualities of each of the herbs and tomatoes for us and our bodies. I had
been studying and learning non-stop in a world of academia, which had not allowed freedom of being fully bodily and mentally present for my children.

As a mother, I seldom observe the special moments between my children and me as a camera does not accompany our everyday interactions. However, time to photograph was possible and purposeful during the residency through Photovoice, marking a distinction between the residency and our everyday life. The camera became one of us, capturing our experiences together as an additional body appendage—offering growth of a distinctly new phase in our relationship, a discussion, and understanding of the photographs captured, making each of our voices heard. McClure Sweeny noticed as well that “Photovoice became an agent in the research” (M. McClure Sweeny, personal communication, October 29, 2021). The 17-day residency removed me from three years of the daily grind of graduate school life, in being present with my children and hearing their perspectives of life they see daily as no other commitments were required of me, except to be present in my research of the feminist teaching art residency.

The moment captured in Figure 47 transpired after our learning about the garden as we were engaged in a reflective recollection art activity, part of the curriculum that emerged from Andrew and Cora’s interests. Our first artmaking together evolved into drawing and painting the garden and pill bugs we watched as each traveled throughout the mushroom soil collecting decomposed leaves. The three of us started by sketching and then painting from the guidance of the pencil marks. Andrew could not be limited to those lines, which at this moment, he began to cry and became frustrated then wandered into the living room of our home to decompress on the floor, as shown in Figure 47.
Figure 47.

Andrew handling his emotions on the living room floor

*Note:* Andrew was expressing in this moment his dislike for structure and lines in art that he wanted to draw outside the lines.

Following this moment, shown below in Figure 48, is the embrace I shared with Andrew. Important is an excerpt I wrote about Andrew’s frustration:

at the point in our residency today when Andrew had a breakdown over the lines and drawings, I calmly expressed my lived experiences and offered for that to sink in, when the time was right for him he took the understanding that lines mean nothing in art, working outside the line is okay (Z. Tredinnick-Kirby, journal excerpt, July 13, 2021).
Figure 48.

*Cora Photovoice image*

Note: Me embracing Andrew during a time he was frustrated while making art.

When Cora examined this photograph she took, she reacted by declaring, “Mama, you made Andrew stop crying and made him feel better. You are a great Mama” (Cora, Photovoice, 2:44). Listening to those sweet words of support from her observation of me modeling the care I have for Andrew and his emotions gives me joy in knowing that she grasps the love I have for her and Andrew. Importantly, my feminist lens of an ethics of care suggests that we might understand Cora’s support as relational reciprocity—that is, Cora modeled care to me in letting me know that she noticed the care I gave her brother. In short, Cora’s relational reciprocity of care saw care modeled and in turn made me feel her care for me. Photovoice offered the opportunity to see Cora’s interpretation of Figure 48 in both visual and verbal ways. In this image, I encouraged and embraced Andrew
During a challenging time as he displayed his dislike of line structure in art, McClure Sweeny (2021) further analyzed this image, saying:

This is a truly remarkable occurrence and expands upon one of the primary themes that I saw in your residency: That of “being with” rather than fixing, analyzing, representing, etc. You are simply being with your children and holding space for these challenging moments.

McClure Sweeny extends her analysis of my “being-with” remarking that being with my children is not “simple” because speaking from her experience as a mother and professional in early childhood education, in practice “being-with children” is anything but simple because of the intensity of pressures toward optimization placed upon mothers and educators (M. McClure Sweeny, personal communication, November 1, 2021).

During the coding process with McClure Sweeny, she shared with me about an ethics of resistance forming within the data. That resistance formed within the data recognized my feminist pedagogy of the non-hierarchal moments with my children and the agency made visible. McClure Sweeny states that within Figure 48 of “mothering” and “educating” I enact an ethics of resistance toward those limiting narratives (McClure Sweeny, 2021). Feminist pedagogy is the resistance toward limiting those narratives and roles. McClure Sweeny further explains and raises critical questions as she interprets Figure 48:

Could the moments you experienced with your son and his vulnerability even be experienced in a classroom, would students feel comfortable enough to explore that space and be honest and reveal themselves in the similar ways your children did in your study? (M. McClure Sweeny, personal communication, October 6, 2021)
In response to McClure Sweeny’s thoughts, I hold that following the residency experience, which created a compelling space that produced equity of artistic expression and self, a similar experience could exist in a comparable environment. If applied to school-based settings, I contend that pedagogical approaches characterizing the residency might similarly unveil students’ vulnerability and generate interactions like those I shared with my son and daughter. Complicating this potential, however, are no touch policies and distancing policies some schools adopt which limit the kind of touch-based modeling of care I experienced with my children. Still, school-based educators can practice a kind of being-with children that models care through words and actions. My modeling of care and being-with might have been mostly one of touch and hugs, but the experience of inviting self-exploration, vulnerability, and equity between my children and I challenge the hierarchal and inexpressive setting of a teacher-led classroom of instruction and observation.

Starting below are the subcategories consist of the thematic emergent themes developed during the data coding: mothering/educator, identity, negotiated emergent curriculum, and anti-childism that correlate to the foundational themes of an ethics of care: modeling, dialogue, practice, and confirmation. Each foundational theme has a subcategory; however, some have more than one as the data overlapped within mutual ethics of care themes.

**Modeling: Mothering and Educator**

Of all these themes that emerged within the inductive thematic discovery of the research data, mothering and educator are the most profound, from a personal growth
standpoint. In writing my proposal, I identified the preconceived thoughts I believed would be documented through Photovoice and would show vulnerability in seeing myself differently. Nevertheless, depicted in Figures 49-50 of our visit to the ocean, my son, Andrew, guided the growth I needed as a mother. During our visit to the ocean, I insisted that Andrew wear his floatation vest, as he has done since he was little, but Andrew’s response to me made me look at myself and my own vulnerability in a new way. The interaction between us changed my life when Andrew mentioned to me:

Mama, you got to trust me, you have let me not wear the vest and show you that I can. You and Papa have shown me what to do if a wave takes me under. You have to let me show you. (Z. Tredinnick-Kirby, journal excerpt, August 5, 2021)

I literally felt like a giant octopus was laying on my chest, I was unable to move with the pressure of fear and anxiety overcoming my body as I watched him enter the ocean without the vest. My journaling excerpt below only begins to hint at the raw emotions I felt as Andrew told me to trust him:

I literally sat there and cried, I teared up because in that moment and reflecting quickly on all I have learned throughout this residency of the components of care ethics, this moment is where it could be applied to the most. Without hesitation, I hugged him and said, “yes, Andrew you are right, you know from what we have taught you, you have seen what Papa does in the ocean, and you know I am right here if you need me.” That is all it took, my son coming to me and telling me he is ready for the next step. I needed to trust him. This fear of the beach that I was instilling on him is not fair, not fair to him or Cora. I literally let it go, I threw my fear up and sent it out to sea. In the one photograph I captured, Andrew is turning
around and giving a thumbs up, this gesture to me was, I am alright, Mama, you are going to be alright…I got this! The smiles from him during this time were gigantic, he couldn’t stop smiling, knowing that he had control over his actions. He let his voice be heard of what he felt was right for him. The last two hours of our beach visit was the most enjoyable experience of watching the freedom of entangling himself and my daughter into the sea water. Letting the waves direct them with the biggest accomplished smiles walking out of the waters. They did it, they taught me. Applying the direction from my children to my life is crucial, listening to them, learning from them. My son came to me and asked of a new way to learn, which prompted my research to only discover through the research of our residency that the application of care ethics to art, to place, to site is a beautiful relationship. The cohesion of this all is sometimes too much to understand, is this real life? (Z. Tredinnick-Kirby, journal excerpt, August 5, 2021)

Figures 49-50.

*Images of wearing the vest and not wearing the vest in the ocean*

*Note:* The images of the transition of vest wearing to the freedom of no vest during the residency.
I am weakened by the fear that overcomes my body when thinking about entering the unknown salt waters of the ocean. I cannot stand the fear I have for the ocean, and I am not a parent that shows fear to my children, but the ocean is an entirely different entity as my fear of it controls me. Although I do not fear much in my life, if anything at all besides the ocean, and I live life without any regret and never miss an opportunity, the lyrics to a great song come to mind in thinking about that fear of the ocean: “that what you fear the most, could meet you halfway” (Pearl Jam, Crazy Mary, 1993).

The reason for choosing a day away from the art residency’s site-specificity was to celebrate my husband’s birthday. The experience mentioned above will eternally be a life-changing event as my son invigorated me to an unprecedented mental and bodily experience. Besides the theme of mothering/educator being the most powerful in transforming me as a human being and mother, the expression on Andrew’s face in Figure 51 says it all, with the positioning of his thumb upward, saying, “chill out, Mama, I got this.” At that instant, Andrew turned to me and gazed at me as if he had succeeded in the biggest challenge in this life of standing his ground in the ocean, yet, little did he know he had changed the longest stranglehold of his mother's life. He removed the shackles dictating my life and made me discern that I need to trust him more and not be fearful in life with my fears of harm coming to Andrew and Cora.
Figure 51.

*Andrew giving me a thumbs up from the ocean without a vest*

*Note:* This moment is a big accomplishment for him, but also for me, I learned so much in this occurrence.

**Dialogue as an Ethics of Care**

Dialogue, a component of care ethics theory, emerged throughout many of themes in the data, which I describe in each of the theme sections. The emergence of dialogue is to no surprise as I consider myself an affable woman who values conversation, as I regularly partake with my students in educational settings. Though, at home, I am constantly immersed in writing and have more diminutive conversations with my children, which is not comfortable to admit. Nonetheless, my graduate research work for the 17-days was the residency, which provided that interim reprieve from the diurnal
demand of writing, and I discovered that as a mother, my dialogue and role that I occupy at home is not the dialogue with my students or who I am to my students. Could it be because I believe I must be less outgoing, so my children take me more seriously? Recognizing this character of myself between my students and then my children became visible during the beginning of the residency; thank goodness for that visibility so soon in the residency.

Utilizing care ethics in my mothering and pedagogy extended my discovery concerning the need for balance in dialogue that was not one-sided, which I admit would occur prior to the start of the residency with my children. As Noddings (2005) implies dialogue “is open-ended; that is, in a genuine dialogue, neither party knows at the outset what the outcome or decision will be” (p. 23). Therefore, with the direction of Noddings's care ethics during the residency, any dialogue with my children was intentional but without predetermined outcomes or goals.

In responding to Noddings’s dialogue component, it was essential for me to know how McClure Sweeny perceived dialogue as she played a crucial role in the research by analyzing the data, which offered insight into the residency. Regarding my position in the residency with my children, McClure Sweeny acknowledged, “I am drawn to the idea of dialogue always being in process and relational, and from this, you have pulled out the threads that you allow to continue and that you nurture” (M. McClure Sweeny, personal communication, November 4, 2021). McClure Sweeny further noted how the pedagogical positioning described by Liselott Olsson (2009) reflects the kind of processes I had to engage with in order to counter the one-sided nature of my dialogic role, which I quickly
became aware of early in the residency. That process McClure Sweeny pointed to was what Olsson (2009) accounts as:

hooking onto … trajectories through installing themselves in the here-and-now and not positioning themselves outside through representing, commentating, interpreting, or reflecting. ... This is a pedagogue who arranges environments that give conditions for experimentation and for making ever more unforeseen and complex connections. (p. xxii)

What McClure Sweeny noticed about my pedagogical positioning in the residency is the attention and space I had to give to relational dialogue not only with my children but, also, to, as Olsson notes, our arrangements with the environment of home and our interpreting and reflecting on our daily interactions throughout each day of the residency.

One such pedagogical positioning and instance of relation dialogue is depicted in Figures 52-54 where I watched my children photograph the luxuriant flower garden that envelops and encloses the back of our home, acting as a dimensional thickness of protection from the external world to the inner entries of our home.
Figures 52-54.

Left: *Andrew documenting the roughness of the coneflower tip and honeybee*
Middle: *Cora capturing the fluffiness of the flowers and honeybees pollinating*
Right: *Andrew observing Cora as she explains to him about what she is photographing*

*Note:* The flower garden location at our home’s location was their favorite spot to capture images and produced much dialogue about care of the garden and Earth.

The admiration of nature became apparent from the daily dialogue and positioning around the vegetable garden, similar to the flower garden. In parsing through all the photographs, I became overwhelmed with an inquest of *if nature can hear.* I seek to believe it can; I contemplate that possibly our property grew more peaceful listening to the dialogue among Andrew, Cora, and me that was formed in the 17-days of the residency. In her analysis of Figures 52-54 above, McClure Sweeny shared that she perceives “the garden as an actor who is speaking with all of you in a dialogue shared among all of the human and non-human actors in your residency” (M. McClure Sweeny, personal communication, October 27, 2021). The garden taking on the role of an actor did create a dialogue that welcomed the components of an ethics of care as the garden acted by offering a continuum of non-prescribed dialogue, which “builds up a substantial
knowledge of one another that serves to guide our responses” in the learning of nature and in generating an emergent curriculum (Noddings, 2005, p. 23). Upon further analysis, the garden and its emergent relational opportunities for dialogue provides evidence of the reciprocity of care between our caring for the garden and the garden taking care of us in learning from it and providing the ingredients for healthy meals and lifestyle.

In an audio transcription of Photovoice after the day was over, Andrew weighed in on the textures of the coneflowers, sharing, “I never got this close up to the flowers in your garden, Mama. I am happy I can now have a picture forever about where the bees land” (A. Kirby, personal communication, July 13, 2021, 13:22). The dialogue ensuing between Andrew and me involved me showing him the still frame of that photograph that he captured, and I explained to him how photography allows the viewer to see the beauty of life that we pass by, as we stood there together and investigated the wonderful, vibrant coneflowers that inundate our English garden in the image. During the residency, we addressed the value of bees and how the flowers in our garden provide the bees with pollen necessary for their life cycle and Earth. Not knowing what Andrew and Cora were going to photograph and would want to discuss from those images was an exciting adventure that emerged.

The residency design offered freedom in merging inside and outside learning, generating emergent curriculum and undetermined dialogue through observation and artmaking in studying insects, trees, and habitats within our home’s site. The design of an art residency heightened my children’s understanding of the disciplines they choose to learn about by collaborating in artmaking. In merging art with education, I noticed love of learning versus reluctance to learn from a prescribed curriculum that would deny
agency to Andrew and Cora. For example, learning about the honeybees while using the method of Photovoice in our garden and the importance of their lives to our Earth was studied without a rigid bell schedule noting a change of discipline. Also, in learning about the beetles that decimate our crops through art encounters and observation, our unprescribed dialogue led us to emergent curriculum and shared artmaking experiences.

My study’s timeliness coincides well with the need for our children to talk about and understand the Earth through hands-on learning, especially when home has become more of a place of learning during the COVID-19 pandemic. Likewise, philosophy scholar Roger J. H. King and art education scholar Laurie Hicks further express the need in the learning of our environment in a context similar to my research, in stating: “art education is well situated to address environmental problems that emerge at the point of contact between nature and social life” (King & Hicks, 2007, p. 334). At a time when children and families were forced to stay home, many turned to the outdoors and the nature just in their own yards with renewed interest which offered unanticipated opportunities for learning about nature and the environment while society was trying to survive and heal. As my study’s emergent art curriculum demonstrates, during COVID-19, my children’s engagement with the environment around us flourished and fueled their continued learning.

An example of one of those unplanned moments investigating our home's property, which we have never done so intently, is shown in Figure 55. I caught Andrew positioned downward through my lens, studying our backyard. After several minutes, he took his camera out to obtain the permanence of his view. Andrew describes in a Photovoice discussion:
I always look at our backyard and see how beautiful the sky is and the trees, so I wanted to take a photograph that I could have forever and put in my room. The place I was standing is where I stand as a baby. In the summer, I play in that spot, and I hug Cora, and we blow bubbles together. (A. Kirby, personal communication, July 16, 2021, 9:12)

In that moment of Andrew conversing with me about the photograph, and throughout the residency dialogue, connected us and Photovoice served as a creative method of dialogic connection for both of us (Noddings, 2005). The undetermined dialogue was sporadic and joyful as we experienced the unknown and whatever would arise throughout our strolls on Dutch Lane.

**Figure 55.**

*Andrew capturing his home and all its beauty*

*Note:* Marveling over our property from a different approach that he had never previously done, organic emergent dialogue transpired from analyzing this image together.
Our home, Dutch Lane as we refer to it, is Andrew's everything, a place of safety. Throughout our residency, Andrew would frequently profess his love for our home. I would emphasize how incredible it is that he loves his home and how much I too admired my childhood home as a child. Through analysis of Figure 5, I cannot help but notice the love even more that he has for our home and, through the method of Photovoice, understand that love more so. When I got accepted to the doctoral program at Penn State, we migrated to State College, Pennsylvania, yet, maintained connection to our home in New Jersey as we knew the move would not be for too long. Living in State College, there would be no more waking up with a farm behind us, a private giant playground to imagine on, or living minutes from family; instead, he was greeted with development living of houses stacked on top of each other and no privacy to explore in the yard. The time away from Dutch Lane was devasting for him, so when we moved back to New Jersey after my required coursework completed, he reverted to the happy New Jerseyan Andrew. As a result of the move, his bond to our home grew more significantly since returning. So, during the time in the residency at Dutch Lane without distractions, I learned of Andrew's depth of love for our home even more than I did prior. I wonder, would I have felt and understood that unmeasurable emotion of his desire to capture Figure 55 as a forever photographic memory if we did not design our residency site-specific to our home? Being together on our property lent to uncovering the positive significance of our home to my children, particularly Andrew.
Dialogue: Negotiated Emergent Curriculum

Our identity during the residency evolved considerably out of the curriculum formed by the passions of Andrew and Cora. In preceding McClure Sweeny to code data and explore emergent themes, I gained insights into how the curriculum emerged and was negotiated throughout each day. McClure Sweeny also found examples of an negotiated emergent curriculum because, “the way you followed your children’s initial interests and expanded them into further teachable moments” (M. McClure Sweeny, personal communication, November 4, 2021). (See Figure 56.) She also examined and offered additional insight into the term of negotiated curriculum, sharing, “the other way that I see it functioning is that negotiating the curriculum with your children is enacting an ethics of care” (M. McClure Sweeny, personal communication, November 4, 2021). Triangulated together, our perspectives as the researcher (me) and expert outside consultant (McClure Sweeny) in conducting inductive analysis indicate that an emergent negotiated curriculum was created during the residency. How McClure Sweeny and I concluded those terms, negotiated emergent curriculum, because the curriculum emerged from Andrew and Cora’s passions and was negotiated between the three of us.
McClure Sweeny and I discovering themes

Figure 56.

Negotiated emergent curriculum THEME

Negotiated curriculum, also known as integrated, co-designed or co-constructed curriculum, is “a dynamic process in which what is taught and learned (the curriculum) is negotiated between teacher and students, rather than being solely pre-determined by the teacher” (Edwards, 2011, p. 144). Analysis in Chapter 4 demonstrates that the curriculum emerged through negotiated and co-constructed endeavors. Negotiation in what Andrew and Cora wanted to learn provided experiences of digging deeper into my children’s interests, an expansion of exploration through which I guided Andrew and Cora because of their passions throughout the residency. One of the most significant examples of our negotiated curriculum came because of my pre-residency purchase of a book written by Ellen Porter and Felicia Sala entitled, *Big Foot and Little Foot: The Squatchicorns* (Figure 57). I initially bought the book because of my children’s passion for Bigfoot and the persistent mention of Bigfoot that arose in our collaborative discussions of ideas that could evolve during the residency. They consistently talked about Bigfoot and wonder often if Bigfoot lurks in the woods behind Dutch Lane.

Note: Image of communication shared between McClure Sweeny and I.
Figure 57.

*Book read during the residency, sparking participatory artmaking curriculum*

![Book](image)

*Note:* The book Andrew and Cora have been waiting for to have me read during the residency.

What evolved from that purchase and reading the book was map making of Dutch Lane, an activity inspired by a part of the book (Figures 58-60) that maps the land upon which the Bigfoot character travels. The whole experience of making maps with Andrew and Cora was interesting to watch how they recalled the layout of the land where our home rests. Depicted in Cora’s map (Figure 59) is her drawing of the blue water where I had taught the two of them, on one of our many walks around the property, how when Luke and I purchased Dutch Lane there was a swimming pool in that location, but the pool hadn’t been in that spot for over nine years. When I asked Cora about the pool still present in her map she replied, “I think about being in the pool there now and how much fun I am having” (C. Kirby, personal communication, July 14, 2021, 2:29). A description of what was once there was present now in her map of how she sees Dutch Lane. I find the discovery of the significance of the pool to be the only item colored of a blue tone in the map as well. The emphasis on the pool is very important to her, as we discussed
further, “my Garbies (Barbies) play in the slide in the pool when I am in the pool there” (C. Kirby, personal communication, July 14, 2021, 3:12). I am overjoyed in learning about her imagination and how the time was made available for me to teach Cora and Andrew about how the property was prior to them being born. She converts our home to what it was even though she never knew it in that form.

**Figures 58-60.**

*Maps of Dutch Lane made from memory*

*Note:* From left to right: Zena, Cora, and Andrew. A depiction from memory of Dutch Lane as we explored the property much more regularly during the residency.

Additionally, more curriculum emerged from *Big Foot and Little Foot: The Squatchicorns* book as Andrew indicated that he wanted to make Bigfoot(s) for Dutch Lane in hopes that the wooden Bigfoot(s) would attract actual Bigfoot(s) to our home. I surprised myself with teaching myself on the spot how to use a handheld jigsaw and creating the shape of a Bigfoot freehand with Andrew and Cora watching the Bigfoot silhouettes come to life (Figures 61-64). The experience was new to each of us, yet through a participatory design of the study, we learned from each other through dialogue of line, shape, color, and texture.
Figures 61-64.

Wooden silhouette of the first of four Bigfoot(s) for Dutch Lane

Note: The Bigfoot(s) were drawn freehand, cut out, painted, and reside on our property.

In total we collaboratively made four Bigfoots, each one representing a family member, and the size of each Bigfoot was determined according to the size of the family member—this conceptual approach was negotiated among the three of us. Our process involved much dialogue in working together to draw the Bigfoot, then I would cut the body out of the plywood, Cora and Andrew would then paint the Bigfoot freely by their hands or a brush (Figures 65-68) and we would let it dry for couple of days. Then I would return to the Bigfoot and apply a waterproof sealant to protect the wood from the outside elements. During the collaborative artmaking adventure of creating the Bigfoot sculptures, we transformed this learning encounter as a way for me to teach them measurement, site-specificity, and texture.
Figures 65-68.

Collaboratively painting and cutting the Bigfoot Sculptures for Dutch Lane

Note: Each Bigfoot was crafted individually for each family member.

Since Andrew and Cora determined the size of the Bigfoot corresponding to the size of each Kirby family member, both had to make sure that they understood how to measure to create the sizing for each site-specific silhouette as well as individual characteristics unique to each family member. During one of the Photovoice interactions between Andrew, Cora, and myself, our discussion assessed their knowledge gained learning of that day. For example, I asked, “when you both look at these photographs of creating Bigfoot, what can [they] teach me about what you learned today?” (Z. Tredinnick-Kirby, personal communication, July 15, 2021, 14:11). Andrew immediately responded: “the bigger the numbers on the stick the taller it is, Papa is the tallest and then you, Mama. Also, I learned that Papa is 8 feet tall, and I am only 4 feet tall. I am half of Papa” (A. Kirby, personal communication, July 15, 2021, 14:27). Followed by Cora: “Mama is tall because she has shoes that are six itches (inches) and that makes her bigger than me, but that’s ok, I love Mama’s shoes that have itches” (C. Kirby, personal communication, July 15, 2021, 14:51). I also taught Andrew and Cora about how Bigfoot
has a lot of hair, and hair creates a texture, so I had them feel their hair and the grass and the dog hair on Sadie. They understood that we needed to create that look on the one-dimensional piece of plywood by making edges that protruded outward to add that element of texture (Figures 69-71) of the final Bigfoot sculptures in their permanent locations, site-specific to our property.

In listening to their explanations of what they learned, my analysis of their verbal responses found evidence that Andrew received and gained knowledge of mathematics from taking 8 foot in half to make 4 feet. Also, Cora grew her vocabulary to itches (inches) which shows she understands the relationship between a larger number and a bigger structure. Therefore, I affirm that the encounter of the Bigfoot encapsulates how learning can be fun and explored through students’ and children’s passions while collaboratively guided by educators teaching mathematics through art education. The knowledge gained and understood in the emergent negotiated curriculum of co-creating an interdisciplinary lesson of Bigfoot created knowledge that will inspire learning because it was pulled from their passion and interest of Bigfoot. Instead of being in a classroom learning how to measure24, through the residency Andrew and Cora were able to gain knowledge experiencing lessons they created for lifelong learning.

24 I recognize feminist educational language as situated learning and authentic assessment used to theorize such ideas (Lave & Wenger, 1991).
Figures 69-71.

Completed Bigfoot statues that were made site-specific to Dutch Lane

Note: Bigfoot sculptures in their permanent location on our property, which was made through an interdisciplinary encounter of learning from Andrew and Cora’s interest in Bigfoot.

Learning from Andrew and Cora was exciting for me as I never knew what each day in the residency would be like since they created each day of the residency. There were plenty of moments and dialogue that surrounded the three of us where I shared about if I was their age, I would have loved to learn in the capacity that the art residency was providing to them. Many times, my excitement for being in the art residency along with Andrew and Cora would shine through and I would catch smiles and winks particularly from Andrew, as he loves to see me happy. Yet, I would do the same, the reciprocity of making the happiness of what we’re experiencing together my me looking and smiling back at Andrew and Cora, or simply asking, “are you both happy?” or “does the residency make you happy to learn?” The dialogue exchange between the three of us was so beneficial in learning, but also in health. Our conversations during the residency
provided the fog to dissolve in our brains from having no outside distractions and utter cleanness.

As the kitchen became much of the learning area for each of us in the residency. Prior to the residency, Andrew and Cora would frequently observe me cooking in the kitchen, always amazed and the process of making a meal. Andrew particularly has always been fond of eggs since he was very young, intrigued by the look, feel, and textures. However, during the residency since there was no rushing of making meals, Andrew randomly grabbed my white cardigan (Figure 72), which according to him resembled a lab coat. He put on the “lab coat” and became a scientist following his interest in mixing found items from the kitchen to create a magical concoction. In exploring the kitchen, Andrew grabbed an egg and asked if I could teach him about eggs. That request to learn about eggs created the last five hours of our day. I explored different educational websites that offered a learning diagram, as I was unaware of the particulars of an egg, finding a 4-H website entitled, *The Parts of an Egg*25 (Figure 73).

---

25 The 4-H Virtual Farm (n.d.)
We all learned so much with the direction Andrew took us when he wanted to be a scientist for the day. After learning the shell of an egg is made of calcium carbonate, which gives a porous property to transfer gases through the shell to the inside of the egg, Andrew wanted to explore the textures of an egg, bringing learning from the inside of Dutch Lane to the outside. When we went outside, I explained to Andrew about the egg drop I did in school for my science class when I was his age. He was curious about what that entailed so I explained that whoever could create a design of a structure and drop from a high height of a raw egg inside that structure without it breaking would receive the highest grade. I thought he would be interested in learning about the building of the
structure, however, instead the dialogue exchange quickly moved to asking about the high grade, see excerpt:

The dialogue of grades occurred; I knew sooner than later this conversation would happen. He asked me what grades were? I explained to him what they were, and he said, “wow I am so glad I don’t have grades, I just have fun!” Seriously … when he said this, I almost dropped over … that’s right he does just have fun … but he learns. He is learning while having fun, the perfect combination. Do grades bring about stress and have students focus more on their grades than having fun in the learning process? (Z. Tredinnick-Kirby, journal excerpt, July 15, 2021)

In reviewing the data and formulating the placement of the above-mentioned excerpt, I couldn’t help but bring myself back to the meeting I had with Nel when she expressed about the educational structure being in for an awakening of test scores because of the pandemic. I firmly believe that test scores shape our educational direction and formulation of curriculum, when in living a residency filled with passions of my children, if we taught from the passion of students and educators and created together, lifelong learning would exist. The knowledge would stick because of wanting to learn, instead of being forced to learn in a very linear one-method approach.

Andrew’s passion and the egg experience evolved into a scientific experiment that incorporated art as we learned together about texture and color. Andrew wanted to see how long a cracked egg in the 104-degree heat would take to scramble on top of a decomposing tree stump (Figures 74-76).
Figures 74-76.

Images of cracking, photographing, and waiting

Note: Pictured is the sequence of the occurrence of egg experiment.

In what felt like forever as the heat was so intense during the July day, in total it took more than four hours (Figure 77) to scramble an egg from Earth’s ball of fire. The teaching and learning aspect of the residency and this example of frying an egg outside afforded no constriction of time on what we learned and provided a space for rich dialogue. Experiencing and witnessing Andrew’s curiosity of becoming a scientist—or as he would say, Doc from Back to the Future©—to documentation of the egg frying lasted the whole day, which if the residency wasn’t the model for our learning and making together, the linear method of teaching and learning would have cut our learning and time short to prioritize a mechanical/routine schedule of manufactured learning.

The example of uninterrupted time is expressed in Figure 78, a photo taken by Andrew as he was so proud to see what he hoped to achieve in learning the length of time for the Earth to cook an egg. When asked through the data collection process of Photovoice, Andrew speaks of Figure 78:
I was so excited to learn about how to do this with an egg, I thought it would take smaller time for the egg to cook. I wonder if Bigfoot waits and watches the waterfall of egg become a desert. (A. Kirby, personal communication, July 15, 2021, 19:51)

**Figures 77-78.**

*Time recorded screenshot from my Apple® iPhone and the scrambled egg from nature*

Note: I recorded the timing of how long it took to scramble the egg on the tree stump.

The conversation quickly shifted to the waterfall comment and the desert as I asked Andrew what he meant by that and his response:

Well the egg looked like a waterfall going over the side of the tree because it was gooey and slimy, like a waterfall that is always moving. A desert looks hard and dry like the way the egg turned out to be from my experiment (A. Kirby, personal communication, July 15, 2021, 21:22).
In examining the collected audio transcripts of this participatory discovery of terms associated with locations, in this instance Andrew’s association with location and texture offered an exploration that could be explored right in his backyard initiated by his wondering. What he gained from his wanting to be a scientist was learning the ins and outs of egg, particularly the length of time Earth can scramble an egg and the discussion that was emerged of introducing Andrew to the concept of grades.

In the dialogue of grades, Andrew was curious about my school, so I explained to him about what I have been doing in the last three years and what I plan to do with my degree. I expressed about teaching college level when I am done and writing books about my experience. In discussing book writing, Andrew was inspired to make a book, which he explained to me is a book (Figures 79-83) that many can learn from as it is about the life of Cora and Andrew (Andrew, 2021). Below is an excerpt as I reflected on Andrew creating a book inspired from our conversation:

While Cora was drawing, Andrew decided to make a comic book of, *The Life of Andrew and Cora*. I documented through photographs of each page, as he explained to me. I captured his voice explaining each frame. I felt [it] was important to capture, since he created the story. After he was done explaining, I hugged him and expressed to him how much I love the love that Cora and Andrew have for each other. They hardly ever argue and just love. He is always thinking about his sister, showing her how to do something, helping her, caring for her, making her laugh when she is hurt. Pretty much always trying to be there for her and lifting her spirits when in need. That emotional connection at eight and four years of age is beautiful to watch. My husband and I are always showing
affection towards each other and express our love for each other, by saying, “I love you.” We are examples, we model our love and in turn Andrew and Cora love each other.

They both know through dialogue that love is the most important aspect of life. I often converse with them about love is not just for human to human, but human to Earth, human to body, and more (Z. Tredinnick-Kirby, journal excerpt, August 9, 2021).

**Figures 79-83.**

*Images of the book Andrew created called, The Story of Andrew and Cora*

*Note: Andrew explored book arts while in the residency.*

The story depicts Andrew and his sister, Cora, watching the sun come up in the morning and praying, then Jesus starts to cry (the rain), and they hold hands, and Andrew tells Cora everything will be all right as long as they are together and believe in Jesus (A. Kirby, personal communication, August 9, 2021).

Interpreting his book purports clarity to me now that months have passed since the residency that Andrew's faith in Jesus and Cora means the most to him. For his first book, the production is of importance in his life, which shined through in illustrating his top
priorities. He transforms his knowledge of Jesus protecting us as what Andrew believes into Andrew protecting his sister. Although my husband and I pray daily with our children and make it a priority, it was confirmed through his book that the faith and love of his sister is a priority in Andrew's world as well. In speaking with Andrew and Cora, I understand their connection to Jesus, yet, in the residency, I learned just about how significant; and the role that Jesus and Cora play in Andrew’s life through his illustrations.

The learning throughout the residency was mutual between the three of us. Guided by the passions of Andrew and Cora, I learned about their curiosities and even had to research material that both wanted to learn but I didn’t know or couldn’t explain fully. In the beginning of the residency in the garden, which became the site and focus of the majority of the curriculum, spotting a beetle on a leaf transformed into learning about the naming of members of the music group, The Beatles, to portraits of our favorite Beatle. During the making of portraits, I expressed to Andrew through a mothering theme of comfort and encouragement that he could do what he likes in art and work outside the lines of an image and not follow any predetermined lines to draw and color his favorite Beatle. I felt that the best way to teach the reasoning for the group gaining their name, The Beatles, was to hear from one of The Beatles. I searched on YouTube® and found a video of John Lennon explaining the significance of their name and how they obtained the name. Andrew and Cora were mesmerized by Lennon’s words (Figure 84). Andrew and Cora have been around The Beatles their entire lives, as The Beatles are one of my favorites along with the music group Pearl Jam. I am always playing music in the house, which they love, and we often find opportunities to dance together.
The artmaking process of the portraits (Figures 85-87) was one of the most joyous experiences of collaborative work that we made together during the residency. The energy amongst us was heightened as we made art while we listened to *The Beatles*. I had never made art of *The Beatles* while listening to their music. Cora requested to hear *The Beatles* while we made art, which transformed that hour together into such a memorable experience as we learned about the reasoning behind the name and explored the qualities and details of the faces in which we were painting. Cora’s favorite Beatle is Ringo Starr (Figure 85), and Andrew’s favorite Beatle is Paul McCartney (Figure 86) and lastly, mine is John Lennon (Figure 87), who I rendered from the *Yellow Submarine* album. All the
images were guided by observation as I printed out the image, we each selected on the computer.

**Figures 85-87.**

*Images of our Beatles inspired paintings. Left: Cora, Middle: Andrew, Right: Zena*

*Note: Emergent curriculum of Beatles portraits from observing beetles in the garden.*

When we reviewed these images together through the Photovoice method, Cora affirmed her love of Starr, “I made Ringo because I love Ringo. He is nice and I like the *Yellow Submarine* song” (C. Kirby, personal communication, July 13, 2021, 14:38).

Andrew describes his piece while critiquing. “I see two eyes and Paul’s mouth singing *Let it Be*, I listened to Paul sing while I made him and I also see *Lucy in the Sky with Diamonds*” (A. Kirby, personal communication, July 13, 2021, 15:22). Cora and Andrew have watched the film, *The Yellow Submarine*, since they were babies, so it was to no surprise that Cora selected to paint Ringo and associate *The Yellow Submarine* reference. I was intrigued, however, in finding Andrew’s explanation as he abstractly deciphered McCartney and the association of floating symbols to symbolize *Lucy in the Sky with Diamonds* as he had seen in the film prior to the residency.
Practice in Action as an Ethics of Care

The time together while enduring the residency without outside distraction lent to understanding more about ourselves through care and in practice. For example, in a clip from the audio data of an interview with Cora, she says: “I like being an investigator and artist together” (C. Kirby, Day 2, personal communication, July 15, 2021, 11:27), indicating not just her enjoyment in the time we spent together in the residency during the research, but also in the practice of collaboratively making art.

Another emergent moment was the practice of care that Andrew and Cora exercised and cultivated together in the residency. For example, I caught the moment in Figure 88 where the two of them embrace each other as they examine the photographs they have just taken of a caterpillar. The softness in Cora’s touch is so tender and caring. When questioned about this image, Cora answered, “I love my brother, and I love to make sure that he is ok; I love to explore as friends in the residency with Andrew” (C. Kirby, personal communication, July 15, 2021, 21:52). I further asked Andrew about his thoughts in our Photovoice process while observing the image of Cora embracing him, to which he replied, “my sister is nice, she is good” (A. Kirby, personal communication, July 15, 2021, 27:19). Thus, the residency enabled me to witness the care practiced within the sibling relationship that Andrew and Cora share; again, the Photovoice method provided the visibility needed to more fully appreciate the care exhibited and invested in our relationships. Andrew and Cora have a very loving relationship, which prior to the residency was evident to me; however, the 17-day residency brought heightened visibility and clarity of that reciprocal care between them. The visibility of emotion, such as the
practice of care, is a positive reassurance of the love one has for another, suggesting there is a reciprocal relationship of care further developed during the residency.

**Figure 88.**

*The practice of care between siblings*

*Note:* A pause in generating the curriculum for the day to reflect upon the images they had captured up to that moment of a caterpillar. The care and love they possess for each other is something so powerful, I hope this continues for the rest of their lives.

The component of practice in moral education is that “the practice provided must be with people who can demonstrate caring” (Noddings, 2005, p. 24). Through modeling and dialogue, the practice of care was most apparent in the data. The coding of data from the theoretical lens of the component practice of an ethics of care, can be interpreted from my journaling, Figures 89-91:
Since the weather was so hot, we decided to accept an invite from the lovely Ms. Alice, our friend from our church. She just turned 90 years old and invites us over to enjoy her pool. Every time we go to her house, I make sure that she is comfortable in her chair with her feet up as she enjoys watching Andrew and Cora swim in the pool. She smiles, talks to them, we take pictures with her, have ice pops with her, and take care of her when she walks. I am usually the one who helps her with walking, as I hold her hand and make sure she doesn’t trip or fall while going from the pool into her home. I nearly cried as we were leaving and Cora said, “no Mama, I will take care of Ms. Alice.” In [the] first image of Cora holding Ms. Alice’s hand, you can see the expression of love and happiness exuded from Ms. Alice’s face. The love and care continued until Cora walked her all the way up to her home and gave her a hug and said thank you. The whole five-minute time of Cora and Ms. Alice together was the most heartwarming experience I ever felt in Cora’s four years. I have never seen her take care and love someone other than Andrew, my husband, and I. Ms. Alice is wonderful for my children, and my children are wonderful for Ms. Alice. My children do not have older figures in their lives, as both my grandparents passed away, yet Ms. Alice is that! I think it is important to connect to a grandparent, as you learn much about life, care, love, and respect from them. Ms. Alice does all that and more for my children. We are very grateful to have her in our lives and love her to pieces. (Z. Tredinnick-Kirby, journal excerpt, August 9, 2021)
Figures 89-91.

Left: Cora helping Ms. Alice from the pool
Middle: Cora safely holds Ms. Alice’s hand in guidance with walking
Right: Cora focuses on Ms. Alice’s steps to make sure she can offer care to her every step of the way

Note: After seeing in the fourteen days of the residency the presence of care and dialogue about care, Cora decided to care for Ms. Alice.

In connecting to Noddings’s care theory, my journal reflection articulates the needed reciprocity between Cora and Ms. Alice to practice care in that a caregiving experience should initiate or contribute to the desired attitude (Noddings, 2005). However, the conditions must be right, and people are central to the setting (Noddings, 2005). For instance, Cora had observed the modeling of care countless times during our visits to Ms. Alice’s house and never had Cora previously initiated the care that is witnessed in the images in Figures 89-91. Analysis of coded data, however, shows how Cora discerned the need for care through the emergent art education curriculum and pedagogy of the residency.
Practice: Mothering and Educator

I learned in the residency the need for remaining present and mindful of my children. I have so much responsibility with being a mother, wife, daughter, and full-time graduate student that, comparable to the suffocation of fear to the ocean, I have felt a tremendous burden from performing as a close to a forty-year-old woman in a doctoral program. Though the residency grounded me, even though I know my children and husband are the most significant people in my life, I realized in living the feminist teaching art residency and in investigating the data, the presence I endured during the time of not being distracted by outside noise of demands afforded me the patience and the time to know my children more. The 17-days were a precise needed time to center my soul with my children.

This centering, perhaps best captured by Andrew’s candid photo-snap of Cora and me in the flower garden, is being present at once with my children, myself, and the moment (Figure 92). I see, in Figure 92-93, the genuine smile on a mother's face being present and witnessing the air circulate and whirlwind around in her daughter's long brown healthy hair as she innocently and purely dances in excitement because she suddenly understands and knows how to utilize her newly gifted camera. There are no interruptions, no focusing on other responsibilities that are always demanded of me, just my daughter and I existing together in that moment of teaching and learning that, ultimately, my son captured. The advantage of Photovoice and the ability to seize these moments are extraordinary, as collecting data was crucial for the hands of an 8-year-old and a 4-year-old to capture their perceptions through photographs. The residency shifted my focus of where I need to be present and yet again as I conducted data analysis and
relived those residency days of our journey together; the presence is always with my family, especially my children. They are my world.

Figures 92-93.

*Image of Cora and myself in the garden, captured by Andrew and the coding between McClure Sweeny and myself of the emerging theme of mothering and educator*

*Note:* Andrew captured the moment after I had taught Cora about using her camera, Cora is dancing with excitement and notes between McClure Sweeny and I in coding the data.

**Practice: A Self-Awakening of Identity**

Photovoice was exciting in the initial days of the residency for Cora and Andrew. Besides the digital camera I gave to them on the first day of the residency, they both had the choice to use a polaroid camera and a manual camera. The manual camera shown in
Figure 94, was gifted to me from my committee chair, Keifer-Boyd, as well darkroom equipment and a Polaroid 440 camera (Figure 95). From years of art school majoring in photography, my love for photography has always remained present prior to art education as a degree path. Therefore, in selecting Photovoice as the primary method of collecting data, I, too, was excited to use photography as a data collection method.

**Figures 94-95.**

Left: *Keifer-Boyd gifted her mother’s camera to me for documentation through the method of Photovoice*

Right: *Original Polaroid camera gifted to me from Keifer-Boyd*

*Note:* Keifer-Boyd invited my husband and I out to her home and gave me photography equipment to use for the residency. Besides the cameras in Figures 94-95, she also gave darkroom equipment to me.

Andrew and Cora wanted nothing to do with the manual camera because you could not see the images instantly, something they had grown accustomed to knowing about photography in a digital age. I explained about the wet processing of film, and still received no excitement from either of them. I discussed more film processing, though, as with all decisions made in the residency, Andrew and Cora had their choice of what they
wanted to adopt as their camera for the method of the Photovoice documentation. I, however, was excited to return to my roots with the time that was offered to me during the residency as a collaborative art journey and use the manual camera that meant so much to me in the return of myself as a photographer. For once in about six years, I was able to use the camera for arts-sake and not teach a prescribed curriculum. My identity for years, I have felt, has shifted from artist to art educator. I sometimes feel that my identity as the artist that was the foundation and passion for teaching art was overshadowed by having things I “must-do” and teach instead of continuing to create art and be an artist all while teaching. The division of time and artmaking weighed heavy on me as a secondary art educator for all those years. However, the residency further offered that space and time for me to be the artist and the educator with my children.

During the residency, the space in the kitchen took on a new meaning. During the 17-days our regular routines were shifted into a space of collaborating and having undistracted time. Cora and Andrew took a fondness to the kitchen and the making of food. I said to them that cooking is art, that art does not need to be the materials of painting, drawing, or clay, and food—as with the garden—can be art. The more colorful food that we eat, the more colorful our bodies are in energy and health. They both loved how I would recount a familiar understanding of art and color to that of food. Since Andrew has a severe milk allergy, all our food in the home is dairy-free. In Figure 96, Andrew’s face shows delight when spending time in the kitchen preparing delicious zucchini peach blueberry bread instead of watching me as they usually would do in the kitchen. Being with my children in the residency agitated the fast-paced life of meal-
making and necessitated that I take time to explicate to them how to follow a recipe from start to finish.

**Figure 96.**

*Andrew cooking zucchini peach blueberry bread*

Note: Andrew as an observational cooker in the kitchen, to doing the cooking himself.

While I was in the kitchen with Andrew, the participatory aspect of artmaking transpired as Andrew embraced the identity of becoming a chef and I reembraced my identity as a photographer. Figure 96 beautifully shows the collaboration of Andrew making his art creation of the bread and my love of photography in capturing the items in the kitchen that I engage with daily yet never see from an artistic point of view in a still frame. So, while Andrew was practicing cooking, I established my scene of kitchen items, quickly transforming the kitchen into a photography studio as shown in Figures 97-101 and described in my journal excerpt:

While I was in the kitchen, I decided that I wanted to make a kitchen series of photography where I captured the elements that I was using to cook alongside
Andrew. I wanted everything to be macro and silver-toned black and white in the editing process. I explained all of this to Andrew, and he watched me do the 1980’s photoshop where I edit the photograph prior to snapping the shot. I explained to him how that is important to edit the photograph as much as you can before you take the image. (Z. Tredinnick-Kirby, journal excerpt, July 21, 2021)

Figures 97-101.

*The Kitchen Series, medium: photography*

---

*Note:* See full series in Appendix D. The residency offered that place to practice art again as I did for so many years, yet I was able to teach my son in the *Kitchen Series* about compositional foundational techniques, which I had never done prior to the residency.
Kitchen Series ignited my passion for photography again, rekindling that passion halfway through the residency. My process for the Kitchen Series was the use of the manual Konica® camera. Then I scanned the negatives into the computer and digitalized them, then was able to edit through Adobe® Photoshop. The joy of creating art again was so good for my soul as a mother, educator, artist, and researcher. I was able to feel myself again as whom I was prior to motherhood and educator being the artist I was in art school all over again. My viewpoint is that sometimes we get overrun by obligations and lose sight of ourselves and our true passions in life. Nevertheless, I am so grateful that within the residency, I was able to see that within myself, though having my children witness that love of art again was the most crucial aspect of discovering my identity as an artist through mothering in the feminist teaching art residency.

During the kitchen photography encounter, Andrew and my time together created a learning environment for both of us. In Figures 102-103, our co-creation and collaboration is at the heart of these two photographs and explored in my journal:

Yet, the most powerful element of today was when we were doing our Photovoice interviews at the end of the residency and we came to a bowl of blueberries that he had captured. His voice spoke of how he watched and did what I did … he observed me and rendered the same shot. I was speechless and cried. He looked at me like I was crazy, I explained to him how beautiful it was that he modeled after me. Today was truly a special day as he is picking up a lot of valuable actions, emotions, and understandings. (Z. Tredinnick-Kirby, journal excerpt, July 21, 2021)
Figures 102-103.

Mother and son blueberry photographs

Note: Andrew observed me capturing the blueberries with the natural light hitting the top sides of them, as he shifted himself and captured the same scene.

Our identity as artists in the residency grew as we explored how art can reflect learning and exploring through the artmaking process. I immediately determined that Andrew and Cora enjoyed and preferred to direct the learning sporadically and then create art from that lived learning experience. From my viewpoint of the data and my experience in the residency with Andrew and Cora, the kitchen experience opened Andrew's thinking and enjoyment of creating art together as a collaborative artmaking process, which became something that he would want to continue to do for the duration of the residency. For example, once Andrew learned about the process of fingerprinting from my husband who needed to be fingerprinted for Cub Scouts®, Andrew launched us into an emergent collaborative artmaking experience to investigate further his fascination with the uniqueness of human fingerprints. After learning of what fingerprinting and fingerprints were about and how each human’s fingers differ from the next one, I write
about this experience in my journaling. I feel the importance to capture the entirety of the journal entry, placing self into the environment in that occurrence to better understand:

In the morning my husband had left the house to get fingerprinted for becoming a Cub Scout® leader. Andrew and Cora did not know what fingerprinting was or every heard of it. I took the time to research with them about fingerprints. However, I normally would teach about the importance of fingerprints in art through Chuck Close. This time in our residency I taught from an interdisciplinary approach of biometrics and learning about the fingerprint and the importance of the development of how we gain fingerprints in the womb. The development is called the tips of our fingers (volar pads).

You want to know what I love about this residency; is I am learning at the same time, oftentimes, and it comes to our minds at the same time. It’s beautiful to learn together like we are and the emergence of learning and art that is being created. We watched videos, read articles, and studied our fingerprints for numerous hours. Once we were done with that, Andrew mentioned he wanted to put two pieces of large paper together, I felt transforming the garage into a studio for that time would be great. It mixes the site up, possible creating differently? The mural in the garage was so incredible. I taught Andrew and Cora about Judith Braun, a feminist finger muralist, who I have never taught about before (as mentioned previously though Chuck Close) I was so proud of myself to teach of a feminist artist versus the male artist that typically is taught in a traditional art
history survey course. Andrew and Cora were amazed by Judith Braun and what you can create with fingerprints.

The beginning of the artmaking was difficult as both Andrew and Cora’s patience of realizing how much paint to put on your finger to see the print. I had to model the amount, once they saw how much to put on, there was no stopping them. The beauty of engaging with my children in that mural was life changing. We all felt free, I asked them about the way they felt during making it and both said so calm. We often do yoga, yet the collaborative mural painting was on a different level of calmness. I would love to do this again and include music into the environment, as my children and I react to music. I also always had music playing in my classroom when I taught inside a school’s building.

While we were creating together Andrew once again brought up Franz Kline, he asked to view one of his paintings and in looking and observing Kline’s piece, Andrew created his own inspired Kline painting in the bottom left, yet, put himself on one of the lines. When I asked Andrew what he was doing on the line he said, “well now I can see myself painting on the mural.” How clever and awesome to think from that viewpoint. From the inside to the outside of the painting, he was imagining while he was painting. This moment sparked a lesson in my mind … what if we painted from the inside out … what would we depict? I asked Andrew what he thought. He responded, “we would see things differently.” We sure would, WOW incredible. The beauty in this encounter with my son of
him depicting what his feeling was during that moment was life changing. We need to allow these moments with our children or students to occur letting us see more clearly into the minds of those creating and what can be created from those thoughts and experiential moments. (Z. Tredinnick-Kirby, journal excerpt, July 23, 2021)

My identity of an interdisciplinary progressive feminist art educator shined through in the learning and artmaking encounters with Andrew and Cora throughout the residency, particularly shown in Figures 104-106. Diving into teaching of biometrics, being a feminist art educator and artist, and collaboratively engaging together through a participatory approach in making art as we learn about fingerprints was an unimaginable event as a mothering and educator.27

26 My definition of and position as a progressive educator (in the Deweyan sense) emphasizes critical learning in an experiential approach to self-directive self-investigation into social responsibilities formed by an ethics of care.

27 In all my classroom experience, I never went to the depth of interdisciplinary teaching and exploring an inclusive emergent curriculum designed by passion of my children/students.
Figures 104-106.

Fingerprint identity mural

Note: In this encounter we explored our fingerprints together after learning a lot about fingerprints from a biometrics point of view. The final piece now is a permanent artwork in our living room.

When I was becoming a parent for the first time, pregnant with Andrew, I remember hearing much advice, to which I smiled and said thank you; however, I knew only through hands-on experience and the reality of having to take care of life in front of me that I would know at that moment what my inner intuition would say to do. However, of the advice I received, I always held on to one piece that said be the best you can be to your children and yourself because they are always watching you and learning from you as your children. Though I feel in the residency I have been the best for my children, the life of watching them for 17-days and their identity and learning from them was just as life-changing as them watching me. However, Andrew did watch me a lot in the creating of art. For example, in Figures 107-109, Andrew photographed me as I taught myself how to use a chainsaw and a top-handle jigsaw. When I asked Andrew about collecting this data, he expressed that I could do anything and that he saw how much I love art and how much I taught myself because I told him while learning in the act that we can’t know what
we can do unless we try (Andrew, 2021). Hypocritical, I know, allowing the fear of the ocean to dictate my life of not enjoying the seawater embrace my body, but on dry land, I am not afraid of anything and will try it to see how I can do what is presented to me. I taught myself a lot about who I am, how I can achieve anything I put my mind to, which Andrew witnessed in these occurrences.

Figures 107-109.

The becoming of an identity of perseverance

Note: Andrew captured me doing art that I had never done before, I am proud looking at these images that he saw his mother pushing herself to achieve something she has never done before.

Practice: Negotiated Emergent Curriculum

Taking the time to explore art with my children in ways we have never done before offered further insight into their likes and dislikes in their worlds, especially with their passion to Moai sculptures. Moai’s are site-specific sculptures that are found on Rapa Nui, a Pacific Island sometimes referred to as Easter Island.

The making of the Moai was predetermined, as prior to the residency a tree had come down in the front of our property and we salvaged the stumps knowing that we would want to create art of Moai during the residency, as Andrew requested. Like their
interest in Bigfoot, Andrew and Cora have loved learning about Moai’s prior to the residency. However, with the anticipation of viewing the tree stumps in our front yard lined up for months (Figures 110-111), the reality of the Maoi’s coming to life was very exciting for the three of us.

Figures 110-111.

Images of the Moai Tree Stumps- Uncarved

Note: The tree stumps sat in our front yard for months prior to the residency beginning.

My daily journaling expresses some initial thoughts and teaching that occurred on that day:

Andrew mentioned while we were outside about the Moai’s that we have been in discussion about for the last year. “Today is the day,” I mentioned to him. Before we started the Moai carving, I taught them everything I knew about the Moai sculptures from Rapa Nui. I recorded myself, so that I could listen to the recording later. I discussed:

-what it means to be a native
-what deforestation is
-decolonization
- defined features of the Moai’s
- Volcanic ash as material
- Height on average: 13 ft. and 1.5 ton
- Most of the body is above land, however, parts are still underneath
- Transport of the Moai on the island, mystery…logging? (Z. Tredinnick-Kirby, journal excerpt, August 3, 2021)

I knew that I would be the main artist in the creating of the four Moai sculptures, which like Bigfoot took on the roles of our family members from size distribution as discussed between Andrew and Cora. There were many variables to working outside in New Jersey during the months of July and August, but also working with material and tools that I had never used prior to the residency. Working with plywood for the Bigfoot was much easier, however, the thickness and qualities of a tree stump offered no remorse of a slight error with the chainsaw (see Figures 112-113).

Figures 112-113.

The first cutting of the tree stump Moai at Dutch Lane Art Residency

Note: The tree stumps were heavy, hard to maneuver and cut in creating Moai sculptures.

28 The variables include heat from the summer months, broken chainsaws, amateur artist working with wood, and the unforgiving qualities of wood and a chainsaw.
In researching prior to the residency starting, I was aware that artist residencies offer a space for artists to create with an objective of achieving a possible new technique in art and transitioning to a deeper understanding of a medium or even to produce a series of completed work. However, at Dutch Lane Art Residency, the accomplishment of all four carved Moai was not achieved. I remember being disappointed at the time, however, now in reviewing the data, I feel accomplished as a new artist working with medium that I had never worked with previously. I pushing myself to explore what I was capable of doing. That is the most important aspect of what came out of co-creating the Moai sculptures together, learning about ourselves and discovering new ways to create and learn. Andrew explored the Dremel® tool (Figure 115), while I used the chainsaw. The end of the residency occurred on Day 17 (Figures 114-118) when I slipped with the tool I was using and cut my finger enough for it to hurt badly when flexed.

**Figures 114-118.**

*Images of Andrew working on the details of the Moai and the end of residency*

*Note: Andrew working with a Dremel® and the accident that caused the residency to end.*
I had originally proposed for the art residency to be three months long, then I switched to a 30-day residency. However, the decision when to conclude was Cora and Andrew’s decision concerning when they were ready to be done with the art residency, which ultimately ended on Day 17. In what follows, my daily journaling explains why the residency ended and my emotions at that moment:

Andrew and Cora were both very upset by me getting hurt. I embraced them and told them that I was fine, and I will be ok. I told them that tomorrow I would finish it up and make sure to wear gloves. After I mentioned this to them, Andrew said, “Mama, I don’t think I want to do the residency anymore with research.” I looked at him and said, “Why?” He replied, “I see how much you are doing with the photographs, and I just want to do the residency with no data collection like you said you are doing, and we are doing.” I looked at Cora and asked her, “Cora, do you want to continue the residency anymore?” She quickly answered, “No, I don’t want you to get hurt anymore.”

While I write this, I am sad. The original duration of our residency was three months, then during my proposal I cut it down to 30 days, and here we are ending the research aspect of the art residency at 17 days! The agreement when the three of us started this journey together was that they had every right to end the residency on their terms. I respect that, but I am sad. I know we will continue learning from the passions of Andrew and Cora, versus a prescribed district level milestone/accomplishment list. The art residency really opened my eyes to ways
in which art educators can pull from their students’ passions and create a studio environment where all people/persons create their passions/likes. Further, the substance of what I discovered during the 17-days in the art residency was applying an ethics of care theoretical framework to my mothering, pedagogy, and life changed who I am as a mother, educator, and human. I found myself so much more involved in dialogue with my children, learning from them as much as they learned from me. Being present with life and my children was made very visible to me, I needed that grounding. I feel as though I have been so absent in thought and mind since being a mother enrolled in a PhD program full time. In transforming my teaching and mothering through the four key components of an ethics of care, *modeling, dialogue, practice, and confirmation* I saw everyday my children applying an ethics of care as well. I always remember my mother and father saying to me as a child, “you are the company you keep.” Well, in a theoretical application to life, my children did just that as I did from Nel.

I always kept a consistent dialogue with my children, being present with them, and enjoying our conversations as I was not focused on publications or deadlines. I practiced what I didn’t know, for example the bigfoot art with learning and practicing with the jigsaw. My children saw that, especially Andrew and he took so much from that in applying that to his art during and throughout the residency.

Lastly, I confirmed all I believe through following through in my word of I will not give up and seeing the best in myself and encouraging Andrew and Cora that
they could do anything they put their minds too! Andrew and Cora gained so much from this residency, as did I. I learned patience; and my children learned patience. I learned how to care more than I already did, my children learned how to care. My children practiced care through taking care of our home, Ms. Alice, themselves with healthy food, and the garden. Confirmation is witnessed by it all coming together and affirming the best in each other. I am grateful, I am blessed … as are my children. What a great journey and research to be a part of, I cannot wait to start my other journey of writing and presenting on what my findings are after going through all the data collection. It [has] been a wild exploration … and I’d do it again in a heartbeat. (Z. Tredinnick-Kirby, journal excerpt, August 11, 2021)

As a result of the ending of Dutch Lane Art Residency, I decided the day after the residency to make my own emergent curriculum and last art series as I felt I needed to explore the emptiness that I was feeling the morning I woke up on Day 18, the day after. Since I had rekindled that love of photography through the method of Photovoice and in creating The Kitchen Series, in this series entitled The Day After (Figures 119-120),29 I captured images of all the places that we occupied during the residency indoors of Dutch Lane that were left untouched from the 24-hours prior when much noise and action was occurring.

29 The full series is Appendix E.
I needed to explore my emotions as I knew that the 17-days we had just experienced together in the art residency would never be felt or experienced the exact same ever again. The residency offered a place of newness for us, exploring a residency design unlike any achieved through family and feminist residencies as homeschool, art, feminist pedagogy, emergent negotiated curriculum, and the design of research where all explored in combination of each other. Each element that made the Dutch Lane Art Residency was unique to those 17-days and because of that I needed to explore that emptiness.

As my final creative and pedagogical interaction with the 17-day Dutch Lane Art Residency, The Day After photograph series astutely and poignantly encapsulates what the four components of an ethics of care brought about for my children and me. The empty chairs and untouched environment in the series reflects the traces of relational modeling of care my children and I did for each other. The series itself was an attempt to model care for myself, too, as I processed the emptiness and loss I felt with the
residency’s end. The chairs sitting opposite each other in one of the photographs whisper about the undetermined dialogue that emerged as my children and I positioned ourselves in different ways at Dutch Lane and constantly engaged our thinking, vulnerability, and reflection. Care in practice is palpable in the absence of our faces and the black and white tone of the photographs. And finally, the untouched objects and scenes in the series confirm and affirm our collaboration, our care, our emergent curriculum. In the final chapter, I offer findings from analysis of the themes and emergent codes present in the data from the residency to answer my research question.

Encouraging and Affirming Confirmation as an Ethics of Care

The last component in moral education is confirmation, which “requires attribution of the best possible motive consonant with reality” (Noddings, 2005, p. 25). One such moment of encouragement and affirmation transpiring between my children and I and the residency environment occurred when Cora chose voluntarily to brush our gorgeous Australian Shepherd, Sadie (Figure 121). So many times, throughout her life, Cora observed the care that my husband, Luke, and I give to Sadie in brushing her, feeding her, and loving her; yet Cora grew throughout the residency in demonstrating that same care and love. While brushing Sadie, I encouraged Cora about the care that Sadie requires as a dog and how Sadie was happy and relished in Cora taking excellent care of her. In selecting the photograph in Figure 121, I had asked Cora about what her voice and agency of the photograph pictured, and she reacted, “I learned that Sadie Girl needs help with long hair, I need to love her with the brush and make sure she is caring in long hair with no knots” (C. Kirby, personal communication, August 2, 2021). After analyzing the
photograph with Cora, I described how she was right and reassured her that Sadie’s hair is very long and needs to be cared for because her arms cannot move like ours. In ethics of care, confirming care is the act of affirming and encouraging the best in others; we confirm someone, we spot a better self and encourage its development (Noddings, 2005), which is the encounter that occurred between Cora to Sadie and me to Cora in our exchange during the residency.

**Figure 121.**

*Cora caring for Sadie*

Note: Cora on her own took care of Sadie Girl without asking and I encouraged Cora through the ethics of care component of confirmation.

*Care for the garden is to care for ourselves.* That is a phrase I repeated over and over throughout the residency. In Figure 122, I photographed Andrew very excited about picking the very first cherry tomato from our garden. Figure 122 shows the confirming of
care, as I had never seen Andrew take such good meticulous care for anything as I did in those 17-days of the art residency as he did for the garden. The devotion and dedication Andrew had for the garden daily was incredible to watch.

**Figure 122.**

*Andrew and the first cherry tomato harvest*

*Note:* Andrew patiently watched and cared for the garden as the days went by in the residency, he became a gardener.

As previously mentioned, the vegetable and flower gardens occupied much of our time throughout the residency and I would always make sure that an understanding of the need to care for the garden was just as important because we need to make sure the soil is moist, weeds are pulled, and when our actions of care towards the garden were received, the garden would confirm that care and give us healthy food.
Confirmation: Mothering and Educator

Further being present with my children during the residency, I discovered much about my children's love for me. Reviewing the photographs captured during our time together offered insight into our relationships. In listening to the Photovoice conversations that transpired during the residency, see Figures 123-124, I especially learned a great deal about Cora's love for me. Before the residency, there would be conversations about loving me and me loving her; however, the images created a dialogue unlike I have ever had with Cora about her love for me.

Figures 123-124.

*Images of me taken from Cora, Day 1*

*Note:* In these images captured through the Photovoice method is me and my reaction to Cora as I listened without distraction to her profess her love for me in reviewing the photographs she captured.

Cora describes in Figure 123, “Mama, you are so happy and love me. I like your glasses and the way your chin moves when you show your teeth” (C. Kirby, personal communication, July 14, 2021, 2:14). She next discusses Figure 124, saying, “you were
looking at me like you do, and I love when you look at me with your eyes. You are beautiful, and I love you. You make me happy, and I love you” (C. Kirby, personal communication, July 14, 2021, 2:24). Listening to the audio when interpreting the data, I was brought to tears hearing her voice reveal her heartfelt love for me while critiquing the photograph. In the stillness of a photograph, there was so much movement in energy and emotion as we sat together, and she discussed how much she loves me through critiquing a photograph together. I am blessed to have had that interaction with time stopped while reviewing these photographs that she captured to hear her love for me. Would I have known those words of hers expressed to the depth that she did if this residency never existed? After we reviewed the images and we were done, I hugged her and inhaled her beautiful scent,\(^{30}\) and told her about how much I love her and that my schooling is almost done, as she often talks about how she misses me when I must read or write. That moment of being in the dining room of our home and nothing else mattering in the world but just the precious time of love explored between us brought me back to the sacred time of just her and me together in the hospital room singing, *Cinnamon Girl*, by Neil Young to her as I breastfed her for the first time as she was only minutes old.

**Confirmation: Anti-Childism**

Ethics of care informs the emergent theme of anti-childism as care is centered in my parenting and teaching of Cora's choices in that theme, creating that space of agency

\(^{30}\) Since Cora was a baby, she has always had a potent smell that calms me. Knowing she is my last baby made me quickly identify her with a smell more so than Andrew. Her smell is unique in that it is sweet and makes me happy, and reminds me of her as a baby.
for herself. Anti-childism and an ethics of care resist the notion of being quiet and just being seen, instead welcoming dialogue in creating a space where voices are heard, opinions are received, and transformation is made. Dewey's theory of experience informs the theme of negotiated emergent curriculum as his philosophy in education implies that experience is the primary component in education (Dewey 1938). My children's lived experiences and interests developed their compelling and impactful learning encounters during the residency, as there was knowledge produced and learned from their passions and inquisitiveness. Reconsidering Dewey’s (1938) idea that “educational experience involves continuity and interaction between the learner and what is learned” (p. 10) is precisely what occurred in my children's experiences of discovery. Their interchange of being the learner and what was learned was welcomed and wanted which provided that space of life-long learning Dewey believed constitutes education as life, not preparation for life (Dewey, 1938). The education welcomed by my children from what the residency afforded them was life and an education that was not dictated by time, or a world constricted by a pandemic.

In scrutinizing the data, with guidance from McClure Sweeny, the theme of anti-childism, (see Figure 125) developed. I was aware and could see in the data throughout each theme that there was a feminist pedagogical positioning of no hierarchy in my parenting or in my teaching, the evidence of my ideology was very apparent, yet in the emergent theme of anti-childism my feminist pedagogical beliefs are more robust.
Discussions and learning from McClure Sweeny about anti-childism

Note: McClure Sweeny introduced me to anti-childism, images from McClure during a conversation and messages between us.

However, I needed to learn about anti-childism, which through a feminist research triangulation occurred. She confirmed care by working with me becoming an expert consultant in explaining about childism and what I was employing in the study, anti-childism:

Childism\(^{31}\) is a sum of biases against children and in favor of adults, and the educational system is set up for childism. Still, in your study, you undermine that

\(^{31}\) Childism is the radical notion that kids need to be respected as human beings. It states that despite differences in size, experience and power, adults and children are inherently of equal worth, and that kids’ perspectives and experiences should thus be considered on the same merits as those of adults. Childism could also be defined as the advocacy of the rights of children (Frisell, 2021, para. 1).
notion because you are giving your children that agency. You are learning and responding to them, which is incredible because you must give up that sense of control as the teacher and even as the parent. In your study, you allowed your children to take risks with things that you know will not work, yet you give them that opportunity to discover and learn themselves. In your study, you were open to situations where you did not know what would happen, which is the profound aspect of your work. In education and parenthood, we are encouraged not to let our students or children see us sweat. We are always in control, yet I was so fascinated by how you voluntarily gave up that control during your residency with your children. (M. McClure Sweeny, personal communication, November 1, 2021)

As with many of the emergent themes that developed in the data coding, anti-childism was made most obvious when Andrew did not want to participate in the residency\textsuperscript{32} so I asked Cora if she would like to be with me alone for the day and we could learn and do anything she would want to do. The first thing she decided to do was dress like me.

Andrew and Cora have the freedom to explore whatever attire they wish to wear and with that freedom, Cora normally selects skirts, dresses, and glittered shirts. However, on Day 10, she picked a “Mama Wears” (C. Kirby, personal communication, August 2, 2021) which is reference to my typical attire—jeans with a sweatshirt and Birkenstocks\textsuperscript{®} (Figures 126-128).

\textsuperscript{32} Throughout the residency, Luke and I determined that if Andrew and Cora did not want to participate in the residency on any given day, he or my mother would be with them.
Figures 126-128.

Images of Cora putting on “Mama Wears.”

Note: Cora selecting clothes that resemble my regular attire to look like me.

Cora also wanted to do the things that I normally do, which she is usually always a part of, but our time is usually restrained due to my obligations for writing or reading. Therefore, a trip to the grocery store would typically take 30-minutes but on Day 10, our grocery store adventure lasted two-hours. What seems so minimal in spending time with you child in a grocery store was very powerful for both of us. I took the time to make the grocery store a learning adventure, a school in its own way, as we utilized the many colors and shapes to explore and explain what everything was to her. For example, in Figure 129, Cora is mesmerized by the ability to choose her own toothbrush which is
something I normally would have done for her and grab something quick and move on to the next item on the grocery list.

**Figure 129.**

*Cora selected her own toothbrush at the grocery store*

*Note:* The moment of picking her own toothbrush was amazing for her as she discussed how she couldn’t pick just one as there was so many options.

The learning experience of the trip to the grocery store was different as I usually take the store for granted and don’t look at it as a learning experience but rather a place that can supply what my garden cannot. I write of the experience in the excerpt below:

Mama and Cora day started with the clothes, then to Wegmans. We spent about two hours in the store, she helped me load the cart while shopping. We discussed the colors of our vegetables and how the more color we eat the healthier we will be. I explained the set-up of a grocery store, what cashiers do, the bakery, the pizzeria, the seafood department, and more. She was really engaged with all that I
taught her. The highlight of the time spent in the grocery store was her choosing a new Disney Frozen toothbrush which took nearly 20 minutes for her to decide. I captured that image, otherwise I didn’t capture any, as I was too busy teaching her about the ins and outs of the grocery store. She loved coming to the grocery store with me, I usually go by myself, as I use the time as time away (alone time) where I get to get a nice latte and walk, watch people, listen to the music, and look up different recipes. Some people might find going to the grocery store stressful, I find it as my Zen pot. However, after the experience with Cora, I do believe I will now have a grocery store buddy. When we returned Cora helped me unload the car, put the food away and wouldn’t let me help her, found that to be her declaring agency within herself. To my surprise she knew where everything went. I learned that she pays more attention to my actions and the movements I generate in the kitchen than I realized. (Z. Tredinnick-Kirby, journal excerpt, July 30, 2021)

The whole experience of Day 10 and review of the data allowed me to embrace learning what anti-childism is and that I do in fact offer that place for my children to be equal to me.

I realize that we can co-exist together as people that respect and value each other’s opinion as I do not see myself as the only figure that needs to make the decisions and know everything and do indeed, I learn from my children all the time. Honestly, through this research and dissecting the data, I believe that my values towards my children are a result of the way I was raised. My mother and father never treated me in a demeaning manner but rather encouraged my opinions to speak up for what I believe in and to exist often with them in activities and trips. They never excluded me or my sister
in anything they were doing, which is like the way I parent. I am grateful for the wonderful relationship that I had with my father\textsuperscript{33} and the relationship that I still have with my mother, Eulogia Tredinnick.

As discussed in this chapter, the four components of an ethics of care offered the initial thematic framework for designing the study and analyzing the data; through collaborative inductive analysis with McClure Sweeny, these four guiding themes were complemented by four additional emergent themes. Taken together, modeling, dialogue, practice, confirmation, mothering/educator, identity, negotiated emergent curriculum, and anti-childism reflected throughout the data of our art residency characterize my own emerging modifications of an ethics of care. In the final chapter, I articulate the findings these themes elucidate, elaborate the ways in which our emergent curriculum modified Noddings’s ethics of care, and offer implications of this study.

\textsuperscript{33} My dearest father, Dennis Lee Tredinnick, passed away in 2013.
In the final chapter of my dissertation, I present findings in relation to the research question that motivated my study. With ethics of care at the heart of my study, I discuss what I found from my thematic and narrative analyses. I conclude the chapter with implications of my study for policy, pedagogy, and further research. Ultimately, the insights from my study serve both as example and encouragement for infusing care and learning in feminist pedagogy through art education.

In accordance with Noddings’s four key components of an ethics of care: *modeling, dialogue, practice, and confirmation*, I discuss four significant ethics of care themes guiding the research and my pedagogical introspection in the residency. Individually, McClure Sweeny and I identified emergent themes, which when brought together began to triangulate data to illuminate shared and divergent perspectives and reflect a commitment to thoroughness (Banes, 2020). In addition, dialogue between us uncovered unique dimensions of the data, most notably mothering/educator, identity, emergent negotiated curriculum, and anti-childism. Furthermore, these emergent themes speak to the feminist collaborative triangulation in data coding, thus facilitating richer and potentially more valid interpretations (Barnes 2020) and enriching the discoveries my children and I made about ourselves—our own identities—and our relationships with each other.
I reflect on these emergent themes and discoveries in revisiting the original shaping of my research question with Nel Noddings. In posing those challenging questions that Nel offered, the focus became clear that Andrew and Cora would lead the day's curriculum, and I would examine my pedagogical inquiry from an ethics of care application. These themes of the negotiated emergent curriculum and my pedagogical inquiry answered my research question: *What art education curriculum and pedagogical experiences will emerge from exploring four key components of Nel Noddings's ethics of care (i.e., modeling, dialogue, practice, and confirmation) within a 17-day home-based feminist teaching art residency conceptualized with my 4- and 7-year-old children?* Nel Noddings's ethics of care is within each of the thematic dimensions discussed in Chapter 4. Sometimes the care was evident to me, but other times, through vulnerability and the eyes of my children, care revealed itself in unexpected ways.

The purpose of this study was to consider how a feminist teaching art residency might produce introspection of pedagogy in art education and encourage an emergent curriculum that generates art educational encounters through teaching Nel Noddings’s four key components of an ethics of care. I believe that my research design and a pedagogy inclusion of care are imperative for our current moment in life and education experiencing, adapting to, and surviving the COVID-19 pandemic.

At the heart of this study was care and what emerged were further materializations and expressions of care between human relationships and care for human relationships with materials, nature, and the future. The study is timely and relevant in that it advocates for a rethinking of the purpose of school in an epoch of global pandemic and climate change. The pandemic has divided many of us—pedagogically,
ideologically, physically, and geographically—by plexiglass barriers, face masks, and forced virtual interaction. What the residency-during-pandemic and my study’s implications echo is the:

need to re-think and re-imagine the human place in nature. This is one of the most pressing tasks set for artists, educators, and other cultural actors today. There is precedent for the hope that the arts can contribute to the task of re-interpreting our relationship to the natural world. (King & Hicks, 2007, pp. 332 & 333).

Many during the pandemic have turned to nature and art, and as our art residency has shown, care, when placed at the center of all our relationships, can “maintain, continue, and repair our world—our interwoven bodies, selves and environment” (Millner & Coombs, 2021, p. 1). As such, I see art education centering around care as integral to safely and generatively moving through and beyond this COVID-19 time.

In this dissertation, I have conceptualized and facilitated a feminist teaching art residency that includes children's passions which generate curriculum, dismantles the exclusivity of residencies, and encourages participatory artmaking where the art educator co-creates with students or children. In addition, my research provides contemplation on the juxtaposition of titles, for example, the mother and the educator, and dismantles the normalcy of what art residencies usually propose—my work further aligns that juxtaposition to the art educator and the artist in the unprecedented innovation of a classroom being a residency where there is a partnership, and no separation between learning and artmaking.

Further, with encouraging our students, we must be empathic to them. Empathy was evident throughout the residency, as we listened with care to each other and engaged
in thoughtful spontaneous dialogue about our feelings with one another. Empathy is entangled within the four key components of an ethics of care. A feminist teaching art residency connects the educator to the student on a deeper level in understanding through care. I can say with certainty that through my research, an ethics of care has provided deeper insights about Andrew than prior to the residency as I was present and focused on his learning and we learned collaboratively. Also, Andrew, at his young age of 8 years old, understood of caring for others and caring for himself, as evident from my analysis of the data collected from the residency.

Additionally, through data coding correlating to the component of confirmation in an ethics of care was the emergent theme of anti-childism, which suggests an obligation to respect children. As I experienced moments of surprised and generative vulnerability and learning alongside my children’s agential activities, we have much to learn and acknowledge about the feelings, experiences, and learning needs of children, especially important in the midst and wake of COVID-19 to confirm care through anti-childism. As advocated and practiced anti-childism in the art residency reveals that children’s experiences of living with and through COVID-19 are valuable and deserve our respect and consideration, which confirms care in respecting our children. Some may espouse theories that purport children are resilient or protected from macro social concerns affecting the adults. The ways in which anti-childism was woven through all four of the key components of my ethics of care and feminist pedagogy strongly indicate otherwise. Presciently, McClure Sweeny mused upon these connections in my study design and findings, stating: “I hope people living the pandemic life will take the initiative and look at this moment and consider the questions you are posing; your research is very timely”
(M. McClure Sweeny, personal communication, October 6, 2021). The application of an ethics of care to education and the space of a residency design—one that focuses on my children's passions in generating an emergent curriculum—brought rich interdisciplinary educational encounters to a lifelong learning experience, which connects to Dewey’s belief that education is life, not preparation for life (Dewey 1938).

Moreover, in my analysis of the inductive process of interpreting the data characterizing the experiences of my children and me, I have shown that applying an ethics of care to self and pedagogy affords a vital presence of deep care that informs teaching and the human soul. As I shared in the Prologue, the spark that ignited this study was my son’s wish to learn in an unconventional way—it was his vision that charted the theoretical direction of this research, further awakening my feminist pedagogy, prompting the design of our art residency, and cultivating learning through a feminist approach to an ethics of care. In what follows, I interpret the main findings of this study resulting from my son’s catalyzing exercise of his own agency and desire for learning. Then, I move to consider the implications of the study’s findings and its uniqueness as a feminist teaching art residency. The through-line of this study, its findings, and its implications is care. Care is modeled by the carer, organically discussed through dialogue between the carer and the cared-for, practiced by the cared-for, and affirmed through confirmation of the cared-for.
Interpretation of Findings

The findings of this study hold care at their core and begin to modify the initial theoretical framing of Nel Noddings’s four components of an ethics of care. Through my analysis, several findings emerged:

Separation of Identities:
Art residencies do not need to separate art, education, student, and/or place to cultivate meaningful learning experiences for children.

Care in Art:
Care as a pedagogical orientation infused with art experiences brings visibility to child agency and their lived experience.

Dismantling Hierarchical Restraints:
In taking the direction of children seriously, learning and the passion of wonder evolve and move uninhibited by hierarchical restraints.

PAR’s Fostering:
Participatory Action Research fosters agency, reciprocity, and surprising reflection and unanticipated learning throughout data analysis.
Significantly, these findings address and resist the problems of one-size-fits-all education models, the underdevelopment of feminist pedagogy in art education, the egregious lack of scholarship and attention to homeschooling realities and potentials that motivated this study and art residency design, and the disruption of the solo journey design in art residencies.

The interpretation of my analysis presented as findings provides a visibility of lived experiences of self through art and care, a recognition that art residencies do not have to separate the art, the educator, student, or place. Through my analysis, the nurturing of creative growth through interdisciplinary curriculum challenged thinking and demonstrated that anything is possible in learning with passion and applying care to guide pedagogical encounters. For example, in the egg study on Day 3, my children and I experienced being in our house as scientists and inventors, moving then to being inquisitive about grades in an educational system, next talking about my childhood experiences in an egg drop, subsequently engaging together in a textural study of the albumin,34 and then finally adventuring outside out of our curiosity of the Earth's warmth and willingness to investigate its ability to cook scrambled eggs on a tree stump. The residency offered a place for the passion of wonder to evolve from one aspect to another in a blink of an eye without the restraint of educational standard mandates. Yet, this discovery through the findings aligns in care, as care to the cared-for provides a space for discovery situated in that learning experience. It is important to note that while coding the data and analyzing the layers and patterns that emerged, pedagogy was always entangled

34 The white component of an egg that has a viscous substance which contains proteins.
among each theme, never alone. Accordingly, I did not deem an exclusive theme of pedagogy. McClure Sweeny, however, and I maintain that pedagogy was persistent within each theme, especially prevalent and visible in Figures 53-55 of Cora caring for Ms. Alice as I had modeled care discussed in dialogue throughout the residency, practiced and confirmed in that instance.

The most significant finding for me as a mother was the experience of letting go that was initiated by my son during the residency at the ocean. That pivotal moment shifted my fear of the ocean and the approach I had to parent. As I remained focused on aligning my parenting and educating with the ethics of care, in applying Noddings’s theory, one must not have a predetermined mindset, but rather an openness in receiving the cared-for thoughts (Noddings, 2005). I did just that and considered Andrew’s intentions of wanting to be free from a vest and explore the ocean in a way he always wanted to, not according to my way of exploring the ocean. McClure Sweeny speaks of that moment with a critical lens: “I see how the structure of the ethics of care and the residency provided you with the safety that you needed in order to be vulnerable and to let go” (M. McClure Sweeny, personal communication, November 4, 2021). As this moment shows, an ethics of care not only asks for vulnerability from educators but also supplies unexpected learning for them if educators openly position themselves accordingly.

Of the findings from the inductive theme of negotiated emergent curriculum—a term that developed through the analysis of the data—I discerned a necessity to be directed by my children as the curriculum is more invigorating if there is a desire to learn instead of a demand to learn. When one craves that learning, the knowledge increases and
stays, which is something I witnessed in the residency with my children. There was no prescribed curriculum in the residency. And yet, in interpreting the findings, it became clear that there was a remarkable amount learned in those 17-days that even still exceeds my imagination; such an incredible amount of erudition and self-discovery might be possible, taught, or investigated in a public-school environment, too, if the directive and imitative comes from the children pushing for their passion to be the curriculum.

Feminist pedagogy transpired in the art residency in the situated space incorporating nonhierarchical, while modeling care and agency to both male and female children as they interpret their agency. For example, in making the Bigfoot silhouettes, Cora declared that my Bigfoot must wear high heels; however, I do not wear high heels. The reflection of that moment providing a place where feminist pedagogy thrived was in my Day 4 journal entry, “This analyzation is deep, I know, yet I just wonder. I talked with her a little about how girls/women do not need to wear high heels; however, if they want to, they can. She smiled, that’s all, and went back to painting” (Z. Tredinnick-Kirby, journal excerpt, July 16, 2021). I utilized that moment to teach Cora how someone does not need to wear high heels to fit that gender constructs, rather someone’s choice.

Another example of how our art residency exhibits feminist pedagogy is when Andrew, on Day 7, “asked if we could be in the kitchen today as he enjoys cooking. He wanted to look up recipes with me and talk about what foods he likes and what are healthy foods” (Z. Tredinnick-Kirby, journal excerpt, July 22, 2021). The stereotypical gender placement within the kitchen discussions is often related to women, yet, offering that place where Andrew enabled his growth and passion for exploring cooking and not limited to the socialized gender boundaries. Further, these examples also offer insight
into the interplay of indoor and outdoor learning while evidence of feminist pedagogy in
teaching was constant throughout the residency.

Additionally, the emotions explored throughout the residency offered further
growth in identity as many organic discussions and experiential learnings occurred. These
emergent moments sparked a more profound investigative nature in what my children
liked and disliked or wanted to explore more in depth. Offering a safe place for emotions
to be explored through art made for the tangible exploration of fingers to canvas, fingers
to wood, and fingers to yolk. The artmaking discoveries provided opportunities to
reconceptualize our pre-residency thoughts and look beyond ourselves and what we knew
in discovering new techniques in mediums of art from paint to wood. The residency
design afforded an emotion of presence, as the knowing and feeling of being present
occurred throughout the entirety of the residency from my children and myself. The
impact of the design of the residency suggests the value of presence of artist and educator
and the presence of artist and student for other research and educational endeavors.

Along with emotions, I cannot help but consider the vulnerability that I hold as
the insider-researcher when examining all that arose from the study—the deepening
closeness of my children and me after the residency in understanding ourselves
differently than before the residency. I was able to pause from the life of a doctoral
student and solely focus on the time with my children with being present the whole time.
The residency gave us time to discover each other further in a more profound capacity
through artmaking and implementing ethics of care through the four key components.
The residency afforded me time with my children away from life, as the residencies I
researched in giving that undivided time for artists to create. I invested unending time
with my children, making art and learning their passions as they formed the curriculum. Further, my children observed my love of photography and art through *The Kitchen Series*, which primarily was a participatory encounter with my son. I modeled the manual process of photography using a 35mm camera and setting up the scene, teaching him about the process. Lastly, Photovoice gave us all a voice in the residency, yet pertaining to the invigorating kindling of my passion for photography, the data collection method of Photovoice provided the opportunity to let my photographs narrate my emotions in, *The Day After* series. Further, Photovoice as a method and PAR as a methodology beautifully aligned with the theoretical grounding of an ethics of care as we collaborated, discussed the photographs, and applied care throughout our 17-days together.

**Implications and Recommendations for Future Research with Noddings’s Ethics of Care Theory**

My research is relevant to our current times of educating at home especially in enduring a pandemic and its affects such as the shifts in education and displacement of places of formal education. The study offers a residency model that amplifies the strengths of one’s position as a parent—and in turn, an educator in their own right—and the value of the home as a site of comfort, care, and learning. In the pandemic era, children have been and, in many places, continue to be at home for their formal learning as institutions from early childhood learning centers to university classrooms pivoted to online instruction. While not the same as homeschooling, COVID-19 has forced parents to be involved in their children’s schooling in vastly different and diverse ways. A recent federal bill, introduced in November 2021, the Build Back Better Act, recognizes the
importance of parents in their children’s education and seeks to repair much of the 
economic and social damage wreaked by COVID-19 and exacerbated by the utter lack of 
federal policy and support for early childhood education and childcare.

The Build Back Better Act (BBB) seeks to provide much-needed assistance in the 
childcare sector. BBB was devised out of the recognition that in the United States—a 
country whose economy and culture expects both parents to work—the realities of 
economic status and marginalization mean that parents often recruit other family 
members, friends, neighbors paid or unpaid to help in watching their children. Some 
affluent families might even hire nannies, some send their children to private day care 
centers. According to Propkop, (2021):

The plan aims to help millions of families with children under age 6 get 
affordable childcare for the first time, funding most or all of the cost of their care 
at licensed providers. The bill would also steer an influx of federal cash to boost 
wages for childcare workers and spur the opening or expansion of childcare 
facilities (para. 1).

My feminist art residency model and the findings gleaned from this research share in 
BBB’s prioritization of family and the role parents, home learning, and well-supported 
caring professionals can have in young children’s lives.

Both my study and BBB advocate anti-childism through a shared investment in 
caring for and respecting how children learn in diverse ways beyond the traditional 
purview of classroom-centered and teacher-directed education. Proponents of the bill 
express how with its passing “we are one step closer to giving our children a bright and 
healthy future that we can be proud to pass down” (Hescox & Moerman, 2021, para. 1).
The BBB’s phased-in federal investments in childcare and pre-K beginning in FY2022—would have addressed access, affordability, and quality in early learning—and could support an ethics of care as moral education for all children (Guarino, 2021). The implementation of an ethics of care in a feminist teaching art residency evidenced in my study would be possible for all children with such nation-wide investments, which could enable parents to enact the four key components of Noddin’s ethics of care within an emergent curriculum attentive to children's inquiries.

My study’s findings also have immediate implications for educators and their efforts developing inclusive and responsive pedagogies. Through my study’s commitment to an ethics of care teaching, I’ve shown how feminist teaching art residencies give agency to children's curriculum of art encounters as the learning of care for place, environment, and interrelationships within the residency. In the residency, I was able to slow down and learn alongside my children, an experience McClure Sweeny notes commenting on my journal entries “is not something talked about very often” as the “typical structure of teaching does not give very much time, space, or value to slowing down enough to experience these moments” (personal communication, September 20, 2021). The ethics of care practiced in the residency shifted my pedagogical positioning to a learner alongside my children as we waited on an egg to cook outside or figured out how to carve together. This experience of slowing down and being-with, in McClure Sweeny’s perspective, “is where the ethics of care is so revolutionary” (personal communication, September 20, 2021).

While educators in formal classroom settings might not be able to experience the same slowing of time as I did with my children walking the paths at Dutch Lane, they can
find ways appropriate to their contexts to modify an ethics of care. The finding of recognizing when to be led by children is most applicable for educators hoping to adopt a pedagogy infused with an ethics of care. In following the cues and the interests of children in a classroom activity, for example, educators can practice an ethics of care that respects and prioritizes children's agency. The educator can share children's interests and expand them into “teachable moments” (M. McClure Sweeny, personal communication, September 20, 2021), as my children and I did collaboratively in our residency. The residency brought about opportunities for care and collaboration with my children, but ethics of care in this way is not limited to the setting of a teaching residency. In short, Noddings’s ethics of care is an ethics of resistance to the typical hierarchical classroom structures, prescribed learning models, and restrictions on children's learning time and agency. Noddings’s ethics of care is feminist pedagogy, in that there is that resistance to oppressive structures of power and privilege and discriminatory stereotyping of gender roles.

As I’ve discussed, the art residency offered agency to my children through a design that encouraged my children’s passions and an emergent curriculum in ways that Noddings described meant they might “feel that they are at least in charge of their own education” (N. Noddings, personal communication, April 22, 2021, 24:49). At stake for educators, too, is how the learning I did alongside my children impacted the way I understood myself as a mother, educator, and an artist. In my journaling for Day 9, for example, I reflected on the moments I shared with my children learning about fingerprints and fingerprinting:
You want to know what I love about this residency; is I am learning at the same time, oftentimes, and it comes to our minds at the same time. It’s beautiful to learn together like we are and the emergence of learning and art that is being created. (Z. Tredinnick-Kirby, journal excerpt, July 29, 2021)

What transpired in moments like these and is reflected in my data is the way I was able to reflect and consider the impact of our learning on both myself and my children.

Reflections, such as my journals entries, are not standard practice for educator preparation or evaluation. Similarly, I was able to reflect on the components of an ethics of care that I adopted for the art residency while experiencing my own and my children’s learning. In the following excerpt, I reproduce my journal entry in full to demonstrate the pedagogical reflections I conducted during the art residency:

**Modeling:** Acts of care for the garden, every morning we take a walk and express the beauty of nature and the respect that I model for our earth and site. I model this through the act of this daily, expressing care and love. At the point in our residency today when Andrew had a breakdown over the lines and drawings, I calmly expressed my lived experiences and offered for that to sink in, and when the time was right for him, he took the understanding that lines mean nothing in art, working outside the line is okay.

**Dialogue:** Constant asking Andrew and Cora about the occurrences at that moment. How they are feeling. Their experience with Photovoice since it is a new encounter for them to experience. Since the residency is emergent and based on
an experiential approach to education, an open dialogue is so important to see how all participants are doing within the residency.

**Practice:** In reflecting on our day, I felt I practiced a positive attitude throughout my actions outside and inside. There was the typical hugging and kissing of my children as that is normal in our household and I will not change from that for this residency. If anything, more discussion on why that is practiced in our home will occur more. However, we tell each other we love each other all the time, this is a normal occurrence in our household.

**Confirmation:** Today the images of bees, beetles, the two of them embracing shows the care of nature, life, earth, and each other. (Z. Tredinnick, journal excerpt, July 13, 2021)

In her review of this entry, McClure Sweeny expressed her appreciation for this kind of reflection (personal communication, September 21, 2021). The study’s finding of not separating art, educator, student, and place means that for educators who are a part of their students’ learning experiences, practicing similar reflective exercises might be transformative to the way they understand and practice care. My journal entries like these focus on the ways I related to the ethics of care components, my feminist pedagogy, and the emergent curriculum. Reflection as I practiced in the residency might be transformational for educational preparation and educator evaluation; instead of “standard kinds of reflective exercises that focus on the curriculum as separate from the
Teacher education and evaluation can center around care as relational practice.

Future research might build from the uniqueness and ambition of my study to continue discovering how an ethics of care in teaching might foster pedagogical insights and emergent learning experiences for and directed by children. First, future studies might contend with what I have been calling an adaptation or modification of Noddings’s ethics of care theory and moving toward an ethics of care in resistance. The interest in this possibility was something McClure Sweeney and I discussed when I found that analyzing my data did not just mean application of the theory of an ethics of care to my pedagogy, but also an application of that ethics theory in learning with my children. The research was just as much about me and my experiences as it was about my children and what they experienced during the residency. The duality of that finding was not just the teacher and mother; it became a complex sociology. I used Noddings’s principles as a guide at the onset of the residency, but the emergent themes of mothering/educator, identity, emergent negotiated curriculum, and anti-childism expand and modify those foundational principles of an ethics of care.

In the context of my study, the modifications, and ethics of resistance I identified with McClure Sweeney’s guidance were undergirded by the idea of home. Home, of course, overlaps with Noddings’s four components of an ethics of care but in our residency, contributed to an ethics of resistance as the site of the residency, our home Dutch Lane, revealed the home as a cultural and social site of learning. As homeschooling parents know, the home as a learning site “doesn’t have to be this academic way of learning all day, every day. They learn from watching us cook,
watching how we treat each other. It doesn’t have to be sitting down at a table with pen and paper” (Hamilton, 2022, para. 9). The impact of home in our residency enacted an ethics of resistance intricately woven with the four guiding components of an ethics of care. That is, the ethics of care enacted throughout the residency is ground in relational and philosophical ethics of morality; the ethics of resistance that emerged within the residency worked with care principles in a way that aligned with Noddings’s feminist theory, the ethics of care approach by specifically engaging in relational ethics with young children. In short, my feminist pedagogical approach in the teaching art residency was based in an ethics of care but enacted an ethics of resistance. By engaging in relational ethics with my young children and sharing agency and power with them, care mobilized an ethics of resistance, which resists the prescribed standardized one-size-fits-all curriculum. The emergent presence of an ethics of resistance coinciding with ethics of care invites future studies to address the complex sociology of learning emplaced in home that is interconnected.

Further, as McClure Sweeny commented on my journaling at the end of the residency, the structure of the ethics of care and the residency provided me “with the safety that [I] needed to be vulnerable and to let go” (personal communication, November 4, 2021). Future studies might explore “what kinds of supports might offer educators the psychological and emotional safety necessary to take such leaps together with children” (McClure Sweeny, 2021). It is imperative that there is a better understanding on the psychological and emotional tolls, as well as the conditions safely enabling or constraining vulnerability, so that educators feel prepared to make such pedagogical alignments.
In this dissertation, I have conceptualized and facilitated a feminist teaching art residency that includes children's passions which generate curriculum, dismantles the exclusivity of residencies, and encourages participatory artmaking where the art educator co-creates with students or children. Many of the implications I consider here necessitate commitment and self-work from educators. I acknowledge the constraints and demands—physical, emotional, mental, financial, and time—placed on educators. Thus, future research might contend with how the education implications I have discussed of slowing down and being-with children in learning moments and pedagogical and relational reflection practices might be supported as such specific aspects of the residency are important to implementation. The residency design offers a collectivity for art educators and students to experience in their studio classrooms as an action of feminist praxis. This is novel in the sense that art educators would not have to request sabbatical to attend an art residency, rather, they would teach through an art residency in their classrooms where they create alongside students. Further, our residency provided a place of nonlinear learning, where passions generated the curriculum. Deep learning became possible through the uninterrupted interdisciplinary serendipitous pathways of how we learned and created together. Application within a public school’s studio classroom would model an art residency where students, as the artists, would find their strengths in exploring different mediums in creating art relevant to their lived experiences.

Art educators and schools could benefit from such a unique approach to teaching art through co-producing with students, sharing the expertise of art skills derived from teachers’ educational past, bringing in the theory of experience to teaching and teaching from a feminist pedagogical position in care. Educators would not need to separate the
love of artmaking; instead, they could teach through care in artmaking with their students in a residency environment where all participants in the studio classroom are artists and make from their lived experiences. The deepness in their educational experience would be of life-long learning as the residency model would provide an education that is life, not preparing the students for life.

Additionally, my research offers a fascinating discussion in contributing to educational discourse given the uniqueness and innovation of the residency design that can be implemented in classrooms aligning within similarities to a Teaching for Artistic Behavior (TAB) design method within the art classroom, however, slightly different. Frequently within the TAB classroom, the art educator is still the educator and not the artist; my residency design, however, would involve the teacher as an artist along with all the other student artists co-creating in the same space. This is the radical shift and change necessary to implement my residency design within a classroom in an educational setting. From my experience as an Advanced Placement (AP) photography art educator and visually implementing my residency design within my classroom, I can see how my students could understand their work on a deeper level as they would create an art portfolio of the required 29 works of art from their lived experiences versus being told what to create within the rigor of the curriculum. Students would feel more compelled and demonstrate more interest in their portfolios. There would be complete agency as they could decide what works are selected, learn from me as I discuss my portfolio, and experience a deepness creating alongside one another. My insight and their perspicuity while participating in the residency might kindle for my students an unexplored rendition of themselves rather than a regard for the portfolio process as daunting and stressful.
Along with the stresses of constructing a portfolio, the stress of the educator in the room was present from my background; thus, my residency design dismantles hierarchy as creation would be a collective.

Closely related to studying educator supports necessary for enacting an ethics of care in their pedagogy is the need for future studies concerning the ways pre-service educators are prepared to enter their classrooms. For example, after employing Participatory Action Research (PAR) methodologies and methods of data collection like Photovoice, I am inspired to integrate these methodologies and technologies into my teacher education courses I teach at The College of New Jersey, that valuable method of collecting within a pedagogical setting could inspire pre-service educator to utilize methods of PAR and Photovoice in their classrooms. Studies researching how to implement PAR and Photovoice into educator preparation courses and their effects would greatly enrich the efficacy and enactment of an ethics of care. Of the potential for researching the application of Photovoice with education students, McClure Sweeny imagined our possible collaboration of “a kind of workshop for families to learn how to use that process together” (M. McClure Sweeny, personal communication, November 4, 2021). Given the abundance of rich data generated with your children through Photovoice, future research could explore the “grass-roots community-based” (effects of Photovoice applications with families (M. McClure Sweeny, personal communication, November 4, 2021).

As an art educator and a mother, I hope my dissertation demonstrates a sincere encouragement for art educators and homeschool families to examine their pedagogical and theoretical positioning aligning in care. As McClure Sweeny mentions of her
experience in education and working with me in deciphering the data, she claims, “When I was reading your reflections, I kept thinking, this is a space that I wish I had as a teacher, yet schools do not offer that structure your study occupied” (M. McClure Sweeny, personal communication, October 6, 2021). She notes that “schools do not offer the space for educators to even get to know their students as I learned from your study and the deeper connection you have with your children” (M. McClure Sweeny, personal communication, October 6, 2021). Hence in my study, I bring that visibility and encourage art educators to examine their pedagogy and place as a residency. I achieved such a transformation, in my research and my teaching through an ethics of care, which can revolutionize education; it is my hope that art educators might benefit from my modeling of care, discussed through dialogue, practiced, and confirmed.
References


https://www.europeanmedical.info/feminist-research/triangulation.html

Barr, J. (1999). Feminist pedagogy as a corrective to patriarchal models of caring (pp. 136-181). National Institute of Adult Continuing Education (NIACE)


https://my.vanderbilt.edu/femped/


http://dx.doi.org.ezaccess.libraries.psu.edu/10.1186/s12889-018-5335-7


https://www.britannica.com/topic/ethics-of-care


https://www.scribbr.com/methodology/thematic-analysis/


https://www.deirdrecolganjones.com/#/art-in-place/


https://kuscholarworks.ku.edu/bitstream/handle/1808/26468/EKEN_ku_0099D_15682_DATA_1.pdf?sequence=1


http://uir.unisa.ac.za/bitstream/handle/10500/2010/06chapter5.pdf

https://tocaboca.com/magazine/childism-definition/


https://news.artnet.com/art-world/art-demystified-artist-residencies-649592


https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jU_2-4SR-gk


Photovoice worldwide. (2020). *What is Photovoice?*

http://www.photovoice worldwide.com/what_is_photovoice.htm#sthash.980tDX1p.dpbo


https://www.vox.com/2021/12/13/22799436/build-back-better-senate-manchin-parliamentarian


https://iep.utm.edu/care-eth/#H2


https://doi.org/10.1007/0-387-36218-5_2


https://repository.upenn.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1015&context=od_these_s_mp


APPENDIX A

Reference of Artist Residencies

Shared Characteristics: Artist Residencies (10)

1. The Luminary: The fully funded residency provides dedicated time and support in artists collaborating. The residency supports a contemporary artistic practice that advances a unique concept to approach material and engages with the community. The residency focuses on innovative forms and unconventional structures, publications, and artist-led projects with experimentation. Themes are encouraged as artists are considered collaborators and co-thinkers and take an active role in the conversation. The residency often invites many of the artists back to extend their art with support from The Luminary. http://theluminaryarts.com/programs/residency-program

2. 18th Street: Located in Santa Monica, CA, 18th Street Residency offers a diverse residency program with a selection of different types, listed above, ranging from one to three months and lasting more than three years. Founded in 1988, their mission is to “provoke public dialogue through contemporary artmaking” (18thstreet.org, 2020, p.1). The residency has seen more than 500 artists from around the world since it began. The presence of the residency has created a positive dialogue with Los Angeles. https://18thstreet.org/about/

3. Recology Residency: Is a month-long residency where artists make art but also partake in an educational program for King County artists only, which is located in San Francisco, CA. The educational aspect of this residency also encourages the artists to speak to school groups and adult tour groups about their experience working with recycled materials. The residency offers a monthly stipend, studio space where artists must spend 20 hours a week, and recycled materials. Recology wants to encourage people through the residency to conserve natural resources and promote new ways of thinking about art and the environment together as artists work with only recycled materials. At the end of the residency, there is an exhibition to exhibit the artist's work along with the artists contributing one piece for permanent collection promoting recycling and reusing. https://www.recology.com/recology-cleanscapes/seattle/artist-in-residence/
4. **Archie Bray Foundation for the ceramic arts**: The Archie Bray Foundation is a ceramic arts center founded in 1951 by brickmaker Archie Bray and is a registered National Historic Landmark located in Helena, Montana. Many of the artists who come to Archie Bray develop their portfolio for graduate school, although some use the time during the residency to transition from school to studio. In contrast, others use the residency as a chance to escape from daily routine and recharge their creative side. Archie Bray is a community residency where the collaboration of working with other artists is encouraged. The residency ranges from a couple of months up to two years. [http://archiebray.org](http://archiebray.org)

---

5. **Art Farm**: Fifteen studios for multidisciplinary artists are located on 60 acres of the Art Farm Residency located in Nebraska. Founded in 1993, the residency's unique quality is the work-exchange program where you work 12 hours a week for your stay at the residency around the farm; the residency is free with the work agreement. This may include working on the buildings, tractors, or the land. There is no specific project that artists need to complete; however, as part of the residency, one piece of work created during the time the artist is on the farm is donated to the permanent collection. [https://www.artfarmnebraska.org/residency.html](https://www.artfarmnebraska.org/residency.html)

---

6. **The Corning Museum of Glass** - Residencies of one to two artists at a time take place at The Corning Museum of Glass, spending one whole month from March to November at the studio exploring glass making and creating from the world's leading glass museum. At the end of the residency, the artists give individual presentations about their work to the public for free in the lecture room, creating an educational space for the community. The residency is completely funded, including travel. The Corning Museum of Glass residency's unique quality is that there are three different residencies to be selected for: David Whitehouse Research Residency for Artists, Black, Indigenous, and People of Color Residency, and Specialty Glass Residency. [https://www.cmog.org/glassmaking/studio/residencies/artists-residence-studio](https://www.cmog.org/glassmaking/studio/residencies/artists-residence-studio)

---

7. **Creative Alliance Residency**: Located in the historic movie theater in downtown Baltimore, building, Patterson, offers an intense creative space for the creation of artwork in all media. For one to three years, eight emerging or mid-career artists are accepted to reinvigorate their work. Artists are expected to present to the community a major project. The residency offers diverse connections, with studio visits from professional artists, and professional opportunities in the surrounding area. This is a fully funded residency of all amenities. [https://www.creativealliance.org/programs/artist-residency](https://www.creativealliance.org/programs/artist-residency)
8. Dieu Donné: Dieu Donné was founded in 1976 by Susan Gosin and Bruce Wineberg to explore the protentional of hand papermaking as art. Solely a hand papermaking residency, this non-profit residency was founded in 1990 to provide a place in Brooklyn, NY to New York-based visual artists for five days with a $500.00 stipend. The residency concludes with an exhibition. Each artist accepted into the residency is paired with a master papermaker, creating unique collaborative artwork; experimentation is highly encouraged. No students will be accepted while they are in regular semester courses, only in the summer months. https://www.dieudonne.org/workspace

9. Houston Center for Contemporary Craft Residency: Focused around craft, the residency supports emerging, mid-career, and established artists working in all craft media. A juried selection is held yearly to select an artist for a three to twelve month-long fully funded residency along with a living stipend. Artists also can assign to teaching assignments and collaborate on work with artists if they desire, while ongoing professional development is available and enrichment programs. Artists also can participate in a joint artist talk and display work outside of their studios. https://crafthouston.org/artists/residents/apply-to-program/

10. The Mattress Factory Residency: Residencies range from one to two months, averaging three to four weeks; the artists determine their length of stay. Founded in 1977 and located in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, artists who work with site-specific installation worldwide are encouraged to apply, and the museum’s curators select the resident artists. The museum staff works closely with the artists to plan each project. The residency includes material cost, staff project support, marketing and publicity, photo documentation, transportation to and from Pittsburg, on-site housing, per diem, and honorarium. https://mattressfactory.submittable.com/submit

Distinctions: Feminist Artist Residencies (10)

11. Artist Working Residency: Rebecca Kautz, a feminist contemporary artist, created a full year in-home residency in which she wore the same uniform that was deemed on the back, Artist Working. She did not wash this piece for the entire year, as clothing becomes the art. Connecting this act as a sense of isolation. The residency was purely out of creating living art, transforming to seeing her life as a process-oriented durational performance. Kautz states of residency, “life as a continual, persistent process of self-discovery and becoming. Making myself vulnerable for the time and visible” (Kautz, 2016, p. 1).
https://www.rebeccakautz.com/blog-artist-working
12. Centre Pompadour: History is encompassed in the building where the residency occurs, located on the cliffs of France in a tiny village called, Ercourt. As the website states, “Centre Pompadour is a feminist dream come true of applied inclusive feminism. It is an artist-run and non-for-profit organization” (Centrepompadour.com, 2020). The projects at Pompadour place gender equality and feminist empowerment at the heart of the creative process and outreach. To be considered for this four-month, six-artist residency, you must be a creative professional, a graduate student in research fields of art, feminism, and or gender studies. The residency fee is equivalent to $793.08 per week, including room and board, food, studio space, and transportation.
https://www.centrepompadour.com/english/

13. There’s Something Going On In There: Missy King & Karen Keifer-Boyd, Eugene, OR. 1987: In the early 1980s, feminist artists, educators, and mothers, Missy (Janine) King and Karen Keifer-Boyd, converted the oldest fish hatchery in Oregon, no longer in use as a fish hatchery, into a studio and gallery where they taught classes and workshops. King and Keifer-Boyd traded childcare five days each week for a six-hour period of time so that King (potter) and Keifer-Boyd (painter) could create their art.

14. Feminist Art Collective: Located in Toronto, FAC is a two-week residency where multidisciplinary artists concentrate on rape, culture, trans-phobia, racism, violence, media presentation, cultural appropriation, environmental degradation and impact on Indigenous lands, violence against women, and Islamophobic policies (Artscape, 2020). The cost to attend FAC is $1450.00 for private accommodations and $1250.00 for shared accommodations; however, there is the opportunity to get funded through a grant proposal submission. The residency offers private individual studio time and group discussions, dinners, film, guest speakers, and group critiques. At the end of the exhibition, the artists will display their work in a group exhibition.

15. Ways: A feminist artist residency for women and queer artists located in Hungary that is self-directed and a place of rest. “Ways offers a space outside of the city and away from regular routines for artists to delve into work or take a break” (Ways.house.org, 2020, p.1). The residency focuses on solitude and comfort in creating art; however, the space can accommodate up to two artists at a time if requested. The place is prepared for independent living; the selected artists do not need to propose a project for their residency or even produce anything during their stay. The residency does allow partners and children if space is available, an additional fee may be necessary to cover amenities. The residency does supply lodging, workspace, and basic cooking supplies.
16. Mentoring Artists for Women’s Art MAWA: MAWA is an urban, loft-style apartment located in Canada for women and non-binary visual artists. The residency is a place for research, reflection, networking, and production. The residency is completely free, with all accommodations covered. The residency lists the accommodations, which are in-depth as listed in the picture above on the right of the dining area and bedroom. The expectation while at MAWA is to present your work to the members of the organization, and you will be paid $316.00 for your presentation, so you get paid while you are there working. The MAWA residency program is intended to increase dialogue between geographical communities on issues dealing with feminism. 
https://mawa.ca/about/history

17. Kentucky Foundation for Women KFW: During the summer, a three-month long-duration hosting a week-long feminist residency in the Hopscotch House was founded in 2006 and offers a place for diverse feminist social change and activism to occur for feminist women artists. The mission is to promote positive social change by supporting varied feminist expression in the arts. There are two grants offered per year; otherwise, there is no funding. https://www.kfw.org/retreats-residencies/residencies/

18. Project for Empty Space: For five months in-person and online, selected artists will create art in a residency in Newark, NJ called Project for Empty Space. The residency's mission is to dismantle gender roles, address issues of female safety, ownership, and agency through the art that artists will create. At the end of the residency, there is an exhibition accompanied by public programs for the community. The feminist portion of the residency is called the feminist incubator program—the art deals with discourses focusing on intersectionality and empowerment. The residency also offers a space called the feminist reading lounge, which features books and literature regarding intersectional feminism and women’s empowerment. https://www.projectforemptyspace.org/2020-fir

19. Feminist Artist in Residence: Based in London, The Feminist Library is a large collection of Women’s Liberation Movement literature. The residency is a part of the library and is one year in duration, and acts as a space for research, activism, and community projects. The residency does not offer funding, rather, it accepts monthly
donations. In residency, the current feminist artist is Finland-born, London-based visual artist Minna Haukka who is working from inspiration from the feminist library, mostly creating installations.  
https://feministlibrary.co.uk/artist-in-residence/

--------------------------

20. **ArtRabbit Residence: Refiguring the Feminist Future**: An online residency that is about feminism and how feminism is more than women. The residency invites artists, poets, and activists to challenge the histories and speculative futures through storytelling and counter-narrative imagining using technology. The residency questions and asks, What does the future is female actually look like? Artists will create to answer that prompt; the focus of the residency is solely around one question.  

--------------------------

**Characteristics: Family Artist Residencies (5)**

21. **Material Fantasies**: It is an interdisciplinary collective of seven international mothers based in Berlin that have created a family-friendly ongoing residency, shaping the discourse on motherhood through collective artistic processes with their children while enhancing contemporary feminist positions' visibility. Combining theory to their practice collectively transforms the research of motherhood and care work rendered in the immersive practice of their art formed with their children.  
https://www.maternalfantasies.net/about

--------------------------

22. **MOTHRA**: A weeklong non-funded/supported artist-parent residency in all disciplines at the Artscape Gibraltar Point (AGP) based in Toronto. The residency is set up for caregivers of babies and preschool-aged children, where they will live and work alongside their child. Sarah Cullen founded the residency in 2018; her focus and research have been merging children and art and how that can happen. The residency pushes boundaries surrounding the childcare. **MOTHRA** rather creates a multi-generational
coworking opportunity for artists and their children; artists bring their own supplies and any childcare accessories necessary for their children. The residency acknowledges the relationship and dynamic between parent and child and how that relationship is often overlooked in contemporary art. The mission of MOTHRA is to produce new artwork with their child in coworking, collaborating relating to issues of caregiving. The residency encourages research and artmaking by normalizing the idea of having children present in the arts sector from the studio to the bedroom—the residency supplies a bedroom, large shared studio, facilitation, and programming.


---

23. **EMAR Family Residency**: EMAR, located in Granville, NY, is an immersive, communal experience, where artists have time and space to grow and experiment with their work without choosing between art and their families for one full week. Founded by artist and mother Elizabeth Murray, whose philosophy was not choosing art or the family yet combine them. The mission of EMAR is to remove the boundaries and constraints that infiltrate residencies and families. Housing is offered where Murray would spend her summers with her family in a large stone farmhouse, and the studios are separated and overlook the studio of Elizabeth Murray. The residency offers childcare for the artists while the artist is working; however, there are plenty of family activities on the property to partake in together. Further, EMAR does offer equitable stipends to EMAR artists.

https://collarworks.org/emar-family-residency

---

24. **SPACE**: SPACE, a week-long family residency on Ryder Farms located in Brewster, NY, was founded by The Lilly Awards Foundation and is a family residency that offers artist-parent time alone to create art. At the same time, their children are cared for and involved in outside farm activities for their learning needs by educators. SPACE is a fully subsidized residency for artists with children ranging from 2 to 12 years old.

https://www.spaceonryderfarm.org/family-residency

---

25. **MARBLE HOUSE PROJECT**: Located in Dorset, VT, The Marble House Project is a multidisciplinary artist residency that offers a one-week session for artists and their families to create. The residency offers the opportunity to participate in all aspects of Marble House’s agriculture program and learn about sustainability and food production. The mission is for the need to make art but learn about the need for education on sustainability. There is no funding for this residency and a fee of $200 for partners to attend; however, artists and children are free. Marble House Project is open to all artists of disciplines and all ages of children.

https://www.marblehouseproject.org/residencyprograms
APPENDIX B

Letter to Andrew & Cora Pre-Residency

Andrew & Cora,

I hope the night before our residency...and Mama is a wreck with emotion. This is it!!! All the hard work of researching, writing, researching, writing, defending, editing, writing, editing, defending, writing, editing, and submitting. The journey and process of my PhD thus far has been something that cannot even be achieved in understanding through the words on the white paper that you are reading from, it’s a deep conversation I will have with you when you are both older.

It started with excitement of holy wow, I am going to be a Dr. and I am going to change policy in education, to holy wow...I am going to research alongside my children. I would have never imagined being able to be co-collaborators in an art residency with the two loves of my life. No other human beings on this earth would I want to spend the next thirty days with but the two of you. You are my lives, and I am grateful and blessed from our Lord, Jesus Christ that I have been able to stay home with you both most of the journey and now in what I will research in my final milestone of my PhD.

We have talked many times about my school, my research, and what will happen when I am finished. I can only hope with some years of understanding and maturity that you see me as a role model of never stopping or being told you can’t do something. I am living proof Andrew and Cora, that anything you put your mind to in this life is achievable. Never let anyone stop you, do it and do it with 100% heart. As my Pops would say...if you don’t like doing something STOP. If you love what you are doing...it will never be a task, rather just pure love. School, learning, and you both are love; therefore I will never stop learning and never stop loving the two of you.

Enjoy the next thirty days with me as I will with the two of you. I will learn so much from the two of you and the same for you both. How awesome is this, we get to create an art residency and knock down barriers of exclusivity of residencies and motherhood, curriculum, and the way we learn through art. Take all the knowledge you gain within this residency and change the world...hold on to it. Never stop learning, never stop wanting to know more and more. I see it in both of you, the drive I’ve always had. My philosophy of life is to do it...and then figure it out. Just have fun in life, never be too serious. Know as much as you can about everything that enters your brain.

Also, your Papa is something incredible. I would not be where I am today in this program and life without him. He has been the biggest supporter that any wife/friend could ever ask for. Your Papa believes so much in me, he never questions my next move, rather, embraces knowing and trusting me in the accomplishments that I will do for us, all of us. Papa is my rock, my true companion, my everything. I love him so much and I know you both know that, but just know a little more through my words here...he is the most incredible man ever!

So sleep well tonight by awesome children, let tomorrow be the start of something absolutely incredible. I know the last three years has been hard with me working a lot in this program...but I am all yours now. I love you both more than you will ever know. God Bless.

-Your Mama
July 12, 2021
APPENDIX C

Approval of Research from Penn State Instructional Review Board (IRB)

NOT HUMAN RESEARCH

Date: June 29, 2021
From: Samantha Adams,
To: Zena Tredinnick-Kirby

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Submission:</th>
<th>Initial Study</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Title of Study:</td>
<td>A FEMINIST TEACHING ART RESIDENCY (IN)FORMED BY AN ETHICS OF CARE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Principal Investigator:</td>
<td>Zena Tredinnick-Kirby</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study ID:</td>
<td>STUDY00018177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Submission ID:</td>
<td>STUDY00018177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Funding:</td>
<td>Not Applicable</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Office for Research Protections determined that the proposed activity, as described in the above-referenced submission, does not meet the definition of human subject research as defined in 45 CFR 46.102(d) and/or (f). Institutional Review Board (IRB) review and approval is not required.

The IRB requires notification and review if there are any proposed changes to the activities described in the IRB submission that may affect this determination. If changes are being considered and there are questions about whether IRB review is needed, please contact the Office for Research Protections.

This correspondence should be maintained with your records.
APPENDIX D

Kitchen Series

The love affair of creating art through food began while I watched my Spanish mother and grandmother and English/German father cook as my eyes recorded their every move. I witnessed the beauty of color combinations that created a painting on a dinner plate. As a result, I learned the importance of healthy cooking at an early age, which I am grateful for, and have passed down the wholeness of healthy eating to the most important people in my life, my family. Kitchen Series is of a macro focus rendering my daily encounters of domestic making through a black and white lens during my two-week-long art residency with my children at our home.
APPENDIX E

The Day After Series

The Day After is a series that I created displaying the places occupied consistently for seventeen days in our home as an art residency with my children that are now vacant.

The photographs explore place as emptiness. I have encountered that quiet absence many times when returning to my classroom after all the students graduated. Yet, now that empty feeling is within our home. Silence fills the previously crowded spaces where dialogue, frustration, laughing, teaching, and learning transpired. 41 Dutch Lane became our studio.

Empty seats now welcome dirty and sticky hands. The shutter release button of a Polaroid camera is affixed to a rigid position, ready to capture the experiential learning encounters it had for seventeen days. Dirty water and paintbrushes sit still, vertically raised to connect to paint and paper. Tightly entangled cords strangled a cold glue gun, hoping for warmth and purpose. The dining and playroom are vacant from voices, in the distance. Andrew and Cora play. A floor is filled with stuffed animals where murals were once created. Half transformed wood Moai sculptures sit patiently waiting to be brought to life fully.

Will 41 Dutch Lane ever be an art residency again? Yes, I believe so. The experience of creating an art residency with my children has been life-changing in motherhood, my relationship with my son, how I view curriculum, and applying ethics of care theory to my pedagogy.
It is what it is…and it is done. I am happy.
Zena Tredinnick-Kirby

Education

Ph.D. Art Education 2018–2022
The Pennsylvania State University
Dissertation Title: A Feminist Teaching Art Residency (In)formed by an Ethics of Care

MPS Art Education 2016–2018
The Pennsylvania State University
Thesis Title: Academic Performance Enhanced by Art Education

BA Art Education 2006–2010
The College of New Jersey

Publications
-Group Publication: Co-Author AERI Article: Hyflex Pandemic Research: Living with Coronavirus
-Group Publication: Visual Culture & Gender Journal, Title: Archival Research Toward Goals of Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion

Grants/Honors/Awards
-NAEA Kathy Connors Teaching Award Nomination, 2021/2022
-National Endowment for the Humanities Summer NEH Stipend $1300.00, 2021
-The Center of Pedagogy in Arts & Design C-Pad Discovery Grant $700.00, Penn State 2020-2021
-Professional Master’s in Excellence Award in Art Education, $1500.00, Penn State 2018

Work Experience
-Supervisor for Pre-Service Art Educators: The College of New Jersey, 2020-Present
-Adjunct Art Education Professor: The College of New Jersey, 2020-Present
-Author ART001 Course, Introduction to the Visual Arts, Penn State University, 2020
-Graduate Teaching Instructor ART001, Penn State University, 2018-Present
-Secondary Art Educator, North Hunterdon High School, NJ, 2010-2018