

The Pennsylvania State University

The Graduate School

College of the Liberal Arts

GENDERING THE HUDDLED MASSES
MEDIA FRAMING OF IMMIGRATION AND ITS IMPACT ON PUBLIC OPINION

A Dissertation in Political Science and Women's, Gender, and Sexuality Studies

by

Shan-Jan Sarah Liu

© 2016 Shan-Jan Sarah Liu

Submitted in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements
for the Degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

August 2016

The dissertation of Shan-Jan Sarah Liu was reviewed and approved* by the following:

Lee Ann Banaszak
Head of the Department of Political Science
Professor of Political Science
Dissertation Advisor
Chair of Committee

Donna Bahry
Professor of Political Science

Vineeta Yadava
Associate Professor of Political Science

Lise Nelson
Associate Professor of Women's, Gender, and Sexuality Studies and Geography

James Piazza
Professor of Political Science
Director of Graduate Studies of the Department of Political Science

*Signatures are on file in the Graduate School

ABSTRACT

International migration is not a new phenomenon and the number of people that move across the world continues to expand every year. This research consists of three parts that examine the print media as a national narrative responding to immigration, individuals' attitudes toward immigrants under the influence of varying media framings of immigration, and marriage migrants' conceptualization of citizenship in Hong Kong, Taiwan, the U.K., and the U.S. Utilizing cross-national content analysis, this research finds that in some cases the media are more likely to identify migrant men when framing immigration as an economic issue and more likely to identify migrant women when framing immigration as a cultural issue. Employing survey experiments, this research also finds that respondents are more likely to reject male immigrants as members of their society when informed the economic consequences of immigration; respondents are more likely to reject female immigrants when informed the cultural consequences of immigration. Lastly, using in-depth interviews with marriage migrants in Taiwan, this research shows that the degrees to which Taiwanese citizenship is desired and actively pursued differ depending on migrants' intersectional identities. This research raises implications for how the states may react to immigration through the media's gendered projections of immigration as various issues. It also raises implications for the impact of the media on how citizens differ in negotiating the presence of male and female immigrants. It also provides areas for further exploration on how immigrants navigate their place, identity, and citizenship even when they choose not to be citizens in their new homes.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|--|------|
| List of Tables | vi |
| Acknowledgements..... | viii |
| Chapter 1 Introduction | 1 |
| Mapping <i>Gendering Immigration</i> | 8 |
| Media Framings and Effect on Public Opinion | 9 |
| Incorporating Gender in the Analysis | 11 |
| Incorporation of Views of Marriage Migrants | 16 |
| Research Design..... | 17 |
| Case Selection | 20 |
| Structure of the Dissertation..... | 34 |
| Chapter 2 Media Framings of Immigration: Economic Consequences | 37 |
| Theoretical Framework | 40 |
| Gendered Media Framings of the Economic Consequences of Immigration | 43 |
| Data and Methodology..... | 48 |
| Analysis of the Economic Framings of Immigration | 51 |
| Economic Threat Frame | 52 |
| Economic Contribution Frame | 55 |
| Cross-National Analysis of the Gendered Economic Media Framings of Immigration .. | 58 |
| Visibility Hypotheses | 59 |
| Gendered Economic Impact Hypotheses | 62 |
| Gender Assumption Hypotheses | 64 |
| Conclusion | 71 |
| Chapter 3 Media Framings of Immigration: Cultural Consequences | 74 |
| Gendered Media Frames on the Cultural Consequences of Immigration | 76 |
| Data and Methodology..... | 83 |
| Analysis of the Cultural Framings of Immigration | 84 |
| Cultural Threat Frame | 85 |
| Cultural Integration Frame | 89 |
| Cross-National Analysis of the Gendered Media Cultural Framings of Immigration | 93 |
| Gendered Cultural Impact Hypotheses..... | 94 |
| Country Difference Hypothesis..... | 95 |
| Conclusion | 103 |
| Chapter 4 Media Effect on Public Opinion..... | 107 |
| Public Opinion regarding Immigrants and Immigration | 110 |
| Gender in the Media..... | 112 |
| Gendered Economic Aspect of Immigration in the Media..... | 114 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| Gendered Cultural Impact of Immigration in the Media..... | 117 |
| Research Design..... | 121 |
| Experimental Design..... | 122 |
| Results and Analysis of the Media Effect on Public Opinion..... | 129 |
| Results: Effects of Media’s Economic Gendered Framings of Immigration | 130 |
| Effects of Media’s Gendered Cultural Framings of Immigration | 134 |
| Conclusion | 139 |
| Chapter 5 Chinese Migrant Brides in Taiwan: Tangible, Imagined, and Undesired | |
| Citizenship | 142 |
| Cross-Strait Marriage Migration | 146 |
| Analysis of the Immigrant Perspective | 150 |
| Tangible, Imagined, and Undesired Citizenship | 151 |
| Tangible Citizenship | 152 |
| Imagined Citizenship..... | 156 |
| Undesired Citizenship | 162 |
| Conclusion | 164 |
| Chapter 6 Concluding Remarks | 168 |
| Cross-National Analysis of the Media Framings of Immigration | 169 |
| The Media Effect on Public Opinion | 173 |
| Marriage Migrants’ Conceptualization of Citizenship..... | 175 |
| Conclusion | 177 |
| References..... | 179 |
| Appendix A Summary of Newspaper Observations | 196 |
| Appendix B Socio-Demographic Characteristics of Interview and Survey Experiment | |
| Participants..... | 200 |

LIST OF TABLES

| | |
|---|------------|
| Table 1-1. Global and Regional Estimates on Domestic Workers in 2010, by Sex | 13 |
| Table 1-2. Marriage Migrant and Migrant Worker Populations in Taiwan in 2012 and 2013, by Sex | 14 |
| Table 1-3. Research Design Feasibility | 19 |
| Table 1-4. Global and Regional Estimates on Domestic Workers in 2010, by Sex | 26 |
| Table 1-5. Comparing Public Opinion regarding Immigration among Samples and Cases | 31 |
| Table 2-1. Types of News in the Newspaper Sample in 2014 in Hong Kong, Taiwan, the U.K., and the U.S. | 50 |
| Table 2-2. Types of Frames of Immigration across all Sampled Countries..... | 52 |
| Table 2-3. Usage of Economic Frames by the Media, by Country | 59 |
| Table 2-4. Immigrants' Gender Identities in the Economic Frames | 61 |
| Table 2-5. Immigrants' Gender Identities in the Economic Frames, by Country | 64 |
| Table 2-6. Immigrants' Occupation Identified in Economic Threat Frames in Newspapers | 67 |
| Table 2-7. Immigrants' Occupation Identified in Economic Contribution Frames in Newspapers, by Country | 69 |
| Table 2-8. Masculine and Feminine Association of Immigrants in Economic Frames, by Country | 71 |
| Table 3-1. Usage of Cultural Frames by the Media, by Country | 94 |
| Table 3-2. Immigrants' Gender Identities in the Cultural Frames | 95 |
| Table 3-3. Explicit Gender Identities of Immigrants in the Cultural Frames, by Country | 96 |
| Table 3-4. Explicit Gender Identities of Immigrants in Cultural Threat and Cultural Integration Frames, by Country | 98 |
| Table 3-5. Immigrants' Family Roles in Cultural Threat Frames, by Country..... | 99 |
| Table 3-6. Immigrants' Family Roles in Cultural Integration Frames, by Country | 101 |
| Table 3-7. Masculine and Feminine Association of Immigrants in Cultural Frames, by Country | 102 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Table 4-1. Six Treatment Groups in the Experimental Design | 124 |
| Table 4-2. Overview of Tested Variables | 126 |
| Table 4-3. Overview of Experimental Conditions and Control and Treatment Groups | 128 |
| Table 4-4. Comparing Rejection Rates of Male and Female Immigrants under the Exposure to the Explicit Gendered Economic Framings of Immigration, by Country | 132 |
| Table 4-5. Comparing Rejection Rates of Male and Female Immigrants under the Exposure to the Implicit Gendered Economic Framings of Immigration, by Country | 134 |
| Table 4-6. Comparing Rejection Rates of Male and Female Immigrants under the Exposure to the Explicit Gendered Cultural Framings of Immigration, by Country | 136 |
| Table 4-7. Comparing Rejection Rates of Male and Female Immigrants under the Exposure to the Implicit Gendered Cultural Framings of Immigration, by Country | 138 |
| Table 5-1. Number of Immigrants in Taiwan between 1998 and 2014 by Sex and Origin | 149 |
| Explicit vs. Implicit Gendering of Immigration | 196 |
| Table A-1. Examples of Explicit and Implicit Gendering of Immigration in the Media | 196 |
| Table A-2. Issue Summary of Newspaper Articles | 197 |
| Table B-1. Average Demographics of Survey Participants in all Four Countries | 200 |
| Table B-2. Socio-Demographics of Survey Participants by Country | 201 |
| Table B-3. Socio-Demographics of Each Country | 202 |
| Table B-4. Socio-Demographic Characteristics of PRC Migrant Brides Interviewed in Taiwan | 203 |

Acknowledgements

During my time at the Pennsylvania State University, I have been privileged to cross paths with many individuals who are not only intellectually stimulating but also engaging in political advocacy. They have made a profound impact on me, my being, my development as a scholar, and hence this dissertation. Seeing their commitment to social change has inspired me to become an activist teacher and scholar in search for answers to systematic disparities and intersectional injustices. This research would not have been possible without the many mentors, colleagues, friends, and family members who have supported me in their own ways throughout my academic career.

First and foremost, I would like to thank the marriage migrants, NGO workers, and experts in Japan, South Korea, and Taiwan who generously offered their valuable time, knowledge, and insight throughout my field research. I especially extend my gratitude to the migrant brides in Taiwan who welcomed me into their homes and offices and shared their stories with me. Their journey and courage are empowering; and I hope my dissertation would be a starting point for which their stories are told.

I am also deeply indebted to my committee members, Donna Bahry, Vineeta Yadav, and Lise Nelson, who have helped me design my study and motivated me to challenge my own assumptions and produce better research. Donna Bahry and Vineeta Yadav have served on various committees of mine throughout my graduate study; I would not have been able to complete the degree have they not ceaselessly shared their support and wisdom. During my time in State College, I have also been fortunate to be a part of the social movement and gender and politics reading groups. The group members' intellectual engagement and feedback on my drafts have enabled me to improve and meet my professional goals. Several outstanding research assistants also aided the completion of this project. I particularly appreciate Chia-Yu Tsou's and Stephanie Wilusz's attentiveness and patience throughout the data collection process. I reserve special thanks to my academic advisor, Lee Ann Banaszak. I have benefited tremendously from the guidance of Lee Ann, who has always pushed me to push my own limits and also worked alongside me in combatting every challenge along the way. She has shown me what it means to be an educator, shaped my scholarship, and fostered my learning beyond the profession.

I also give my appreciation to the College of the Liberal Arts, the Center of Global Studies, the Department of Political Science, and the Department of Women's, Gender, and Sexuality Studies for providing me financial support, allowing me to facilitate field research, complete original data collection, and travel to national conferences. Both departments have also been a fertile ground where I have been able to pursue my interdisciplinary interests. I particularly appreciate the space I was given to carry out my research, to teach, to write, and to grow intellectually and professionally. Mostly importantly, I am grateful to those who have fought for gender equality in the past. Although the battle continues, without their audacity and efforts, I would not have the opportunity or the space today to advance my education.

Chapter 1

Introduction

*Migration concerns us all and no State can escape from its obligations under international human rights law to protect and ensure respect for the human rights of migrants, irrespective of their migration status.*¹

—Francois Crepeau, U.N. Special Rapporteur

In 2015, 244 million people, roughly 3.3% of the world's population, made the difficult decision to leave their homes and lived outside their countries of origin.² Some moved voluntarily to seek better opportunities while some were forced to flee their home countries and became displaced. Although numerous explanations might exist for why people choose to migrate across the world every year, personal choices or experiences do not sufficiently explain why people migrate. As the international migration phenomenon is inevitably a byproduct of the social, economic, and political developments of the modern era, it has become a priority issue for states, political leaders, policy makers, as well as members of society. Scholars also have increasingly paid attention to such phenomenon. Existing studies on international migration seek to explain the determinants of migration. As migration can be costly and requires sacrifices and endurance, the force that motivates migrants to cross borders is relevant in identifying who migrates, as well as how s/he will be perceived by native citizens. Conventionally, scholars explain the causes from an economic perspective by narrowly looking at the push and pull factors. That is, as countries have a void in labor that needs to be filled, individuals are willing to relocate so long the return to

¹ “Immigrant’ Rights are Human Rights” *Amnesty International*. Retrieved from <http://www.amnestyusa.org/our-work/issues/refugee-and-migrant-rights/immigrants-rights-are-human-rights> on April 25, 2016.

² ““Overview.” *United Nations Population Fund*. Retrieved from <http://www.unfpa.org/migration> April 25, 2016.

labor outweighs the cost of migration. According to Borjas (1989) and Chiswick (2000), it is only natural that labor flows from countries that are rich in labor but low in wage to countries that are high in wage but short on labor. A perfect example would be the Turks being motivated by the economic differentials to move to Germany decades ago (Horrocks and Kolinsky 1996). In the early 1960s, Germany experienced an economic break, resulting in its shortage in labor. The door was officially open for migrants, particularly those from Turkey, to work temporarily in factories as guest workers. The guest worker program in Germany has resulted in millions of Turks staying, working, and becoming a part of the German society, as well as the largest guest worker population in the country.

Whereas neoclassical theory explains the rationality in individuals' decision to migrate, another economic perspective also explains that many of these migrants are not necessarily from the lowest economic class or educational background. Many migrants are from the middle class as they have the means to invest in migration, as well as the means to seek improvements in living standards (Bailey and Boyle 2004; Stark 1991). What distinguishes these economically better off migrants from guest workers are their likelihood to migrate the entire household and the possibility of them staying permanently in receiving countries. Additionally, globalization has also made it easier for both individuals, as well as the entire families, to up their roots and move to another country (Sassen 1996). More importantly, regardless of whether individuals or families migrate as guest workers or with the plans to stay in host countries permanently, the structural pulls usually have unattractive jobs available for immigrants, with a few exceptions of industries that desire high-skilled workers. Therefore, the labor void left for immigrants to fill consists of jobs that the natives are reluctant to doing (Piore 1980; Tsuda, Valdez and Cornelius 2003). For example, in addition to working on the farms along the West coast and providing gardening

services and child care, 20% of the undocumented workers in the U.S. work in construction, an industry that is difficult to attract native-born American workers.³

In addition to economic determinants, many also are forced to migrate as they experience war, natural disaster, or persecution on account of “race, religion, nationality, political opinion, or membership in a particular social group.”⁴ Although it is normally understood that refugees are forced to seek asylum in another country that could provide them security and legality, many scholars also suggest that the link between asylum seekers and voluntary migrants is obscure (Cornelius and Rosenblum 2005; Gibney 2004; Joppke 1997; Loescher 2002). Moreover, as refugees may receive authorization to stay and work immediately upon arrive, which differentiate them from some other types of immigrants, it is important to recognize that refugees do not always receive the additional legal protection that they are in principle entitled (Cornelius and Rosenblum 2005).

While labor and asylum-seeking seem to be a common understanding of immigration, immigrants are certainly not restricted to just workers and refugees. Whether immigration is forced or voluntary and whether immigrants are staying temporarily or long-term, how immigrants survive in their destinations becomes a challenge, not only for themselves but also for receiving countries. For example, according to the 2010 United States Census,⁵ 40 million, approximately 13% of the total population of the U.S., are foreign-born.⁶ The statistics from the United Nations do not only reflect the scale of people moving across borders but also the degree to which native citizens of the U.S. may come into contact with immigrants or be exposed to immigration politics. Although foreign-born individuals could have been living in the U.S. for

³ Altman, Daniel. “Shattering Stereotypes about Immigrant Workers.” *The New York Times*, June 3, 2007.

⁴ INA 208; 8 U.S.C. 1158.

⁵ “Foreign Born” *United States Census Bureau*. Retrieved from <http://www.census.gov/topics/population/foreign-born.html> April 22, 2016.

⁶ A foreign born is a person who is not born in the U.S. S/he could be a naturalized U.S. citizen, a legal permanent resident, a temporary migrant, or an unauthorized migrant.

most of their lives, it is still likely that they are perceived as “outsiders.” For many people, America is the land of the free where historically people have come to pursue their American dreams. As an immigrant country, the U.S. is often assumed to be accepting and welcoming of immigrants. As a nation that is built by immigrants, the U.S. celebrates diversity and takes pride in its multiculturalism. The U.S. is certainly not alone in being an immigrant country. Several other countries in the world also experience high immigration every year, such as the United Kingdom and Hong Kong. However, are Chungking Mansion⁷ in Hong Kong and Chinatowns and Little-Tokyo’s in various major U.S. cities symbolic enough for diversity in the country? If Chungking Mansions, Chinatowns, and Little-Tokyo’s are the only places where immigrants could find comfort and celebrate their identities, could Hong Kong and the U.S. still be considered multicultural? More significantly, as receiving countries continue to experience immigration and develop longer histories of immigration, do they automatically become more accepting of immigrants?

While immigrants struggle to make ends meet and navigate the politics of belonging in their host countries, native citizens also struggle over the increasing presence of immigrants. Nativist concerns are shaped by worries and apprehension of scarce resources, employment competition, cultural unity, and so on. These concerns also encompass various levels of politics, ranging from individual to national, and are apparent in the media coverage of immigration. On November 20, 2014, Senator Jeff Sessions published a response to President Barack Obama’s immigration reform in *U.S.A. Today*:

Apparently, America now has its first emperor. And he has issued an imperial order to dissolve America’s borders. Millions more will enter and demand the same amnesty benefits as those who came before. The entire moral foundation

⁷ Chungking Mansion is a building in Hong Kong that is known for its affordable accommodation for tourists, visitors, and newly arrived immigrants. The building also features ethnic restaurants that have served as a place for immigrants from India, Nepal, Pakistan, Bangladesh, Sri Lanka, Africa, and Europe to contribute to ethnic economy (Wang 2008) by serving and selling ethnic food in the restaurants. The building itself is a symbol of diversity as people from more than 120 countries have passed through in the last decade (Matthews 2007).

and consistency of our laws will have been eviscerated. Law enforcement officials have repeatedly warned that the president's new amnesty will unleash a "tidal wave" of illegal immigration. The impact on our jobs, wages, hospitals, schools, police departments and neighborhoods will be crushing. A second hammer blow will be dealt by the president's unilateral increase in foreign worker programs for large corporations, including technology corporations. Currently two-thirds of all new jobs in the IT industry are being filled by foreign workers—and yet the president wants to dramatically surge foreign worker admissions even further. This at a time when the Census Bureau tells us more than 11 million Americans with science, technology, engineering and math degrees don't have jobs in those fields. President Obama is auctioning off America's middle class to the highest bidders.⁸

Senator Sessions points out that the U.S. faces many challenges—challenges that threaten the livelihood of Americans, particularly middle-class Americans—as President Obama opens up the border and grants amnesty to more immigrants. Nonetheless, Senator Sessions is not alone in the anti-immigration position. In another letter to *The New York Times* editor, Congressperson Lamar Smith urges that the "jobs magnet" must be turned off in order to deter undocumented workers from entering the U.S.⁹ These opens letter specific lay out the economic consequences of immigration, which shows that the debate over immigration in the U.S. revolves around the role of undocumented workers in the economy. Although undocumented workers only constitute about five percent of the workforce in the U.S.,¹⁰ stories about how immigrants benefit from job opportunities in the U.S. unfold. These stories implicitly suggest that Americans' jobs are lost—to undocumented workers.

Overseas in Europe, it is a different type of immigrants that have been under the spotlight. While issues of economic concerns in Europe can be seen as prevalent as they can in the U.S., cultural or religious symbols can also stimulate tension and debates. For example, the bans on face-covering veils in France and the Netherlands several years ago raised much

⁸ Sessions, Jeff. "Congress must fix the problems President Obama's executive amnesty plan creates." Retrieved from <http://www.usatoday.com/story/opinion/2014/11/20/obama-immigration-amnesty-reform-executive-action-overreach-imperial-emperor-column/19293813/> April 15, 2016.

⁹ Smith, Lamar. "Amnesty for Immigrants?" *The New York Times*, June 8, 2012.

¹⁰ Preston, Julia. "11.2 Million Illegal Immigrants in U.S. in 2010." *The New York Times*, February 2, 2011.

controversy as the government declared that “the government believes the wearing of clothing that completely or almost entirely covers the face is fundamentally at odds with public life, where people are recognized by their faces.”¹¹ While immigrants’ integration in the public sphere seems to be a major concern of the politicians and citizens in Europe, the implication lies in what such “enforcement” of wearing burqas means to the freedom and choice of Muslim women. The French politicians introduced the ban in support of “protection of gender equality,” instead of “liberation.” This policy also has violated niqab-wearing women’s body ownership and excluded them from exercising their human rights in the public sphere.¹² As the ban on burqa and anti-immigration parties forming coalition blocs and winning elections make the news in Europe, it shows that the dominant discourse on immigration in Europe has decentered from immigrants’ economic threat, which seems to dominate the media discourse in the U.S., to immigrants’ threat to state-building ideology and national identity.

On the other side of the world in East Asia, marriage migrants have been the center of the attention since the 1990s when a considerable number of women from less developed countries in Asia began to migrate to neighboring countries through and for marriage. While the various push factors behind such commercialized marriage should not be ignored, the principal discourse remains on the consequences of marriage migration in receiving countries. These consequences are often politicized and used to drive harsh provisions on immigration. For example, in 2012, Taiwanese Legislator Chang Hsiao-feng stated that the “high” quota of foreign brides was detrimental to since Taiwanese women’s likelihood of marrying. She suggested that foreign brides’ “monopolization” of Taiwanese men resulted in a “national loss,” in which ample single women could not find men to marry and thus had been demoted to “left-over” (sheng nu) status.¹³ This narrative indicates that the debate over immigration centers on the “negative” outcomes of

¹¹ Dutch to Ban Full-Face Veils.” *The New York Times*, September 17, 2011.

¹² Chrisafis, Angelique. *The Guardian*, September 19, 2011.

¹³ *Taiwan Insights*. April 4, 2012.

international marriage. Moreover, as Legislator Lai Shi-bao proposed a stronger government role in commercialized marriages as a mechanism to solve Taiwan's low fertility crisis, the focus had then been shifted to the consequences of marriage migrants' reproduction of future generations. Precisely, this discourse suggests marriage migration has a serious and shared impact on what the nation may be both demographically and ideologically since approximately 11% to 14% newborns in Taiwan are from families of international marriage.¹⁴

The examples above illustrate that these concerns are reflected through the media's discussions of native citizens' support of political candidates, national policies, and public opinion poll. Yet, certain groups of immigrants seem to be placed at the center of the media discourse—Muslim women, undocumented workers, migrant brides, and such. Extant literature explores the racialization of media discourse on immigration; yet little is known about how the media discourse on immigration could be gendered. Additionally, the examples above also paint an image of immigrants as “takers” —immigrants “take” jobs, democratic values, religion, and even native male citizens away from native citizens. Current studies focus on the obstacles faced immigrants in receiving countries in becoming citizens so they are no longer seen as “takers” or at least they could be “legal” takers. However, little is known about the extent to which immigrants desire naturalization. Furthermore, the questions to how immigration is discussed and how immigrants are portrayed in the media vary by country remain unanswered. If country variation exists, do the media vary by the stereotypical coverages that I illustrate above? While there is no universal finding on the cause of the shifts in media framings of immigration, the ways that the media frame nativist concerns have shifted (Vilgenthart and Roggeband 2007). These shifts could perhaps be explained by internal politics, societal understanding of immigration, and/or international pressure. Consequently, some of the examples I offer are from early 2000's, but are they still representative of how the media frame immigration today? Moreover, how do

¹⁴ Department of Education, Taiwan (2012)

these different framings of immigration in the media affect individuals' attitudes toward immigrants? Do gendered media framings also lead to gendered opinion regarding male and female immigrants?

To pull together such broad areas as immigration in the media, public opinion toward immigrants, and immigrants' experiences, I draw from existing theoretical discussions of gender, immigration, citizenship, media, and public opinion in my research. The broader questions I address are the following:

- How do the media gender their framings of immigration? Particularly, how are issues of immigration and identities of immigrants framed in national newspapers?
- How might the media framings of immigration affect public opinion regarding immigrants? Particularly, how might the interactions among gender and immigrant cues trigger acceptance or opposition among citizens?
- How do the media framings of immigration and citizens' attitudes toward immigrants vary by country?
- How do citizens' attitudes toward immigrants differ among countries that allow citizenship by birth and countries that allow naturalization?
- How do immigrants view their place and citizenship in host countries?

Mapping *Gendering Immigration*

In this research, I address three major predicaments for immigration politics in theories encompassing gender, citizenship, the media, and public opinion:

Media Framings and Effect on Public Opinion

As newspapers are major sources of information, what is presented and represented in the media constitutes a major interest of scholars. Not only do newspapers present information about current events, but they also signal the emergence of social and political consensus. While “politically produced immigration policies determine who may enter, reside, work, and naturalize” (Fujiwara 2008, xii), the media determine whose voice is recorded and represented. Particularly in the construction of immigration politics, the media determine how issues of immigration are defined and framed and how identities of immigrants are portrayed and discussed. Migrant voices are rare in the media; thus, the media framings of immigration serve as an indicator of how immigrants may be perceived and treated in society. More specifically, media framings of immigration reflect the numerous ways of reckoning who belongs and who does not. For example, as the debate in the U.S. centers on whether to incorporate hardworking, tax-paying, and English-speaking immigrants into American society,¹⁵ the media insinuate the moral characters that one must possess in order to be considered an American. Similarly, protecting gender egalitarian values by banning burqas in public space is necessary for a society to be truly Dutch, French, or German. The simultaneous instances where Taiwanese media advocate granting citizenship immediately to the Anglo-Saxon missionaries¹⁶ and question shortening the required length for marriage migrants also indicates society’s approval of only certain types and groups of immigrants. These differences in the media discourse reflect the societal ambience of tolerance and embracement.

Most literature finds that biased journalism exists in the portrayal of events related to immigrants (Bradimore and Bauder 2011). For example, immigrants, even refugees, are described

¹⁵ Swarns, Rachel. “Split Over Immigration Reflects Nation’s Struggle.” *The New York Times*, March 29, 2006.

¹⁶ *United Daily News*, March 16, 2014.

as migrating for economic purposes. However, when an economic dimension is incorporated to frame the entry of immigrants, the media delegitimize the real or the primary reasons that people move (Greenberg 2000). As only the economic dimensions are valued, the general structure of the media seems to be built off of the motivation for economic betterment and built on the “financial risks” that immigrants pose (Bradimore and Bauder 2011; Greenberg 2000). Looking at the various dimensions of immigration in addition to the economy allows me to examine how the media operate the mainstream ideology, how native citizens understand immigration within the larger economic, social, and political context, and how different immigrant groups negotiate positions.

As immigration, whether authorized or undocumented, is often perceived as an issue that transgress politics, how it is portrayed in the media is particularly important for understanding the effect it might have on society. White (1969) describes the power of the media as “an authority that in other nations is reserved for tyrants, priests, parties and mandarins,” the influence of the media is not to be ignored. Although vast research on the media effect on public opinion exists, the findings are mixed. Some find that not only do the media portray the collective consensus of the general public, but they also are found to shape the consensus of the public via their thematic frames and representation of certain issues that are perceived as “problematic” (Greenberg and Hier 2001, 463). Existing research shows that public attitudes toward immigration and immigrants are usually conveyed through the types of threat immigrants are perceived to pose. For example, as economic betterment is perceived to be a common determinant for people to migrate (Cornelius and Rosenblum 2005), the entries of immigrants suggest labor competition. This perception and assumption of immigrants’ migrating for work creates a fear based on economic concern as immigration seems to violate self-economic interest of native citizens.

In addition to the perceived economic threat, public opinion also shows that immigrants are understood in their lack of will to assimilate socially, linguistically, politically, and religiously

(Portes and Rumbaut 2006). The presence of immigrants, thus, leaves native citizens, particularly in countries that are homogeneous, feel threatened for the changes in the demographics of their population, as well as national identity. That is, as immigrants enter and become more visible by the number, the different religion they practice, the different language they speak, the different wardrobe they wear suddenly become a concern about violation of an existing identity. Societal anxiety over immigrants' assimilability implies how the citizens of one country view these "strangers" on their homeland.

Although there is ample research on the media discourse surrounding immigration and the media effect on public opinion, little is known about how the two are connected to each other. In other words, the impact of the media framings of immigration on public opinion toward acceptance of immigrants also remains underexplored. Is the fear that native citizens express toward immigrants caused by the media framings of immigration? To what extent do the media influence social attitudes toward immigrants? To what extent does the media effect vary by country? By examining the cross-national differences in the media framings of immigration and media effect on public opinion toward immigrants, this research provides a causal explanation for how social attitudes can be manipulated and shaped.

Incorporating Gender in the Analysis

Current analyses of the media discourse and public opinion regarding immigration evaluate immigrants as a whole—immigrants tend to be categorized in one group and generalized. Even when studies focus on the ways different groups of immigrants are portrayed in the media and perceived by the public, they focus on the race and ethnicity of immigrants, leaving other categories of axes under-examined. By centering women in the context of the media framings of immigration, I challenge the simple understanding of men being the major actors in

international migration. Inserting gender into the immigration discourse and politics is much more than moving away from the dichotomous definition of gender. Recent scholarship on gender and politics has recognized that gender also functions as a process. Gender is manifested “as the differential effects of structures and policies upon women and men” and “as the means by which masculine and feminine actors (often men and women, but not perfectly congruent, and often individuals but also structures) actively work to produce favored gendered outcomes” (Beckwith 2005, 132).

As anyone can participate in transnational migration, it seems like a gender-neutral form of action. Nevertheless, when most scholars draw on the works of economists to determine the causes of migration, what underlies these economic determinants is the gendering of labor that is pulled and pushed. As women constitute half of the immigrant population, it shows that women have become the dominant force in migration. Yet, gender is rarely incorporated in the studies of immigration (Boyd and Greico 2002). The underpinning assumption is that most immigrants who migrate for economic betterment are men because traditionally men are the decision makers and the major source of income. Additionally, jobs that require much physical strength is reserved for migrants, making the demand for male labor more visible. For instance, a large portion of the immigrant population in the U.S. is women. Yet, because women generally occupy more effeminized jobs that carry low visibility, not only are their presence and contribution excluded in the media discourse but also auxiliary in the scholarly literature. Table 1-1 demonstrates the global and regional estimates on number and the percentage of women of all domestic workers in 2010. As shown in the Table, across the world the majority of domestic workers are women—with an average of 92%--the highest in Latin America and the Caribbean—and with an average of 63%--the lowest in the Middle East. These effeminized occupations constrain female labor in the private sphere, leading to their low visibility and recognition. Thus, although untrue, but because

financial security is the conventional explanation for migration (Castles and Miller 2009; Kandel and Massey 2002), migration is often recognized as an individual's, mostly a man's, choice.

Table 1-1. Global and Regional Estimates on Domestic Workers in 2010, by Sex

| Region | Number of Domestic Workers | % Women |
|-------------------------|----------------------------|---------|
| Developed Countries | 3,555,000 | 73 |
| Eastern Europe/CIS | 595,000 | 67 |
| Asia/Pacific | 21,467,000 | 81 |
| Latin America/Caribbean | 19,593,000 | 92 |
| Africa | 5,236,000 | 74 |
| Middle East | 2,107,000 | 63 |

Source: International Labour Organization (2013)

Similarly to the discussion of economic immigration, the discussion of marriage migration, particularly in East Asia, generally emphasizes migrant brides, rather than migrant husbands. Table 1-2 displays the marriage migrant population and as the Table shows, women constitute the majority of the marriage migrant population in Taiwan; however, it does not mean that foreign husbands do not exist. Although men also migrate for marriage, they are excluded from the dominant discourse. As migrant husbands, not only do their experiences differ but also are overlooked. Table 1-2 also depicts that the migrant worker population in Taiwan consists mainly of women. Because it is common in Taiwan to hire housekeepers from abroad, migrant women in Taiwan also constitute a significant proportion of the migrant worker population. Because of the constructed gender differences in society, how marriage migrant men, marriage migrant women, and migrant women and migrant men as guest workers are portrayed by the media and perceived in society may also differ. These potential differences suggest that the media can be gendered and call for a deeper analysis for the ways the media gender immigration.

Table 1-2. Marriage Migrant and Migrant Worker Populations in Taiwan in 2012 and 2013, by Sex

| Marriage migrant population in 2013 | | | Migrant worker population in 2012 | | |
|-------------------------------------|---------|---------|-----------------------------------|---------|---------|
| Men | Women | Total | Men | Women | Total |
| 35,222 | 447,651 | 482,873 | 177,878 | 267,701 | 445,579 |

Source: Ministry of Interior, Taiwan (2012 and 2013)

As migration studies emphasize the experiences of men, how female immigrants are situated in international migration is often overlooked. Even when women's experiences are incorporated, they are studied as dependents rather than significant contributors (Kofman 2004; Tseng 2010). For instance, scholarship on the connections among immigration, unemployment, and public opinion toward guest workers imply that men are the ones that experience a blue-collar threat, leaving the potential and (different) threat imposed by female immigrants out of the discourse. While female immigrants also participate in the labor force, many also migrate for reasons beyond economic betterment. For example, when interviewed, Indonesian women who migrated to Taiwan through marriage explained that freedom and being with me who respected women were what encouraged them to leave Indonesia (Lu 2005). Although recent research has started to incorporate gender, it usually focuses on the experiences of either men or women (Alicea 1997; Bhabha, Klug, and Shutter 1985; Boyd 1986; Keely 1992). That is, for scholars, they are interested in the experiences of women since women have long been underrepresented in the literature. Nonetheless, what is absent is how women and men are positioned adjacent to each other within one society and how such differential positioning influences how immigrants are portrayed by the media, what native citizens read in the newspapers, and how native citizens' acceptance of immigration is affected by their media exposure and surroundings. Therefore, while it is relevant to recognize that migrant women's experiences differ from migrant men's, it is also crucial to understand how gender, not just either women or men, plays out in the theories and analyses of immigration.

I analyze how the media discourse is gendered by looking at both the *explicit* identifications of immigrants' gender identities, as well as the *implicit* connections of immigrants and their gender identities. Explicit identification of immigrants simply means that men and women are identified in a news article. When I examine how the media explicitly gender immigration, I only examine the ways migrant men and women are identified in the news articles. In the coverage of immigration, the media may specifically claim that the immigrant groups they refer to are men or women. For example, in discussing Prime Minister David Cameron's proposal to ensure that immigrants integrate into the British society, a news article focuses on "Muslim women to make an important point about the integration of immigrants" (Mason and Sherwood 2016). When reading the excerpt, the readers know that immigrants discussed are women, rather than men. Such explicit identification of immigrants as women falls under my category of *explicit* gendering of immigration.

While gender-marking may be expected of the media framing of immigration, I also evaluate how gender may be *implicitly* identified. I define implicit gendering of immigration as the unconscious attribution of gender to immigrants. These attributions are resulted from the socially constructed understanding of gender. In implicitly gendering immigration, the media may no longer explicitly claim that the particular immigrants that they discuss are men or women. Instead, implicit gendering of immigration entails the effect of institutionalized process, system, structure, and practices that imply the gender of immigrants. As scholars suggest, these implicit gender stereotypes associated with gender-typical activities could cause gender bias (Baron et al. 2014). Particularly, implicit stereotypes are "the introspectively unidentified (or inaccurately identified) traces of past experience that mediate attributions of qualities to members of a social category" (Greenwald and Banaji 1995, 15). In this instance, immigrants' gender identities may be assigned by the media through occupations, family roles, dress, etc, associated with immigrants. Examples of implicitly gendering of immigration may not specifically reveal the sex

of immigrants, but they inform the readers of the sex of immigrants by indicating the roles that immigrants play, such fathers, mothers, sons, or daughters. An example would be a report on a “father of five U.S. citizenship children” who might be deported due to his undocumented status (Lee 2016). Although this particular excerpt does not state that the immigrant is a man, its identification of his role as a father suggests his gender identity. Other implicit gender stereotypes may also be employed by the media in implying the sex of immigrants discussed. (See Table A-1 in Appendix A for details.) It is important to further note that these attributions of gender are learned through past experiences of how gender is constructed. Based on the experiences of interacting with the world, newspaper readers are likely to process implicit associations of activities with certain gender, such as caring and cooking for the family, being a nurse, working on a construction site (White and White 2007). As a result, it is particularly important to examine the implicit gendering process of immigration in the media because evidence suggests that implicit cognitions shape attitudes and behaviors in ways that are different and independent from the effects of explicit gendering (Baron et al. 2014; Gawronski and Bodenhausen 2006; Nock and Banaji 2007). Additionally, I argue that it is imperative to examine both how immigration is both explicitly and implicitly gendered in the media, as well as to evaluate how such gendering may have an effect on social attitudes toward male and female immigrants.

Incorporation of Views of Marriage Migrants

In order to employ feminist methodology in my research, I also investigate immigrants’ experiences. Incorporating migrant brides and centering their experiences and perspectives in the larger gendered analysis of the media and public opinion allows for understanding of their positionality in host countries from their perspectives. As the media framings of immigration and effect on public opinion reflect societal ambiance toward immigrants, their connections with

immigrants are also inseparable and complex. As immigrants also live, breathe, and function in the same media context as those who are native, it is important to comprehend how they may operate and negotiate positions under the influence of the media and public opinion. In order to reduce the power differentials between myself as a research and migrant brides, I employ feminist methodology in my research. Although I had presumptions about how marriage migrants in Taiwan might be situated. I utilized a semi-structure open format in my interview to ensure that my “imaginings” of marriage migration does not affect their responses. By giving migrant brides the full opportunity to define their own issues and conceptualize their own experiences, I came away with much more comprehension of what immigration, citizenship, and naturalization mean to them. Voices of migrant brides are rare in extant research. The data I draw from the field reflect opinions of migrant women with whom I engaged. Specifically, the varying conceptualizations and acquisitions of Taiwanese citizenship reflect the extent to which migrant brides’ identities, namely socio-economic class, education, etc., may play a role in their desire to officially integrate in Taiwanese society as Taiwanese citizens.

Research Design

This research examines how the media gender their discussions of immigration issues and immigrant identities and how these gendering processes affect native citizens’ attitudes toward male and female immigrants, as well as how immigrants themselves perceive their situation in host countries. There are two sets of hypotheses that need to be tested in this research in order to examine the media framings and media effect. The first tests the connection between the media’s identification of immigration and the media’s identification of sex of immigrants. The second tests the causal mechanism that links the gendered media framings and social attitudes toward male and female immigrants. As I explain more in detail in Chapters 2, 3, and 4, very few studies

on the media and immigration directly test the gender effect. Although mixed results exist and some find that the media have an impact on public opinion, extant evidence does not allow for understanding the gendered impact of the media on the public opinion. In this section, I explain the ways my research design addresses these gaps in existing literature, as well as the limitations of my design.

Table 1-3 shows the challenges this project faces in terms of data availability and data limitations. Ideally, in order to study how the media frame immigration that could be generalizable, I would utilize a large cross-sectional dataset that includes information on the media discourses surrounding immigration, including aspects of gender. However, as the Table indicates, very little cross-sectional data exist in the media's gendered framings of immigration. Similarly, in order to study how the media affect social attitudes toward migrant men and women, I would also use public opinion survey data. Nevertheless, as shown in the Table, no data exist in which opinion regarding migrant men and women is evaluated. Not only would the ideal data require comparable measures of gender in the media framings of immigration, but the ideal data would also need to include as many countries as possible. Furthermore, not only would the ideal data require a larger sample of countries, but the cases and the time periods would also be matched with existing public opinion survey data in order to enable a large-n statistical analysis on the connections between the media and public opinion. While these data do not exist, my potential sources are the national newspapers that are documented in archives and my own original country surveys. Nevertheless, it is almost infeasible to obtain such a large amount of data—several national newspaper articles in multiple countries and public opinion surveys in multiple countries—given the time and language¹⁷ constraint. Therefore, I employ a mixed-method approach that includes cross-national content analysis of the newspapers, survey

¹⁷ In order to examine how the media gender their framings of immigration, I would need to analyze national newspapers that are written and published in country national languages. Given that I am not a linguistic expert, I am unable to interpret newspaper articles that are written beyond English and Chinese.

experiments, and in-depth interviews of four cases to answer my research questions. Utilizing detailed analysis of my selected cases, I am able to combine the original data collection on the newspaper articles and the original data collection on public opinion. While this strategy also allows me to directly test the causal mechanism in my selected cases, it is also important to note that my four-case study may not provide evidence for causal mechanism in other countries that do not share similar characteristics with those of these cases. My four-case study serves as a starting point for collecting more data and running more analyses that examine the causal connections between the gendered media and gendered public opinion in the future. In the following section, I present an overview of my case selection.

Table 1-3. Research Design Feasibility

| | Media framings of immigration | Gender in the Media | Gender in Public Opinion |
|---------------------------------|---|---|---|
| Ideal Testing | Cross-sectional data at the country level | Cross-sectional data at the country level | Cross-sectional data at the country level |
| Available Data | Some Cross-Sections | None | Large-Scale Public Opinion Survey Data, e.g. The International Social Survey Programme, the World Values Survey, the European Values Survey |
| Potential Sources | Newspaper documents | Newspaper documents | Original Country Surveys |
| Constraint Feasibility Strategy | Linguistic ability Feasible Selected Case Studies | Linguistic ability Feasible Selected Case Studies | Linguistic ability Feasible Selected Case Studies |

Case Selection

Gender has increasingly been incorporated into the studies of international or cross-border migration throughout the last decade. While scholars have begun to recognize gender as critical in the understanding of the causes and consequences of migration, most literature remains to center on the circumstances that motivate women to migrate, particularly the passivity in their migration for family considerations or reunions. Studies that explore the gendered process of migration also often neglect to examine how female and male migrants might be situated differently, particularly how they might be portrayed in the media and how such portrayals might affect how they are perceived by others in their host countries. My primary interest is analyzing media framings and evaluating the effect of media's gendered framings on public opinion. Because of the lack of data availability on a large dataset that includes information on how the media gender immigration, I am unable to conduct a cross-national analysis at a large scale. Therefore, I choose a case study approach.

Case selection is extremely important for researchers as case studies seek to “elucidate the features of a broader population” (Seawright and Gerring 2008, 294). However, cases cannot and should not be chosen randomly because I may run into the danger of case selection bias. Random sampling a small set of cases may lead to misrepresentation of a population and a lack of variance on the aspects of theoretical interest. Due to my small sample, I have utilized the techniques suggested by Seawright and Gerring (2008) in choosing my cases. They argue that having “a representative sample” and having “useful variation on the dimensions of theoretical interest” are the two primary objectives in case selection (296). Among the several techniques they recommend, I choose to employ the diverse case strategy. The diverse case strategy requires a selection of at least two cases that could represent the full range of values characterizing both independent variables, dependent variables, and some particular relationships between the

independent and dependent variables. As I am interested in how the media gender their portrayals of immigrants and affect public opinion toward immigrants, my primary dependent variable would be individuals' attitudes toward male and female immigrants. My main variable of interest would be the media's coverage of immigration issues and immigrant identities. Therefore, before I select cases, I must ensure that variation exists in both my independent and my dependent variables. Using this method allows me to achieve maximum variance along relevant dimensions, which is also the primary objective of this particular method. The limitation of this study, nonetheless, lies in the lack of data availability on the gendered media framings of immigration—the main independent variable.—and public opinion toward male and female immigrants—the dependent variable.

As the previous section states, the cross-national media's gendered framings of immigration and gendered public opinion data have yet to be collected and coded to allow me to examine the variation in my primary variables prior to my study. Therefore, I choose other national-level indicators that could best reflect the mainstream media's representation of immigrants and public opinion toward male and female immigrants. Particularly, I examine variation in immigration histories and policies to reflect the potential variation in the media discourse surrounding immigration for three reasons. First, immigration histories and policies and news discourse on immigration are all factors at the national level, suggesting that native citizens in whichever case I study are exposed to the same level of discourse surrounding immigration. Second, although the media framings of immigration are not the same as immigration policies, one similarity they share is that they are both discourses constructed by the elites—whoever has power in shaping who is allowed to enter a country, to obtain citizenship, and who is portrayed positively or negatively in the mainstream understanding and portrayal of immigration. While immigration policies reflect the power of lawmakers in determining the legal status of immigrants, the media reflect those who have authority, including lawmakers, whose words are

often quoted and borrowed, in the media. Third, I examine immigration histories because they reflect the trends of immigrant in-flow, as well as the compositions of immigrant populations. The long-term history of immigration may reflect how a society views immigration, particularly how immigration may be conveyed in the mainstream discourse. For example, a country that has had a short history of immigration and a country that has had a long history of immigration may report immigration differently in the media. Moreover, contemporary trends of immigrant in-flows may be particularly reflected in the contemporary media framings of immigration. Histories of immigration, including the compositions of immigrants, may also reflect the groups of immigrants that are predominantly discussed in the media. For example, a country that has predominantly female immigrants may construct immigration differently from a country that has predominantly male immigrants. For these reasons, I analyze immigration histories and policies as a substitute for media framings of immigration in determining variation in my independent variables in the initial stage of this research.

It is also important to further note that in order to conduct a good case study of the media framings of immigration and their impact on public opinion regarding immigrants, I must also choose cases in which I could sufficiently examine the media discourse, as well as social attitudes. Because I am only fluent in two languages—English and Chinese—I could only choose cases that are diverse in the relevant dimensions of my variables of interest as well as cases in which English and Chinese are the national languages. I am aware that such constraint limits my ability in examining cases that are beyond English-speaking and Chinese-speaking countries. However, utilizing Seawright and Gerring's (2008) recommendation of diverse case selection, I ensure that my selected cases are representative of cases that are diverse along these relevant dimensions. In the following sections, I discuss specifically the variation of my independent variable and dependent variable. I also explain my selection of the time period in which I study.

Variation on Independent Variables

As Seawright and Gerring (2008) recommends, I must choose cases that have variance along my variables of interest. In this research, I select four receiving cases to conduct analysis of the media framings and media effect on public opinion toward immigrants: Hong Kong, Taiwan, the U.K., and the U.S. Current immigration studies mostly focus on the media frames in the North American and European contexts. Little is known about how the media in Asia gender their framings of immigration and affect social attitudes regarding immigrants. These four cases are selected not only because they provide the first systematic cross-regional empirical evidence, but also because they have potentials in representing the varying degrees of the relationships between the media and public opinion. Located in different parts of the world, Hong Kong,¹⁸ Taiwan, the U.K., and the U.S. have had long histories of immigration and yet have also experienced different levels of immigrating populations and immigration populations originating from very different areas. Therefore, I suspect the variation in these national-level indicators as mentioned above reflects that my cases may also vary in the gendered discourse on immigration as well as other dimensions of interest and cases that can be representative of individuals' attitudes perceptions of who is entitled to societal membership

¹⁸ While Hong Kong is not a nation-state, its policies strictly limit who can enter Hong Kong. As visa is often a requirement for foreigners as well as Chinese mainlanders to enter Hong Kong. The exit-entry permits for mainlanders are often restricted to those who join and travel with a tourist group or those who travel for business. Permits for entering Hong Kong without a traveling with a tourist group or for business purposes are limited to only residents of Guangdong Province and 28 other major cities in China. Financial statements are required to attain visa. (Immigration Department, the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region 2014). I include Hong Kong as one of my cases as the sanctions to enter and settle in Hong Kong grants it to function almost like a nation-state. Furthermore, the Hongkonger residents also enjoy privileges, entitlements, and welfare that other Chinese do not. Therefore, it is important to note that although Hong Kong is not an independent regime, its permanent residency permit functions in a way like citizenship where it requires a difficult process to obtain and carries the same benefits that citizenship would.

Hong Kong, Taiwan, the U.K., and the U.S. have had a long history of immigration where most of the populations in these three countries are descendants of immigrants. Throughout the last few decades, the U.S. has attracted the largest absolute number of immigrants while the U.K. comes close to having one of the largest net migration rates as demonstrated by Column 1 in Table 1-4. As Table 1-4 also shows, Taiwan and Hong Kong, in comparison, have lower numbers of immigrants (The CIA World Factbook 2014). Specifically, as displayed in Column 2 in Table 1-4, the percentages of immigrants among native population range from 4% in Taiwan to 14% in the U.S. Immigrants in these four countries vary in their gender, race and ethnicity, countries of origin, and other characteristics. While the U.S. and the U.K. receive more immigrants every year, their immigrant populations are also more ethnically diverse whereas Taiwan and Hong Kong's immigrant populations are more diverse in gender. Taiwan and Hong Kong have been a top destination for women from developing countries in Asia since the 1990s (Lee 2007; Kawaguchi and Lee 2012; Lim 2010). Therefore, in Hong Kong and Taiwan an overwhelming percentage of immigrants are women who are both marriage migrants and migrant workers working in the private homes as care workers and domestic helps.

While they have experienced different waves of immigrants and opened their doors for immigrants of various origins, they are currently facing a phenomenon of unconventional forms of immigration—migration for marriage and migration for birth. Understanding how gender is embedded in these forms of migrations is especially important because they depend on the gendered performativity of bodies, in which only (or mostly) women participate in. In Taiwan and Hong Kong, marriage migration has been popular. While some men also marry Hong Kong or Taiwanese women, the majority of marriage migrants remain female. Since Hong Kong shares a border with China and the U.S. with Mexico, many also enter Hong Kong and the U.S. before they deliver their babies with the objectives for their newborns to be residents of Hong Kong and citizens of the U.S. as they are entitled to benefits exclusively for citizens (residents).

Taiwan, although not traditionally seen as a country of immigrants, the majority of its citizens are also of Han descendants from China. Because of its geographical location, it attracted settlers from mainland China, mostly coastal regions, such as Fujian, in the 16th century. As the Chinese Civil War ended in the late 1940s, many also fled to and settled in Taiwan with the nationalist army. For decades after the Civil War, Taiwan had a very restrictive immigration policy, particularly towards citizens of China. Since the door officially opened for marriage migration in the 1990s, Taiwan has attracted many foreigners, mostly women, to migrate to Taiwan for marriage.

In contrast, gender is more balanced in the populations of immigrants in the U.K. and the U.S. Instead, the U.K. and the U.S. have immigrants from varying parts of the world. Particularly, Mexicans constitute the largest immigrant group in the U.S. since 1960s while immigrants from India, Pakistan, and Bangladesh constitute the largest percentage of arrivals during the last decade in the U.K. Immigrants from these three countries, along with Nigeria, which is also a major immigrant origin and colonized by the British, constitute the large percentage of Muslims in the U.K. (Migration Policy Institute 2014; The U.K. 2011 Census Data). In Hong Kong and Taiwan, on the other hand, the largest immigrant group comes from People's Republic of China (Hong Kong Information Services Department 2014; Taiwan Internal Affairs Department 2013). Moreover, women constitute approximately half of the immigrant population in the U.K. and the U.S. and they constitute larger proportions of the immigrant populations in Hong Kong and Taiwan, at 77% and 64%, respectively, as displayed in Column 3 in Table 1-4.

Table 1-4. Global and Regional Estimates on Domestic Workers in 2010, by Sex

| | Net Migration rate (per 1,000 population) | % immigrants among country's population | % female migrants |
|----------------|--|--|----------------------|
| Hong Kong | 1.68 | 8 | 77 |
| Taiwan | 0.9 | 4 | 64 |
| United Kingdom | 2.6 | 12 | 52 |
| U.S.A. | 3.38 | 14 | 50 |

Source: International Organization of Migrants (2013)

The majority of residents in Hong Kong are also descendants of immigrants who migrate from various regions of mainland China, particularly from Guangdong Province, which shares a border with Hong Kong. In addition to the ethnic Chinese population in Hong Kong, its colonial history of 150 years has also resulted in migrants from various origins, such as England, India, and Russia to reside in Hong Kong. As Hong Kong relaxed its border control in the 1980s, it became popular for Hong Kong men to seek wives in China (Lang and Smart 2002; So 2003). Furthermore, the handover in 1997 also granted easier access for the mainland Chinese to enter Hong Kong. Throughout the last few years as the economy of China grew rapidly, women in China no longer necessarily migrated to Hong Kong for marriage. Instead, many, particularly the rich, started crossing the borders to give birth to their children in order for the newborns to receive Hong Kong resident status, which came with entitlements and privileges.

Although different in the patterns of immigration from Hong Kong and Taiwan, the U.K. also has a rich and long history of immigration—one of colonization. The Romans, the Angles, Saxons, the Jutes, the Scots, and the Irish (Salwy 1981) settled in the U.K. in the beginning of the century. In modern days, however, because of the British history of colonization and trade, many from Africa were transported to the U.K. as slaves and settled. Consequently, thousands of Indians settled in the U.K. (Fisher 2007) in the 19th century. Many Muslim immigrants from Southeast Asia also migrated to the U.K. (Ansari 2004). In the 19th century, a significant number of Germans and Russian Jews also migrated to the U.K. for work (Panayi 1994). Particularly after

the world wars, a substantial populations of immigrants also migrated to the U.K. as workers, students, and asylum seekers or refugees (Border and Immigration Agency 2008). The active importation of migrants in the U.K. throughout history has diversified the population in the U.K. The history of immigration to the U.S. started in the 1600s where the Europeans first began to settle on the East Coast. Since then, the U.S. has experienced waves of immigration with immigrants from all over the world. Recently as globalization and transportation has made migration more accessible, the U.S. has been confronted with individuals crossing the border from Mexico and entering from other parts of the world, which has forced the U.S. to implement more restrict policies. While many have migrated to the U.S. for work and other purposes throughout the last few decades, many, particularly from Mexico or other parts of the world where individuals are financially capable, have also come to the U.S. to deliver their newborns as they instantly become citizens and entitled to social welfare. Statistics show close to 8% of the babies born in 2008 had at least parent that was of an undocumented status (Pew Hispanic Center 2008). While marriage migration has not been highlighted, according to the Census Bureau in 2011, approximately 21% of all married-couple households in America, there is at least one spouse born in another country.¹⁹ Among the 21% of mixed nativity households, 39% of them has foreign-born spouse that is not a U.S. citizen. Essentially about 8% of the married-couple households have a spouse that is not a U.S. citizen.

As previously explained, I am unable to examine the variation in the media framings of immigration due to the lack of data availability; therefore, I also investigate the way in which immigration policies, another national-level indicator, are varied. In addition to diversity in immigration history and immigrant composition, variation also exists in the immigration policies in these four cases. Hong Kong, Taiwan and the U.S. all have strict immigration policies. Capital

¹⁹ Larsen, L. and N. P. Walters. Married-Couple Households by Nativity Status: 2011. Retrieved <https://www.census.gov/prod/2013pubs/acsbr11-16.pdf> July 14, 2014.

investment, highly-skilled workers, and family reunifications are ways to immigrate to these countries. However, while Hong Kong does not require highly skilled workers to obtain a job offer before entering Hong Kong, Taiwan and the U.S. both require highly skilled workers to have job offers before they can settle as highly-skilled workers. Quota, however, exists for the number of immigrants that can settle every year in all three countries.

Most importantly, as my interest lies in the gendered immigration that is embedded in women's bodies, particularly their reproductive abilities, I focus specifically on family sponsorship for their spouses, children, and parents in Hong Kong, Taiwan, and the U.S. They all allow citizens (or residents, in the case of Hong Kong) to sponsor their family members to immigrate. The U.S. Department of Homeland Security reports that 10% of foreigners who obtain lawful permanent residency are parents of American citizens, 10% are children of American citizens, 27% are spouses of American citizens, and 9% are spouses and children of lawful permanent residents. When adding these figures up, family reunifications through maternal citizenship and marriage (excluding being brothers and sisters of American citizens), become the major way to gain lawful permanent residency, much more than the 14% of applicants who attain lawful permanent residency through job employment. Statistics also report that 10% of immigrants received Hong Kong residency through marriage and 15% through births (naturalization). Among the marriages between Hongkonger and a foreigner, 80% of the couples are mainland women married to a Hongkonger man²⁰. According to the government report, the peak of international marriage was in 2001 where 27% of the newly wedded couples that year had a foreign spouse. The numbers have plummeted since then and now it remains at a 12% to 17% during the last decade.

²⁰ Luo, Lucia. "Dispute over new immigrants from the mainland, Hong Kong is unhappy?" *The Southern Weekly*, May 18, 2011. Retrieved July 11, 2014 <http://www.chinahush.com/2011/05/18/dispute-over-new-immigrants-from-the-mainland-hong-kong-is-unhappy/>

Particularly, Hong Kong and the U.S. have naturalization laws by which any individual born in Hong Kong and Taiwan is automatically granted citizenship and residency. This naturalization law allows leeway for individuals to enter and give births as some have hopes that their children who are automatically Hong Kongers and Americans can aid them in the process of becoming legal residents. While attaining citizenship through children may not be the ultimate goals of these parents, particularly mothers who cross the borders while pregnant, it has been highly controversial in the debates of the causes and consequences of immigrants in Hong Kong and Taiwan.

Variation on Dependent Variable

In addition to selecting cases that are diverse along the relevant dimensions of my interest variables, I must also choose cases that may be diverse in the dependent variables. As variation on the national-level indicators of immigration is verified, I also need to ensure that variation exists in my dependent variable—social attitudes toward immigrants. Similar to the lack of data availability on gendered media frames, no data exist on the gendered public opinion regarding immigrants. Therefore, I examine how public opinion regarding immigrants may be compared cross-nationally (King, Keohane, and Verba 1994) using the International Social Survey Programme's (ISSP) National Identity III Survey (2013). I evaluate the degree to which the various characteristics of immigrants may shape individuals' likelihood to be accepted by citizens. The ISSP ask participants in 33 countries²¹ questions that measure their attitudes toward immigrants. Particularly, I investigate how important the following eight criteria are for immigrants to be considered citizens of a country: (1) born in [country]; (2) have [country

²¹ These 33 countries include Belgium, Croatia, Czech Republic, Denmark, Estonia, Finland, France, Georgia, Germany, the United Kingdom, Hungary, Iceland, India, Ireland, Israel, Japan, South Korea, Latvia, Lithuania, Mexico, Norway, Philippines, Portugal, Russian Federation, Slovakia, Slovenia, South Africa, Spain, Sweden, Switzerland, Taiwan, Turkey, and the United States.

nationality] citizenship; (3) living most of life in [country]; (4) able to speak [country language]; (5) to be a [religion]; (6) to respect [country nationality political institutions and laws; (7) to feel [country nationality]; and (8) to have [country nationality] ancestry. These items are on a 4-point scale, ranging from 1—not important at all, 2—not very important, 3—fairly important, to 4—very important. Although these eight aspects do not measure how gender might shape one’s perception of immigrants as data on gendered perception of citizenship do not exist, they are the most extensive items that reflect public opinion regarding opinion that is cross-sectional and most up to date. While not directly related to gender, these responses allow for a preliminary understanding of the varying characteristics that may play a role in citizens’ perception of citizenship.

Table 1-5 shows the distribution of these various items and indicate how they compare among the world average and Hong Kong, Taiwan, the U.K., and the U.S.²² Column 1 displays the average of the 33 countries in the sample on the importance of various aspects of citizenship. Columns 6, 7, and 8 demonstrate that Taiwan, the U.K., and the U.S. meet the criteria that allow for distinct values on participants’ perceived importance of criteria to be considered a citizen. The Table also shows that these cases are either more similar or more different from the world average and match better on some factors than others. For example, Row 1 indicates that the U.S. matches relatively closely to the mean on having been born in [country] as an important criterion for being a citizen while the participants in Taiwan on average think it’s less important and the participants in the U.K. on average think it’s more important than the world average. Row 2 indicates that the U.K. matches relatively closely to the mean of having [country nationality] citizenship whereas the participants in Taiwan on average think it’s less important and the

²² Hong Kong is not included in the ISSP data. However, I also include Hong Kong because as Chapter 4 details, I am also interested in the country effect on attitudes toward immigrants. Hong Kong’s policy on naturalization is similar to the U.S. where birth citizenship is granted. Therefore, including Hong Kong as one of the cases I examine allows for a deeper understanding of the country effect on gendering public opinion toward immigrants.

participants in the U.S. on average think it's more important than the world average. Rows 3, 4, 5, 6, and 8 demonstrate that Taiwan, the U.K., and the U.S. all have distinct values that differ from the world average. The cases also represent different ends of opinion on different criteria. Row 7 shows that the participants in the U.S. on average mirror the world average of feeling [country nationality] whereas the participants in the U.K. think that particular criterion is less important and the participants in Taiwan think it is more important than the world average. These data demonstrate variation in what matters for individuals in different countries for consideration of being a citizen. Consequently, I set cases that represent the full range of values of my dependent variables, allowing for representation of diverse public opinion regarding immigration at the country level.

Table 1-5. Comparing Public Opinion regarding Immigration among Samples and Cases

| | | Full sample (33 countries) | | | | | | |
|---|--|----------------------------|-----------------------|---------|---------|--------|------|------|
| | | Mean | Standard Deviation | Minimum | Maximum | Taiwan | U.K. | U.S. |
| 1 | To have been born in [country] | 3.00 | 0.98 | 1 | 4 | 2.84 | 3.16 | 2.94 |
| 2 | To have [country nationality] citizenship | 3.34 | 0.81 | 1 | 4 | 3.19 | 3.39 | 3.63 |
| 3 | To have lived in [country] for most of one's life | 3.08 | 0.89 | 1 | 4 | 3.02 | 3.21 | 3.05 |
| 4 | To be able to speak [country language] | 3.43 | 0.80 | 1 | 4 | 3.00 | 3.72 | 3.64 |
| 5 | To be a [religion] | 2.26 | 1.16 | 1 | 4 | 1.88 | 2.05 | 2.47 |
| 6 | To respect [country nationality] political institutions and laws | 3.35 | 0.80 | 1 | 4 | 3.43 | 3.45 | 3.55 |
| 7 | To feel [country nationality] | 3.39 | 0.79 | 1 | 4 | 3.55 | 3.25 | 3.39 |
| 8 | To have [country nationality] ancestry | 2.77 | 1.05 | 1 | 4 | 2.38 | 2.71 | 2.41 |

Selection of Time Periods

2014 is an ideal time period to study the media framings of immigration and their effect for two major reasons although these Hong Kong, Taiwan, the U.K., and the U.S. have experienced different waves, different numbers, and different demographic populations of immigrants (see Table 1-4). First, immigration was hotly contested in these four cases in 2014. Specifically in November 2014, the media reported on President Barack Obama's speech on the immigration overhaul in the U.S. Years leading up to his address, there had been many debates about either the economic cost or gain from varying policies regarding immigrants, such as the Deferred Action for Parents Act, the DREAM Act, etc. In the same year, the U.K. had also been debating the immigration overhaul as Prime Minister David Cameron was confronted with the European Union's Open Door policy, particularly pertaining to Eastern European migrants who enter the U.K. for work and who are also entitled to benefits provided by the government. Immigration issue was also believed to be what had led to United Kingdom Independent Party's (UKIP) victory in the general elections in 2015.

On the other side of the world in East Asia, both Taiwan and Hong Kong, whose largest immigrant populations are mainlanders from China, experienced much political action implicitly targeted at the increasing number of Chinese immigrants. Taiwanese students occupied the parliament in the protest of the Cross-Strait Service Trade Agreement (CSSTA) in March 2014. They initially protested the undemocratic process of the passage of the trade agreement, but eventually the fear of Chinese immigrants' taking over local businesses through the open door policy surfaced. Months after the Sunflower Student Movement in Taiwan, students in Hong Kong also occupied major public spaces in Central Hong Kong to protest against the restrictive electoral system implemented by the Communist Party. Although the Umbrella Revolution was not directly aimed at immigrants from Hong Kong, the protests reflected broader issues between

Hong Kong and China, particularly pertaining to Chinese immigrants' and tourists' economic behavior in Hong Kong and Hong Kong's economic dependency on China throughout the years.²³

As immigration was a major issue that has led to changes in political leadership and widespread social movements in these four cases in 2014, studying them allows for a deeper understanding of how immigration was particularly constructed and gendered by the media in the given year. Moreover, since I am also interested in looking at the effect of the gendered media framings on public opinion regarding immigrants, evaluating newspaper samples in 2014 enables me to directly test the effect of the media the following year. Building upon what I find in my cross-national content analysis of newspaper articles, I construct experiment vignettes (explained more in detail in Chapter 4) that reflect the current media's gendering of immigration and examine it influences social attitudes toward immigrants. Doing so allows me to me to benefit from the mirroring of contemporary media coverage on immigration in the experiments, making my experiment vignettes more realistic than completely made up vignettes. It also allows the survey experiments to connect with real world politics at the time.

In sum, the long and yet different histories of immigration, diverse immigrant populations and compositions, and potential variation in public opinion in Hong Kong, Taiwan, the U.K., and the U.S. allow for a more in-depth understanding of the media framings of immigration affect social attitudes toward migrant men and women. Specifically, given that migration occurs in all parts of the world, western democracies are not exclusive in experiencing large scale immigration. While immigration is experienced by many countries in different ways and on different contents, how immigrants are situated within the media discourse and its effect on social attitudes regarding immigrants may differ depending on the context. For that reason, I ensure that my research that focuses on media framings of immigration and public opinion regarding

²³ Hong Kong's "Umbrella Revolution" Reflects Broader Issues in China. Retrieved <http://gwtoday.gwu.edu/hong-kong%E2%80%99s-%E2%80%98%E2%80%98umbrella-revolution%E2%80%99-reflects-broader-issues-china> August 5, 2015.

immigrants entails a more comprehensive examination that is cross-national and cross-regional. More importantly, my comparison and contrast of these four diverse cases allow for contextualizing the media's gendered representation of immigration in areas that have been previously ignored. To my knowledge, this research is also the first cross-regional comparison of the media framings of immigration and effect on public opinion toward immigrants.

Structure of the Dissertation

To develop the questions asked in this research, I draw from interdisciplinary scholarship and various theoretical frameworks. My goal is not to examine all elements that shape the media framings of immigration or media effects on public opinion in all countries in the world. Rather, I aim to converge the media framings of immigration and public opinion toward immigrants in select cases. This research focuses on the ways the media frame economic and cultural consequences of immigration and how these different framings affect native citizens' acceptance of immigrants in Hong Kong, Taiwan, the U.K., and the U.S. Additionally, to expand on how institutions and context—the media and public opinion that represents societal ambiance—and to give a voice to immigrants who are challenged with navigating their lives in countries outside their home countries, this research also examines how marriage migrants in Taiwan conceptualize citizenship.

As I discuss in greater detail in Chapter 2, I draw from gender in the media discourse to analyze how the economic impacts of immigration are framed by the media. This chapter provides details of the gender in the media theory on which my research is based, as well as the methodology I use. I utilize cross-national content analysis of the top-circulated newspapers in Hong Kong Taiwan, the U.K., and the U.S. to examine the ways in which economic immigration is framed and gendered. I hypothesize that the

news articles that frame immigration using the immigrants' impact on the economy are likely to discuss male immigrants. Moreover, I expect that the news articles that discuss negative impact on the economy are likely to mention migrant men's gender identity as well as masculine professions. Utilizing cross-national content analysis of the most circulated newspapers in these four cases, I find that parts of my hypotheses are supported. My findings suggest gender is not always explicitly stated in the media framings of immigration. Instead, gender is more likely to be implicitly discussed than explicitly discussed when framing the economic impacts of immigration. My results also show that cross-national variation exists in how the media frame economic impacts of immigration.

In Chapter 3, I also employ feminist theory and cross-national content analysis of the top circulated newspapers in Hong Kong, Taiwan, the U.K., and the U.S. This chapter draws from the same theories and employs the same methodological approach as Chapter 2; therefore, fewer references are provided in this chapter. I hypothesize that the news articles that frame immigration using the immigrants' impact on the national identity and culture are likely to discuss female immigrants. I also hypothesize that the news articles that discuss negative impact on the national identity and culture are likely to mention migrant women's gender identity. Similar to my findings in Chapter 2, my hypotheses are partially supported in that the newspapers in several cases are more likely to identify female immigrants when framing immigration as a cultural issue. Nevertheless, such gendered framing is also more implicit than explicit. My findings also suggest cross-national variation exists in how the media frame economic impacts of immigration.

Chapter 4 investigates the causal connections between the media and public opinion. Utilizing survey experiments in these four countries, I hypothesize that citizens are more likely to reject migrant men than migrant women when exposed to immigrants'

impact on the economy. I also hypothesize that citizens are more likely to reject migrant women than migrant men when exposed to immigrants' impact on the culture. The findings partially confirm my hypotheses regarding the gendered economic and cultural effects of immigration on opinion about male and female immigrants. Specifically, the findings support that when exposed to the economic impacts of immigration, citizens reject male immigrants more than female immigrants, in both instances where the message is explicitly or implicitly gendered. My results also show that citizens reject female immigrants than of male immigrants when exposed to the explicitly or implicitly gendered cultural impacts of immigration.

Chapter 5 dissects how immigrants, mostly migrant brides, in Taiwan negotiate their belonging through their conceptualization of Taiwanese citizenship and navigate their daily lives with or without citizen status. Employing in-depth interviews with marriage migrants who share varying identities and experiences, I allow the marriage migrants to be the agents in defining their own experiences, challenges, and perspectives toward Taiwanese citizenship. My findings suggest that not all migrant brides from People's Republic of China (PRC) desire Taiwanese citizenship. Moreover, the Chinese women who refuse to naturalize are from the upper class contradict the public's concern about Taiwanese citizenship being sold to wealthy investors. While immigrants' lack of desire to acquire citizenship is not a new concept (Hansen and Weil 2002), this chapter addresses how intersectional identities play a role in migrant women's utilizations of citizenship as a form of social membership, explained by their decisions in naturalization.

Chapter 6 summarizes the theories and results from Chapters 2 to 5 and delves deeper into the political meanings of the media discourse, media effect on public opinion, and migrant brides' conceptualization of Taiwanese citizenship. It also concludes by offering implications of this research, as well as areas of improvement and areas to explore in the future.

Chapter 2

Media Framings of Immigration: Economic Consequences

International migration is hotly contested across the world; many of the current debates appear to raise the common concern about the economic consequences of immigration. Even the recent event of refugees fleeing Syria has not only been discussed in terms of a humanitarian crisis at the global scale, but many receiving countries have also raised questions about whether they are “well-suited” economically for accepting them.²⁴ Even in cases where asylum seekers are not the majority of the immigrant population, the general attitudes of citizens toward immigrants also tend to focus on their impact on the national economy. Fifty-one percent of the American voters sampled in the Ramsmussen Reports survey conducted in 2015 believed undocumented immigrants were taking jobs away from U.S. citizens. While 39% of the sample disagrees, the vast majority’s concern over economic threat posed by immigrants suggests the few aspects of the agenda and tone for debates on immigration.

A quick perusal of recent headlines on the issue suggests that mainstream discourses differ in their discussion of the economic consequences of immigration. For example, the United Kingdom news reports on the increasing immigration have varied from framing migrants as “claiming jobseekers’ allowance and child benefits” to being “more prepared than native workers to do antisocial shifts” (Fisher 2014; Gibb 2014). Similarly in the United States, news report regularly carry such statements as “Americans believe illegals are taking jobs” and immigrants’ investment in exchange for visa provides “cash [to fund] luxury apartment buildings”

²⁴ Soergel, Andrew. “Refugees: Economic Boon or Burden?” *U.S. News*. Retrieved from <http://www.usnews.com/news/blogs/data-mine/2015/09/15/would-syrian-refugees-be-an-economic-boon-or-burden> September 15, 2015.

(Batley 2015; Brown 2015). Evidence suggests that the newspapers are likely to bias the consequences of immigration, but how such economic biases are gendered in the media framings of immigration and immigrants remains underexplored (Bradimore and Bauder 2011; Charteris-Black 2006; Cisneros 2008; Mehan 1997; Quinsaat 2014; Triandafyllidou 1999). Therefore, the major questions I address in this chapter are:

- How do the media frame the economic impacts of immigration?
- How are the media gendered in their economic framings of immigration? What role does gender play in the media framings of the economic impacts of immigration?

While there is a wealth of case studies discussing how immigrants' gender identities are framed (Bredstrom 2003; Durham 2004; Messner 1999), few systematic analyses of the media framings have occurred; and this work does not examine how gender interacts with different types of frames. Moreover, although international migration has been a phenomenon in recent decades, little is known about how immigrants in Asia are portrayed by the media because most studies focus on the North American and European contexts (Ana 1999; Boomgaarden and Vilegenthart 2007; Chan 2013; Cisneros 2008; Bradimore 2012). As the journalists' own interpretations of national consciousness are reflected in their reporting and framing of an issue (Abraham and Appiah 2006; Gamson et al. 1992; Marshall 1992), understanding how the media construct their discourses surrounding immigration, particularly through the incorporation of male and female immigrants in the reporting, allows for understanding how the media across countries gender their coverage on immigration. Comprehending the media discourse also has implications for the ways nations constitute their identity and conceptualize citizenship as they reflect who (women, men, or both) is considered to be a positive impact and therefore who belongs as members of society (Koopmans 2005).

This chapter has two theoretical aims in explaining how the media treat the economic consequences of male and female immigrants. First, it compares the ways in which the media

frames are gendered in their discussions of the economic consequences of immigration. In examining the media's selective prioritization of immigrants' gender identities, I argue that the media are more likely to incorporate male immigrants when they discuss the economic consequences of immigration. As men have traditionally been considered the major participants of the labor force while women are often relegated to the private sector, the economy is often associated with masculinity, resulting in an emphasis on migrant men's presence. Particularly, I argue that when the media frame immigration as an economic threat, male immigrants are more likely to be discussed as most native male citizens are traditionally seen as the "breadwinners." I also argue that in the cases where the media do not explicitly assert the gender identities of immigrants, they are likely to implicitly suggest the sex of immigrants, e.g. through highlighting immigrants' occupations that could be masculine or feminine. Specifically, I argue that the media are likely to discuss masculinized professions in their framings of the economic consequences of immigration.

My second theoretical aim focuses on how countries differ in their gendered media framings of the economic consequences of immigration as the understanding and conceptualization of gender also vary across national contexts. While countries have distinctive needs for and acceptance of migrant workers' participation in the local economy, I argue that a country's immigration history and immigrant population and composition also play a role in the media's gendering of the immigrants' influence on the economy. Hong Kong, Taiwan, the United Kingdom, and the United States have varying experiences with immigration; thus, they provide a unique opening for inquiry into how the media gender their framings of the economic aspect of immigration.

To carry out this examination, this chapter analyzes a representative sample of news articles published in the major newspapers during 2014 in the four cases mentioned above. It is organized in four parts. First, I lay out the theoretical framework, explaining how the media may

be gendered in their utilization of the economic frames to discuss immigration. Second, I discuss my data and methodology, which I use to analyze the media framings of immigration. Third, I present and interpret my findings. Last, I conclude by discussing the implications of the results and examining areas for future research.

Theoretical Framework

The theoretical foundation for studying media discourse can be traced back to scholars who suggest that news frames are not only part of the discourse itself but also mechanisms by which the news is constructed and processed (; Entman 1993, 2010; Gamson 1992; Gamson and Stuart 1992; Pan and Kosicki 1993; van Dijk 2006). As frames are “socially shared and persistent over time,” (Hertog and McLeod 2001, 140), journalists help structure saliency through their deliberate selection and emphasis of certain facets of issues and identities of actors (Entman 1993; Gamson and Modigliani 1989; Gitlin 1980; Melger et al. 2013). Scholarship in this vein has mostly looked at the positive or negative tones of the media to confirm the media’s practice of lexical selectivity when representing immigrants (Bradimore and Bauder 2012; Greenberg 2000). Particularly, current studies focus on the media’s positioning toward a wide range of consequences of immigration, such as the economy, domestic security, national health, ethnic relationships, national identity, and more (Allan and Szafran 2005; Bradimore and Bauder 2012; Bell 2009; Cisneros 2008; Greenberg 2000; Greenberg and Hier 2001; Henry and Tator 2002; Ibrahim 2005; van der Zon 2000). However, existing literature does not suffice in addressing how the media treat immigrants beyond its general binary positions (pro or anti). Moreover, as literature finds that the media represent immigrants as “problematic” (Greenberg and Hier 2001, p. 463) and treat them like “scapegoats” or the “folk devils” (Cohen, 1972), not enough is known about the frames used by the media in discussing varying aspects of immigration. Understanding

the specific framing of a story is crucial because it helps uncover the mainstream ideology, exposing the underlying assumptions of immigration and immigrants (Hackett 1984).

Newspapers reflect the mainstream concepts and ideologies, through which the “less powerful members of society” are underrepresented (Neubeck and Glasberg 1995). Particularly in framing the events and issues surrounding immigration, the journalistic representations of immigrants are found to be biased (Bradimore and Bauder 2011; Cisnero 2008; Junn and Haynie 2008). Not only do these constructions of frames reflect issue saliency (Gauntlett 2008; Hanke 1998; Morella et al. 2013; Stoller 1994), but these biases reflect the power dynamics between those that construct the mainstream discourses versus those that are portrayed. Moreover, the media’s representation of the gender identities of immigrants indicates the power dynamics among native citizens and female and male immigrants, both in the media and in society (Quinsaas 2014).

Furthermore, scholars find that attitudes toward immigrants are situational and that the immigration reform often depends on the demographics of immigrants (Becker 1971; Quillian 2006; Lee 2008; Vernby and Finseraas 2010). Certain groups of immigrants are found to be stigmatized while others are found to be “exemplary” immigrants (Huntington 2004; King 2000). For example, minorities of Asian descent in the U.S. are often portrayed as the “model minority” (Saito 1997; Suzuki 1989) whereas Latinos are held responsible for “browning of the America” (Johnson et al. 1997). In addition to racial distinctions, the type of skills that immigrants possess also matter for the extent to which they are accepted by native citizens. Hainmueller and Hiscox (2010) find that both low-skilled and high-skilled native workers and both rich and poor citizens prefer high-skilled immigrants. While such preferences are often associated with the racial, ethnic, religious, and socio-economic class identities of immigrants, gender may also be embedded in the perception of immigrants and yet remains largely underexplored.

Particularly, extant evidence suggests that the economy has strong predictive power of citizens' feelings toward immigrants (Citrin and Sides 2008; De Figueredo and Elkins 2003; Raijman et al. 2008; Sides and Citrin 2007). For example, immigrants that contribute in a boost in the economy may be more welcomed than those that are perceived as taking financial resources. Therefore, I analyze the media framings of the economic consequences of immigration in this chapter. The consequences of immigration on the economy center on the changes in the supply and demand of labor, as well as the impact on the national fiscal budget with the presence of immigrants (Borjas 2003; Katz and Murphy 1991). Immigrants' perceived positive or negative impacts are often linked with their various backgrounds. For example, high-skilled workers are often favored whereas other migrants may be seen as a fiscal burden on the national economy (Bauer and Kunze 2004; Razin et al. 2002; Regets 2001; Scheve and Slaughter 2001). While the media may situate the economic consequences of immigration within the discourse of risk (Beck, 1986; Bradimore and Bauder, 2012; Morella et al. 2014) or contribution depending on the characteristics of immigrants, I argue that gender is not to be ignored in evaluating the media framings of immigration because the impacts of female and male immigrants on the economy may be perceived and portrayed differently. I further argue that the media are gendered in their distinct framings of threat by and contribution of male and female immigrants because of the economic roles that men and women are expected to play in society.

In the subsequent section, I discuss in detail my conceptualization of the print media as "authority" (White 1969, p. 327) and my theories on the ways media are gendered. I explain how constructions of gender differ depending on the media framings of immigration, particularly pertaining to its economic aspects.

Gendered Media Framings of the Economic Consequences of Immigration

Economic betterment is conventionally seen as a part, if not the core, of an explanation for migration (Borjas, 1989; Chiswick, 2000; Hanson and Spilmergo, 2001). However, such narrow understanding of immigration contributes to the construction of gender in perceiving the economic consequences of immigration, leading to the importance of understanding how the media gender their portrayals of the economic consequences of immigration. In particular, contrary to what van der Zon (2000) argues, I theorize that gender is not completely lost in the media but instead employed in a conventional way, affected by our comprehension of the experiences of immigrants based on gender role assignments. I theorize that the media are gendered in their framing of the economic consequences of immigration in three ways.

First, women over all have lower visibility in the media than their male counterparts in the U.S. (Byerly and Ross 2008; Kahn and Goldenberg 1991; Norris 1997; Ross and Carter 2011). Women are discussed less, if not absent, in the media. When it comes to understanding immigration in the form of economic betterment, immigration is often examined as the embodiment of male migrants and their families (Boyd and Greico 2003). Women are traditionally viewed as “dependents.” The decision makers in this perceived motivation of immigration are often men, excluding women from having ownership of their own movement and leading to the media’s lack of coverage on female immigrants. Furthermore, this conventional understanding disregards migrant women’s impact on the economy as they are not perceived as the major decision makers or contributors to the process of “economic betterment” (Boyd and Greico 2003).

On the one hand, migrant men are the focus of discussions of economic migration, with an emphasis on how the increase in the supply of low-skilled male migrant workers decreases the quantity and wage of low-skilled jobs for native (male) citizens (Kessler 2001; Mayda 2006;

Olzak 1992; Scheve and Slaughter 2001). For example, migrant men are often portrayed as posing a blue collar threat because low-skill jobs are what are thought of as most likely to be taken by migrants (Borjas 1999; Fietkau, Hansen, and Faas n.d.; Borjas, Freeman, and Katz 1996, 1997;). Women’s “potential threat” to labor competition in the domestic setting is unremarked upon as women’s private labor goes unrecognized and undisclosed (Boyd and Greico 2003).²⁵

In addition, even when the media utilizes immigrants’ contribution, instead of threat, to the economy to frame the story, the gendered nature of immigration is reflected via the support for high-skilled workers in areas that are dominated by men. As both the U.K. and the U.S. have programs that favor highly skilled immigration, women are disadvantaged (Yuval-Davis, Anthias and Kofman 2005). The media framings of high-skilled workers’ contributions focus on those in the STEM (science, technology, engineering, and mathematics) fields, but these fields are also where gender imbalance persists.²⁶ As STEM are male-dominated fields, many of the spouses of these high-skilled workers who are granted legal stay in the U.S. by H-1B visa are not allowed to work, making them unable to legally contribute to the economy and leading to their underrepresentation in the media (Bhatt n.d.). Hence, I expect that the economic frames used by news articles tend to identify immigrants’ as men.

On the other hand, exceptions exist in cases where women break gender norms, making them “interesting” and “worthwhile” of media attention. For example, women running in electoral races exemplify novelty as politics are generally men’s game (Karp and Banducci 2008; Mansbridge 1999); hence, female political candidates may appear more in the media (Meeks 2012). Another example of women standing out in their activities is their participation in sports, resulting in their visibility in the media. As sports are considered masculine activities with the underlying assumption that men are the major participants, when female players win a game or

²⁵ All the jobs that are also dominated by migrant workers in all four cases are primarily lower-wage jobs that require little skills (Camarota and Zeigler 2009; Ong and Hu n.d; Rienzo 2014; Lee and Wu 2013).

²⁶ Parker, Ashley. “Gender Bias Seen in Visas for Skilled Workers.” *The New York Times*. March 18, 2013.

receive an award, their achievements are highlighted via the emphasis of their gender (Daddario and Wigley 2007; Wenner 2009). Although there may be more coverage on women in areas where women are not seen as the traditional players, the media's emphasis on women breaking the norms suggests society's understanding and assignment of gender roles. Therefore, I expect that because female labor may be considered breaking gender norms, the gender identity of migrant women is more likely to be highlighted in the media's utilization of the economic frames in portraying immigration. This discussion leads us to two opposing hypotheses about the visibility of women:

Visibility hypotheses

H1a: The news articles that frame immigration using the immigrants' impact on the economy are likely to discuss male immigrants.

H1b: The news articles that frame immigration using the immigrants' impact on the economy are likely to specify the gender identities of female immigrants.

Second, even when women's economic participation is recognized, they are often assigned effeminized occupations that fit with gender conventions and stereotypes. For example, women are usually expected to be employed in care work and domestic help industries, although not all women hold these effeminized occupations (Boyd and Greico 2003; Eckenwiler 2009). Such portrayal of women's contribution in the economy can result in the media's gendering immigration in two ways. On the one hand, most of these effeminized occupations do not involve visibility as they occur in private or in home settings. For example, in the hotel industry migrant women are concentrated in the "back of the house" as cleaners, resulting in their very limited interactions with the world (Louie 2001). Because their presence is often invisible, migrant women's services and contributions also are likely to be invisible whereas men are likely to be more visible as their works in masculine industries are done in the public.²⁷

²⁷ According to Camarota and Zeigler's (2009) study, immigrants in the U.S. hold a significant portion of several occupations and many of these industries are gendered. For example, 42% of the taxi drivers and

In addition, effeminized occupations offer various implications about women's role in the economy. Effeminized occupations, because they are held by women, may be considered irrelevant. That is, migrant women's "taking over" native female citizens' jobs may not be considered as critical a threat to native citizens because women are often not considered the crucial source of income in families. In other words, because women are not traditionally seen as the breadwinners of the family, their jobs are not considered as vital as their male partners'. Therefore, the economic threat that female immigrants might pose, even when they participate in the labor force, differs from that of male migrants. Because of the general conceptualization of women's labor, I expect the media to highlight the gender identity of migrant men more when discussing the economic threat that immigrants pose.

As migrant women are likely to provide domestic help or health care, their jobs may be considered necessary for families who are in need of cheap labor to take care of the elderly and children. In this case, their employers are able to devote to their own careers and contribute to the economy more significantly; hence migrant women's contribution may even be considered as crucial (Lan 2006). Particularly in countries where a significant portion of women participate in the labor force, help around the house alleviates these female citizens' responsibilities in the household as their own economic contributions are recognized and encouraged. I argue that more so in the four cases I examine where there is no paid family leave, namely the U.S., or that paid maternity leave is not encouraged by employers, namely Taiwan, help around the house is especially important for families. The "necessity" of domestic help or care work may not only

chauffeurs are held by immigrants and 45% of the housekeepers in the U.S. are held by immigrants and housekeeping jobs. Housekeepers, predominantly women, work in a private setting whereas taxi drivers, predominantly men, work in the public, where they are much more visible and have much more interactions with native citizens than female maids or housekeepers. In the U.K., the top two jobs held by migrants are elementary process plant occupations and cleaning and housekeeping (Rienzo 2014). Migrants work in factories and in housekeeping in Taiwan whereas migrants work in construction and housekeeping in Hong Kong. As examples in all four cases demonstrate, occupations held by migrants can easily be divided by the traditional gender norms and the degree to which they occur outside of the public sphere with female immigrants more likely to be in occupations in the private sphere.

make female migrants less threatening but possibly even desirable. For that reason, I expect that the necessity of effeminized services in host countries is likely to lead to the high visibility of women in the media's coverage in discussing economic contribution of immigrants. Also, I argue that the media's discussions of immigrants when their gender identities are not explicitly stated may be context-specific. Given that many migrant women in Hong Kong and Taiwan are hired as care workers and domestic workers, I suspect the effect to be stronger in Hong Kong and Taiwan.

Gendered economic impact hypotheses

H2a: The news articles that discuss negative impact on the economy are likely to mention migrant men's gender identity.

H2b: The news articles that portray immigrants' positive impact on the economy are likely to specify migrant women's gender identity.

H2c: The news articles that highlight the economic contribution of female immigrants will appear more frequently in the media in Hong Kong and Taiwan.

Third, when one's sex is not specified in the news coverage, the media make assumptions about gender and assign gender to individuals based on their presumed attributes (Van Zoonen 1994). Much of the inclusion of women in the media are often based on gender stereotypes (Burns et al. 2013; Glascock and Preston-Schreck 2004; Len-Rios, Thorson, and Yoon 2005). For example, a story about a construction worker might not identify the sex of the worker, but having a job in the construction industry implies that the worker is a man because he has a "masculine" job. Similarly, being employed as a care taker suggests and may encourage readers to perceive the worker more as a woman rather than a man. Consequently, even when the media do not explicitly declare the gender identities of immigrants, I suspect that the media are more likely to incorporate implicitly gendered traits of masculinity when discussing the economic impacts of immigration.

Gender assumption hypotheses

H3a: The news articles that highlight immigrants' negative impact on the economy are likely to mention masculinized jobs.

H3b: The news articles that emphasize immigrants' positive impact on the economy are likely to mention effeminized jobs.

Data and Methodology

To evaluate how immigration is represented in the media in the four cases, I conduct a framing analysis of coverage of immigration in the most circulated newspapers in Hong Kong, Taiwan, the United Kingdom, and the United States in 2014. I follow a two-step procedure that uses both qualitative and quantitative analysis to gather data. First, I employ relevant keyword searches in the three most circulated and ideologically diverse publications in each country between January 2014 and December 2014.²⁸ Articles are sought from the LexisNexis Academic archive, the ProQuest archive, and the other national newspapers archives using both the English and Chinese terms “immigration,” “immigrant,” “alien,” “migrant,” “asylum seeker,” “refugee,” “undocumented,” “guest worker,” and “international student.”²⁹ In addition to searching these terms, because of the way the language works, I also search for “foreign bride,” “foreign spouse,” and “foreign worker” in Chinese, which are equivalent to the English terms “migrant bride,” “migrant spouse,” and “migrant worker” to ensure that I do not exclude female immigrants and do not oversample the western contexts. Although Chinese and English represent distinct

²⁸ Thirty-seven articles are generated from Hong Kong's *Headline Daily*, 62 from Hong Kong's *Oriental Daily News*, 84 from Hong Kong's *Apple Daily*,; 105 from Taiwan's *Apple Daily*, 225 from Taiwan's *The Liberty Times*, 279 from Taiwan's *United Daily News*, 108 from the U.K.'s *The Sun*, 151 from the U.K.'s *Daily Telegraph*, 124 from the UK's *The Times*, 154 from the U.S.'s *The Wall Street Journal*, 342 from the U.S.'s *The New York Times*, and 42 from the U.S.'s *USA Today*. I recognize that differences exist in newspaper types (some are considered tabloids while others are generally accepted as high quality news outlets). However, by selecting on their popularity I am assured that they are widely read, which is crucial to my focus on examining the messages regarding immigration that readers receive.

²⁹ Although international students are not often included in the analysis of migrant population, I consider them migrants because like other immigrants, they are foreigners who enter the country for a number of years and may also have the intention to stay in their host countries beyond their studies. In particular cases, like the U.K., international students outnumber refugees in recent years and they are also accounted for the “net migration” statistics that have been utilized by policymakers (Bliner and Allen n.d.).

language processing, the lack of grammatical gender in English and Chinese makes issues of gendered media framing that might arise from gendered nouns irrelevant in all four countries.

Second, from these articles, I draw a representative sample of articles that consists of all stories on one day of each week in all weeks in 2014. The day of the week chosen differs each week by randomizing the day chosen in a specific week. On that day, all of the news, editorials, opinion columns, and features, and other coverage using the keywords mentioned above are included in the sample. The result is a sample of 1,718 articles. In other words, I examine all news stories from these 12 newspapers from all four countries on the same days. This particular method of sampling allows me to avoid oversampling events that may have occurred and received much media attention on consecutive days. Table 2-1 shows the breakdown of the types of coverage on immigration from my sample. The majority of the newspaper articles related to immigration are news articles where factual news or events are reported. Meanwhile, op-eds, feature articles, editorials, and letters to the editors also appear in my sample and are examined. In addition to these common types of articles, the keywords I examine also appear in interviews, public announcements, art (book, theater performance, film, etc.) reviews, obituaries of famous individuals, and portraits of an individual or group among others. They constitute a smaller portion of the newspaper sample, except for in the U.S. where 5% of the news coverage in the media is reviews of art performances and 3% are obituaries of well-known individuals whose immigrant identities are declared.

Table 2-1. Types of News in the Newspaper Sample in 2014 in Hong Kong, Taiwan, the U.K., and the U.S.

| | News | Op-Ed | Feature | Editorial | Letters to the Editor | Other | Total N. |
|----------------|--------------|-------------|------------|-------------|-----------------------|-------------|----------|
| Hong Kong | 164 (89%) | 4 (2%) | 0 (0%) | 14 (8%) | 1 (0.5%) | 1 (0.5%) | 184 |
| Taiwan | 526 (86%) | 16 (3%) | 20 (3%) | 4 (1%) | 33 (5%) | 10 (2%) | 609 |
| United Kingdom | 239 (62%) | 3 (1%) | 32 (8%) | 41 (11%) | 59 (15%) | 10 (3%) | 386 |
| U.S.A. | 317 (59%) | 56 (10%) | 20 (4%) | 26 (5%) | 50 (9%) | 85 (13%) | 539 |

Once the articles are collected, I conduct framing analysis of newspapers articles on immigration across all four countries. I interpret the meaning of the texts by analyzing the media framings of immigration (Gamson and Modigliani 1989; Hertog and McLeod 2001; Pan and Kosicki 1993; Reese 2010). It is important to note that frames are not topics but instead the devices in which the reporters use to convey meaning (Gamson and Hertog and McLeod 2001; Modigliani 1989; Reese 2010). While the framing mechanisms are choices made by the reporters and can be subtle, I specifically analyze how articles are structured and presented in the ways immigrants' gender, activities, and influences are identified. Additionally, I analyze how discourse surrounding immigration is constructed through the reporters' presentation of issues and statistics and selection of specific quotations to accompany the article (van Dijk 1995; van Gorp 2010;). I also collect information about the themes of the articles. The positions³⁰ toward immigration and the multiple identities (gender, country of origin, occupation, education, religion, dress, language, role in the family, and more) are also collected during the data collection process to aid my interpretations of the media frames.

³⁰ Positions toward immigration are related to the positive or negative position taken on immigration in the article based on explicit statements of positive or negative views of immigration or whether the article discusses the benefits or costs of immigration.

The major themes that I identify in the articles are the following: legal aspects, immigration, policies, homeland/security politics, integration, immigrant rights, threat, xenophobia, contribution, hardship, immigrant demographics, and miscellaneous. These themes are then broken down into various issues that are identified underneath the major themes of these articles (see Table A-2 in Appendix A for details about theme and issue summaries.) From analyzing these texts, I determine the frames. The combination of the general themes, position, and various identities in an article allows me to overcome the common mistakes of confusing general topics and positions and identify the ideology of discourse (Gamson 1992; Gamson and Modigliani 1989; Nisbet 2010; Reese 2010; Quinsaat 2014). Through assessing the ways that the media identify immigrants or immigration issues, I am also able to interpret the meanings they convey (Gamson and Modigliani 1989; Hertog and McLeod 2001; Pan and Kosicki 1993; Reese 2010).

Analysis of the Economic Framings of Immigration

Several dominant frames are identified in my analysis of the media coverage on immigration. Table 2-2 reports the types of frame that are used by the media in all sampled countries. This chapter focuses on the economy as it constitutes 36% of the sampled frames used by the media. However, the economy remains one of several frames utilized by the media as displayed in Table 2-2. National identity and culture is the other primary way the media frame immigration as it constitutes 53% of the sampled media frames, which will be discussed in detail in Chapter 3. Other frames that often appear are a focus on national identity and culture, policy analysis, and crime.³¹ In the media's discussion of the economic aspects of immigration,

³¹ While the economic frames are not the most dominant frames that the media use in discussing immigration, the other media frames are analyzed in my other paper.

economic threat and economic contribution are the two major frames used by the media. In the subsequent sections, I explain the economic threat and economic contribution frames in detail and provide examples of each.

Table 2-2. Types of Frames of Immigration across all Sampled Countries

| Frame | Number | Percentage |
|-----------------------|--------|------------|
| Economic threat | 251 | 15 |
| Economic contribution | 132 | 8 |
| Cultural threat | 334 | 19 |
| Cultural integration | 454 | 26 |
| Other | 551 | 32 |
| Total | 1722 | 100 |

Economic Threat Frame

The economic threat frame centers on the negative consequences of immigration on the economy. In this frame, immigrants are often labeled as job seekers, job takers, or job stealers. In addition to criticizing immigrants for “taking over” native citizens’ jobs, the media also question the quality of their labor. Particularly, as the media frame immigration surrounding its economic threat, they may highlight the threat for the most marginalized groups, such as the working class. For example, those indigenous to Taiwan are likely to be from working class. Migrant workers’ legal presence has been discussed as a threat to the indigenous population’s ability to live decent lives due to increasing unemployment. An excerpt from Taiwan’s *The Liberty Times* shows how an economic threat frame is utilized in discussing the unemployment rate among indigenous citizens in Taiwan:

Historically, the indigenous people were forced to leave their home towns and migrate to cities for work. Now the government’s open door policy has caused

the high unemployment rate among the indigenous. They are no longer able to pay off their mortgages and are facing tremendous obstacles in their lives.³²

Not only do the media frame immigration through its negative consequences on unemployment or labor quality, but they also highlight the economic burdens on the government or taxpayers (referring to native citizens) in the economic threat frame. Oftentimes the media present the amount of money it would cost the government to fund social welfare programs targeted at immigrants or making border control more strict and effective. The U.K.'s *The Daily Telegraph* uses this frame by citing a report from Migration Watch UK, a conservative organization that is anti-immigration:

In fact, immigration between 1995 and 2011 cost the taxpayer more than £140 billion, or £22 million a day, after balancing what immigrants pay in tax with what they take out of Britain's coffers by claiming benefits and tax credits, it said. In 2011 alone the cost was £23 billion, or £3,000 each for the eight million foreign-born population[s], the group concluded. The sum was equal to the amount spent by the National Health Services on general practitioners and dentists in a year.³³

In the media's usage of this frame, immigrants are often accused of adding to the burden on taxpayers, implying that immigrants do not pay taxes and only receive benefits from social welfare. In addition to the increased social welfare burden, a news article from Hong Kong's *Oriental Daily* argues that immigration causes increasing competition for public housing and on food-regulation (through the importation of unapproved products).³⁴ In utilizing this frame, this editorial particularly argues that the social welfare and public housing benefits for immigrants are the source of tension between immigrants and citizens:

³² 七成土地不能用 原民聯署爭補償 2014. *The Liberty Times*. January 5

³³ Barrett, David. 2014. Immigrants Cost Britain £3,000 a Year Each, Says Report. *The Daily Telegraph*. March 12.

³⁴ China has suffered from an outbreak of tainted baby formula since 2008, causing a high demand for baby formula and other related food products from international brands. This shortage of legitimate food supplies in China are also perceived as a cause for the shortage in Hong Kong as the Chinese are known to cross the border and enter Hong Kong to purchase food products, leaving the residents of Hong Kong with decreased supplies (Buckley and Wong 2015).

A new policy passed in the end of last year that allowed the newcomers to apply for public housing after one year of residency. Although it is approximated to only cost the new administration a few more billion Hong Kong dollars, once this policy is set, it will only create competition for other housing and medical resources. The government calls for acceptance of newcomers from China, but such policy only creates xenophobia.

The example refers to an implementation of a new policy, already been set in stone, to stress the power that newcomers might have on shaping pro-China policies. The framing suggests that China-friendly policies only create anxiety over competition for resources among native Hong Kongers and Chinese newcomers. The example creates a sense of political take-over and also a sense of anxiety in the reduction of resources for Hong Kongers as they have to compete for housing, medical, and even food resources with the mainlanders, implying that the prevalence of immigrants in their economic take-over of Hong Kong.

Moreover, the media frame immigration with economic burdens to analyze how well political parties do in electoral races. In discussing constituents' changing support for the U.K.'s Independent Party (Ukip), a news excerpt in the U.K.'s *The Daily Telegraph* frames the economic burden caused by immigration as the primary concern for the party's upcoming election:

Ukip, however, will not be unhappy. It has become increasingly apparent that Nigel Farage's party is more than just a repository for disenchanting Tories. In particular, many less affluent voters have been dismayed by the way immigration from Eastern Europe has driven down wages and threatened jobs, while putting pressure on housing and public services.³⁵

These examples of the media's framing of immigration as economic threat demonstrate the negative consequences of immigration portrayed by the media. As the economic threat frame is employed in multiple instances, ranging from highlighting the unemployment rate among the native citizens, fiscal burden on the national government, to political debates surrounding the open door policy for immigrants, these various ways of framing immigration as an economic

³⁵ Osborne, Peter. 2014. Labour's Unforced Error on the EU is a Priceless Gift for its Opponents. *The Telegraph* March 12.

threat suggests the perception of viewing immigrants more as a threat than as a promise, illuminating the general fear of labor competition and a nation's financial status.

Economic Contribution Frame

On the contrary, in using the economic contribution frame, the media focus on the positive impact that immigrants bring to the economy. In Taiwan where there are a large percentage of families with a foreign-born spouse, mostly women, the news articles emphasize their contribution to the economy. An excerpt from Taiwan's *The United Daily News* shows that migrant women have teamed up with native citizens to fulfill the labor shortage.

Nantou, the capital of tea, is facing a serious demand for labor. The labor shortage has caused the average age of the tea pickers to go up. The tea gardens even have hired 80-year-old grandmothers, and even grandfathers, to pick tea. With the migrant brides, they have formed a team, going to different tea farms around town, making it a unique characteristic of the capital of tea.³⁶

The description of the migrant women who are tea pickers illustrates that they have integrated through their economic contribution in society, fulfilling the labor shortage where there is a high demand of tea pickers. Similarly, also in Taiwan, the growing population of children in these families of the foreign brides is seen as potential human capital that may help with the economic development of Taiwan. Much emphasis in article from Taiwan's *The United Daily News* has focused on these second generation immigrants in broadening the business relations between Taiwan and other parts of East Asia.

[The government] has developed programs to mandate that the second generations learn their mother tongue. Its purpose is to encourage these children to embrace their mothers' language and culture. In a more positive outlook, Taiwan and Southeast Asian countries have had much more business transactions. The second generation's language ability has potential to broaden

³⁶ 千歲採茶班征戰南投茶山 2014. *United Daily News*. February 12.

the market for Taiwan.³⁷

Although the portrayal of immigrants as potential human resource in developing the economy seems positive, it suggests that an immigrant's worth lies in the "economic" contribution they can make to society. While the example above illustrates the economic contribution that second generation children may bring by their bilingual abilities, the demographic group that makes a positive economic contribution that these news articles identify is mostly distinct from the demographic group they identify in the economic threat frame. News articles that utilize an economic contribution frame often emphasize the wealthy investors' positive impact on the economy. That is, instead of discussing the contributions that ordinary migrants from the working class might make at factories, on the farms, in the restaurants, or at homes, the media highlight the economic contributions of foreign investors. As opposed to being jobseekers, those who migrate through the investment they make are coined "job creators." The number of jobs that wealthy immigrants create is often presented in the economic contribution frame, illustrated by a news article excerpt from *The Wall Street Journal* about the EB-5 visa, which provides a method of obtaining a green card for foreigners who make investments in the U.S.:

To date, the agency estimates the program has raised \$8.6 billion and created at least 57,300 jobs since 1990.³⁸

As EB-5³⁹ offers wealthy immigrants an opportunity to obtain permanent residency, the news articles that report the stories of immigration through investment also reveal the gender identity and nationality of those that invest in the U.S. Another article from *The Wall Street*

³⁷ 教育部推新住民母語班. 2014, *United Daily News*, March 23.

³⁸ Loten, Angus. 2014. Job-Creating Visa Program Had Record Applications in 2013. *The Wall Street Journal* January 20.

³⁹ The EB-5 program was created in 1990 by the U.S. Congress to stimulate the economy in the aim to create jobs through foreign investors' capital investment. Under this program, entrepreneurs and their immediate families (children must be 21 years old) are eligible to apply for permanent residence in the U.S. if they meet the requirements of the government, such as making substantial amount of investment and creating 10 permanent full-time jobs for U.S. citizens. (United Citizenship and Immigration Services).

details how franchises that struggle to find buyers utilize the EB-5 program to attract foreign buyers, mostly from China, to save their businesses.

One franchise buyer who has tapped the EB-5 program is Zhijun Mao. In March, the 25-year-old borrowed \$550,000 from his parents in China to open a YoBlendz frozen-yogurt stand, as well as a JuiceBlendz fresh-juice stand, at the American Airlines Arena in Miami. A graduate of the State University of New York at Buffalo, where he studied finance and international business, Mr. Mao applied for an EB-5 visa in July based on the investment, which included a one-time franchise fee of \$40,000. His student visa is set to expire in June. Mr. Mao says the two stands will put about 24 people to work, including up to eight workers behind the two counters. The rest of the jobs are based on estimates of increased consumer spending, as his investment ripples through the local economy, he says.⁴⁰

The description of the amount of money needed to invest and gain citizenship through EB-5 and the number of workers are hired imply that this federal program has helped aid the economy, particularly by the amount of money that immigrants spend on investments.

Nevertheless, even in framing immigration with foreign investors' economic contributions, there are often questions about whether their investments are up to par with the number of benefits they receive through their investment. In questioning the Tier 1 Investor Program, in which GBP£1 million is required for immigrants to attain UK permanent residency, news articles like the one from the U.K.'s *The Times*⁴¹ below depicts the negative connotation behind the economic contribution of foreign investors:

Hundreds of Russian oligarchs and Chinese millionaires have won the right to settle in Britain in return for a minimum £1 million in gilts.⁴¹

In the economic contribution frame, words like selling and auctioning may be used to describe the visas, permanent residency, or citizenship that investors receive in return. The media's usage of the economic contribution frame thus also takes their contribution with a grain of salt, reminding the readers that immigrants who invest a large amount of money also receive

⁴⁰ Loten, Angus. 2014. Franchises Target Immigrants as Buyers. *The Wall Street Journal* February 3.

⁴¹ Barrett, David. 2014. 850 Chinese Millionaires and Russian Oligarchs Have 'Brought' British Visa. *The Telegraph* February 25.

citizenship or permanent residency in return. In other words, both parties (nation and immigrants) benefit from this exchange.

Cross-National Analysis of the Gendered Economic Media Framings of Immigration

My findings suggest that economic threat and economic contribution are the two ways the media frame immigration. Table 2-3 reports the types of frames used by the media, broken down by country. Among the news articles that discuss the economic dimension of immigration in my sample, 66% of them utilize the economic threat frame while 34% of the news articles employ the economic contribution frame. Although the media in all four cases frame immigration as an economic threat at a higher rate than as economic contribution, countries differ in the extent to which they utilize the economic threat frame and the economic contribution in discussing the economic impacts of immigration.. As Table 4 indicates, in Hong Kong, 63% of the news articles utilize the economic threat frame and 37% utilize the economic contribution frame. In Taiwan, 56% of the news articles utilize the economic threat frame and 44% utilize the economic contribution frame. In the U.K. 75% of the media frame immigration as an economic threat and 25% frame immigration as an form of economic contribution. In the U.S. 63% of the media utilize the economic threat frame while 37% of the media utilize an economic contribution frame. The overwhelmingly usage of the economic threat frame in most countries in my sample suggest that the mainstream discourse surrounding immigrants' influences centers on their negative impact on the economy. In the following sections, I present my findings from testing my hypotheses and discuss how they differ by country.

Table 2-3. Usage of Economic Frames by the Media, by Country

| | Economic threat | Economic contribution | Total |
|--------------------|-----------------|-----------------------|-------|
| Hong Kong | 27 (63%) | 16 (37%) | 43 |
| Taiwan | 48 (56%) | 38 (44%) | 86 |
| United Kingdom | 106 (75%) | 36 (25%) | 142 |
| U.S.A. | 70 (63%) | 41 (37%) | 111 |
| Newspaper articles | 251 (66%) | 131 (34%) | 382 |

Visibility Hypotheses

My assumption about the visibility of male and female immigrants in the media has led to two alternative hypotheses. My H1a states that the news articles that are linked to immigrants' impact on the economy are likely mention migrant men's gender identity while my H1b states that the news articles surrounding the economic impacts of immigration are likely to specify the sex of female immigrants. I examine these hypotheses by analyzing how frequent media identify the sex of immigrants when framing immigration as an economic issue.

Table 2-4 displays the ways the sex of immigrants is mentioned in the economic frames in all four countries. Most news articles rarely explicitly identify the sex of immigrants. Ninety-four percent of the news articles using the economic threat frame fail to identify the sex of immigrants whereas 81% of the news articles using the economic contribution frame fail to do so. Moreover, in the economic threat frame, although migrant women appear to be discussed at a slightly higher number than migrant men, my test of significance shows me that there is no

significant difference in how migrant men and women are portrayed in the economic threat frame. In other words, male immigrants are as likely to be identified as female immigrants. In the economic contribution frames, male immigrants appear slightly more than female immigrants. Among all news articles that use the economic threat frame, 4.5% of them explicitly identify immigrants discussed as men or women.⁴² Among all news articles that use the economic contribution frame, 9% of them explicitly identify immigrants discussed as men whereas 8% explicitly identify immigrants as women. However, my test of significance again shows me that there is no significant difference in the likelihood of migrant men and women being identified in the economic contribution frame. Table 2-4 also illustrates that a small portion of news articles also explicitly identify both male and female immigrants at 1% in the economic threat frame and 2% in the economic contribution frame.

Contrary to my initial expectation of the media to explicitly gender immigration, the media in reality do not highlight the gender identities of immigrants. Furthermore, male immigrants are not identified significantly more than female immigrants in the utilization of economic threat frame. What is interesting, however, is that migrant women are much more likely to be identified than migrant men in the economic contribution frame. This outcome may be attributed to two reasons. First, because of the lower visibility of women in the labor force; their rarity makes the news stories interesting. Therefore, when the media report on female immigrants' activities in the labor force, the media tend to mark gender. Second, women's effeminized

⁴² While the figures on explicitly identified male and female immigrants may seem low, it is important to note that I use the strictest method in evaluating whether sex of immigrants is explicitly identified. Gender pronouns like male, man, men, he, his, female, woman, women, she, her must be used in the articles in order for the article to be coded as explicit identification of the sex of immigrants. Although other information, such as names that are most commonly gendered, like John being a man and Maria being a woman, could be used to identify the sex of immigrants discussed, I opt out in using that information for several reasons. First, some names are more gender neutral than others, such as Charlie could possibly mean both Charles and Charlotte. Second, there are always chances that a person with a name that commonly identifies himself or herself as a man or a woman could be the opposite sex. Third, names in Chinese are harder to identify as men or women. Therefore, forgoing assumption about sex of immigrants ensures that my coding schemes are consistent across articles and across countries.

occupation may be seen as a contribution rather than a threat because their jobs are often considered necessary and helpful, particularly to employers who are women. For instance, female citizens in industrialized societies participate in the formal economy. While their participation in the formal economy is often at the expense of their fulfillment of their roles as mothers, wives, and caretakers, as traditionally expected in society, hiring housekeepers, particularly those from abroad, becomes a way for women to pursue their career goals. Therefore, migrant women become desirable and their contribution is recognized at a higher rate than men's.

Table 2-4. Immigrants' Gender Identities in the Economic Frames

| Economic threat | | | | Economic integration | | | |
|-------------------|----------|-----------|----------------------|----------------------|------------|------------|----------------------|
| Sex not mentioned | Male | Female | Both sexes mentioned | Sex not mentioned | Male | Female | Both sexes mentioned |
| 238 (94%) | 5 (2) | 7 (3%) | 1 (1%) | 107 (81%) | 12 (9%) | 10 (8%) | 3 (2%) |

While gender identities are rarely and less likely to be mentioned in the media's economic frames as I initially expect, my findings are not surprising as they align with the media's reporting of gender in other coverage. Asymmetrical gender marking is common in the media's coverage on male-dominated areas, such as sports and politics (Daddario and Wigley 2007; Wenner 2009). The lack of identification of gender identities of individuals that hold masculine occupations or engage in masculine activities, such as athletes, politicians, or immigrants, suggests that the journalists often fail to make an effort to mark sex as men are already the dominant players. However, when women engage in these traditionally considered masculine activities, their gender identity tends to be highlighted because their unusual presence signals novelty and indicates their breaking of the gender norms. This pattern of asymmetrical gender-marking where there is no need to emphasize immigrants as men is similarly found in my analysis of the economic frames.

Gendered Economic Impact Hypotheses

In addition to the visibility hypotheses, I also test my gendered economic impact hypotheses, which can vary based on the media framings of the economic impacts of male and female immigrants. Specifically, my H2a states that the economic threat frame is likely to be employed in the discussion of male immigrants. My H2b states that the news articles' framing of immigration based on the economic contribution is likely to lead to emphasize the sex of migrant women. My H2c further states that the news articles highlighting the economic contribution of female immigrants are likely to appear more frequently in the media in Hong Kong and Taiwan. I test my gendered economic impact hypotheses by examining how female and male immigrants are identified in the media's framing of immigration as an economic threat or economic contribution.

Table 2-5 illustrates the ways the sex of immigrants is mentioned in the economic frames in all four countries. Again, the majority of news articles in each rarely explicitly identify the sex of the immigrants, leading to very little country different in how the media explicitly or implicitly gender immigration. When the media do identify gender identities of immigrants, the media differ across countries in how they do so. Table 2-5 shows that my H2a is supported in the U.S., but not supported in Hong Kong, Taiwan, and the U.K. Six percent of the economic threat frames identify immigrants as men whereas only 3% of the economic threat frames identify immigrants as women. In Taiwan and the U.K., however, migrant men's and men's gender identities are specified in the economic threat frame at an equal. In Taiwan, 1% of the economic threat frame specifies male immigrants' sex and another 1% specifies female immigrants' sex. In the U.K., none of the economic threat frame identifies the sex of migrant men and women. On the contrary, the economic threat frame in Hong Kong identifies immigrants as women more than they do men.

Specifically, in 15% of the economic threat frame in Hong Kong identify the sex of female immigrants whereas 0% of migrant men are identified in the same frame.

Similar to what has been found with the economic threat frame's identification of the sex of immigrants, the economic contribution frame also rarely identifies immigrants' sex. However, when looking at the media's employment of economic contribution frames, different patterns emerge. Twelve percent and 13% of the news articles in Hong Kong and Taiwan, respectively, incorporate migrant women when framing immigration as a form of economic contribution. This outcome shows that my H2c is supported in Hong Kong and Taiwan. This outcome, again, could be explained by the nature of gendered migrant labor in these cases. It is popular and common for middle-class and upper-class families in Hong Kong and Taiwan to hire housekeepers.

Opposite from Hong Kong and Taiwan, the media in the U.K. and the U.S. incorporate migrant women's sex more than migrant men's when using the economic contribution frame to discuss immigration. Looking more closely, 8% of the economic contribution frame in the U.K. identifies male immigrants whereas only 3% identifies female immigrants. Similarly in the U.S., 17% of the economic contribution frame identifies male immigrants whereas only 5% identifies female immigrants. This result is opposite from how the economic threat frames are gendered in Hong Kong and Taiwan., suggesting that when immigrants are discussed in the U.K. and the U.S., male immigrants are more likely to be identified as making a contribution as well as economically threatening. This outcome shows that my H2b is not supported in the U.K or the U.S.

These differences in cross-country patterns may be explained by the number and proportion of migrant women of all immigrants. When the percentages of female immigrants are higher, their contribution to the economy, in industries, namely domestic work and care work, where there seems to be a high demand but low threat makes them more visible in the media in Hong Kong and Taiwan. On the other hand, when the percentage of male immigrants are

relatively higher or when gender ratio is more balanced, like in the U.K., and the U.S., migrant men are more likely to be portrayed in the media as both threatening and contributing.

Table 2-5. Immigrants' Gender Identities in the Economic Frames, by Country

| | Economic threat | | | | Economic integration | | | |
|-----------|-------------------|-----------|------------|----------------------|----------------------|------------|------------|----------------------|
| | Sex not mentioned | Male | Female | Both sexes mentioned | Sex not mentioned | Male | Female | Both sexes mentioned |
| Hong Kong | 23 (85%) | 0 (0%) | 4 (15%) | 0 (0%) | 14 (88%) | 0 (0%) | 2 (12%) | 0 (0%) |
| Taiwan | 45 (94%) | 1 (2%) | 1 (2%) | 1 (2%) | 31 (82%) | 2 (5%) | 5 (13%) | 0 (0%) |
| U.K. | 106 (100%) | 0 (0%) | 0 (0%) | 0 (0%) | 32 (89%) | 3 (8%) | 1 (3%) | 0 (0%) |
| U.S.A. | 64 (91%) | 4 (6%) | 2 (3%) | 0 (0%) | 29 (71%) | 7 (17%) | 2 (5%) | 3 (7%) |

Gender Assumption Hypotheses

While my findings demonstrate that the media vary in their gendering of immigration in multiple countries, the media can also be gendered in their assumptions of the sex of immigrants by their selective prioritization of the occupation of immigrants. As my gender assumption hypotheses state, the news articles that discuss immigrants' negative impact on the economy are likely to mention masculinized jobs and the news articles that discuss immigrants' positive impact are likely to include effeminized jobs. I test my gender assumption hypotheses by examining occupation of immigrants reported by the media when their gender identities are not revealed.

Although the sex of immigrants is rarely identified in these news articles, the media implicitly suggest the sex of immigrants through the occupations they identify. Sixty-four percent of the news articles with the economic threat frame in all four cases fail to identify the occupation of immigrants. Nevertheless, the economic threat frames implicitly suggest the sex of immigrants using stereotypical occupations with which immigrants are often associated. Many of these occupations are likely to be explicitly gendered, meaning the sex of the workers can be assumed or guessed based on the socially constructed understanding of such occupation. For example, construction workers are more likely to be considered a masculine profession whereas nannies are considered a feminine profession. On the one hand, the implicit associations of construction workers with men and nannies with women may be a result of the distribution of men and women in these professions in reality. For example, according to the 2014 U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics, roughly 9% of construction workers are women. The reality of construction being a gender-imbalanced industry may lead people to associate construction workers with men. Similarly, according to the 2012 Institute for Women's Policy and Research, only roughly 13% of the housekeepers in the U.S. are men. This gender imbalance in the housekeeping industry may lead individuals to associate domestic workers with men. More closely related to the breakdown of gender and immigrant occupation, roughly 100% of the migrant workers in Hong Kong and Taiwan that work as housekeepers and nannies are women whereas roughly 100% of the migrant workers in Hong Kong and Taiwan who work as construction workers and fishing boat workers are men (Department of Internal Affairs of Taiwan 2015; Labor Department of Hong Kong 2007). The reality of gender imbalance in certain professions may lead to people to instill gender stereotypes on immigrants. On the other hand, the implicit associations of these occupations may also be a result of how individuals are used to seeing and experiencing in the world. Based on these past experiences and interactions with the world, members of a society formulate their own judgments of immigrants based on their gender.

The following is a list of occupations that appear in my newspaper sample: construction workers, farmers, factory workers, restaurant workers (delivery people and dishwashers), fishing boat workers, caretakers, domestic workers, nannies, international students, foreign teachers, and entrepreneurs. Based on the implicit gender attributions of these occupations, I create three categories for them: masculine, feminine, and gender-neutral. Farmers, fishing boat workers, and the jobs alike that require much physical strength and that are often considered masculine belong to the masculine category. Additionally, some media coverage does not specify the type of masculine occupation an immigrant holds, but they do indicate that these occupations are low-skilled, blue-collar work. Therefore, I also treat unspecified blue-collar jobs as part of the masculine profession. Housekeeping, nannies, and healthcare workers are often considered feminine and mostly occupied by women belong to the feminine category. Some other occupations, such as international students and foreign teachers, are more ambiguous in that both men and women could be students and teachers. Although there might be a gender difference in these two occupations, gender imbalance remains unreported. Therefore, I treat international students and foreign teachers as gender-neutral professions.

Table 2-6 reports the number and percentage of articles that do and do not mention immigrants' occupations in all four cases. My results show that 73% of the articles in all four cases do not explicitly specify the occupation of immigrants. They also show that 21% of the economic threat frames in all four cases are associated with masculine professions. On the contrary, only 5% of the economic threat frames associate immigrants with feminine professions.

Table 2-6. Immigrants' Occupation Identified in Economic Threat Frames in Newspapers

| | Masculine Occupation | Feminine Occupation | Gender-Neutral Occupation | Total |
|-----------|----------------------|---------------------|---------------------------|-------|
| Hong Kong | 23 (66%) | 4 (11%) | 8 (23%) | 35 |
| Taiwan | 20 (41%) | 9 (18%) | 19 (40%) | 48 |
| U.K. | 5 (5%) | 0 | 101 (95%) | 106 |
| U.S. | 7 (10%) | 1 (1%) | 63 (89%) | 71 |
| Total | 55 (21%) | 14 (5%) | 191 (73%) | 260 |

When evaluating the media frames by country, Table 2-6 shows 66% of the economic threat frames in Hong Kong mentions masculine professions and 11% mention feminine professions. Similarly in Taiwan, when the media frame immigration as an economic threat, 41% of the economic threat frames identify migrants to have masculine occupations and 18% identify immigrants to have feminine occupations. In both Taiwan and Hong Kong, male-dominated positions, namely construction workers, fishing boat worker, factory workers, and entrepreneurs are more likely to be mentioned when the media frame immigration as an economic threat.

Similarly, in the U.K. and the U.S., a significant portion of my sample does not explicitly specify the occupations of immigrants when framing immigration as an economic threat as displayed in Table 2-6. Ninety five percent of the sample in the U.K. is neutral in gendering the occupation of immigration. However, 5% of the economic threat frames in the U.K. identify masculine occupations, including factory workers and blue-collar workers. Eight-nine percent of the news articles in the U.S. treat the occupation of immigrants as gender neutral. However, again, 10% of the news articles discuss immigration as economically threatening. Only 1% of the

economic threat frames incorporate feminine occupations. Similar to Hong Kong and Taiwan, the media in the U.K. and the U.S. are likely to disclose the masculinized jobs, such as construction workers, dishwashers, farmers, and factory workers, when framing immigration as an economic threat. This pattern suggests that the media perceive the presence of male immigrants as more threatening than that of female immigrants. My findings from all my four cases support my H3a in that the news articles that center on immigrants' negative impact on the economy are more likely to mention masculinized jobs. This outcome suggests that when discussing immigration as an economic threat, the media are more likely to associate these threats with migrant men.

In addition to examining the way in which the media implicitly gender immigration by selectively choosing the types of occupation to incorporate when employing the economic threat frame, I also investigate the media's incorporation of immigrant occupations when using the economic contribution frame. Table 2-7 reports the immigrants' occupation in the economic contribution frames in all four cases. Similarly, 52% of the economic contribution frames treat immigrant occupations as gender neutral. Among the news articles that employ the economic contribution frame in Hong Kong, 33% of them treat immigrant occupations as gender neutral. Nevertheless when the media specify immigrant occupations when framing immigration as a form of contribution, as Table 2-7 demonstrates, 54% of the economic contribution frames in Hong Kong specify masculine occupations. On the contrary, only 13% indicate that they are domestic workers. This pattern suggests that my H3b is supported in Hong Kong.

In Taiwan when the media frame immigration as a form of contribution, 19% of the news articles treat immigrant occupations as gender neutral, but 53% specify masculine occupations and 28% specify feminine occupations when immigrant occupations are mentioned. As masculine jobs are identified in the economic contribution frames in Hong Kong and Taiwan, effeminized occupations are also discussed more in the media's framing of immigration as a form of

economic contribution than as an economic threat. Specifically, effeminized occupations, namely domestic workers and care takers, constitute a larger percentage of being specified in the economic contribution frame than in the economic threat frame.

On the other hand, the majority of the U.K. and the U.S. economic contribution frames treat immigrant occupations as gender neutral at a much higher rate, at 84% and 66%, respectively. Looking more closely, 15% of the economic contribution frames in the U.K. specify masculine occupations, including construction workers, factory workers, and blue-collar workers. Only 3% of the economic contribution frames that incorporate immigrant occupation identify immigrants to hold effeminized jobs. When the media specify immigrant occupation in the U.S., 32% of the economic contribution frames identify immigrants with masculine occupations. In contrast, only 2% of the economic contribution frames that incorporate immigrant occupations identify immigrants to be in the effeminized industry. Although women may also hold these effeminized occupations in the U.K. and the U.S., these two countries generally do not provide work visas for migrants of these effeminized occupations. Therefore, their presence of female workers in the U.K. and U.S. may lead to lower visibility in the media. Nevertheless, my findings in Hong Kong and Taiwan support my H3b in that the news articles that are likely to immigrants' positive impact on the economy are more likely to mention pink-collar jobs than news articles in the U.K. and the U.S.

Table 2-7. Immigrants' Occupation Identified in Economic Contribution Frames in Newspapers, by Country

| | Masculine Occupation | Feminine Occupation | Gender-Neutral Occupation | Total |
|-----------|----------------------|---------------------|---------------------------|-------|
| Hong Kong | 8 (54%) | 2 (13%) | 5 (33%) | 15 |
| Taiwan | 17 (53%) | 9 (28%) | 6 (19%) | 32 |
| U.K. | 5 | 1 | 32 | 38 |

| | | | | |
|-------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-----|
| | (15%) | (3%) | (84%) | |
| U.S. | 13 (32%) | 1 (2%) | 27 (66%) | 41 |
| Total | 43 (34%) | 13 (10%) | 65 (52%) | 126 |

In addition to the media's gendering of immigration by suggesting the occupations of immigrants, I also examine other ways in which the media gender economic immigration. Specifically, I analyze the family roles (husband vs. wife), wardrobe (niqab vs. turban, etc.), and familial responsibility (caretaker and cooker vs. breadwinner). I categorize these various gender traits into masculine and feminine categories. The masculine category includes media descriptions, such as father, husband, turban, etc., that are associated with immigrants. The feminine category includes media descriptions, such as mother, wife, niqab, caretaker, etc., that are associated with immigrants. Table 2-6 presents the results from my analysis of the media's associations of masculinity and femininity with immigrants. This Table only shows the numbers and percentages of economic frames that incorporate traits that are beyond gender-neutral ones. As the Table demonstrates, the media in all four cases overwhelmingly identify masculine traits of immigration when framing immigration as an economic threat (at 72%), as well as a form of economic contribution (at 73%). Looking more closely, 79% of the economic threat frames in Hong Kong that implicitly gender immigration beyond the identification of immigrant occupations assign immigrants masculine traits and 80% of the economic contribution frames assign immigrants masculine traits. On the contrary, 21% of the economic threat frames in Hong Kong that implicitly gender immigration beyond the identification of immigrant occupations assign immigrants feminine traits and 20% of the economic contribution frames assign immigrants feminine traits. In Taiwan, 67% of news articles that frame immigration as an economic threat assign masculine traits while 64% of those that frame immigration as a form of

contribution assign masculine traits. In contrast, 33% of news articles that frame immigration as an economic threat assign feminine traits while 36% of those that frame immigration as a form of contribution assign feminine traits. In the U.K., 100% of the economic threat frames assign masculine traits to immigrants while 78% of the economic contribution frames assign masculine traits to immigrants. In the U.S., 62% of the economic threat frames assign masculine characteristics to immigrants while 78% of the economic contribution frames assign masculine characteristics to immigrants. In contrast, 38% of the economic threat frames assign feminine characteristics to immigrants while 22% of the economic contribution frames assign feminine characteristics to immigrants.

Table 2-8. Masculine and Feminine Association of Immigrants in Economic Frames, by Country

| | Economic Threat | | Economic Contribution | |
|-----------|-----------------|-------------|-----------------------|-------------|
| | Masculine | Feminine | Masculine | Feminine |
| Hong Kong | 15 (79%) | 4 (21%) | 8 (80%) | 2 (20%) |
| Taiwan | 20 (67%) | 10 (33%) | 18 (64%) | 10 (36%) |
| U.K. | 5 (100%) | 0 | 6 (86%) | 1 (14%) |
| U.S.A. | 8 (62%) | 5 (38%) | 14 (78%) | 4 (22%) |
| Total | 48 (72%) | 19 (28%) | 46 (73%) | 17 (27%) |

Conclusion

As the media are known to foster sentiments in society through the journalists' own interpretations (Gamson et al. 1992; Gamson and Wolfsfeld 1993), it is imperative that we

understand how the media gender their framings of immigration, not a new but continuously increasing phenomenon throughout the 21st century. This chapter analyzes the economic frames commonly used by the media and their incorporation of gender in discussing immigration between January and December 2014 in Hong Kong, Taiwan, the U.K., and the U.S. I investigate the two dominant economic frames, economic threat and economic contribution, through which I find that the media tend to not mark gender. I also find that the media's economic framings of immigration are also gendered in different ways across countries.

The two economic frames I identify show that the media do not always have negative positions toward immigrants. Some frames are immigrant-friendly in that they recognize immigrants' presence, experiences, and place in society. Nevertheless, even in cases where immigrants' impacts are portrayed with positivity; there is a general sentiment of otherness in which immigrants are singled out. For example, although the economic contribution frame celebrates immigrants' creation of jobs, it also emphasizes what these immigrants are "foreigners" or "outsiders" who wish to naturalize in return of their investment.

As existing studies provide evidence on how the media racialize their discourses on immigration, this chapter particularly adds to current studies with its evaluation of gendered media discourses. Particularly, the findings on the overwhelmingly dominant implicit gendered frames show that gender is not conveyed in a way that is traditionally assumed. Instead, gender is rarely marked and yet implicitly conveyed through the reporters' selection of various characteristics that give away a person's gender identity. As studies on immigration have traditionally centered on men's participation and roles, this chapter acknowledges that women constitute half, if not more, of the immigrant population across the world. Not only does their presence need to be recognized, how they are treated under the masculine media frames is crucial in the understanding of migrant experiences.

The results demonstrate that the media are gendered in a way that resembles gender roles often assigned to individuals. For example, the media seldom mark gender when employing economic frames as men are the default sex in the labor force. Such low proportion of the media's report on the sex of immigrants suggests that immigrants, as a group of people, are rarely the center of the debate (Campani 2001; Navarro 2010) but instead are objects of discourse (Giorgi 2012). However, when the media do mention the sex of immigrants, in cases where there is not a significant gender gap in immigration, men are more likely to be identified in the economic threat frame. In cases where there are significantly more female immigrants than male immigrants, the media specify the sex of migrant women more when framing immigration as a form of economic contribution. In cases where the media do not specify the sex of immigrants but reveal occupations that are likely to offer a clue of immigrants' gender identities, the media tend to incorporate migrant men more when discussing the negative impact of immigration in the U.K. and the U.S. whereas women are more likely to be highlighted when discussing the positive impact of immigration in Hong Kong and Taiwan. My findings suggest that how the media gender immigration is context-specific.

This study compares the media frames in two western contexts and two eastern contexts where immigration has been previously rarely explored. Such comparison helps us comprehend how the media in each case react to the country's specificity in terms of the immigrant population, demographics, and scale. More importantly, it contextualizes how male and female immigrants are situated in the political and social discourse through the media's treatment of them. Through studying the media frames as a form of social construction, we understand the power dynamics between immigrants and citizens. Further research is needed to comprehend how other media frames gender their discussions of immigration. Further research is also needed in investigating whether and how such construction of discourses surrounding immigration plays a role in shaping individuals' opinion regarding immigrants.

Chapter 3

Media Framings of Immigration: Cultural Consequences

Immigration is not a recent phenomenon and yet people that participate in cross-border movement have increased drastically as globalization has made traveling easier. Accompanied by the large scale of movement across the globe are concerns over the impacts of immigration, ranging from immigrants' role in shaping the national economy (as demonstrated in Chapter 2) to shaping the national culture. Accompanied these concerns are also various framings of immigration. As the causes and motivations of immigration are multifaceted, the media could also frame immigration in multiple ways. Very recently, London's election of Sadiq Khan, a Muslim and son of Pakistani immigrants, is framed as the United Kingdom's prevail of anti-Muslim sentiments.⁴³ While this election been considered to be historical as Khan is the first Muslim mayor of a major European city, this historical moment has yet to dismantle the challenges faced by immigrants in the media's constructions of their impacts on the national identity and culture. A sharp contrast of Khan's election would be the media's emphasis on the low percentage of British Muslim women speaking English and the high percentage of British Muslim women wearing veils in the last decade.

As Chapter 2 demonstrates, economic and cultural impacts of immigration are dominant frames used in print media. While language is often used strategically to frame immigration (Lakoff and Ferguson 2006), understudied is how the print media frame specific aspects of immigration as related to national identity and culture. Moreover, as the previous chapter illustrates that the economic framings of immigration are gendered, how and the extent to which

⁴³ Diaz, M. "The Waves Created by Electing a Muslim Mayo for London." Retrieved http://www.swissinfo.ch/eng/opinion_the-waves-created-by-electing-a-muslim-mayor-for-london/42145378 on May 18, 2016.

the media's cultural framings of immigration are gendered remain underexplored. The major questions I explore in this chapter are:

- How do the media frame the cultural impacts of immigration?
- How are the media gendered in their cultural framings of immigration? What role does gender play in the media framings of the cultural impacts of immigration?

This chapter expands upon Chapter 2 to analyze the media framings of the cultural impacts of immigration. To analyze the questions above, I utilize the same method of sampling as explained in Chapter 2 to analyze the top three circulated newspapers in Hong Kong, Taiwan, the U.K., and the United States. between January 1, 2014 and December 31, 2014. Building on the same theoretical frameworks that the media are gendered, I argue that the media are also gendered in their framing of cultural aspects of immigration. As women have traditionally been considered the reproducers of the nation, culture is often associated with femininity, resulting in an emphasis on migrant women's presence. I suspect that the media are more likely to incorporate female immigrants when they discuss the cultural consequences of immigration. Particularly, I also argue that when the media frame immigration as a cultural threat, female immigrants are more likely to be discussed as women are responsible for reproducing and maintaining national identity.

My second theoretical aim also draws from my Chapter 2 and focuses on country differences among Hong Kong, Taiwan, the U.K., and the U.S. in the media's gendered framings of the cultural impacts of immigration. As contexts often matter for how society understands women's roles as mothers and as reproducers, I argue that a state's naturalization and citizenship politics play a role in the media's gendering of the immigrants' influence on the national identity and culture. Specifically, I argue that the media in countries that have laws allowing for birthright citizenship are more likely to frame immigration surrounding migrant women's cultural impact. Hong Kong and the U.S. are the two cases that I examine that allow birthright citizenship whereas

Taiwan and the U.K. require immigrants to go through a certain legal process in order to naturalize and become citizens.

This chapter is organized in four parts. First, it presents the theoretical arguments for how the media may be gendered in their employment of cultural frames to discuss immigration. Second, I discuss how the media utilize different cultural frames to discuss immigration. Third, I discuss my findings in the cross-national differences. Last, I conclude by discussing the implications of my results.

Gendered Media Frames on the Cultural Consequences of Immigration

Discourse regarding immigrants can be driven by noneconomic concerns, such as language, culture, race, ethnicity, and religion (Bauer, Rodriguez, Quiroga, and Flores-Ortiz 2000; Burns and Gimpel 2000; Chandler and Tsai 2001; Citrin et al. 2007; Dustmann and Preston 2007; Espenshade and Hempstead 1996; Lahav 2004; Jacobson 2008 McLaren 2003;). The unprecedented levels of diversity lead to sudden changes in the demographics of existing population. This change transforms native communities and further challenge closely cherished notions of national identity that is built on various cultural factors. These differences in ethnic, racial, and religious attributes are also associated with a national identity as studies suggest (Sharp and Nationhood 1996). These differences could be visible and reflected through visuals, such as skin color, dress, and religious symbols. These differences could also be invisible and reflected through non-visuals, such as language and religious practices. Regardless of whether these practices are easily identifiable, these differences create boundaries between native citizens and immigrants (Bail 2008). These differences, particularly the fear of these differences, may also lead to a native citizens' collective understanding of a group's specific cultural cues (Blumer 1958; Bobo 1999). For example, common assumptions exist of what an American should look

like. A study by Devos and Ma (2008) demonstrates that Americans are more likely to assume that Kate Winslet, a Caucasian British citizen, is American than they are to assume Lucy Liu, an Asian American, is American. Utilizing experiments, their findings provide evidence for how citizens are likely to process ethnicity in the implicit ascription of a national identity. Similar to racial and ethnic cues based on skin color, looks, and names, other cultural practices also serve as indicators of who is likely to be considered a citizen of a country and who is not. While language abilities, dress, religious symbols, etc. are common in mainstream discourse to identify immigrants, they are also explored in extant research. What is rarely examined, instead, is how gender plays a role in the media's cultural associations placed upon immigrants. I argue the media's usage of cultural frames in discussing immigration is gendered in four main ways.

First, as discussed in Chapter 2, women have lower visibility than men in the media (Byerly and Ross 2008; Kahn and Goldenberg 1991; Norris 1997; Ross and Carter 2011). As economic betterment is often considered a major motivation for immigrants and men are considered the major participants of the labor force, women migrants are discussed even less in the media. While migrant men's position is constantly defined by their participation in the economy, women's immigration is not necessarily associated with economic factors. Instead of being seen as the principle decision-maker in migration and primary source of income, female immigrants are identified as dependents of men, particularly in the traditional understanding of family hierarchy (Collins 1998). Regardless of whether they enter a country documented or undocumented, they are seen often as spouses of migrant workers. Moreover, although it may be true that most spouses of high-skilled workers may be women in the case of the U.S., their activities are confined mostly in the private sphere because they are not allowed to work legally⁴⁴

⁴⁴ The Department of Homeland Security has only recently extended eligibility for employment authorization to certain H-1B workers' spouses. <https://www.uscis.gov/news/dhs-extends-eligibility-employment-authorization-certain-h-4-dependent-spouses-h-1b-nonimmigrants-seeking-employment-based-lawful-permanent-residence>

(Bhatt n.d.). This lower visibility of spouses of high-skilled workers who are likely to be permitted work visa because of their skills in science, technology, engineering, and mathematics makes them unnoticed.

Second, motherhood is intrinsic to women (Ireland 1993). Not only are reproduction and motherhood experiences that women (are expected to) endure, but motherhood is also institutionalized as a crucial female identity (Ireland 1993; Rich 1995). Women are traditionally constrained by being positioned within the domestic sphere and their biology (Nash 2004). Thus, even when migrant women are acknowledged in the media, they are often recognized as wives and mothers. In addition to being wives and mothers, women are also “producers in their own right, and reproduce the workforce through their role as careers and community activists” (Pearson and Sweetman 1994, 46). While women put on many hats every day, their biological motherhood also extends beyond biological reproduction. As Yuval-Davis (1996) writes, women also produce “culturally and symbolically their ethnic and national collectivities as well as the workforce, their families, or the citizenry of their states” (17). On the one hand, women’s reproductive abilities allow them to be biological mothers of future generations. Through their reproduction, they breed children who grow up to enact citizenship. As human population is recognized as power and capital, who women breed becomes politicized. In this discourse, who is being reproduced and whether s/he helps maintain purity of the dominant race and ethnicity of a nation becomes a major concern when a country experiences immigration. For instance, while Israel welcomes immigration, only Jewish immigrants are desired (Ehrlich 1987). This example demonstrates the importance of immigrants’ abilities to reproduce.

In addition to women’s responsibility for maintaining racial purity, women particularly experience the expectations to maintain the “quality” of future generations. For example, one point in time in history, the Singaporean government demanded that highly educated women reproduce because their children are considered genetically superior. Meanwhile, uneducated

women were given monetary incentives if they chose to sterilize and stop reproducing “genetically inferior” children (Heng 1992). This understanding of selective eugenics is also common in the politicized discourse regarding migrant women’s reproduction and childbearing. For instance, as Taiwan has experienced one of the lowest fertility rates in the world during the last decade, the government has taken actions to encourage women to have children. Nevertheless, such promotion of fertility is selective based on preferences of ethnicity and socio-economic class. The Vice Minister of the Department of Education in Taiwan, Chou Tsan-Te, once made a comment expressing his concern about the “low quality” of immigrants and stated that “foreign brides should not have so many children” (Yiu 2004, 2). As one out of every seven elementary students in Taiwan is born in a family with one migrant parent nowadays as a result of marriage being a common path for migration, Taiwanese Legislator Liao Ben-Yen’s proposal to mandate physical examinations of Vietnamese migrant brides’ and to eliminate parental subsidies for immigrant mothers to ensure the “quality” of future generations illustrates a discourse in responding to the increasing numbers of immigrant-born children, particularly in the midst of a low fertility crisis (United Daily News 2006).

Third, as women’s biological reproduction is connected with the demographics and quality of future generations, women’s roles in motherhood and in family are thus associated with national identity and culture (Bullock and Jafri 2000; Byng 2010). Women play a vital role in the making of a nation; thus they are seen as the symbolic representation of society (Nash 2006). That is, women’s reproductive abilities result in the common understanding of women as the “symbolic bearers of the nation” (McClintock 1993, 62) or “the mothers of the nation” (Sharp 1996, 99). As social cohesion is pursued, countries often desire support for political institutions, absence of conflict, harmonious culture, and collective personal and place identity (Cantle 2001). Such pursuit of social cohesion also places the burden on women, who are responsible for making that social cohesion happen. This pursuit of social-cohesion also disadvantages women in

particular as culture and traditions are defined in context-specific gender relations, gender role assignments, and the control of women's behavior (Yuval-Davis and Anthias 1989). In the case of immigrants, migrant women are identified through their significant cultural characteristics and traits and abilities and actions to carry on existing national identities. Critiques of whether and the extent to which migrant women assimilate or stand out are often played out in the media's portrayals of language abilities, dress, assimilation in community, or contribution to maintaining national identity.

A primary example would be the recent British media's emphasis on Prime Minister David Cameron's proposal to mandate that migrant spouses pass English-proficiency tests within five years upon arrival or they could be deported. Although the proposal aims to help spouses of migrant workers to integrate linguistically, most of the media reports only focus on Muslim women's abilities to speak English. Some reports even highlight statistical facts that indicate that 22% of British Muslim women speak little or no English.⁴⁵ This assumption of immigrants' roles is gendered. While Cameron's proposal is recent, the assumption of migrant women lacking the knowledge of English is not new. Language has always been a pre-requisite for attaining the U.K. citizenship. Regulations have mandated that immigrants provide formal documents to prove their linguistic competence. Yet, in news articles, it is mostly, if not only, Muslim women that are discussed when covering linguistic assimilation of immigrants.

In contrast to the media's emphasis on migrant women's abilities to integrate, the media may also highlight the positive impact that women make. For instance, marriage migrants in Taiwan constitute both men and women; however, the media repetitively tell stories of migrant women's contribution to the local community. A quick perusal through the headlines on immigrants' lives in Taiwan, especially on holidays, results in migrant women's active

⁴⁵ Bates, Laura. "David Cameron will Support Muslim Women—but only when it suits his scaremongering narrative." *The Guardian*. Retrieved <http://www.theguardian.com/lifeandstyle/2016/jan/21/davids-america-will-support-muslim-women-but-only-when-it-suits-his-scaremongering-narrative> on April 18, 2016.

participation in the community. Migrant women could be portrayed in dressing up in their traditional clothes to introduce their culture to members of the community. The make and function of women's dresses are explained in detail. The commonality in emphasizing women's dress could be derived from the media's production of the public subject through a "regime of visibility" (Cinar 2008, 895). As Cinar (2008) explains, the public sphere is a field of "appearances, performances, images, and displays" (895), which the obsession of migrant women's dress, particularly veil in this instance. Moreover, as portrayals and understanding of immigrants remain stereotypical, migrant women's visibilities are homogenized (Keskin-Kozat 2003), making the print media to be an excellent unit of analysis for understanding the circulation of power and the construction of immigration (Carpignano 1999).

In addition, migrant women in Taiwan could also be discussed in their participation in Mandarin Chinese. It is important to note, nonetheless, even a positive portrayal of migrant women in Taiwan is associated and emphasized through their active integration in the community. It is also crucial to note that although a higher number of women have migrated to Taiwan for marriage than men, migrant husbands also exist in the daily lives of Taiwanese citizens, just not in the media discourse. This sole incorporation of marriage migrants as women leads to a gendered discourse in the media. The assumption of women's impotence to speak English also creates a gendered threat. The incorporation of women's dress and the exclusive emphasis on migrant women's participation in cultural events in the community also create a gendered image of women's role in the community, which is far removed from being a labor provider. Therefore, as women are constructed as "symbolic boarder guards of ethnic and national collectivities" (Yuval-Davis, Anthias, and Kofman 2005, 527), I expect that the cultural frames used by news articles tend to identify immigrants' as women.

Gendered cultural impact hypothesis

H1: The news articles that frame immigration using the immigrants' impact on the national identity and culture are likely to identify female immigrants than male immigrants.

Last, the gendered discourse surrounding female immigrants is also reflected on the disparity between the media's portrayals of "anchor babies" and the reality. Anchor baby refers to the presumed strategy that non-citizen women give birth in the U.S. so their children could be used to facilitate legalized immigration and naturalization. Although the "anchor baby" is a myth as only 8% of the children born in the U.S. between March 2009 and March 2010 to at least one unauthorized migrant parent (Ormonde 2012), the media consistently report on the anchor baby phenomenon (Holding 2011; Ormonde 2012). The term has been politicized and employed by politicians like Donald Trump who presented inaccurate statistics on the number of so-called anchor babies in the U.S.⁴⁶ The media have also created a message of women crossing the border or entering a country with the goal to obtain citizenship as the term "anchor baby" is used to describe young children sponsoring immigration for their undocumented parents (Ignatow and Williams 2011). Regardless of whether having children in countries that grant birthright citizenship is effective in the acquisition of citizenship, this discourse is inherently gendered in that migration and naturalization are only made possible by and through the maternal body.

Although termed differently, the concept of "anchor baby" exists in countries where birthright citizenship exists. In the case of the U.S., anchor babies were initially referred to women who cross the border predominantly from Mexico to give birth. Now, anchor babies could also be applied to wealthy Chinese women who fly thousands of miles to give birth in the U.S. in the engagement of birth tourism. In the case of Hong Kong, women cross the border and enter from China to give birth to children. A common assumption is also that these children could be entitled to prenatal and postnatal resources, as well as benefits reserved for Hong Kong residents

⁴⁶McGinty, Jo. "Fact-Checking th Figures on Anchor Babies." *The Wall Street Journal*. Retrieved from <http://www.wsj.com/articles/fact-checking-the-figures-on-anchor-babies-1441963800> on March 23, 2016.

(LAFranier 2012). The consequences are gendered in that many Chinese tourist women are refused entry at immigration as the Hong Kong customer services accuse them of entering to give birth. Therefore, I hypothesize that the effect of the media's employment of cultural frames in identifying migrant's female identity to be stronger in countries where citizenship can be gained by birth.

Country difference hypothesis

H2a: The news articles that highlight the cultural consequences of female immigrants will appear more frequently in the media in Hong Kong and the U.S. than the media in Taiwan and the U.K.

H2b: The news articles that portray immigrants' negative impact on the economy are likely to specify migrant women's gender identity in Hong Kong and the U.S. than in Taiwan and the U.K.

H2c: The news articles that portray immigrants' positive impact on the economy are likely to specify migrant women's gender identity in Taiwan and the U.K. than in Hong Kong and the U.S.

Data and Methodology

The sampling strategy that I use in this chapter is the same as described in Chapter 2. Utilizing the keyword searches in the top three most circulated newspapers in Hong Kong, Taiwan, the U.K., and the U.S., I draw a representative sample. From the representative sample, I collect information about the themes of the articles, the positions toward immigration, and the multiple identities of immigrants described in the media. The major themes that I identify in the articles are the following: legal aspects, immigration, policies, homeland/security politics, integration, immigrant rights, threat, xenophobia, contribution, hardship, immigrant demographics, and miscellaneous. These themes are then broken down into various issues that are

identified underneath the major themes of these articles. For example, language abilities, family relations, and relations in the community are coded as issues underneath the integration theme.

(See Appendix A for details.)

After interpreting and coding the representative sample of news articles, I analyze and determine the frames. Specifically, I combine the three approaches to measuring frames—the “media package”, the “multidimensional concept”, and “the list of frames” described by Tankard (2008) by examining the location of the news articles, terms that are used to refer to immigration and immigrants, as well as how issues are included and excluded. As a “frame is a central organizing idea for news content that supplies a context and suggests what the issue is through the use of selection, emphasis, exclusion, and elaboration (Tankard, Hendrickson, Silberman, Bliss and Ghanem 1991)” the combination of looking at various themes, positions, and characteristics of a news article allow me ensure that my understanding of the framing of the article is as well-rounded as it can be.

Analysis of the Cultural Framings of Immigration

As Chapter 2 illustrates, several dominant frames are identified in my analysis of the media coverage on immigration. This chapter focuses on the national identity and culture, but this remains one of several frames utilized by the media. In the media’s discussion of the cultural aspects of immigration, cultural threat and cultural contribution are the two major frames used by the media. In the subsequent sections, I explain the cultural threat and cultural contribution frames in detail and provide examples of each.

Cultural Threat Frame

The cultural threat frame emphasizes the transformation that a nation undergoes with increasing immigration. This frame is analyzed in two major aspects. First, the cultural threat frame accompanies with statistics that indicate the number of immigrants that have entered the country in recent years. What is implied through the presentation of statistical information on immigrant population is the changes in the face of a nation. An example from the U.K.'s *The Sun* states:

Hundreds of thousands of non-EU migrants could flood the UK—because they hold Bulgarian and Romanian passports. Ministers were last night warned that hard-up families from Moldova, Macedonia and Serbia could pour in. EU rules forcing Britain to lift restrictions on Bulgarians and Romanians coming in start today — with *The Sun* yesterday revealing the first busloads are on their way. Up to 400,000 Moldovans are thought to hold dual Romanian citizenship and 20,000 Serbians have Bulgarian passports.⁴⁷

As the excerpt demonstrates, words like “flood” and “pour” are commonly used to describe the increasing entries of migrant. The example from the *New York Times* below demonstrates the media’s usage of numbers to discuss the scope of immigration as well as the scale of immigrants’ impact on the nation:

That part of Mr. Obama’s plan alone could affect as many as 3.3 million people who have been living in the United States illegally for at least five years, according to an analysis by the Migration Policy Institute, an immigration research organization in Washington. But the White House is also considering a stricter policy that would limit the benefits to people who have lived in the country for at least 10 years, or about 2.5 million people.⁴⁸

Some media reports may not present the statistics of migrant women but utilize visual images to convey the message that the country receives overwhelming immigrants. The following serves as

⁴⁷ Hawkes, Steve and Ryan Parry. 2014. Moldova the Border. *The Sun* January 1.

⁴⁸ Shear, Michael, Julia Preston, and Ashley Parker. 2014. Obama Plan May Allow Millions of Immigrants. *The New York Times* November 13.

an example of how the *New York Times* imply that “crowds” of migrant women and children may be changing the demographics of the U.S.:

In Phoenix, up to four buses a day arrive at the Greyhound station, each filled to capacity with women and children from El Salvador, Guatemala, and Honduras. They crossed the border in Texas, but immigration officials sent them to Phoenix because the Texas facilities were overcrowded... Dozens of staff members interacted with the children, preaching to them, teaching them basic English and tending to the sick.”⁴⁹

More explicitly gendered discourse regarding the statistics and cultural impact of immigrants could be seen in an excerpt in Taiwan’s *Apple Daily*:

According to the Department of Internal Affairs, by 2030, 13.5% of 25-year-old young adults will be new Taiwanese children.⁵⁰ The Chair of the Department, Lee Hung-Yuan indicates, over 10% of primary school students are children of one foreign parent... Hong Man Chi, the Vice President of Nang-Yan Sisters, who has been married into⁵¹ a family in Taiwan for 16 years indicates, the most important thing to do upon arrival in Taiwan is to learn Chinese. Having the linguistic abilities allows for obtaining information and assimilating into society.⁵²

Not only does the example above illustrate the media’s usage of statistics to construct the “seriousness” of immigration, but it also demonstrates that the capability to learn native language is and should also be a priority for migrant women. The discussion of the increasing presence of migrant women and their mixed-race/inter-cultural children in the same article as the discussion of the need to learn Chinese indicates the urgency of assimilation as well as the cultural threat that immigrants may impose should they refuse to integrate.

⁴⁹ Fausset, Richard and Ken Belson. 2014. Faces of an Immigration System Overwhelmed by Women and Children. *The New York Times* June 5.

⁵⁰ New Taiwanese children are referred to the mixed-race of cross-border marriages, a term coined by the media in Taiwan (Lan 2008).

⁵¹ The term “marry into” a family is only used to discuss women’s participation in marriage. The term is inherently gendered, implying that women leave their families when they get married and enter the families of their husbands’. Once women marry into a family in Chinese-Han culture, prevalent in Taiwan and Hong Kong, they become a part of their husbands’ families. Therefore, the term also serves as an indicator that female immigrants, instead of male immigrants, are discussed in the media.

⁵² 台灣新移民之子. *Taiwan Apple Daily News*, March 26, 2014.

Second, the cultural threat frame highlights the cultural threat in a country through which a nation's national identity and culture are threatened. The frame fosters an anxiety that comes with the presence of immigrants who represent different races, ethnicities, religions, and traditions from the native citizens. Such frame emphasizes how immigration transforms what the country looks like racially, ethnically, or religiously. It also stresses the diminishment of traditional values accompanied by immigration. An article in the U.K.'s *The Daily Telegraph* illustrates the discontent toward immigrants' rituals and practices becoming accepted in the public in the U.K.:

It's the primary school in Leicester where a teacher I know doesn't have a single white child in her class. (Ghetto anyone?) It's self-styled "Muslim Patrol" vigilante group in east London terrorizing a couple for "holding hands" and telling a woman she would be punished in "hellfire" because of the way she is dressed. Its universities capitulating to pressure to segregate male and female students to please certain Islamic speakers... It's watching open-mouthed as Channel 4 televises a debate on the burka with a studio audience full of women—and, quite possibly, bearded blokes—covered head to toe in black, like a parliament of crows. And it's the sole white man on the panel trying in vain to speak up for women's rights... It's daring to suggest that any of the above might be worrying or quite scary, actually, or not in keeping with values we hold dear, and immediately being called a little Englander, or xenophobic, or "racist."⁵³

This excerpt from the *Daily Telegraph* emphasizes the threat that immigrants pose on the identity of the U.K., particularly its long-established gender equality and democratic values. The excerpt points out the absence of "white" students in school, implying immigrants' "coloring" of the U.K. It also stresses that Muslim men and women expect to be treated according to "their" religious rules rather than what is commonly accepted in the U.K. The emphasis on such expectation indicates how the U.K. has to accommodate to the outsiders, implying only cost of immigration for the U.K.

In addition to race and religion being a mechanism that the media use to frame immigration as a threat to the national identity, dress is also prevalent in the media's discourse

⁵³ Pearson, Allison. 2014. At Last, the BBC Talks about Immigration. *The Telegraph*. January 8.

regarding immigration. The news articles on the dress and wardrobe of immigrants may not explicitly identify the sex of immigrants. However, their identifications of niqabs, burqas, and hijabs are exclusive to female immigrants, allowing the readers to identify the sex of the subject discussed. An article from the U.K.'s *The Daily Telegraph* shows how migrant women may be identified by their wardrobe and religious practice and constructed as cultural threat:

Young's Muslim population began to swell around 20 years ago when Lebanese migrants moved to the area to work on vegetable and cherry farms. The "significant" Islamic presence in the main streets is visible. Burqas, niqabs and hijabs are not uncommon in the sleepy former mining town of golden soil and beauties rich and rare. The old drive-in cinema is now the Omar Ibn Khatab mosque. Back when Thomas Carson worked there as an usher, picking up discarded dollar coins from the ground near the speaker poles, he could play a mean guitar riff. He adored '50s rock'n'roll and counted Buddy Holly among his idols. He saw AC/DC perform live three times and took inspiration from Creedence Clearwater Revival.

This excerpt paints a vivid picture of the transformation of a town in the U.K. It starts off by emphasizing the wardrobe that Muslim immigrants, particularly women, wear that is different from what the native British may wear. It then moves into the cultural changes of the town. A drive-in movie theater, likely screened films known to the native British, no longer exists. What has replaced it is a Muslim mosque, which is likely to be visited by mostly if not exclusively Muslim migrants. What is implied through these detailed descriptions of the changes in the town decades after Muslim migrants' arrival is that the town has changed forever and may never go back to the way it was one day. Such framing of the cultural impacts of immigrants creates a sentiment of fear for the long-gone character and history to the British.

These examples of the media's framing of immigration as cultural threat demonstrate the negative consequences of immigration portrayed by the media. As the cultural threat frame is employed in multiple instances, ranging from presenting statistics

about the demographic changes in the population to highlighting the racial, ethnic, religious, and cultural differences between immigrants and native citizens, these various ways of framing immigration as a cultural threat suggests the perception of viewing immigrants more as a threat than as a promise. This discourse also illuminates the general fear of a transformation of a national identity.

Cultural Integration Frame

On the contrary, in using the cultural integration frame, the media focus on the positive impact that immigrants make in the community. The cultural integration frame highlights the increasing population of immigrants in receiving countries with a positive position by conveying the hardship the immigrants endure in the country in order emerge as members of society and to create new, promising, and prosperous lives. In this frame, the narrative establishes the notion that the nation is no longer a nation of homogeneity but instead a nation of groups of people from varying origins making ends meet. This frame implies three important implications. First, the cultural integration frame normalizes the presence of immigrants. That is, as the news articles record immigrants' activities, whether daily or on special occasions, this frame indicates that they have become members of society. A news article excerpt from Taiwan's *The Liberty Times* implies that immigrants' membership in society is dictated by how much contribution they have made to a community.

According to the Agriculture Services, newcomers, Wen-Hsian, Rona, Suying, are mothers who have been in Taiwan for over ten years. They have come up with creative ways to cook Southeastern cuisine with locally grown ingredients to help raise funds for children's tug-of-war practices. The cooperation between the agriculture services and these mothers has created a fusion cuisine, which successfully caught attendees' attention at the festival.⁵⁴

⁵⁴ 台灣的新移民 2014. *The Liberty Times*, May 23.

This passage shows that these female newcomers (a term that has increasingly become popular in Taiwan to describe immigrants who are mostly marriage migrants), who are primarily identified as mothers, have been in Taiwan for a long time. Not only have they been part of the community, but they have also contributed efforts to support the emergence of a community by creating and selling Southeastern Asian cuisine that incorporates locally grown Taiwanese ingredients to help raise funds for children's sports. It is important to note, however, that these marriage migrants are still singled out in their participation of the community events. That is, while their presence is mentioned and normalized through which readers are aware of the long-term membership, their identities as newcomers, or as mothers, in this particular excerpt, are still emphasized, implying a division of us vs. them.

Second, while the number of years that immigrants have been in the host country is often highlighted as the example above shows, the cultural integration frame also includes the assimilation aspect in which stories of how immigrants have integrated in their society are constantly told. Many of these newspaper articles are stories of human interest, bringing a human face to the presentation of immigrants' identities. In other words, these are personal stories of citizens whose immigrant identities are mentioned. Although such a frame allows the country to be perceived as a "compassionate, immigrant-receiving" nation (Chavez 2001), it also implies that immigrants are praised for showing desire and taking concrete steps to becoming members of the community. By stressing the assimilation process of immigrants, the media perpetuate the immigrant heritage of the nation but also imply the importance of holding onto the nation's values and traditions. Below is an example of the U.S.'s *New York Times*' utilization of such frame:

One of four children born to poor Irish immigrants, she grew up in Hewlett, N.Y., on Long Island, playing basketball and planning to attend college. She surprised

her parents by entering the Sisters of St. Joseph of Brentwood after high school, she said. It meant being away from her family except for occasional visits.⁵⁵

Third, the media often demonstrate migrant women's contribution in their new families through their fulfillment of the traditional gender roles—mothers and wives who cook and care for the family. A news article excerpt from Taiwan's *United Daily News* demonstrates that cultural integration is illustrated through the newcomers' adoption of a palette for the local food in their new homes in host countries:

Approximately 20 marriage migrants gathered together at a kitchen in Tao Yuan yesterday to make sticky rice treats wrapped in bamboo leaves. Most of the women present had not had made sticky rice before. Sticky rice is part of our traditional culture; teaching marriage migrants to make sticky rice allows them to treat Taiwan as their homeland.⁵⁶

As cooking is traditionally seen as a woman's responsibility, these marriage migrants who are naturally expected to familiarize themselves with local Taiwanese cuisine. Although not explicitly stated, but the newspapers' discussion of adopting these cooking skills as a form of cultural integration suggests the expected gender roles of migrant brides.

Another example from Taiwan's *The Liberty Times* also showcases how migrant diversify a community and yet maintain harmony:

Hundreds of migrant sisters (brides) from China, Vietnam, Indonesia, Cambodia, Thailand, Japan, and South Korea celebrated the "International Migrants Day" with their families. This event aimed to convey a "We are family" message, by which Changhua would welcome a global community through accepting diversity and creating a harmonious society.

While stories like these give migrant women a chance to showcase their traditions and customs, they are also framed in the way that immigrants must assimilate and make a contribution to the community in order to be positively portrayed in the media. Migrant women in this case are allowed to diversify the community; nonetheless, such diversification must remain in the context of food and clothing. Rarely do the media positively portray migrant women's transformation of

⁵⁵ Leland, John. 2014. The Sister of Second Chances. *The New York Times* June 13.

⁵⁶ 粽葉飄新香. 2014. *The Liberty Times*, June 4.

language, religion, or other cultural aspects. Much of the “transformation” or introduction of new culture remain very shallow in the sense that it is allowed only on several occasions of the year—preferably on holidays or mother’s day when migrant women are being appreciated. On any other days, their diversity efforts become selectively discussed and their assimilation is mostly emphasized in the media.

Fourth, in addition to discussing immigrants’ assimilation of the national culture by engaging in activities that ordinary citizens do, the cultural integration frame also incorporates another aspect of immigration in which immigrants endure hardship and overcome obstacles to be a member of society or simply to survive. Below is an example of the portrayals of immigrants as marginalized in Taiwan’s *Apple Daily*:

There are many marriage migrants in Beitou. I have come in contact with Vietnamese single mothers recently. They did not know that their husbands were alcoholics or gamblers until they came here and got married. Some of these men use their wives’ newly-obtained Taiwanese identifications to take out loans and as leverage to prohibit them from finding legal jobs, which leaves these women with no choice but to be temporary workers that work and get paid on a day to day basis. They experience hardship but never give up easily. Such portrayal constructs a notion of a nation of immigrants that are hardworking and willing to make sacrifices.⁵⁷

These immigrants may be portrayed as both victims and agents, in which they are victimized by their situations but are agents in making ends meet. On the one hand, this media frame pays tribute to immigrants who diligently pursue their dreams. On the other hand, such frame validates that the receiving nation is one that can provide better means and offer promises of which immigrants are willing to sacrifice to be a member.

My findings of the nation of immigrant frame as the dominant discourse in the Taiwanese and the U.S. media echoes what has been found by Quinsaas’s (2014) study of the media frames on the immigration debate in 2006. As she suggests, the nation of immigrant frame “glorifies the immigrant narrative,” but at the same time also appropriates host country as a nation that is

⁵⁷ 單親媽媽 2014. *Taiwan Apple Daily News*. April 14.

sympathetic, welcoming, and open to immigrants (584). As discussed earlier, what underlies these messages is the expectation that immigrants should be enduring and assimilating in order to be worth such “positive” position when framing their stories.

Cross-National Analysis of the Gendered Media Cultural Framings of Immigration

My findings suggest that cultural threat and cultural contribution are the two ways the media frame immigration. Among the news articles that discuss the cultural dimension of immigration in my sample, 42% of them utilize the cultural threat frame while 58% of the news articles employ the cultural contribution frame (shown in Table 3-1). Countries differ in how they utilize the cultural threat frame and the cultural integration in discussing the cultural impacts of immigration. More newspaper articles in Taiwan frame immigration around cultural integration than newspaper articles in the U.K. and the U.S. As Table 3-2 indicates, in Hong Kong, 46% of the news articles utilize the cultural threat frame and 54% utilize the cultural integration frame. The media in Taiwan even engage in cultural integration frames at a higher level than the media in Hong Kong do. Only 22% of the news articles in Taiwan utilize the cultural threat frame where as 78% of the news articles utilize the cultural integration frame. On the contrary, the U.K. and the U.S., it is more common for the media in the U.K. and the U.S. to frame immigration as a cultural threat than cultural integration. In the U.K. 76% of the news articles frame immigration as a cultural threat whereas 24% of the news articles frame immigration as cultural integration. It is a bit more balanced in the U.S. in that 47% of the news articles employ the cultural threat frame and 53% of the news articles use the cultural integration frame. The difference in how the most circulated newspapers in these four cases frame immigration suggest that context may matters in how immigration is perceived. Hong Kong and Taiwan experience more marriage migrants than the U.K. and the U.S. As the presence of marriage migrants has been normalized in

Hong Kong and Taiwan, their presence is viewed as less of a threat. Nonetheless, it is worthy to note that although they are not seen as threatening, the media still emphasize their integration, implying that immigrants in Hong Kong and Taiwan still have to abandon their traditions and customs in order to assimilate and to be accepted and portrayed positively in society.

In the following sections, I present my findings from testing my hypotheses and discuss how they differ by country.

Table 3-1. Usage of Cultural Frames by the Media, by Country

| Frames | Cultural threat | Cultural Integration | Total |
|--------------------|-----------------|----------------------|-------|
| Hong Kong | 33 (46%) | 39 (54%) | 72 |
| Taiwan | 68 (22%) | 241 (78%) | 309 |
| U.K. | 109 (76%) | 34 (24%) | 143 |
| U.S. | 124 (47%) | 140 (53%) | 264 |
| Newspaper Articles | 334 (42%) | 454 (58%) | 788 |

Gendered Cultural Impact Hypotheses

My H1 states that the news articles that are linked to immigrants' impact on national identity and culture are likely mention migrant women's gender identity. I examine this hypothesis by analyzing how frequent media identify the sex of immigrants when framing immigration as a cultural issue. Table 3-2 displays the ways the sex of immigrants is mentioned in the cultural frames in all four countries. Similar to the findings on the media's employment of economic frames as presented in Chapter One, most news articles rarely explicitly identify the sex of immigrants. 82% of the news articles using the cultural threat frame fail to identify the sex of immigrants whereas 62% of the news articles using the cultural integration frame fail to do so. However, in both the cultural threat and cultural integration frames, female immigrants are more likely to be identified. Among all news articles that use the cultural threat frame, 11% of them

explicitly identify immigrants discussed as women whereas 5% explicitly identify immigrants as men.⁵⁸ Among all news articles that use the cultural integration frame, 65% of the articles fail to explicitly identify the sex of immigrants. Twenty-one percent of them explicitly identify immigrants discussed as women whereas only 11% explicitly identify immigrants as men. Table 3-2 also illustrates that a small portion of news articles also explicitly identify both male and female immigrants at 2% in the cultural threat frame and 3% in the cultural integration frame. This outcome supports my first hypothesis—when framing immigration as a cultural issue, the media are more likely to identify migrant women than migrant men.

Table 3-2. Immigrants' Gender Identities in the Cultural Frames

| Cultural threat | | | | Cultural integration | | | |
|-------------------|------------|-------------|----------------------|----------------------|-------------|-------------|----------------------|
| Sex not mentioned | Male | Female | Both sexes mentioned | Sex not mentioned | Male | Female | Both sexes mentioned |
| 273 (82%) | 17 (5%) | 37 (11%) | 7 (2%) | 296 (65%) | 50 (11%) | 93 (21%) | 15 (3%) |

Country Difference Hypothesis

In addition to the gendered cultural framing hypothesis, I also expect the effect to vary depending on the context. The first country difference hypothesis expects the news articles using the cultural frames to identify female immigrants more in Hong Kong and the U.S. than in Taiwan and the U.K. As displayed in Table 3-3, Hong Kong and Taiwan report more stories with

⁵⁸ While the figures on explicitly identified male and female immigrants may seem low, it is important to note that I use the strictest method in evaluating whether sex of immigrants is explicitly identified. Gender pronouns like male, man, men, he, his, female, woman, women, she, her must be used in the articles in order for the article to be coded as explicit identification of the sex of immigrants. Although other information, such as names that are most commonly gendered, like John being a man and Maria being a woman, could be used to identify the sex of immigrants discussed, I opt out in using that information for several reasons. First, some names are more gender neutral than others, such as Charlie could possibly mean both Charles and Charlotte. Second, there are always chances that a person with a name that commonly identifies himself or herself as a man or a woman could be the opposite sex. Third, names in Chinese are harder to identify as men or women. Therefore, forgoing assumption about sex of immigrants ensures that my coding schemes are consistent across articles and across countries.

the inclusion of female immigrants than male immigrants. The U.K. and the U.S. report more stories with the inclusion of male immigrants than female immigrants. Thirty-one percent of the news articles in Hong Kong identify migrant women whereas 29% of those in Taiwan do. This outcome indicates that my H2a is only partially supported in that the news articles that highlight the cultural consequences of female immigrants appear more frequently in the media in Hong Kong but not in the U.S. However, when they do highlight female immigrants, they do so at a higher rate than the media of any other country.

Table 3-3. Explicit Gender Identities of Immigrants in the Cultural Frames, by Country

| | Sex not mentioned | Male | Female | Both sexes mentioned |
|-----------|-------------------|-------------|-------------|----------------------|
| Hong Kong | 43 (60%) | 6 (8%) | 22 (31%) | 1 (1%) |
| Taiwan | 193 (62%) | 19 (6%) | 87 (29%) | 10 (3%) |
| U.K. | 128 (90%) | 9 (6%) | 6 (4%) | 0 (0%) |
| U.S.A. | 205 (77%) | 33 (13%) | 15 (6%) | 11 (4%) |

Table 3-4 reports the numbers and percentages of my sample that explicitly specifies the sex of immigrants in each case. As shown in Table 3-4, the majority of the news articles I examine do not explicitly reveal the sex of immigrants. More specifically, 94% and 86% of the cultural threat frames in the U.K. and the U.S., respectively, do not report the sex of immigrants while 64% and 58% of the cultural threat frames in Taiwan and Hong Kong, respectively, do not report the sex of immigrants. In other words, only 32 of the cultural threat frames in Hong Kong identify the sexes of immigrants in Hong Kong, 36% in Taiwan, 6% in the U.K., and 14% in the U.S. Thirty percent of the news articles that frame immigration as a cultural threat in Hong Kong identify immigrants as women and 12% identifies immigrants as men. Twenty percent of the news articles that frame immigration as a cultural threat in Taiwan identify immigrants as women

and only 3% identify immigrants as men. Four percent of the news articles that frame immigration as a cultural threat in the U.K. identify immigrants as women and 2% identify immigrants as men. This outcome suggests that my H2b is partially supported—migrant women in Hong Kong, Taiwan, and the U.K. are more likely to be identified as threatening than men. Looking at the cultural threat frame in the U.S., the media have a stronger tendency to identify male immigrants when using the culture threat frame than female immigrants. Seven percent of the news articles in the U.S. incorporate male immigrants and 0% incorporate female immigrants when framing immigration as a cultural threat. This outcome shows that my H2b is not supported in the U.S.

Looking at the statistics on the reporting of the sex of immigrants in cultural integration frames in Table 3-4, the media in Hong Kong and Taiwan incorporate female immigrants at a higher rate at 31% and 29% respectively than they incorporate male immigrants at 5% and 7% respectively. They also incorporate female immigrants at a higher rate than the media in the U.K. and the U.S. Six percent and 7% of the news article in the U.K. and the U.S. identify female immigrants whereas 21% and 17% of the news articles in the U.K. and the U.S., respectively, identify male immigrants. This outcome reported in Table 3-4 shows that my H2c is also partially supported.

When sexes are identified in the cultural frames, women are more likely to be mentioned in Hong Kong and Taiwan whereas men are more likely to be mentioned in the U.K. and the U.S. These differences in how gender is identified can be explained by the histories of immigration in these countries. While both Hong Kong and Taiwan have had long histories of immigration, particularly with immigrants from mainland China, in recent decades, there has been an increase in female immigrants migrating to Hong Kong and Taiwan for marriage. As marriage becomes the motivation for migration, the demographics of immigrants in Hong Kong and Taiwan have also changed throughout time, resulting in the media's identification of migrant women in their

employment of cultural frames. In contrast, while the U.K. and the U.S. also have had long histories of immigration, there has not been an overwhelming discussion of women migrating for marriage. The discourses of immigration have remained masculine as the cultural frames utilized in the media in the U.K. and the U.S. still emphasize male immigrants' endurance of hardship to survive and become members of societies.

Table 3-4. Explicit Gender Identities of Immigrants in Cultural Threat and Cultural Integration Frames, by Country

| | Cultural threat | | | | Cultural integration | | | |
|-----------|-------------------|------------|-------------|----------------------|----------------------|-------------|-------------|----------------------|
| | Sex not mentioned | Male | Female | Both sexes mentioned | Sex not mentioned | Male | Female | Both sexes mentioned |
| Hong Kong | 19 (58%) | 4 (12%) | 10 (30%) | 0 (0%) | 24 (61%) | 2 (5%) | 12 (31%) | 1 (3%) |
| Taiwan | 44 (64%) | 2 (3%) | 18 (27%) | 4 (6%) | 149 (62%) | 17 (7%) | 69 (29%) | 6 (2%) |
| U.K. | 103 (94%) | 2 (2%) | 4 (4%) | 0 (0%) | 25 (73%) | 7 (21%) | 2 (6%) | 0 (0%) |
| U.S. | 107 (86%) | 9 (7%) | 5 (4%) | 3 (3%) | 98 (70%) | 24 (17%) | 10 (7%) | 8 (6%) |

Although most of the media in framing immigration as a cultural threat or contribution do not explicitly identify immigrants' sex as I have initially expected and previously demonstrated, the media do implicitly gender their discussions of immigration. Tables 3-5 and 3-6 illustrate how immigrants' family roles may be identified in the cultural threat and contribution frames. As Table 3-5 shows, while Hong Kong, Taiwan, the U.K., and the U.S. are likely to discuss immigrants' identities at home in gender-neutral terms, such as spouse, partner, child, and parent at 11%, 72%, 43%, and 33%, respectively, many cultural threat frames also implicitly reveal immigrants' sex. Looking more closely, among the media frames that specify immigrants' family roles in Hong Kong, 56% of them identify immigrants as having feminine roles and 33% identify immigrants as having masculine roles (shown in Column 4). Specifically, 22% of these frames

identify immigrants as wives, 34% identify women as mothers, and only 33% are identified as husbands in Hong Kong.

Similarly in Taiwan, 28% of the cultural threat frames that specify immigrants' family roles identify immigrants with feminine roles and none specifies immigrants with masculine roles. Particularly, 22% of these frames identify immigrants as women (wives) and 6% identify them as mothers. Moreover in the U.K., 14% of these frames reveal that immigrants are husbands whereas 43% if reveal that immigrants are mothers and/or daughters. The cultural threat frames also utilize similar strategy in the U.S. Fourteen percent of these frames identify immigrants as men (fathers) and 53% reveal that immigrants are women (daughters).

Table 3-5. Immigrants' Family Roles in Cultural Threat Frames, by Country

| | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|-----------------------------------|-----------------------|----------------|-----------------|--------------|
| Gender Neutral Family Role | Spouse/partner | Child | Parent | Total |
| Hong Kong | 1 (11%) | | | 1 (11%) |
| Taiwan | 12 (66%) | 1 (6%) | | 13 (72%) |
| U.K. | | 2 (29%) | 1 (14%) | 3 (43%) |
| U.S.A. | | 5 (23%) | 2 (10%) | 7 (33%) |
| Masculine Family Role | Father | Husband | | |
| Hong Kong | | 3 (33%) | | 3 (33%) |
| Taiwan | - | - | | - |
| U.K. | | 1 (14%) | | 1 (14%) |
| U.S.A. | 3 (14%) | | | 3 (14%) |
| Feminine Family Role | Mother | Wife | Daughter | |
| Hong Kong | 3 (34%) | 2 (22%) | | 5 (56%) |

| | | | |
|--------|------------|-------------|-------------|
| Taiwan | 1 (6%) | 4 (22%) | 5 (28%) |
| U.K. | 2 (29%) | 1 (14%) | 3 (43%) |
| U.S.A. | | 11 (53%) | 11 (53%) |

While immigration is implicitly gendered in the cultural threat frames, the cultural integration frames also gender immigration in a subtle way. As Table 3-6 shows, while Taiwan, the U.K., and the U.S. are likely to discuss immigrants' identities at home in gender-neutral terms, such as spouse, partner, child, and parent at 44%, 33%, and 28%, respectively, many cultural integration frames also implicitly reveal immigrants' sex. Looking more closely, among the cultural integration frames that specify immigrants' family roles in Hong Kong, 67% of them identify immigrants as having feminine roles and 33% identify immigrants as having masculine roles (shown in Column 5). Specifically, 50% of these frames identify immigrants as mothers, 17% identify women as wives, and only 33% are identified as husbands in Hong Kong.

Similarly in Taiwan, 49% of the cultural threat frames that specify immigrants' family roles identify immigrants with feminine roles and only 7% specifies immigrants with masculine roles. Particularly, 29% of these frames identify immigrants as wives and 11% identify them as mothers 9% identify them as daughters and daughter-in-laws. Similarly, in the cultural integration frames that reveal the family roles of immigrants in the U.S. also incorporate feminine family roles at a higher rate (45%) than masculine roles (17%). Looking more closely, 17% of these frames reveal that immigrants are mothers, 11% reveal that they are wives, 27% reveal that they are daughters, and only 17% reveal that they are fathers. In the U.K.'s cultural integration frames, 33% identify immigrants to be men and another 33% identify immigrants to be women.

Table 3-6. Immigrants' Family Roles in Cultural Integration Frames, by Country

| | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|--|----------------|------------|------------|-------------|
| More Gender Neutral Family Role | Spouse/partner | Child | Parent | Total |
| Hong Kong | - | - | - | - |
| Taiwan | 30 (38%) | 5 (6%) | | 35 (44%) |
| U.K. | | 1 (34%) | | 1 (33%) |
| U.S.A. | 1 (6%) | 2 (11%) | 2 (11%) | 5 (28%) |
| Masculine Family Role | Father | Husband | Son | |
| Hong Kong | | 2 (33%) | | 2 (33%) |
| Taiwan | 2 (3%) | 3 (4%) | | 5 (7%) |
| U.K. | | | 1 (33%) | 1 (33%) |
| U.S.A. | 3 (17%) | | | 3 (17%) |
| Feminine Family Role | Mother | Wife | Daughter | |
| Hong Kong | 3 (50%) | 1 (17%) | | 4 (67%) |
| Taiwan | 23 (29%) | 9 (11%) | 7 (9%) | 29 (49%) |
| U.K. | | | 1 (33%) | 1 (33%) |
| U.S.A. | 3 (17%) | 2 (11%) | 5 (27%) | 10 (45%) |

In addition to the media's gendering of immigration by suggesting the family roles of immigrants, I also examine other ways in which the media gender cultural impacts of immigration. Specifically, I examine the occupation (masculine vs. feminine), wardrobe (niqab vs. turban, etc.), and familial responsibility (caretaker and cooker vs. breadwinner). Table 3-7

presents the results from my analysis of the media's associations of masculinity and femininity with immigrants. As the Table demonstrates, the media in all four cases overwhelmingly identify feminine traits of immigration when framing immigration as a cultural threat (at 54%). In contrast, only 46% of the cultural contribution frames assign masculine traits, but 54% assign feminine traits to immigrants in these articles.

Looking more closely, country differences exist in that in some cases, masculine characteristics are assigned at a higher rate than feminine characteristics. Specifically, both the cultural threat and contribution frames in Hong Kong assign feminine traits (at 60%) to immigrants in these articles than masculine traits (at 85%). Results in the U.K., however, are opposite to what has been found in Hong Kong. 65% of the cultural threat frames and 67% that are implicitly gendered assign masculine characteristics to immigrant's masculine traits whereas only 46% of cultural threat frames and 33% cultural contribution frames are associated with feminine traits of immigrants.

Taiwan and the U.S., on the other hand, have different results in cultural threat frames and cultural contribution frames. 72% of the cultural threat frames that are implicitly gendered associate immigrants with masculine traits whereas only 49% do so in the cultural integration frames. Cultural contribution frames associate immigrants with feminine cues at a higher rate (51%) than masculine cues (49%). The U.S. also have different findings in how varying cultural frames associate masculine and feminine cues of immigrants. 45% of the cultural threat frames in the U.S. associate immigrants with masculine cues while 57% of the cultural integration frames in the U.S. do so. In other words, feminine cues are associated with immigrants at a higher rate than masculine cues in the cultural threat frame, but feminine cues are associated with immigrants at a lower rate than masculine cues in the cultural contribution frames.

Table 3-7. Masculine and Feminine Association of Immigrants in Cultural Frames, by Country

| | Cultural Threat | | Cultural Integration | |
|-----------|-----------------|-------------|----------------------|--------------|
| | Masculine | Feminine | Masculine | Feminine |
| Hong Kong | 8 (40%) | 12 (60%) | 7 (15%) | 39 (85%) |
| Taiwan | 23 (72%) | 9 (28%) | 64 (49%) | 66 (51%) |
| U.K. | 7 (54%) | 6 (46%) | 4 (67%) | 2 (33%) |
| U.S.A. | 15 (45%) | 18 (55%) | 25 (57%) | 19 (43%) |
| Total | 53 (54%) | 45 (46%) | 100 (46%) | 118 (54%) |

In sum, both cultural threat and integration frames rarely explicitly reveal the sex of immigrants; however, they include other gender cues with which the readers could easily associate immigrants. An example is the media's identification of immigrants' family roles. In these instances, both frames in all four cases are more likely to reveal that immigrants are mothers, wives, daughters, and daughter-in-laws than they are to reveal that immigrants hold masculine family roles, such as fathers, husbands, and sons. These outcomes show that the media are not necessarily explicitly gendered in the way that the sex of immigrants are openly discussed and easily assessed. Instead, the media are implicitly gendered in that stereotypes and traditional family roles are incorporated when reporting on the cultural impact of immigration.

Conclusion

Issues of immigration have become central to the mainstream discourse in many receiving countries over the last few decades. As immigration has only increased, political and public debates over immigration have also only escalated. Ranging from politicians utilizing

immigration as part of their campaign strategy and platform to citizens proactively support anti-immigration policies, how the media frame immigration becomes an important question to ask. As Chapters 2 and 3 demonstrate, immigrants' impacts on the economy and on the national identity and culture are the two overarching themes employed by newspaper articles in Hong Kong, Taiwan, the U.K., and the U.S. This chapter examines how immigration is framed as a cultural issue in these four cases and also analyzes the extent to which the cultural consequences of immigration are implicitly or explicitly gendered in the media.

Utilizing a representative sample of news articles from the top circulated newspapers in Hong Kong, Taiwan, the U.K., and the U.S. between January 1 and December 31, 2014, this chapter shows that cultural threat and cultural integration are the two dominant frames that the media use in discussing the cultural consequences of immigration. These two oppositional frames show that media's cultural framings of immigration do not always have negative positions towards immigrants. On the one hand, the media construct fear by discussing how threatening immigrants might be. On the other hand, the media also indicate the positive presence of immigrants in the community. It is important to note, however, that even when the media positively portray immigrants' presence, they are likely to focus more on integration than on immigrants' preservation and celebration of their own native cultures. The extent to which immigrants are integrated is often one way the media utilize to embrace diversity.

Moreover, this chapter also shows that the media are gendered in that they identify female immigrants at a higher rate than they do male immigrants in the cultural frames. Migrant women are identified at a higher rate in the Hong Kong and Taiwanese media when cultural frames are employed. While this is not the case in the cultural integration frame in the U.K. and the U.S., this result can also be explained by the fact that traditionally immigrants in these cases are understood to be men and thus are more likely to be mentioned. Such low proportion of the media's report on the sexes of immigrants suggests that immigrants, as a group of people, are

rarely the center of the debate (Campani 2001; Sampedro et al.2010) but instead are objects of discourse (Giorgi 2012).This outcome can be explained by the normalized gender expectations in that women represent motherhood and thus carry the responsibility of biological reproduction. This gendered responsibility also leads to the reproduction of culture and national identity. Women are expected to partake in such role to maintain a homogeneous identity and harmonious society. Therefore, as immigrants are often faced with the questions about their presence transforming the demographics of a nation and changing existing traditions, customs, and values, female immigrants' impacts on the cultural aspects of immigration are particularly highlighted. Across all frames, however, there is a general sentiment of otherness in which immigrants are singled out. For example, although the cultural integration frame celebrates immigrants' presence, it also praises the immigrants' endurance of hardship and cultural integration by emphasizing their identities as immigrants although they could have had been citizens for the majority of their lives.

As scholars provide evidence on how the media racialize their discourses on immigration, this paper particularly adds to current studies with its evaluation of gendered media discourses. As studies on immigration have traditionally centered on men's participation and roles, this paper acknowledges that women constitute half, if not more, of the immigrant population across the world. Not only does migrant women's presence need to be recognized, how they are treated under the masculine media frames is crucial in our understanding of migrant experiences.

Moreover, this study compares the media frames in two western contexts (the U.K. and the U.S.) and two eastern contexts (Hong Kong and Taiwan) where immigration has been previously rarely explored. Such comparison helps us comprehend how the media in each case react to the country's uniqueness of the immigrant population, demographics, and scale. More importantly, it contextualizes how male and female immigrants are situated in the political and social discourse through the media's treatment of them. Through studying the media frames as a

form of social construction, we understand the power dynamics between immigrants and citizens. Further research is needed to comprehend whether and how such construction of discourses surrounding immigration plays a role in shaping individuals' opinion regarding immigrants.

Chapter 4

Media Effect on Public Opinion

“They’re taking our jobs. They’re taking our manufacturing jobs. They’re taking our money. They’re killing us.”⁵⁹ This statement made by Donald Trump, the 2016 United States Republican presidential candidate, at a campaign event in Phoenix, Arizona in July 2015. Not only does this statement illustrate his anti-immigration agenda, but it also reflects that the economic impact of immigration is a major concern of many citizens of receiving countries. Approximately the same time Trump spoke about immigrants’ impact on the labor force during his political campaign, the United Kingdom Prime Minister David Cameron also announced his plans to deport Muslim women, spouses of immigrants, who fail to learn English within five years upon arrival in the U.K.⁶⁰ His plans echo the other major concern of native citizens—the impact of immigrants’ lack of immersion in the national culture. These two news stories about politicians’ promises and proposals regarding immigration are not uncommon; yet, they share different characteristics—one focuses on the economic consequences of immigration and the other on the cultural consequences of immigration. However, even the economic and cultural consequences of immigration are uniquely separated based on societal understanding and normalization of gender roles. Stories about immigrants who cross the border for work usually revolve around migrant men’s experiences. On contrary, the depictions of the cultural side of immigration are often centered on migrant women. Although these narratives do not present facts because in reality women also migrate for work and men also face issues of integration and have

⁵⁹Schreckinger, Ben. Retrieved May 2, 2016. <http://www.politico.com/story/2015/07/donald-trump-storms-phoenix-119989>

⁶⁰ Mason, Rowena and Sherwood, Harriet. January 18, 2016. “Cameron ‘Stigmatizing Muslim Women’ with English Language Policy” Retrieved May 2, 2016 <http://www.theguardian.com/politics/2016/jan/18/david-cameron-stigmatising-muslim-women-learn-english-language-policy>

abilities to transform the demographic characteristics of a community, they showcase the commonality in the gender role assignments of immigrants in the media.

As anxiety toward immigrants is found to be racialized and situational depending on the racial, ethnic, and religious demographic characteristics of immigrants (Devos and Ma 2008; Krysan 2000), what remains underexplored is how public opinion toward immigrants could also be gendered, particularly under the influence of gendered media framings of immigration. Moreover, little is known about how the role of media on public opinion might compare across countries, particularly in East Asia—a top destination of immigration for many from more peripheral, neighboring countries. As immigration has been on the national agenda of many receiving countries, understanding how citizens' attitudes toward male and female immigrants may be affected by media framing is crucial for several reasons. First, the media's influence of public opinion regarding immigration helps predict the agenda setting of national policies (McCombs 2013). Second, it also helps understand the process in which political parties and politicians may construct their platforms. Third, it also allows for comprehending of how the general public and the countries conceptualize citizenship, dictating who is an official member and has the right to participate in the political process (Koopmans 2005). Such understand of the relationship between the media and public opinion regarding immigration also provides implications for how citizens constitute a national identity vis-à-vis the type of information regarding immigration to which they are regularly exposed. While public opinion regarding immigrants has received much scholarly attention, several questions are still insufficiently addressed in academic research:

- How might the media framing of immigration issues and immigrant identities affect public opinion regarding citizens? Particularly, how might the media's emphasis on the economic and cultural impacts of immigration influence the social attitudes toward migrant men and women?

- How does the media effect on citizens' attitudes differ among countries with varying naturalization policies?

Based on previous analysis of the print media, this chapter utilizes survey experiments to explore above questions by testing how framings of various consequences of immigration in national newspapers in Hong Kong, Taiwan, the United Kingdom and the United States shape native citizens' opinions regarding migrant men and women. As my previous analysis of newspaper framings in Chapters 2 and 3 informs me that the economic and cultural consequences of immigration dominate the media discourse, the scripts in my experiments are built on the interactions between gender and economy and gender and culture. I hypothesize that attitudes toward male and female immigrants could be affected by the ways the media gender the economic and cultural consequences of immigration.

In conducting experiments, I measure how controlled media frames affect citizens' attitudes toward immigrants. My data show that participants' responses differ depending on the media's manipulations of gender and the economic and cultural aspects of immigration. Specifically, I find that native citizens are more likely to reject male immigrants than female immigrants when informed about the economic impact of immigration. I also find that the media framing of immigrants' impact on the national identity leads to a higher rejection rate of migrant women than of migrant men among native citizens.

This chapter contributes theoretically and methodologically in the understanding of how citizens' attitudes toward immigrants are gendered and affected by media framing of immigration. In the former case, this chapter draws from feminist theory, applies to political science research, and offers an integrated theory of how gender, when intersected with the economic and cultural aspects of immigration, plays a role in the media impact on public opinion. In the latter case, this chapter is the first cross-national examination, including countries in East Asia which are previously rarely compared, of the media effect using survey experiments. This

cross-regional systematic examination provides causal evidence that suggests the conditions and the extent to which immigrants might be accepted as members of society under the influence of newspapers.

This chapter is organized in four parts. First, I provide an overview of public opinion on immigrants and immigration and discuss the insufficiencies in existing literature. Then I briefly review how the media are gendered. Second, I discuss my data and methodology. Third, I present my findings on the media effects of public opinion. Fourth, I conclude by discussing the implications of my findings.

Public Opinion regarding Immigrants and Immigration

Immigrants often propel heated discussions in domestic politics in receiving countries as their arrivals force the existing communities to confront the existence of immigrants as “outsiders.” Their presence in and impacts on the country could be as threatening, leading to the overwhelming opposition toward immigrants (Ceobanus and Escandell 2010). Some of the threats as which immigrants may be perceived include criminals, health hazards, job takers, etc. In these instances, immigrants are portrayed as scapegoats for the problems and that receiving countries have—immigrants are seen as a burden and blamed for issues that may have already existed long before their arrival. In the following section, I specifically discuss the ways immigrants’ impacts on the economy and culture serve as predictors of public opinion toward immigrants. Economic factors are one way in which scholars identify to explain public opinion toward immigrants. Native citizens’ attitudes toward immigration may differ, but scholars suggest that public opinion is particularly vigorous when immigration is framed from an economic perspective (Esses, Dovidio, and Hodson 2002). Particularly, current studies show that individual career trajectories, fear of competition, and rational calculations determine their attitudes toward immigrant and

immigration" (Ceobanu and Escandell, 2010, 317). That is, the issues of immigration would be a concern or even seen as a threat when self-interests are expected to be violated. The entry of workers implies more people are competing over jobs and space (Olzak, 1992). . The fear of labor competition comes from the supply and demand theory, which suggests that the increasing migrant labor endangers the wages and demands for native labor (Mayda 2006; Olzak 1992; Kessler 2001; Scheve and Slaughter 2001). In other words, such competition especially raises fear and insecurity as the increase in migrant labor raises the supply labor, which then results in the decrease in the wages and the number of jobs available for native citizens. Scholars even suggest that citizens should always oppose immigration, particularly those whom they share similar skills with (Borjas, Freeman, and Katz 1997; Borjas 1999). Moreover, evidence also shows that citizens with low-skills tend to oppose immigration (Hainmueller and Hiscox 2010; Mayda 2006).

In addition to the impact of immigration on the economy, social attitudes toward immigrants can also be driven by noneconomic concerns, such as culture. Particularly, public opinion centers on how citizens view the place, citizenship, identity of immigrants, and constructions of national identity (Simon and Lynch, 1999; Suro, 2009). With increasing immigration, native citizens face the sudden emergence of multiculturalism, challenging the traditional notion of national identity (Bloemraad et al. 2008; Kivisto 2001). Consequently, the presence of immigrants often raises cultural and ethnic tensions (Bauer et al. 2000; Burns and Gimpel 2000; Espenshade and Hempstead 1996; Chandler and Tsai 2001; Citrin, et al. 2007; Dustmann and Preston 2007; Fetzer 2000; McLaren 2003; Lahav 2004;). As immigrants are often accused of not assimilating culturally, socially, linguistically, and religiously (Portes and Rumbaut 2006), this threat particularly leaves native citizens in countries with high homogeneity feel threatened for the changes in their national identity. That is, as immigrants enter and become more visible by the number, the different religion they practice, the different language they speak,

the different wardrobe they wear suddenly become a violation of an existing identity. Cultural threat and ethnic tensions thus rise as a result of immigrants (Bauer et al. 2000; Burns and Gimpel 2000; Espenshade and Hempstead 1996; Chandler and Tsai 2001; Citrin, et al. 2007; Dustmann and Preston 2007; Fetzner 2000; McLaren 2003; Lahav 2004;). Societal anxiety over immigrants' abilities to assimilate implies how the citizens of one country view these "strangers" on their homeland, which then leads to distinguishing who is one of us and entitled to political rights. The ban on burqa in Europe is an example of how the natives respond to an outsider group existing in "their" space, wearing clothes that are unfamiliar to their culture, and challenging their existing ideologies of gender equality and democratic freedom. Thus, immigrants can be seen as a "threat" to a country's national identity as migrants often represent an end of homogeneity (Citrin et al. 2007; Lim 2010).

Gender in the Media

Scholars also find that attitudes towards immigrants are situational and that the immigration reform depends on the demographics of immigrants (Becker, 1971; Quillian, 2006; Vernby and Finseraas, 2010), but concentrate on ethnic factors. Therefore, I also want to highlight the relevance of gender as an identity of immigrants as it is embedded in who moves, why s/he moves, and how s/he integrates. Gender shapes how the stories about migrants are conveyed in two major ways. First, gender may be explicit in that the sex of actors is identified. For instance, in the media portrayal of a particular immigrant or immigrant group, they could be identified as male, female, men, and women, informing the readers the sex of immigrants.

Second, gender may be implicit in that the sex of actors is not explicitly identified or revealed in a story. However, the media gender their portrayals of a particular immigrant or group of immigrant by identifying gender traits and characteristics or assigning gender stereotypes,

through which readers are able to guess or assume the sex of immigrants. For instance, occupations of immigrants may be discussed in a news story. While most occupations are identified as masculine or feminine, readers are able to gather the sex of immigrants based on their occupations without the revelation of their gender identities. For example, in March 2014, Hong Kong's *Oriental Daily* published a news article discussing the impact of migrant workers:

Currently it takes an elevator repairer four to eight years to be certified... making resources and time spent on training cost-ineffective. Looking at the long term, migrant workers only worsen the problems in human resources and lower wages for the local workers.

Nowhere in this article is the sex of the migrant workers identified; however, the readers are likely to assume that these elevator repairers are men because of the masculine nature of this industry. Similarly, a story about caregivers may lead readers to assume that they are women because of the feminine nature of caregivers. Where images accompany these discussions, implicit constructions of gender are often reinforced by pictures portraying only one sex of individual.

The distinction between explicit and implicit gendered messages is crucial because my previous findings from media content analysis inform me that the majority of newspaper articles are implicitly gendered. While the sex of immigrants may not be revealed in most newspapers, I expect both explicitly and implicitly gendered messages to gender public opinion toward immigrants. In the following section, I describe how the media may be gendered when portraying the economic and cultural consequences of immigration. I then present my hypotheses on how the media may also gender public opinion toward immigrants.

Gendered Economic Aspect of Immigration in the Media

The economy has strong predictive power of citizens' feelings toward immigrants because their presence suggests labor market competition (Citrin and Sides 2008; De Figueredo and Elkins 2003; Raijman et al. 2008; Sides and Citrin 2007). What is understudied, however, is how gender plays into native citizens' attitudes toward immigrants, particularly under the influence of the media. While the media are generally gendered, I argue that it is particularly gendered in making the connections between male and female immigrants' and their impacts on the economy in three major ways.

First, as the media are gendered in portraying the migrant experiences of men and women (van der Zon 2000), I argue that gender is not completely lost but employed in a conventional way when the media discuss immigrants. That is, much understanding of immigrants' economic consequences center on the impact of men's migration, whereas the economic consequences of women's migration remain under-discussed. One reason might be because men are the primary breadwinners, bringing home the income; consequently the focus of the economic impact of immigration is largely centered on how immigrants may threaten the livelihood of men (Borjas, 1989; Chiswick, 2000; Hanson and Spilimbergo, 2001). The underpinning assumption is that most migrants who migrate for economic betterment are men as workers. Specifically, low-skilled workers, and undocumented workers are usually the emphasis of who migrates. Unattractive jobs and jobs that require much physical strength are reserved for these migrants, where the demand for male migrants might be more visible. In other words, because financial security is the conventional explanation for migration (Castles and Miller, 2009; Kandel and Massey 2002), migration is often recognized as an individual's, mostly a man's, choice.

However, the reality is that international migration among women has increased since the 1980s. Women have been accounted for at least 50% of the immigrant population in many

countries in the world, including the Hong Kong, Taiwan, and the U.S. The percentages of migrant in Hong Kong and Taiwan are also much higher than those in the U.K. and the U.S. as many of them move to Taiwan and Hong Kong as healthcare workers or maids. In the U.S., 56% of the foreign-born women participate in the lower, comprising 15% of all female workers and 7% of all U.S. workers. The strong presence of women in the labor force, nevertheless, is often left out in the mainstream discourse (Zhou 2000; Department of Homeland Security 2014). For instance, the *Los Angeles Times* ran a series of articles in December, 2014 with a focus on the experiences of Mexican farm workers. While the articles highlight the struggles for fair wage and decent working conditions, all the photographs accompanied with the articles only feature men as farm workers. This example demonstrates that migrant men are often portrayed as a blue collar threat because masculine, low-skill jobs that require manual labor are most likely to be replaced (Borjas, Freeman, and Katz 1996, 1997; Borjas 1999; Fietkau, Hansen, and Faas n.d.), whereas migrant women's threat to pink collar jobs is rarely discussed.

Second, even when migrant women's experiences are incorporated, they are studied as dependents rather than significant contributors (Kofman, 2004; Tseng, 2010). For example, a large immigrant population in the U.S. is women who both migrate to reunite with families and to be employed. Yet, because women generally occupy more effeminized jobs that carry low visibility, not only are their presence and contribution excluded in the media discourse but also auxiliary in the scholarly literature. Women's role in the labor force is under-addressed because their work remains private (Louie 2001; Eckenwiler 2009). For example, 33% of immigrant women in the U.S. are employed in service occupations related to maid service, healthcare, and tourism. Many of these jobs require women to work in a private space, taking care of children and the elderly, washing and folding laundry, cleaning hotel rooms, etc., leading to the lower visibility of migrant women's presence. Although not all migrant women hold effeminized occupations, many work in the private sphere, helping around the house. Specifically, women's

private labor results in their limited interactions with the world and vice versa, leading to migrant women's lack of economic cues for labor competition (Louie 2001; Rivas 2002).

Furthermore, many women also participate in the labor force in a less legitimate way in that they could be undocumented or unauthorized to obtain legal work. Not only is it more difficult to track their contribution to the economy, but it also makes their contribution less known and noticeable. Although not all women are primary decision makers for immigration, many still work and bring home income. Yet migrant women's low visibility also lowers their economic threat, easily leading the general public to be unaware of their impact on the economy. That is, because of the gendered perception of the labor force, women's contribution tends to be ignored, leading to a one-dimensional understanding of women's migration.

Third, even when the economic aspects of women's participation in the labor force are recognized, it is usually their private and effeminized work, such as domestic help and care work, that is emphasized, which is often considered necessary for the families in host countries (Lan 2003). Thus, migrant women's consequences for the economy are perceived differently from those of men. Therefore, I expect the gendered discourse to affect the types of threat that citizens perceive regarding migrant men and women. I expect the media's emphasis on the economy to stimulate more negative responses among citizens toward male immigrants. As gender may be implicit in citizens' everyday lives, I also expect a message about the economy where the sex of immigrant is implicit to lead to more negative attitudes toward male immigrants than female immigrants because people may assume that economic issues are more related to men than to women under the influence of implicit gender bias. Lastly, because of the gendered expectations of labor force participation, I expect that the rejection of male immigrants to be stronger in countries where men comprise a higher percentage of the immigrant population than countries where men comprise a lower percentage of the immigrant population.

I also expect the effect to be stronger in countries where women comprise a lower percentage of the immigrant population.

Economy hypothesis:

H1a: Citizens are more likely to reject migrant men than migrant women when reading about immigrants' impact on the economy when the sex of immigrant population is primed.

H1b: Citizens are more likely to reject migrant men than migrant women when reading about immigrants' impact on the economy when the sex of immigrant population is implicit (not primed).

H1c: The likelihood of citizens to reject migrant men than migrant women is higher in countries where there are more men in the immigrant population.

Gendered Cultural Impact of Immigration in the Media

In addition to the focus on immigrants' economic immigration, opinion regarding immigrants can also revolve around noneconomic dimensions, such as language, culture, race, ethnicity, and religion (Bauer et al. 2000; Burns and Gimpel 2000; Espenshade and Hempstead 1996; Chandler and Tsai 2001; Citrin, et al. 2007; Dustmann and Preston 2007; Fetzer 2000; McLaren 2003; Lahav 2004;). The emergence of multiculturalism through the increasing immigration challenges the traditional notions of national identity in many countries as connecting certain ethnic, racial, or religious attributes with national identity.⁶¹ The differences reflected through the visuals, such as skin color, dress, and religious symbols, create visible boundaries between in-groups and out-groups (Bail 2008), resulting in a collective positioning as a response to the immigrant cultural cue (Blumer 1958; Bobo 1999). For example, Caucasians in the U.S. are more likely to be accepted as representatives of America than other racial groups

⁶¹ I recognize the importance of race and ethnicity in the role they play in immigrants' experiences, as well as native citizens' attitudes toward immigrants. However, because of the limitation of the four-case study where specific races and ethnicities of immigrants and native citizens differ across countries, I am unable to examine the ways race and ethnicity of immigrants may shape public opinion. However, I still choose to include this brief discussion in this chapter because race and ethnicity constitute a part of the discussion on the national identity and culture.

(Kunovich 2009; Ceobanu and Escandell 2008; Coenders and Scheepers 2004). Similarly, dress also serves as an indicator of in-group and out-group. The legal bans of veils in several European countries as efforts to preserve national ideologies and values are examples of shifting the immigration debate from immigrants' economic consequences to their collective cultural threat (Charisafis 2011).

The media's discussions of the cultural impacts of immigration are also gendered in three major ways. First, while women's economic cues are obscure, their cultural cues are conspicuous. When discussing migrant women, an emphasis is often placed on women's dress, leading to migrant women's associations with culture in most countries (Bullock and Jafri 2000; Byng 2010). For instance, while in France, wearing the burqa has caused much controversy, the major insecurity comes from the intimidation of what Muslim women being "required" to wear burqas by their culture means to gender equality in France. As the media portrays wearing burqa as lack of freedom and choice, clothes in this case are connected with western democratic values as well as women's, not men's, bodies. It is also important to note that migrant men may also wear traditional wardrobe distinguishing them from native male citizens. Yet, there are fewer discussions of a legal ban on turban in countries that have prohibited veils, which suggests that that the media's illustrations of immigrants' cultural consequence are gendered.

Additionally, the media often highlight the traditional wardrobe of migrant women in East Asia, particularly those that have migrated for marriage. Consequently, it is common to see images of migrant women wearing their traditional clothing and introducing their traditional culture in the media, especially when they participate in community events. As most marriage migrants come from Southeast Asia, many media discourses revolve around what these Southeastern Asian women wear when celebrating their own holidays at community centers. Although underlying this celebration of their native culture is the message that these marriage migrants have assimilated to Taiwan (as they dress up in their traditional clothes only on special

occasions, like traditional holidays), migrant women's wardrobe is once again connected with how they integrate in society and what they mean to their host countries. Most importantly, rarely are migrant men who are married to native female citizens portrayed to be associated with dress and values. Similar to the fashion industry, women's clothes and accessories are much more emphasized than men's. Such emphasis puts migrant women in a visible and public sphere where the cultural significance through their dress is highlighted while their economic significance remains unrecognized.

Second, women are often considered the "cultural carriers," (Peterson 1999, p.47) "symbolic bearers of the nation" (McClintock 1993, p. 62) or "the mothers of the nation" (Sharp 1996, p. 99). These stereotypes that emphasize women's responsibility in constructing, maintaining, and passing on national ideologies result in the concerns over migrant women's reproductive roles. To the extent that women's contribution is associated to some degree in their reproductive roles, women's roles in society are constrained in their ability to perform motherhood. Although not all women are mothers or desire to be mothers, their reproductive abilities automatically make them responsible for reproductions of biological lives as well as national boundaries that constitute unique national identities (Yuval-Davis and Anthias 1989). Not only is migrant women's contribution in reproduction valued as producing future generations of citizens, but such social reproductive role also carries symbolic meanings that must remain representative and pure in order to maintain national identities (Mayer 2000). Because of a nation's persistence on maintaining homogeneity in national prosperity, ideology, and virility (Moran and Marecek 2000; Martin 2000; Mayer 2000; Mostov 2000), the cultural cues of immigrants are particularly strongly associated with migrant women than their male counterparts.

Eugenics in the United States prior to the World War II and in Germany during the Nazi era are examples of controlling the birthrates of women of certain race and ethnicity (Lusane 2003; Ross 1993). Evidence supports citizens' potential concern with what a nation would look

like when a large number of immigrant children become citizens at birth (Jacobson 2008; Ignatow and Williams 2011). Not only does the popular term “browning of the America” describes the increasing population of Latino immigrants and changing demographics of the U.S., but it also illustrates the emphasis on the cultural and social reproduction of migrant women (Johnson et al., 1997). Association of women’s reproduction with national identity is also apparent through Taiwanese society’s constant questioning of migrant women’s qualifications to be the early educators of the future generations of Taiwan because of the lack of language ability and familiarity with local customs. Specifically, the Taiwanese media often report migrant children’s slow development of language a major concern due to their migrant mothers’ lack of cultural and linguistic integration.⁶² Such discourse reinforces the stereotypes that migrant mothers are incapable of educating their children, particularly in helping their children assimilate and succeed in school. Another example that illustrates the connection between gender and national identity would be the U.K. Prime Minister David Cameron’s mandate of migrant women obtaining English proficiency in a certain amount of time. Failure to do so would result in the deportation of them. According to Cameron, English abilities help with integration and allow for establishing a unified British identity.

In addition to controlling women’s role in reproducing a national identity, the media in countries where there is birth citizenship have also created a message of women crossing the borders or entering a country with the goal to obtain citizenship. The media’s perpetuate the myth of the “anchor baby” by highlighting the benefits of migration through the maternal body for immigrant women and families. Because the discourse is centered on what country-born children can bring to their non-citizen immigrant parents, the media constantly reiterate the power that immigrants, particularly women, have in utilizing their bodies for citizenship. Obama’s recent immigration reform to deter deportation of parents whose children are Americans by birth,

⁶²陳雪慧著，〈側記南洋台灣姊妹會〉，刊於「南洋姊妹會會訊」創刊號，2004年5月

Chinese tourists' stay at the "baby care centers" or "maternity hotels" (Richburg 2010; Schechter 2013; Semotiuk 2014), and the mainland Chinese flocking to Hong Kong and taking up prenatal and postnatal resources (LaFranier 2012) are examples of the public's concerns with migration through the maternal body. Although men can also be parents of immigrant children, I argue that because of immigrant babies' inability to migrate through the paternal body, citizens rarely associate men with the changes in the demographics, which can challenge an existing national identity. Consequently, I expect the media's coverage on culture and female migrant to lower citizens' acceptance of female immigrants. Because gender may be implicit in citizens' everyday lives, I also expect a message that is centered on the cultural aspects of immigration without any specificity of the sex of immigrant to lead to more negative attitudes toward female immigrants because people may assume that female immigrants with the ability to reproduce are generators of cultural threat. I also expect this effect to be stronger in countries where immigrants can gain citizenship by birth.

Culture hypothesis:

H2a: Citizens are more likely to reject migrant women than migrant men when reading about immigrants' impact on the culture when the sex of immigrant population is primed.

H2b: Citizens are more likely to reject migrant women than migrant men when reading about immigrants' impact on the culture when the sex of immigrant population is implicit (not primed).

H2c: The likelihood of citizens to reject migrant women than migrant men is higher in countries where jus soli is the pathway to citizenship than in countries where citizenship can only be naturalized.

Research Design

Currently, there are no large datasets that examine the relationships between gendered media framings of immigration and public opinion on immigrants. Therefore, I utilize a case

study approach. The data for this chapter stem from studies of the causal connections between the media and public opinion in four cases: Hong Kong, Taiwan, the U.K., and the U.S. These four cases allow me to achieve maximum variance along relevant dimensions as immigrants in these four countries vary in their gender, race, and ethnicity, countries of origin, and other characteristics (Seawright and Gerring 2008).

Specifically, I conduct survey experiments to test the effect of gendered media textual vignettes on citizens' attitudes toward male and female immigrants. The experimental design of this chapter goes beyond the specific characteristics of public opinion chapter (Weaver 2009). The survey experiments can narrow the gap between the survey and the real world (Hainmueller et al. n.d.) and also allow for systematically varying the immigrant group cues and examining the effects of gender by measuring the differences among the outcomes of the controlled and the treatment groups. In the following sections, I discuss in detail my experimental design, survey design, and sampling strategy.

Experimental Design

Questions about citizens' attitudes toward male and female immigrants are rare in national surveys. Therefore, I conducted original Internet survey experiments to test how various media frames surrounding immigration influence citizens' acceptance or rejection of immigrants. Utilizing the Amazon Mechanical Turk (MTurk), I was able to recruit participants in Hong Kong, the U.K., and the U.S.⁶³ Panels of respondents saw a job post via MTurk and voluntarily

⁶³ The surveys in the U.K. and the U.S. are fielded for one week in August 2015. The survey in Hong Kong was fielded for ten weeks in November 2015.

participated in the experiment. I also partnered up with Pollcracy Lab⁶⁴ at the Election Study Center at National Chengchi University to recruit participants in Taiwan.⁶⁵

My recruitment process in Hong Kong, the U.K., and the U.S. is as follows. I post a human intelligence task (HIT) that includes a link to my survey that is hosted on the Qualtrics platform on the MTurk system. As MTurk workers browse through the MTurk website, they see my HIT announcement and they may proceed to gather more information about the project. The recruitment information that details the title of the survey, the reward, the time allocation, requestor, keywords, description of the study, as well as instructions are included (see Appendix A for details). Once they view the instructions, they may decide to accept the HIT. In order to ensure that my respondents are citizens of a country that I sample, I set up my HIT in the way that only country-based workers can accept my HIT. Upon acceptance of my HIT, the participants will be directed to the Qualtrics platform through which the users will be asked five questions regarding their citizenship status and age. Participants must meet my selection criteria before they can proceed to the consent page, which they must sign in order to continue their participation.

The recruitment process in Taiwan is similar in that Pollcracy Lab sends an invitation to its panel members with a link to the survey. The participants could choose to volunteer in the survey by clicking on the link. After reading over the same instructions that are given on MTurk, participants will be directed to the Pollcracy Lab platform through which the users will be asked questions about their citizenship status and age.

⁶⁴ I posted a HIT on Amazon Taiwan during the same time period as I posted a HIT on Amazon Hong Kong. However, I was not able to recruit any participants. I also tried posting the HITs at various times of the day to ensure that I was able to reach different audiences; however, I still received no response. Thus, I resorted to utilizing the Pollcracy Lab's panel of participants to run the survey experiments. The participants on the Pollcracy Lab's panel are also relatively young and share similar demographics as those who are regular workers on MTurk, allowing for comparison of responses across nations. See Tables B-1 and B-2 in Appendix B for the details of the sociodemographic characteristics of the participants of MTurk and the Pollcracy Lab. Table B-3 represents the sociodemographic characteristics of the national samples in Hong Kong, Taiwan, the U.K., and the U.S.

⁶⁵ The Pollcracy Lab fielded the survey in Taiwan for one week in the end of April and early May 2016.

My sample includes 2,694 respondents: 544 in Hong Kong, 544 in the U.K., 544 in the U.S., and 1,062 in Taiwan. In order to avoid bias, the target population for my study is adult native citizens that are born in the country sampled and do not have immediate family members that are immigrants. My participants are screened to ensure that they meet the criteria before proceeding. Roughly 10% of those that respond to my surveys do not pass the screening questions and thus are excluded from my overall sample. Existing studies also demonstrate that samples via MTurk are generally more representative of country socio-demographic characteristics than other online convenience samples and college samples (Buhrmester, Kwang, and Gosling 2001; Horton, Rand and Zeckhauser 2011).

I construct experiments to assess the effects of different treatment combinations for gendered framing cues. Table 4-1 displays an overview of my experiment design. I have six treatment groups to which the participants were randomly assigned. Randomization ensures that my participants in all groups are identical in all other characteristics that may confound a comparison across groups (Hainmueller and Hiscox 2010). My experiments are conducted in the form of a survey (see Appendix C for the survey questionnaire). The questionnaire was modeled after existing public opinion survey, allowing for comparability. The survey questionnaire consists of four sections. First, the respondents are asked a series of questions that contain information about their demographic characteristics: age, gender, education, employment, marital status, number of children. In this section, respondents are also asked about how often they consume news via various outlets, such as daily newspapers, printed magazines, TV news, etc.

Table 4-1. Six Treatment Groups in the Experimental Design

| | Explicit Gender | Explicit Gender | Implicit Gender |
|----------|-----------------|------------------|--------------------------------|
| Economic | Economic frame | Economic frame | Economic frame |
| | Male immigrant | Female immigrant | Sex of immigrant not specified |
| Cultural | Cultural frame | Cultural frame | Cultural frame |
| | Male immigrant | Female immigrant | Sex of immigrant not specified |

I also pre-test participants' existing ideologies regarding gender and immigration prior to the actual treatment by asking them to answer a set of classical survey questions regarding their ideologies on a wide range of statements in a survey and their backgrounds, modeled after standardized public opinion survey. In the second section, respondents are presented with a set of seven items that allow me to examine respondents' ideology and stance on relevant issues. The ideology questions ranged from environmental, fiscal, to other statements related to gender and immigration and respondents are asked to answer on a scale of 1 to 5 scale if they strongly agree, agree, neither agree or disagree, or disagree, or strongly disagree with these statements. The statements are: (1) Governments should tax the rich and subsidize the poor; (2) On the whole, men make better business executives than women do; (3) Employers should be incentivized to hire physically challenged workers; (4) Death penalty should be banned as a form of punishment; (5) When creating annual budgets, governments should allocate more on maintaining national security; and (6) Government ownership of business and industry should be increased; and (7) For certain problems, like environment pollution, international bodies should have the right to enforce solutions. The respondents were also asked to list any groups on the following list that they would not like to have as neighbors: drug addicts, people who have AIDS, people of a difference race, sex offenders, immigrants, homosexuals, heavy drinkers, people of a different religion, and unmarried couples living together. I mix a set of ideology questions together to avoiding priming the participants, which also allows me to understand the participants' ideologies related to gender and immigration. Table 4-2 demonstrates my variables of interest and how they are measured.

Table 4-2. Overview of Tested Variables

| | | |
|-----------------------|---|--|
| Dependent variable | Rejected to admit to country (0=yes, 1=no) | |
| Independent variables | Immigrant Sex (1=female, 0=male) Associated cue (1=economic, 2= cultural) | Respondent Sex (1=female, 0=male) Age Education Employment status Marital status # of children Frequency and outlet for following the news Attitudes toward various policies Attitudes toward immigration (asked in post-test) Religion Political party affiliation |

In the third section, each group was given a unique media message that includes a cue and sex of immigrants connected to their randomly assignment to a particular treatment group. Respondents are presented with one of six treatment conditions. Respondents are asked to carefully read a newspaper excerpt that includes an immigration cue that is interacted with a gender cue.⁶⁶ As Table 4-3 indicates, the first three treatment groups were tested based on the economic framings of the media with descriptions of different sexes. Treatment group 1 was presented a media message about the *economic* aspect of immigration and through which *male* immigrants were highlighted. Treatment group 2 was presented a media message about the *economic* aspect of immigration and through which *female* immigrants were highlighted. Treatment group 3 was presented a media message about the *economic* aspect of immigration and through which no sex of the immigrant was specified. The participants in these three treatment group were presented with a profile of either a male or a female immigrant (matched with the

⁶⁶ Although the intersectionality of gender, race/ethnicity, and other social identities may shape how citizens view immigrants; my study focusses on the gender aspect of immigration to allow experimental design that is not overly complicated in order to succeed. Based on findings in this study, my future research will incorporate gender and race to examine how these two interact in influencing public opinion toward immigrants.

gender cue in their previous vignette) and asked if they would like to be his/her neighbor and give him/her work permit, residency, and citizenship. In Treatment group 3 where gender is implicit, respondents are randomly assigned into two blocks: one that receives a male immigrant profile and the other receives a female immigrant profile. The three groups differ in that they are asked to read a media excerpt about the explicitly gendered and implicitly gendered media message about the economic consequences of immigration.

The next three treatment groups were tested based on the cultural framings of the media with descriptions of different sexes. Treatment group 4 was presented a media message about the *cultural* aspect of immigration and through which *male* immigrants were highlighted. Treatment group 5 was presented a media message about the *cultural* aspect of immigration and through which *female* immigrants were highlighted. Treatment group 6 was presented a media message about the *cultural* aspect of immigration and through which the sex of the immigrant will not be specified. Similarly, the participants in these three treatment group were presented with a profile of either a male or a female immigrant and asked if they would like to be his/her neighbor and give him/her work permit, residency, and citizenship. In the treatment group where gender is implicit, respondents are randomly assigned into two blocks: one that receives a male immigrant profile and the other receives a female immigrant profile. The three groups differ in that they are asked to read a media excerpt about the explicitly gendered and implicitly gendered media message about the cultural consequences of immigration.

In the fourth section, respondents are asked about their religion, party ideology, and the amount of interaction they have with immigrants in their daily lives. These post-test questions were aimed at helping me understand participants' social distance from immigrants and other demographical information without being primed.

Table 4-3. Overview of Experimental Conditions and Control and Treatment Groups

| Hypothesis | Condition | Messages (vignettes) |
|------------|--|---|
| H1 | Economic Gender-explicit: Male | A report issued by the institute of migration last week makes clear that there has been a sharp rise in the number of immigrants living in [country] in recent decades. Immigrants now make up a substantial proportion of the country's workforce. Most of the new immigrants are men. Immigrants who participate in the labor force usually hold jobs in the construction and the agriculture industries. Labor economists have concluded that illegal immigrants have created competition and significantly lowered the wages of [country] adults. |
| H1 | Economic Gender-explicit: Female | A report issued by the institute of migration last week makes clear that there has been a sharp rise in the number of immigrants living in [country] in recent decades. Immigrants now make up a substantial proportion of the country's workforce. Most of the new immigrants are women. Immigrants who participate in the labor force usually hold jobs in the home settings as caregivers or domestic helps. Labor economists have concluded that illegal immigrants have created competition and significantly lowered the wages of [country] adults. |
| H1 | Economic Gender-implicit | A report issued by the institute of migration last week makes clear that there has been a sharp rise in the number of immigrants living in [country] in recent decades. Immigrants now make up a substantial proportion of the country's workforce. Immigrants who participate in the labor force usually hold jobs in the construction and the agriculture industries or in the home settings as caregivers or domestic helps. Labor economists have concluded that illegal immigrants have created competition and significantly lowered the wages of [country] adults. |
| H2 | Cultural Gender-explicit: Male | A report issued by the institute of migration last week makes clear that there has been a sharp rise in the number of immigrants living in [country] in recent decades. Immigrants now make up a substantial proportion of the country's population. Most immigrants are men. The report also shows that in most major cities, the official city government documents are published in multiple languages to accommodate the increasing population of immigrants. A considerable number of public schools have also hired interpreters to help non-English speaking parents of immigrant children to communicate with their teachers. Shops that carry traditional clothing and target immigrants increasingly open throughout major cities and small towns in the last year. As the report indicates, mass immigration seems to have transformed the nation by making it more diverse. |
| H2 | Cultural Gender-explicit: Female | A report issued by the institute of migration last week makes clear that there has been a sharp rise in the number of immigrants living in [country] in recent decades. Immigrants now make up a substantial proportion of the country's population. Most immigrants are women. The report also shows that in most major cities, the official city government |

| | | |
|----|-----------------------------|--|
| | | documents are published in multiple languages to accommodate the increasing population of immigrants. A considerable number of public schools have also hired interpreters to help non-English speaking parents of immigrant children to communicate with their teachers. Shops that carry traditional clothing and target immigrants increasingly open throughout major cities and small towns in the last year. As the report indicates, mass immigration seems to have transformed the nation by making it more diverse. |
| H2 | Cultural Gender-implicit | A report issued by the institute of migration last week makes clear that there has been a sharp rise in the number of immigrants living in [country] in recent decades. Immigrants now make up a substantial proportion of the country's population. The report also shows that in most major cities, the official city government documents are published in multiple languages to accommodate the increasing population of immigrants. A considerable number of public schools have also hired interpreters to help non-English speaking parents of immigrant children to communicate with their teachers. Shops that carry traditional clothing and target immigrants increasingly open throughout major cities and small towns in the last year. As the report indicates, mass immigration seems to have transformed the nation by making it more diverse. |

After the participants in each group were given the treatments and the control and their responses are recorded, I measured the significant differences among the treatment groups in how the different media frames of immigration affect how likely they are to have a female or male immigrant as their neighbor, worker, permit resident or citizen.

Results and Analysis of the Media Effect on Public Opinion

As hypothesized above, I expect immigrants' gender and the framing of immigration to be strong predictors for participants' attitudes toward immigrants. I expect that participants are more likely to reject male immigrants when they are presented a media message about the economic consequences of immigration. I also expect that participants are less accepting of female immigrants when presented a news article about the cultural consequences of immigration. Tables 4-4 to 4-7 present the outcomes from the survey experiments in Hong Kong,

Taiwan, the U.K., and the U.S., respectively. I conduct tests of significance to analyze whether participants' responses differ significantly under various treatments. My four dependent variables in all cases are citizens' public opinion toward immigrants, which consists of granting immigrants for being neighbor, granting work permission, granting permanent residency, and granting citizenship. Attitudes toward immigrants range from 0—Yes (accepting) to 1—No (rejecting).

Results: Effects of Media's Economic Gendered Framings of Immigration

Table 4-4 shows how participants respond to male and female immigrants after reading a news excerpt on the economic consequences of either male or female immigrants. Respondents overwhelmingly show preference for female immigrants under the economic treatment in all four forms of societal membership. Specifically, when the media message regarding the economic consequences of immigration is *explicitly* gendered, higher percentage of respondents in Hong Kong opposes granting work permits, permanent residency, and citizenship to male immigrants than to female immigrants. Specifically, 63% of respondents in Hong Kong reject male immigrants of work permits when only 37% of respondents reject female immigrants. Similarly, 68% of respondents in Hong Kong refuse to grant immigrants residency while 39% refuse to grant residency to female immigrants. 40% of respondents in Hong Kong refuse to grant male immigrants citizenship while 7% refuse to grant female immigrants citizenship. Although there is no significant difference in respondents' preference for having either migrant men or migrant women as neighbors, the significant differences in other types of societal membership demonstrate that respondents in Hong Kong favor migrant women more than migrant men under the influence of the media's manipulation of the economic impacts of immigration.

Respondents in Taiwan are also less supportive of male immigrants when it comes to granting them work permits, residency, and citizenship under the influence of *explicitly* gendered

economic media framing. Specifically, 76%, 68%, and 71% of Taiwanese citizens refuse to grant male immigrants work permits, residency, and citizenship, respectively. Meanwhile, only 45%, 42%, and 48% of Taiwanese citizens refuse to grant migrant women work permits, residency, and citizenship, respectively. These significant differences show that Taiwanese citizens are more in favor of migrant women when they are exposed to the economic impacts of immigration.

The U.K. results are similar where there are higher rejection rates of male immigrants than female immigrants when it comes to having migrant men as neighbors, workers, and citizens. Specifically, 91% of respondents in the U.K. reject migrant men to be their neighbors whereas only 61% of respondents in the U.K. reject migrant women. Also, 82% and 87% of respondents in the U.K. refuse to grant male immigrants work permit and citizenship, respectively, whereas 61% and 58% of respondents in the U.K. refuse to grant female immigrants the same privileges. There is no significant difference in respondents' preference for giving either migrant men or migrant women permanent residency.

Although the results in Hong Kong, Taiwan, and the U.K. support part of my hypothesis, the results in the U.S. support my hypothesis completely: the rejection rate of migrant men is higher than of migrant women when it comes to having immigrants as neighbors, workers, permanent residents, and citizens. Americans have an 87% rejection rate of male immigrants as their neighbors and a 67% rejection rate of female immigrants as their neighbors. Eighty-seven percent, 90%, and 87% of Americans refuse to grant migrant men work permit, residency, and citizenship, respectively whereas 67%, 64%, and 58% of Americans refuse to grant migrant women the same privileges.

Table 4-4. Comparing Rejection Rates of Male and Female Immigrants under the Exposure to the Explicit Gendered Economic Framings of Immigration, by Country

| | Hong Kong | | Taiwan | | U.K. | | U.S. | |
|-------------|-----------------|----------------|------------------|----------------|-------------------|----------------|-------------------|----------------|
| | Male | Female | Male | Female | Male | Female | Male | Female |
| Neighbor | 0.39 (0.05) | 0.28 (0.04) | 0.56 (0.07) | 0.45 (0.08) | 0.91 (0.07)** | 0.61 (0.07) | 0.87 (0.04)** | 0.67 (0.06) |
| Work permit | 0.63 (0.06)* | 0.37 (0.05) | 0.76 (0.03)** | 0.45 (0.04) | 0.82 (0.05)** | 0.61 (0.07) | 0.87 (0.04)*** | 0.67 (0.06) |
| Residency | 0.68 (0.07)* | 0.49 (0.05) | 0.68 (0.04)** | 0.52 (0.05) | 0.51 (0.07) | 0.42 (0.07) | 0.9 (0.04)*** | 0.64 (0.06) |
| Citizenship | 0.4 (0.07)* | 0.27 (0.04) | 0.71 (0.05)** | 0.48 (0.04) | 0.87*** (0.05) | 0.58 (0.07) | 0.87 (0.04)*** | 0.58 (0.06) |

***p-value<0.00; **p-value <0.05; *p-value <0.10

When the media message regarding the economic consequences of immigration is *implicitly* gendered, some of the responses from the survey experiments participants are similar to those that receive *explicitly* gendered messages as displayed in Table 4-5. Specifically, in Hong Kong, a higher percentage of respondents oppose granting male immigrants work permits, permanent residency, and citizenship than female immigrants. 67% of the respondents in Hong Kong refuse to grant male immigrants work permit and 39% refuse to grant female immigrants work permit. Sixty-six percent of respondents in Hong Kong also refuse to grant migrant men residency whereas 33% refuse to grant migrant women residency. There is no significant difference in respondents' preference for having either migrant men or migrant women as neighbors.

Respondents in Taiwan also overwhelmingly reject male immigrants when presented the economic impacts of immigration. Significant differences exist in how likely migrant men and women are to receive work permit, residency, and citizenship. Taiwanese citizens have rejection rates of 73%, 64%, and 68% when it comes to refusing migrant men work permit, residency, and citizenship, respectively. Meanwhile, Taiwanese citizens have rejection rates of 49%, 41%, and

43% when it comes to refusing migrant women work permit, residency, and citizenship, respectively.

In the U.K., there is a higher rejection rate of migrant men than migrant women when it comes to granting immigrants permanent residency and citizenship when respondents are exposed to implicitly gendered economic framing of immigration. Specifically, 60% of respondents in the U.K. are more likely to refuse male immigrants residency and citizenship whereas only 40% and 20% of respondents in the U.K. are likely to refuse female immigrants. Although there is no significant difference in respondents' preference for having either migrant men or migrant women as neighbors or workers, the significant differences in the likelihood to grant residency and citizenship to migrant men and women suggests that gendered media message leads to gendered outcome in opinion.

In the U.S., respondents are more likely to oppose granting male immigrants work permits and permanent residency than female immigrants. Forty-nine percent of the American respondents are less likely to favor migrant men over migrant women in giving them work permit. Eighty percent of the American respondents are less likely to favor migrant men over migrant women in giving them permanent residency. No significant difference exists between respondents' preferences for having either migrant men or migrant women as neighbors or citizens.

In all four cases although *explicitly* and *implicitly* gendered media framings of the economic impacts of immigration do not lead to the same exact responses of native citizens as some are null findings, when the results are significant, native citizens are less accepting of migrant men than migrant women. The findings partially confirm my hypotheses regarding the gendered economic effect of immigration on opinion about immigrants. Specifically, the findings support that when migrant men's gender identities are emphasized in news about the economic impacts of immigration, citizens are more accepting of female immigrants than of male

immigrants. These differences can be explained by the economic threat that migrant men are perceived to pose. On the contrary, because the economy is often considered masculine and less associated with women, migrant women's presence poses less of a threat to citizens who may be concerned about what it means to have female immigrants as neighbors, workers, residents, or citizens in the country.

Table 4-5. Comparing Rejection Rates of Male and Female Immigrants under the Exposure to the Implicit Gendered Economic Framings of Immigration, by Country

| Variable | Hong Kong | | Taiwan | | U.K. | | U.S. | |
|-------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|----------------|-------------------|---------------|-------------------|----------------|
| | Male | Female | Male | Female | Male | Female | Male | Female |
| Neighbor | 0.35 (0.05) | 0.23 (0.05) | 0.58 | 0.52 | 0.8 (0.05) | 0.7 (0.05) | 0.8 (0.05) | 0.71 (0.05) |
| Work permit | 0.67 (0.06) * | 0.49 (0.07) | 0.73 (0.04)** | 0.59 (0.04) | 0.5 (0.04) | 0.6 (0.03) | 0.49 (0.06)*** | 0.25 (0.05) |
| Residency | 0.66 (0.06)* | 0.43 (0.05) | 0.64 (0.04)* | 0.51 (0.03) | 0.6 (0.07) ** | 0.4 (0.05) | 0.8 (0.05)* | 0.66 (0.06) |
| Citizenship | 0.6 (0.07) | 0.44 (0.06) * | 0.68 (0.06)* | 0.53 (0.05) | 0.6 (0.07) *** | 0.2 (0.03) | 0.76 (0.05) | 0.64 (0.06) |

***p-value<0.00; **p-value <0.05; *p-value <0.10

Effects of Media's Gendered Cultural Framings of Immigration

Tables 4-6 and 4-7 display the results from participants who receive a news excerpt about the cultural impacts. As shown in Table 4-6, respondents in Hong Kong, Taiwan, and the U.S. are more likely to reject female immigrants than male immigrants when it comes to having immigrants as neighbors, residents, and citizens. There is no significant difference in respondents' preference for giving either migrant men or migrant women work permits in both cases. Specifically, respondents in Hong Kong have a rejection rate of 43% of female immigrants as neighbors and a rejection rate of 11% of male immigrants as neighbors. Respondents in Hong Kong are also more likely to refuse giving female immigrants residency and citizenship at 54%

and 60%, respectively. These differences demonstrate that explicitly gendered cultural framing of immigration leads to citizens' likelihood to reject migrant women over migrant men.

The explicitly gendered cultural framings of immigration also lead to similar outcomes in Taiwan. Seventy-three percent of Taiwanese respondents are likely to reject migrant women as neighbors whereas 56% of respondents are. Taiwanese respondents' rejection rates of migrant women as residents or citizens are at 74% and 78%, respectively, whereas rejection rates of migrant men as residents or citizens are at 47% and 52%.

In the U.K., there is a higher rejection rate of migrant women obtaining work permits than migrant men when exposed to explicitly gendered cultural framing of immigration. Seventy-five percent of respondents in the U.K. are likely to refuse to grant migrant women work permit whereas 40% of respondents are to refuse migrant men the same privilege. There is no significant difference in respondents' preference for having either migrant men or migrant women as neighbors, residents, or citizens.

In the U.S. when exposed to the explicitly gendered cultural framing of the media, 81% and 70% of the American respondents are likely to refuse female immigrants residency and citizenship, respectively, whereas 60% and 51% of respondents are likely to reject male immigrants.

Table 4-6. Comparing Rejection Rates of Male and Female Immigrants under the Exposure to the Explicit Gendered Cultural Framings of Immigration, by Country

| Variable | Hong Kong | | Taiwan | | U.K. | | U.S. | |
|-------------|----------------|------------------|----------------|------------------|----------------|-------------------|----------------|-------------------|
| | Male | Female | Male | Female | Male | Female | Male | Female |
| Neighbor | 0.21 (0.06) | 0.43 (0.05) * | 0.56 (0.03) | 0.73 (0.04)** | 0.75 (0.05) | 0.8 (0.05) | 0.81 (0.06) | 0.86 (0.04)*** |
| Work permit | 0.34 (0.07) | 0.26 (0.07) | 0.52 (0.04) | 0.58 (0.05) | 0.4 (0.07) | 0.75 (0.07)*** | 0.60 (0.06) | 0.71 (0.05) |
| Residency | 0.29 (0.06) | 0.54 (0.07) * | 0.47 (0.07) | 0.64 (0.06)** | 0.25 (0.07) | 0.4 (0.07) | 0.60 (0.06) | 0.81 (0.05)** |
| Citizenship | 0.16 (0.06) | 0.31 (0.07) * | 0.52 (0.06) | 0.78 (0.05)** | 0.25 (0.05) | 0.2 (0.07) | 0.51 (0.06) | 0.7 (0.06)** |

***p-value<0.00; **p-value <0.05; *p-value <0.10

As Table 4-7 displays, when the media message about the cultural consequences of immigration is *implicitly* gendered, similar outcomes on opinion toward migrant men and migrant women are achieved. Respondents in Hong Kong are more likely to reject migrant women for being their neighbors, residents, or citizens. Fifty-one percent of respondents in Hong Kong reject female immigrants as neighbors whereas only 23% of respondents reject male immigrants. Fifty-six percent and 53% of respondents in Hong Kong reject female immigrants as residents and citizens whereas 29% and 13% of respondents reject male immigrants. No significant differences exist in respondents' preferences for granting either migrant men or migrant women work permits.

Taiwanese respondents also have similar responses as respondents in Hong Kong when receiving implicitly gendered media message about the cultural impact of immigration. Sixty-eight percent of Taiwanese respondents reject female immigrants whereas 49% of respondents reject male immigrants. Moreover, the rejection rates among Taiwanese respondents in granting female immigrants residency and citizenship are at 71% and 72%, respectively and male immigrants at 45% and 48%, respectively.

In the U.K., however, the respondents are more likely to reject female immigrants than male immigrants in all regards of societal membership under the influence of implicitly gendered media framing of the cultural impacts of immigration. Ninety-percent of the respondents in the U.K. reject female immigrants as their neighbors whereas 70% of the respondents reject male immigrants. Eighty percent of the respondents in the U.K. reject female immigrants as their workers whereas 50% of the respondents reject male immigrants. Seventy-eight percent of the respondents in the U.K. refuse to grant migrant women residency whereas 51% of the respondents refuse to grant residency to migrant men. Seventy-three percent of the citizen respondents in the U.K. refuse to grant migrant women residency whereas 21% of the respondents refuse to grant citizenship to migrant men.

In the U.S., the respondents oppose granting female immigrants work permits, permanent residency, and citizenship at a stronger level than male immigrants. Seventy-five percent of respondents in the U.S. reject female immigrants as workers whereas 59% of respondents reject male immigrants. Similarly, 86% of American respondents reject migrant women as residents and 74% of respondents reject migrant women as citizens whereas 57% and 54% respondents reject men as residents and citizens, respectively. No strong differences exist in respondents' preferences for having either migrant men or migrant women as neighbors.

Table 4-7. Comparing Rejection Rates of Male and Female Immigrants under the Exposure to the Implicit Gendered Cultural Framings of Immigration, by Country

| Variable | Hong Kong | | Taiwan | | U.K. | | U.S. | |
|-------------|----------------|------------------|----------------|------------------|----------------|-------------------|----------------|-------------------|
| | Male | Female | Male | Female | Male | Female | Male | Female |
| Neighbor | 0.23 (0.05) | 0.51 (0.05) * | 0.49 (0.04) | 0.68 (0.05)** | 0.7 (0.05) | 0.9 (0.03)*** | 0.72 (0.06) | 0.75 (0.04) |
| Work permit | 0.43 (0.06) | 0.39 (0.07) | 0.47 (0.03) | 0.52 (0.05) | 0.5 (0.06) | 0.8 (0.04)*** | 0.59 (0.06) | 0.75 (0.05)** |
| Residency | 0.39 (0.06) | 0.56* (0.05) | 0.45 (0.06) | 0.61 (0.05)* | 0.51 (0.05) | 0.78 (0.03)*** | 0.57 (0.06) | 0.86 (0.04)*** |
| Citizenship | 0.36 (0.04) | 0.53* (0.07) | 0.48 (0.07) | 0.72 (0.06)** | 0.21 (0.05) | 0.73 (0.05)*** | 0.54 (0.06) | 0.74 (0.05)** |

***p-value<0.00; **p-value <0.05; *p-value <0.10

Similarly to the gendered economic frame treatments, my findings on the gendered cultural frame treatments partially support most of my hypotheses on the cultural treatments—female immigrants are less welcome and less accepted than male immigrants when the cultural impacts of immigration are contextualized for the participants. As displayed in Table 4-6, although on average respondents are likely to give migrant men and women work permits at very similar rates, this result is not surprising as the cultural conditions in the experiment does not include any hints about the economic aspects of immigration, preventing participants from associating immigration with the economy.

The results suggest that when given a media message about the cultural aspect of immigration even when the media message is implicitly gendered, respondents are more likely to associate with culture with femininity. Their preferences for migrant men over migrant women in most forms of societal membership may be explained by the cultural threat that female immigrants are often perceived to pose. In other words, women’s ability to reproduce future generations and in doing so transform what the culture looks like in a country has a strong negative influence on how citizens accept migrant women into their communities.

Conclusion

Using survey experiments, this study analyzes whether and the degree to which the media framing of immigration affects social attitudes toward male and female immigrants. In the vignettes, the media explicitly or implicitly gender the discussion of the economic or cultural consequences of immigration. Respondents in Hong Kong, Taiwan, and the U.K. are found to be less accepting of male immigrants when they are primed the economic impacts of immigration. Respondents in these cases are also found to be less accepting of female immigrants when they are primed the cultural impacts of immigration. Regardless of when the media messages are explicitly or implicitly gendered, the media effects are overall similar. Although further research is necessary for understanding how other factors, such as race, ethnicity, and country of origin, may shape public opinion, my reported results suggest that the public is susceptible to manipulation it comes to their views of immigrants, which implies that media framings and public opinion are gendered.

This chapter on the media effect on public opinion provides several important implications for political science. First and foremost, answering questions about gendered media effect on public opinion matters for understanding how and where receiving countries may place immigration on their national agendas. While politicians often perceive immigration as a growing problem and often wrangle over reforms on immigration, the current state of international migration has forced them to confront the increasing immigrant population as well as various dilemmas related to immigration. For example, while the European countries receive many Syrian refugees, not only are they confronted to cope with the in-flow of migrants, but they are also forced to cope with the aftermath of the in-flow of migrants, ranging from their adjustment to their new homes and employment to tensions that arise between the natives and the newcomers. More importantly, such migration is not only constrained to European countries, as the 2016 U.S.

presidential candidates are also challenged with questions such as whether and how they would accept asylum seekers.

Furthermore, scholars continue to debate the net impact of immigration, but on the mass level increases in immigration have helped to fuel rising public opposition in developed democracies. The public response, in turn, has provided fertile ground for mobilization by new right-wing movements and parties, and in some cases, for overt anti-immigrant violence. Particularly, many studies show that anti-immigrant sentiment is one of the key factors that lead people to support right-wing parties in Europe (Ivarsflaten 2008; Rydgren 2007). In other words, public opinion toward immigrants has the potential to influence anti-immigrant movements, party formations, as well as election outcomes. In reality, immigration was a major issue in the 2008 U.S. presidential election and became salient in the recent U.K. elections.

More broadly, resolving how social attitudes regarding immigrants are affected by the mainstream discourse is critical for understanding how states may respond to increasing immigration, through the various policies states implement, to control the flow level and to control who gets to have legal status to stay, to have a home, to work, or to participate in the political process. Particularly, as many developed and wealthier countries are experiencing declining populations, and thus declining size of their workforce since a smaller workforce implies less ability to grow the economy. Therefore, as demographics and population analysts argue that immigration is one of the main ways to counter that trend of declining fertility rates and labor force, policies that support immigration are unlikely to occur without a widespread public support. Furthermore, as the general public is likely to be more accepting of immigrants that have high skills and high levels of education, the demographics of immigrants determine play a role in shaping public opinion for who is allowed in (Knabe, Ratzel and Thomsen, 2009).

Lastly, the way the public perceive migrant men and women under the influence of the media indicates a fluid national identity that resembles the complexities of the notion of

citizenship in a globalized world. As some immigrants may one day become citizens, who gets to become citizens indicates who is officially accepted as members of society that could be allowed to enact their citizen rights, such as voting. Understanding who gets to participate and be represented is important for understanding the democratization process of a country.

Chapter 5

Chinese Migrant Brides in Taiwan: Tangible, Imagined, and Undesired Citizenship

Socioeconomic interaction between Taiwan and the People's Republic of China (PRC) has increased immensely during the last decades. Meanwhile, the cross-strait relations have also intensified. The emergence of the anti-China discourse in the spring 2014's Sunflower Movement against the Nationalist Party's "undemocratic" passage of the Cross-Strait Service Trade Agreement illustrates many Taiwanese citizens' concern about the increasing presence of Chinese immigrants in Taiwan (Ho 2015). The idea that the trade agreement sells Taiwanese citizenship suggests the anxiety about the influence of the PRC nationals on the future of Taiwan, namely taking over local businesses and media (Tzeng 2014), gaining political leverage (Shu 2010), and eventually voting for unification (Wang and Liu 2004). This anxiety particularly indicates a common public trajectory of opinion regarding mainlander immigrants' interest in attaining Taiwanese citizenship. I address the following questions in order to understand whether this assumption of marriage migrants' desire to acquire Taiwanese citizenship stays true:

- How do PRC marriage migrants in Taiwan conceptualize Taiwanese citizenship?
- What are some of the benefits and disadvantages they perceive of Taiwanese citizenship?
- How do gender, socio-economic class, and other social identities shape their conceptualization and further the actual acquisition of Taiwanese citizenship?

Assumption about Chinese immigrants' desire to attain Taiwanese citizenship could be traced to the large number of Chinese immigrants who partook in marital migration. Moreover, because marriage migration, a form of family reunification, has been the main and most efficient and effective path to naturalized citizenship, such movement across the strait is also highly gendered in that it is usually Chinese women that partake in the migration. Although Taiwan also experiences marriage migrants from other country of origins, Chinese spouses are treated

particularly differently because they are seen as a “potential threat to national integrity and sovereignty”—as a result of the complicated historical and political relationships between Taiwan and China (Friedman 2010).

While these harsher citizenship regulations⁶⁷ for PRC nationals have been hotly contested, the extent to which marriage migrants themselves view Taiwanese citizenship as desirable remains underexplored. Many studies examine the role of cross-strait interactions in the political (Chao 2003) and social (Li 2014) culture of Taiwan, but few explore how the Chinese marital immigrants are situated within Taiwanese society. Even when studies explore the paths and motivations of Chinese marriage migrants, they mainly focus on the lived experiences of women who migrated through commercialized marriage agencies (Tsay 2004). Little is written about the experiences of the Chinese women who met their spouses through venues other than brokers and those who migrated to Taiwan more recently. Similarly, much literature investigates the ways in which native citizens view PRC nationals and their impact on the Taiwan’s national identity (Chen 2002), but few studies examine the extent to which the assumption about marriage migrants’ motivation to attain citizenship reflects reality.

⁶⁷ Naturalization requirements differ for immigrants from PRC and immigrants from other countries in multiple ways. First, PRC nationals must reside in Taiwan for two years before becoming residents. In contrast, spouses of other nationalities are automatically granted a “resident” status, allowing them to enter Taiwan and work immediately upon declaration of marriage. Second, PRC spouses must wait until they become residents to work, except for under six specific conditions in their newly established household or in their in-laws: (1) meet the legal requirements for low income; (2) there is an elderly person over the age of 65 living in the home; (3) if a member of the immediate family is disabled; (4) severely ill family member; (5) under age children; and (6) experiences of domestic violence. In other words, PRC nationals must prove that there is need in their (in-law) family in order to participate in the labor force. As it is a common practice for adult children to live with their parents and in-laws, this policy further reflects migrant brides’ role in their new families. Their participation in the labor force can only be validated if their in-laws are in need, but not their birth families, reflecting the feudal concepts of paternal family and marriage. Moreover, this policy results in migrant brides’ illegal employment, leaving them vulnerable to risks, as well as devoid of health insurance and legal protection. Third, eight years of residency in Taiwan used to be the minimum requirement for PRC spouses to naturalize whereas only three years were required for other foreign spouses (Yeh 2010). Recently, under the leadership of President Ma Ying-Jeou who seeks to establish good relations with the mainland, legislation was passed, shortening the wait period to six years for PRC nationals. Although the length of time for residency has shortened, it is still longer than the requirement for spouses of other countries.

Immigrants interpret citizenship differently. Some may consider it as a status or membership (Marshall 1950); some may consider it as a ticket to participate in the political process (Plascencia 2012); some may consider it as a reward for contribution to a community (Stavig 2015). Most importantly, citizenship is considered to constitute the right to have rights (Arendt 1951), which ensures that human beings are entitled to security, equality, and freedom. This understanding of citizenship results in much literature's focus on the exclusion, oppression, and subordination of those that are rejected from citizenship (Gordon and Stack 2007; Lister 2003; McNevin 2011; Rocco 2014; Somers 2008; Weber 2011; Young 1990;). Yet, contrary to the common belief that naturalization is the ultimate goal for immigrants, the data from Taiwan's Department of Internal Affairs shows that the number of naturalizations among international spouses, largely made up of Chinese women, has decreased drastically while the number of international marriages has remained stable. Specifically, my interviews suggest that not all Chinese immigrants desire Taiwanese citizenship. Moreover, that the Chinese women who refuse to naturalize are from the upper class contradict the public's concern about Taiwanese citizenship being sold to wealthy investors. While immigrants' lack of desire to acquire citizenship is not a new concept (Hansen and Weil 2002), this chapter addresses how intersectional identities play a role in migrant women's utilizations of citizenship as a form of social membership, explained by their decisions in naturalization.

Driven by standpoint theory and grounded theory (Charmaz 1983; Cuadraz and Uttal 1999; Glaser and Strauss 1967; Harding 1997; 2004; Lincoln and Guba 1985; Strauss and Corbin 1990), I allow the migrant brides that I observed and interviewed to be the agents in defining their own citizen status and explaining their own ideas about citizenship throughout the research process (Oakley 1981). Utilizing in-depth interviews in an open format and ethnography and building on their experiences, I argue that migrant women' vision of citizenship has moved away from the concept of "imagined community" that is primarily used as a tool of nation-

building by heterosexual men (Rajaram and Grundy-Warr 2004). Given that cross-strait marriages are gendered, it is particularly important to hear the voices of the Chinese women as their ability to establish families and comply with the virtues expected for women in a Confucius society are also part of the “invisible” criteria for societal membership (Parreñas 2001). I also argue that citizenship is multifaceted and should not be “predominantly configured by the ethos and directive of democratic agency” (Lee n.d., 1). It is equally crucial to understand the informal narratives of claiming citizenship, as well as the formal ways of rejecting citizenship. I also argue that the agency of marriage immigrants produces a space and freedom even when citizenship is not acquiesced; such agency particularly interacts with material agency derived from immigrants’ socioeconomic status. This chapter, thus, provides an in-depth look at how Chinese marriage migrants view the pros and cons of naturalization and how their identities, experiences, and perspectives shape their decisions to naturalize. Addressing the gap in existing literature that explains citizens’ attitudes toward immigrants, it explores the ways in which various categories of axes shape marriage migrants’ desire and motivation to attain Taiwanese citizenship (Portes 2010).

This chapter consists of four parts. First, it provides an overview on the cross-strait marriage migration phenomenon in Taiwan by detailing the changes in the historical paths and motivations of migration. It also reviews the laws regulating mainlanders’ acquisition of Taiwanese citizenship. I describe the motivations for Taiwanese men to seek marriage with women overseas and the paths that migrant brides take to migrate to Taiwan. I also compare and contrast the laws regulating citizenship attainment for PRC migrant brides’ and migrant brides from other countries of origins. Second, it presents the data and methods used in answering the research question. I discuss my recruitment process, sample, interviewing procedure, and coding mechanisms. Third, it draws connections between class and immigrants’ desire to obtain Taiwanese citizenship. I contextualize the mechanisms and realities that enable migrant brides to

conceptualize citizenship. Building on their experiences, I draw that migrant brides' vision of citizenship has moved away from the concept of "imagined community" that is primarily used as a tool of nation-building by heterosexual men (Anderson 1991; Rajaram and Grundy-Warr 2004; Stavig 2015). Lastly, it concludes by discussing this chapter's implications for future research. In discussing our knowledge about PRC migrant brides' vision of citizenship, my goal is to show that PRC migrant brides' desire for becoming official Taiwanese citizens varies among individuals and is not always aligned with Taiwanese citizens' assumption. By emphasizing the different interpretations of and motivations for citizenship, I demonstrate that intersectionality plays a role through which class impacts how PRC migrant brides negotiate the politics of belonging, with or without a citizen status.

Cross-Strait Marriage Migration

Cross-strait marriages have only become common in Taiwan since the late 1980s and early 1990s as Taiwan has suffered from a bride deficit (Lan 2008). The term "bride deficit" is commonly used to describe the consequences of gender asymmetry in Taiwanese population. Precisely, the gender ratio in Taiwan is skewed as a result of preference for sons and prenatal sex selection (DGBAS 2007). This imbalanced gender ratio causes a shortage of women for Taiwanese male citizens to marry. This bride deficit was first lessened when veterans' visits to the mainland were allowed for family reunions. Visits home paved the way for them to establish families with women from the mainland (Chao 2004). Although not an intended goal of the policy, it marked the beginning of cross-strait marriages.

Although PRC women's presence has been an increasing part of the Taiwanese society for almost three decades, economic betterment has generally been seen as the major motivation behind their migration (Davin 2007; Kawaguchi and Lee 2012). The high demand to seek wives

abroad has also encouraged several popular venues to ease the searches. Commercialized agencies or brokers blossomed in order to respond to such demand for arranging trips to the mainland to meet women, as well as to handle the complicated paperwork for marriage migration, including applications for and interviews with the immigration services (Friedman 2010). Informal social networks, through which men are introduced to women in the mainland by Chinese women who already live in Taiwan, have also been utilized. That is, Chinese women who have resided in Taiwan for a while become the primary agents in introducing their sisters or friends to other men in their established networks in Taiwan (Lu 2008).

Nonetheless, as the economic and political relations between Taiwan and China have transformed significantly in the last decade, cross-strait marriages have also changed, ranging from marriage with an elderly veteran whose family and healthcare needs might be met to marriage with younger Taiwanese men from agricultural and working class who might have lower prospects in the marriage market. More recently, many Chinese women also met their spouses as they traveled or migrated to the mainland for pleasure and work. Yet, the discourse surrounding cross-strait marriages and mainlanders remains largely discriminatory. Stereotypes still exist in characterizing their marriage as financial transactions. Such ingrained misconception ignores other dimensions of marriage migration—economic better may be a major motivation for migration, but it is not always the case (King 2012). For example, Lu finds that some PRC women migrate for better employment and educational opportunities for themselves, as well as for their children from previous relationships while in China (Lu 2012). Consequently, the narrative surrounding PRC migrant women's naturalization assumes that they all want to become Taiwanese citizens because citizenship presumably has much to offer.

Nevertheless, statistics demonstrate that cross-strait marriages and naturalized citizenship do not necessarily align in recent years. Table 5-1 displays the total number of international marriages in Taiwan between 1998 and 2014. As the Table indicates, the total number of Chinese

women marrying Taiwanese men has reached 267,101 as of 2014. In other words, on average every year between 1998 and 2014, 15,711 couples with one PRC national have registered to marry in Taiwan. It also demonstrates that it is predominantly Chinese women who marry Taiwanese men. While marriages with other foreign nationals also occur in Taiwan, Marriages with PRC nationals constitute the largest among international marriages. More importantly, the number cross-strait marriages reached a peak in 2003 when approximately 34,610 or 20% of total marriages (including exclusively Taiwanese couples) in Taiwan were with a PRC spouse. Among international marriages, 63% of registered international marriages were with a PRC national in 2003. Although there was a slight decrease in the number of registered marriages with Chinese women since 2003, the number of Chinese female spouses who became residents has also been relative steady.

Table 5-1. Number of Immigrants in Taiwan between 1998 and 2014 by Sex and Origin

| Year | Total no. of int'l marriages | No. of Men | | | No. of Women | | | % of marriages with a PRC spouse |
|-------|------------------------------|--------------------|------------------------------------|-------------------------------|--------------------|------------------------------------|-------------------------------|----------------------------------|
| | | No. of PRC spouses | No. of Hong Kong and Macau spouses | No. of other Foreign National | No. of PRC spouses | No. of Hong Kong and Macau spouses | No. of other Foreign National | |
| 1998 | 21,969 | 366 | 124 | 1,725 | 11,303 | 149 | 8,302 | 53 |
| 1999 | 32,764 | 708 | 149 | 1,983 | 16,849 | 156 | 12,919 | 54 |
| 2000 | 45,308 | 691 | 161 | 2,293 | 22,784 | 172 | 19,207 | 52 |
| 2001 | 45,449 | 848 | 156 | 2,261 | 26,198 | 140 | 15,846 | 60 |
| 2002 | 49,300 | 1,609 | 169 | 2,679 | 27,626 | 141 | 17,076 | 60 |
| 2003 | 54,305 | 2,926 | 147 | 2,832 | 31,183 | 170 | 17,047 | 63 |
| 2004 | 32,531 | 215 | 141 | 2,747 | 11,671 | 169 | 17,588 | 37 |
| 2005 | 27,731 | 281 | 167 | 2,687 | 13,767 | 196 | 10,633 | 51 |
| 2006 | 23,608 | 323 | 191 | 2,660 | 13,604 | 267 | 6,563 | 60 |
| 2007 | 24,473 | 392 | 191 | 2,602 | 13,775 | 228 | 7,285 | 58 |
| 2008 | 21,500 | 383 | 243 | 2,878 | 11,887 | 262 | 5,847 | 57 |
| 2009 | 21,724 | 467 | 223 | 2,973 | 12,270 | 249 | 5,542 | 59 |
| 2010 | 21,322 | 588 | 252 | 2,968 | 12,065 | 268 | 5,181 | 59 |
| 2011 | 21,591 | 714 | 332 | 3,126 | 12,117 | 366 | 4,936 | 59 |
| 2012 | 20,115 | 755 | 338 | 3,195 | 10,896 | 319 | 4,612 | 58 |
| 2013 | 19,439 | 735 | 348 | 3,160 | 9,902 | 393 | 4,901 | 55 |
| 2014 | 19,946 | 740 | 462 | 3,354 | 9,204 | 498 | 5,688 | 50 |
| Total | 50,3075 | 12,741 | 3,794 | 46,123 | 267,101 | 4,143 | 169,173 | 56 |

To seek why the rate of naturalization has decreased at a higher rate than the rate of cross-strait marriages, I argue that when cross-strait marriages go beyond commercialized agencies, the intersectional identities of marriage migrants, either their own or in association with their spouses, shape how they view their place in their new home, specifically through their attitudes and actions toward naturalization. In the following section, I discuss how the social and

political discourses, through the examination of naturalization requirements and migrant women's reproductive roles, may shape the experiences of female migrants from the mainland in Taiwan.

Analysis of the Immigrant Perspective

In order to understand the experiences of PRC marriage migrants in Taiwan, I interviewed 24 individuals who are immigrants from the mainland. The 24 individuals I interviewed are all marriage migrants with an exception of a woman who migrated to Taiwan to reunite with her grandfather for educational purposes in the later 1980s and later married a Taiwanese man. These interviews took place at coffee shops, offices, or the women's homes between May 13, 2015 and June 1, 2015. Participants were recruited through existing social networks and non-governmental organizations. I use pseudonyms to identify my participants so they could speak freely.

Although my sample size is not large, it is rich in content as most interviews lasted between one to three hours. Some interviews also lasted half a day where I was invited to observe these women's activities at their homes, workplace, as well as volunteer-sites. The amount of time I spent with them was not very long, but for many migrant brides, it was their first time openly discussing their experiences in Taiwan. The semi-structured and informal format allowed us to explore the various aspects of their lives in Taiwan. Particularly, through feminist in-depth interviewing, my participants were able to share their "substantial experience" (Charmaz 2003) and describe "how they viewed their circumstances, to define issues in their own terms, to identify processes leading to different outcomes, and to interpret the meaning of their lives to the research" (Cuadraz and Uttal 1999). As power differential is always inevitable in a researcher/interviewee relationship; nevertheless, in-depth interviewing enabled the participants

to be the experts in their own experiences through the stories they shared (Leonard 2013; Merriam 2002).

In order to analyze the content of the interviews and draw connections, I utilize the analytic methods of grounded theory, allowing for flexibility in understanding the data (Charmaz 2000). Specifically, I perform three rounds of coding: open coding, axial coding, and selective coding (Roberts and Woods 2002). In the first round of coding, I read my transcriptions several times and created codes for almost every part of the text based on the content of the data. In the second round of coding, I look through the various labels that I create and identify patterns across these labels. I sought the connection among these codes. In the last round of coding, I reread the transcripts and recode the texts that were linked to the core codes that I have identified. In this stage, I find connections between my codes and theoretical patterns. Through these three rounds of coding, I am able to trace and analyze participants' rhetoric and experiences, as well as find common themes that allowed me to reiterate their ideas.

Tangible, Imagined, and Undesired Citizenship

As native citizens often use citizenship to mark the boundaries between themselves and immigrants (Yuval-Davis 1997), the actual benefits of citizenship perceived by immigrants are multi-faceted. On the one hand, citizenship allows immigrants to become "official" members of society but with caveat of strict immigration policies. Because immigrants represent the end of homogeneity (Lim 2010), the increasing presence of immigrants forces host countries to face the sudden emergence of heterogeneity and to rethink their national identity (Liu and Lee 2013) and their concepts of citizenship (Piper 2003).

On the other hand, citizenship does not guarantee native citizens' acceptance of immigrants as their "immigration status" marginalizes them. Particularly, Chinese migrant

women face intersections of oppressions because of their PRC identity that is considered sensitive, threatening, and exceptional. As Agamben (1998) suggests, as “exceptional citizens,” Chinese migrants suffer from precarious laws (Puar 2012), through which they Chinese women are placed in an extra vulnerable position because of their identity. More importantly, although their marriages may remain private, their presence as migrant brides is nevertheless public. Despite their language abilities, most mainland migrants’ identities may still be exposed via their accents and dress, different from native Taiwanese women. These differences make their presence and identity distinctive, enabling others to immediately categorize and exclude them. Moreover, such otherness is particularly paradoxical as Chinese migrants share the same ancestry with many native Taiwanese citizens. Furthermore, mainland marriage migrants’ experiences with multiple forms of discrimination, violence, and oppression via the general climate of “us vs. them” in everyday life extend beyond their naturalized citizenship (Friedman 2015).

In the following section, I discuss how marriage migrants may use their attained citizen status to navigate their lives in Taiwan or use the luxury of their free will to mark the boundaries of their citizenship. I first discuss what naturalization means to marriage migrants who have become Taiwanese citizens. Then I evaluate the ways in which citizenship may be imagined while they accompany legal constraints, specifically for PRC nationals. Last, I discuss how Taiwanese citizenship may be rejected by PRC nationals as they choose not to naturalize.

Tangible Citizenship

Most of the immigrants I interviewed have acquiesced Taiwanese citizenship. Not only does Taiwanese citizenship allow them to stay legally in Taiwan, but it also permits them to engage in a variety of activities, such as employment. Legal employment is almost always the first direct benefit that all working migrant women associate with naturalization. Eight-eight

percent of the migrant women in my sample are employed. Many of them work long hours every day, holding positions that require low-skills, such as school kitchen staff, market vendor, and masseuse. The majority of those who expressed their satisfaction with the direct benefits of Taiwanese citizenship are those that came to Taiwan via commercialized agencies. They began working as soon as they could legally as they reckoned that employment helped reduce their reliance on their husbands. Regardless of the multiple definitions of citizenship, the tangible benefit of being legally employed makes Taiwanese citizenship palpable and worth of acquisition.

Mei, a masseuse, met with me at a coffee shop near the massage parlor she works at on a Saturday morning prior to work. She has resided in Taiwan for 18 years. When she first moved to Taiwan in the 1990's, Mei couldn't work. Eventually, she attained a work permit, which allowed her to seek legal employment and become financially independent. When asked about her experiences after attaining her citizenship, Mei said:

When I first got married and moved here, I couldn't work. All I did was take care of my mother-in-law. She was very sick. I would give her massages to alleviate her pain. I was often bored around the house besides tending to her needs. She encouraged me to get a masseuse license. I took training lessons, got my license, and started working after I got my work permit. My husband initially did not support my work outside the home. He couldn't accept it at all. I had to convince him. He didn't really understand what a masseuse did and thought it was illegitimate. He didn't want me to have any physical contact with men, which is inevitable in giving massages. Now that I have been working for many years, he knows what this job constitutes and realizes that I wouldn't leave him just because I have outside contact or an earning.⁶⁸

Mei and I met for about an hour before she had to leave for her first massage appointment. I saw Mei two additional times and had brief conversations with her; however, she was always busy attending to her clients. Mei works from 9am to 9pm at the massage parlor and Sunday is the only day she has off.

⁶⁸ Interview by the author, Taipei, Taiwan, 17 May, 2015.

Marriage migrants without jobs are often forced to be financially dependent upon their husbands. Moreover, such economic dependence forces them to become isolated and insecure (Goodman 1987). Mei's response suggests that citizenship gives her the opportunity to work, have outside contact, and be financially dependent of his husband. Furthermore, the possibility of mainlanders being financially independent gives them an opportunity to step up in their social status. As social status influences in immigrants' adaptation to new culture, mainlanders should have an easier time adjusting and gaining independence. In fact, from a survey Yeh (2010) conducts, she finds that "Chinese spouses' families were better gender equalized. In such families, 72 percent of the Chinese spouses reported that wives were the ones doing the most housework, compared with Southeast Asian families 82 percent and European and North American families' 86.4 percent" (211). This "more equal" division of gender work could be a result of various factors; however, their ability to participate in the workforce, granted by law, might be an important contributor.

It is also important to recognize that the ability to participate in the labor force, as granted by an identification card also brings fear to male spouses. Working entails having outside contact, as Mei's husband's concern illustrates, work is often considered a gateway to bad influence. Women generally are expected to behave; migrant brides who are "purchased" are even more likely to be expected to behave. Moreover, financial independence may cause concerns among male spouses about their wives' "love" and loyalty to them. Stories about marriage migrants leaving their husbands immediately upon naturalization are reiterated in the media. While citizen status empowers marriage migrants, it may also raise issues that are not to be ignored.

In addition to the ability to work, other marriage migrants also disclose their abilities to engage in various activities granted by citizenship. When asked about why she wanted to become a Taiwanese citizen, Hsia, who lives in a rural town outside of Hsinchu where public transportation is not accessible, indicated:

Of course I had to think about it. If I attained Taiwanese citizenship, I would have to give up my PRC citizenship. I would have to return home as a Taiwanese then if that were to happen. So I thought long and hard about it. Taiwanese citizenship allows you to do many things. When you move to a new environment, you have to start from zero. In order for you to adjust to your new environment, you have to learn many basic things. I became a Taiwanese citizen so I could engage in a number of activities that are easier for Taiwanese nationals to do, such as obtaining a driver's license. If I could drive a car or ride a motorbike, it makes grocery shopping a lot easier. I no longer have to depend on anyone to take me places.⁶⁹

Her citizen status in this case grants her mobility and independence. Particularly because Hsia lives in a rural town where fewer employment opportunities exist, her ability get to the school where she works as a kitchen staff is vital for her mobility, as well as independence.

While Mei's and Hsia's responses reveal the independence that official documents, such as work permit and driver's license, can give them, other marriage emigrants express other dimensions of citizenship, such as healthcare benefits. Chu, a butcher who works alongside her husband at a traditional market, confessed her regret for marrying an abusive Taiwanese man. Every day Chu gets up early in the morning to prepare for her butchery business at a traditional market that operates during the morning when homemakers shop for their fresh produce for the day. Chu also works at the traditional market that runs in the evening, allowing working individuals to purchase ingredients, produce, and food on their way home from work. Chu only gets a break for a few hours in the afternoon between the morning market and evening market operation hours. Although she goes home and takes a nap sometimes, oftentimes she stays at the market in the afternoon, tidying up her butcher stand to prepare for the night market. In our conversations, she constantly stressed how her husband physically and mentally abuses her and how she is the one getting work done at the booth they have at the market. Nonetheless, when asked if there is anything positive about being in Taiwan, she said:

The universal healthcare system here is better. There are more healthcare benefits here in Taiwan than there are in the mainland. Just as of this morning, I went to

⁶⁹ Interview with author, Taipei, Taiwan, 19 May, 2015.

the hospital to get my eyes checked. But I had to go twice because I forgot to bring my insurance card with me the first time I went. The nurse said she could let me get my eyes checked and I'd have to return another day to complete the paperwork with my insurance card. Since I would have to make another trip another day anyway, I thought might as well go home to get my insurance card. So I made two trips to the hospital this morning. Having insurance covered by the government is very convenient.⁷⁰

Chu is not alone in asserting that healthcare benefits are great for being Taiwanese citizens. A number of women indicated that the healthcare system is better in Taiwan. Several women also expressed gratitude for the contributions that the government has made. Their attitudes toward government support seem to be connected with the actual, practical, and tangible benefits and services that the government provides. Through the ability to work, drive a car, and receive universal healthcare, their citizenship is defined. It is their rights to these privileges that enable their definition of their citizenship. Although implicit, these women, who appreciate the benefits that citizenship brings are the ones that are from the working class in which their concerns about the actual advantages of citizenship are closely related to their basic survival—wages, mobility, and financial independence.

Imagined Citizenship

While some marriage migrants have shown content with the benefits that Taiwanese citizenship provides, many of these benefits can be considered “imagined” as systematic barriers exist for PRC nationals. Citizenship can be “imagined” in four ways: (1) the longer-wait period for naturalization; (2) the unrecognized degrees and certificates, disabling educated women to hold high-skilled jobs; (3) the 10-year wait period to be eligible for government positions; and (4) deportation of divorced, unnaturalized marriage migrants.

⁷⁰ Interview with author, Taipei, Taiwan, 18 May, 2015.

While the mandatory number of years of residency in Taiwan for naturalization has been shortened to six years for PRC nationals, the proposal to shorten it to four years has been stalled in the legislature. The requirements have been stricter for PRC nationals than for migrants for other nationals, the substantive implications of citizenship attainment for mainlanders go beyond the usual benefits that come with citizenship as discussed in previous sections. In all my interviews with the marriage migrants who currently work at non-governmental organizations that strive to support new residents, they all mentioned that they strive for the equal legal treatment of PRC nationals and other foreign nationals. Among the policy goals they have, first, mainland migrants must live in Taiwan for six years in order to obtain citizenship. However, they must live for half a year during those years that they are in Taiwan in order for their time to be counted. However, the calculation of days is confusing as many marriage migrants are yet to acquire citizenship because they do not understand how days are counted. Yun, the chair of a political party that serves new residents, indicated:

I'm still not sure how the days are counted. They say that I must stay in Taiwan for at least half a year. Even if you are short for one day, that year does not count toward your wait for citizenship. For those who go back to the mainland frequently, their time is not counted. Many do not even attain their citizenship after more than 10 years of living here.⁷¹

Second, several women also shared their friends' experiences in not being able to complete the process of attaining Taiwanese citizenship because they were or had sought divorce.

Liu who volunteers at non-governmental organization that works for immigrants revealed:

My friend wants to break up with her husband, but she has not done it yet because she hasn't acquiesced Taiwanese citizenship yet. She doesn't care so much about the citizenship, but if she's not a Taiwanese citizen, she cannot stay here, meaning she will not be able to see her children.⁷²

⁷¹ Interview with author, Taipei, Taiwan, 27 May, 2015.

⁷² Interview with author, Taipei, Taiwan, 20 May, 2015.

Hong, working as an insurance agent⁷³ and also a staff member at a non-governmental organization, explained why I could not conduct my interview in the conference room by telling me the story of behind the meeting that occurred in the conference room:

The woman that is having a meeting in there right now is here for help because her husband tried to divorce her. He wants to divorce her based on her lack of fulfillment of wifely duties. But the reality is that he is cheating on her. If he successfully divorces her, she will be deported. This is the second time they went to court and her mother came from China to give her moral support. She is happy now because it looks like it went well at court today. She couldn't have had an easier time at court without our legal advice. We're experiences with cases like this because we see a lot of these—women who came to us because their husbands want to divorce them before they attain their citizenship. They'd be deported if divorces finalize.⁷⁴

Oftentimes, the legal battles also include children. As Hua asserted:

If you get caught working without documents, you will get deported. Even if you have children, you still will not be able to stay without citizenship.⁷⁵

Marriage migrants who have yet to receive citizenship are often confined in their marriage as they have no power for negotiation in their marriage. They do not even have the right to fight or argue with their spouses as their ability to obtain citizenship can be threatened, creating unfair dynamics and highly risky families where the marriage migrants and their children may be exposed to domestic violence. Throughout the process of “waiting” for citizenship, everything marriage migrants have in Taiwan is determined by what is provided through their marriage. As marriage migrants, mostly women, are bound by their marriage, these citizenship requirements also reinforce the unequal power dynamics in a marital relationship. Not only does the citizenship

⁷³ According to the migrant brides I interviewed, working as an insurance agent is common for PRC nationals with university degrees because of its low barrier to enter. Many educated migrant brides do not work in sectors that require low-skills, such as restaurants or beauty salons because they do not find those occupations fitting for their background. While their university degrees are not recognized, prohibiting them from working in sectors that require high skills, selling insurance is a compromise they make. It is also relatively easier to enter and establish a client base as they often sell insurance to other marriage migrants within their own existing social networks.

⁷⁴ Interview with author, Taipei, Taiwan, 18 May, 2015.

⁷⁵ Interview with author, Taipei, Taiwan, 19 May, 2015.

process objectify these marriage migrant women, but they also materialize their marriage by what is tangible and what is imagined.

While marriage migrants from all country of origins face the dilemma of choosing divorce and children in their process of attaining citizenship, this policy affects PRC nationals even more as it is extremely difficult for PRC nationals to travel to Taiwan. Currently, PRC nationals can travel to Taiwan under three conditions: (1) they travel with a tourist group and must stay with the tour the entire duration of stay; (2) they need to demonstrate their financial ability (income) in order to receive a tourist visa, allowing them to travel without a tourist group; and (3) they can enter Taiwan for business purposes where documents, such as an invitation, must be provided. Given that most PRC marriage migrants are women who have left China for Taiwan without any work experiences for several years, it is unlikely that they would have enough savings to apply for a tourist visa. It may also take time for women to find a job, secure a steady income before they could apply for a tourist visa to travel to Taiwan to see their children. Hence, in an event of divorce, marriage migrants face even more oppression that is interlocked with their gender, class, and nationality.

Third, marriage migrants from the mainland have to wait 10 years after they become Taiwanese citizens to hold public servant positions. In other words, not only do mainland migrants wait to be hired by the government, including both local and national, they also cannot run for public office until 10 years after they naturalize whereas migrants of other countries of origin can immediately upon citizenship attainment. The unequal post-naturalization restrictions also mean that migrants from the mainland have to wait even longer to serve in the government. Such restriction means that it takes about 18 years (for those who migrated to Taiwan before the policy to apply for citizenship changed from eight to six years) to represent in politics, leaving many mainland migrants unqualified to participate in the political process. While these

exceptional policies for Chinese immigrants reflect Taiwanese sovereignty, it also causes many more barriers for Chinese migrants as Yun stressed:

Even if I work in the government does not mean I would steal the confidential documents. It is not reasonable to make citizens from the mainland to wait... to work in government, not even in the department that has nothing to do with confidentiality. Look at me. I was already 30 years old when I moved here from the mainland. It took me eight years to get my citizenship. If I had to wait another 10 years to get a job in the government, I would be 48 years old already. How would I have the energy to study and prepare for public-service exams? People retire at that age. My identity as someone from the mainland has restricted me. It's like my citizenship allows me to work, but only in certain sectors.⁷⁶

Yun also confessed that the individuals in her political party that show interest in running for office are mostly not migrants from the mainland, but instead Taiwanese natives who care about the well-being of marriage migrants or the family members of the veterans who came were born and raised in Taiwan after 1949. She said:

There are many rights that we, as a group, are trying to obtain; however, new residents have or can step up to run for public office to represent our voices. Many members are non-new-residents in our political party. They are natives of Taiwan. They are mostly spouses or the in-laws of marriage migrants from the mainland.⁷⁷

Last, these women who work or volunteer at the NGOs or political parties are educated with university degrees, held professional jobs while in China, and became involved with their work at the non-governmental organizations because they realized that their degrees in China are not recognized in Taiwan. Yun, for example, also conducts research for this political party. Before moving to Taiwan, she was working at a Fortune 500 company in China. These highly educated women are required to hold low-skilled occupations because their degrees and certificates are not officially recognized. While many women, like Mei, the masseuse, and Hsia, the kitchen staff, are content with their jobs and financial independence, highly-educated women feel, to a certain degree, penalized. They express that they feel like they do not fit in with other

⁷⁶ Interview with author, Taipei, Taiwan, 29 May, 2015.

⁷⁷ Interview with author, Taipei, Taiwan, 29 May, 2015.

marriage migrants working in the restaurants or in the beauty salons. Several of them even choose not to work because they do not want to be in that an environment where physical labor is valued. Their lack of opportunities to the types of positions they used to hold while in China reflects discrimination and leads to a sense of betrayal. They think it is an “injustice” that their degrees are not recognized.

While working-class and low-income marriage migrants are the most vulnerable to the lack of citizenship in that they often need it to work legally and gain financial independence, they are also the ones that have internalized the discriminatory policies. In contrast to Yun’s responses about her discontent with the policies, several working class marriage migrants expressed that it is understandable that PRC nationals are treated differently from other migrants. Mei, said:

If you are negative about it, you could say that these policies are discriminatory. But if you look at it more positively, it is just a product of the political structure. Political structures exist for a reason.⁷⁸

Mei consistently expressed positive thinking throughout our conversations. When I applauded her for her positive energy, she simply replied:

I tend to have positive thinking. Many mainland migrant brides live difficult lives. When we get together, we often complain, but I try to have positive thinking. Although I sense Taiwanese people’s discriminatory looks, I try not to think too much about it.⁷⁹

Xing, another woman who has tried hard to adjust her accent expressed similar thoughts:

I don’t think it’s unfair that Taiwan accepts dual citizenship of countries besides China. A lot of immigrants in China also experience discrimination. You’re on someone else’s land, it’s normal that they have policies tailored toward individuals of specific countries.⁸⁰

As Taiwanese citizenship presents its multifaceted advantages and disadvantages, marriage migrants of different socioeconomic backgrounds cope with these unequal treatments differently. The more educated and wealthier women cope with the political challenges by being

⁷⁸ Interview with author, Taipei, Taiwan, 17 May, 2015.

⁷⁹ Interview with author, Taipei, Taiwan, 17 May, 2015.

⁸⁰ Interview with author, Taipei, Taiwan, 15 May, 2015.

involved with a variety of organizations that aim at serving new residents or marriage migrants. Those without the resources cope with the same political barriers by staying optimistic and feeling grateful for what the government has already offered them.

Undesired Citizenship

While many immigrants may have the desire or plan to naturalize, it is not seen as the only way to immerse oneself in a society. In reality, citizenship grants legal status but not real acceptance or membership. In addition to citizenship, how much one integrates dictates the extent to which she sees herself as a member of society. Citizenship attainment has its practical benefits, but for those who are wealthy may not necessarily need citizenship to survive. As the general public may still hold an “us vs. them” mentality, citizenship does not necessarily make marriage migrants identify themselves as part of the in-groups (Allport 1979). Instead, such strong group consciousness can be achieved through association membership and emotional attachment to a society via their newly established networks (Huddy 2001). That is, marriage migrants who are not from the working class may not be subjected to oppressive systems of classism as they have the options to choose between either becoming Taiwanese citizens or maintaining PRC nationality.

In comparison to those who indicate that benefit from the ability to work, the welfare, or the healthcare in Taiwan as citizens, marriage migrants who are not interested to convert to Taiwanese citizens are younger as they mostly met their husbands who traveled to China for business and wealthier, indicated by their ownership of factories and maintenance of homes in both Taiwan and China. Wen, in her early 30's, who met her husband while he traveled to China for work indicated:

I don't want to accept Taiwanese citizenship. My husband has plans to go back to China for in two years. It'll be easier if I were still a PRC national. Maybe citizenship means different things for other marriage migrants. It doesn't really make that much of a difference to me. Plus, it's not like I want to work here. I have plans to return to China one day. I don't intend to stay or die here. If anything, Taiwanese citizenship only creates trouble for me. If I had Taiwanese citizenship, I would have to give up my mainland citizenship. It'll make going back more difficult. I could still buy properties there now. I have been thinking about buying a house there because my family is there. I think it's more difficult for Taiwanese citizens to own properties there.⁸¹

Wen's response implicitly illustrates her socioeconomic class as citizenship to her is a very instrumental tool, dictated by her ability to own property in China, instead of her ability to be an official member of the Taiwanese society. Wen's wealth status also becomes apparent immediately after we were introduced. She showed up to my interview in her BMW. After finding out where she lives, I apologized for having her travel all this way to the interview site. She comforted me by telling me that she had plans to wait there until her husband gets off from work; he owns a business nearby. I became curious about her daily activities and asked her to describe them, she expressed that on most days she spends time with her friends, getting high tea or shopping.

Wen's lifestyle certainly does not resonate with most other migrant brides that I have met or read about in the newspapers. Nonetheless, Wen is not alone in shattering the myth of poor marital immigrants. Wen is certainly not alone in her reluctance to naturalize. Several other women also specified that they do not want to become Taiwanese citizens, but they are only going through the process because their husbands want them to. Very much like Wen, Huang spends her day jogging and following the stock market on the news. Huang, who is also in her early 30's and met her husband at work while he splits his time between Taiwan and China confessed:

My husband lives in China. I live here now because I am in the process of obtaining my citizenship. I don't really want to get it. It doesn't really make a

⁸¹ Interview with author, Taipei, Taiwan, 14 May, 2015.

difference to me. My husband wants to retire in Taiwan eventually and wants me to stay here with him. That's why I'm in Taiwan alone, fulfilling my time requirement for citizenship. Otherwise, I don't think it makes a difference to me.⁸²

Compared to those that I interviewed that are employed, Wen and Huang express no interest in becoming Taiwanese citizens. The ability to move and choose where grants them mobility and freedom whereas as others need citizenship and its accompanied resources to have the capacity to mobilize. Wen and Huang's access to economic capital also leads to their social and cultural capital as they have more choices in life (Van Hear 2014). In addition to wealthy marriage migrants who refuse to become Taiwanese citizens, several women who have families, including children, in China indicate that they have no plans to bring their families to Taiwan. Contrary to the common belief that opening the door for immigration results in mass entries because families could also come once immigrants acquire their citizenship, none of the migrants I interviewed expressed desire to bring their family over. While their rejection of naturalization illustrates the multi-dimensions of migration, shaped by resources, their cases further annihilate the stereotypes that Taiwanese citizens impose upon them. The resources that their Chinese citizenship guarantees them, in terms of property ownership in China, outweigh the advantages that their Taiwanese citizenship offers.

Conclusion

In this day and age where globalization affects many people's lives, individuals no longer confine themselves in one geographical space. Instead, people move for education, work, pleasure, and family. While much of the current immigration focuses on public opinion, such as anxiety, toward immigrants, very little is written about how migrants themselves view their own

⁸² Interview with author, Taipei, Taiwan, 29 May, 2015.

situation in the citizenship attainment process. As citizenship acquisition is assumed to be the main motivation of most immigrants, evidence suggests that cross-strait marriages actually involve complex dimensions as not all marriage migrants prefer the same things. My findings suggest that while some benefit from the rights accompanied by citizenship, some see costs in becoming citizens. This finding illustrates that although not acquiring citizenship does not allow immigrants to participate or be represented in a democracy. Such nondemocratic improvisation of citizenship offers strategic implications what it means to have rights as immigrants in this neoliberal era. As the world has transitioned into a global capitalist space, financial benefits and cost of naturalization becomes a primary agenda for immigrants. Moreover, one's socio-economic class plays a role in how she perceives the importance of citizenship attainment. The stories of marital immigrants from mainland illustrate the complexity in their everyday negotiations with belonging. Although I did not explicitly ask the participants about the income, I observed that their intersectional identities, particularly class, have an effect their vision of citizenship (Skeggs 1997).

While marriage migrants share the same experiences as “outsiders” in Taiwan, their aspirations for migration and naturalization are different. Citizenship signals varying meanings for marriage migrants. Some aspects of citizenship are palpable whereas some are imagined in the sense that marriage migrants partake in the classed process of migration. As a “global hypergamy” (Fan and Huang 1998; Lavelly 1991) is most apparent in the phenomenon of marriage migration, economic betterment may no longer be one's motivation to migrate. In that instance, marriage migrants' various identities, particularly their class, dictate their likelihood to naturalize, particularly if when the calculated cost of naturalization is higher than the benefits. Particularly, immigrants' agency in naturalizing and vitalizing citizenship depends upon their various identities and material agency. As Constable (2010) states, the desire, motivation, and process of citizenship attainment entail “a number of paradoxes, including those of

nationality/ethnicity, gender, geography, and economic class” (10). Although native citizens’ assumptions about marriage migrants’ desire to become Taiwanese citizens are not always reflected in reality, such assumption generates an (unnecessary) divide between those immigrants “taking something” from “us” versus citizens giving something to them.

My paper fills the gap in current literature by addressing how Chinese migrant brides conceptualize Taiwanese citizenship. My findings show that the desire for naturalization and citizenship is multi-dimensional. One interesting aspect of my interviews was how rarely citizenship was understood in terms of the rights to participate in the political process. As conventional wisdom associates citizenship with voting rights, none of the migrant women I interviewed indicated the inconvenience in political participation before naturalization. While why political participation as a benefit of citizenship was not raised is beyond the scope of this project, migrant women’s lack of discussion about their abilities to engage in politics need to be explored in future research. Nonetheless, this finding shows that PRC migrant women’s different interpretation of citizenship, excluding voting rights, is indicative of the need to move away from the western eyes in examining the lived migrant experiences (Mohanty 1988). It also illustrates that in addition to differentiated citizenship (Young 1990), *diva* citizenship (Berlant 1997), and insurgent citizenship (Isin 2002), the contestation for non-citizen citizenship calls for more attention. Particularly, as my findings revoke the democratic iterations of citizenship, this chapter decenters the discourse on citizenship from democratic politics and recenter it on how immigrants’ rights may be obtained and practiced even when immigrants reject citizenship. Although Young (1989; 1990) advocates emphasis on the marginalized groups’ differential power and access to the democratic framework, my findings reinvoke politicized intervention of citizenship via the lived experiences and multiple identities of marriage migrants in Taiwan, particularly how intersectionality plays a role in their negotiation of informal and perhaps undocumented belonging.

Also, as my paper evaluates the experiences of Chinese migrant brides, future research is needed to explore how male marriage migrants from the mainland conceptualize citizenship. Although there are significantly less PRC male marriage migrants, the experiences of migrant husbands may differ in two ways. First, the Taiwanese women who marry PRC nationals are likely to follow their spouses, migrating to and residing in China. Therefore, it is crucial to understand whether and the extent to which male marriage migrants view Taiwanese citizenship as desirable, particularly if married couples in these instances establish their lives in China instead. Second, even if PRC migrant husbands settle in Taiwan, they are less likely to participate in organizations that support immigrants because many of these programs offer “feminine” support, through which they may run baking and sewing workshops, where migrant husbands do not necessarily fit in. Future research is also needed in exploring how marriage migrants of other nationalities conceptualize citizenship when compared with marriage migrants from China, particularly when the challenges they face differ.

Lastly, future research is needed to address how the knowledge of one’s citizen status makes a difference for how she is treated. In other words, do native Taiwanese citizens view mainland marriage migrants differently if they knew they were reluctant to naturalize? Would their loyalty be questioned? As only 20.5% of Chinese spouses report that they feel the Taiwanese treat them very well (Yeh 2010) and as the social climate and societal attitudes distinguish Chinese women based on the assumption that they are there for resources, betterment, and citizenship, the extent to which the hostile division might still be built, with or without citizenship, needs to be explored.

Chapter 6

Concluding Remarks

*I am tired. Sometimes I want to give up.
 My exhausted body can no longer carry my heavy heart.
 I have cried a river.
 Yet my still cannot wash away my sorrow of being away from home.*

*My days are a puzzle.
 Piece by piece I construct, connect, and arrange
 Until it is done
 With perseverance my pain will be over
 Blood and tears are what give me hope.*

—Edcel Benosa (2006) of the Philippines

Since it has become increasingly common for people to move across the world for work, education, pleasure, family, safety, and numerous other reasons, international migration is no longer a temporary occurrence. Instead, it has become a phenomenon that is bound to exist for a while. The growing rates of immigration not only determine the experiences of those who migrate, but it also influences how native citizens view diversity, multiculturalism, as well as national identity. When people enter a country, they often see themselves and are seen by others as outsiders. However, whether this “outsider” status could one day become a status of “insider” or “us” often depends on how native citizens choose to view them. As immigrants’ experiences change when they move, their receiving countries also change in their own conceptualization of what a nation should look like. As I argue that acceptance of immigrants is rooted in the exposure to stories about and interactions with immigrants, in this research, I first examine the role of the media in framing the economic and cultural consequences of immigration in Hong Kong, Taiwan, the U.K., and the U.S. Drawing from findings from my media analysis, I then investigate the ways media framing influences native citizens’ opinions regarding male and female immigrants.

Lastly, I also investigate how Chinese immigrants in Taiwan describe their migrant experiences and their conceptualization of Taiwanese citizenship. The cross-national media content analysis, survey experiments, and feminist in-depth interviews allow me to answer the questions I set out to ask. In this final chapter of *Gendering Immigration*, I summarize the significant contributions that my research makes to the field of gender and politics. While my research offers important implications to societies experiencing increasing immigration, limitations also exist in my research. Consequently, I also present several directions in which this research could be expanded.

Cross-National Analysis of the Media Framings of Immigration

The media discourse on immigration reflects relationships of power (Quinsaat 2014) And the local elite's ideas of immigration (van Dijk 1987). For example, immigrants are more likely to appear in the news than in advertisements (Hargreaves 1995). When immigrants appear in the news, they are also unlikely to appear as regular citizens but instead as outsiders (Morley 2000). Much literature also shows that immigration issues and immigrant identities are portrayed in a certain way in the media (Bradimore and Bauder 2011; Charteris-Black 2006; Cisnero 2008; Mehan 1997; Quinsaat 2014; Triandafyllidou 1999.) While many extant findings remain true in my analysis of the media framings of immigration, my approach looks at the multi-dimensions of media framings of immigration in different ways. Firstly, I also do not emphasize one situational portrayal of immigrants based on skill-level, legitimacy, religion, or race and ethnicity (Hainmueller and Hiscox 2010). Instead, I incorporate gender in the analysis and investigate the ways in which gender is processed when interacting with other aspects of immigration. This focus on gender allows for understanding the ways the media are gendered in their discussions of varying immigration issues and different immigrant identities. Secondly, my analysis has shifted

away from examining only the binary portrayals of immigrants as good or bad, positive or negative, supportive or opposing immigration, allowing for a more well-rounded understanding of the media's constructions of immigration. Thirdly, I do not only focus on the media's construction of one specific issue of immigration. Instead, I look at various ways the media frame immigration as issues. I compare how these issues, such as the economy, national identity, etc., are framed in different cases. This again enables a deeper understanding of how the media, overall, frame immigration.

In Chapter 2 and 3, I primarily examine how the media frame the economic and cultural impacts of immigration in Hong Kong, Taiwan, the U.K., and the U.S. In addition to analyzing the major issues of immigration identified by the media and the position that the media take on immigration, I also look at the gender identities of immigration. I first find that economic threat, economic contribution, cultural threat, and cultural integration are the four key frames used by the media when framing immigration. These frames show that the media do not always negatively portray immigrants, which contradicts conventional wisdom. Much extant literature shows that the media stereotypically portray immigrants as job stealers or job takers; however, my analysis demonstrates that many news articles also portray immigrants as contributors of the economy. Not only could they also be hard-working workers, but they could also be job creators. While my findings show that immigrants could be positively discussed in the media, it is worthy to note that immigrants are still portrayed as stereotypical workers who would do anything to survive harsh working conditions in order to make a living in their host countries. Additionally, even when immigrants are identified as job creators, their loyalty is also questioned. Oftentimes, wealthy immigrants could be portrayed as making investments for the purpose of citizenship. These stereotypical ways of framing immigration as an economic issue, although positive, still demonstrates the lack of diversity in viewing and imagining what migrant labor could look like.

My results also show that the media do not only discuss the negative impacts of immigrants on the national identity and culture. Similar to the economic framings, some cultural framings of the media also paint immigrants with a positive image. While some news articles discuss the changes in demographics with the increasing immigration and its impact on transforming the face of the community, other news articles also focus on immigrants' efforts to be a part of the community. Many of the latter discussions are connected with immigrants' participation in community events and immigrants' determination to learn the national language. Nonetheless, much like the economic framings of immigration, the cultural framings of immigration also remains in the stereotypical portrayals of immigrants' abilities to integrate. Immigrants who lack the abilities or who struggle with integrating in their families and communities are seldom pictured in the media. It is important to note that only immigrants who are able to integrate and act as members of the community are worthy of positive portrayals. In other words, only those who try their best and succeed at assimilation are the ones that deserve positive media attention.

My analysis also demonstrates that the media are gendered in a way that resembles the traditional gender roles that are assigned to individuals. For instance, the media seldom mark gender when employing economic frames as men are the default sex in the labor force. Such low proportions of the media reports on the sex of immigrants suggests that immigrants, as a group of people, are rarely the center of the debate (Campani 2001; Navarro 2010) but instead are objects of discourse (Giorgi 2012). However, when the media do mention the sex of immigrants, in cases where there is not a significant gender gap in immigration, men are more likely to be identified in the economic threat frame. In cases where there are significantly more female immigrants than male immigrants, the media specify the sex of migrant women more when framing immigration as a form of economic contribution. In cases where the media do not specify the sex of immigrants but reveal occupations that are likely to offer a clue of immigrants' gender identities,

the media tend to incorporate occupations with migrant men more when discussing the negative impact of immigration in the U.K. and the U.S. whereas women are more likely to be highlighted when discussing the positive impact of immigration in Hong Kong and Taiwan. My findings suggest that how the media gender immigration is context-specific.

Moreover, the outcomes on the cultural framings of the media also show that the media are gendered in that they identify female immigrants at a higher rate than they do male immigrants in the cultural frames. The media in Hong Kong and Taiwan are more likely to identify when cultural frames are employed. This outcome can be explained by the normalized gender expectations in that women represent motherhood and thus carry the responsibility of biological reproduction. This gendered responsibility also leads to the reproduction of national identity and culture. Women are expected to engage in such role in order to maintain a homogeneous identity and harmonious society. Hence, as immigrants are often faced with the questions about their presence transforming the demographics of a nation and changing existing traditions, customs, and values, female immigrants' cultural impacts are particularly highlighted. It is crucial to note that when female immigrants are discussed in the cultural integration frame, they are often praised for their endeavor in overcoming the language barriers. As language is one of the biggest obstacles in making connections among human beings, it functions as a mechanism to differentiate immigrants and native citizens. Thus, one's ability to learn national language and communicate is also considered the most important tool to gain upon arrival (May 2001). The emphasis on migrant women's integration in learning the national language of their host countries also implies that only one language should be tolerated and used. Even when immigrants speak their native language at home, it should only be temporary. Consequently, women who are able to "abandon" their native language and ensure that their children only speak the national language are encouraged by the media.

Through the analysis of the implicit existence of gender in the media discourse, this research shows how gender may be visible (or invisible) alongside of the news coverage of immigrants' roles in the economy and in national identity and culture. Although my research focuses on the economic and cultural framings of immigration, it is not my intention to reduce the complexity of media discourse surrounding immigration. As I discover that the media are also likely to frame immigration as issues of crime, political party politics, and policies, my next step would be to examine how these other frames are also gendered and compared across all frames. Moreover, my research also raises implications on what serves as a normalization of judgement of immigrants, especially when interacting with axes of categories other than gender. While male immigrants are assumed to create economic threat, how do immigrants of other race and ethnicity and skill level portrayed by the media? For instance, many of the executives of the high technology industry in the Silicon Valley are foreign-born, how are their immigrant statuses highlighted in the media? Many of these white-collar workers who hold powerful positions in these companies are also men, how are their immigrant statuses discussed in the media? The interactions of gender, race and ethnicity, skill level, country of origin and more are also areas to explore in the future when analyzing the media framings of immigration as economic, cultural, criminal, and policy issues.

The Media Effect on Public Opinion

Using survey experiments, this research also analyzes whether and the degree to which the media framing of immigration affects social attitudes toward male and female immigrants. Drawn from findings from my cross-national content analysis, I specifically analyze the ways in which the media's economic and cultural framings of immigration affect native citizens' perceptions of male and female immigrants. My experimental outcomes in Hong Kong, Taiwan,

the U.K., and the U.S. show that country variation exists. However, in most scenarios, native citizens are more likely to reject male immigrants when exposed to the economic impact of immigration and more likely to reject female immigrants when exposed to the cultural impact of immigration.

As whether the media shape public opinion remains an argument in existing literature, my research offers evidence for the causal connections between the media and public opinion. Although my sample of participants are recruited via the Internet, thus preventing me from making an inference about the general population, my results show that the media play a role in shaping people's attitudes. The different messages participants receive matter for how likely they are to accept or reject immigrants. Specifically, my research shows that exposure to gendered media messages, regardless of explicit or implicit, leads to gendered opinion regarding migrant men and women. To my knowledge, my research on the media effect on social attitudes toward immigrants is the first cross-national and cross-regional study. This unique feature allows for understanding how native citizens, who could be exposed to numerous media messages (and yet overwhelmingly stereotypical as demonstrated in Chapters 1 and 2), may respond to the growing immigration in their countries.

My survey experiments incorporate gender treatments, allowing me to understand the gender effect on public opinion. However, what is lacking in my research is the incorporation of other important social identities that may play a role in influencing social attitudes toward immigrants. For example, in the case of the U.S., how Mexican and Chinese immigrants are portrayed in the media may shape public opinion toward Mexican and Chinese immigrants. Specifically, stereotypes about Latino immigrants remain on their border-crossing "illegally" whereas Chinese immigrants may be perceived otherwise. The U.S. Republican presidential candidate, Donald Trump's, statement, "[Mexicans] are taking our jobs. They're taking our

manufacturing jobs. They're taking our money. They're killing us⁸³” illustrates a common assumption about Mexican immigrants. On the other hand, Chinese immigrants, particularly those that enter the U.S. through the EB-5 program, are seen as investors and job creators. Similarly, in the U.K., Muslim immigrants are portrayed different from migrant workers from the Eastern European countries. In Hong Kong, non-white immigrants, particularly those from India and Pakistan, suffer from high unemployment rates and are most likely given opportunities of low-wage and low-skilled jobs. In Taiwan, marriage migrants from Vietnam and mainland China are also treated differently. These examples demonstrate that race, ethnicity, and country of origin may interact with salient issues of immigration and affect how immigrants in different groups are accepted. Thus, what lies in my future research in the causal connections between the media and public opinion is further research on the role of race, particularly when interacted with gender, in the media effect on social attitudes toward immigrants

Marriage Migrants' Conceptualization of Citizenship

How nations and native citizens view immigration is the core of my analyses of the media framings of immigration and the media effect on social attitudes toward immigrants. While Chapters 2, 3, and 4 examine the media framings of immigration and effect on social attitudes regarding immigrants, Chapter 5 positions immigrants as subjects of the study. In my in-depth interviews with Chinese marriage migrants in Taiwan, I allow them to be the agents in defining their own experiences, situations, and concerns. Our interviews show that while some appreciate the benefits and privileges of being citizens, some also see being Taiwanese citizens as more costly. As a result, not all marriage migrants desire to take active action to acquire Taiwanese

⁸³Poliiti, D. “Donald Trmp in Phoenix : Mexicans are ‘Taking our Jobs’ and ‘Killing Us’ Retrieved from ,http://www.slate.com/blogs/the_slated/2015/07/12/donald_trump_in_phoenix_mexicans_are_taking_our_jobs_and_killing_us.html on May 2, 2016.

citizenship. The decision-making is often determined by various individual characteristics. For instance, gender matters for how marriage migrants may negotiate citizenship. Socio-economic class also plays a role in the likelihood marriage migrants are to become Taiwanese citizens. Wealthy migrant brides may have less to worry about if they do not acquire Taiwanese citizenship. My findings illustrate that citizenship offers strategic implications for naturalization and that careful calculations are made prior to the acquisition of citizenship.

While the results depart from the conventional wisdom on immigrants' desire to naturalize, lacking in my research is the experiences and consequences of women who refuse to naturalize. For example, as citizenship has multiple meanings, it comes with the legal right to participate in the political process. Immigrants, through naturalization, gain the right to vote, allowing their voices to be expressed via a legitimate venue. Marriage migrants' rejection to naturalize also means they will never enact citizenship rights, begging the question of how they may be treated politically. Specifically, future research is necessary to explore the implications of wealthy migrant women's lack of desire for Taiwanese citizenship. Without citizen rights, how do wealthy women enact their social rights as suggested by Orloff (1993)? As Orloff (1993) states that social provisions are gendered, how might gender intersect with socio-economic class and citizenship status in the social provisions of marriage migrants in Taiwan?

Moreover, citizenship does not have a singular meaning or singular level, the extent to which marriage migrants in Taiwan, particularly those who refuse to naturalize enact their citizenship at various levels needs to be further explored. In other words, as citizenship "occupies different layers—local, ethnic, national, state, cross- or trans-state and superstrate—and is affected and often at least partly constructed by the relationships and positioning of each layer in a specific historical context (Fujiwara 2008), I propose to examine what these different levels of citizenship mean for marriage migrants' inclusion and exclusion in Taiwan. Moreover, marriage

migrants are not only exclusive to Taiwanese society. I expect to also examine how multilayered citizenship affects marriage migrants' experiences in Hong Kong in the future.

Conclusion

As the number of people participate in cross-national movement continues to increase in the 21st Century, it is particularly crucial to understand the desire and abilities to respond to immigration. My research on the media framings of immigration, media effect on public opinion regarding immigrants, and marriage migrants' conceptualization of citizenship provides important implications to the field. My cross-national analysis fills the gap that explains variance in the social ambiance regarding immigration. It helps to understand how states may place and prioritize immigration on their national agenda, via their most-circulated print media and via their citizens' attitudes toward immigrants. Moreover it allows for comprehending what type of manipulation works for shaping native citizens' attitudes toward immigrants. As my research demonstrates that gender in the media plays a role in the ways native citizens view male and female immigrants, it raises questions about how the media's other framing of immigration may affect native citizens' acceptance of certain groups of immigrants. My incorporation of the views of marriage migrants in Taiwan also moves the immigration debates beyond the terrain of immigration politics in the media and public opinion. Instead, it allows for understanding citizenship as a relationship where national citizenship is "conditional, partial, particularistic, and generates inequality" (Stasiulis and Bakan 2003, 165). How citizenship may be negotiated depends on a number of institutional, as well as individual characteristics. While my findings show that citizenship is navigated through personal leverage of the system, they also call for advocacy on better and multi-dimensional representation of the media discourse. As the media are found to shape public opinion, more nuanced framings of issues of immigration and identities of immigrants may also help create a

more inclusive understanding and higher acceptance of immigrants. While marriage migrants' negotiation strategy varies, lifting the constraints and stereotypes of the media framings of immigration may be the first step to creating meaningful development of rights and justice for immigrants.

References

- Abraham, L. and Appiah, O., 2006. Framing News Stories: The Role of Visual Imagery in Priming Racial Stereotypes. *The Howard Journal of Communications*, 17(3), pp.183-203.
- Agamben, G., 1998. *Homo Sacer: Sovereign Power and Bare Life*. Stanford University Press.
- Alicea, M. 1997. "A Chambered Nautilus" The Contradictory Nature of Puerto Rican Women's Role in the Social Construction of a Transnational Community. *Gender and Society*, 11(5), 597-626.
- Allan, G. M., and Szafran, O. 2005. Health of Chinese Illegal Immigrants who Arrived by Boat on the West Coast of Canada in 1999. *Journal of Immigrant and Minority Health*, 7(4), 233-238.
- Allport, G. W. 1979. *The Nature of Prejudice*. Basic books.
- Altman, D. 2007. Shattering Stereotypes about Immigrant Workers. *New York Times*, June, 3.
- Anderson, K. J. 1991. Vancouver's Chinatown: Racial discourse in Canada, 1875-1980. McGill-Queen's Press-MQUP.
- Ansari, H. 2004. *The Infidel within: Muslims in Britain since 1800*. C. Hurst and Co. Publishers.
- Arendt, H. 1951. *The Burden of Our time*. London; printed in USA.
- Arzheimer, K. 2009. Contextual Factors and the Extreme Right Vote in Western Europe, 1980–2002. *American Journal of Political Science*, 53(2), 259-275.
- Bail, C. A. 2008. The Configuration of Symbolic Boundaries against Immigrants in Europe. *American sociological review*, 73(1), 37-59.
- Bailey, A., and Boyle, P. 2004. Untying and Retying Family Migration in the New Europe. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 30(2), 229-241.
- Baker, P., and McEnery, T. 2005. A Corpus-Based Approach to Discourses of Refugees and Asylum Seekers in UN and Newspaper texts. *Journal of Language and Politics*, 4(2), 197-226.
- Baron, A. S., Schmader, T., Cvencek, D., and Meltzoff, A. N. 2014. The Gendered Self-Concept: How Implicit Gender Stereotypes and Attitudes Shape Self-Definition. *Gender and Development*, 109-132.
- Barrett, D. 2014. 850 Chinese Millionaires and Russian Oligarchs Have 'Brought' British Visa. *The Telegraph* February 25.
- Barrett, D. 2014. Immigrants Cost Britain £3,000 a Year Each, Says Report. *The Daily Telegraph*. March 12.
- Bates, L. 2016. David Cameron will Support Muslim Women—but only when it suits his scaremongering narrative. *The Guardian*, April 18.
- Batley, M. Rasmussen Poll: Americans Believe Illegals are Taking Jobs. *Newsmax*, August 21. Retrieved <http://www.newsmax.com/Newsfront/illegal-immigration-rasmussen-poll/2015/08/14/id/670157/> August 21, 2015.
- Bauder, H. 2008. Foreign Farm Workers in Ontario (Canada): Exclusionary Discourse in the Newsprint Media. *The Journal of Peasant Studies*, 35(1), 100-118.
- Bauer, H. M., Rodriguez, M. A., Quiroga, S. S., and Flores-Ortiz, Y. G. 2000. Barriers to Health Care for Abused Latina and Asian Immigrant Women. *Journal of Health Care for the Poor and Underserved*, 11(1), 33-44.
- Bauer, T. K., and Kunze, A. 2004. The Demand for High-Skilled Workers and Immigration Policy.
- Becker, A.S., 1971. *Isreal and the Palestinian Occupied Territories: Military-Political Issues in the Debate* 882 (ISA). Rand Corporation.
- Beckwith, K. 2005. A Common Language of Gender? *Politics & Gender*, 1(01), 128-137.

- Bélanger, D., Lee, H. and Wang, H. 2010. Ethnic diversity and statistics in East Asia: 'foreign brides' surveys in Taiwan and South Korea. *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 33(6): 1108-1130.
- Bell, S. 2009. Cargo Ship Passenger Wanted in Sri Lanka for Terrorism: Subject of Interpol Notice Wanted for Unspecified Offence among 76 migrants Detained after Arriving off BC coast Saturday. *Vancouver Sun*, October 22.
- Berger, M., Galonska, C., and Koopmans, R. 2002. Not a Zero-Sum Game: Ethnic Communities and Political Integration of Migrants in Berlin. In Turin: Paper presented at the ECPR Joint Sessions of Workshops: Political Participation of Immigrants and their Descendants in Post-War Western Europe, 22-27.
- Berlant, L.G. 1997. *The Queen of America Goes to Washington City: Essays on Sex and Citizenship*. Duke University Press.
- Bhabha, J., Klug, F., and Shutter, S. 1985. Worlds Apart: Women under Immigration and Nationality Law.
- Bhatt, A. n.d. Transnational Migration, American citizens and the Indian family.
- Blinder, S. 2015. Imagined Immigration: The Impact of Different Meanings of Immigrants in Public Opinion and Policy Debates in Britain. *Political Studies* 63(1): 88-100.
- Bloemraad, I., Korteweg, A., and Yurdakul, G. 2008. Citizenship and Immigration: Multiculturalism, Assimilation, and Challenges to the Nation-State. *Sociology*, 34(1), 153.
- Blumer, H. 1958. Race Prejudice as a Sense of Group Position. *Pacific Sociological Review*, 3-7.
- Bobo, L. D. 1999. Prejudice as Group Position: Microfoundations of a Sociological Approach to Racism and Race Relations. *Journal of Social Issues*, 55(3), 445-472.
- Boomgaarden, H. G., and Vliegenthart, R. 2007. Explaining the Rise of Anti-Immigrant Parties: The Role of News Media Content. *Electoral Studies*, 26(2), 404-417.
- Borjas, G. J. 1989. Immigrant and Emigrant Earnings: A Longitudinal Study. *Economic Inquiry*, 27(1), 21-37.
- Borjas, G. J. 1999. The Economic Analysis of Immigration. *Handbook of Labor Economics*, 3, 1697-1760.
- Borjas, G. J. 2003. The Labor Demand Curve is Downward Sloping: Reexamining the Impact of Immigration on the Labor Market. National Bureau of Economic Research.
- Borjas, G. J., Freeman, R. B., Katz, L. F., DiNardo, J., and Abowd, J. M. 1997. How Much do Immigration and Trade Affect Labor Market Outcomes? Brookings Papers on Economic Activity, 1-90.
- Bosniak, L. 2007. Being here: Ethical Territoriality and the Rights of Immigrants. *Theoretical Inquiries in Law*, 8(2), 389-410.
- Bourdieu, P. 1987. What Makes a Social Class? On the Theoretical and Practical Existence of Groups. *Berkeley Journal of sociology*, 32, 1-17.
- Boyd, M. and Greico, E. 2003. Women and Migration: Incorporating Gender in International Migration Theory. Migration Policy Institute. Retrieved March 24, 2015 from <http://www.migrationpolicy.org/article/women-and-migration-incorporating-gender-international-migration-theory>
- Boyd, M. 1986. Immigrant Women in Canada.
- Brader, T., Valentino, N. A., and Suhay, E. 2008. What Triggers Public Opposition to Immigration? Anxiety, Group Cues, and Immigration Threat. *American Journal of Political Science*, 52(4), 959-978.
- Bradimore, A., and Bauder, H. 2012. Mystery Ships and Risky Boat People: Tamil Refugee Migration in the Newsprint media. *Canadian Journal of Communication*, 36(4).

- Bredström, A. 2003. Gendered Racism and the Production of Cultural Difference: Media Representations and Identity Work among "Immigrant Youth in Contemporary Sweden. *Nora: Nordic Journal of Women's Studies*, 11(2), 78-88.
- Brown, E 2015. How a U.S. Visa-for-Cash Plan Funds Luxury Apartment Buildings. *The Wall Street Journal* September 21.
- Brubaker, W. R. 1989. Membership Without Citizenship: The Economic and Social Rights of Noncitizens. *Immigration and the Politics of Citizenship in Europe and North America*, 145-162.
- Buckley, C. and Wong, A. 2015. China Limits Neighbors' Visits to Hong Kong. *The New York Times*. April 14.
- Buhrmester, M., Kwang, T., and Gosling, S. D. 2011. Amazon's Mechanical Turk a New Source of Inexpensive, yet High-quality, Data? *Perspectives on Psychological Science*, 6(1), 3-5.
- Bullock, K. H., and Jafri, G. J. 2000. Media (mis)representations: Muslim Women in the Canadian Nation. *Canadian Woman Studies*, 20(2).
- Burnard, P. 1991. A Method of Analysing Interview Transcripts in Qualitative research. *Nurse Education Today*, 11(6), 461-466.
- Burns, P., and Gimpel, J. G. 2000. Economic Insecurity, Prejudicial Stereotypes, and Public Opinion on Immigration Policy. *Political Science Quarterly*, 115 (2), 201-225.
- Burns, S., L. Eberhardt, and J. Morella 2013. What is the Difference between a Hockey Mom and a Pit Bull? Presentations of Palin and Gender Stereotypes in the 2008 Presidential Election. *Political Research Quarterly* 66(3): 687-701
- Burstein, P. 2003. The Impact of Public Opinion on Public Policy: A Review and an Agenda. *Political Research Quarterly*, 56(1), 29-40.
- Byerly, C. M., and Ross, K. 2008. *Women and Media: A Critical Introduction*. John Wiley and Sons.
- Byng, M. D. 2010. Symbolically Muslim: Media, Hijab, and the West. *Critical Sociology*, 36(1), 109-129.
- Campani, G. 2001. "Migrants and Media: the Italian Case". In *Media and Migration: Constructions of Mobility and Difference*, Edited by: King, R. and Wood, N. 38-52. London: Routledge.
- Cantle, T. 2001. *Community Cohesion: A Report of the Independent Review Team*.
- Card, D., and Raphael, S. 2013. *Immigration, Poverty, and Socioeconomic Inequality*. Russell Sage Foundation.
- Carpignano, P. 1999. The Shape of the Sphere: The Public Sphere and the Materiality of Communication. *Constellations*, 6(2), 177-189.
- Castles, S., and Miller, M. J. 2009. Migration in the Asia-Pacific Region. Migration Information Source.
- Cebula, R. J., and Vedder, R. K. 1973. A Note on Migration, Economic Opportunity, and the Quality of life. *Journal of Regional Science*, 13(2), 205-211.
- Ceobanu, A. M., and Escandell, X. 2008. East is West? National Feelings and Anti-immigrant Sentiment in Europe. *Social Science Research*, 37(4), 1147-1170.
- Ceobanu, A. M., and Escandell, X. 2010. Comparative Analyses of Public Attitudes toward Immigrants and Immigration using Multinational Survey Data: A Review of Theories and Research. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 36, 309-328.
- Chan, W. 2013. *News Media Representations of Immigrants in the Canadian Criminal Justice System*. Metropolis British Columbia.
- Chandler, C. R., and Tsai, Y. 2001. Social Factors Influencing Immigration Attitudes: An Analysis of Data from the General Social Survey. *The Social Science Journal*, 38 (2), 177-188.

- Chao, A. 2004. The Modern State, Citizenship, and the Intimate Life: a Case Study of Taiwan's Glorious Citizens and their Mainland Wives. *Taiwan She Hui Xue*, (8), 1.
- Chao, C. M. 2003. Will Economic Integration between Mainland China and Taiwan Lead to a Congenial Political Culture?. *Asian Survey*, 43(2), 280-304.
- Charmaz, K. 2000. Constructivist and Objectivist Grounded Theory. *Handbook of Qualitative Research*, 2, 509-535.
- Charmaz, K. 2003. Grounded Theory. *Qualitative Psychology: A Practical Guide to Research Methods*, 81-110.
- Charteris-Black, J. 2006. Britain as a Container: Immigration Metaphors in the 2005 Election Campaign. *Discourse and Society*, 17(5), 563-581.
- Chavez, L. R. 2001. *Covering Immigration: Popular Images and the Politics of the Nation*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Chilton, P. 1987. Critical Discourse Moments and Critical Discourse analysis: Towards a Methodology. Paper presented at the First Annual Conference on Discourse, Peace, Security and International Society, Ballyvaughn, Ireland.
- Chiswick, B. R. 2000. Are Immigrants Positively Self-Selected? An Economic Analysis 131: 55-82. IZA Discussion Paper.
- Chrisafis, Angelique. 2011. *The Guardian*, September 19.
- Çinar, A. 2008. Subversion and Subjugation in the Public Sphere: Secularism and the Islamic Headscarf. *Signs*, 33(4), 891-913.
- Cisneros, J. D. (2008). Contaminated Communities: The Metaphor of “Immigrant as Pollutant” in Media Representations of Immigration. *Rhetoric and Public Affairs*, 11 (4), 569–601.
- Citrin J, Sides J. 2008. Immigration and the Imagined Community in Europe and the United States. *Political Studies*, 56:33–56
- Citrin, J., Lerman, A., Murakami, M., and Pearson, K. 2007. Testing Huntington: Is Hispanic Immigration a Threat to American identity? *Perspectives on Politics*, 5 (01), 31–48.
- Clarkson, B. 2000. 600 is too Many: How the Press Used Four Boatloads of Chinese Migrants to Create an Immigration Crisis. *Ryerson Review of Journalism*.
- Coenders M, Scheepers P. 2003. The Effect of Education on Nationalism and Ethnic Exclusionism: an International Comparison. *Political Psychology* 24(2):313–43
- Cohen, R. 1987. *The New Helots: Migrants in the International Division of Labour*.
- Cohen, S. 2002. *Folk Devils and Moral Panics: The Creation of the Mods and Rockers*. Psychology Press.
- Coll, K. 2010. *Remaking Citizenship: Latina Immigrants and the New American Politics*. Stanford University Press.
- Collier, D., and Levitsky, S. 1997. Democracy with Adjectives. *World Politics*, 49 (3), 430–451.
- Collins, P. H. 2001. Like One of the Family: Race, Ethnicity, and the Paradox of US National Identity. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 24(1), 3-28.
- Constable, N. (Ed.). 2010. *Cross-border Marriages: Gender and Mobility in Transnational Asia*. University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Corbin, J. M., and Strauss, A. 1990. Grounded Theory Research: Procedures, Canons, and Evaluative Criteria. *Qualitative Sociology*, 13(1), 3-21.
- Cornelius, W. A., and Rosenblum, M. R. 2005. Immigration and Politics. *Annual Review of Political Science*, 8, 99–119.
- Crenshaw, K. 1991. Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, Identity Politics, and Violence against Women of Color. *Stanford Law Review*, 1241-1299.
- Cuadraz, G. H., and Uttal, L. 1999. Intersectionality and in-depth Interviews: Methodological Strategies for Analyzing Race, Class, and Gender. *Race, Gender and Class*, 156-186.

- Cvejic, B., Lorey, I., Puar, J., and Vujanovic, A. 2012. Precarity Talk. *TDR: The Drama Review*, 56(4), T216.
- Daddario, G., and Wigley, B. J. 2007. Gender Marking and Racial Stereotyping at the 2004 Athens Games. *Journal of Sports Media*, 2(1), 29-51.
- Danso, R., and McDonald, D. A. 2001. Writing Xenophobia: Immigration and the Print Media in Post-Apartheid South Africa. *Africa Today*, 48 (3), 115–137.
- Davin, D. 2005. Marriage Migration in China The Enlargement of Marriage Markets in the Era of Market Reforms. *Indian Journal of Gender Studies*, 12(2-3), 173-188.
- Davin, D. 2007. Marriage Migration in China and East Asia. *Journal of Contemporary China*, 16(50), 83-95.
- Dear, M., Bobo, L. D., Oliver, M. L., Johnson, J. H., and Valenzuela, A. 2003. Prismatic Metropolis: Inequality in Los Angeles. Russel Sage Foundation.
- De Figueredo RJP Jr, Elkins Z. 2003. Are Patriots Bigots? An Inquiry into the Vices of In-Group Pride. *American Journal of Political Science* 47:171–88
- Denzin, N. K., and Lincoln, Y. S. (1994). Handbook of qualitative research. Sage Publications, Inc.
- Diaz, M. 2016 “The Waves Created by Electing a Muslim Mayo for London.” May 10. Retrieved http://www.swissinfo.ch/eng/opinion_the-waves-created-by-electing-a-muslim-mayor-for-london/42145378 on May 18, 2016.
- Dickson, Bruce. 2014. Hong Kong’s “Umbrella Revolution” Reflects Broader Issues in China. Retrieved <http://gwtoday.gwu.edu/hong-kong%E2%80%99s-%E2%80%98umbrella-revolution%E2%80%99-reflects-broader-issues-china> on August 5, 2015.
- Devos, T., and Ma, D. S. 2008. Is Kate Winslet more American than Lucy Liu? The Impact of Construal Processes on the Implicit Ascription of a National Identity. *British Journal of Social Psychology*, 47(2), 191-215.
- Druckman, J. N., Green, D. P., Kuklinski, J. H., and Lupia, A. (Eds.). 2011. Cambridge Handbook of Experimental Political Science. Cambridge University Press.
- Dunning, T. 2012. Natural Experiments in the Social Sciences: a Design-based Approach. Cambridge University Press.
- Dustmann, C., and Preston, I. P. 2007. Racial and Economic Factors in Attitudes to Immigration. *The BE Journal of Economic Analysis and Policy*, 7(1).
- Reuters. 2011. Dutch to Ban Full-Face Veils.” *The New York Times*, September 17.
- Eckenwiler, L. 2011. Women on the Move: Long-term Care, Migrant Women, and Global Justice. *International Journal of Feminist Approaches to Bioethics*, 4(2), 1-31.
- Eckenwiler, L. A. 2009. Care Worker Migration and Transnational Justice. *Public Health Ethics*, 2 (2), 171–183.
- Ehrenfreund, Max. 2014. Your Complete Guide to Obama’s Immigration Executive Action. *The Washington Post*, November 19.
- Ehrenreich, B., and Hochschild, A. R. (Eds.). 2003. *Global Woman: Nannies, Maids, and Sex Workers in the New Economy*. Macmillan.
- Ehrlich, A. 1987. Israel: Conflict, War and Social Change. In *The Sociology of War and Peace*, 121-142. Palgrave Macmillan UK.
- Entman, R. M. 1993. Framing: Toward Clarification of a Fractured Paradigm. *Journal of Communication*, 43(4), 51–58.
- Entman, R. M. 2010. Media Framing Biases and Political Power: Explaining Slant in News of Campaign 2008. *Journalism*, 11, 389–408.
- Espenshade, T. J., and Hempstead, K. 1996. Contemporary American Attitudes toward US Immigration. *International Migration Review*, 535–570.

- Esses VM, Dovidio JF, Hodson G. 2002. Public Attitudes toward Immigration in the United States and Canada in Response to the September 11, 2001 "Attack on America." *Analyses of Soc. Issues and Public Policy* 2:69–85
- Facchini, G., and Mayda, A. M. 2009. Does the Welfare State Affect Individual Attitudes toward Immigrants? Evidence across Countries. *The Review of Economics and Statistics*, 91 (2), 295–314.
- Fan, C. C., and Huang, Y. 1998. Waves of Rural Brides: Female Marriage Migration in China. *Annals of the Association of American Geographers*, 88(2), 227-251.
- Fausset, Richard and Ken Belson. 2014. Faces of an Immigration System Overwhelmed by Women and Children. *The New York Times*, June 5.
- Ferber, Marianne A.; Nelson, Julie A. 2003. Beyond Economic Man, Ten Years Later. In *Feminist Economics Today: Beyond Economic Man*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1–32.
- Fetzer, J. S. 2000. *Public Attitudes toward Immigration in the United States, France, and Germany*. Cambridge University Press.
- United States Census Bureau. 2016. Foreign Born. *United States Census Bureau*. Retrieved from <http://www.census.gov/topics/population/foreign-born.html> on April 22, 2016.
- Friedman, S. L. 2010. Marital Immigration and Graduated Citizenship: Post-Naturalization Restrictions on Mainland Chinese Spouses in Taiwan. *Pacific Affairs*, 83(1), 73-93.
- Friedman, S. L. 2015. *Exceptional States: Chinese Immigrants and Taiwanese Sovereignty*. University of California Press.
- Fujiwara, L. 2008. *Mothers without Citizenship: Asian Immigrant Families and the Consequences of Welfare Reform*. University of Minnesota Press.
- Gabrielatos, C., and Baker, P. 2008. Fleeing, Sneaking, Flooding A Corpus Analysis of Discursive Constructions of Refugees and Asylum Seekers in the UK Press, 1996-2005. *Journal of English Linguistics*, 36(1), 5-38.
- Gamson, W. A. 1992. *Talking Politics*. New York, NY: Cambridge University Press.
- Gamson, W. A., and Modigliani, A. 1989. Media Discourse and Public Opinion on Nuclear Power: A Constructionist Approach. *American Journal of Sociology*, 95, 1–37.
- Gamson, W. A., and Stuart, D. 1992. Media Discourse as a Symbolic Contest: The Bomb in Political Cartoons. *Sociological Forum*, 7(1), 55–86.
- Gandy, O. H., Jr. 2001. Epilogue—Framing at the Horizon: A Retrospective Assessment. In S. D. Reese, O. H. Gandy, and A. E. Grant (Eds.), *Framing Public life. Perspectives on Media and our Understanding of the Social World* (355–378). Mahwah, NJ: Erlbaum
- Gauntlett, D. 2008. *Media, Gender and Identity: An Introduction*. Routledge.
- Gawronski, B. and Bodenhausen, G.V. 2006. Associative and Propositional Processes in Evaluation: An Integrative Review of Implicit and Explicit Attitude Change. *Psychological Bulletin*, 132, 692-731.
- Gibb, F. 2014. Migrants Win 1m Jobs with Can-Do Attitude. *The Times*, July 23.
- Gibney, M. J. 2004. *The Ethics and Politics of Asylum: Liberal Democracy and the Response to Refugees*. Courier Corporation.
- Durham, M. G. 2004. Constructing the "New Ethnicities": Media, Sexuality, and Diaspora Identity in the Lives of South Asian Immigrant Girls. *Critical Studies in Media Communication*, 21(2), 140-161.
- Gitlin, T. 1980. *The Whole World is Watching: The Mass Media in the Making and Unmaking of the New Left*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Glascok, J., and Preston-Schreck, C. 2004. Gender and Racial Stereotypes in Daily Newspaper Comics: A Time-Honored Tradition?. *Sex Roles*, 51(7-8), 423-431.

- Glaser, B. G., and Strauss, A. L. 2009. *The Discovery of Grounded Theory: Strategies for Qualitative Research*. Transaction Publishers.
- Goodman, C. 1987. Immigration and Class Mobility: The Case of Family Reunification Wives in West Germany. *Women's Studies: An Interdisciplinary Journal*, 13(3), 235-248.
- Gordon, A., and Stack, T. 2007. Citizenship beyond the State: Thinking with Early Modern Citizenship in the Contemporary World. *Citizenship Studies*, 11(2), 117-133.
- Green, D. 2012. Experimental Design. *Encyclopedia of Research Methods in the Social Sciences*.
- Greenberg, J. 2000. Opinion Discourse and Canadian Newspapers: The Case of the Chinese "Boat People". *Canadian Journal of Communication*, 25 (4).
- Greenberg, J., and Hier, S. 2001. Crisis, Mobilization and Collective Problematization: "Illegal" Chinese Migrants and the Canadian News Media. *Journalism Studies*, 2 (4), 563-583.
- Hackett, R. A. 1984. Decline of a Paradigm? Bias and Objectivity in News Media Studies. *Critical Studies in Media Communication*, 1(3), 229-259.
- Hainmueller, J. D. Hangartner, and T. Yamamoto (n.d.) "Do Survey Experiments Capture Real World Decision Making? Validating Conjoint and Vignette Analysis of Swiss Naturalization Decisions." Retrieved November 1, 2014
<http://web.stanford.edu/~jhain/Paper/conjointswiss.pdf>
- Hainmueller, J., and Hangartner, D. 2013. Who Gets a Swiss Passport? A Natural Experiment in Immigrant Discrimination. *American Political Science Review*, 107 (01), 159-187.
- Hainmueller, J., and Hiscox, M. J. 2010. Attitudes toward Highly Skilled and Low-Skilled Immigration: Evidence from a Survey Experiment. *American Political Science Review*, 104(01), 61-84.
- Hall, S. 1993. *Culture, Community, Nation*. *Cultural Studies*, 7 (3), 349-363.
- Hancock, A. M. 2007. When Multiplication Doesn't Equal Quick Addition: Examining Intersectionality as a Research Paradigm. *Perspectives on Politics*, 5(01), 63-79.
- Hanke, R. 1998. Theorizing Masculinity with/in the Media. *Communication Theory*, 8, 183-202.
- Hansen, R., and Weil, P. 2002. Dual Citizenship in a Changed World: Immigration, Gender and Social Rights. *Dual Nationality, Social Rights and Federal Citizenship in the US and Europe. The Reinvention of Citizenship*, 1-15. Berghahn Books.
- Hanson, G. H. 2005. Why Does Immigration Divide America?: Public Finance and Political Opposition to Open Borders (129). Peterson Institute.
- Hanson, G. H., and Spilimbergo, A. 2001. Political Economy, Sectoral Shocks, and Border Enforcement. *Canadian Journal of Economics/Revue canadienne d'économie*, 34 (3), 612-638.
- Hanson, G. H., Scheve, K., and Slaughter, M. J. 2007. Public Finance and Individual Preferences over Globalization Strategies. *Economics and Politics*, 19 (1), 1-33
- Harding, S. G. 2004. *The Feminist Standpoint Theory Reader: Intellectual and Political Controversies*. Psychology Press.
- Hawkes, Steve and Ryan Parry. 2014. Moldova the Border. *The Sun*, January 1.
- Hekman, S. 1997. Truth and Method: Feminist Standpoint Theory revisited. *Signs*, 22(2), 341-365.
- Heng, G. Landas Devan. 1992. State Fatherhood: The Politics of Nationalism Sexuality and Race in Singapore. In *Nationalisms and Sexualities*, Parker, New York: Routledge, 343-364.
- Henry, F., and Tator, C. 2002. *Discourses of Domination: Racial Bias in the Canadian English-Language Press*. University of Toronto Press.
- Hertog, J. K., and McLeod, D. M. 2001. A Multiperspectival Approach to Framing Analysis: A Field Guide. In S. D. Reese, O. H. Gandy, Jr., and A. E. Grant (Eds.), *Framing Public life: Perspectives on Media and Our Understanding of the Social World*, 146-161. Mahwah, NJ: Erlbaum.

- Holding, Reynolds. 2011. 'Anchor Babies': No Getting Around the Constitution. *Time Magazine*. February 1.
- Horton, J. J., Rand, D. G., and Zeckhauser, R. J. 2011. The Online Laboratory: Conducting Experiments in a Real Labor Market. *Experimental Economics*, 14(3), 399-425.
- Horrocks, D., and Kolinsky, E. 1996. *Turkish Culture in German Society Today* (1). Berghahn Books.
- Hsia, H. C. 1997. *Selfing and Othering in the "Foreign Bride" Phenomenon: A Study of Class, Gender and Ethnicity in the Transnational Marriages between Taiwanese men and Indonesian women* Doctoral dissertation, University of Florida.
- Hsia, H. C. 2007. Imaged and Imagined Threat to the Nation: the Media Construction of the 'Foreign Brides' Phenomenon' as Social Problems in Taiwan. *Inter-Asia Cultural Studies*, 8(1), 55-85.
- Hsu, C. J. 2014. China's Influence on Taiwan's Media. *Asian Survey*, 54(3), 515-539.
- Huddy, L. 2001. From Social to Political Identity: A Critical Examination of Social Identity Theory. *Political Psychology*, 22(1), 127-156.
- Huddy, L., and Terkildsen, N. 1993. The Consequences of Gender Stereotypes for Women Candidates at Different Levels and Types of Office. *Political Research Quarterly*, 46(3), 503-525.
- Huntington, Samuel P. 2004. The Hispanic Challenge. *Foreign Policy* (March/April): 30-45.
- Ibrahim, M. 2005. The Securitization of Migration: A Racial Discourse 1. *International Migration*, 43(5), 163-187.
- Ignatow, G., and Williams, A. T. 2011. New Media and the 'Anchor Baby' Boom. *Journal of Computer-Mediated Communication*, 17(1), 60-76.
- Amnesty International. Immigrant' Rights are Human Rights. *Amnesty International*. Retrieved from <http://www.amnestyusa.org/our-work/issues/refugee-and-migrant-rights/immigrants-rights-are-human-rights> on April 25, 2016.
- Ireland, M. S. 1993. *Reconceiving Women: Separating Motherhood from Female Identity*. Guilford Press.
- Isin, E. F. 2002. *Being Political: Genealogies of Citizenship*. University of Minnesota Press.
- Ivarsflaten, E. 2008. What Unites Right-Wing Populists in Western Europe? Re-examining Grievance Mobilization Models in Seven Successful Cases. *Comparative Political Studies*, 41(1), 3-23.
- Jacobson, R. D. 2008. *The New Nativism: Proposition 187 and the Debate over Immigration*. University of Minnesota Press.
- Johnson Jr, J. H., Farrell Jr, W. C., and Guinn, C. 1997. Immigration Reform and the Browning of America: Tensions, Conflicts and Community Instability in Metropolitan Los Angeles. *International Migration Review*, 1055-1095.
- Joppke, C. 1997. Asylum and State Sovereignty a Comparison of the United States, Germany, and Britain. *Comparative Political Studies*, 30 (3), 259-298.
- Junn, J., and Haynie, K. L. (Eds.). 2008. *New Race Politics in America: Understanding Minority and Immigrant Politics*. Cambridge University Press.
- Kahn, K. F., and Fridkin, K. 1996. *The Political Consequences of Being a Woman: How Stereotypes Influence the Conduct and Consequences of Political Campaigns*. Columbia University Press.
- Kahn, K. F., and Goldenberg, E. N. 1991. Women Candidates in the News: An Examination of Gender Differences in US Senate Campaign Coverage. *Public Opinion Quarterly*, 55(2), 180-199.
- Kalmijn, M. 1991. Shifting Boundaries: Trends in Religious and Educational Homogamy. *American Sociological Review*, 786-800.

- Kalmijn, M. 1991. Status Homogamy in the United States. *American Journal of Sociology*, 496-523.
- Kandel, W., and Massey, D. S. 2002. The Culture of Mexican Migration: A Theoretical and Empirical Analysis. *Social Forces*, 80 (3), 981–1004.
- Kang, M. "Maternal Flexible Citizenship: Tiger Mothers as Neoliberal Transnational Actors" Paper presented at the annual meeting of the National Women's Studies Association, Cincinnati Netherland Plaza, Cincinnati, OH <Not Available>. 2014-11 22 from http://citation.allacademic.com/meta/p661969_index.html
- Karp, J. A., and Banducci, S. A. 2008. When Politics is not Just a Man's Game: Women's Representation and Political Engagement. *Electoral Studies*, 27(1), 105-115.
- Katz, L. F., and Murphy, K. M. 1991. Changes in Relative Wages, 1963-1987: Supply and Demand Factors (3927). National Bureau of Economic Research.
- Kawaguchi, D., and Lee, S. 2012. Brides for Sale: Cross-border Marriages and Female Immigration. Harvard Business School Research Paper, (12-082).
- Keely, C. B. 1992. The Resettlement of Women and Children Refugees. *Migration World Magazine*, 20 (4), 14–18.
- Keskin-Kozat, B. 2003. Entangled in Secular Nationalism, Feminism and Islamism The Life of Konca Kuriş. *Cultural Dynamics*, 15(2), 183-211.
- Kessler, A. 2001. Immigration, Economic Insecurity, and the "Ambivalent" American Public. Center for Comparative Immigration Studies.
- Kim, H.-S. 2008. International Marriage Migrant Women in Korea. *Korean Journal of Women Health Nursing*, 14 (4), 248–256.
- King, D. 2009. *Making Americans: Immigration, Race, and the Origins of the Diverse Democracy*. Harvard University Press.
- King, G., Keohane, R. O., and Verba, S. 1994. *Designing Social Inquiry: Scientific Inference in Qualitative Research*. Princeton University Press.
- King, R. 2012. Geography and Migration Studies: Retrospect and Prospect. *Population, Space and Place*, 18(2), 134-153.
- Kivisto P. 2001. Theorizing Transnational Immigration: A Critical Review of Current Efforts. *Ethnicity Racial Studies* 24(4):549–77
- Knabe, A., Rätzl, S., and Thomsen, S. 2009. *Right-Wing Extremism and the Well-Being of Immigrants*.
- Kofman, E. 2004. Family-Related Migration: a Critical Review of European Studies 30(2). *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 30(2), 243-262.
- Koomen, M., Tillie, J., van Heelsum, A., and van Stiphout, S. 2013. Discursive Framing and the Reproduction of Integration in the Public Sphere: A Comparative Analysis of France, the United Kingdom, the Netherlands and Germany. *Ethnicities*, 13 (2), 191–208.
- Koopmans, R. 2005. *Contested Citizenship: Immigration and Cultural Diversity in Europe* (25). University of Minnesota Press.
- Koopmans, R., and Statham, P. 1999. Political Claims Analysis: Integrating Protest Event and Political Discourse Approaches. *Mobilization: An International Quarterly*, 4 (2), 203–221.
- Krysan, M. 2000. Prejudice, Politics, and Public Opinion: Understanding the Sources of Racial Policy Attitudes. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 135-168.
- Kunovich, R. M. 2009. The Sources and Consequences of National identification. *American Sociological Review*, 74(4), 573-593.
- Kymlicka, W., Yosef, R., and Margalit, A. 1995. *The Rights of Minority Cultures*. Cambridge University Press.

- LaFraniere, S. 2014. Mainland Chinese Flock to Hong Kong to Give Birth. *The New York Times*, February 23.
- Lahav, G. 2004. Public Opinion toward Immigration in the European Union does it Matter? *Comparative Political Studies*, 37 (10), 1151–1183.
- Lahav, G. 2004. *Immigration and Politics in the New Europe: Reinventing Borders*. Cambridge University Press.
- Lakoff, G., and Ferguson, S. 2016. The Framing of Immigration.
- Lamont, M., and Fournier, M. 1992. *Cultivating Differences: Symbolic Boundaries and the Making of Inequality*. University of Chicago Press.
- Lan, P. C. 2003. Maid or Madam? Filipina Migrant Workers and the Continuity of Domestic Labor. *Gender and Society*, 17(2), 187-208.
- Lan, P. C. 2006. *Global Cinderellas: Migrant Domesticity and Newly Rich Employers in Taiwan*. Duke University Press.
- Lan, P. C. 2008. Migrant Women's Bodies as Boundary Markers: Reproductive Crisis and Sexual Control in the Ethnic Frontiers of Taiwan. *Signs*, 33(4), 833-861.
- Landale, J. 2014. Sir John Major Praises Immigrants for 'Guts and Drive.' *BBC News*, August 12, 2014.
- Lang, G., and Smart, J. 2002. Migration and the "Second Wife" in South China: Toward Cross-Border Polygyny. *International Migration Review*, 36(2), 546-569.
- Lavelly, W. (1991). Marriage and Mobility under Rural Collectivism. In *Marriage and Inequality in Chinese Society*, 286-312.
- Lazar, M. M. 2005. *Feminist Critical Discourse Analysis: Gender, Power, and Ideology in Discourse*. Springer.
- Lee, C. T. 2016. Ethnic Food, Cultural Agency, and Early Chinese Immigrants' Informal Citizen-Making in the Pre-Civil Rights United States. Presented at the Western Political Science Association Conference.
- Lee, E. 2016. This Father Won't Leave a Chicago-Area Church Until ICE Promises Not to Deport Him. Think Progress. Retrieved from <http://thinkprogress.org/immigration/2016/04/19/3770362/jose-juan-federico-moreno-sanctuary/> on April 30, 2016.
- Lee, T. 2008. Race, Immigration, and the Identity-to-Politics Link. *Annual Review of Political Science*, 11, 457-478.
- Lee, T. L., and Fiske, S. T. 2006. Not an Outgroup, not yet an Ingroup: Immigrants in the Stereotype Content Model. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, 30 (6), 751–768.
- Len- Ríos, M. E., Rodgers, S., Thorson, E., and Yoon, D. 2005. Representation of Women in News and Photos: Comparing Content to Perceptions. *Journal of Communication*, 55(1), 152-168.
- Leland, John. 2014. The Sister of Second Chances. *The New York Times*, June 13.
- Leonard, R. L. 2013. Traveling Literacies: Multilingual Writing on the Move. *Research in the Teaching of English*, 48(1), 13.
- Li, Y. 2014. Constructing Peace in the Taiwan Strait: A Constructivist Analysis of the Changing Dynamics of Identities and Nationalisms. *Journal of Contemporary China*, 23(85), 119-142.
- Lim, T. 2010. Rethinking Belongingness in Korea: Transnational Migration, "Migrant Marriages" and the Politics of Multiculturalism. *Pacific Affairs*, 83(1), 51-71.
- Lincoln, Y. S., and Guba, E. G. 1985. *Naturalist Inquiry*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- Lister, R. 2003. *Citizenship: Feminist perspectives*. NYU Press.
- Liu, F. C., and Lee, F. L. 2013. Country, National, and Pan-national Identification in Taiwan and Hong Kong. *Asian Survey*, 53(6), 1112-1134.

- Loescher, G. (2002). State Responses to Refugees and Asylum Seekers in Europe. *West European Immigration and Immigrant Policy in the New Century*, 33–46.
- Loten, Angus. 2014. Job-Creating Visa Program Had Record Applications in 2013. *The Wall Street Journal*, January 20.
- Loten, Angus. 2014. Franchises Target Immigrants as Buyers. *The Wall Street Journal*, February 3.
- Louie, M. C. Y. 2001. *Sweatshop Warriors: Immigrant Women Workers Take on the Global Factory*. South End Press.
- Lu, M. C. W. 2005. Commercially Arranged Marriage Migration Case Studies of Cross-border Marriages in Taiwan. *Indian Journal of Gender Studies*, 12(2-3), 275-303.
- Lu, M. C. W. 2008. Gender, Marriage and Migration: Contemporary Marriages between Mainland China and Taiwan (Doctoral dissertation, Research School of Asian, African and Amerindian Studies (CNWS), Faculty of Arts, Leiden University).
- Lu, M. C. W. 2011. Strategies of Alliance among Cross-Border Families and Chinese Marriage Immigrants. *Politics of Difference in Taiwan*, 116-133.
- Lu, M. C. W. 2012. Transnational Marriages as a Strategy of Care Exchange: Veteran Soldiers and their Mainland Chinese Spouses in Taiwan. *Global Networks*, 12(2), 233-251.
- Lusane, C. 2003. Hitler's Black Victims: The Historical Experiences of Afro-Germans, European Blacks, Africans, and African Americans in the Nazi Era (9). Psychology Press.
- Maddox, K. B., and Gray, S. A. 2002. Cognitive Representations of Black Americans: Reexploring the Role of Skin Tone. *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin*, 28(2), 250-259.
- Maggio, J. 2007. "Can the Subaltern Be Heard?": Political Theory, Translation, Representation, and Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak. *Alternatives: Global, Local, Political*, 32(4), 419-443.
- Malhotra, N., Margalit, Y., and Mo, C. H. 2013. Economic Explanations for Opposition to Immigration: Distinguishing between Prevalence and Conditional Impact. *American Journal of Political Science*, 57 (2), 391–410.
- Mansbridge, J. 1999. Should Blacks Represent Blacks and Women Represent Women? A Contingent "Yes". *The Journal of Politics*, 61(03), 628-657.
- Marecek, J. 2000. Am I A Woman In These Matters? Notes On Sinhala Nationalism And Gender In Sri Lanka.
- Marion, Y. I. 1990. *Justice and the Politics of Difference*. New Jersey: Princeton.
- Marshall, T. H. 1950. *Citizenship and Social Class* (11). Cambridge.
- Martin, A. K. 2000. Transnationalism, Bodies and Abortion in Late Twentieth-Century Ireland. *Gender Ironies of Nationalism: Sexing the Nation*, 65-86.
- Mason, R. 2014. David Cameron Criticized for PR Student in Home of Suspected Illegal Immigrants. *The Guardian*, July 30.
- Mason, Rowena and Sherwood, Harriet. 2016. "Cameron 'Stigmatizing Muslim Women' with English Language Policy" *The Guardian*, January 18.
- Massey, D. S., Arango, J., Hugo, G., Kouaouci, A., and Pellegrino, A. 1999. *Worlds in Motion: Understanding International Migration at the End of the Millennium: Understanding International Migration at the End of the Millennium*. Clarendon Press.
- Massey, D. S., Arango, J., Hugo, G., Kouaouci, A., Pellegrino, A., and Taylor, J. E. 1993. Theories of International Migration: A Review and Appraisal. *Population and Development Review*, 431-466.
- Mayda, A. M. 2006. Who is Against Immigration? A Cross-Country Investigation of Individual Attitudes toward Immigrants. *The Review of Economics and Statistics*, 88 (3), 510–530.
- Mayer, T. (Ed.). 2000. *Gender Ironies of Nationalism: Sexing the Nation*. Psychology Press.
- McCall, L. 2005. The Complexity of Intersectionality. *Signs*, 30(3), 1771-1800.

- McClintock, A. 1993. Family Feuds: Gender, Nationalism and the Family. *Feminist Review*, 61-80.
- McCombs, M. 2013. *Setting the Agenda: The Mass Media and Public Opinion*. John Wiley and Sons.
- McCombs, M. E., and Shaw, D. L. 1972. The Agenda-Setting Function of Mass Media. *Public Opinion Quarterly*, 36 (2), 176–187.
- McGinty, Jo. Fact-Checking the Figures on Anchor Babies. *The Wall Street Journal*, September 11, 2015.
- McLaren, L. M. 2003. Anti-immigrant prejudice in Europe: Contact, Threat Perception, and Preferences for the Exclusion of Migrants. *Social Forces*, 81 (3), 909–936.
- McNevin, A. 2013. *Contesting Citizenship: Irregular Migrants and New Frontiers of the Political*. Columbia University Press.
- Meeks, L. 2012. Is She “Man Enough”? Women Candidates, Executive Political Offices, and News Coverage. *Journal of Communication*, 62(1), 175-193.
- Mehan, H. 1997. The Discourse of the Illegal Immigration Debate: A Case Study in the Politics of Representation. *Discourse and Society*, 8(2), 249-270.
- Melgar, I., J. Morella, J. Mora, and A. D. Pantoja 2013. From Coverage to Action: The Immigration Debate and Its Effects on Participation. *Political Research Quarterly* 66(2): 322-335.
- Merolla, J, S. K. Ramakrishnan, and C. Haynes. 2013. “Illegal,’ ‘Undocumented,’ or ‘Unauthorized’: Equivalency Frames, Issue Frames, and Public Opinion on Immigration, *Perspectives on Politics* 11(3): 789-807.
- Merriam, S. B. 2002. *Qualitative Research in Practice: Examples for Discussion and Analysis*. Jossey-Bass Inc Publisher.
- Messner, M. A. 1999. Gender Displays and Men’s Power: the “New Man” and the Mexican Immigrant Man. *American Families: A Multicultural Reader*, 342.
- Miller, Joanne M., and Jon A. Krosnick. 2004. Threat as a Motivator of Political Activism: A Field Experiment. *Political Psychology* 25(4): 507–23.
- Mochoruk, J., and Gordon, J. 2007. *Suburban Sweatshops: The Fight for Immigrant Rights*.
- Mohanty, C. T. 1988. Under Western Eyes: Feminist Scholarship and Colonial Discourses. *Feminist Review*, (30), 61-88.
- Morella, J., A. D. Pantoja, and I. Cargile 2014. “The Effects of Media Framing on Attitudes toward Undocumented Immigration” In Carty, Victoria and Tekle M. Woldemikael, ed. *Scholars and Southern California Immigrants in Dialogue*. Lexington Books. 41-68.
- Mostov, J. 2000. Sexing the Nation/Desexing the Body: Politics of National Identity in the Former Yugoslavia.” In *Gender Ironies of Nationalism: Sexing the Nation*, edited by Tamar Mayer.
- Neubeck, K. J., and Glasberg, D. S. 1995. *Sociology: A Critical Approach*. McGraw-Hill College.
- Neuhauser, A. 2015. 50,000 Foreign-Born STEM Workers May Be Forced Home. *U.S. News*, September 9.
- Nisbet, E. C., and Myers, T. A. 2010. Challenging the State: Transnational TV and Political Identity in the Middle East. *Political Communication*, 27(4), 347-366.
- Nock, M.L., and Banaji, M.R. 2007. Assessment of Self-Injurious Thoughts Using Behavioral Test. *American Journal of Psychiatry*, 164(5), 820-823.
- Norris, Pippa. 1997. Women Leaders Worldwide: A Splash of Color in the Photo Op. In *Women, Media, and Politics*, ed. Pippa Norris. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 149-65.
- Oakley, A. 1981. Interviewing Women: A Contradiction in Terms. *Doing Feminist Research*, 30(6), 1.

- Oborne, Peter. 2014. Labour's Unforced Error on the EU is a Priceless Gift for its Opponents. *The Telegraph*, March 12.
- Oliver, C., and O'Reilly, K. 2010. A Bourdieusian Analysis of Class and Migration Habitus and the Individualizing Process. *Sociology*, 44(1), 49-66.
- Olzak, S. 1992. *The Dynamics of Ethnic Competition and Conflict*. Stanford University Press.
- Ong, A. 1999. *Flexible Citizenship: The Cultural Logics of Transnationality*. Duke University Press.
- Orloff, A. S. 1993. Gender and the Social Rights of Citizenship: The Comparative Analysis of Gender Relations and Welfare States. *American Sociological Review*, 303-328.
- Ormonde, M. E. 2012. Debunking the Myth of the Anchor Baby: Why Proposed Legislation Limiting Birthright Citizenship is Not a Means of Controlling Unauthorized Immigration. *Roger Williams UL Rev.*, 17, 861.
- United Nations Population Fund. 2016. Overview. United Nations Population Fund. Retrieved from <http://www.unfpa.org/migration> April 25, 2016.
- Özden, Ç., and Schiff, M. W. (Eds.). 2007. *International Migration, Economic Development and Policy*. World Bank Publications.
- Page, B. I., and Shapiro, R. Y. 1983. Effects of Public Opinion on Policy. *The American Political Science Review*, 175-190.
- Pan, Z., and Kosicki, G. M. 1993. Framing Analysis: An Approach to News Discourse. *Political Communication*, 10, 55-75.
- Panayi, P. 1994. *Immigration, Ethnicity and Racism in Britain, 1815-1945*. Manchester University Press.
- Pande, Kamla. 2006. The Effect of September 11, 2001 on Media Discourse and Public Opinion toward Immigration. Senior honors thesis. University of Michigan.
- Pandit, N. R. 1996. The Creation of Theory: A Recent Application of the Grounded Theory Method. *The Qualitative Report*, 2(4), 1-15.
- Parker, Ashley. "Gender Bias Seen in Visas for Skilled Workers." *The New York Times*. March 18, 2013.
- Pearson, Allison. 2014. At Last, the BBC Talks about Immigration. *The Telegraph*, January 8.
- Pearson, R., and Sweetman, C. 1994. Abortion, Reproductive Rights and Maternal Mortality. *Gender and Development*, 2(2), 45-50.
- Però, D. 2014. Class Politics and Migrants: Collective Action among New Migrant Workers in Britain. *Sociology*, 1-17.
- Pew Research Center. 2009. Most Mexicans See Better Life in U.S. –One-in-Three Would Migrate. Pew Research Center. Retrieved from <http://www.pewglobal.org/2009/09/23/most-mexicans-see-better-life-in-us-one-in-three-would-migrate/> on September 28, 2014
- Piore, M. J. 1980. *Birds of Passage*. Cambridge Books.
- Piper, N. 2003. Wife or Worker? Worker or Wife? Marriage and Cross- Border Migration in Contemporary Japan. *International Journal of Population Geography*, 9(6), 457-469.
- Plascencia, L. F. 2012. *Disenchanting Citizenship: Mexican Migrants and the Boundaries of Belonging*. Rutgers University Press.
- Poliiti, D. Donald Trump in Phoenix : Mexicans are 'Taking our Jobs' and 'Killing Us.' *Slate*, July 12. Retrieved from http://www.slate.com/blogs/the_slatest/2015/07/12/donald_trump_in_phoenix_mexicans_are_taking_our_jobs_and_killing_us.html on May 2, 2016.
- Portes, A. 2010. Migration and Social Change: Some Conceptual Reflections. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 36(10), 1537-1563.
- Portes, A., and Rumbaut, R. G. 2006. *Immigrant America: A Portrait*. University of California Press.

- Preston, Julia. 11.2 Million Illegal Immigrants in U.S. in 2010. *The New York Times*, February 2, 2011.
- Priest, H., Roberts, P., and Woods, L. 2002. An Overview of Three Different Approaches to the Interpretation of Qualitative Data. Part 1: Theoretical Issues. *Nurse Researcher*, 10(1), 30-42.
- Puar, J. 2012. Precarity Talk: A Virtual Roundtable with Lauren Berlant, Judith Butler, Bojana Cvejić, Isabell Lorey, Jasbir Puar, and Ana Vujanović. *TDR/The Drama Review*, 56(4), 163-177.
- Quillian, L. 1995. Prejudice as a Response to Perceived Group Threat: Population Composition and Anti-Immigrant and Racial Prejudice in Europe. *American Sociological Review*, 586-611.
- Quillian, L. 2006. New Approaches to Understanding Racial Prejudice and Discrimination. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 32, 299-328.
- Quinsaat, S. 2014. Competing News Frames and Hegemonic Discourses in the Construction of Contemporary Immigration and Immigrants in the United States. *Mass Communication and Society*, 1-24.
- Raijman R, Davidov E, Schmidt P, Hochman O. 2008. What does a Nation Owe Noncitizens? National Attachments, Perception of Threat and Attitudes towards Granting Citizenship Rights in a Comparative Perspective. *International Journal of Comparative Sociology*. 49(2-3):195
- Rajaram, P. K., and Grundy- Warr, C. 2004. The Irregular Migrant as Homo Sacer: Migration and Detention in Australia, Malaysia, and Thailand. *International Migration*, 42(1), 33-64.
- Rasmussen Reports. 2015. Americans Think Illegals are Taking Their Jobs. Retrieved http://www.rasmussenreports.com/public_content/business/general_business/august_2015/americans_think_illegals_are_taking_their_jobs_on_August_15, 2015.
- Razin, A., Sadka, E., and Swagel, P. 2002. Tax Burden and Migration: A Political Economy Theory and Evidence. *Journal of Public Economics*, 85(2), 167-190.
- Reese, S. D. 2010. Finding Frames in a Web of Culture. *Doing News Framing Analysis: Empirical and Theoretical Perspectives*, 17-42.
- Regets, M. C. 2001. Research and Policy Issues in High-Skilled International Migration: A Perspective with Data from the United States.
- Rich, A. 1995. *Of Woman Born: Motherhood as Experience and Institution*. WW Norton and Company.
- Richburg, K. B. 2010. For Many Pregnant Chinese, a U.S. Passport for Baby Remains a Powerful Lure. *The Washington Post*, July 17.
- Ritchey, P. N. 1976. Explanations of Migration. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 363-404.
- Rivas, D. 2002. *Mexican-American Identities: Dualism in the Self-Conceptualization of Persons*.
- Rocco, R. A. 2014. *Transforming Citizenship: Democracy, Membership, and Belonging in Latino Communities*. MSU Press.
- Rollins, J. 1987. *Between Women: Domesticity and their Employers*. Temple University Press.
- Rosenlee, L.-H. L. 2007. *Confucianism and Women: A Philosophical Interpretation*. SUNY Press.
- Ross, K., and Carter, C. 2011. Women and News: A Long and Winding Road. *Media, Culture and Society*, 33(8), 1148-1165.
- Ross, L. J. 1993. African American Women and Abortion: 1800-1970. Theorizing Black Feminisms: *The Visionary Pragmatism of Black Women*, 141-159.
- Rydgren, J. 2007. The Sociology of the Radical Right. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 33, 241-262.
- Saito, N. T. 1997. Model Minority, Yellow Peril: Functions of Foreignness in the Construction of Asian American Legal Identity. *Asian Law Journal*, 4, 71.

- Sampedro, A., Mazuelas, P., Rodríguez-Granger, J., Torres, E., Puertas, A., and Navarro, J. M. 2010. Serological Markers in Immigrant and Spanish Pregnant Women in Granada. *Enfermedades Infecciosas y Microbiología Clínica*, 28(10), 694-697.
- Santa Ana, O. 1999. Like an Animal I was Treated': Anti-Immigrant Metaphor in US Public Discourse. *Discourse and Society*, 10(2), 191-224.
- Sassen, S. 1996. *Losing Control?: Sovereignty in an Age of Globalization*. Columbia University Press.
- Schecter, A. 2013. "Born in the U.S.A.: Birth Tourists Get Instant U.S. Citizenship for their Newborns." Retrieved from <http://rockcenter.nbcnews.com/news/2013/03/07/17225891-born-in-the-usa-birth-tourists-get-instant-us-citizenship-for-their-newborns?lite> on December 09, 2014.
- Scheepers P, Gijssberts M, Coenders M. 2002. Ethnic Exclusionism in European Countries: Public Opposition to Civil Rights for Legal Migrants as a Response to Perceived Group Threat. *European Sociology Review* 18(1):17-34
- Scheve, K. F., and Slaughter, M. J. 2001. Labor Market Competition and Individual Preferences over Immigration Policy. *Review of Economics and Statistics*, 83 (1), 133-145.
- Schippers, M. 2007. Recovering the Feminine Other: Masculinity, Femininity, and Gender Hegemony. *Theory and Society*, 36(1), 85-102.
- Schoen, R., and Weinick, R. M. 1993. Partner Choice in Marriages and Cohabitations. *Journal of Marriage and the Family*, 55(2), 408-414.
- Schreckinger, B. 2016. Donald Trump Storms Phonix. *Politico*, July 11.
- Seawright, J., and Gerring, J. 2008. Case Selection Techniques in Case Study Research A Menu of Qualitative and Quantitative Options. *Political Research Quarterly*, 61(2), 294-308.
- Semotiuk, A. J. 2014. Immigration: The Myth of the 'Anchor Baby. *Forbes Asia*, September 22.
- Sessions, J. Congress Must Fix the Problems President Obama's Executive Amnesty Plan Creates." *USA Today*, November 20.
- Sharp, J. R., and Nationhood, G. 1996. A Feminist Engagement with National Identity. *Bodyspace: Destabilizing Geographies of Gender and Sexuality*, 97-107.
- Shear, Michael, Julia Preston, and Ashley Parker. 2014. Obama Plan May Allow Millions of Immigrants. *The New York Times*, November 13.
- Sides J, Citrin J. 2007. European Opinion about Immigration: the Role of Identities, Interests, and Information. *British Journal of Political Science* 37:477-504
- Silva, C. 2015. Undocumented Immigrants Taking Jobs From US Citizens? Most Americans Believe Immigration Is Bad For Economy. *International Business Times*, August 14.
- Simon, R. J., and Lynch, J. P. 1999. A Comparative Assessment of Public Opinion toward Immigrants and Immigration Policies. *International Migration Review*, 455-467.
- Skeggs, B. 1997. Formations of Class and Gender: Becoming Respectable (51). Sage.
- Smith, L. 2012. Amnesty for Immigrants? *The New York Times*, June 8, 2012.
- Soergel, A. Refugees: Economic Boon or Burden? *U.S. News*, September 15.
- Somers, M. R., and Wright, O. 2008. *Genealogies of Citizenship: Markets, Statelessness, and the Right to Have rights*.
- Spivak, G. C. 1988. *Can the Subaltern Speak?* (271-313). Macmillan Education UK.
- Stark, O. 1991. *The Migration of Labor*. Blackwell Oxford.
- Stasiulis, D. K., and Bakan, A. B. 2005. *Negotiating Citizenship: Migrant Women in Canada and the Global System*. University of Toronto Press.
- Stavig, L. I. 2015. I'll Give You a Dollar If You Give Me Your Papers: Active Citizenship and Immigrant Women's Right to Work. *Signs*, 41(1), 155-178.

- Stephan, W. G., Lausanne Renfro, C., Esses, V. M., White Stephan, C., and Martin, T. 2005. The Effects of Feeling Threatened on Attitudes toward Immigrants. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, 29(1), 1-19.
- Stephanie, C. 2005. *Marriage, A History: From Obedience to Intimacy or How Love Conquered Marriage*. New York: Viking.
- Stoller, R. J. 1994. *Sex and Gender: The Development of Masculinity and Femininity*. Karnac Books.
- United States Census Bureau (2012). Retrieved <http://www.census.gov/compendia/statab/> on August 15, 2014.
- Strauss, A., and Corbin, J. 1967. *Discovery of Grounded Theory*.
- Strauss, A., and Corbin, J. 1990. *Basics of Qualitative Research* (15). Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Suro, R. 2009. America's Views of Immigration: The Evidence from Public Opinion Surveys. Migration Policy Institute.
- Suzuki, B. H. 1989. Asian Americans as the "Model Minority": Outdoing Whites? Or Media Hype?. *Change: The Magazine of Higher Learning*, 21(6), 13-19.
- Swarns, Rachel. 2006. Split Over Immigration Reflects Nation's Struggle." *The New York Times*, March 29.
- Tankard, J., Hendrickson, L., Silberman, J., Bliss, K., and Ghanem, S. 1991. Media Frames: Approaches to Conceptualization and Measurement, Paper presented to the Association for Education in Journalism and Mass Communication. Communication Theory and Methodology Division, Boston, MA.
- Tankard, J. (2008). The Empirical Approach to the Study of Media Framing. In S. Reese, O. Gandy and A. Grant (Eds.), *Framing Public Life* (95–105). Mahwah, NJ: Erlbaum.
- Tong, C. K. 2007. *Rationalizing Religion: Religious Conversion, Revivalism and Competition in Singapore Society* (13). Brill.
- Triandafyllidou, A. 1999. Nation and Immigration: A Study of the Italian Press Discourse. *Social Identities*, 5(1), 65-88.
- Tsay, C. L. 2004. Marriage Migration of Women from China and Southeast Asia to Taiwan. GW Jones and K. Ramdas (eds.), 173-191.
- Tseng, Y.-f. (2010). Marriage Migration to East Asia: Current Issues and Propositions in Making Comparisons. *Asian Cross-Border Marriage Migration: Demographic Patterns and Social Issues*, 31–45.
- Tsuda, T., Valdez, Z., and Cornelius, W. A. 2003. Human Versus Social Capital, Immigrant Wages and Labor Market Incorporation in Japan and the United States. *Host Societies and the Reception of Immigrants*, 215–42.
- United States Census Bureau. 2012. Retrieved from <http://www.census.gov/compendia/statab/> on August 15, 2014.
- van der Zon, M. 2000. Aliens Go Home: A Critical Media Analysis of the Chinese Migrants. Unpublished BA Honours Thesis. University of Victoria, Victoria, BC, Department of Sociology
- Van Dijk, T. A. 1995. Power and the News Media. *Political Communication and Action*, 9-36.
- Van Dijk, T. 2001. Principles of Critical discourse Analysis. *Discourse Theory and Practice: A Reader*, 300–317.
- Van Dijk, T. A. 2000. New (s) racism: A Discourse Analytical Approach. *Ethnic Minorities and the Media*, 33–49.
- van Dijk, T. A. 2006. Discourse and Manipulation. *Discourse and Society*, 17, 359–383.
- Van Gorp, B. 2010. Strategies to Take Subjectivity Out of Framing Analysis. *Doing News Framing Analysis: Empirical and Theoretical Perspectives*, 84-109.

- Van Hear, N. 2014. Reconsidering Migration and Class. *International Migration Review*, 48(s1), S100-S121.
- Van Zoonen, L. 1994. *Feminist Media Studies* (9). Sage.
- Vernby, K., and Finseraas, H. 2010. Xenophobia and Left Voting. *Politics and Society*, 38 (4), 490–516.
- Walsh, J. 2014. Obama's Immigration Plan Includes Amnesty. *Newsmax*. Retrieved from <http://www.newsmax.com/jameswalsh/obama-dream-immigration-illegals/2014/11/17/id/607767/> on November 22, 2014.
- Wang, H. Z., and Chang, S. M. 2002. The Commodification of International Marriages: Cross-border Marriage Business in Taiwan and Viet Nam. *International Migration*, 40(6), 93-116.
- Wang, T. Y., and Liu, I. C. 2004. Contending identities in Taiwan: Implications for cross-strait relations. *Asian Survey*, 44(4), 568-590.
- Watts, D. J., and Dodds, P. S. 2007. Influentials, Networks, and Public Opinion Formation. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 34 (4), 441–458.
- Weber, C. 2011. *I am an American!': Filming the Fear of Difference*. Intellect Books.
- Wenner, L. A., and Jackson, S. J. 2009. Sport, Beer, and Gender: Promotional Culture and Contemporary Social Life (17). Peter Lang.
- White, M. J., and White, G. B. 2006. Implicit and Explicit Occupational Gender Stereotypes. *Sex Roles*, 55(3-4), 259-266.
- White, T. H. 1969. *The Making of the President*, 1968. Atheneum.
- Wodak, R. 2001. The Discourse-Historical Approach. *Methods of Critical Discourse Analysis*, 63–94.
- World Values Survey. 2005. *World Values Survey*. Retrieved <http://www.worldvaluesurvey.org>
- World Values Survey. 2010. *World Values Survey*. Retrieved <http://www.worldvaluesurvey.org>
- Yang, W. S., and Lu, M. C. W. (Eds.). 2010. *Asian Cross-Border Marriage Migration: Demographic Patterns and Social Issues* (2). Amsterdam University Press.
- Yeh, Y. C. 2010. Foreign Spouses' Acculturation in Taiwan: A Comparison of their Countries of Origin, Gender, and Education Degrees. *Asian Cross-Border Marriage Migration: Demographic Patterns and Social Issues*, 201-220.
- Yiu, Cody. 2004. Chou Warned on Immigrant Jibe. *Taipei Times*, July 13, 2.
- Young, I. M. 1990. *Throwing like a Girl and other Essays in Feminist Philosophy and Social Theory*.
- Yuval-Davis, N. 1996. Women and the Biological Reproduction of “the Nation”. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 19(1): 17-24. Pergamon.
- Yuval-Davis, N. 1997. Theorizing Gender and Nation, in N. Yuval-Davis: *Gender and Nation*.
- Yuval-Davis, N. 2009. Interview with Professor Nira Yuval-Davis: After Gender and Nation. Interview by Lois Lee. *Studies in Ethnicity and Nationalism*, 9 (1), 128–38.
- Yuval-Davis, N., and Anthias, F. (Eds.). 1989. *Woman, Nation, State*. Macmillan.
- Yuval-Davis, N., Anthias, F., and Kofman, E. 2005. Secure Borders and Safe Haven and the Gendered Politics of Belonging: Beyond Social Cohesion. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 28(3), 513-535.
- Zhou, Y. 2000. The Fall of “the Other Half of the Sky”? Chinese Immigrant Women in the New York Area. In *Women's Studies International Forum* 23(4): 445-459. Pergamon.

Appendix A

Summary of Newspaper Observations

Explicit vs. Implicit Gendering of Immigration

Table A-1. Examples of Explicit and Implicit Gendering of Immigration in the Media

| Explicit | Implicit | | | | | |
|----------|--------------|--------------|-------------|---------------|-----------|----------|
| | Occupation | | Family role | | Dress | |
| Man | Masculine | Feminine | Masculine | Feminine | Masculine | Feminine |
| Woman | Construction | Nurse | Father | Mother | Turban | Burqa |
| Male | Engineer | Healthcare | Son | Daughter | | Nijab |
| Female | Farmer | worker | Brother-in- | Sister-in-law | | Hijab |
| | Gardener | Housekeeper; | law | Wife | | Skirt |
| | Entrepreneur | maids | Husband | | | |
| | Athlete | Nanny | | | | |
| | Butcher | Restaurant | | | | |
| | Cook | receptionist | | | | |
| | Janitor | | | | | |

Theme Summary

Newspaper themes record all the main theme of an article in relation to immigration. Themes are the subject of a news article that is often determined by the writer (reporter) and that exhibits the writer's thoughts and position. Themes in a news article are expressed through texts as the writer determines the main topics to cover in relation to immigration. The themes are broken down into the following categories: legal aspects, immigration policies, homeland and security politics, integration, immigrant and human rights, threat (perceived to be) imposed by immigrants, xenophobia and discrimination, immigrants' contribution, immigrants' struggles and survival of hardship, immigrant identity; immigrant demographics, and other. Multiple themes could exist in an article. If an article entails more than one theme, the most important or most utilized theme by a particular article was coded as a major theme and all the other relatively less relevant themes were also coded. The coder decides the main themes by looking at the position of the theme within the text, e.g. first sentences or first paragraph of the text, and the scope of theme communicated.

Issue Summary

Under every theme that a newspaper article utilizes to highlight immigration, an particular of issue related to immigration is also identified. Table A-2 illustrates the specific issues that are identified under each theme.

Table A-2. Issue Summary of Newspaper Articles

| Theme | Issue | Description |
|----------------------|---|---|
| Legal aspect | Entry and Exit | The legality of immigrants entering and exiting a country. |
| | Duration of stay | The amount of time for which immigrants are legally allowed to stay in host country. |
| | Citizenship | The legal requirement by which immigrants must comply in order to receive citizenship |
| | Interview for entry or citizenship | The process by which immigrants are to be interviewed to enter or receive citizenship in host country. The media that discuss interview for entry or citizenship are likely to be centered on the questions that are asked during the interview, biased attitudes of interviewers, interviewers' treatments of interviewees, e.g. prejudice and discrimination, and the environmental conditions in which the interviews occur. |
| | Exclusions, deportations, and voluntary return | The legality and legal process of host country to deport immigrants. |
| | Work, employment | The legality of hiring undocumented migrants, providing fair and safe working conditions, wage discrimination based on citizens status, etc. |
| Immigration policies | General evaluation of policies | Evaluations of general policies that are related to immigration. |
| | Proposal of new policies | Proposals of new immigration policies. These proposals are often advocated by interest groups, proposed by policy-makers, and debated among the public. Discussion of immigration reform would also be considered proposal of new policies if the article centers on advocacy a reform on existing immigration policies. |
| | Institutional framework, responsibilities, procedures, and costs | Policies related to institutional framework, government responsibilities, and legal procedures, and costs of immigration. |
| | Migration prevention in homeland countries | Policies related to prevent inflow of immigrants and control of borders. |
| | Registration and internal control | Policies related to registration and internal control of immigrants. For example, a policy that allows law enforcement to demand that any individual to answer questions about his or her status. |
| | Recognition, residence, rights, legal status, permits, space, and resources | The legal aspects about immigrants obtaining residency, drivers' license, and other forms of documentation. |
| | Access to | The legality of immigrants having access to welfare services or being |

| | | |
|--------------------------------|---|--|
| | welfare services | on welfare programs, such as public or subsidized housing, Medicaid, food resources (WIC, SNAP, school lunch), etc. |
| Homeland and security politics | Crime rate and immigrants' involvement in crime | Discussion about the increasing crime rates along with the increase of immigrant population or discussion about immigrants' involvement in crimes, such as stealing, sex trafficking, drug trafficking, etc. |
| | Quality of immigrants | Discussion about the quality of immigrants as a harm or danger to host country. |
| | Burden on welfare | Coverage of immigrants posing as a burden on host countries through the discussion of the increasing demand for space, food, educational resources, healthcare resources, etc. |
| | Fertility, aging, and marriage issues | Discussion of issues that immigrants pose upon traditional family structures or compositions. For example, an article may suggest that the future of a nation is in danger because of the changes in demographics by discussing the high fertility rate of migrant women. |
| Integration | Linguistic integration | Discussion of the degree to which immigrants are (or must be) integrated linguistically in host country. An example would be an article's emphasis on how quickly (or slowly) an immigrant learns the national language since arrival. |
| | Integration in family and community | Discussion of the degree to which immigrants are (or must be) integrated in their families and communities. An example would be an article's emphasis on how much friendship and support network an immigrant has been able to build since arrival. |
| | Political integration | Discussion about the degree to which immigrants participate in politics in host countries. Various forms of political actions at various levels including but not limited to voting, protesting, petition-signing, volunteering in a political party, contacting government officials, donating to political campaigns, etc., may be discussed. |
| | Wardrobe, body, and appearances | Discussion of the degree to which immigrants have adapted to traditional wardrobe or dress of host countries or the degree to which immigrants maintain their own traditional wardrobe and dress. The media coverage may also discuss the likelihood of native citizens to differentiate between native citizens and immigrants based on immigrants' body and appearances. |
| Human rights | Protection | Immigrants' right to legal protection and judiciary. |
| | Language acquisition | Immigrants' right to maintain their native language or to learn a new language. The media may also report on the children of immigrants' rights to learn their mother tongue at school as part of the educational curriculum. |
| | Education | Immigrants' right to education. |
| | Housing | Immigrants' right to living conditions, decent housing, and public and subsidized housing. |
| | Health and welfare | Immigrants' rights to health programs and services provided by the government. An example would be the discussion of including immigrants in the universal healthcare program. |
| | Labor | Immigrants' right to labor market and employment opportunities. Equal pay at the work place may also be discussed. |
| | Religion | Immigrants' right to practice their own religion. |
| | Political | Immigrants' right to participate in politics, such as voting. |

| | | |
|---------------|-----------------|--|
| | participation | |
| | Ownership | Immigrants' right to own property. |
| | Family Reunion | Immigrants' right to unite with their families. |
| | Citizenship | Immigrants' right to acquire citizenship. |
| Threat | Economic threat | Immigrants' threat to the economy: blue-collar jobs, pink-collar jobs, etc |
| | Health threat | Immigrants' threat to national health through the spread of diseases, etc. |
| | Ideology threat | Immigrants' threat to national/conventional ideology and values: democracy, equality, civilization, Confucianism, Christianity, religion, etc. Other |
| Xenophobia | Racism | Intense fear of immigrants based on immigrants' race and ethnicity, religion, sex, sexuality, ability, age, etc. |
| Contribution | Health | Immigrants' contribution to national health or healthcare. |
| | Resource | Immigrants' contribution to increasing resources in host country. |
| | Labor | Immigrants' contribution based on labor. |
| | Diversity | Immigrants' contribution to diversity of culture, traditions, customs, and demographics in host country. |
| | Wealth | Immigrants' contribution to the economy, fund, money, or wealth in host country. |
| Hardship | Hardship | Immigrants' struggles and survival of hardship, such as their dire need of resources. |
| Self-identity | Embracing | Discussion about immigrants who embrace and take pride in their immigrant identities. |
| | Struggling | Discussion about immigrants who struggle with their immigrant identities, particularly with the challenges that are brought by immigrant status. |
| | Rejecting | Discussion about immigrants who reject their immigrant identities. Examples include immigrants who only identify themselves as their host country identity and refuse to acknowledge their immigrant history. |
| Population | Decrease | Decrease in immigrant population. |
| | Increase | Increase in immigrant population |
| | Changes | Changes in immigrant population or native demographic characteristics without specifying whether these changes are positive or negative. Examples may also include changes of immigrants' preference of residency. |

Appendix B

Socio-Demographic Characteristics of Interview and Survey Experiment Participants

Table B-1. Average Demographics of Survey Participants in all Four Countries

| Characteristics | Mean |
|----------------------------|---|
| Sex | 51% male 49% female |
| Average age | 33 |
| Education | 23% graduate 44% bachelors 33% other |
| Employment status | 70% employed 30% unemployed |
| Marital Status | 44% married 56% unmarried |
| Average number of children | 1.1 |
| Religion | 17% Buddhist 7.6% Catholic 18.8% Christian 0.1% Hindu 0.5% Jewish 0.04% Muslim 32.3% No religion 23.7% Tao |
| N | 2,694 |

Table B-2. Socio-Demographics of Survey Participants by Country

| | Hong Kong | Taiwan | U.K. | U.S. |
|-------------------|---|--|---|---|
| Sex | 57% male 43% female | 51% male 49% female | 46% male 54% female | 52% male 48% female |
| Average age | 25 | 39 | 29 | 34 |
| Education | 20% graduate 57% bachelors 23% other | 34% graduate 47% bachelors 19% other | 15% graduate 35% bachelors 50% other | 12% graduate 33% bachelors 55% other |
| Employment status | 63% employed 37% unemployed | 87% employed 13% unemployed | 51% employed 49% unemployed | 65% employed 35% unemployed |
| Marital Status | 34% married 66% unmarried | 49% married 51% unmarried | 41% married 59% unmarried | 48% married 52% unmarried |
| # of children | 0.9 | 0.9 | 1.2 | 1.5 |
| Religion | 24.3% Buddhist 5% Catholic 8.5% Christian 0.5% Hindu 45.5% No religion 16.7% Tao | 35.2% Buddhist 0.8% Catholic 5.6% Christian 52.1% No religion 6.3% Tao | 0.4% Buddhist 15% Catholic 39% Christian 0.1% Hindu 0.5% Jewish 0.1% Muslim 44.7% No religion | 0.7% Buddhist 18.8% Catholic 41.8% Christian 0.1% Hindu 1.9% Jewish 0.1% Muslim 36.6% No religion |
| N | 506 | 1,062 | 548 | 578 |

Table B-3. Socio-Demographics of Each Country

| | Hong Kong | Taiwan | U.K. | U.S. |
|-------------------|--|--|--|--|
| Sex | 48% male 52% female | 48% male 52% female | 49% male 51% female | 49% male 51% female |
| Average age | 44 | 45 | 46 | 49 |
| Education | 15% bachelors 85% other | 43% bachelors 57% other | 27% bachelors 73% other | 59% bachelors 41% other |
| Employment status | 48% employed 52% unemployed | 54% employed 46% unemployed | 46% employed 54% unemployed | 51% employed 49% unemployed |
| Marital Status | 62% married 38% unmarried | 59% married 61% unmarried | 48% married 52% unmarried | 58% married 42% unmarried |
| # of children | 1.3 | 1.7 | 1.7 | 1.7 |
| Religion | 47.5% Buddhist 10.7% Catholic 30.3% Christian 0.6% Hindu 0.2% No religion 10.7% Tao | 27.7% Buddhist 1.3% Catholic 4.9% Christian 23.2% No religion 13.8% Tao 30% Other | 1% Buddhist 20.5% Catholic 55.8% Christian 1.6% Hindu 0.4% Jewish 7.7% Muslim 6.1% No religion 7.9% Other | 0.7% Buddhist 21.7% Catholic 27.3% Christian 0.3% Hindu 2.1% Jewish 0.3% Muslim 32.3% No religion 15.4% Other |
| N | 1,252 | 1,238 | 1,041 | 2,232 |

Source: The World Values Surveys (2015 and 2010)

Table B-4. Socio-Demographic Characteristics of PRC Migrant Brides Interviewed in Taiwan

| | N | Mean | Minimum | Maximum |
|------------------------------------|----|------|---------|---------|
| Female (=1) | 24 | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| Average age | 24 | 39 | 22 | 63 |
| Education ⁸⁴ | 24 | 5 | 3 | 7 |
| Employed (=1) | 24 | 0.8 | 0 | 1 |
| Marital Status | 24 | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| # of children | 24 | 1.13 | 0 | 3 |
| Socio-economic class ⁸⁵ | 16 | 2.1 | 1 | 3 |
| Duration of stay | 24 | 8.2 | 1 | 21 |
| Citizen (=1) | 24 | 0.4 | 0 | 1 |

⁸⁴ Education is coded on a 7-point scale. For those who did not finish primary school is coded 1; finished primary school is coded 2; finished middle school is coded 3; finished high school is coded 4; incomplete bachelor's degree is coded 5; completed bachelor's degree is coded 6; completed graduate degree is coded 7.

⁸⁵ Socio-economic class is self-identified by migrants themselves, which entail lower (=1), middle (=2), and upper class (=3).

VITA

Shan-Jan Sarah Liu

Departments of Political Science and Women's, Gender, and Sexuality Studies
The Pennsylvania State University
214 Pond Laboratory
University Park, 16802

sarah.liu@psu.edu
<http://www.ShanJanSarahLiu.com>

EDUCATION

Dual Ph.D., Political Science and Women's, Gender, and Sexuality Studies 2016
Pennsylvania State University, University Park PA
Major Fields: Comparative Politics and Women's, Gender, and Sexuality Studies
Minor Field: Methodology
Committee: Lee Ann Banaszak (chair), Donna Bahry, Vineeta Yadav, Lise Nelson

Dual M.A., Political Science and Women's, Gender, and Sexuality Studies 2012
Pennsylvania State University, University Park PA

M.A.. Intercultural Service, Leadership, and Management 2012
World Learning SIT Graduate Institute, Brattleboro, VT

B.A. American Studies and Studio Art 2006
University of Notre Dame, IN
Minor: International Peace Studies

PEER-REVIEWED PUBLICATION

Liu, S. & Banaszak, L.A. Do Government Positions Held by Women Matter? A Cross-National Examination of Female Ministers' Impact on Women's Political Participation, forthcoming in *Politics & Gender*

BOOK REVIEW

Review of Torben Iversen and Frances Rosenbluth's *Women, Work, and Politics: The Political Economy of Gender Inequality in International Feminist Journal of Politics*, 15 (2013, No. 3): 442-44.

UNDER REVIEW

Do Asian Women Serve as Role Models? An Examination of Female Legislators' Influence on Asian Women's Political Participation, revise and resubmit in *Political Research Quarterly*

AWARDS AND GRANTS

Emerging Diversity Scholar Award, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor 2016
Center for Global Studies Career Development Award, Pennsylvania State University 2015
Teaching Fellowship in Women's Studies, Pennsylvania State University 2015
PiCP Graduate Research Award for International Research, Pennsylvania State University 2015
Laura Richardson Whitaker Memorial Graduate Award in Women's Studies, Pennsylvania State University 2014
College of the Liberal Arts RGSO Dissertation Support, Pennsylvania State University 2014